

2019

# Urban Development of a City in Niger Delta Region of Nigeria

chinyere Emmanuel igwe  
*Walden University*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.waldenu.edu/dissertations>

 Part of the [Public Administration Commons](#), [Public Policy Commons](#), and the [Sustainability Commons](#)

---

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies Collection at ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact [ScholarWorks@waldenu.edu](mailto:ScholarWorks@waldenu.edu).

# Walden University

College of Social and Behavioral Sciences

This is to certify that the doctoral dissertation by

Chinyere Emmanuel Igwe

has been found to be complete and satisfactory in all respects,  
and that any and all revisions required by  
the review committee have been made.

Review Committee

Dr. Marcel Kitissou, Committee Chairperson,  
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

Dr. Susan Baer, Committee Member,  
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

Dr. Slobodan Pesic, University Reviewer,  
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

The Office of the Provost

Walden University  
2019

Abstract

Urban Development of a City in Niger Delta Region of Nigeria

by

Chinyere Emmanuel Igwe

MBA, Rivers State University, 2009

BL, Nigeria Law School, Bwari-Abuja, 2007

LL.B, University of Calabar, 2006

B.Sc, University of Port Harcourt, 1997

Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Public Policy and Administration

Walden University

August 2019

## Abstract

The issue of indiscriminate urban expansion is not uncommon in Africa. It has created haphazard, unplanned, and unapproved development that negatively affected urban planning for cities in the Niger Delta Region in Nigeria. Using Stone's urban regime theory, the purpose of this phenomenological study was to explore from the perspective of developers, associations, and government agencies (referred to as stakeholders), the roots causes of indiscriminate urban development and their activities in the process in the Niger Delta Region. Data were collected through semi structured telephone interviews with 10 participants who had at least 5 years experience working in public and private organizations in the urban setting. Interviews were transcribed, coded, and analyzed using Braun and Clarke's procedure for thematic analysis. Findings included six themes of limited knowledge, passive role, recognition of experiencing the problem, contributing to the problem, weakness of regulatory framework, and lack of synergy in the process. The principal theme was limited knowledge of the roles and obligations of participants which impede participation in the planning process. The recommendations, if implemented, may result in positive changes and bring many benefits to city residents such as better housing and traffic systems, adequate sanitation and improved access to public services. To do so, government agencies in the urban sector should engage the stakeholders to create synergy. Following these recommendations may help resolve the issue of indiscriminate urban expansion, promote effective planning and management, and ensure good governance and sustainable development in the urban setting.

Urban Development of a City in Niger Delta Region of Nigeria

by

Chinyere Emmanuel Igwe

MBA, Rivers State University, 2009

BL, Nigeria Law School, Bwari-Abuja, 2007

LL.B, University of Calabar, 2006

B.Sc, University of Port Harcourt, 1997

Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Public Policy and Administration

Walden University

August 2019

## Dedication

I dedicate this work to memory of my late grand-mother Martha Ndukwuru Igwe whose deterministic and courageous disposition was the foundation for my life journey. To my wife, Darlyn, and children, Giada and Austin, you were by my side and, in some instances, forgo some essential needs to enable me to stay focused on this academic journey. I trust that it has inspired you all; remembering that there is nothing too difficult to achieve with determination. Thank you for the love, support, and encouragement you all demonstrated during the challenging times of this journey.

## Acknowledgments

I thank God for making it possible for me to complete this dissertation. I would like to express my deepest appreciation to my dissertation committee chairperson, Dr. Marcel Kitissou, committee member, Dr. Susan Baer and university research reviewer, Dr. Slobodan Pesic. Let me extend my thankfulness to the academic instructors and the teams that I passed through to acquire this certificate for their patience, assistance, support, and commitment to the Walden University philosophy to ensure positive social change.

Let me thank Chief Nyesom Ezenwo Wike Governor of Rivers State, my leader Chief Rt. Hon. Austin Opara as well as all my friends, associates, well wishers, and family for their encouragement, support, and understanding. Finally, I thank my dear wonderful wife Darlyn, children Giada, and Austin for their understanding, support, encouragement, and endurance of my absence occasioned by the rigors of this academic work.

## Table of Contents

List of Tables.....	iv
Chapter 1: Introduction to the Study.....	1
Background of the Study .....	3
Statement of the Problem .....	4
Purpose of the Study .....	5
Research Questions.....	6
Theoretical Foundation .....	6
Operational Definitions.....	9
Assumptions, Limitations,Scope, and Delimitations.....	12
Significance of the Study.....	12
Summary and Transition.....	14
Chapter 2: Review of Literature.....	15
Literature Search Strategy .....	16
Literature Review .....	18
Story of the city.....	18
Theoretical Framework.....	45
Summary and Conclusions.....	77
Chapter 3: Research Method.....	79
Research Design and Rationale .....	79
Role of the Researcher .....	83
Methodology.....	85



Population Selection Logic .....	87
Instrumentation .....	90
Procedures for Recruitment, and Data Collection.....	93
Data Analysis Plan.....	96
Issues of Trustworthiness.....	104
Credibility .....	106
Transferability.....	106
Conformability .....	107
Dependability.....	107
Ethical Research.....	108
Summary and Transition.....	112
Chapter 4: Results.....	113
Introduction.....	113
Restatement of the Purpose of the Study.....	113
Data Collection .....	114
Data Analysis.....	116
Coding.....	117
Finding.....	117
Theme .....	119
Evidence of Trustworthiness .....	120
Results .....	123
Research Questions.....	123

Summary .....	133
Chapter 5: Discussion, Conclusions, and Recommendations.....	134
Introduction .....	134
Interpretation of the Findings.....	134
Limitations.....	157
Recommendations.....	157
Implications.....	159
Conclusions .....	162
References.....	164
Appendix A: Letter to Leadership of Bodies.....	186
Appendix B: Letter to Request Participation.....	188
Appendix C: Interview Protocol .....	189
Appendix D: Coding Matrix Sample.....	191

## List of Tables

Table1. List Showing the Demography of the city.....	34
Table 2. List of Communities in the city .....	65
Table 3. List Showing Artisans, Location and Numbers in the city.....	71
Table 4. List Showing Institutional Private Estate Developers in the city .....	80
Table 5. List Showing Public Sector (Govt) Estate Development in the city.....	80
Table 6. List Showing Public Private Partnership Estate Development in the city.....	80
Table 7. List Showing Six Phase Framework for Thematic Analysis.....	110
Table 8. List Showing Participants Demographics .....	125
Table 9. Table Showing the Frequency of Responses by the Respondents.....	128
Table 10. Table showing Participants Responses in Interview 1.....	129

## **Chapter 1: Introduction to the Study**

### **Introduction**

Change comes through the instrument of laws, regulations, and policies. It takes place in the individual, family, society, organization, community, and state. People accept change based on their circumstances and disposition. Societal components, institutional structures, roles, and responsibilities are the determinants of change. Kundert (2015) contended that change affects society positively and negatively. Negative change resulted to indiscriminate urban development in a city in Niger Delta Region of Nigeria. Wike (2015) posited that the development pervading the city's landscape is against the spirits of relevant town planning laws, urban development regulations, and policies.

