2020

Perceptions of White Mountain Apache High School Graduates about College

Tyler Rush Bangert
Walden University

Walden University

College of Education

This is to certify that the doctoral study by

Tyler R. Bangert

has been found to be complete and satisfactory in all respects,
and that any and all revisions required by
the review committee have been made.

Review Committee
Dr. Donna Graham, Committee Chairperson, Education Faculty
Dr. Kim Nisbett, Committee Member, Education Faculty
Dr. Barbara Schirmer, University Reviewer, Education Faculty

Chief Academic Officer and Provost
Sue Subocz, Ph.D.

Walden University
2020

Abstract

Perceptions of White Mountain Apache High School Graduates about College

By

Tyler R. Bangert

MA, University of San Francisco, 2000

MA, Regis University, 1993

BS, Saint Louis University, 1983

Project Study Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

Of the Requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Education

Administrator Leadership for Teaching and Learning

Walden University

April 2020

Abstract

Very few high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation go on to college, and it is not known what perceptions may contribute to a decision not to attend college. The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study is to investigate these perceptions, including cultural values and family obligations. The framework of this study is founded on Tribal Critical Race Theory, also known as TribalCrit, which came out of Critical Race Theory (CRT). TribalCrit posits that colonization (Western European peoples colonizing Native American lands and peoples) is endemic in society. Seventeen White Mountain Apache tribal members who had graduated from high school participated in semi-structured interviews and/or focus groups. Interviews, focus groups, and researcher notes were analyzed through coding and categorizing from transcripts, and themes were identified, which included: finances, paperwork, and transportation; family obligations; lack of educational expectations after high school graduation; alcohol and drugs; "being stuck" on the reservation; differences in Native American and Western European worldviews; and issues of historical trauma. Many White Mountain Apache tribal members have made the decision that remaining on the reservation is more important than the benefits of a post-secondary education. The outcome of this study was a project that would engage school employees in dialogues with different cultural worldviews to increase understanding of how different worldviews operate in an organization, particularly a school. Dialogues involving people with very different worldviews can have a positive impact on the organization, relationships of employees, and especially the people the organization serves, students who receive an education from these employees.

Perceptions of White Mountain Apache High School Graduates about College

by

Tyler R. Bangert

MA, University of San Francisco, 2000

MA, Regis University, 1993

BS, Saint Louis University, 1983

Project Study Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Education

Walden University

March 24, 2020

Dedication

This project is dedicated to all those who have helped me reach this point in my life and in my education. This dedication includes all the indigenous peoples I have worked with, my mentors, and especially my family. I also dedicate this paper to all those who strive to improve and elevate the lives of those who are not adequately recognized for their contributions and achievements to the lives of others and their communities.

Acknowledgments

I would like to acknowledge those who have contributed to the realization of this project. In particular, all of the professors I have had at Walden University who have pushed me to go beyond what I thought I was capable of and guided me to greater understanding and performance. This is especially true of Dr. Graham, who guided me through the final capstone project. I would also like to acknowledge all the mentors I have had throughout my life, too many to mention. And most especially, my family who has supported through my long hours, doubts, and anxieties.

Table of Contents

List of Tables iii

Section 1: The Problem 1

The Local Problem 1

Rationale 4

Definition of Terms 7

Significance of the Study 8

Research Questions 9

Review of the Literature 9

Implications 32

Summary 33

Section 2: The Methodology 37

Design and Approach 37

Participants 38

Section 3: The Project 65

Introduction 65

Rationale 66

Review of the Literature 68

Project Description 78

Project Evaluation Plan 81

Project Implications 82

Section 4: Reflections and Conclusions 84

Project Strengths and Limitations 84

Recommendations for Alternative Approaches 84

Scholarship, Project Development and Evaluation, and Leadership and Change 86

Reflection on Importance of the Work 87

Implications, Applications, and Directions for Future Research 88

Conclusion 89

References 91

Appendix A: Interview Protocol 107

Appendix B: Focus Group Protocol 113

Appendix C: Interview Consent form 114

Appendix D: Focus Group Consent Form 116

Appendix E: Information Letter 118

Appendix F: Professional Development Outline 115

Appendix G: Professional Development PowerPoint 118

Appendix H: Survey 119

List of Tables

Table 1. Particpants 40

Section 1: The Problem

The Local Problem

It is not known what perceptions high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation have that contribute to a decision not to attend college. According to Indians.org (2018) the Apache people were nomadic and originally migrated from the Alaska region to the plains region and southwest region of North America, although according to the White Mountain Apache Tribe (2018) the Apache people were placed in their current location by the Creator and did not migrate from any other region. Eventually the Apaches split into a number of groups, and the White Mountain Apache are considered part of the Western Apache group. The Apaches defended their lands, first against the Spaniards in the 1700s and later against the United States as settlers migrated west. The United States government signed a treaty with the Apaches in the 1850s, but this was soon broken when an Apache leader, Mangas Coloradas, was attacked by miners (Legends of America, 2018; Tribal Directory, 2018).

In 1869 the United States Cavalry went to the White Mountain Apache lands (White Mountain Apache Tribe, 2011). The intention was to kill any Apaches on the way and then compel Apaches to live on their reservation without resistance. The Cavalry was also to oversee the activities of the Apache people, including to monitor and stop the "traffic in corn with the hostile tribes" (White Mountain Apache, 2011). The Cavalry soon set up Camp Ord, which was later named Fort Apache (Fortwiki, 2016). Apache warriors, called Apache Scouts, were recruited in 1871 by General Crook to help with military operations, which included the "Apache Wars" that lasted for 15 years. The Battle of Cibecue Creek (Wikipedia, 2018), which occurred in the same village as one of the current reservations high schools, was part of these conflicts,

although the Apache Scouts sided with the Apaches for this battle. The Apache Wars ended with the surrender of Geronimo in 1886 (White Mountain Apache Tribe, 2011).

Fort Apache was disbanded as an army fort in 1922 and the Bureau of Indian Affairs took over the site to establish Theodore Roosevelt Indian Boarding School. Theodore Roosevelt School was originally founded for Navajo children, but as other schools were established elsewhere the majority of the population of students became Apache. In 1960 the ownership of the buildings of Fort Apache were turned over to the tribe. The United States government continued to operate the school through the Bureau of Indian Education. Over the years the buildings deteriorated, so the White Mountain Apache Tribe sued the United States government to pay for the restoration of the buildings. The case went to the Supreme Court, who decided 5-4 in favor of the White Mountain Apache tribe (United States v White Mountain Apache Tribe, 2003). Judge Souter wrote the majority opinion and Judge Thomas wrote the dissenting opinion. The United States government was ordered to pay the White Mountain Apache tribe $12 million in damages. Theodore Roosevelt school continues today to serve middle school Apaches as a Bureau of Indian Education school.

The White Mountain Apache Tribe is a federally recognized tribe and considered a sovereign nation. The White Mountain Apache tribe currently operate Hoh Dah Casino and Sunrise Ski Resort. The White Mountain Apache reservation occupies 2,600 square miles in east-central Arizona, and ranges in elevation from 2,600 feet above sea level to 11,400 feet. There are approximately 15,000 White Mountain Apache tribal members.

Nationwide the percentage of high school graduates who have gone on to college is 60%; however, for Native Americans this percentage is only 17% (Oliff, 2017). Not only have Native Americans attended college at rates far below the general population nationwide, the rates on the

White Mountain Apache Reservation are even lower. Of the two high schools on the White Mountain Apache Reservation, one high school funded by the Bureau of Indian Education has a rate of high school graduates going to college of 15% (D. Whitesinger, personal communication, July 28, 2017), and the high school with state funding has a rate of high school graduates going on to college of 10% (B. Dreyer, personal communication, July 31, 2017). This is well below the high school graduation rate for the state of Arizona, which was 77.4% in 2015 (Making Action Possible, 2015).

There is a continuing gap between White students and Native American students in pursuing post-secondary education (Ross et al., 2012). This gap in to further education is marked on the White Mountain Apache Reservation with significantly less White Mountain Apaches attending college than the national average (D. Whitesinger, personal communication, July 28, 2017; B. Dreyer, personal communication, July 31, 2017). Native American students' experiences and culture have been significantly different than White students (Minthorn, 2014). This study will explore perceptions of high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation that have contributed to a decision not to go on to college.

Nutton and Fast (2015) reviewed the history of discrimination and colonialism that Native Americans have experienced and suggested that Native Americans continue to suffer from historical trauma. They suggested that one factor to help mitigate the impact of historical trauma is a healthier formation of cultural identity by recognizing Native American values, traditions and worldviews. Nutton and Fast recommended in their Limitations and Future Research section more qualitative research and case studies with Native Americans that include quality of life and risk factors at the community, family and individual levels.

Mitchell and Syed (2015) studied longitudinal data from the Youth Development Study from 1988 to 2004 and spanned participant ages from adolescence through the early thirties. Mitchell and Syed used this data specifically because the data included ages of emerging adulthood and included both participants who attended college and who did not attend college. Most research on emerging adulthood had used participants in college, but Mitchell and Syed wanted to address emerging adults who had not attended college. Some of the results included an overrepresentation of Native Americans who had not attended college and a correlation of college graduates with higher education of their parents. In their Conclusion, Mitchell and Syed recommended further research that focused on emerging adults who are not college bound. Discussing and being aware of considerations that led to a decision not to go on to college can provide schools, graduates and families with information to inform better the decision-making process.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study is to investigate perceptions of high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation that contribute to a decision not to go attend college Getting personal perspectives from high school graduates as to why they decide not to attend college will help to understand what factors play into these decisions. Of interest is what values are placed on different issues and what meaning these issues have to individual decision makers.

Rationale

Arnett and Arnett (2012) addressed the necessity to consider how culture interacts with emerging adulthood, including the development of cultural identity and how culture impacts patterns of thought. In their conclusion section, Arnett and Arnett (2012) recommended research

on emerging adulthood outside of mainstream American culture. Cerecer (2013) conducted a 5-year qualitative study using interviews and focus groups of 21 Native American high school students. In her Findings, Cerecer found that these students did not feel the high school environment or policies reflected the worldview or lived experiences of Native American students. Cerecer recommended further study on how institutional policies and practices might increase high school graduation and transition to post-secondary institutions.

Flynn, Olson, and Yellig (2014) conducted focus groups and interviews with 20 Native American college students aged 18-33 who had lived in tribal settings. In their Recommendations for Future Research, Flynn et al. recommended further research on Native Americans transitioning to college as well as continued research on those Native Americans who chose not to acculturate into the mainstream culture. Minthorn, (2015) and Flynn et al. (2014) suggested that Native Americans have a difficulty transitioning to the mainstream culture when going on to post-secondary institutions. This is especially true for Native Americans because many post-secondary educational institutions practice values that are often in direct conflict with Native American ways of knowing and these institutions often dismiss and misrepresent Native American cultures (Lundberg, 2014). Lundberg surveyed 647 Native American college students on school engagement to predict student learning. Lundberg found that a Native American student's family plays a primary role in the path to graduation and recommends in Future Research ways that educational institutions can foster more family support for Native American students.

Native Americans who have attended college have expressed a feeling they cannot be themselves in a non-Native educational setting (Minthorn, 2015). This may be because government-funded Native American boarding schools were formed for the reason of

assimilating Natives into the mainstream culture (Bureau of Indian Education Study Group, 2015). Tribal Critical Race Theory posits that endemic racism continues to be embedded in the mainstream culture (Cerecer, 2013). High school graduates from the White Mountain Apache reservation often do not feel they are prepared for either work or post-secondary education outside the reservation. The Director of Curriculum and Instruction, an Apache woman, has suggested exposing Native American students to cultures off the reservation so these students can be more comfortable with the mainstream culture before moving on to college or career (D. Whitesinger, personal communication, April 2017). There are instances of White Mountain Apaches being discriminated against by the mainstream culture adjacent to the reservation, as experienced by a Catholic priest who has lived on the White Mountain Reservation for over 30 years (E. Fronske, OFM, personal communication, December 2017). Although White Mountain Apache and the predominantly White cultures have lived next to each other for centuries, there still seems to be endemic racism, confirming the Tribal Critical Race Theory.

The desire to see White Mountain Apache have a better chance at improving their lives through education has, in part, prompted a state Superior Judge to found a private school that serves the local urban center as well as White Mountain Apache (R. Higgins, personal communication, January 2018). This private school is located in the urban center but offers scholarships that allow many Native American students to attend the school. Judge Higgins has explained that he would like to see more Native American students attend college after graduation, and he hopes to offer this preparation through the school he has founded. Judge Higgins's goals reflect his experiences working with schools on the White Mountain Apache reservation. This private school offers an opportunity for many Native American students to

experience a quality education that integrates with mainstream students. However, there are still many obstacles to overcome, including family and cultural differences.

Definition of Terms

Emerging Adulthood – This term defines an individual as having left the dependencies of adolescence yet not having the responsibilities of an adult (Arnett, 2000).

Historical Trauma – Historical trauma comes from a negative group experience that continues to impact sub sequent generations (Brave Heart, Chase, Elkins & Altschul, 2011). Historical trauma is considered a communal experience, which includes mourning for past and present generations, and often involves continued oppression and discrimination (Grayshield, Rutherford, Salazar, Mihecoby & Luna, 2015). Historical trauma can comprise social physical or emotional distresses for a group or an individual.

Tribal Critical Race Theory, also known as *TribalCrit* – TribalCrit emerged from critical race theory which claimed that White people primarily benefited from civil rights legislation (Ladson-Billings, 1998). TribalCrit starts from the assumption that racism is a ubiquitous part of the American culture, and the United States Government developed policies pertaining to Native Americans based on imperialism and White supremacy (Cerecer, 2013; McKinley & Brayboy, 2005).

White Mountain Apache Tribe – The White Mountain Apache Tribe is a recognized Native American tribe by the United States. The White Mountain Apache reservation is located in the central eastern part of Arizona, covering over 2600 square miles (White Mountain Apache Tribe, 2011). The tribe has approximately 15,000 tribal members and three educational organizations, including: The Whiteriver Unified School District, consisting of three elementary schools, one middle school and one high school, all funded by the State of Arizona; the Bureau

of Indian Education funding three schools, one of which includes a high school; and Eastfork Lutheran School, a privately funded school for grades k-8.

Significance of the Study

The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study is to explore perceptions of high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation that contribute to a decision not to attend college. The White Mountain Apache Reservation has had a low rate of tribal high school graduates who go on to college after graduating from high school. Located in the central western part of Arizona in Navajo County, adverse economic conditions affect the White Mountain Apache Reservation, including high levels of poverty and unemployment (Bureau of Labor Statistics, 2015; Arizona Department of Education, 2014). There is a strong correlation between high poverty and low education (Boggs, 2011).

A significant contributor to the lack of economic opportunity on the reservation is a lack of educational attainment on the part of tribal members. Mitchell and Syed (2015) found that high school graduates that do not go to college have lower incomes than those that do go to college. Museus, Yi, and Saelua (2017) findings, through a survey of 499 college students of various cultures from three institutions, were that lower degree attainment correlated with lower lifetime earnings. There is a significant earnings gap between high school graduates and college graduates (Autor, 2014). In Navajo County (home to the White Mountain Apache Reservation), a person with some education beyond high school earns on average $4,000 more than a person without education beyond high school, a figure which goes up to almost $10,000 more with a bachelor's degree (U.S. Census Bureau, 2015).

This study might be beneficial to the local education community in a several ways. First, those who participate in the focus groups might be exposed to experiences and thoughts of others

that might stimulate reflection on their own experiences and decision-making processes, possibly a reconsideration of pursuing further education. Second, a deeper musing on their own lives may also result from the interview process. Third, sharing results of the study with local educators could assist them by giving them more insight on the factors that high school graduates on the White Mountain Reservation consider when deciding whether or not to go to college after high school. Fourth, it would be important to share results with the tribal council and the community in general. The results from this study could support generating possible solutions to increasing rates of high school graduates deciding to pursue college.

Research Questions

The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study is to explore perceptions of high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation that contribute to a decision not to go on to college

The research questions for this study follow:

RQ1: How do high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation perceive the factors that contribute to a decision not to attend college?

RQ2: How do high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation perceive cultural values and family obligations that contribute to a decision of White Mountain Apache high school graduates not to attend college?

Review of the Literature

Theoretical Foundation

The framework of this study is founded on work done by McKinley and Brayboy (2005), called Tribal Critical Race Theory also known as TribalCrit. Scrutiny of race disparities in education can be seen as early as the 1920s when W. E. B. Du Bois used scientific methods to

shine a light on racism in education (Racial Frameworks in Higher Education, 2015). Although at that time the Northern United States was considered to be a safe haven for African Americans, Du Bois found that the treatment of Black people in educational institutions ranged from "tolerance to active hostility" (as quoted in Racial Frameworks in Higher Education, 2015, p. 17). In the late 20th century Critical Race Theory (CRT) posited that "legal scholarship did not give sufficient attention to the role of racism in shaping the legal system" (Racial Frameworks in Higher Education, 2015, p. 18), and maintains that racism has become a part of the American cultural fabric and is endemic in society. Ladson-Billings (1998) asserted in Critical Race Theory that racism continues to be a part of the mainstream culture and White Americans have benefitted most from legislation regarding civil rights. Ladson-Billings also applied CRT to education. The normalization of racism has caused racism to be invisible, despite claims of color-blindness, equality, and race-neutrality. In addition to bringing injustices to light, CRT is also committed to facilitating change to achieve social justice.

Some scholars realized that CRT, although a step forward in making clear inequalities in race, there needed to be a focus on other race inequalities in our society, and CRT branched into other areas. TribalCrit comes out of CRT and looks specifically at how Native Americans perceive the world differently than the mainstream White culture, and how the continued treatment of Native Americans has had negative consequences on Indigenous peoples. Similar to CRT, TribalCrit postulates that the Western value of colonization is endemic, and that policies of the United States towards Native Americans have been tailored to maintain White supremacy (Racial Frameworks in Higher Education, 2015). One goal of U. S. policies has been to assimilate Natives into a Western society mindset which is considered to be civilized (Writer, 2010). This comes from a foundational belief on the part of the White culture that Western

ideals are superior and that Native peoples pose an “obstacle” (Writer, 2010, p. 6) to Western progress. Writer maintains that institutions were designed to maintain the status quo of the mainstream culture, inculcating Native populations to this view so they would “never question their position” (Writer, 2010, p. 7) in White society. The end goal being that beliefs will in turn affect public policies in a way that do not threaten mainstream practices. Writer also claims that although there are multicultural educational (MCE) programs to acknowledge different cultures, these programs often are often very superficial, offering just “food, fun, festivals, and foolishness” (p. 4), while maintaining mainstream ideals.

Central to Tribal Critical Race Theory, not only is racism endemic to society but colonization is also endemic to society (McKinley & Brayboy, 2005). This tenet of TribalCrit is made clear by Grann (2017) in his description of the plight of the Osage in Oklahoma. The Osage were forced from their ancestral lands and forced to settle on land that was considered “broken, rocky, sterile, and utterly unfit for cultivation” (Grann, 2017, p. 40). However, when oil was found in the ground non-Natives were allowed to pass laws and use the legal system to divest Osage individuals from their rightful fortunes. Some non-Natives even resorted to a series of murders to take what little the Osage had. Writer (2010) described a contemporary lesson in Oklahoma schools that had students participate in a simulated land run. Presumably the lesson was designed to teach students elements of planning and how to be successful from a mainstream perspective, rather than consider the plight of the Osage. Writer suggested that another purpose for this lesson was to keep Native people invisible. In Arizona in 2008, Senate Bill 1108 was proposed to prevent schools from denigrating Western civilization or using materials that were considered anti-American (Writer, 2010). The bill would have allowed the State Superintendent to confiscate questionable instructional materials, as well as prohibiting race-based organizations

such as American Indian Student Associations. Writer claimed the bill would preserve "White privilege and whiteness as normal history" (p. 7). O'Leary and Romero (2011) stated that the purpose of Arizona's SB 1108 was to "eliminate the state's ethnic-studies programs and ethnic-based organizations characterized as 'un-American'" (from the abstract). The bill was passed into Arizona law in May 2010 as HB 2281. Subsequently, some Arizona schools had to eliminate classes that were considered to be designed for a particular ethnic group (Arizona House Bill 2281).

Kitchen, Lorenzo and Trudeau (2010) did a qualitative study with six Aboriginal teachers in Ontario Canada who had participated in a teacher training program targeted for Indigenous peoples. Even though the participants in the program would return to Indigenous communities to teach, the six participants felt that the program's focus was on mainstream curriculum rather than to develop skills to manage Native ways of knowing, learning, and perceiving the world. The participants felt that the program tried to weed-out students that did not conform to a conventional model of teaching, and the program was an attempt to assimilate Native students in the mainstream paradigm rather than honor Native cultures. Kitchen, et al. suggested that the dropout rate of the program indicated that "institutional discrimination may be thriving" (p. 116).

TribalCrit also includes the goal of promoting social justice. A critical part of TribalCrit is to identify and become aware of dominant ideologies, especially those that uphold White power and disparage Native cultures, including in education (Racial Frameworks in Higher Education, 2015; Kitchen, et al., 2010). Writer (2010) noted that social change requires reflection that can lead to action and suggested that perceptions of Indigenous peoples change from being "minorities" and "artifacts of the past" to actors of a "transformative present" (p. 10). Institutions can encourage positive change through understanding and meeting the needs of a

diverse student population (Racial Frameworks in Higher Education, 2015) and training teachers to address the complexity of different student backgrounds and experiences (Kitchen, et al., 2010). For many Native Americans this means both individual and community healing, which should include Native traditions (Braveheart, et al., 2011; Kitchen, et al., 2010; Lafever, 2016; Grayshield, et al., 2015). Part of healing would include the development of a positive individual and cultural identity (Kitchen, et al., 2010).

Research Strategy

The review of the literature was compiled using references obtained primarily through the online Walden Library and EBSCO/host using databases such as ERIC and Education Source. Some statistical information, such as on graduation rates and poverty, were obtained from online governmental sources found primarily from the Walden Library search software. Data for local (state, county and reservation) statistics on rates of graduation, student performance on standardized tests, college attendance rates, and income were obtained from internet searches and personal communications. For instance, there was very little information to be found specific to the White Mountain Apache Reservation. Although there is a White Mountain Apache Tribe educational office, they had no information on rates of high school graduation or of rates of high school graduates doing on to post-secondary education. This information was obtained by going directly to high schools and talking to personnel.

Articles from academic journals and dissertations were reviewed over a period of years through doctoral coursework with Walden University. The local problem was formulated first through personal experiences on the White Mountain Apache Reservation and developed through coursework and review of academic articles. Initial search terms included: American Indian, Native American, indigenous people, education, graduation rates, post-secondary, college

and high school. Perusing articles lead to other search terms and Walden instructors recommended specific search terms to perform a more comprehensive literature review. The more comprehensive search terms included: poverty, Critical Race Theory, historical trauma, emerging adulthood, assimilation, educational performance, identity formation, and worldview. Examining references used in academic articles and dissertations also aided in finding relevant references to investigate. Articles were saved in folders on the computer for continuing reference, and a Word documents was used to list all articles reviewed with notes for each article. Later, the format was changed from a Word document to a Excel document, which helped in better organization and search capabilities.

The local problem developed over a period of time. Initially, the study was going to look at White Mountain Apaches who had graduated from a post-secondary institution. Although there are many known Apaches with college degrees on the reservation, data was not available specific to the White Mountain Apache Tribe regarding rates of post-secondary degree attainment. Lack of data on post-secondary education for White Mountain Apaches was a difficulty, so in consultation with the Chair, the study focus shifted to high school graduates who decided not to go on to college, in large part because data on this population was available. The theoretical foundation of emerging adulthood also fit very well with this new focus. The literature supports the dearth of Native Americans going on to college, which is also experienced on the White Mountain Apache Reservation as confirmed through personal communications with reservation school personnel. The literature has much to say about lower rates of post-secondary education of Native Americans, and the links to poverty. The development of cultural identity is a reoccurring topic in the literature, with more research recommended in this area for emerging

adulthood. Differences in worldview of Native Americans from the dominant mainstream culture are also reoccurring themes in the literature relevant to this study.

Family Influences

Native Americans who live in, or are influence by, mainstream American culture must decide the extent to which they will be faithful to local cultural family obligations, and how they will adhere to cultural spiritual beliefs, both of which are often at odds with the mainstream American value system. Native American and many minority cultures tend to make decisions, including decisions on life directions that take into account obligations to others, rather than the mainstream values of individual advancement (Arnett, 2003). These values of community obligations over individual interests shows up in other academic literature (Lundberg, 2014; Jain-Jamall, 2013).

In looking at emerging adults, it is important to consider the influences family may have on education. Of special interest for emerging adults would be the trajectories students take, or don't take, toward and through secondary and post-secondary education. In a study of 570 college students aged 19-22, which included Native American students, the relationship of parenting styles and academic attitudes and performance were examined (Waterman & Lefkowitz, 2017). Although a relationship was found that parenting characteristics were correlated more with academic attitudes than with academic behavior, the environment that the student lived in at college had more impact than parenting characteristics. Budescu and Silverman (2016) found that strong parental attachments with freshmen at college helped to alleviate the impacts of stress the freshmen experienced. Budescu and Silverman studied 530 emerging adults at college and found that close emotional relationships with parents helped with college adjustment, especially during times of transition (such as during the freshmen or senior

years in college). Although Budescu and Silverman do not specify the ethnic makeup of their study, a discussion with a White Mountain Apache parent of a college graduate felt that these conclusions were applicable to the White Mountain Apache (Sam Mallow, personal communication, July 2018). Also of great importance during the emerging adulthood stage, is the process of identity formation. A more positive identity formation may depend on the self-efficacy of an individual, with individuals of low self-efficacy more likely to choose a path of least resistance, regardless of traditional expectations (Schwartz, Cote, & Arnett, 2005). Budescu and Silverman (2016) mentioned self-efficacy as an important factor for successful transitioning into the college environment.

Personal Cultural Identity

Emerging adulthood is, as proposed by Arnett (2000), is a life stage between Erikson's stages of adolescence and young adulthood, which encompasses the ages from 18 to 25. This is a time in which individuals explore life options and roles in society and begin to take steps toward chosen life pathways. Part of the work of the emerging adult is negotiating a personal identity, which is more complex for those who are immersed in more than one culture (Arnett & Arnett, 2012). This life stage is a time of continuing identity formation, which will facilitate steps that will shape the future of their lives. Developing an identity during emerging adulthood has become more difficult with more cultural influences, especially due to globalization (Arnett & Arnett, 2012). Arnett and Arnett described four possible responses to developing a cultural identity: assimilation, separation, integration, and marginalization.

Assimilation is developing and identity that is consistent with the mainstream culture. The individual either sees the local culture as a hinderance or as not useful in adapting to a world with a dominant culture. In essence, during assimilation an individual sheds the local culture and

takes on the mainstream culture in large part because the mainstream culture will be more advantageous to life goals.

In contrast to assimilation, separation is clinging to the local culture and keeping the dominant culture at a distance. If possible, the individual will not engage with the mainstream culture and shun it when possible. Keeping traditions and participating in cultural rituals is important to the individual, especially if these rituals bestow a greater level of belonging and immersion in the traditional culture. Arnett used an example of Samoans who received traditional tattoos during adolescence as a sign of retaining a sign of cultural belonging.

On the White Mountain Apache Reservation one cultural practice that is preserved is the Sunrise Dance ritual which initiates a girl into womanhood (Norma DeHose, personal communication October 2017). The White Mountain Apache Sunrise Dance ritual takes months of preparation by the girl's family and the girl's sponsoring family, with the ceremony taking up to five days to complete. The Sunrise dance occurs at a camp that is located on sacred reservation ground and includes a series of specified rituals that include exchanges of gifts, community dancing, Crown dancers, chanting, drumming, meals, blessings, speeches by elders, and a culmination dance by the young woman. All rituals are led by a tribally recognized Medicine Man. Just as there were missionaries who wanted to discontinue the traditional practice of Samoan ritual tattoos because there were immoral (Arnett, 2012), a similar sentiment is exhibited by some churches on the White Mountain Apache Reservation who have declared the Apache Sunrise Dances as morally wrong (Fr. Edward Fronske, personal communication December 2017).

Integration is a mix of embracing the local culture while at the same time adapting to the mainstream culture. The balance between the two cultures has been called biculturalism.

Biculturalism may allow an individual to more successfully navigate the two cultures that they interact with on a continual basis. Marginalization is when an individual feels comfortable in neither the local culture nor the mainstream culture. The mainstream culture may be just too different for an individual to feel comfortable with, or a person may feel prejudice because of their heritage. Arnett (2012) explained that a marginalized person may feel as if they are rejected because of "physical appearance, socioeconomic status, or religion" (p. 280). In the closest urban area to the White Mountain Apache reservation, most tribal members can be identified by their appearance of brown skin, accent, distinct facial and physical features. Tribal members are often discriminated against because of these identifying traits (Fr. Edward Fronske, personal communication December 2017). Although I am clearly White, while engaging in small-talk in this same urban area if I mention that I live on the White Mountain Apache Reservation the most common response is sympathy because I live in such a miserable community.

In a multicultural setting, identity development may include navigating through a broad range of cultural values and practices, including values and practices that are in conflict (Phinney, 2010). This conflict in values can be very personal and deep, such as when the cultural heritage of an individual includes different ethnic and racial antecedents, such as when one parent is Native American and the other parent is White (Sykes, 2014). Sykes conducted a phenomenological study that focused on identity formation in the Chickasaw culture. He stated that the US government tried to "strip American Indians of their cultural and heritage" (p. 4). Sykes noted that today some individuals with a quantum of Native American blood may look more White than Native and experience a degree of White privilege. This has caused some with Native American roots to feel a great degree of internal turmoil, especially when trying to

develop a cultural identity. Sykes helped individuals to navigate these contrasts and develop an identity that included their Native heritage in a way that did not ignore or demean their White heritage. Sykes went on to recommend that educational institutions provide opportunities for minority learners to engage in immersive cultural experiences to aid in the identity forming process. He related that these experiences have helped both Native and non-Native alike.

One difficulty that individuals in minority cultures experience in developing an identity and life path is the ease in which emerging adults are exposed to and embrace other cultural values. However, the acceptance of different cultural perspectives and values can be a difficult adjustment for parents and older community members. This globalization effect can cause discord between emerging adults and their parents. Negative influences because of globalism have been referred to as "cultural identity confusion" (Arnett, 2012, p. 487). Nonetheless, empirical investigations have found that most people adapt well to changes in their culture, although young people tend to adapt better than adults.

Wexler, Eglinton, and Gubrium (2014) chose 31 stories from a pool of over 200 digital stories written by Inupiaq Native Alaskan emerging adults. It was clear that these emerging adults created a positive cultural identity from their traditional cultural values as well as from pop culture images. In the language of and Arnett and Arnett (2012), including aspects of the traditional culture and aspects of pop culture would fit in the category of integration.

For some emerging adults, the path of least resistance is taken because they have not developed the tools necessary to make a life path decision, or they lack support from traditional community sources. The sources necessary for today's emerging adults were not needed for past generations, so are not available to today's emerging adults. Although some emerging adults are more prepared to negotiate an identity in the social environment, other emerging adults may need

some intervention to be successful. The Limitations section of the Schwartz, Cote and Arnett (2005) study indicated that because the participants of the study only included college students, it is not known if those who decide not to go to college may have a more diffuse identity structure. Mitchell and Syed (2015) questioned if emerging adults who do not attend college have a significantly different path than those who do attend college, and if so, when and why do non-college emerging adults diverge from college-bound students. In their study, Mitchell and Syed found that Native Americans were "overrepresented" (p. 2017) in the no-college category. The same study also found that students that did graduate from college correlated with higher parent education.

The development of a positive cultural identity during emerging adulthood may be an important factor to encourage high school graduates to go on to college. Rivas-Drake, Seaton, et al. (2014) reviewed research on ethnic and racial identity and noted that there is evidence that ethnic and racial identity is correlated to better psychosocial results for Native American youth. One study Rivas-Drake, Seaton, et al. reviewed indicated that ethnic affirmation and belonging were associated with greater self-esteem and adapting for Navajo high school students. Sykes (2014) alleged that not feeling he belonged to his Native American side of his birthright was a difficulty in his own development of an identity that included his Native American roots. This personal experience has spurred him in his work to help emerging adults develop identities that embrace their Native American heritages. Rivas-Drake, Markstrom, et al. (2014) performed a meta-analysis to determine if there was a positive affect from a developed ethnic and racial identity. They found 25 studies that included a total of 7,822 child and adolescent (non-college) participants which indicated that a positive ethnic and racial identity was related to better academic adjustment. A study of 19,312 emerging adults who participated in the 2010 National

Survey on Drug Use and Health showed that high school graduates were less likely to be involved in risky behaviors, such as drug use, suicide attempts and being arrested (Maynard, Sala-Wright, & Vaughn, 2015). These results suggest a positive identity may lead to choosing a more positive life path. Wickrama, O'Neal, and Lee (2016) examined a sample of 14,563 respondents to the National Longitudinal Study of Adolescent to Adult done over a 13-year period, which included about half minority youth. This study found that socioeconomic adversity led to a higher incidence of difficulties later in life. Unfortunately, many Native Americans grow up in a low socioeconomic environment. Jury et al. (2017) reported that students from a low socioeconomic background often feel out of place in a college environment and often have difficulty forming a new identity that includes their status as a college student. Part of the reason for feeling out of place are frequent reminders that they are different and have had different experiences than their peers, which the majority are from high socioeconomic backgrounds.

Historical Trauma

Historical trauma may also affect the decision-making process of Native American high school graduates in their decision not to go on to college. Ladson-Billings (1998) asserted in Critical Race Theory that racism is part of the mainstream culture and White Americans have benefitted most from legislation regarding civil rights. Tribal Critical Race Theory emerges from Critical Race Theory and looks specifically at how Native Americans perceive the world differently than the mainstream White culture.

Central to Tribal Critical Race Theory, not only is race endemic to society but colonization is also endemic to society (McKinley & Brayboy, 2005). Native Americans are affected by disparaging descriptions and many events in American history have contributed to

the historical trauma of Native Americans (Grayshield, Rutherford, Salazar, Mihecoby, & Luna, 2015). After the first Europeans arrived on the American continent, many Native Americans died from disease and warfare, and survivors were eventually deprived of Native lands, forced to live on reservations, and required to attend schools intended to achieve the "assimilation" of Native American children. The education of Native American children is only one aspect of the historical trauma they have experienced.

Brigham Young University (2015) wrote a comprehensive review of Federal policy regarding Indian Education. The basis for federal law was the belief that Native Americans were not civilized and therefore their culture should be eliminated and replaced by a civilized, American culture. Brigham Young University (2015) quoted an excerpt from Cohen's Handbook on Federal Indian Law as follows: "Kill the Indian in him, and save the man" (p. 354). To achieve assimilation of Native peoples into the mainstream society, federal law compelled Native children to attend school. To take the goal of acculturation even further, federal boarding schools for Indian children were created off the reservations to separate children from the influence of parents and culture. One stated goal of education for Indian children was to create a sense of individualism in the child and eliminate any tribal identification the child may have had or develop. Two more goals were to teach students to speak English (while forbidding students to speak their native languages) and learn about Christianity. The government funded schools, often run by religious organizations, were "for an Indigenous child to see their culture as savage superstition" (Nutton & Fast, 2015, p. 839).

Western cultures have conceptualized knowledge as objective and thus denigrated indigenous ways of knowing as either being subjective or not being based in evidence as required by the scientific method. In essence, indigenous peoples have been told by the

Western mindset that they possess “non-knowledge” or their ways of knowing are “inferior,” (Collins and Mueller, 2016, p. 308). Native Americans look to stories from their communities to inform them about truths in the world, whereas the mainstream culture considers theories supported by data as truth and often dismiss Native American ways of knowing (McKinley & Brayboy, 2005).

Makey (2017) analyzed public government reports and resolutions to understand the relationship of federal and state governments on tribal self-determination. Makay concluded that states have more control over education than tribes do, partly due to a reduced role of the federal government. Many Native Americans no longer live on reservations and most Native American students currently attend public schools not associated with the Bureau of Indian Education. Consequently, federal guidelines and laws do not directly affect these students, resulting in a fragmentary implementation of those policies intended to improve the education of Native American students (Brigham Young University, 2015). Although Native American students have a legal right to a quality education, Smith, Stumpff, and Cole (2012) maintained that the United States government has had a poor record of following through with their side of this obligation.

The presentation of knowledge in schools is controlled by the dominant culture which has often resulted in a lack of presenting indigenous ways of knowing in textbooks and curricula (Cerecer, 2014; Padgett, 2015). Cerecer even referenced Arizona’s House Bill 2281 which disallows public schools to use multicultural texts. Padgett examined proposed textbooks in Florida to determine how school texts depicted Native Americans from the point of view of Tribal Critical Race Theory. In other research a case study of 14 Native American high school students was conducted as part of a larger study to ascertain what challenges schools have in

increasing Native American graduation rates (Wilcox 2014). Wilcox offered data that indicated the district graduation rate was 87%, but the graduation rate of Native Americans was only 50%. Results from Wilcox study indicated that educators from the dominant culture could see that Native Americans do not do as well in school, but often attributed this failure to a lack of ambition among Native American students or their home-life., These educators also failed to acknowledge difficulties Native American students may have had with an impersonal school environment, lack of inclusion of Native American families, Native ways of communicating, or Native ways of perceiving the world. In the discussion section of the study, Wilcox suggested that part of the path to higher graduation rates for Native American students includes a staff that understands that Native American students have cultural values and deep histories that differ from the mainstream experience.

Value differences have caused much conflict throughout the history involving interactions of White peoples and indigenous peoples. Graysheild et al. (2015) conducted a phenomenological study with 11 Native American elders on the topic of historical trauma. Graysheild et al. indicated that historical trauma is well documented, and the indicators of historical trauma can be physical, psychological, social and behavioral. Even when Native Americans live on a reservation they have frequent interactions with the main culture, whether that be through media, watching movies, eating in restaurants, or shopping in predominantly White America, which often perpetuates cultural trauma. Brave Heart et al. (2011) recommended interventions that promote Native Americans to transcend historical trauma and reclaim their cultural identities, which includes healing practices centered in Native world views. They also recommended continuing dialogue regarding traditional healing rituals and how customary roles might be lived out in contemporary society.

Educational Attainment

Native Americans have had the lowest secondary and post-secondary graduation rates (Flynn et al., 2014), and few Native Americans pursue college after high school graduation (Oliff, 2017). To end the cycle of poverty, and to ensure a better future, the most powerful intervention has been the completion of a secondary or post-secondary education (Boggs, 2011).

The level of education that a student completes, as well as a student's aspirations for higher education, have had positive outcomes for students later in life (Irvin, Byun, Meece, Reed, & Farmer, 2016). Irvin et al. used the Rural High School Aspirations Study which included 6,150 high school students for their sample from 34 states, and included White, Hispanic, African American and Native American ethnicities. The Results section from the study indicated that Native American students in rural areas were more likely to have parents with less education, experience economic hardship, live in communities with high poverty, and experience grade retention more often. The results also indicated Native American youth had the lowest measure of the value of school and their teachers had the lowest educational expectations from Native American students. The Implications section suggested that school experiences were more predictive of educational aspirations than school characteristics. Irvin et al. recommended that to increase both students' educational aspirations and a positive academic self-concept, that schools consider ways to increase positive experiences and reduce negative experiences. Positive experiences included college preparation programs and advanced mathematics courses, and negative experiences included grade retention.

Many factors have affected the decision of students to enter post-secondary education after graduation from high school. Finnie, Wismer, and Mueller (2015) studied data from the Cohort A of the Youth in Transition Survey (YITS-A). The survey followed students who were

born in 1984 for six cycles of surveys given in the years 2000, 2002, 2004, 2006, 2008 and 2010. Finnie et al. focused on cycle four of the survey administered in 2006 because the respondents were 21 years old and would have already made a choice as whether or not to enter post-secondary education (PSE). The cycle four survey included 16,340 respondents. In their section of Descriptive Analysis, the study found: non-minorities were more likely to enter PSE; urban students were more likely to enter PSE than rural students; and students from higher-income families were more likely to enter PSE. However, they determined that family income was not the most important factor and stated, "we interpret this set of results as indicating the importance of cultural influences on access to PSE." (p. 252). The study cited in the conclusions section that the "most important determinant" (p. 257) for access to PSE was the level of education attained by a student's parents. Unfortunately, Native American students are not well represented in these categories that are likely to lead to entering PSE.

What can make it more difficult for students with parents that have not gone to college is that the parents cannot help their children with college search, college applications, financial aid paperwork, or the transition to college. Sykes (2014) said of his own experience, "the admission process and requisite skills to succeed in college were foreign to me" (p. 6).

One question is whether Native Americans are on the same footing when it comes to showing academic proficiency and being prepared for post-secondary education. Taylor and Lee (2011) did a study over five years where they analyzed reading test scores for fourth, seventh and tenth graders. In each of the five years, approximately 200,000 scores were analyzed for differential item functioning (DFI). Taylor and Lee found that multiple choice questions favored White students and constructed response items favored minority students. Taylor and Lee speculated that for multiple choice questions "readers must recognize appropriate inference or

interpretation" (p. 37) inherent in the question, which would be based on prior knowledge and may not be available or apparent to minority students. Taylor and Lee indicated that the required knowledge in questions may be obvious to test writers since the test writers are generally White. The reason minority students may have done better in the constructed response questions, Taylor and Lee suggested, was because the student could create their own interpretation of the reading, rather relying on an assumed interpretation. Taylor and Lee explained that socioeconomic status may also be a factor in question interpretation since socioeconomic status is generally aligned with ethnicity. McLeod (2014) affirmed that according to Vygotsky, a child's environment will form their cognitive development and how they think.