As a contemporary issue of socioeconomic development, urban planning and management have dominated the government's critical platform, acknowledged as a city planners and managers. Alnsour (2016) stated that positive transformation of urban space is the result of sustainable urban planning through institutional frameworks, laws, regulations, plans and actions. Bailey (2014) posited that philosophical and technical limits will address the negative consequences of the ever-increasing urban poor population, spatial expansion of squalor and informal settlement, overburdened and old urban infrastructure, and of indiscriminate development.

Multiple researchers have examined indiscriminate urban development. The relationship between the government, private, and nonprofit organizations in the landscape management is concerning as indiscriminate development. Tsavdaridou & Metaxas (2015) asserted that the involvement of key stakeholders in urban development

and management is controversial. The collaboration involving the government, private enterprises, and non-profit organizations as network governance has become ineffective as their divergent interests result in indiscriminate urban development in the city (Igwe, 2017).

The primary concern of this study was the exploration of the role or activities of the stakeholders in the indiscriminate urban development in a city in Niger

Delta. Traditionally, society has relied on government to ensure law and order (Tsavdaridou & Metaxas, 2015). However, collaborative governance has shifted the task to third parties (Pierre, 2016). The presence of these actors has made participatory network governance relevant as their involvement in decision making has become crucial (Marques, 2013). Society is at risk as competing interests are upheld over the general interest in the collaborative arrangement (Stone, 2014). The reduction of collaborative governance to personal interest has led to loss of confidence in the network.

There is a lack of existing literature on the role of stakeholders in indiscriminate urban development. This study will contribute to the positive social change of this Niger Delta City's sustainable urban development. The sustainable change will bring improvement on the urban landscape management of the city.

### **Background of the Study**

The city is a center of Nigeria's oil and gas resources. Ministry of Urban Development & Physical Planning (2013) stated that this reputation is the product of the landscape, skyline, the environment, neatness, and orderliness in the built industry,

strategic location of social infrastructures, and adherence to the rules and regulations of government policy.

However, the city witnessed change from the garden city to slum city as a result of indiscriminate urban development from the 1990s to the 2000s. The random urban development in the city has affected the socioeconomic life of the people. Wike (2015), Wokekoro & Owei (2014), and Kio-Lawson & Dekor (2014) argued that the standard development indexes of education; economic activities; greening; health; housing and infrastructural facilities of electricity, road and drainage, water, recreation, and open space lost their bearing. Wang (2012) acknowledged that socio-economic indexes are adversely affected by the creation of urban sprawl. Opong (2016) contended that the existence of slums has negative implications for the city and its people. Bailey (2014) opined that a comprehensive evaluation of urban development management to address the negative consequences of indiscriminate development is the way out. This indiscriminate development brings about the expansion of slum, informal settlement, and too much pressure on urban infrastructure.

In this study, I explored the role or activities of the stakeholders in the indiscriminate urban development in this Niger Delta City of Nigeria. The findings contribute to the knowledge gap in urban planning and assist policymakers and city managers in ensuring sustainable urban development in the city in Nigeria.

### **Problem Statement**

The phenomenon of indiscriminate urban development in this Niger Delta City in Nigeria is at a rate that requires research. Poor planning, absence of law, lack of

implementation of relevant regulations, and poor policy framework lead to corruption, disobedience, and institutional failure in the urban sector (Wike, 2015). Stone (2014) presented the urban setting as having stakeholders who determines the course of events in the urban landscape. However, there is no scholarly work on stakeholders' contribution to the subject. This vacuum in research provided the foundation for this research. This study will provide a better understanding of the role and activities of stakeholders in the urban setting that has caused the indiscriminate urban development the City.

### **Purpose of the Study**

The purpose of this work was to determine the cause of indiscriminate urban development. The qualitative research methodology was used to gather primary data. Semi structured question were developed and administered randomly to stakeholders. Websites, brochures, and government archival records were also reviewed to support responses to the semi-structured questionnaire. Also, direct observation of indiscriminate development in the city contributed to this work.

This research and its findings have the potential of affecting urban sustainability. Development plans based on the conclusions and recommendation of this study will benefit the long-range strategy that can increase competitive advantage (Morris, 2013). Spearman (2015) contended that sustainable urban development serves as foundation for economic growth. Stone (2015), and Rehm & Ade (2013) asserted that economic growth is the interest of business in the governing coalition, while conserving natural resources and reducing climate change from greenhouse emission is in the interest of government. Stoker (2015), and Rast (2015) contended that these interests hold the city's coalition

actors together.

This city is the commercial center of the South Eastern, the political and administrative center of Nigerian Niger Delta zone and the petroleum hub of Africa have stakeholders with various interests. These led people from different destinations to converge in the city leading to parallel economic and urbanization growth that reshaped the life of the city to building of bridges of civic interaction and entrepreneurship attracting a sporadic rise to the influx of people to the mega city (Kio-Lawson, 2013; Kio-Lawson & Dekor, 2014; Okpara, 2013; Wokekoro & Owei, 2014;). This is accentuated by the change from a small wharf town to an industrial and petroleum hub (Emeka, 2015; Emenike & Sampson, 2017).

### **Research Questions**

1. What are the causes of the continuous indiscriminate urban development in the city?
2. What are the effects and consequences of indiscriminate urban development of the city?

### **Theoretical Foundation**

The theoretical framework for this research was the urban regime theory of Stone (1989). The literature on the subject and associated variables are of benefit to an exploratory research of indiscriminate urban development of a city in Niger Delta Region of Nigeria. The theory is an approach to the study of urban governance through which stakeholders and actors in the urban setting uses the informal institutions to maximize their ability (Grooms & Boamah, 2017). According to the Urban Regime Theory there is



a common ground where the stakeholders who must necessarily exist through organizations meet. It is a widely used theoretical framework based on its reliance on the institutional environment to provide information and enforcement mechanism (Crow, Albright, & Koebele, 2015).

Urban governance has many characteristics of decentralization and delegation of responsibilities by the state, financial impediments, and ever developing private sector through profit and non-profit organizations (Stoker as cited by Rich & Tsitsos (2017)). The governments as agents and catalyst for development work through the other partners to advance the policies and programs in the economic development, human capital, security, and crime prevention, as well as environmental protection issues, etc. The regime theory goal centered on using the actors in the urban setting to create innovation that will accentuate sustainable development. Jerneck & Olsson (2011) posited that the theory also functions through investigative processes to ensure sustainability. To achieve goals, in-depth exploration of the critical elements that will activate sustainable development is required. Urban regime theory accentuates behaviors necessary to accommodate risk and uncertainty because businesses are always in risky and uncertainty situation in their operations.

To achieve sustainable urban development, there must be conscious environmental design, cooperation from actors, adequate laws and regulations, and protocols that will ensure sustainability, and eliminate waste. The urban regime theory provided the phenomenological investigation of determining the cause of indiscriminate urban development of Port Harcourt City, Nigeria.

### **Nature of the Study**

The nature of this study was the qualitative method with a phenomenological strategy of inquiry. Qualitative researchers explore as well as support the quest for more than apparent knowledge of the issue and ensure the exploration of distinctions in the subject matter (Starke, 2013). In this study, the qualitative approach included use of in-depth phone interview, observing and experiencing the phenomenon, and accessing large documents. Because this study was conducted in a city in Niger Delta Region of Nigeria, it was bounded by place. Participants in the study included government officials, professional town planners, developers, non-governmental organizations, residents and members of associations.

This research methodology ensured a systematic inquiry into the phenomenon of indiscriminate urban development in the city. Interviews with key participants and stakeholders were conducted to ensure that I explored appropriate individuals and organizations in the subject area. Singh (2014) asserted that qualitative methods are mostly suitable to answer the what, how and why questions which are relevant for providing answers to the research questions in this study. This methodology provided a better understanding of the urban space management. Kassai & Jabbour (2014) acknowledged that answers to the questions by the work would support the urban regime concept of incorporating business as a strategic partner and its interest of economic goals.

### **Operational Definitions**

Knowledge base and sharing are factors of sustainability. Nieves & Haller (2014) supported that they are advantageous to sustainability. Banwi & Bilec (2014) contended

that sharing information improves operational efficiency and helps organizations sustain their competitive advantage. Different sectors use terms and acronyms familiar and understandable to them.

In this study I intended to discover the cause of indiscriminate urban development in the city in the Niger Delta Region of Nigeria. Terms in this research will increase the ability of persons outside to understand the urban industry better. Precise contextual meanings are offered to assist in the urban development sector. The following terms are defined below:

*Sustainable development:* Kumar and Kumar (2014) posited that there is multidisciplinary literature on sustainable development across the various social sciences fields of sociology, economy, politics, geography, architecture and urban studies, government, public policy, philosophy and ethics, environmental studies, ecology, and transportation disciplines. It is a policy and strategy for continued economic and social development that is not adverse to the environment as it is a development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of the future generations to meet their own needs.

*Strategic land use plan:* Sets out the present and future location, form, type and extent for residential, commercial, industrial and institutional land use. This has a direct bearing on urban aesthetics, public health, economic and social bearing as it discourages slum in the city (Oriye & Fakere, 2015).

*Urban management:* Alnsour (2016) stated that urban management is the capacity to control land use in order to exploit space effectively economically and socially. It is necessary that several institutions work together.

*Urban planning and development:* The University of Toronto (2017) stated that this urban planning and development is concerned with the processes through which the physical fabric of the city is developed, redeveloped and revitalized, and the ways in which these development processes can be modified or directed by public policy and regulation on and by the policies, practices and decisions of private corporations on. Somma (2017) agreed that the urbanization of cities is one of government's main objectives, and the core element in economic and social decisions.

*Stakeholders:* Persons with interest or concern in something and use their influence to affect the actions, objectives and policies in the urban environment (Stone, 2015). IN this study, this includes government and its agencies, business organizations, professional bodies, artisan unions, residents, community members, developers and civil society organizations.

*Indiscriminate urban development:* Earle (2017) stated that the rapid and poorly planned urbanization is pervading the urban centers with large proportions of the urban population being vulnerable.

*Squatter settlement:* Definition of a squatter settlement varies from country to country and depends on a variety of defining parameters and is more generally considered as a residential area in an urban locality inhabited by the poor who have no

access to tenured land of their own, and hence squat on vacant land, either private or public (Ostby, 2016).

*Slum*: Oppong (2016) defined slum as residential areas that are physically and socially deteriorated, occupied by diverse group of people without access to good satisfactory condition. It is a condition of settlement people without access to safe water, adequate sanitation, secured tenure, and durable houses of permanent nature.

*Urban governance*: The exercise of political, economic and administrative authority in the management of urban affairs (Grooms & Boamah, 2017). The Commission on Global Governance (1995) posited that it comprises the complex mechanisms, processes, and institutions through which citizens and groups articulate their interests, mediate their differences, and exercise their legal rights and obligations. In urban governance, the state creates conducive political and legal environment whereas the private sector generates jobs and income, and the civil society facilitates political and social interaction.

*Urban regime theory*: A dominant paradigm in the field of urban politics and policy. Stone (2014) used it in explaining the relationship between the public and private-sector in the management of cities. The concept examines whether or how various interests are incorporated into governing coalitions.

**(a) Assumptions, Limitations, Scope, and Delimitations.**

- Access to coalition members was not difficult to establish. An identification of active actors was undertaken through random sampling based on established locations.

- Participants will answer questions openly and honestly .
- The results of this work may be limited to this city. This is because the scope of this study was limited to it.
- Results may be generalized to other cities across the world with similar attributes.
- The findings from this study were limited to interpretation rather than quantitative analysis.

### **Significance of the Study**

The urban development sector is the foreclosure of the construction industry. Igwe (2017) acknowledged it as a significant contributor to economic growth and development of every society. Banawi&Bilec (2014) admitted that in the U.S, revenue accruing from the construction industry for 2012 was more than \$558 billion with employment to over 7 million persons. Wike (2015) asserted that the revenue profile of the industry was about #150 billion to the Rivers State Government and constituted about 82% of the state capital budget for 2016. Therefore, it is imperative that the study has significant relevance to the economic planning process of Rivers State Government, and development planning of this city.

This study is significant as it will fill the gap in literature on the cause of indiscriminate urban development in this city in Niger Delta Region of Nigeria. Emenike and Sampson (2017) contended that absence of relevant records; poor planning and overcrowding of internal facilities; amenities; and poor quality housing contributed to lack of sustainable urban development of the city. Adekola, Fischbacher-Smith, Fischbacher-Smith & Adekola (2016) stated that the paucity of research and planning created room for

the random development in the city. An understanding of the cause of inadequate planning by those charged with the responsibility of managing the city space will enable them to curtail, control and regulate indiscriminate development.

The results of this study may provide information to policymakers, lawmakers, developers and other Institutional organizations. Tsavadaridou& Metaxas (2015) argued that cities and enterprises as living and growing entities affect each other, and the people living and working in them. The findings of the research will serve as data to the legislative, executive and judicial arms of government, the businesses in the city and the professional bodies in the construction industry a veritable platform for the practice of town planning and management of urban space usage. Businesses will have to undertake their development efforts within the contemplation of planning and development framework that will accentuate efficient management of the urban landscape.

The study will serve as my contribution to sustainable urban development which will ensure positive social change. The change will improve the society as this study will help policymakers understand why this city deteriorated and will help them to make policy changes to address these issues and help the city to thrive again. The citizenry will derive benefits from the oil and gas nerve center.

### **Summary and Transition**

The nature of urban development in this city has been characterized with irregularity, and distortion of the landscape; it has become a source of concern to visitors, city managers, public officials, residents and business executives. That the indiscriminate nature of the development has not only distorted the city landscape, but that it has also

affected the economic prosperity of the city. The city has become a shadow of its former self as the garden city of Nigeria. The tourist attraction the city portends has been eroded with indiscriminate development. The coalition actors played role in the state of indiscriminate development, but formal study will need to be conducted to determine how, and what caused the problem.