In another study, Chen, Hernandez and Dong (2015) evaluated pretests and posttests, interviews, and observations of 15 urban college seniors and graduate students who participated in a collaborative project-based learning (CPBL) course. In Findings and Interpretations, Chen et al. noted that for the pretest Hispanic students exhibited a lower perceived self-efficacy than White students, but this difference disappeared in the posttest. Chen et al. stated that some of the benefits for the CPBL course included multiple perspectives, authentic context, collaboration, communication, and deeper learning, which included discovering unexpected connections and complexity in their learning. In their Discussion, Chen et al. expressed that they found little influence based on gender, socioeconomic status, or ethnicity, but the group dynamics played an important role in the students' learning. This is consistent with several other sources.

Kolb's theory asserted that knowledge acquisition comes from experience, not just instruction (Bergsteiner, Avery & Neuman, 2010). Lafever (2016) suggested a reframing of Bloom's taxonomy to a Medicine Wheel for Native Americans, in part because the Medicine Wheel includes not just a cognitive domain, but physical and affective domains as well. The

CPBL course mentioned by Chen, et al. (2015) is consistent with Native ways of learning, which could account for little influence based on ethnicity. Hain-Jamal (2013) stated that for Native Americans, personal experience has a greater determinant in learning than a logic without an empirical component.

The percentage of Native Americans in Arizona with a post-secondary degree has been less than half the percentage for Whites in Arizona (Lumina Foundation, 2014), while on the White Mountain Apache Reservation the rate of graduates pursuing post-secondary education after high school is even lower, between 10% and 15% (D. Whitesinger, personal communication, July 28, 2017; B. Dreyer, personal communication, July 31, 2017). Poverty is endemic throughout the reservation (Arizona Department of Education, 2014). Students with lower economic status have been shown to have lower educational performance (Lee & Slate, 2014). Lee and Slate analyzed over 220,000 11^{th} grade student scores on both language arts and mathematics on the performance of the Texas Assessment of Knowledge and Skills in 2012. In the Results section of their study, those students labeled as economically disadvantaged were statistically significantly lower in performance than those not labeled as economically disadvantaged. Wright and Slate (2015) analyzed reading scores on the Texas Assessment of Knowledge and Skills for over 700,000 6^{th}, $7^{th,}$ and 8^{th}-graders and found that economically disadvantage students performed statistically lower than those not economically disadvantage. Native Americans reported in the American Community Survey for 2006-2010, which included 37 tribal affiliations of single-race Native Americans, that American Indian and Alaska Natives had higher levels of poverty than Whites (Huyser, Take & Sakamoto, 2014). Native American students attend higher poverty schools than Whites in both elementary and high schools (Logan & Burdick-Will, 2016). Durham, et al. (2015) suggested that the home environment, including

poverty, neighborhood violence, food insecurity and family trauma, may have more of an effect on student outcomes than the environment of the classroom. Although a school should do as much as possible to provide transformative experiences for students, to be even more effective schools may have to offer programs and services outside of the school to families and communities. Logan and Burdick-Will found that students in high poverty areas who attend a charter school generally benefit from a better-performing school.

The White Mountain Apache Reservation has no charter schools on the reservation. Some White Mountain Apaches travel over 50 miles to the closest urban center to attend non-reservation public schools, and in some cases private schools, to get a better education. Many Native Americans attend schools run and funded by the Bureau of Indian Affairs, yet many of these schools are also in high poverty areas. Even President Obama admitted that the Bureau of Indian Affairs has been underfunded and mismanaged (Morris, 2015). About a quarter of White Mountain Apache students attend Bureau of Indian Affairs funded schools.

Different Worldview

Hain-Jamall (2013) categorized cultural worldviews into two broad categories: individualistic and collectivistic. As the two terms imply, an individualistic culture often considers the individual as a separate entity from the surroundings while the collectivistic culture considers how individuals are connected to others and the environment. In other words, the individualistic worldviews examine separate entities and the collectivistic worldview perceives systems. In general, Hain-Jamall contended that the White culture is individualistic and Native culture is collectivistic. For instance, Dongoske, Pasqual, and King (2015) maintained that a Western worldview is materialistic and centered on Western scientific values, which fails to take into account a Native American perspective on environmental issues when considering the

National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) actions. Dongoske et al. asserted that the views taken in NEPA actions devalued Native American worldviews as well as put Native Americans at a disadvantage. The Bureau of Land Management wanted to kill one type of fish to balance the population of another fish, which Dongoske et al. described as a decision based on a materialistic worldview. The affected Native Americans disagreed with this assessment because the killing of the fish was believed to be killing of part of the Native Americans' family as well as desecrating a sacred site. Dongoske et al. argued that the knowledge Native Americans' had of their environment was "based upon empirical observations that have been accumulated and tested over centuries" (p. 40) was dismissed as unscientific.

Individualistic cultures also value individual achievement and competition. In the White educational system, letter grades are earned by individuals which measure achievement and a higher grade indicates a superior level of status. Because letter grades are earned by individuals, the grade also represents the individualistic value of independence. In contrast, a collectivistic Native culture would value group work which does not single out individuals as superior to other individuals, which Hain-Jamall said would be contrary to Native cultural norms. Students answering questions posed by a teacher in a classroom setting would appeal to the competition and status aspects of an individualistic worldview. This would not be valued by a collectivistic worldview because answering questions in a group setting would draw attention to the individual and could be considered presumptuous in a collectivist worldview. Hain-Jamall (2013) indicated that the majority of teachers in the United States are White who have an individualistic worldview which provides "infinite possibilities for misinterpretation and misunderstandings with Native-American students" (p. 14). Schoorman (2016) called for ongoing learning by

educators in understanding the students they teach and understanding the communities they serve, in part to better understand their own "limited and privileged perspectives" (p. 800).

Native American students have experienced a different culture and have grown up with different values than the mainstream culture of the United States. On a small reservation community, most high school graduates know of a relative or tribal member who has gone off to college, often to return without a degree. One major difficulty these returning students have experienced while at college has been an experience referred to as transition shock (McLachlan & Justice, 2009) or acculturation (Flynn et al., 2014), which is the difficulty of students adapting to a culture different from the one where they grew up. Some transition shock has been due to different ways of thinking between students who have grown up on a Native American reservation and the mainstream U.S. culture (Minthorn, 2014; Minthorn, 2015). Minthorn (2014) noted in her Recommendations section that college staff working with on-campus housing make an effort to understand Native Americans' culture and beliefs, as well as offering activities to support this population. Adjusting to a different culture, and especially balancing the values from their home culture and the values of the institution, has been especially stressful for Native American students (Flynn et al., 2014). For instance, many post-secondary institutions have valued individualism as opposed to Native American's values of community and collectivism (Lundberg, 2014; Collins & Mueller, 2016; Grayshield et al., 2015; Eric Development Team, 2002). High school graduates on the reservation most likely have heard about these acculturation difficulties from relatives and other tribal members which may play in their own decision to whether to attend college.

Collins and Mueller (2016) explained that historically Native American knowledge of the world has been discredited and disparaged by the mainstream White culture. Collins and Mueller

conducted a case study and conducted 52 interviews with faculty of the University of Hawaii, Manoa (UHM) and local food producers involved in the UHM extension program. In their Implications section, the study contended that the university personnel retained a Western perspective of science in relation to the food producers which limited exchanges of knowledge. The Implications section also concluded that the Western scientific bias limited public funds to local food producers. Native American students have been put in an uncomfortable position in mainstream settings when they have had to acknowledge or defend their way of thinking. When discussion includes perceptions of the world, even if the student doesn't vocalize particular beliefs, Native Americans have acutely felt their minority status. Lundberg (2014) asserted that these cultural value differences have detracted from the achievement of Native American students. Educators engaging students in high-poverty communities to understand their culture, experiences and worldview can gain a better understanding of how individuals in the community have been marginalized (Schoorman, 2016). This process can help educators to reflect on how the educational process can bring about positive change. Baltes, Hernandez, and Collins (2015) suggested students of different cultures engage in talk about their cultures and backgrounds, especially through a structured program, to promote positive changes in attitudes and behavior. Although, any interventions to confront attitudes and beliefs, and promote changes, should include indigenous communities in the developmental stages (Brave Heart et al., 2011).

Implications

This study has the possibility of contributing in some areas as follows: a) it will add to the research on emerging adulthood and TribalCrit; b) it will add to those who experience life in a multicultural setting; c) it will add some insight into the mindset of a tribal people considering a more direct immersion into the mainstream culture, thus also adding to the literature on

TribalCrit; d) it will inform tribal members on the White Mountain Apache Tribe; e) it will inform educators on what future high school graduates might take into account when considering post-secondary education. Educators may then be able to anticipate concerns of future graduates and address these concerns before graduation; and f) it will possibly contain useful information for tribal leaders and tribal agencies in better understanding the emerging adults living on the reservation: however, the results will not be transferable to other locations. Although Native American tribes have some similarities, each tribe is unique. This research is hoped to provide insight to the White Mountain Apache Tribe. Other tribes in the United States might find this research helpful, but before any results could be transferred, a study within their tribe would be necessary.

Summary

It is not known what perceptions high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation have that contribute to a decision not to go on to college. Also, it is not known how cultural values and family obligations contribute to a decision of White Mountain Apache high school graduates not to attend college.

The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study is to explore perceptions of high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation that contribute to a decision not to go on to college. It is not known how high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation perceive factors that contribute to a decision not to go on to college. Also, to explore how cultural values and family obligations contribute to a decision of White Mountain Apache high school graduates not to attend college.

The following research questions will be addressed in this study:

RQ1: How do high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation perceive the factors that contribute to a decision not to go on to college?

RQ2: How do high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation perceive cultural values and family obligations contribute to a decision of White Mountain Apache high school graduates not to attend college?

A low rate of high school graduates of Native American decent going on to college is a problem throughout the United States. On the White Mountain Apache Reservation the rate of high school graduates going on to college is especially low. Further research has been recommended (Mitchell & Syed, 2015; Phinney, 2010; Schwartz, Cote & Arnett, 2005) on emerging adults who do not go on to college, especially of cultures outside the mainstream culture. Understanding what drives a high school graduate on the White Mountain Apache Reservation to not to continue with post-secondary education might be important in a deeper understanding of the reservation community and in generating possible solutions that could increase this rate. Results from this study could help educators on the White Mountain Apache Reservation better understand perceptions that affect high school graduates' decisions, and hopefully promote higher incomes and a better quality of life.

Emerging adult theory will be a lens to understand the perceptions of high school graduates in a Native American community. Taking a broader view of Native Americans and education it is clear that Native Americans do not graduate from high school and do not go on to college at the same rate as other American students. The period of emerging adulthood is also a period of forming an identity. For minority groups such as Native Americans, there is the added complication of forming an identity that is different from the dominant culture, especially since most colleges and universities are embedded with mainstream values. Developing an identity

can range from separating from the mainstream culture to adopting the mainstream culture, or finding some mix of integrating both a traditional culture with the dominant culture. The process of forming an identity may be difficult for emerging adults who have had exposure global influences and values that parents and elders may have difficulty accepting. These conflicts of values may mean the emerging adult in a minority culture must navigate the identity forming process without traditional supports. A sense of self-efficacy may also play a role with emerging adults with lower levels of self-efficacy taking a route of least resistance. In the case of minority cultures, this path of least resistance may mean not making difficult decisions such as going off to college.

Tribal Critical Race Theory contends that a colonial attitude toward Native Americans still persists across the country, including in higher education institutions. Both emerging adulthood of minority groups and Tribal Critical Race Theory suggests that values of family and culture, as well as a different way of perceiving the world, might be at odds with the mainstream values of what post-secondary education can provide. There is also evidence that historical trauma is still experienced by many Native Americans. Leaving a known and familiar culture and entering a culture that is different – a culture that may see the traditional culture as inferior – may make a transition into an educational institution with mainstream values may be a difficult step to make.

Native Americans have a lower rate of educational attainment than the rest of the population. Lower rates of educational attainment is also associated with poverty. Differences in culture and poverty are both attributes of Native Americans. Unfortunately, poverty is linked with the lower performance of students on standardized tests, which may make it difficult for

Native American students to enter post-secondary education or succeed in post-secondary education.

Native Americans have a different view of the world than the mainstream culture, which can lead to difficulties in transition or not feeling a part of a post-secondary environment that has different values. Differences in worldview have conflicted with differing values in different cultures. In general, the mainstream culture values individualism, which Native cultures value collectivism. Navigating these cultural differences can be difficult, but efforts by both groups to understand each other can be a path forward.

A few points on the Methodology. A qualitative exploratory case study design was selected for this study. Participants will include White Mountain Apache tribal members who have graduated from high school but have decided not to go on to college. Semi-structured interviews, focus groups, and researcher observations will be used to collect data. Interviews will provide a deeper more personal view of the reasons that led to not going on to college and lay a foundation for identifying themes in the decision process. Themes identified in the interviews would be explored in the focus groups. Focus groups will allow for interaction of participants and clarifying perceptions that are important to White Mountain Apache high school graduates. Focus groups will allow members to suggest which considerations are most prevalent and have the most impact. Data will be analyzed through coding and categorizing from transcripts of focus groups, interviews, and researcher notes. Research software will be used to assist in this process.

Section 2: The Methodology

Design and Approach

The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study is to explore perceptions of high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation that contribute to a decision not to go on to college. It is not known how high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation perceive factors that contribute to a decision not to go on to college. Also, to explore how cultural values and family obligations contribute to a decision of White Mountain Apache high school graduates not to attend college.

Approach

Qualitative research was used by the researcher to acquire a sense of meaning through the perspective of the participants (Lodico, Spaulding, & Voegtle, 2010). This research was based on the qualitative approach, which was suitable to gaining individual perspectives and interpretations of events and investigate meaning from the experiences of a specific group of people (Creswell, 2012; Merriam & Tisdell, 2016). Qualitative research can focus on meaning and phenomena that are difficult to get using qualitative means (Murakami, 2013). Although qualitative approaches have their place, qualitative methods can help to both validate quantitative results as well as provide a deeper understanding of the phenomena (Viola, Musso, Inguglia & Lo Coco, 2016).

Design

The problem investigated is a lack of understanding of why so many White Mountain Apache high school graduates do not go on to college. There is a dearth of data on the White Mountain Apache, especially regarding post-secondary education. Collecting information on this problem requires listening directly to the voices of the White Mountain Apache to address

each research question: ask these high school graduates directly their perceptions as to what directed their decisions and how culture was a factor. According to Yin (2013, p. 321), "The classic case study consists of an in-depth inquiry into a specific and complex phenomenon (the 'case'), set within its real-world context." Case studies may have a large number of variables and few data points, however, "case study methods [are] a viable alternative among the other methodological choices" (Yin, 2013, p. 323). Merriam and Tisdell (2016) contended that a case study is appropriate for examining a specific, identifiable group of people, and whose end product is "richly descriptive" (p. 37). Therefore, a case study design was used for this study. The data for this research was gathered using focus groups, interviews, and researcher notes.

Participants

Sample

Seventeen participants were recruited to participate in focus groups, semi-structured interviews, or both (see Table 1 in the following section). All participants were White Mountain Apache tribal members, 12 participants had graduated 10 years ago or less, and 13 had not attended any college, with four having earned 12 or less college credits. Focus groups ranged from three to nine participants, which allowed for interaction between participants.

Sampling Method and Sample Criteria see rubric for this section

The purposive sampling method was used to select the participants. Purposive sampling engages participants who have experiences and knowledge associated with the research questions of the study (Lodico, Spaulding, & Voegtle, 2010). The criteria used to select the participants were tribal members of the White Mountain Tribe that graduated from a high school within the last ten years and have decided not to pursue a post-secondary program.

The nature and purpose of the research was explained to participants in advertisements, during initial contact, and verbally during the focus group or interview. Participants were ensured confidentiality, and participants were told they could drop out at any time, although no participant dropped out. It was explained to participants that the only anticipated harm might be discomfort discussing topics of a personal nature. In this regard, participants were informed that they may refrain from continuing a discussion if their discomfort becomes more than they are comfortable with. Before focus groups or interviews began, were told verbally and participants signed an informed consent which disclosed that focus group discussions and interviews would be audio recorded.

Data Collection, Analysis, and Results

Introduction

The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study is to investigate perceptions of high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation that contribute to a decision not to go attend college. A qualitative case study approach was used to gather data, which included seventeen high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Tribe. Each participant participated in either an interview, a focus group, or both. The researcher also took notes during interviews and focus groups. All participants were members of the White Mountain Apache Tribe, and interviews and focus groups took place on the White Mountain Apache Reservation in either of two locations, Whiteriver (the main population center of the reservation on the west side) or Cibecue (the eastern-most village on the reservation). Table 1 below shows a list of participants with some demographics.

Table 1 – Participants

Participant ID	High School Graduation Year	High School Graduated From	Interview	Focus Group
Participant 1	2018	Riverside, CA	Yes	
Participant 2	2008	Cibecue, AZ	Yes	Yes
Participant 3	2012	Cibecue, AZ	Yes	Yes
Participant 4	2016	Cibecue, AZ	Yes	
Participant 5	2013	Cibecue, AZ	Yes	
Participant 6	2013	Cibecue, AZ	Yes	Yes
Participant 7	2009	Cibecue, AZ	Yes	Yes
Participant 8	2012	Riverside, OK	Yes	
Participant 9	2012	Cibecue, AZ		Yes
Participant 10	2010	Alchesay, AZ	Yes	Yes
Participant 11	1993	Alchesay, AZ		Yes
Participant 12	2010	Alchesay, AZ	Yes	Yes
Participant 13	1994	Sherman, CA		Yes
Participant 14	2012	Native Boarding School, South Dakota		Yes
Participant 15	2009	Alchesay, AZ		Yes
Participant 16	2002	Northern Arizona Academy, AZ		Yes
Participant 17	1998	Alchesay, AZ		Yes

After each interview or focus group, the audio recording was transcribed into the QDAMAX research software. The transcripts were then printed and the researcher searched for common themes that had an impact on the decision to not pursue college after high school graduation. These themes were then coded into the QDAMAX research software. The themes were grouped and printed again, which were reviewed for cohesiveness or additional themes were identified and re-coded.

Data Collection

The first form of data collected was from focus groups. When approval was received by the Internal Review Board (IRB), flyers and consent forms were sent out to different representatives in the community, including schools, the Education Department for the tribe, the

secretary for the Tribal Council, and members of the community to reach out to prospective participants. A focus group date was set, first for the community of Cibecue, and information was given to prospective participants inviting them to attend. Only one person showed up for the first focus group. Instead of conducting a focus group at that time, the participant was asked if he would participant in an interview. He agreed, so the interview was conducted instead. Two more focus groups were scheduled for Cibecue. In Cibecue a total of five people showed up to focus groups. A focus group was also scheduled for the community of Whiteriver, with interviews scheduled after that focus group. In Whiteriver there were eight people in the focus group. Therefore, there was a total of 13 participants in focus groups for this study.

Interviews were the second form of data collected. Some participants were unable to attend focus groups, but were willing to be interviewed, so those individuals were interviewed. In Cibecue eight people were interviewed and in Whiteriver only two were available for interview, for a total of ten interviews. The average length of focus groups and interviews were just under 20 minutes (the shortest was an interview of just over 7 minutes and the longest was the Whiteriver focus group that was one hour and 12 minutes), for a total of more than four hours of audio.

The third form of data collected was researcher notes. Notes were taken during focus groups and interviews, as well as notes taken on transcripts and printed coding categories. Researcher notes during focus groups and interviews helped to identify speakers on the audio recordings. Notes on transcripts and coding categories helped to parse out themes for results.

The researcher has worked on the White Mountain Reservation for twelve years prior to data collection, but he was not working on the reservation for almost two years prior to data collection. The researcher knew some of the participants. One positive of knowing participants

was a knowledge of family histories, and having a deeper understanding of individual stories. During analyzation of data, however, codes were used based on verbatim words of participants. In coding using QDAMAX, parts of focus groups and interviews were highlighted for each code. Printed codes were only the words of participants, and these quotes were used to write the results.

Data Analysis

Conducting the focus groups and interviews was the first level of data analysis as the researcher listened to responses of participants. The second level of data analysis was during the transcription of each audio file of the focus groups and interviews. As the researcher listened and transcribed each response into QDAMAX, data was reviewed a second time. This provided the researcher a deep familiarity of each discussion, especially since each quote had to be listened to multiple times to be transcribed accurately. The researcher's handwritten notes were used to help ensure each comment was attributed to the correct person, as well as, in a few cases, helping to be sure quotes were recorded correctly. Each focus group and interview transcription was then printed. A third level of data analysis occurred as these transcripts were reviewed and initial codes were written into the margins. These codes were entered into QDAMAX. QDAMAX was used to group codes, and these grouped codes were printed. The fourth level of data analysis occurred when these coded pages were reviewed, with more notes taken in margins. In some cases, more codes were recognized and entered into QDAMAX, so each category was as comprehensive as possible. QDAMAX was used to resort and reprint collected codes to be reviewed yet another time.

All transcribed sessions were kept in a notebook with tabs to make finding data easily. Coded groups that were printed were also kept in the same notebook with tabs to identity each

code. Notes, consent forms, the literature matrix, and other materials were also kept in this notebook. These materials were used to write up the summary of results. Main themes were identified, then subcategorized as necessary. The themes, with subcategories, follow.

- Aspirations and Goals
    - Military
    - Further Education
- Barriers to Further Education
    - Finances, Paperwork, and Transportation
    - Family Obligations
    - Educational Expectations End at High School
    - Alcohol and Drugs
    - Being Stuck
- Differences in Worldview
    - Knowledge, Wisdom, and Education
    - Competing Worldviews on the Reservation
    - Involving the Community
- Historical Trauma
    - Experiences of Historical Trauma
    - Lands
    - Healing

The printed codes were physically arranged into the themes and subcategories as listed above. Using the above outline, words of the participants were used to write the summary of results. This was a fifth level of immersion into the data.

After the summary of the results was written, a copy was sent or given to participants for feedback. The feedback was positive, with no recommendations for change. None of the participants that responded to the summary of results said they thought any of the results were misrepresented or inaccurate, or that anything was left out. The summary of results was also given to some colleagues for feedback; again, no recommendations for major changes.

In this section the themes that have emerged from the data are presented. The first theme is the aspirations the participants had when they graduated from high school; the possibilities they saw for their future. Second will be some of the barriers these high school graduates perceived that were between them and achieving their goals. Third and fourth will are differences in worldview and historical trauma, respectively. These themes were represented in the literature, and these themes came up frequently in the focus groups and interviews.

Aspirations and Goals.

Military. All participants indicated that they had aspirations beyond graduating from high school. Most of them thought that college would be the path taken after graduation, and participants 2, 9, 11 and 14 considered the military. Participant 2 was not sure what he would do with his life after high school, other than work. It took this participant a year to decide that the military was a good choice for him. Working with a recruiter he was all set to enter the service. . He said the recruiter "really didn't want to take any chance with me, so he just, basically, just shut me out." Participant 11 seemed to have "lucked into" the military. An acquaintance saw potential in him and arranged for him to take the ASVAB (Armed Services Vocational Aptitude

Battery). He said the only reason he took the test was because "I could get out of half a day of [high] school if I did my ASVAB…" He said the following Monday he was in boot camp, and he was in the Marine Corps for four years. Participant 14 was part of the Junior Reserve Officer Training Corps (JROTC) in high school, which allowed her to begin college through the military. Unfortunately, she attended college for only one semester, and she said she left college because of some experiences involving racism. Participant 9 considered going into the military, but his mom talked him out of it. He said, "She was worried for me that I might not come back home." He then got accepted to Southwest Indian Polytechnic Institute (SIPI), but never went.

Further Education. The other participants all indicated that they had planned on attending college after high school graduation. Some of the courses of study they were interested in included: culinary arts, architecture, cosmetology, computer graphics, law enforcement, child protective services, and emergency medical technician/paramedic. The comments that follow are from both interviews and focus groups in response to what aspirations they had for after high school graduation.

Participant 12, "I did want to go to college, but … I needed to take care of my daughter."

Participant 6, "… college was a really big part of my consideration when I graduated [from high school]."

Participant 16, "…when I was done with high school I lost focus… I went to work and I didn't think about college until years later. I realized you can go to school, like um, from home."

Participant 14, "I was pretty blessed with my mom being so about education…"

Participant 5, "I was thinking about going back to school."

Participant 3, "[My plan] was to go back to school…and I wanted to try out for, um, sports…"

Participant 4, “My main thing was to go the police academy.”

Participant 7, “…my plans were basically…to go back to college… to be a paramedic.”

Participant 15, “I wanted to get into college.”

Participant 8, “…go to college and get some kind of degree.”

Participant 10, “I wanted to do law enforcement and case working, [which would have required more education].”

Participant 1, “[M]y ambition was to become a cosmetologist. I got a free ride into college…”

Participant 9, “I got accepted to that place called SIPI (Southwest Indian Polytechnic Institute).”

These comments indicated that these high school graduates did have aspirations to pursue college after graduation. Of the participants that made the above comments, participants 12, 14, 15, and 16 went on to college for one semester or less, and participants 1, 4 and 9 were accepted to school but did not go. Participants 3, 6, 8, and 10 started processing paperwork to attend college. Each faced some sort of barrier that prevented them from going on to college or prevented them from getting a degree or certificate.

Barriers to Further Education. The participants of this study described several barriers that they experienced as they pursued an education beyond high school graduation. Below are the what they perceived to be the main barriers, and some participants experienced more than one barrier.

Finances, Paperwork, and Transportation. One barrier to furthering an education, as related by the participants, included doing the paperwork (which here includes filling out a hardcopy or filling out a document on a computer to apply to college and/or apply for financial

aid). Also, because most communities on the reservation are 30 to 60 minutes from the closest town, transportation to the local community college proved to be a barrier, especially for families who share a car or cannot afford a car. The social economic status of those who live on the reservation is well below that of the mainstream population (Arizona Department of Education, 2014; Flynn, Olson, & Yellig, 2014). This means that most, if not all, tribal members of the White Mountain Apache Tribe cannot afford education beyond high school without some financial assistance. During a focus group the discussion revolved around barriers to post-secondary education. Participant 16 stated, "…we don't have money, we don't have money like that, even just to make monthly payments… we don't have that kind of money… We live with not just our families, we live with our aunties, our cousins, our uncles, we provide for each other, and it's a lot for all of us to try and push other people to just go [to college]."

Getting this assistance turned out to be an insurmountable obstacle for some of the participants, in large part because of the difficulty of providing the documentation needed. The literature indicates that this is not a problem just for those on the White Mountain Apache reservation (Finnie, Wismer, & Mueller, 2015). The difficulty of paperwork was the subject of discussion in focus groups in both Whiteriver and Cibecue. More than one participant acknowledged that there is a lot of money out there for Native Americans, but, as participant 14 put it, "… we wouldn't know how to even establish a connection with getting these scholarships." Because most of the participants in this study have parents who have not gone on to college, many do not have the luxury of a family member to guide them through the process of filling out paperwork, especially for financial aid. For many of the adults on the White Mountain Apache reservation ~~in the community~~, even using a computer can be daunting, and filling out a document can be overwhelming for a society that does not have a history of the written word.

The real difficulty, however, seemed to have been when participants experienced obstacles in the paperwork process that they did not know how to get around.

Participant 8 had decided on a school to attend, but found out the school had closed down. She decided to try the local community college (about a 45 minute drive from her home). She went as far as starting the FAFSA, but did not know how to answer some of the questions on the form. Before she could finish that document, she moved do a different reservation with her boyfriend. She is now back on her home reservation, and she says she would still consider attending the local community college. However, with no car, transportation of 45 minutes still proved to be a barrier. This was not a person who lacked intelligence or agency, for she graduated from high school three months early.

Participants 2, 3, and 6, who were valedictorian or salutatorian, also had difficulty in completing paperwork to attend college. Participant 6 applied for scholarships through the Tribal Education Department, but she said, "I don't know what happened, they never got back to me. When I called back they said they already had [given scholarships] for the year." Participant 3 said, "I had trouble, trouble with, you know, with paperwork stuff, and financial aid, and, just like, getting scholarships and all." Participant 2 said "…every time I applied they would say the paperwork got lost, that I never turned it in…" He was told that he had to do the paperwork over. He went on to say, "Yeah, get more paperwork done. That's what happened over there at Tribal Ed."

I also spoke to a father (personal communication, June 2013) of yet another valedictorian. He told me his daughter should have been awarded funds through the Tribal Education Department on the reservation, but he was also told the paperwork was never turned in to their office. This father said he had personally brought the paperwork to the office. His daughter

ended up getting a scholarship through the college for tuition, but the father had to do fundraisers to pay for his daughter's boarding and other expenses. two school representatives from one of the reservation high schools (personal communications, May 2015) who both said that paperwork submitted to the Tribal Education Department was lost on more than one occasion. One of these representatives resorted to delivering paperwork in person and obtaining a signature from the receiving department to acknowledge the receipt of paperwork. This representative indicated that on a follow-up phone call the department indicated the paperwork was not received. Both representatives claimed a number of qualifying students missed out on getting financial assistance for college. Participant 11 had a similar comment, "These guys in education aren't doing their jobs. Somewhere, somebody's not doing their jobs." Participant 14 said, "You see recruiters for military coming to the high school, but you don't see the Education Department trying to let you know anything."

During the focus group in Cibecue there as discussion of pursuing online courses, but participants indicated that the cost of a computer was prohibitive, and participant 9 said "WiFi is a problem." On the White Mountain Apache reservation service is limited for cellphones and internet, and the cost for data usage can be expensive. During the same focus group participant 6 said, "We have a library [with internet]. It's open to the public. But it has a time limit to one hour [for users]." Participant 9 added, "I asked if I can do extra time, but I couldn't." Whiteriver is a larger community, but also has limited internet. one mother (personal communication, Marianna Minjarez, April 2019) said, "Data runs out fast, and it is expensive to buy more data." During the Whiteriver focus group participant 16 said she did some online courses and really liked it. She commented that online courses were "convenient, easy, real fast,

doable, manageable." She also said, "I just ended up mismanaging funds, and I just wasn't able to do it anymore." She completed only 12 credits.

Even getting financial assistance is not a guarantee school will be successful. Participant 11 during the Whiteriver focus group said, "There were a lot of people that I know that went off to college. After they got their scholarship they paid all their books, bills, you know, a lot of them just partied with the rest of the money." As mentioned above, participant 16 did one semester of college, but admitted she "mismanaged funds." Participant 11 added, "There's no concept of saving." With the perception of family obligations being so strong on the reservation, some people feel any money they have must also be shared with the family. In a personal communication with the founder of a private school (Bob Higgins, April 2019), the told me he knew of high school graduates on the reservation who got scholarships for college, but had to quit after a semester or two because the scholarship money was given to the family back on the reservation. Perceived obligations to family overwhelmed the need to pay for college expenses.

Family Obligations. A barrier for many high school graduates is obligations they feel for their families. All the participants indicated family obligations were more important than furthering their education. Regarding obligations to family, participant 16 said during the Whiteriver focus group, "We take care of them [family]. If something like that happens [illness, injury, or age] we're there. We help. And it's more of like a family thing over education."

One of the most obvious family obligations is children. Participants 10 and 12 said they got pregnant during high school, which prevented them from going on to college right away. Participant 12 said, "I needed to take care of my daughter more than going to school." Although both participants have graduated from high school over ten years ago, both still have aspirations to go on to college. At least participant 10 is actively pursuing that route. Participant

11 said, “I got a girl pregnant [in high school] so I said, ‘Man, I’ve got to man up and do something.’” He did not go on to college but did get into the military and later got a good job. Participant 8 did not get pregnant in high school, but as she was thinking about going on to college, “I ended up getting pregnant” and then moved to her boyfriend’s reservation “three hours away from here.” For others it was similar; they did not get pregnant in high school, but soon had children, which interfered with college plans.

Although some still have aspirations for further education, participant 7 said “it’s just the kids right now.” This mother has three kids, all under six. Participant 9 said a similar thing, “…go to a job, have a job, but It’s hard [because] you have to worry about your kids.” In his case he was referring to child care; his girlfriend could watch the children, but she was also looking for work.

Children were not the only consideration regarding family. Participant 10 said “I could have graduated early” but waited a year so as not to overshadow her cousin. Her cousin was feeling bad because “her sister took the light from her.” Participant 10 added, “So I just kind of stepped back. I could have graduated a year early.” . Participant 16 said, “You have to watch your brothers and sisters. You have to cook, you have to clean, you can’t do this, you can’t do that, you know.”

In some cases it is the direct care of family members. Participant 12 was going to college and got word “my father had gotten beat up pretty bad…” She had to leave college – first semester – and care for her father. When she tried to resume college she said she was told by the college, “You missed too much credits, you were already on probation, and there’s nothing we can do about it, we can’t help you.” Regarding this she said “my life just broke apart.” For others, it was a death in the family. Participant 1 said, “My great-grandma died… I came back

and, I don't know, everything fell apart afterwards." He did not go to college, even though he had a scholarship to attend college.

Many expressed the perception that they were obligated to help the family. Participant 16 put it this way, "We… care more than we should, because we're carrying our life, and we're carrying our moms', and our sisters', and our cousins', and our whatever or whoever is in our household or whoever's household we are in." She added, "You know, sometimes we can't say no." Many of the participants indicated that it wasn't just immediate family members that they had obligations to, but the extended family: grandmother, grandfathers, uncles, aunties, cousins, nieces, nephews, and even members of the god-family. The Sunrise Dance is an opportunity to invite, in the words of participant 12, "a completely different family that we're not related to so that our family can be bigger… it's called shi'di'keh. And that's… our family from the Sunrise Dance." Although the shi'di'keh may not be blood related, there are still obligations, many of which may be financial. Sunrise Dances are very important to the culture, and can be expensive, including for the shi'di'keh. This is also true for funerals and graduation celebrations.

Educational Expectations End at High School. Many of the participants in the focus groups and the interviews indicated that the expectation was to graduate from high school, but there was no, or little, expectation to continue school after high school graduation. When asked about educational expectations in the family, participant 1 said many of his family members, including his brothers, father, and grandparents did not even graduate from high school. He said, "I don't know, it was probably the expectation, though, was just to graduate from high school." Participant 12, in talking about parents and grandparents, said, "…all they had to get was their [high school] diploma," and added, "…when it comes to school, it's more like, 'You're on your own.'" She explained that it wasn't that her parents and grandparents didn't want to help her

through school. It was that they didn't know how to help her through school. They had neither the experience nor the knowledge regarding education beyond high school on the reservation. Referring to her mother, participant 14 said that although her mother graduated from high school, "…she really didn't know anything besides just getting the job and working and she never looked for college." Participant 15 noted, "…they didn't have a college offered here on the rez. In the old days there was no NPC (Northern Pioneer College)."

Previous generations didn't see much beyond the reservation, including education. A high school diploma was all that was needed to get a job. Parents told participant 12, "Get a job somewhere, it doesn't matter. Start as a janitor position, you can work your way up." She said the attitude of her parents "was more like what are you gonna do as in work, not in education." Participant 11 said, "The only thing that was on my mind was a diploma." He said that even his high school didn't encourage further education after getting a diploma; "My counselors never told me nothing… that's how far my goal was, just get a diploma."

In fact, many of the participants didn't feel even a high school diploma was necessary to get a job on the reservation. "There's a lot of nepotism [in the Tribe]," said participant 11. Participant 14 said of the Tribe, "…they only hire you of who you know, and who you're related to." She added, "A lot of these people don't even have a high school diploma." More than one participant indicated that even with a college degree, getting a job on the reservation was difficult, which led some to wonder if getting a degree was worth it. Participant 15 said it this way, "There're few jobs here with their experience, you know, for what they went to school for, so they would have to go back off the reservation to apply for a job."

Alcohol and Drugs. Some of the participants at both Whiteriver and Cibecue focus groups mentioned that alcohol and drugs had been either a problem for themselves or people

they knew. Participant 9 said alcohol got in the way of going to college, "Alcohol, that's why I didn't go," and added "your friends can pull you down." Participant 12 said, "I did go on the drunk for like a long time, and I didn't think about going to school… A lot of the time you get sucked into that lifestyle." Participant 11 said, "The biggest barrier is alcohol and drugs." Participant added, "Family would be a big barrier, because your family [laughter] could be where you get your alcohol." Participant 11 admitted, "I had extra [money from financial assistance], and was just, you know, drinking with that." In an interview participant 7 said, "It just didn't work out for me, maybe because I had the wrong friends at the time and they introduced me to, you know, like, alcohol. So that's what I started doing. I just never had a chance to do what I wanted to do." Alcohol and drugs were clearly a barrier for these participants or their families.

Being Stuck. Although most participants had planned on doing something after graduating from high school, some felt they just "got stuck" and didn't move forward. Participant 1, who returned to the reservation for his grandmother's funeral, said "I think I just got stuck" and he didn't pursue college, even though he had a scholarship. In the Whiteriver focus group participant 12 said, "When I was done with high school I lost focus, I guess. And then I didn't think about college. I thought about the life I was living… and eventually it just became every day." Participant 16, in the same focus group, said, "We have people that take care of us, we have everything we need here… being home would be easier than going to college." She added, "It's not that we don't have the support, or that we can't find it, it's just that we're stuck." Participant 13 spoke of her daughter not wanting to go back to school because, as the daughter said, "I want to be with you where I'm safe." In an interview participant 12 said, "I got a job… why would I go back to school?" In the Cibecue focus group participant 3 used almost the same words, "Basically I concentrated just on work. The only thing

that kept me going was work." Also in Cibecue, participant 2 said about getting a job in construction, "I really didn't have anything else to do. From there I just got stuck." It's hard to know if these people got entrenched in their lives on the reservation, lost interest in school, were afraid of a new environment, or felt other ties that kept them from leaving. Participant 3 added, "[school] was going to be a little more harder since I forgot math and division and literature and all that stuff." A few participants seemed to have an excuse for not going on to school after a few years. Participant 5 said, "My handwriting is no good." Participant 4 said, "I didn't have a driver's license for so long."

Differences in worldview.

Knowledge, Wisdom, and Education. In both focus groups and interviews, participants brought up a number of ways how they, as Native Americans, have a different worldview than White Americans. This is not to say that one worldview is better than the other, but many people are not even aware that there is a difference. One way that the two worldviews are different includes he perception of how a person learns. In both worldviews knowledge and wisdom come from an older generation, but in the White culture knowledge comes from an expert who has been proven to have certified knowledge, such as through a degree, and knowledge is written down to be honored, such as in a textbook (Hain-Jamal, 2013).

For Native Americans, however, knowledge and wisdom come from elders who are respected because of who they are, and a certificate is not needed to prove that knowledge. Participant 12 said about the education of the elders, "[it is] good education" but "you can't put it in writing on a paper for the government to see." In Native American cultures, personal experience is more important than standardized knowledge, whereas, in the mainstream American culture knowledge is seen as external to the individual and should be attained in a

universal way (Hain-Jamal, 2013). Similar ideas surfaced in the focus groups without prompting. In Whiteriver participant 12 said, "The elders and our parents are the ones that teach us." In Cibecue participant 2 said education "starts out when you are young, … the elders will talk to you and tell you things you gotta know… I learned from the elders from my past, and they learned from the elders from their past." Participants in the Whiteriver and Cibecue focus groups mentioned that what they were taught not just knowledge but meaning. . In a discussion in Cibecue about elders and their lessons, participant 2 said "…all the signs that they have… like the colors, like the symbols of the Tribe all represent something meaningful to life." In an interview, participant 12 said each lesson "in the Sunrise Dance, it has a meaning."

Participants from both Whiteriver and Cibecue talked about the knowledge the elders have in local plants and herbs. From an interview in Whiteriver participant 12 said, "I know a few ladies who know so many herbs… to make a soothing remedy for your cough and all that stuff. They can just point out a root [while] going for a walk." From Cibecue participant 2 said, "There are some sacred sites that … culturally there's like all these plants that have like certain medicines in them." Participant 12 added, "Apache ways aren't in books… a lot of what the elders know is not really thought of as education [by the White culture]." She continued, "the reading and the math… it's just a whole new thing [for Apaches]."

Native Americans see education more as a hands-on experience, rather than knowledge that comes from a book or worksheets. During an interview, participant 12 indicated that many of the lessons come from cultural practices; "The Sunrise Dance [is] where many of the lessons come from." Although a Sunrise Dance is for a particular girl entering into womanhood, she added "everyone is learning." This learning comes not only through the actual dances and songs and all the associated symbols and practices, but also in the camp through making bread and

cooking. Participant said, “For example, um… how to make bread. The older ladies will tell the young lady… ‘you have to do it like this.’ … and we always go in a circle… it has a symbolism to it.” But not all things happen in a ceremony. “My auntie, she makes moccasins, so we’ll all get together and she’ll teach us how to make moccasins.” No lesson plan or written test, yet this lesson still has good components of a lesson: oral instruction, modeling, guided practice, an educational product, and an assessment for mastery. “[W]e’ll make a pair for everyone until we have it down.” This fits with what the Eric Development Team (2002) summarized as just one aspect of Native American learning; “a preference for a collaborative approach to task completion” (p. 2). This is not just a concept for Native American learning. Bergsteiner, Avery and Neuman (2010) reviewed Kolb’s experiential learning model and stated, “Individuals create knowledge from experience rather than just from received instruction.” A lot of the lessons are oral and hands-on, but some of the lessons come from observing others in life.