Chapter 2, review of the literature on the subject will follow.



## **Chapter 2: Literature Review**

The indiscriminate urban development of this Niger Delta City in Nigeria consists of irregular developmental activities undertaken by various persons on the urban land. These developments occur in different shapes and types (Wike, 2015). Many scholars have engaged in research on indiscriminate urban development across the globe. However, minimal attention has been directed to this city in Niger Delta Region of Nigeria and no effort has been dedicated to understanding the role played by the stakeholders or coalition actors on the indiscriminate urban development.

In this work, a review of research materials that are relevant will be undertaken to assist in locating reference articles. In this literature review, I will highlight seminal works on the subject of indiscriminate urban development, the role and activities of stakeholders or coalition actors in the urban setting, and how they cause indiscriminate urban development. Through this review, a better understanding of their activities' impact on the policy implementation with reference to the study will become visible.

### **Literature Research Strategies**

This literature research consists of contemporary studies on the subject of urban planning, management and development, indiscriminate development, sustainable development and stakeholders. The review includes peer-reviewed studies that addressed the issues being determined, as well as potentials for future research. Other sources include government laws, regulations, gazettes, reports, statistical data and reports, and scholarly books. The primary resource of this work included Walden University Library

databases that helped in the identification of full-text articles, scholarly journals, peer-reviewed studies and dissertations.

About 1000 materials were identified in course of the research, and 180 relevant materials in the literature were used. From the materials found through these search strategies, a review of references of previous authors was conducted to locate additional resources that the general search did not discover. I did not find any research literature that directly dealt on the role of stakeholders or coalition actors on indiscriminate urban development of any city or town.

Key words used for the search included sustainable development, urban planning, development and management, land use, urban law, policy and regulation, slum, indiscriminate development, urban managers, stakeholders or coalition actors in urban sector. Emphasis was placed on peer-reviewed materials of not more than 5 years of publication.

The research goal was to include a presentation of multifaceted views on variables to facilitate connection with answers to research questions. Alnsour (2016) posited that the purpose of a comprehensive literature is to review critically and analyze existing literature to develop a cogent foundation that will ensure collection and analysis of data for the research work

An unbiased approach was adopted in the literature review to ensure that the literature was applicable.

## (b) Literature Review

The role and activities of stakeholders or coalition actors has induced indiscriminate urban development in this Niger Delta City in Nigeria. The following literature review provides insight into how urban planning and development of the city has been affected.

### **Story of the city**

This city is the largest town and capital of a state, political and administrative center in South South Zone also known as Niger Delta Region of Nigeria and one of the largest town in Nigeria with a population of 1,865,000 persons (Nigerian Population Commission, 2016). The city referred to as the garden city of Nigeria is the third most developed metropolis after Lagos and Abuja (Sycky, 2016). Okpara (2013); Kio-Lawson and Dekor (2014) and Igwe (2018) posit that it is the oil capital of Nigeria and the oil hub of Africa.

The city lies along the Bonny River in the eastern corridor of the Niger River with a distance of 41 nautical miles off the Gulf of Guinea and surrounded by Aba, Owerri and Yenagoa, and linked by the eastern rail line to Enugu. Climatically, it has a tropical wet climate of long and heavy rainfall with September recording 367mm of rain, while the short dry season is in December and January. The city temperatures are relatively constant all through the year with an average between 25°C – 28°C (World Weather Information Service, Port Harcourt, 2016).

In December 2012, the city celebrated its 100<sup>th</sup> year of creation by Lord Luggard British Colonial Governor General for the Northern and Southern protectorates of Nigeria

and named it after Sir Lewis Viscount Harcourt, the then British Secretary of State for the Colonies. The area was the vast farmland and secondary forest belonging to the Diobu village of Ikwerre and had adjoining creeks through which trading activities with the Okrika, Kalabari and Ibani fishermen was facilitated (Kio-Lawson & Dekor, 2014; Rebisi Progressive Movement, 2006; Wokekoro & Owei, 2014). The establishment of the town was necessitated by the need for a port town as an outlet for the exploitation of the mineral resources in the hinterland. Okpara (2013) opined that the need for a medium to transport the vast agricultural products from the South Eastern parts of the Southern protectorate prompted Luggard to create the town. Luggard wanted to ensure that the palm oil, palm kernel, timber and coal from the Eastern states; tin and columbite from the plateau, and peanuts from the North East of Nigeria were effectively transferred to Europe. The town also served as a muster point during the world wars.

In 1930, the establishment of Nigerian Observer Newspaper in the town, the formation of African Community League in 1935 provided the ideological fire with which struggle for political power with the Europeans commenced. Kio-Lawson (2013) posited that the use of militancy without hostility by the African Community League propelled the introduction of the franchise. This engendered political tranquility that propelled the African Community League to demand that Port Harcourt be accorded a representative town in the Nigerian Legislative Council with elective capacity and town council status; these requests were granted in 1949. Kio-Lawson and Dekor (2014) concurred that the recognitions shifted the battle ground of political control to the city.

Land is used to meet a variety of human needs. The Township Ordinance No. 29 of 1917 brought about the introduction of spatial ordinances in land use pattern of some Nigerian Towns leading to the preparation of layouts in Port Harcourt, Aba, Kaduna and other major towns.

The Nigerian Town and Country Planning Ordinance of 1946 established town planning authorities to undertake and manage planning schemes that produced Amadi Layout or Amadi Flats, an old low density layout in the city with 20 streets, conceived as residential area with 257 houses. The Town and Country Planning Law CAP 126 of 1963 enabled the regional governments to increase the number of planning authorities, and declare planning areas that ensured the development of planning schemes.

The diobu line popularly called the D/line is a medium density residential neighborhood made up of three layouts in the Area Planning scheme Order in Council 29 of 1947 and placed under the Port Harcourt-Obio Planning Authority in Section 10 of Eastern Nigeria Law 1947. There are Orije, Ogbunabali and Oromenike layouts.

The Federal Military Government of Nigeria created Rivers State in 1967. Ever since then, the political and administrative control of the city fell into the care of Rivers people, and the oil boom witnessed by the country increased the population (Wokekoro&Owei, 2014); the port facility, industrial activities and commercial undertakings turned the city into a cosmopolitan town (Kio-Lawson, 2013). In the city, the interests of major stakeholders were promoted as competition amongst contending groups attracted people from all walks of life, to live, work and do various kind of commercial activities in the city.