Participant 2, who had difficulty getting paperwork done for college, mentioned that his cousin who had graduated from college, said, “She’s teaching me how not to give up, and get my paper done again, the process. She’s encouraging me to go back to school.” He also said, “…you do things to disappoint, then in the back of your head you know you can still go forward, and then all these teachings as you’re growing up in the culture, you can actually go farther than you think you can.”

The participants of this study had all attended school with a dominant mainstream education, so they were familiar with, and used to, the standard education most people across the United States experience. However, many still experienced a conflict with the values of the mainstream culture and their traditional Native American culture. One difference in worldview between the participants and mainstream culture was with religious teaching from particular

Christian denominations and White Mountain Apache traditional cultural teachings. Participant 16 said, "My mom is a Christian and her nephew is traditional, and the two will never, ever, ever come to an agreement. That's a big barrier, if you want to look at the two. Caucasian and Native American." This same participant suggested that a Christian's view of God is very narrow and singular compared to a Native American's concept of the world, which she saw as wide and varied. This is similar to the Bureau of Reclamation's view of removing trout from a stream to achieve a narrow scientific end, which was in contrast to the Zuni belief which saw the trout as their children (Dongoske, Pasqual & King, 2015).

Some of the conflict is more cultural. Participant 12 said, "Our grandparents want us to learn our own traditions, … and at the same time we're wanting education. They'd rather have us be taught our own traditional ways to keep it going, instead of being educated [college]." She added, "With us we like to be with our family, but with the Caucasians they talk about 'leaving the nest.' So, moving somewhere else to go to college we get really homesick." Participant 16 said, "You can't really coincide with both [worldviews] at once." Although most students of any culture will feel some level of homesickness when they go to college, it seemed particularly visceral with the White Mountain Apache in this study.

McLachlanand Justice (2009) called this "transition shock," and it is common when a person enters a different cultural environment, even in the same country. "Because they've been on the reservation for so long," one participant remarked in an interview, "[being in a different environment] it's different for them… because people around here are friendly… everybody knows each other and everybody feels family here." During an interview participant 12 joked, "In the city you can get stabbed by a stranger. But at least here you'll know whose cousin it is." At a different time in the same interview she said, "Oh, it's just the rez. But I don't

think I could ever leave it." It should be noted that more than half of the participants in this study proudly lived with parents and extended family, which would be a shame for many in the mainstream culture.

During an interview with participant 12, we discussed the focus that many school agencies have on parent involvement. She agreed that there is a benefit when parents visit the school, but many parents experience a conflict when entering a school. Many parents had bad experiences with school, or know relatives that have had bad experiences with school. Some of this could be attributed to Historical Trauma.

The schools on the White Mountain Apache reservation, that are overseen by the Bureau of Indian Education or by the state government, are required to have an agenda for parent meetings. These agendas must include school business items, which can promote an atmosphere that is very stilted and informal, and, consequently, uncomfortable for parents and parent meetings were often sparsely attended. This model may have fit most mainstream educational institutions but did not necessarily fit a Native American site. However, as Cerecer (2013) pointed out, "The dominant group establishes the status quo" (p. 592). Participant 12 suggested instead of a meeting to discuss school matters that a school should have a Social Dance. "That would really bring them in." In fact, a number of years earlier, one local elementary school did have a dinner and Social Dance, and to fulfill requirements of government regulations, a short meeting agenda was included. The expected number of parents and family, based on previous events, was 100 to 150 people. The actual was number was between 400 and 500 people. Although it cannot be established for certain, inclusion of a social and indigenous component to the meeting allowed more parents and family to feel comfortable stepping on school property, even though many may have had a negative opinion of education. Schoorman (2016) suggested

that true engagement with a community can have a transformative potential. This seems to be what had happened at this school.

Historical Trauma. Historical trauma is described in a number of ways (Brave Heart, 2006; Nutton & Fast, 2015; Grayshield, et al, 2015), and one simple definition is "emotional and psychological wounding across generations" (Brave Heart, et al, 2011, p. 283). Although some people may question the existence of Historical Trauma, there were a number of examples in the focus groups, in both Whiteriver and Cibecue, and in interviews that suggested historical trauma is still felt by White Mountain Apaches.

Participant 1 said of boarding school, "[one teacher] teaches us to value our culture because before it was like, they were trying to get rid of it." In the Whiteriver focus group participant 11 said when he left the reservation to enter the military, "There is, like… shock out there, you know… there is racial tension out there… there's hatred." He said that some people would ask him sarcastically, "You guys still live in tepees?" In the same focus group participant 14 spoke about her experience of blatant racism when the book *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part-Time Indian* by Sherman Alexie (2007) was read in an introductory college class. Instead of promoting understanding between cultures, the book seemed to elicit negative attention on Native American students. She said, "in one of my classes they have like, uh, compare and contrast between Native Americans and regular people, and a bunch of the stuff like the kids were saying toward the Native Americans were all like the clichés about drinking, poverty and all that other stuff. And they only really had like negative things to say."

Other participants felt that some employees at educational institutions would not help Native American students; "we can't help you." When persons who are different from the dominant culture are not served, these persons can feel like they are treated like they are invisible

(Souto-Manning & Ray 2007). Participant 16 spoke of experiences she, her brother, and her mother had with non-Natives telling them about educational programs, "Hey, this is good, this is great, this will fit *you*." She added, "all for a waste of time" because in the end the programs did not fit them well.

Collins and Mueller (2016) talked about the dominant culture's "…approach to knowledge systems involves a singular approach to reality and social order by suppressing worldviews, which creates oppression and discrimination (Little Bear, 2000)" (p. 142). The participant just mentioned felt she was not seen as a real person, a person different from the mainstream culture. Participant 15 said, "…with just being Native American they tend to give you an option and that's the only option, whatever, it's not because it's easier for [the student but easier for the employee.]" Participant 14 added that she also felt that school employees did not often know what to do for her as a Native American student, so just came up with an option that was "easier for them [the employee]," and the employees would "talk in a dumbfounded way" regarding Native Americans. In contrast, this same participant added that while at the Native boarding schools, "We were not talked to like one [tribe or culture], like they [the boarding school] were understanding of all of our situations."

During an interview, participant 12 described a number of instances that had happened to her parents and grandparents. She spoke of a story her father told her. He described that during a class one of his friends spoke in Apache, then "got spanked in front of the class" by a White teacher. It has been documented that Native Americans were often prohibited from speaking in their native language (Grayshield, et al, 2015). This same participant remembers her mother describing the grandfather "being pried away from his mom and dad" to be taken to a boarding school. Native American children being taken forcibly from families to attend school is also

documented (BIE Study Group, 2015). These experiences were still difficult for participants to speak about. This participant said, "[hearing those stories] really affected how I grew up and they [my parents] wanted me to succeed just because they couldn't." She added later, "I feel that's why a lot of us don't graduate."

There is also the issue of lands. Although the reservations for Apache tribes in Arizona are fairly sizable, in modern times lands have been taken from Apaches for the purpose of mining. During one interview participant 12 said, "…they were doing the thing with the copper mines in Globe, and where Globe wanted to take the land from [the Apaches]. That is one of *the* first places, the first Holy Grounds, the most sacred place for the Apaches… where we believe one of the first Sunrise Dances was held. So, it really hurt us when that land was taken away." A similar land swap, which took away sacred lands from the Apache, also occurred near Superior, Arizona. "That will forever destroy religious and cultural rights as well as prime real estate," said Wendsler Nosie Sr., a council member and former chairman of the San Carlos Apache Tribe (The Apache Messenger, 2014).

Healing of historical trauma involves Indigenous peoples embracing and participating in traditional practices (Nutton & Fast, 2015). The knowledge and agency of Native peoples also need to be embraced and promoted by leaders, scholars, and practitioners, both from the mainstream culture, but especially within the Native cultures (Brave Heart, et al, 2011; Brigham Young University, 2015). Some research has confirmed traditional practices can mitigate the effects of historical trauma (Nutton & Fast, 2015).

Fortunately, signs of this was present in the focus groups and interviews. In one interview participant 12 said, "to dance is to pray, and to pray is to heal… when we pray we're healing." In another interview participant 2 said, "Just be out in the back country, that's what I

like, it's what I love. The scenery, the mountain, and the landscape. Especially when you look at the rocks you just stand there and look and look at 'em on the mountain, you wonder how this rock formed, like a long time ago, yeah. I get that a lot every time I pass through Salt River… I just think about it, it's nice creation, it's God's creation and I like it." In another interview participant 10 said, "I had a Sunrise Dance, so I'm like pretty rooted down to that." A little later she said, "I kind of want to further my education and take my culture with me." In fact, in response to questions regarding culture, every participant I interviewed or who participated in a focus group indicated that their culture was a positive aspect and strength in their life.

Limitations

One limitation of a qualitative study is that data cannot be objectively examined numerically. The data is transcripts from participants own words, so the researcher must closely examine a large amount of data to identify themes from all interviews and focus groups. Not all participants use the same words or expressions, so it is incumbent on the researcher to interpret what each participant meant and collate into common themes. The researcher must also decide which themes are important when to combine two themes into one or divide one theme into two. To help overcome this limitation, the researcher asked participants for clarification, or asked to confirm how the researcher understood a participant's comments. Also, the data was reviewed many times and the actual words of the participants were used in the results.

The researcher must be aware of personal bias to reduce limitations of bias. This researcher lived and worked on the White Mountain Apache Reservation for 12 years. Although not a tribal member or related to any tribal members, this researcher has attended tribal functions such as weddings, funerals, Sunrise dances, church services, and is the godfather of seven White Mountain Apache children. To help reduce this limitation, participants were open to all White

Mountain Apache who met the criteria, focus groups and interviews were held at neutral locations or locations comfortable for participants, and a standard set of questions for focus groups and interviews were used.

A third limitation is the amount of data collected. By their vary nature, case studies have a limited number of participants, thus a limited perspective on any topic investigated. The goal is to reach saturation, so that as many perspectives as possible can be represented within the limitations of time and other resources. Originally, the goal for this research was to recruit eight to twelve participants. Seventeen participants were recruited, and although not all participated in both focus groups and interviews, the threshold goal was reached for both focus groups and interviews. Also, the themes that emerged from the data were repeated by many participants, which suggests that saturation was reached, or very close to being reached.

Section 3: The Project

Introduction

When people from different cultural backgrounds live and work together there is an opportunity to listen to different worldviews, and to see how others' worldviews are revealed through their actions. These experiences allow for reflection on personal worldviews and one's own worldview is expressed through one's own actions. The results of this study show that the effects of historical trauma continue to be lived out in interactions between Native Americans and White Americans, even at locations adjacent to the White Mountain Apache reservation. In a sense, historical trauma could be referred to as "contemporary trauma."

Conducting this research allowed a clearer view of what the people of the White Mountain Apache Tribe experience when considering a post-secondary education outside of the White Mountain Apache reservation. Conversations with White Mountain Apache tribal members confirmed that the effects of historical trauma are real, and the issues of discrimination and microaggressions are on-going. Considering the suggestions in the literature for healing, the uncovering, and sharing, of worldviews could be one contribution to healing, if not at least lessening the occurrence of microaggressions between people with different worldviews.

The proposed project is a three-day professional development that can be used for an organization whose employees are of different backgrounds, cultures, nationalities, or races. The professional development would guide participants to reflect on their own worldviews, to listen to others' worldviews, and engage in dialogue that explores how worldviews can affect how people interact with each other, and possibly cause conflict, especially through misunderstanding. There are four (4) goals of the proposed project.

1. Articulate personal assumptions about the world around us, and using this information to formulate a personal worldview,
2. Actively listen to others express their views of the world, begin to explore what assumptions underly these worldviews, and understand how another person's worldview might inform their behavior,
3. Use techniques of dialogue to engage with others regarding their personal beliefs and views of the world, including,
    a. Listening attentively to others,
    b. Responding to what others express without being reactive or judgmental,
    c. Being able to listen to the feedback from others,
    d. listening to others without responding reactively, trying to understand another's point of view without judging,
4. Show appreciation to others for what they have shared.

Rationale

In the review of the literature conducted before executing the study, the topics of historical trauma and differences in worldview were included. The topic of historical trauma led to the topic of healing, which was also included in the review of the literature. In many cases the source of historical trauma – or ongoing misunderstanding and microaggressions – is differences in worldview and failing to recognize these differences. Acknowledging the pain of historical trauma, ongoing discrimination, and microaggressions are important, but it is important to take the next step, which is healing. The professional development project presented is to both acknowledge differences in worldview and begin a process that will lead to healing for some people.

From the results of the study, it was clear that elements of historical trauma and differences in worldview were experienced by a number – if not all – of the participants of the study. These results were consistent with what was in the literature, so this project is designed to pursue these concepts deeper. The original review of the literature indicated that part of healing is to acknowledge the pain and then address it, especially in the present (Aho, 2014; Kirmayer, Gone and Moses, 2014). A large part of the process is self-awareness, especially of one's own personal worldview, but also of the worldviews of others. Knowing a worldview requires effort to understand and effort to listen, both without judgment, if possible.

During my studies for a master's degree in the early 1990's one of the presenters in my course of studies was Dr. Steven Brookfield. His work has had a positive impact on my own capacity for reflection. One of his books was a text for one of my classes at Walden University, and I came across his work cited in some academic articles in reference to dialogue. I pursued his more recent work and I found that his techniques, and the techniques of his colleagues (Brookfield and Associates, 2019) could be used to develop a professional development program that uses dialogue to allow people to understand their own personal worldviews and listen and understand the worldviews of others. In particular, since I had worked on the White Mountain Apache reservation, particularly in Dishchii'bikoh Community Schools (DCS), I thought that a professional development to explore worldviews would be particularly applicable for this school (and similar schools on the reservation) to increase an awareness of differences in worldviews, as well as provide an opportunity to dialogue and heal. DCS serves 97% Native American students, and the composition of faculty and staff includes Native American, White American, Hispanic, and Filipino. Differences in worldview are real, and in the past these differences have caused

difficulties. A professional development program would be an opportunity to begin a dialogue on this issue.

The professional development presented uses techniques presented in the book Teaching Race (Brookfield and Associates, 2019). Many of the ideas incorporated in the professional development program come from information presented in the Review of Literature. Although, a specific location was used to initially conceive of this project, the same professional development could be used for any school on the White Mountain Apache reservation, other organizations, and organizations not on the reservation with little or no modifications. Ultimately, the professional development presented can be applied to any organization that would like to address differences in worldview, especially where different cultures are working in a common workplace.

Review of the Literature

How Search was Conducted

The results from Section 2 indicated that the participants of the study have experienced the effects of historical trauma and conflict with differences in the worldviews of others. Many of these negative experiences were with people who were not familiar with the lives of Native Americans, including the White Mountain Apache. Feedback from participants in the study indicated that talking about their experiences during the interviews or the focus groups gave them an outlet to share their experiences as Native Americans. A number of participants said the process of talking through their experiences, and hearing the experiences of others, gave them a feeling of validation of their worldview and in their worth as Native Americans. A search for resources was primarily conducted through Walden University online library. Searches were limited to academic articles that were published within five or less years. The initial search

terms included a combination of the following: Native American, indigenous, worldview, historical trauma and healing. As articles were reviewed, search terms were expanded to include: dialogue, conflict, reflection. Authors and cited sources in articles were also pursued to find further sources. After reading articles and continuing to search, many of the same articles were showing up in the search results, to the point I felt I had reach saturation even though the goal of 25 sources was not reached.

Historical Trauma and Ongoing Oppression

Historical trauma has been well documented, and for Native Americans part of historical trauma includes ongoing effects initiated by inimical historical events (Hartmann & Wendt, 2019). White Mountain Apache Tribe members who participated in the current study confirmed that they continue to experience historical trauma. For example, participant 11 said, "There is, like… shock out there, you know… there is racial tension out there… there's hatred," adding that some people would ask him sarcastically, "You guys still live in tepees?" This example could be put in the category of microaggressions, which are sometimes non-intentional but can still insulting or invalidating to the person on the receiving end (Jones &Galliher, 2014, p. 2). In a sample of 114 Native American young adults Jones and Galliher (2014) found that 98% felt they had experienced microaggressions on a frequent basis, and many of the aggressions were a result of *"assumed superiority of White values and assumption of* [Native American] *criminality"* (p. 7, emphasis in the original).

Even though Native Americans are American citizens with all the rights of any other American, there remains reminders of being under the authority of colonizers. For instance, quoting from Aho (2014),

> "Fanon (1957) identified that the colonised (read indigenous peoples) try to adopt the ways of the colonisers to gain acceptance. The struggle for acceptance carries a high price and the colonised according to Fanon must loathe and reject everything about themselves, their language, culture, world views, values and institutions to become 'acceptable' to the colonisers" (p. 184).

Offermann, *et al*. (2014) did a study with 362 undergraduates of different ethnic groups (non-Hispanic White, Hispanic and African American) and collected data (through video vignettes) on their perceptions of microaggressions in the workplace. The study verified that "color blindness in views of institutional discrimination and blatant racial issues [is] significantly more pervasive among non-Hispanic Whites than representatives of these [other] racioethnic minority groups" (p. 505). Part of the problem, according to Offermann, *et al.* (2014), was that the non-Hispanic Whites were just not as aware when a microaggression occurred. The problem can be exacerbated when Native Americans experience difficulties stemming from historical trauma and seek help through behavior health agencies. The Native American enters a mental health system that uses psychotherapies that are based on Western mindsets and analytic models instead of Native American values or perceptions (Hartmann and Wendt, 2019).

There can also be pressure on indigenous peoples when Western European cultures seek to obtain resources from indigenous communities. The pressure comes in the form of a Western mindset to "increase income and profits (Coq-Huelva, Torres-Navarrete, and Bueno-Suarez, 2018, p. 166) which requires "implementation of industrial upgrading processes" (p. 164). The Kichwa of the Ecuadorian Amazon Region have resisted many of these pressures, and instead have retained their concept of *Sumak Kawsay*, or good living. Their concepts of good living

have included keeping farms to a size that can be run by family labor, refraining from implementing Western European practices that would damage indigenous forests, and instead retaining a balance of crops such as plantains and cassava instead of just one cash crop, like cocoa (Coq-Huelva, Torres-Navarrete, and Bueno-Suarez, 2018). In a reverse situation, some Western based cultures endeavor to provide aid to underdeveloped cultures. However, when organizations offer help, the help is often contingent on certain criteria which are based on a particular philosophy. Unfortunately, this philosophy may not be in the best interest of the receiving entity, especially when the giving organization is unwilling find out more about the indigenous culture or offer compromise (Maudslay, 2014).

Differences in worldviews

Worldviews have been described in many different places in the literature, and generally refer to an individual's or a culture's system of beliefs, perceptions of reality, ways of conceptualizing problems, and guidelines for interacting with others (Hain-Jamall, 2013; Helve, 2015; Coq-Huelva, *et al.,* 2018). One of the first steps in moving forward from postcolonialism and the effects of historical trauma is to acknowledge that people operate in the world with different worldviews. As mentioned above, sometimes people are not even aware how their worldview might affect the way they act in the world, especially those who are part of the mainstream Western mindset (Jones and Galliher, 2014). Jensen and Guimaraes (2018) noted that Mayans considered the community as not only people, but the environment in which people live, including non-animate entities such as mountains. Hyrnkow and Westlund (2015) quoted a Mayan priest as saying that when there is a problem in the community the first questions to ask were, "Did you greet the sun today? Did you thank the earth for the corn?" In solving a problem, the Mayans also ask who represents these entities and who represents the different animals that

are part of the community (Hyrnkow and Westlund, 2015). The Kichwa saw *amasanga* as an energy that flowed through the environment and connected the different elements, social, natural, spiritual, animate and non-animate (Coq-Huelva, Torres-Navarrete and Bueno-Suarez, 2018). These sentiments were expressed by participants in the current study. Participant 2 expressed the importance of nature to his life. "Just be out in the back country, that's what I like, it's what I love. The scenery, the mountain, and the landscape. Especially when you look at the rocks you just stand there and look and look at 'em on the mountain, you wonder how this rock formed, like a long time ago, yeah. I get that a lot every time I pass through Salt River… I just think about it, it's nice creation, it's God's creation and I like it." Participant 16 suggested that a Christian's view of one God is very narrow and singular compared to a Native American's concept of the world, which she saw as wide and varied, referring to the elements of the environment and the associated spirits. A poster in Dishchii'bikoh High School, one of the high schools on the White Mountain Apache reservation, also expresses the concept of a community as larger than just the people in the community,

> When the last tree has been cut down, the last fish caught, the last river poisoned, only then will we realize that one cannot eat money.

An internet search (https://quoteinvestigator.com/2011/10/20/last-tree-cut/) attributed this quote to an Osage saying, with the more complete quote as,

> Canada, the most affluent of countries, operates on a depletion economy which leaves destruction in its wake. Your people are driven by a terrible sense of deficiency. When the last tree is cut, the last fish is caught, and the last river is polluted; when to breathe the air is sickening, you will realize, too late, that wealth is not in bank accounts and that you can't eat money.

This view that the environment is part of the community is not an idea that is historically a part of the Western European-based worldview. Often the environment is thought of as providing resources to humankind, of which Genesis 1:28 is often quoted, "God blessed them and God said to them: Be fertile and multiply; fill the earth and subdue it. Have dominion over the fish of the sea, the birds of the air, and all the living things that crawl on the earth" (New American Bible translation). Hrynkow and Westlund (2015) summarized the 1985 World Council for Indigenous Peoples with the quote, "We do not dominate her [Mother Earth]; we must harmonize with her" (p. 31). Similarly, insurance is a concept that exists in indigenous cultures, but not in the manner that Western European-based cultures would recognize it. The Kichwa of the Amazon have a *mingas* every week or two weeks (Coq-Huelva, Torres-Navarrete, and Bueno-Suarez, 2018). The people spend a day maintaining communal goods, such as buildings and pathways. If needed, the community will also help a family who needs the extra help, especially if an unexpected and unfortunate event has occurred in that family. In the Palauan indigenous culture (at the western edge of Micronesia) helping family members in cultural activities with both materials and labor is a form of local insurance. This is because one day when that person needs help, the family will remember if this person was helpful to others in the past and if they deserve the help of the family (Dr. Anthony Polloi, personal communication, 1993).

The point is not that one worldview is better than another, but, rather, a better understanding of other people must include the worldviews that the others are embedded. Helve (2015) suggested that just acknowledging that there are multiple worldviews helps in understanding different cultures may also have different beliefs and perceptions of the world, and that cultural beliefs and personal experiences can contribute a worldview. Everybody has a

worldview. Each individual worldview affects how a person understands others and how a person communicates with others. Rissanen, Kuusisto and Kuusisto (2016) found that teachers can unintentionally express a particular worldview through teaching. Masta and Rosa (2019) found that when teachers tried to intentionally present a more accurate picture of history, there was still a bias toward the dominant culture, portraying the White culture as privileged over native cultures. Another important point is that worldviews are often hidden to very people who express a view, especially when most people around them hold the same, or a similar, worldview.

When Native Americans enter a Western European-based culture, they often feel the microaggressions directed toward them. However, those in the dominant culture are often unaware of their microaggressions because they are embedded in the dominant culture and have not themselves felt microaggressions from others in their own culture. Rissanes, Kuusisto and Kuusisto (2016) stressed that it is not only important to understand that there are different worldviews, but that those in the dominant culture must strive to understand the worldviews of minority cultures. This not an easy result to achieve, especially if a person – or organization – does not feel the need or importance of investigating a different worldview. Those in a dominant culture might recognize that a minority's culture is different but then may oversimplify the other culture, which is also a problem (Maudsley, 2014). One aspect of the Western European-based culture is that there is an answer to any problem. However, as Maudsley (2014) quoted, when spending effort to deeply understand another culture the dominant culture often finds that "The only Big Answer is that there is no Big Answer" (p. 422). Even with race, it is better to acknowledge race differences – and worldview differences – and that everyone in a community is involved, including the White person (Offermann, *et al.*, 2014).

Reflection and Healing

Reflection

One first necessary step in understanding differences in worldview is understanding one's own worldview. This requires some critical reflection of one's own assumptions and patterns of thinking about the world (Brookfield, 2010). Brookfield (2010) continued that reflection on one's own assumptions of the world can be a process that is initiated through a desire to know one's self better, but often comes through life events which challenges a person's belief system. This is often the case when people of different cultures, religions, or political beliefs meet each other.

Hinck, et al. (2009) recommended "metacognition on the reflection process" and suggested that journaling was especially useful to stimulate this process (p. 121). Once a person can identify some of the assumptions that drive the way they perceive and react to the world, the person can then question if these assumptions and patterns of thinking are valid. This process can involve both rationality and emotions (Brookfield, 2010) and can be a frightening process (Johanson, 2010). One source of discomfort in the process is when a person discovers contradictions in their own thinking and these contradictions may even challenge a person's self-concept. This process, however, can lead to a change in how the world is viewed and lead to a more dynamic worldview allowing truth to emerge (Brookfield, 2010). Often people believe that they hold a neutral position, especially with regards to a minority position, and need an "awakening" to evaluate their own assumptions and positions and become aware that others hold different positions and experiences (Rissanen, Kuusisto and Kuusisto, 2016, p. 454).

Brookfield used a "critical incident questionnaire" as a routine part of his classes to get feedback from students. He then anonymously shared some of the feedback with his class and

discovered that this process spurred reflective thinking among students because students realized other students reacted to the same event differently (Johanson, 2010, p. 27). Conversely, those that "endorsed institutional discrimination" were less likely to recognize even blatant examples of racism in the workplace (Offerman, et al., 2014, p. 505). Offerman, *et al.* (2014) went on to stress the importance of self-examination of values and attitudes to uncover beliefs that underlie worldview in an effort to expose discrimination and the presence of microaggressions in the workplace.

Another significant part of the process is to have people with differing worldviews engage in dialogue. The reason for this, according to Brookfield (2019) is to introduce multiple perspectives on an issue, allow all participants to participate equally, and to uncover the different worldviews that are present when addressing an issue. Bigelow, Elsass, and Arndt (2014) stressed that dialogue is not the same as discussion. Discussion is people talking, but dialogue implies people trying to understand another person's point of view as a person, not as an opponent. Dialogue implies that other positions are also valid, and one's own position may require further and deeper reflection. Brookfield (2019) also stressed that dialogue can not be conducted when someone tries to dominate and push a specific point of view. A positive dialogue requires planning and prior preparation, which includes developing a structure that promotes dialogue and ensures the safety of individual participants (Brookfield, 2019; Merriweather, Talmadge & Manglitz, 2019; Bigelow, Elsass, and Arndt, 2014). Dialogues both help participants discover the worldviews of others and also of themselves (Merriweather, Talmadge & Manglitz, 2019). A good dialogue may take some time – and even many different sessions of dialogue – to develop because the best dialogues include a relationship between participants, especially when the inevitable tensions arise (Hinck, et al., 2009). Thus, a good

dialogue with the purpose of addressing different worldviews may require a period to develop properly, and in some cases, as with Hinck, *et al.* (2009), even months.

Healing

In the case of Native Americans and other indigenous peoples, the goal of dialogue is understanding, reduction of microaggressions, and healing. Part of the process of healing is to be aware of the effects and structure of colonization and then move past the "trauma narratives" (Aho, 2014, p. 186). A dialogue can acknowledge the past but must also focus on the present. Kirmayer, Gone and Moses (2014) suggested that for Native Americans, symptoms of historical trauma are "not so much past trauma as ongoing structural violence" (p. 301). This may be why subsequent generations of those who experience the holocaust are doing better than subsequent generations of Native Americans (Kirmayer, Gone and Moses, 2014).

Dialogues can be an aid in the opportunity for Native Americans to tell their side of the story and "set the record straight" which "can be a powerful catalyst for healing" (Aho, 2014, p. 188). A dialogue can help people to listen to the experiences and points of view of others, but the process can also help a person to express and examine their own worldview, experiences and culture. Examining the impact of reclaiming one's cultural heritage is a way of healing (Shea, et al., 2019). Dialogue is an opportunity for people to share their own stories along with the associated emotions, and to engage in reflection that develops a racial awareness, of both self and others (Merriweather, Talmadge & Manglitz, 2019). Although dialogue is not a "remedy to all that divides us… [what the] processes of dialogue does offer is an opportunity to pause, to interrupt cycles of dehumanization" (Flint, 2019, p. 357).

Mary Rothschild recounted the experience of healing through dialogue among 14 children of the holocaust, both children of the imprisoned and children of the Nazi perpetrators. The

dialogues spanned over a period of five days. She expressed the pain involved in such dialogues, but said she believed that dialogue can "stop the transmission of trauma" (p. 53). In her study of five Maori women, Aho (2014) found that to heal one does not surrender to or ignore pain, but, as one woman put it, "I am older, wiser and can see mamae (pain) for what it is...it is an opportunity for recovery, to rebuild, reclaim and heal ourselves" (P. 200). Participant 13 in this current study was thankful for the opportunity to talk about her own culture, and she felt validated in her indigenous experiences and beliefs.

Those that discussed dialogue as a vehicle for healing and understanding all recognized that dialogue is also a place that can sometimes be uncomfortable and generate intense emotions, including anger, resentment, indignation, regret, and embarrassment. Yet, moving through these emotions, and sharing them with others – including the those who are different – can also bring healing. Aho (2014) cited Duran (from his book, *Healing the soul wound: Counselling with American Indians and other native peoples*, 2006) who said "the medicine is the pain" (p. 200). Dialogue can effect many positive outcomes, included the opportunity to be aware of one's own worldview, understand the worldview of others, an opportunity to develop relationship with others, feel validated through sharing personal experiences, and aid in the healing process, especially for Native Americans who might have been affected by historical trauma.

Project Description

As a starting point, an organization with employees from multiple cultures – including the White Mountain Apache – was considered, although the proposed project could be conducted at many different organizations, either on or off the reservation. The proposed project is a professional development program designed with the faculty and staff of Dishchii'bikoh Community Schools in mind. Dishchii'bikoh Community Schools is located on the White

Mountain Apache Tribe reservation in the town of Cibecue, Arizona. The faculty and Staff include about 120 employees, and the demographics of the faculty and staff include the following races/cultures: Apache and other Native American, White non-Hispanic, Hispanic, and Filipino.

Based on the results of the current study, differences in worldviews among Native Americans and non-Native Americans are real, so this proposed professional development program is intended to begin the process of helping people to understand that there are differences in worldview and to begin to understand the worldviews of others. This is especially important for the many teachers who work in an environment that serves primarily Native Americans; students, parents and the local community. It is important for the teachers and staff to understand to the best possible extent the people they will be working for so to best prepare lessons for Native American students and to develop positive relationships with colleagues, students, parents, and community members. It is also important for the local people to be able to express their own culture and values to those who will be working with the children of the community.

In the past, Dishchii'bikoh Community Schools has had a "Cultural Orientation" for both new teachers and veteran teachers. These orientations have included Native elders giving talks to the teachers, visiting White Mountain Apache sites (such as ancient ruins, the Peoples' Farm, the fish hatchery, Fort Apache Museum, White Springs, and more), tours of the local community and remote villages, and some discussion on "do and don'ts" on the reservation. Although these orientations have been helpful, they have neither been extensive nor included dialogue, especially on differences in worldviews. This proposed professional development is designed to begin to fill this gap.

Because Dishchii'bikoh Community Schools has already included some cultural orientation for teachers before the school year has started, this proposal would be consistent with past orientations. One barrier would be that the present proposal would require more time than has been allocated in the past; it would be hard for the schools to provide three days during its regular teacher orientation. However, in the past the schools have also had "pre-orientations" before the regular teacher orientation. These pre-orientations have not been required in the past, but most teachers attend anyway because they include pay outside of the regular contract period. A solution to this barrier is to have this professional development program during a "pre-orientation" period and not part of the regular teacher orientation.

The professional development is slated to be presented over three days. The first day begins with project goals, ground rules, and some easy dialogue exercises. Day two goes through some self-reflection and identifying personal worldviews. Then there are exercises in identifying the worldviews of others. This second day also includes discussions, and these discussions are designed to go a bit deeper. The final day is only dialogues, and these dialogues are longer to allow time to process more sensitive material. Specifically, the dialogues will address discrimination based on race and culture, and discrimination in education. The proposed timeline of the project is included in Appendix A. A PowerPoint has been developed that walks through the activities of each day (Appendix B).

Although this proposal has been developed with Dishchii'bikoh Community Schools in mind, this same professional development could also be presented to any of the schools on the White Mountain Tribe reservation with no needed alterations. This professional development could also easily be presented, with few changes, to other schools or organizations with a diversity of races or cultures among the work force.

This proposal will be presented to both the White Mountain Tribal Council and to the Board of Education for Dishchii'bikoh Community Schools. These presentations can be delivered during the Winter or Fall of 2020, and the professional development could be conducted before the 2020-2021 school year at Dishchii'bikoh Community Schools or other schools on the reservation. Approval would be required from the White Mountain Tribal Council and the Board of any school where the professional development would be conducted. The student who conducted this research would also conduct the proposed professional development.

Project Evaluation Plan

The outcomes of project goals will be measured through self-reporting via a survey. The survey would be anonymous, and could be done through an electronic source, such as google docs or survey monkey. Survey questions would include each of the four goals articulated in the Introduction. Some of the survey questions would be answered using a Likert scale, while other questions would be free-response.

A survey allows for participants to express if the outcomes of the project was positive, neutral for negative for themselves. The survey would be anonymous so as not to be influenced by others. The Likert scale responses can be analyzed mathematically, while the free-response questions allow for participants to express thoughts, feelings and experiences with more detail, and may include responses that may not have been anticipated. The survey is in Appendix C.

The results from the survey can be used to improve the project through additions, deletions, or modifications. One question that the results of the survey could help to answer is, "Was the project beneficial, and should it be repeated for other organizations?" Results could be

shared with the participants, the School Board of the school, the Leadership Team of the school, and the Tribal Council, which has expressed an interest in seeing the results of this study.

Project Implications

The proposed professional development project offers possibilities for social change, including greater understanding among people of different ethnic and cultural groups who work together. Although the project is not designed to focus on information, the process of dialogue allows for participants to provide first-hand information about their own backgrounds, histories and experiences within an ethnic or cultural group. This information flows in different directions. People new to the Native American reservation can learn directly from the people they will be working with and for, and those who live in the community can learn about the people new to the community and what they bring to the children in the schools. Providing new employees greater understanding of how parents and students perceive the world new employees can have deeper insight into motivations and actions of the local people and how students may interact in the classroom. Greater understanding can aid in communication, reduced misunderstanding, and greater awareness of cultural worldviews, which can lead to preparation of more effective lessons and strategies for teaching.

The process of dialogue has the potential for developing relationships with others in the workplace. Getting to know others on a deeper level can also allow for a greater possibility of developing compassion, which is difficult to develop for the stranger. Positive relationships and compassion would be beneficial for people new to the reservation and for the local people, where all can feel that they are becoming partners in the education children. The local community can feel their children are in the hands of people they know and who have the best interest of their children in mind and heart.

Although the project is designed with a educational institution in mind, the design of the project can be used in a variety of settings with little or no alteration. The project is not intended to deliver information, but to encourage dialogue and understanding of those we work with and for. Dialogue is a skill that can benefit any organization and promote a deeper understanding of both self and others, especially in the area of culture and background.

Section 4: Reflections and Conclusions

Project Strengths and Limitations

As stated in the Implications section above, this project can be used in just about any work setting. A few minor changes may be necessary for tailor the project to a particular organization or work environment.

Although, this project has not yet been implemented, based on the literature review very similar projects have already been conducted successfully. The focus of this project – intimate and personal worldviews – can be charged with emotion for some participants. This requires the facilitator of this project to be aware of possible emotional reactions before beginning the project. The facilitator must expect and be ready to work with the different emotions that might arise from the participants. Although the discussion protocols are designed to be able to handle and allow emotion during the project, it is important for the facilitator to be ready for the reactions of the participants and thought out beforehand how different reactions can be dealt with. The current researcher has done a lot of work with groups, including on sensitive subjects, so there is a comfort level already established with the current researcher. The limitation, however, is if this project were to be conducted by a facilitator that is inexperienced or does not have the "presence" for this type of work.

Recommendations for Alternative Approaches

One recommendation for a different approach would be to have a multiple-day seminar for students and their parents on preparing for post-secondary education off the reservation. This could be done over a number of Saturdays or after school sessions. Topics would be based upon the results of the study, which might include:

- Aspirations and Goals

    - Military
    - Further Education
- Barriers to Further Education
    - Finances, Paperwork, and Transportation
    - Family Obligations
    - Educational Expectations End at High School
    - Alcohol and Drugs
    - Being Stuck
- Differences in Worldview
    - Knowledge, Wisdom, and Education
    - Competing Worldviews on the Reservation
    - Involving the Community
- Historical Trauma
    - Experiences of Historical Trauma
    - Lands
    - Healing

The seminar sessions could include information for students and parents, such as how to apply for college, fill out a FAFSA, apply for financial aid, and other practical information that could help a student navigate the post-secondary landscape. Outside organizations, such as the Tribal Educational Office or local colleges and universities, could be invited to present some of these informational topics. These informational sessions could also be accompanied by "work sessions" to help students and families complete some of these steps with help available on hand.

Another topic to include would be discussion on planning and setting goals for life beyond high school. For the student this would include planning for getting into a post-secondary institution but should also include some discussion of life-long plans and goals, and how to achieve these. Parents could be a part of this discussion, but some of this discussion might be fruitful for students alone.

While students consider their own futures, a parallel session could be for parents on how they can help – and not hinder – the plans of their children. It would also be good to allow parents to have a similar discussion on their own goals for the future, as many Native American parents may not have considered their own futures. At least some of this planning and goal setting could be done using some of the discussion methods already addressed in the project presented above. Another dialogue to include would be on the topic of fears in overcoming barriers that both students and parents foresee. For students this might include navigating a culture different than their own, which might entail microaggressions, misunderstanding of their worldviews, and preconceived ideas of who the Native American is, such as the myth that all Native Americans are drunkards or "simple." For parents this discussion might include fears that their children will harmed by the outside world, or that their child may never return home.

Scholarship, Project Development and Evaluation, and Leadership and Change

There was so much to learn, as there would be in engaging in any research endeavor. Conducting the literature reviews were especially helpful because the information in the literature was detailed instead of general. Although I already knew something about Native Americans after having lived on a reservation for over a decade, the literature included very specific information about specific Native American cultures, including Native American cultures that are different from the one I had lived on. Much of the literature also included

history I was not previously aware of. In terms of motivation, it was good to discover that so much work had already been done, yet so much work has yet to be pursued. In collecting the data through interviews and focus groups was helpful in that I heard first-hand the experiences and points of views of individuals from the White Mountain Apache. This made the information in the literature more tangible and real. Although I already had some perception of Native Americans, I also learned some things that I wouldn't have had I not done this research. Some of what I learned to a deeper extent included that stereotypes of Native Americans continue to affect the White Mountain Apache. I was also to hear the depth that the White Mountain Apache in the interviews and focus groups are rooted to their families, communities, traditions, and lands.

Reflection on Importance of the Work

Although there has been some progress in reducing discrimination in the United States since the founding of the country, it is apparent from the literature that discrimination continues to be a problem, particularly with Native Americans. The importance of this work is to provide a concrete way to reduce misunderstanding of Native American worldviews, which in turn should lead to decreased conflict. This work of this project goes in both directions. In other words, Native Americans will have an opportunity to be better understood, and non-Natives will also have an opportunity to be better understood. Although the work is directed at a cultural level – both a better understanding of Native worldviews and non-Native worldviews – the real understanding will take place on an individual basis so individuals will better understand individuals.

One target of this work is in schools on the reservation. For educators to understand the students they are working which can allow teaching to be more effective. More importantly,

many – if not most – students on the reservation have been taught by non-Native staff using non-Native approaches to education. Although this will continue to be the case, if non-Native staff can be cognizant of the worldview to the local community, students can be taught in ways that are more conducive to students' learning styles. Non-Native staff can also begin to use their Native colleagues as resources and "mentors" as they work in a foreign culture. This work can make some progress in eliminating the concept that Native students have a "savage" inside them that needs to be killed, and instead see a person inside the student that can learn and be learned from.

Implications, Applications, and Directions for Future Research

The impact of this work will be felt by the employees and students of White Mountain Apache reservation schools. Non-Native teachers have been a reality since a government school system has existed on the reservation. Over the years the diversity of teachers has increased with teachers being recruited from outside the United States. This diversity can be a good thing for the school. Yet, because many of the staff are working in an unfamiliar culture, it is important for these employees to understand as much as possible the lives of the students: their families, their beliefs, their lifestyles (especially as impacted by social economic status), their culture, their ceremonies, and more. This project can be a continuation of current steps of some reservations schools to achieve this end to a greater degree. Not only will teachers from off-reservation understand the students better, the students and Native employees will understand their colleagues better, also.