Following the declaration of Republic of Biafra from Nigeria in 1967, a civil war ensued. The city became the nerve center of economic activities in the new republic. However, the city fell to Nigerian forces on May 19, 1968, which contributed to the surrender of the seceding republic in 1969. The end of the civil war brought about unprecedented urban population growth to the city (Okpara, 2013). Migrants to the city accounted for about 72% of its population with about 66% who migrated from the rural areas of the South-East Nigeria (Kio-Lawson & Dekor, 2014). The rural urban migration contributed to the high rate of indiscriminate urbanization of the city. Persons in the city who were not of the Eastern Region extraction were made to leave for their own villages due to the antagonism of the war. This led to an in-migration and out-migration in the early stages of the political crisis (Wokekoro & Owei, 2014).

The city's expansion overtime as an area of 15.54 km<sup>2</sup> in 1914 has grown to 360 km<sup>2</sup> in the 2000s (Igwe, 2017). The main city has become congested, precipitating the passing of a law creating the greater city development authority spanning the city to eight local government areas.

The economic importance of the city has remained high, because of its position as a port city, one of the only two railway terminals in Southern Nigeria. Onukwugha (2017) argued that it is the largest city in the South-South Region of Nigeria as well as the fastest economically growing city in the Nigeria with more than 70 % of all foreign investment in the South-South region situated there, because it is well endowed with natural resources and infrastructures like international and domestic airports, seaports, rail way terminal, international hotels and other facilities. Ihueze, Nwosu, & Okorundu (2014)

agreed that it is one of the cities that grew at a fast rate based on its strategic position in land and sea which led its industrialization, rapid expansion and eventual congestion.

The city became important became the centre of the booming oil and gas industry in Nigeria and Africa. Kio-Lawson & Dekor (2014); and Igwe (2018) stated that the state is regarded as the treasure base of the Nigeria due to its oil and gas infrastructures. Port Harcourt is the largest aggregation of heavy and light industry-technology in the petroleum industry in Nigeria and African; hence, it is a vibrant economy with opportunities for business, investment and tourism. Ihueze et al., (2014) emphasized that the expansion of oil and allied extractive industries attracted many other manufacturing industries giving rise to high influx of people.

The role of public policy in the urban development process aftermath of the civil war is of importance. After the civil war, rural settlements were incorporated into the city sphere because of the heightened migrations into the city which was stimulated by the civil war migration (Klieman, 2012). This expansion became necessary due to the opportunities that a city like oil-rich Port Harcourt provides (Kio-Lawson, 2013). The Master Plan of 1975 made ample provisions of basic urban infrastructure and services, location of economic activities, and housing development. This led to urban planning at the expense of the rural areas. Igwe (2017) contended that nearly 80% of the manufacturing industries in the state are located in the city. Aprioku (2017) stated that nearly all government housing programs are situated in Port Harcourt. In developing countries, land use planning and management is not effectively established. UNIHABITAT (2008) affirmed that manifestation of the land use activities abound in the

cities as the physical, economic and social conditions of African cities leaves much to be desired.

The city exploded in the 1990s and 2000s following a rapid rate of urbanization due to a plethora of issues. This resulted in the unplanned and unregulated growth. The land use planning that ensures orderly physical development that evolve functional and livable environment has failed in the city by the end of last century (Owei, Obinna & Ede, 2010; Wokekoro & Owei, 2014; Dekor, 2014; Rivers State Ministry of Urban Development & Physical Planning, 2013; and Lombard, 2016).

United Nations Sustainable Development Agenda has sustainable land use planning as Agenda 21 with the objective of providing land as requirements of human settlement development to achieve sound environmental physical planning and land use for access to land to all households. Oyesiku (2015) argued that planning practice in Nigeria has not created spatially sustainable cities because planning is like preventative medicine, but professional planners in the country spent decades focusing attention on curative medicine. Land use planning as a key component of urban management and sustainability are influenced by control and regulation mechanism for efficient use of urban land (Owei, et al., 2010). Land acquisition and development are the basis of physical growth under the purview of development control process of plans, regulations and laws.

Ineffectiveness of the control processes in the city was derived from the planning, regulatory and administrative frameworks within which land use or physical planning and development took place. Planned expansion in the city encountered



problems of access to land, acquisition of land, and relevant laws for the regulation of land use (Owei, et al., 2010).

Competition for land in times of rapid urbanization is reflected in the disputes over titles registration. Owei, et al., (2010) argued that improving policies and practices of land tenure and property rights are critical elements for effective planned development of urban cities' efficiency and equity. The responsibility for formulating and enforcing the rules for ownership and use of land rests with the state. Property issues will continue to command the attention of policy makers despite their political persuasions. Dekor (2014) argued that in urban areas population pressure and the complex nature of transactions requires states' intervention to provide for the elements of residential, commercial, industrial and the interests of vulnerable groups. Tenure and property rights system addresses traditional and customary arrangements, squatter settlements and other non formal categories, just as urban areas require systems of tenure and rights to create security for investment of all stakeholders.

Influence of land use tenure system on indiscriminate urban development of the city cannot therefore be ignored. Insecure land use tenure has been a security threat to urban development as land conflicts have degenerated to violence (Lombard, 2016). The relationship between land issues and conflicts are framed within the wider economic, political and social processes of land reform, changes in policy, and increasing urban insecurity. The failure of the legal and administrative framework for land use planning provided a leeway for developers to undertake developments without control. Much of the city's growth is attributed to this process of informal development of land.

Land Use Act (1978) failed in its role to simplify and streamline land management and ownership. Problematic implementation did not improve land use as over 75 % of stakeholders ignored it (Dekor, 2014). Rivers State Physical Planning Law was enacted to provide for the control, planning and development of land in the state, but did not fare better (Igwe, 2017). Owei, et., al (2010) maintained that the main factor responsible for the ineffectiveness of these laws was poor implementation. Government's inability to control and sanction activities of indiscriminate development was manifest.

Despite the massive influxes of oil revenues, Nigeria's economic landscape continued to witness experiences of stagnating economies, declining standards of living, authoritarian and corrupt forms of government. The period of civil war in Nigeria (1967–1970) has often been neglected in analyses of Nigerian oil boom even though the structures, policies, and political relations that characterized Nigeria's unique version of the oil curse were established then (Igwe, 2017). The tax battle waged by U.S. oil companies brought tensions before the 30 months old civil war. U.S. oil companies undertook lobbying and propaganda campaigns to convince Nigerians not to accept the Libyan-style tax laws (Klieman, 2017). The U. S. oil companies propagated the believe that the law will relegate areas where oil companies operated to perpetual poverty.

Nigerian Military Leader Lt. General Yakubu Gowon, secessionist leader Emeka Ojukwu and the international oil companies agreed that oil matters should be out of the public domain thereby introducing opacity in the political economy of oil in Nigeria (Klieman, 2017). This policy removed information about oil production, revenues,

accounting, and operations from the people leading to the impression that Nigeria's first oil boom came in the 1970s as global oil prices skyrocketed. This is false as substantial oil boom occurred between 1964 and 1965 with Shell and Gulf Oil producing from onshore concessions in the East, five other major Société Africaine des Pétroles (SAFRAP), AziendaGeneraleItalianaPetroli (AGIP), Philips Petroleum Company, Amoseas, and Mobil were prospecting offshore oil activities in the Midwestern region (Klieman, 2017). Nigeria's first shipment of crude oil passed through Port Harcourt port in 1958, a new refinery opened in September 1965 in Port Harcourt.