Further understanding can come from the evaluation of the project as it is implemented. Feedback from participants will provide information to help determine if the proposed dialogues actually do aid in better understanding of different worldviews, and if employees find the

dialogues helpful in their professional lives. This particular study began by trying to understand perceptions of high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache reservation and why they did not continue on to post-secondary education. This project addresses one sliver of the results: understanding differences in worldview. Further research is recommended to increase understanding of the perceptions of those White Mountain Apache who have earned a degree in a post-secondary institution. Specifically, it would be good to have a better understanding of what barriers they faced when pursuing school off the reservation, and how they overcame these barriers. It would also be beneficial to find out how they navigated and succeeded in a culture that operates in a different worldview from where they grew up.

Conclusion

From the interviews and focus groups with White Mountain Apache high school graduates it is clear there are a number of barriers that contribute to a decision not to attend college after high school. Some of these barriers are intuitive, such as navigating applications, financial aid, expectations of and obligations to family, and alcohol and drugs. Other barriers are less intuitive, such as experiences (direct or by family and friends) in differences of worldviews with people off the reservation, and experiences of historical trauma and continued discrimination from non-Natives. To put it in one simple statement, it appears that many White Mountain Apaches find it very difficult to leave their home, their culture, and their people in order to enter into a world where the world is unfamiliar and alien to their deepest experiences. Many have made the decision that remaining on the reservation is more important than the benefits of a post-secondary education.

The barriers can, however, be overcome. One possibility could be to help high school students and their parents begin to think about post-secondary education and begin to prepare for

making step to leaving the reservation for further education. The project presented here would take steps to address differences in worldview. By having educators better understand the worldview of the students and their culture, not only can education be improved, but the students can begin to feel that those outside of their community can understand and respect them as people. The process of dialogue presented in the project can aid non-Natives and Natives alike ways to express their personal ways of perceiving the world, culture, values, and beliefs, Although the process will be difficult and painful at times, the work can lead to greater awareness and healing.

This project provides a deeper understanding of the White Mountain Apaches' perceptions of reasons for not pursuing education. This knowledge can be helpful to educators on the White Mountain Apache reservation. Using the knowledge can also be a guide in providing ways to overcome some the barriers the White Mountain Apache experience.

References

Arizona Department of Education (2014). Percentage of children approved for free or reduced-price lunches. Retrieved from http://www.azed.gov/health-nutrition/frpercentages/.

Arizona House Bill 2281 (2010). Retrieved from: https://www.azleg.gov/legtext/49leg/2r/bills/hb2281s.pdf.

Arnett, J. J. (2000). Emerging adulthood: A theory of development from the late teens through the twenties. *American Psychologist*, 55(5), 469-480. doi: 10.1037//0003-066X.55.5.469.

Arnett, J.J. (2003). Conceptions of the transition to adulthood among emerging adults in American ethnic groups. New Directions for Child and Adolescent Development, 2003(100), 63-76. Retrieved from http://web.b.ebscohost.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=15&sid=5cd9d6e7-98d7-4a81-8f0e-146a5a843b3c%40sessionmgr104.

Arnett, L. J., & Arnett, J. J. (2012). Going global: New pathways for adolescents and emerging adults in a changing world. *Journal of Social Issues, 68*(3), 473-492. doi: 10.1111/j.1540-4560.2012.01759.x.

Baltes, B., Hernandez, D., & Collins, C. (2015). Increasing cultural awareness through a cultural awareness program. *Journal of Educational Research and Practice, 5*(1), 1-20. doi: 10.5590/JERAP.2015.05.1.01.

Banks, J. (2013). Barriers and supports to postsecondary transition: Case studies of African American students with disabilities. *Remedial and Special Education*, *35*(1), 28-39. Retrieved from http://journals.sagepub.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/doi/full/10.1177/074193251351220.

Bigelow, B., Elsass, P. & Arndt M. (2015). Dialogue in the graduate management classroom: Learning from diversity. *The International Journal of Management Education, 13,* 48-56. DOI: 10.1016/j_ijme.2014.09.007.

Bogdan, R. C., & Biklen, S. K. (2007). *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theories and methods* (5th ed.). Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon.

Boggs, O. M. (2011). The rise of childhood poverty in Georgia: Implications for public school planning and pedagogy. Retrieved from http://www.eric.ed.gov/contentdelivery/servlet/ERICServlet?accno=ED521383.

Brave Heart, M.Y.H. (2006). Historical trauma. *Tribal College Journal, 17*(3), 8-11. Retrieved from: EBSCO*host*, ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login?url=https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eue&AN=507883966&site=eds-live&scope=site.

Brave Heart, M.Y.H., Chase, J., Elkins, J., & Altschul, D. B. (2011). Historical trauma among indigenous peoples of the Americas: Concepts, research, and clinical considerations. *Journal of Psychoactive Drugs*, *43*(4), 282-290. doi: 10.1080/02791072.2011.628913.

Brigham Young University (2015). Indian Education: Maintaining tribal sovereignty through Native American cultural and language preservation. *Brigham Young University Education and Law Journal, 1,* 353-366. Retrieved from http://digitalcommons.law.byu.edu/elj/vol2015/iss1/12.

Boswell, S. S. (2015). Effects of aging and adult development education and service learning on attitude, anxiety, and occupational interest. *The Journal of Effective Teaching, 15*(1), 5-19. Retrieved from http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1060443.pdf.

Brookfield, S. D. (2019). Adapting discussion methods to teach race. In Brookfield, S. D. & Associates, *Teaching Race* (p. 191-212). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Brookfield, S. D. (2010). *Developing critical thinkers: Challenging adults to explore alternative ways of thinking and acting.* Hoboken, NJ: Laureate Education, Inc.

Budescu, M., & Silverman, L. R. (2016). Kinship support and academic efficacy among college students: A cross-sectional examination. *Journal of Child Family Studies,* 25, 1789–1801. doi: 10.1007/s10826-016-0359-z.

Bureau of Labor Statistics (2015). Local area unemployment statistics. Retrieved from http://www.bls.gov/web/laus/laumstrk.htm.

Cerecer, P. D. Q. (2013). The policing of native bodies and minds: Perspectives on schooling from American Indian youth. *American Journal of Education,* Aug 119, 591-616. doi: 00060195-6744/2013/11904

Chen, P., Hernandez, A., & Dong, J. (2015). Impact of collaborative project-based learning on self-efficacy of urban minority students in engineering. *Journal of Urban Learning Teaching and Research, 11,* 26-39. Retrieved from: https://eric.ed.gov/contentdelivery/servlet/ERICServlet?accno=EJ1071407.

Collins, C. S., & Mueller, M. K. (2016). University land-grant extension and resistance to inclusive epistemologies. *The Journal of Higher Education*, *87*(3), 303-331. doi: 10.1080/00221546.2016.11777404.

Connolly, F., Olson, L. S., Durham, R. E., Plank, S. B., & Baltimore Education Research Consortium (2014). Indicators of college readiness: A comparison of high school and college measures. *Baltimore Education Research Consortium*. Retrieved from: EBSCO*host*,

ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login?url=https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=ED553163&site=eds-live&scope=site.

Coq-Huelva, D, Torres-Navarrete, B. & Bueno-Suarez, C. (2018). Indigenous worldviews and western conventions: Sumak kawsay and cocoa production in Ecuadorian Amazonia. *Agric Hum Values, 35,*163-179. DOI: 10.1007/s10460-017-9812-x.

Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (Laureate custom ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson Education, Inc.

Dongoske, K. E., Pasqual, T., & King, T. (2015). Environmental reviews and case studies: The national environmental policy Act (NEPA) and the silencing of Native American worldveiws. *Environmental Practice, 17*(1), 36-45. doi: 10.1017/S1466046614000490.

English, M. C., & Kitsantas, A. (2013). Supporting student self-regulated learning in problem- and project-based learning. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Problem-based Learning*, *7*(2), 127-150. doi: 10.7771/1541-5015.1339.

Eric Development Team (2002). Theoretical perspectives, research findings, and classroom implications of the learning styles of American Indian and Alaska Native students. *ERIC Digest*, ED468000 2002-09-00. Retrieved from https://escholarship.org/uc/item/49v3p55m.

Finnie, R., Wismer, A., & Mueller, R. E. (2015). Access and barriers to postsecondary education: Evidence from the Youth in Transition survey. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, *45*(2), 229-262. Retrieved from eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1073589.pdf.

Flint, M. A. (2019). Healing a divide nation: Transforming spaces through sustained dialogue. *The Review of Higher Education, 42*, 337-361. DOI: https://doi.org/101353/rhe.2019.005.

Flynn, S. V., Olson, S. D., & Yellig, A.D. (2014). American Indian acculturation: Tribal lands to predominately White postsecondary settings. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 194*, 280-293. doi: 10.1002/j.1556-6676.2014.00156.x.

Flynn, S. V., Duncan, K., & Jorgensen, M. F., (2012). An emergent phenomenon of American Indian postsecondary transition and retention. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 90*, 437-449. doi: 10.1002/j.1556-6676.2012.00055.x.

Fort Wiki (2016). Retrieved from: http://fortwiki.com/Fort_Apache.

Grann, D. (2017). *Killers of the flower moon: The Osage murders and the birth of the FBI*. New York, NY: Doubleday.

Grayshield, L., Rutherford, J. J., Salazar, S. B., Mihecoby, A. L., & Luna, L. L. (2015). Understanding and healing historical trauma: The perspectives of Native American elders. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling, 37*(4), 295-307. doi: 10.17744/mehc.37.4.02.

Hartmann, . E., Wendt, D. C., Burrage, R. L., Pomerville, A. & Gone, J. P. (2019). American Indian Historical Trauma: Anticolonial Prescriptions for Healing, Resilience, and Survivance. *American Psycologist, 74*(1), 6-19. http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/amp0000326.

Heinrich, W. F., Habron, G. B., Johnson, H. L., & Goralnik, L. (2015). Critical thinking assessment across four sustainability related experiential learning settings. *Journal of Experiential Education*, *38*(4), 373 –39. doi: 10.1177/1053825915592890.

Huyser, K.R., Take., I., & Sakamoto, A. (2014). Demographic factors associated with poverty among American Indians and Alaska Natives. *Race and Social Problems, 6*(2), 120-134. doi: 10.1007/s12552-013-9110-1.

Indians.org, Apache Tribes (2018). Retrieved from: http://indians.org/articles/apache-tribes.html.

Irvin, M. J., Byun, S., Meece, J. L., Reed, K. S., & Farmer, T. W. (2016). School characteristics and experiences of African American, Hispanic/Latino, and Native American youth in rural communities: Relation to educational aspirations, *Peabody Journal of Education, 91*(2), 176-202. doi: 10.1080/0161956X.2016.1151739.

Jones, A. L., & Kiser, P. M. (2014). Conceptualizing criticality as a guiding principle for high quality academic service learning. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education, 26*(1), 147-156. Retrieved from http://www.isetl.org/ijtlhe/.

Johanson, J. (2010). Cultivating Critical Thinking: An Interview with Stephen Brookfield. *Journal of Developmental Education, 33*(3), 26–30. Retrieved from https://search-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eue&AN=508156371&site=eds-live&scope=site

Jones, M. L & Galliher, R. V. (2014). Daily Racial Microaggressions and Ethnic Identification Among Native American Young Adults. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology, 21*(1), 1-9. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/a0037537.

Jury, M., Smeding, A., Stephens, N. M., Nelson, J. E., Aelenai, C., & Darnon, C. (2017). The experience of low-SES students in higher education: Psychological barriers to success and interventions to reduce social-class inequality. *Journal of Social Issues, 73*(1), 23--41. doi: 10.1111/josi.12202.

Karacalli, S., & Korur, F., (2014). The effects of project-based learning on students' academic achievement, attitude, and retention of knowledge: The subject of 'electricity in our lives'. *School Science & Mathematics, 114*(5), 224-235. doi: 10.1111/ssm.12071.

Kelley, A., Snell, B. & Bingham, D. (2015). Peer recovery support in American Indian communities: A qualitative intrinsic case-study approach. *Journal of Groups in Addiction & Recovery, 10*, 271–286. doi: 10.1080/1556035X.2015.1066727.

Kitchen, J., Lorenzo, C. & Trudeau, L. (2010). Weeding out or developing Capacity? Challenges for Aboriginal teacher education. *The Alberta Journal of Educational Research, 56*(2), 107-123. Retrieved from: https://eds-b-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=5&sid=067f2fae-4b2b-42c2-abc9-7ac33621a826%40sessionmgr101.

Knoeppel, R. C., & Brewer, C. A. (2011). Education reform, equal opportunity and educational achievement: Do trend data adequately report progress? *Education Policy Analysis Archives, 19*(10), 1-27. Retrieved from http://www.redalyc.org/articulo.oa?id=275019735010.

Ladson-Billings, G. (1998). Just what is critical race theory and what's it doing in a nice field like education*? International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education, 11*(1), 7-24. Retrieved from https://eds-a-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/detail/detail?vid=8&sid=b2ca817e-0f8e-4a7c-bc8a-2a86e0223e56%40sessionmgr4007&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWRzLWxpdmUmc2NvcGU9c2l0ZQ%3d%3d#AN=75559714&db=edb.

Legends of America (2018). Retrieved from: https://www.legendsofamerica.com/mangas-coloradas/

Lee, K. M., & Slate, J.R. (2014). Differences in advance achievement outcomes for Texas students as a function of economic disadvantage. *Journal of Education Research, 8*(3), 137-149. Retrieved from: https://eds-a-ebscohost-

com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=19&sid=73035acb-8434-405f-9159-0e22cdcfb01c%40sessionmgr4008

Lodico, M. G., Spaulding, D. T., & Voegtle, K. H. (2010). *Methods in educational research: From theory to practice*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Logan, J. R., & Burdick-Will, J. (2016). School segregation, charter schools, and access to quality education. *Journal of Urban Affairs, 38*(3), 323-343. doi: 10.1111/juaf.12246.

Lundberg, C. A. (2014). Institutional support and interpersonal climate as predictors of learning for Native American students. *Journal of College Student Development*, *55*(3), 263-277. doi:10.1353/csd.2014.0027.

Lumina Foundation (2014). A stronger nation through higher education. Retrieved from: http//:www.luminafoundation.org.

Making Action Possible (2015). High school graduation rates. Retrieved from: https://mapazdashboard.arizona.edu/education/high-school-graduation-rates.

Masta, S. & Rosa, T. J. K. (2019). Understanding the dominant discourse of colonialism: A qualitative, single case study of an eighth-grade U.S. History classroom. *Social Studies, 110*(3), 146-154. DOI: 10.1080/00377996.2019.1585317.

Maudslay, L. (2014). Inclusive education in Nepal: Assumptions and reality. *Childhood, 21*(3), 418-424. DOI: 10.1177/0907582135614778

Maynard, B., Sala-Wright, C., & Vaughn, M. (2015). High school dropouts in emerging adulthood: Substance use, mental health problems, and crime. *Community Mental Health Journal, 51*(3), 289-299. doi: http://dx.doi.org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.1007/s10597-014-9760-5.

McKinley, B., & Brayboy, J. (2005). Toward a tribal critical race theory in education. *Urban Review, 37*(5), 425-446, 22. doi: 10.1007/s11256-005-0018-y.

McLachlan, D. A., & Justice, J. (2009). A grounded theory of international student well-being. *The Journal of Theory Construction & Testing, 13*(1), 27-32. Retrieved from: https://eds-a-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=6&sid=d28d9f61-ee8c-4889-8b30-f5e0fa5c849a%40sessionmgr4008

Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2016). *Qualitative Research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Minthorn, R. S. (2015). Accommodating the spiritual and cultural practices of Native American college and university students. *The Journal of College and University Student Housing*, *41*(1), 154-163. Retrieved from http://scholarsarchive.byu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2601&context=facpub.

Minthorn, R. (2014). Perspectives and values of leadership for Native American college students in Non-Native colleges and universities. *Journal of Leadership Education, Spring 2014*, 67-95. doi: 10.12806/V13/12/R4.

Mitchell, L. L., & Syed, M. (2015). Does college matter for emerging adulthood? Comparing developmental trajectories of educational groups. *Journal of Youth Adolescence, 44*(11),2012–2027. doi: 10.1007/s10964-015-0330-0

Morin, S. M., Crandall, R. E., Rockenbach, A. N. & Mayhew, M. J. (2018). Bridging Political Divides on Campus: Insights from the Study of Worldview Diversity. *Journal of College and Character, 19*(2), 152-159. Retrieved from https://search-ebscohost-

com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ1179612&site=eds-live&scope=site.

Morris, C. (2015). President Obama tackles native education, poverty at Tribal Nations Conference. *Diverse Issues in Higher Education*, *32*(22), 8. Retrieved from: https://eds-a-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=8&sid=d28d9f61-ee8c-4889-8b30-f5e0fa5c849a%40sessionmgr4008.

Murakami, Y. (2013). Rethinking a case study method in educational research: A comparative analysis method in qualitative research. *Educational Studies in Japan: International Yearbook, 7*, 81-96. Retrieved from: https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1007054.pdf.

Museus, S. D., Yi, V., & Saelua, N. (2017). The impact of culturally engaging campus environments on sense of belonging. Review of Higher Education, 40(2), 187-215. doi: 10.1353/rhe.2017.0001

Musu-Gillette, L., Robinson, J., McFarland, J., KewalRamani, A., Zhang, A., & Wilkinson-Flicker, S. (2016). Status and trends in the education of racial and ethnic groups 2016. American Institutes for Research: National Center for Educational Statistics, 2016(7), 1-169. Retrieved from: https://eric.ed.gov/contentdelivery/servlet/ERICServlet?accno=ED567806.

Nutton, J., & Fast, E. (2015). Historical trauma, substance use, and indigenous peoples: Seven generations of harm form a “big event”. *Substance Use & Misuse*, *50*, 839-847. doi: 10.3109/10826084.2015.1018755.

Offermann, L. R., Basford, T. E., Graebner, R., Jaffer, S., De Graaf, S. B. & Kaminsky, S. E. (2014). See No Evil: Color Blindness and Perceptions of Subtle Racial Discrimination in the Workplace. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*, *20*(4), 499-507.

O'Leary, A. O., & Romero, A. (2011). Chicana/o Students' Engagement with Arizona's "Anti-Ethnic Studies" Bill 1108: Civic Engagement, Ethnic Identity and Well-being. *Aztlan: A Journal of Chicano Studies, 36*(1), 9-36. Retrieved from: https://mas.arizona.edu/content/chicanao-students'-engagement-arizona's-"anti-ethnic-studies"-bill-1108-civic-engagement.

Oliff, H. (2017). Graduation rates and American Indian education. Partnership with Native Americans. Retrieved from: http://blog.nativepartnership.org/graduation-rates-american-indian-education/.

Padgett, G. (2015). A critical case study of selected U.S. history textbooks from a tribal critical race theory perspective. *The Qualitative Report 20*(3), 153-171. Retrieved from: http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR20/3/padgett1.pdf.

Phinney, J. S. (2010). Understanding development in cultural contexts: How do we deal with the complexity? *Human Development, 53,* 33–38. doi: 10.1159/000268138.

Racial Frameworks in Higher Education. (2015). *ASHE Higher Education Report, 42*(1), 16-37. Retrieved from: https://eds-b-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=2&sid=067f2fae-4b2b-42c2-abc9-7ac33621a826%40sessionmgr101.

Rivas-Drake, D., Markstrom, C., Syed, M., Lee, R. M., Schwartz, S. J., Umaña-Taylor, A. J., & French, S. (2014). Feeling good, happy, and proud: A meta-analysis of positive ethnic–racial affect and adjustment. *Child Development, 85*(1), 77-102. doi: 10.1111/cdev.12175.

Rivas-Drake, D., Seaton, E. K., Markstrom, C., Quintana, S., Syed, M., Lee, R. M., Schwartz, S. J., Umaña-Taylor, A. J., French, S., & Yip, T. (2014). Ethnic and racial identity in

adolescence: Implications for psychosocial, academic, and health outcomes. *Child Development, 85*(1), 40-57. doi-org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.1111/cdev.12200.

Ross, T., Kena, G., Rathbun, A., KewalRamani, A., Zhang, J., Kristapovich, P., & Manning, E., (2012). Higher education: Gaps in access and persistence study. Statistical analysis report [Abstract]. *National Center for Education Statistics, 46,* 1-329. Retrieved from https://nces.ed.gov/pubs2012/2012046.pdf.

Rothschild, M. H. (2000). Transforming our legacies: Heroic journeys for children of holocaust survivors and Nazi perpetrators. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology, 40*(3), 43-56. DOI: 10.1177/0022167800403004.

Rury, J. L. (2014). The Power and Limitations of Historical Case Study: A Consideration of Postwar African American Educational Experience. *Social and Education History, 3*(3), 241-270. doi: 10.4471/hse.2014.15.

Schoorman, D. (2016). From the "ivory tower" to the "university of the poor": A professor's educational journey. *Urban Education, 51*(7), 797-823. Retrieved from: EBSCOhost, ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login?url=https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=edswss&AN=000382568300004&site=eds-live&scope=site.

Schwartz, S. J., Cote, J.E., & Arnett, J. J. (2005). Identity and agency in emerging adulthood: Two developmental routes in the individuation process. *Youth and Society, 37*(2), 201-229. doi: 10 1177/0044118X05275965.

Shaefer Hinck, S., Garza Mitchell, R. L., Williamson, P., Eddy, P. L., & Bechtold, B. H. (2009). Reflection and research: Forming the perfect FIT. *Teaching & Learning, 23*(3), 120-133.

Shea, H., Mosley-Howard, G. S., Baldwin, D., Ironstrack, G., Rousmaniere, K., & Schroer, J. E. (2019). Cultural Revitalization as a Restorative Process to Combat Racial and Cultural

Trauma and Promote Living Well. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology, 25*(4), 553-565. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/cdp0000250.

Shear, S. B., Knowles, R. T., Soden, G. J., & Castro, A. J. (2015). Manifesting destiny: Re/presentations of Indigenous peoples in K-12 US history standards. *Theory and Research in Social Education, 43*(1), 68–101. doi:10.1080/00933104.2014.999849

Smith, J. L., Metz, A., Cech, E, Huntoon, M., & Moyer, C. (2014). Giving back or giving up: Native American student experiences in science and engineering. *Cultural Diversity and Ethic Minority Psychology*, *20*(3), 413-429. doi: 10999809/14.

Smith, B. L., Stumpff, L. M., & Cole, R. (2012). Engaging students from underrepresented populations: The Enduring Legacies Native Cases Initiative. *Journal of College Science Teaching, 41*(4), 60-68. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Barbara_Smith31/publication/283296286_Engaging_students_from_under-represented_populations_the_enduring_legacies_Native_Cases_Initiative/links/563132b008ae13bc6c3563dc.pdf.

Smith, W. J., Jr., Liu, Z., Safi, A. S., & Chief, K. (n.d.). Climate change perception, observation and policy support in rural Nevada: A comparative analysis of Native Americans, non-native ranchers and farmers and mainstream America. *ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCE & POLICY*, *42*, 101–122. https://doi-org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.1016/j.envsci.2014.03.007

Souto-Manning, M. (2014). Critical narrative analysis: the interplay of critical discourse and narrative analyses, International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education, 27(2), 159–

180. Retrieved from: http://dx.doi.org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.1080/09518398.2012.737046.

Stanton, C. R., & Morrison, D. (2018). Investigating Curricular Policy as a Tool to Dismantle the Master's House: Indian Education for All and Social Studies Teacher Education. *Policy Futures in Education, 16*(6), 729–748. Retrieved from https://search-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ1190504&site=ehost-live&scope=site

Sykes, B. E. (2014). Transformative autoethnography: An examination of cultural identity and its implications for learners. *Adult Learning, 25*(1), 3-10. doi:10.1177/1045159513510147.

Taylor, C. S., & Lee, Y. (2011). Ethnic DIF in reading tests with mixed item formats. *Educational Assessment, 16,* 35-68. doi: 10-1080/10627197.2011.552039.

The Apache Messenger (2014). Once again, the fight for religious freedom in America begins. *The Apache Messenger*. Retrieved June 15, 2019. http://www.indianz.com/News/2014/015978.asp

Tribal Directory (2018). Retrieved from: http://tribaldirectory.com/information/apache-tribes.html.

United States v. White Mountain Apache Tribe, 537 U.S. 465 (2003). Retrieved from: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/United_States_v._White_Mountain_Apache_Tribe.

Vaismoradi, M., Turunen, H. & Bondas, T. (2013). Content analysis and thematic analysis: Implications for conducting a qualitative descriptive study. *Nursing and Health Sciences, 15*(3), 398-405. Retrieved from: https://doi.org/10.1111/nhs.12048.

Viola, M. M., Musso, P., Inguglia, C. & Lo Coco, A. (2016). Psychological well-being and career indecision in emerging adulthood: The moderating role of hardiness. *The Career Development Quarterly, 64*(4), 387-396. doi: 10.1002/cdq.12073.

Waterman, E. A., & Lefkowitz, E. S. (2017). Are mothers' and fathers' parenting characteristics associated with emerging adults' academic engagement? *Journal of Family Issues, 38*(9), 1239-1261. doi: 10.1177/0192513X16637101.

Wexler, L., Eglinton, K., & Gubrium, A. (2014). Using digital stories to understand the lives of Alaska Native young people. *Youth and Society, 46*(4), 478-504. doi: http://dx.doi.org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.1177/0044118X12441613.

Wilcox, K. C. (2014). Not at the expense of their culture: Graduating Native American youth from high school. *The High School Journal, 98*(4), 337-35. doi: 10.1353/hsj.2015.0011.

White Mountain Apache Tribe (2011). Retrieved on 3/10/2018 from: http://www.wmat.nsn.us/history.html.

Wickrama, K. A. S., O'Neal, C. W., & Lee, T. K. (2016). Cumulative socioeconomic adversity, developmental pathways, and mental health risks during the early life course. *Emerging Adulthood, 4*(6), 378-390. Retrieved from: EBSCO*host*, ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login?url=https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=edo&AN=ejs42275662&site=eds-live&scope=site.

Wright, L. A., & Slate, J. R. (2015). Differences in critical-thinking skills for Texas middle school students as a function of economic disadvantage. *Journal of Education Research, 9*(4), 345-356. Retrieved from: https://eds-a-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=47&sid=d28d9f61-ee8c-4889-8b30-f5e0fa5c849a%40sessionmgr4008.

Writer, J. H (2010). Unmasking, exposing, and confronting: Critical Race Theory, Tribal Critical Race Theory and multicultural education. *International Journal of Multicultural Education, 10*(2), 1-15. Abstract retrieved from: https://web-b-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=5&sid=12c64974-72d2-4452-ab5c-f5546510dc21%40sessionmgr120.

Yin, R. K. (2013). Validity and generalization in future case study evaluations. *Evaluation,* 19(3) 321 –332. DOI: 10.1177/1356389013497081.

Appendix A: Project

Professional Development Outline

1. Day 1
    a. Sign-in, Time to Mix, Light Breakfast (30 min)
    b. Explanation of the Purpose of this Professional Development (20 min)
        The purpose of the professional development training seminar includes the following.
        i. For employees of the organization to get to know each other and understand each other on a deeper level.
        ii. To understand our own worldviews and how this might affect how we teach and interact with others.
        iii. To understand that others have different worldviews than our own, and understanding others' worldviews will help us to understand others on a deeper level.
        iv. To develop dialogue skills, which include
            1. The ability to listen without reacting with judgment,
            2. The ability to give feedback to another that is not judgmental,
            3. Sharing with others personal beliefs of the world around us,
            4. Identifying underlying assumptions of self and others,
            5. Showing appreciation to others for sharing personal beliefs and experiences.
        v. Through understanding our colleagues, we can enhance our ability to provide a better education to the children we work for.
    c. Ground Rules (20 min)
        i. Confidentiality,
        ii. Be all in, participate in the professional development,
        iii. Use "I" statements where possible,
        iv. Allow others to share without interruption,
        v. Respond to others with objective insights rather than judgments,
        vi. Be attentive to your own feelings, without self-judgment,
        vii. Refrain from using defamatory or derogatory language,
        viii. During times of preparation, use the time so you are ready for dialogues.
    d. Some things to expect (10 min)
        i. Self Reflection
        ii. Learning about Dialogue
        iii. Time to Dialogue with others
        iv. Learning about others and their worldviews, values, and beliefs
        v. Difficult subjects
        vi. Emotions: pleasant and uncomfortable
        vii. Conflicting views
        viii. Deeper relationships
        ix. Healing
    e. Break (15 min)
    f. Practice Exercises (60 min)

i. Do a few practice dialogues with some low-conflict issues (circle of voices, p. 195).
    1. Dialogue 1 – Introductions: Name, place of birth, size of family, favorite hobby.
    2. Dialogue 2 – Three rules for the classroom, and why those rules work.

g. Lunch (45 min)
h. Modeling Critical Thinking (120 min)
    i. The facilitator will demonstrate the process of identifying underlying assumptions of self. Feedback from the group will be asked for to help with the process.
    ii. The facilitator will demonstrate the process of providing feedback that is non-judgmental to another.
    iii. Participants will reflect on their own worldviews.
    iv. Break (15 min)
    v. Participants will get into pairs or triplets and share their reflections.
    vi. Sharing appreciation for the sharing of another person.

2. Day 2
    a. Time to Mix, Light Breakfast (30 min)
    b. Personal Goal Formation (15 min)
        i. Participants will be given quiet time to formulate some goals for the school year. Goals will be SMART. An example will be given.
    c. Identifying Personal Assumptions (45 min)
        i. Participants will review the goals they have set and try to identify underlying assumptions. Assumptions will be listed.
        ii. Create a Worldview document
    d. Break (15 min)
    e. Identifying Other's Assumptions (60 min)
        i. Participants will be divided into pairs or small groups. Each person will share a goal. The other person will try to identify an underlying assumption. The assumptions identified will be compared and discussed.
    f. Lunch (45 min)
    g. Identifying Cultural Assumptions (90 min)
        i. Participants will be divided into groups.
        ii. Each group will use whatever knowledge they have to identify some salient cultural beliefs or practices for each of the following cultures. These cultural beliefs will be written on posters for later display. They should consider the following topics for each culture: Education, Marriage, Family.
            1. Native American
            2. Western European
            3. African American
            4. Asian
            5. Hispanic
        iii. Each group's work will be posted, and participants will do a "gallery walk" or "chalk talk" (p. 198) to see what is similar and different in the work posted.
        iv. The fishbowl technique will be used to discuss the results of the posters (p. 143).

        v. “Appreciation pause”
    h. Time for Self-Reflection (20 min)
    i. Debrief Day (20 min)

3. Day 3
    a. Time to Mix, Light Breakfast (30 min)
    b. Overview of Day 3 (10 min)
    c. Dialogue 1 (120 min)
        i. “Bohemian Dialogue”: Differences in Worldview and Discrimination
            1. Watch “The Color of Fear” videos”
            2. 10 Minutes of personal reflection on videos.
            3. Begin Dialogue
    d. Lunch (45 min)
    e. Dialogue 2 (120 min)
        i. “Bohemian Dialogue”: Discrimination in Education
            1. Post discussion question
            2. 10 Minutes of personal reflection on question.
            3. Begin Dialogue
    f. Time for Self-Reflection (10 min)
    g. Debrief dialogues and professional development (20 minutes)
    h. Survey (10 minutes)

Appendix B: Project Professional Development PowerPoint

See Separate File.

Appendix C: Project Survey

Professional Development – Identifying Worldviews
End-of-PD Survey

The survey below is to help determine the outcomes of the professional development. Answer each question as it applies to you. You are not required to answer any question you do not want to answer. Surveys are anonymous. Respond to each statement with Strongly Agree (SA), Agree (A), Neutral (N), Disagree (D) or Strongly Disagree (SD).

		SA	A	N	D	SD
1	I have a better understanding of what my own personal worldview is than I did before attending this professional development.					
2	I feel confident in understanding what the worldview of another person is based upon.					
3	I have the ability to listen to another person express thoughts and opinions without interrupting.					
4	I can restate what another person has expressed without judgement.					
5	I can express appreciation to others for expressing themselves.					
6	I have a better understanding of the process of dialogue than I did before attending this professional development.					
7	I have begun to re-evaluate some of my own assumptions regarding education.					
8	I have begun to re-evaluate some of my own assumptions regarding culture.					

It would be helpful to get your thoughts on the following topics. However, you do not have to answer if you do not want to.

9. List and/or explain some of the assumptions your personal worldview is based upon.

10. List and/or explain some of the assumptions you heard another person express that their personal worldview is based upon.

11. What are some helpful dialogue skills you improved or learned?

12, Write any other comments you have regarding this professional development.

Appendix D: Interview Protocol

Interview Protocol

Interviewee Code:

Date of Interview:

High school graduated from:

Date of graduation:

Nature of study explained:

Confidentiality discussed:

Questions:

RQ1: How do you perceive the factors that contributed to a decision not to attend college?

1. Life Options
    a. After graduating from high school, what options did you see for your life ahead?

    b. How did you prioritize or decide which option to pursue?

    c. What are your plans to achieve any of these options?

    d. What value do you place on each option you considered (i.e. how does an option improve your life, your family lives, or your community)?

RQ2: How do you perceive cultural values and family obligations that contribute to a decision not to attend college?

2. Family
    a. Explain some of the considerations that led to your family members to decide to go on, or not go on, to college after graduating from high school. When considering family members, consider parents, siblings, uncles, aunts, grandparents, and cousins.

    b. In what ways did your family members encourage or discourage you from going on to college? If possible, give specific examples.
3. Value of Education
    a. What value do you perceive that your Native American culture places on a college education?

    b. What aspects of your culture led you to believe this?

Appendix E: Focus Group Protocol

Focus Group Protocol

Date of Focus Group:

Participants (provide sign-in sheet)

Agenda:

1. Explanation of study
2. Confidentiality
3. Introduction of Researcher
4. Introduction of Participants
5. Possible Guiding Discussion Questions (to be based on common themes from interviews):
    a. After graduating from high school, what were some things you considered when deciding whether to go on to college?
    b. What were some influences that swayed you either toward attending college or swayed you away from attending college?
    c. If not already discussed, how did any of the following considerations play in to your choice not to attend college?
        i. Family obligations or expectations.
        ii. Cultural or religious beliefs.
        iii. Peer relationships.
        iv. Finances and expenses.
        v. Fears (please define).
        vi. Benefits or burdens of a post-secondary education.
6. What are some life options you considered, or are considering, other than college?
7. What advice would you give to future high school graduates regarding making a choice for a life path after high school?

Appendix F: Interview Consent form

Interview Consent Form

Study Title Perceptions of White Mountain Apache High School Graduates on College

You are being asked to take part in a research study of how high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache consider when deciding whether to go on to college after high school. We are asking you to take part because you responded to a query in the paper or through another participant as willing to help with this research. Please read this form carefully and ask any questions you may have before agreeing to take part in the study.

What the study is about: The purpose of this study is to learn what high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation consider when deciding whether to go on to college. You must have graduated from a high school on the White Mountain Apache Reservation to take part in this study.

What we will ask you to do: If you agree to be in this study, we will conduct an interview with you. The interview will include questions about family influences with regard to going to college, life goals you may have, values you have regarding education, and cultural influences. The interview will take about 30 minutes to complete. With your permission, I would also like to audio-record the interview.

Risks and Benefits: There is the risk that you may find some of the questions about your family or culture to be sensitive, but you may decline to answer any question asked. Other than these risks, I do not anticipate any risks to you participating in this study other than those encountered in day-to-day life.

There are no benefits to you other than having the opportunity to reflect on your own life.

Compensation: There will be no compensation for participating in this study.

Your answers will be confidential. The records of this study will be kept private. In any sort of report I make public I will not include any information that will make it possible to identify you. Research records will be kept in a locked file; only the researchers will have access to the records. If I audio-record the interview, I will destroy the audio after it has been transcribed, which I anticipate will be within two months of the interview.

Taking part is voluntary: Taking part in this study is completely voluntary. You may skip any questions that you do not want to answer. If you decide not to take part or to skip some of the questions, it will not affect the interview process. You are free to decide not to take part or to withdraw at any time.

If you have questions: The researcher conducting this study is Tyler Bangert. Please ask any questions you have now. If you have questions later, you may contact Tyler Bangert at bangerttyler@gmail.com or 928-434-0711. If you have any questions or concerns regarding your rights as a subject in this study, you may contact the Institutional Review Board (IRB) at irb@mail.waldenu.edu.

Study Title Perceptions of White Mountain Apache High School Graduates on College

You will be given a copy of this form to keep for your records.

Participant Signatures

Statement of Consent: I have read the above information and have received answers to any questions I asked. I consent to take part in the study.

Participant Signature _____ Date _____

Participant Name (printed) _____ Date _____

In addition to agreeing to participate, I also consent to having the interview audio-recorded.

Your Signature _____ Date _____

Researcher Signature

Researcher signature _____ Date _____

Printed name of researcher _____ Date _____

Appendix G: Focus Group Consent Form

Focus Group Consent Form

Study Title Perceptions of White Mountain Apache High School Graduates on College

You are being asked to take part in a research study of how high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache consider when deciding whether to go on to college after high school. We are asking you to take part because you responded to a query in the paper or through another participant as willing to help with this research. Please read this form carefully and ask any questions you may have before agreeing to take part in the study.

What the study is about: The purpose of this study is to learn what high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation consider when deciding whether to go on to college. You must have graduated from a high school on the White Mountain Apache Reservation to take part in this study.

What we will ask you to do: If you agree to be in this study, I will conduct a focus group with a number of high school graduates, including you. The focus will include questions about family influences with regard to going to college, life goal you may have, values you have regarding education, and cultural influences. The purpose of the focus group is to encourage discussion and sharing of perceptions. The focus group will take about 30 minutes to complete. With your permission, I would also like to audio-record the focus group.

Risks and Benefits: There is the risk that you may find some of the questions about your family or culture to be sensitive, but you may decline to answer any question asked. Other than these risks, I do not anticipate any risks to you participating in this study other than those encountered in day-to-day life.

There are no benefits to you other than having the opportunity to reflect on your own life.

Compensation: There will be no compensation for participating in this study.

Your answers will be confidential. The records of this study will be kept private. In any sort of report I make public I will not include any information that will make it possible to identify you. Research records will be kept in a locked file; only the researchers will have access to the records. If I audio-record the focus group, I will destroy the audio after it has been transcribed, which I anticipate will be within two months of the focus group.

Taking part is voluntary: Taking part in this study is completely voluntary. You may skip any questions that you do not want to answer. If you decide not to take part or to skip some of the questions, it will not affect the interview process. You are free to decide not to take part or to withdraw at any time.

If you have questions: The researcher conducting this study is Tyler Bangert. Please ask any questions you have now. If you have questions later, you may contact Tyler Bangert at bangerttyler@gmail.com or 928-434-0711. If you have any questions or concerns regarding your

rights as a subject in this study, you may contact the Institutional Review Board (IRB) at irb@mail.waldenu.edu.

Study Title Perceptions of White Mountain Apache High School Graduates on College

You will be given a copy of this form to keep for your records.

Participant Signatures

Statement of Consent: I have read the above information and have received answers to any questions I asked. I consent to take part in the study.

Participant Signature _____ Date _____

Participant Name (printed) _____ Date _____

In addition to agreeing to participate, I also consent to having the interview audio-recorded.

Your Signature _____ Date _____

Researcher Signature

Researcher signature _____ Date _____

Printed name of researcher _____ Date _____

Appendix H: Information Letter

Research Study Information Letter

Study Title: Perceptions of White Mountain Apache High School Graduates on College

This is an information letter about a research study that you have the option to take part in. The research study is being conducted by Tyler Bangert as partial requirements for a Doctor of Education degree from Walden University.

Research studies are done to answer specific questions. This research study includes two questions, which are:

> RQ1: How do high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation perceive the factors that contribute to a decision not to go on to college?
>
> RQ2: How do high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation perceive cultural values and family obligations contribute to a decision of White Mountain Apache high school graduates not to attend college?

This study is being done because the percentage of Native American high school graduates is lower than the general population, including on the White Mountain Apache Reservation. The purpose of this research study is to find out why some high school graduates from the White Mountain Apache Reservation decide not to go on to college.

Taking part in research is always optional. I am looking for people who want to take part in this research study and who:

1. Have graduated from high school on the White Mountain Apache Reservation,
2. Have not gone on to college.

If you decide to take part in this research study you will be asked to:

1. Participate in an interview that will include questions about family influences with regard to going to college, life goals you may have, values you have regarding education, and cultural influences. The interview will take about 45 minutes to complete. With your permission, I would also like to audio-record the interview.
2. Participate in a focus group that will include similar questions to the interview, with emphasis on common themes from the interviews. The purpose of the focus group is to encourage discussion and sharing of perceptions from high school graduates. The focus group will take about 45 minutes to complete. With your permission, I would also like to audio-record the focus group.

All audio recordings will be destroyed after transcribing them. Any part of the research that might be published will not include any information that might identify any participants in this research study.

There is no cost to participate in the study. Participants will not be compensated for participating in this research study.

Before participating in the interview or focus group a consent form will be signed. If you have questions you can contact me through e-mail (bangerttyler@gmail.com), text, or phone (928-434-0711,

Taking part in research is voluntary. At any time you may opt out of the study with no consequences.

Sincerely,

Tyler Bangert