The city's oil economy was acknowledged. In 1964 the U.S. embassy in Nigeria posited that the oil boom atmosphere of Port Harcourt had moved Nigeria from a marginal producer to a major world oil produce as Nigeria's became the thirteenth largest oil producer in the world in 1965 with daily crude output of 301, 352 barrels earning over £60 million daily per day (Klieman, 2012). 83 % of the total oil production was in the Eastern Region by Royal Dutch Shell based in Port Harcourt and 9.4 % by SAFRAP. The sharing formula of the oil revenue accorded 50% of the rents and royalties to the Region of origin, 20 % to the Federal Government, and 30 % to a pool from which distributions were made to all regions in proportion to their population size (Jega, 2013).

Nigeria as a major supplier of oil to the U. S. brought the strategic interest of Port Harcourt to the U. S. The new status of world oil player did not go down with the international community. The U. S. embassy and their oil companies were not

comfortable with the development hence they used all mechanism to down play its importance. U.S. Agency for International Development (1966) assessed the impact of increased oil revenues in Nigeria and stated that the official Nigerian government position on the anticipated oil revenues were lower than what the oil company officials knew and that these projections were different and lower than the figures estimated by the oil field operators. U.S. embassy never released the report as it was believed that the information would be explosive since the Ojukwu / Gowon standoff has commenced.

International oil companies' interest in Nigeria contributed to the civil war. Their opposition to the new tax law ignited regional and ethnic tensions that led to the outbreak of war (Kleiman, 2016). The strategy of Opacity which shielded information about oil activities played a central role as incorrect information were released for political and economic reasons. Secessionist leader Emeka Ojukwu also used similar strategy to manage his image abroad. His background as an Oxford university educated, son of one of Nigeria's first millionaires knighted by Queen Elizabeth of England, also a director on the board of Royal Dutch Shell prepared and armed him with most innovative and successful tactics to hire public relations teams that promoted his pet dream of Biafra Republic in the United States and the United Kingdom (Egwu, 2015).

Eastern Region was the base of the oil wealth which Ojukwu was interested in. Klieman, (2016) argued that Ojukwu avoided drawing the international oil companies into the conflict or even mentioning oil in public but explained that it was not his desire to touch oil. Rivers State Government (2013) disagreed by stating that Ojukwu

strategized around oil from the very beginning through his prewar tactics to block the passage of petroleum to the Northern Region and held two meetings with the heads of the oil companies before secession took place. During the thirty-five days between formal secession and the firing of the first shots, he sent lawyers to New York City to convince U.S. oil companies that once their production started they would be legally justified in paying their revenues to the East.

Oil exploitation requires intense financing and high technology that detached it from the rest of the nation's economy. Klieman (2012) contended that the global petroleum industry navigates very choppy waters from prolonged run of high and growing rig counts that are mega capital expenditure, requiring high capital investment, and against precipitously sliding oil prices. Oil companies' investment is product of heavily rosy forecasts hence, returns on capital are always not static. Ya'u (2012) posited that price rebound increases optimism, and cost containment efforts of reducing head count, postponing projects, and cutting spending are used.

In its efforts to face the uncertain long-term forecasts, oil companies explore strategies to boost efficiency. High technological advancements which help them transform operations and create additional profits are deployed. Igwe (2018) contended that the effective use of digital technologies in the sector ensured the reduction of capital expenditures by 20%, cut operating costs in upstream by 3 to 5%, and about half of that in downstream, and pioneered the first digital age in the 1980s and 1990s. Oil companies were making use of 3-D seismic, linear program modeling of refineries, and advanced

process control for operations long before the digitalization of other business activities. The use of these technologies substantially detached the industry from other sectors of the city's economy and contributed to the dearth of other business sectors. The many employers and employees of the collapsed businesses in a bid to survive engaged in indiscriminate development in the city.

The city as a major industrial centre has large number of business organizations in all sectors of economic endeavors. The status as the chief oil-refining city in Nigeria attracted various industrial and commercial concerns (Poroma, David, & Jackson, 2015). It is the capital city of one of the wealthiest states in Nigeria, have a gross domestic product and foreign exchange earnings from the oil industry that attracted other business activities (Igwe, 2018). The city has the highest number of expatriates outside Lagos with the number of jobs seekers outstripping the available jobs opportunities (Klieman, 2015). Cost of living in the city is very high and can be compared next to the Federal Capital, Abuja. It would be recalled that the reason for creating the port town and linking it to Enugu through the Eastern railway line was to export coal, palm oil and other resources from the hinterlands. The oil economy turned her into a cosmopolitan city but with serious economic, social, cultural, and political consequences. The Niger Delta people were forced by the increasing fortune of oil boom to abandon their predominant profession of farming and fishing (Wokekoro&Owei, 2014). The predominance of oil as the prime economic good and the devastation of farmlands, rivers, creeks, oceans, the mangrove, and aquatic life due to oil and gas pollution occasioned by oil exploration activities and attendant neglect by the oil companies brought declining fortune in agriculture that forced

people to migrate to Port Harcourt (Kio-Lawson & Dekor, 2014). The movement by SHELL from Owerri to Rumukrushu and Rumuobiakani in Port Harcourt by 1950 attracted people to the city.

Initially, only young men migrated to the city in search of greener pastures. Hannah & Hannah (1974) revealed that land tenure system did not favor women. Cities with preponderance of young men had artificial scarcity of sex issue hence urban men had to source it with their money. It also involved enterprising young ladies migrating to the cities with less cultural and social restriction, selling their bodies for the resources it attracts. Klieman (2012) argued that the city ward movement by young unmarried girls portrayed how structural changes in industrial urban economy motivated most women to migrate to the city to find opportunities of earning money in the looming oil industry. Lots of girls delved into the thriving trade of migrating to the city arising from the collapse of the rural economy that once sustained them. This contributed to the indiscriminate development of the Niger Delta Region City as they lacked capacity to procure decent accommodations, so they ended in shanties.

Inadequate urban planning had seriously impacted on sustainable development of the city. Onu, Surendran, & Price (2014) posited that the continuous movement of people to the urban center led to high concentration of people, ever increasing industrial activities with little or no implementation of urban planning procedures led to the city continued witnessing of indiscriminate development. It is not uncommon to see streets, roads, undeveloped plots of land and drainages littered with all sorts of developments.

Indiscriminate waste disposal is also an attribute of existence of unplanned settlements in the city. Urban planning implementations in course of building and development of towns and villages in the city was not been given priority attention. Onu et al., (2014) contended that failure in planning led to the increasing problem of unsanitary municipal solid waste management in the city. Open dumping of solid waste is common wherever land is available as it is often done without regard to safety, health hazards, and aesthetic value degradation (Botkins& Kelly, 1998). The intractable issue of waste management is a product of indiscriminate waste disposal and inadequate waste collection.

It was exacerbated by the absence of waste management infrastructure, inadequate collection of wastes, inadequate road networks, the existence of unplanned areas, towns and shanties, inadequate funding, lack of proper and sustained awareness, and the unwholesome attitude of the people (Onu, et al., 2014; UN-HABITAT, 2010).

The decline in provision of infrastructural facilities, and hindrance posed to intra-city mobility by the poorly planned and inefficient management of land use didn't help matters in the indiscriminate urban development in this city. These led to failure of municipal service of waste collection and disposal as refuse generated heaped up, uncollected in large parts of city, especially the low-income areas. Wokeokoro&Owei (2014); and Onu, et al., (2014) maintained that in most towns, areas and streets, the service is unreliable, irregular, and inefficient. Housing and associated facilities of water, electricity, telephone are similarly inadequate hence millions of people live in



substandard and subhuman environments, plagued by slums, squalor, and inadequate social amenities like poor schools' infrastructures, poor health and recreational facilities.

African countries from the 1970s adopted socioeconomic programs intended to revitalize their economies as imposed by the Breton Woods organizations of World Bank and International Monetary Fund (IMF). The neoliberal policies of the Structural Adjustment Program (SAP) truncated and stagnated the pace and pendulum of economic growth and development in the continent (Abah, Danladi, & Naankiel (2015). Anthony (2012) stated that the devaluation of currency, removal of social subsidies, abolition of marketing boards, deregulation and privatization of government owned companies are ill conceived reforms that were unsuitable for African economies based on their poor volatility with a skewed, and form worsened the geometric growing unemployment crisis. These immersed the people with severe economic hardship and poverty by relegating their purchasing power parity, and decreased their access to basic social services of schools and hospital facilities. Heidhues & Gideon (2011) reported that farmers and manufacturers were exposed to the vagaries of international capitalist competition. Experts of political economy agreed that SAP in Africa and Nigeria heightened the upsurge in the emergence of international multinational corporations which plundered Nigeria resources for the benefits of its shareholders in Europe and America (Egwu, 2014). It impacted identity politics, raised violent conflicts, and hampered democratization (Jega, 2011). The rising profile of ethnic militia groups like the Yandaba in the North, Area Boys in the South West and Niger Delta militants were orchestrated by the debilitating consequence of SAP (Ya'u, 2012).

Nigeria's industrial system was not spared the iron hand of oligarchy as SAP adoption and implementation generated disputes. Abah, et al., (2015) summed that it gave impetus to the preponderance of labor unrests, human rights abuses, intimidation, arrest and incarceration of labor leaders and advocacy groups that challenged its adoption through grievance weapons of demonstrations, public enlightenment rallies and strikes. The imposition reduced the capacity of states to deal with the challenges of development and welfare. The consequences created unemployment, inflation, and widespread poverty in the major cities (Nwabugo, 2011). The adoption and implementation of SAP created socio political conflicts which led to loss of state capacity to provide basic social services to the people. Egwu (2014) stated that it eroded the cultural, economic, and political glues that tied together the elements of nationhood, deepened the process of uneven development, created divides along ethnic lines, that led to tension and exclusion from governance, undermined the viability of the middle class, fanned the embers of ethnic and religious extremism.

This confused situation led to states' loss of capacity to provide basic public goods that further heightened apprehension against the Babaginda's military junta entire SAP package. Abah, et al., (2015) painted the worrisome inflation that increased astronomically from 5.4% to 40.9% in 1986 to 1989 respectively following the implementation in 1986. The high inflationary trend had enormous effects which altered Nigeria's balance of payment structure and led to devaluation of Nigeria's Naira. The state no longer had productive capacity for resource distribution. Jega (2011) argued that as manufacturing and productive activities collapsed, the capitalist class gravitated

around the state for patronage.

Redundancy in government ministries, departments, agencies, and the private sector led to loss of jobs and that caused social dislocations in many families without alternative means of livelihood (Nwabugo, 2011). Statistics showed that United Africa Company (UAC), Nigeria's biggest conglomerate compressed its 23,850 workers in 1985 to 9,000 workers in 1988 (Egwu, 2014). The economic turmoil of SAP brought the reduction in capacity utilization low to between 30 and 37% and income per capita collapsed from 778 US dollars to 108 US dollars in 1989 (Ya'u, 2012).

These scenarios led to drastic fall in standard of living, galloping inflation and under development in the country. The introduction of SAP did not transform the economy of Nigeria or stimulate growth and industrialization. Many distortions that defied solution surfaced, just as numerous socio economic problems remained intractable. Abah, et al., (2015) were emphatic that there was apparent lack of commitment to national development as public servants displayed lackadaisical attitude to work thereby entrenching negligence, corruption, ineptitude, and other vices that manifested in poor planning, lack of control, and inability to monitor the indiscriminate development.

The Master Plan was commissioned in 1975 with the Greater Port Harcourt Metropolitan Planning Authority to implement the plan covering 24km radius from the former Liberation Stadium (Boro Park), the areas that fall within the radius of the master plan automatically became Port Harcourt planning area. Though the Master Plan was not holistically implemented, some planning schemes like the eagle island estate, elekahia

housing estate, rumuibekwe housing estate, and government residential area layout II, III etc, were established by the town planning department in the period covering 1970-1980.

During the post regional decade of 1970-1980, the planning authorities were set aside and its activities subsumed into ministry of works and later ministry of lands and housing. In the decade of 1981-1992, holistic planning was not witnessed, but the development of some housing schemes like aggrey and ndoki water front estates, marine base estate ,borikiri housing estate phases I, II and III, igbo-etc site and service scheme, eneka and oyigbo were implemented.

The city is over One hundred years old, the period could be said to be the commencement of land-use planning in the city centering on predominantly four land-use types of residential, industrial, commercial and circulation. The planning schemes from the various era of colonial, regional and state have concentrated on residential as reflected in the various developments. Ministry of Urban Development (2013); and Synger (2016) captured the consequences as manifesting in problems of housing, provision of basic infrastructure such as water supply, roads, storm drainage, reliable electricity, waste disposal, and social infrastructure of schools, hospitals, and recreational centers.

As an industrial city producing and consuming, it became a risk capital. It is the capital of the second wealthiest state in Nigeria with high gross domestic product and foreign exchange earnings (Rivers State Ministry of Budget and Economic Planning, 2018); her per capita income of \$3,965 compares favorably with the National per capita income of \$2,640 (Igwe, 2018). Emeka (2015) posited that her economic prowess attracted everyone to desire a taste of the quantum petro-dollar as there is no part of the

city you won't see people struggling to survive and some smart people trying to cut corners to get a bite of the big pie. Sychyk (2016) agreed that the blistering pace of urbanization is predicated on the high proportion of youths migrating to the city to compete for the few job prospects.

Youth unemployment is a major factor of instability, because the youthful age bracket account for more than 20% of the population, 40% of the workforce as well as 60% of unemployed people. This accentuates a combustible mix of risks and posed as a formidable challenge to the city's sustainable urban development.

### **DEMOGRAPHICS IN THE CITY.**

Table 1 showing the demography of the city at different years

S/N	YEAR	POPULATION
1	1915	5,000
2	1921	7,000
3	1931	27,000
4	1944	30,200
5	1948	35,000
6	1953	73,000
7	1963	179,653
8	1967	183,000
9	1973	231,000
10	1975	250,000
11	1991	406,738
12	2006	1,382,592
13	2015	2,343,300

Source: Population Census of Eastern Nigeria (1953); Ogionwo, W.W. (1979); The City of Port Harcourt. Ibadan: Heinemann; National Population Commission (2006); and The Rivers State Statistical Agency (2015).

The city's physical size grew from 15.54 sq. km in 1914, to a metropolis covering an area of 360 sq. kilometers in the 2000s. Its spread has occurred in both a south easterly direction and a northerly direction. Growth in the south was through marshland

reclamation for squatter settlements locally called waterfronts (Aprioku, 2017). Growth occurred in a north westerly and northerly easterly direction by the entrapment of indigenous enclaves of semirural and rural communities within the built up area of the city (Wokekoro, 2014). However, the southern section is constrained by the river. The city urban fringe today stretches to Choba, Rumuokoro, ElelewnoRukpoku and Woji. Much of this growth is unplanned and unregulated (Rivers State Ministry of Urban planning and Physical development, 2017). The Rivers State Statistical Agency puts the annual growth rate of the city between 1.5% and 5%.

The dream city has transformed into a tourist destination for business and tourism. It is a multicultural city flourishing in affluent history and sites providing landmarks to keep visitors agape and give a feeling of satisfaction and homeliness. Emeka (2015) remarked that a first time visitor will not miss out the dramas and razzmatazz that unfolds with the bundle of opportunities available in the city. Night fall presents the beginning of a new day for the city dwellers as the exciting, exotic, and vibrant assortment of destinations drags night owls from their nests to have a taste of the luxurious lifestyle presented by the various business undertaking and interests available. Emeka (2015) further argued that the city is not really cheap, but not also notoriously expensive as may be perceived, because fun and fun-fare is available for all classes of people. It is therefore agreed that the city has a vibrant night-life and entertainment scene which has the propensity to escalate population.

The availability of good network of roads, transport systems of air, sea, and roads made access to the city effortless. Kio-Lawson & Dekor (2014) opined that this singular

advantage of about four hundred and eighty-three identifiable roads supported the vast business opportunities available that attracted the hardworking Ibo businessmen, the skillful Hausa traders, and the highly connected and educated Yoruba man. Okpara (2013) agreed that the astronomical increase in the city population is predicated on the massive migration from all parts of the country with everybody doing whatever they like everywhere all the time unrestrained. Sychyk (2016) supported that population surge is highly driven by consumer spending boom. Maggah& Kilcullen (2017) were in agreement that the fastest and most problematic growth occurs in small and medium cities with likelihood of urban revolution and population explosion in Africa, as Antananarivo in Madagascar grows at 5.1%, Ouagadougou in Burkina Faso at 7.2%, Abuja and Port Harcourt in Nigeria growing at 6.2% and 5.1% respectively against global urban population growth rate of 1.84%. It is imperative to state that speed and unregulated urban growth rate has critically impacted the sustainability of the city.

To ensure even development of the town, a Master Plan was produced in 1975, with the main objective of providing a framework that will streamline physical planning, road network, housing development, water supply system, electricity, drainages, and public institution etc (Ministry of Urban Development, 2013; Synger, 2016). Kio-Lawson & Dekor (2013) stated that the success of physical planning depends on the personnel to implement the plan, government policies on health, productivity and welfare of the people. There was vast development planning that gained momentum leading to expansion and diversification of industrial and commercial activities creating a place filled with promises, unimagined, and immeasurable consequences. Emenike& Sampson

(2017) agreed that as the young city was witnessing population explosion, its economy was also growing. During the century, human activities impacted on the landscape, and changed the earth's nutrients resulting to climate change. These changes resulted to urban sprawl, loss of vegetation, and open space as well decline in societal value in metropolitan city(Wokekoro&Owei, 2014). It is obvious that residents enjoyed a city of enormous opportunities while the expanding city brought nightmares characterized with indiscriminate development.

The beauty of a spatial city as encapsulated by modern architecture, beautiful town planning of industrial, commercial, and residential layouts with green trees, and well laid setbacks, lawns, parks, and assortments of infrastructures put smiles on friendly people as welcoming visitors was the story of the city (Ministry of urban Development, 2013; and Synger, 2016). Kio-Lawson & Dekor (2014) emphasized that the layout planning and rich greenery earned her the garden city title. This young city gave out its opportunities in trade and commerce, and also opened her heaven of tourist attractions, only to become a nightmare. Kio-Lawson (2013) posited that housing famine is the first casualty for the city as accommodation issue confronted first-time visitor to the city. Wokekoro & Owei (2014) affirmed that housing crisis is characteristics of urban centers in developing nations due to inadequate supply in comparison to demand. Emenike & Sampson (2017) agreed that overcrowding, absence of internal facilities, amenities, and poor-quality housing contributed to demeaning the quality of the city. It followed that inability to pay the rent in planned areas accentuated the survival strategy of settling in any make shift accommodation, attribute of indiscriminate development.



Traffic congestion presented its ugly head to the residents as they have to live with daily rowdiness and frustration. Emeka (2015) summed that impatience has become the watchword for people on the road in the city. Kio-Lawson (2014) lamented that despite the huge amount committed to road construction and expansion, traffic jam is still rampant and has become a nightmare in the city. It is implied as the major roads have failed due to poor drainages, deep potholes, and inadequate setbacks and can therefore not accommodate the huge population.

Non-availability of power supply has become the order of the city. Rationing of power supply in the city has killed businesses as every commercial activity depends on power to function, and in this situation where the national power is not available, businesses has to source for personal power through generators to function (Okpara, 2013). People therefore resort to all manners of activities to generate power that contributed to the indiscriminate developments.

With the oil boom, the vast majority of the people lack information on environmental issues associated with the industry. The city like others faced formidable environmental issues that generated conflicts and tension (Adekola, Fischbacher-Smith, Fischbacher-Smith & Adekola, 2016). Sub Sahara Africa has acute scenario of power outage (Vasquez, 2013). This resulted in many trying to manage complex health issues which they lack capacity to contend with, just as the absence of an effective mechanism for health care management opened windows of causalities and death. The medical personnel of doctors and nurses in the government hospitals had gone on strikes than any other union in the city (Adekola, et al, 2013). Wilson, Frickel & Nguyen (2015)

acknowledged that these are significant risks challenging public health. Residents are subjected to frustration as private hospitals hike and collect indiscriminate high fees. The larger populations which cannot afford the high fees seek to cut corners and thereby contribute to the indiscriminate urban development in the city.

Water supply is a basic service that supplies from public tap have been struck out from the list of government's provisions. The supply of water in the city has completely been taken over by private water vendors as public taps are no longer visible in the streets (Onukwugha, 2017). The taps that gave water to the common man before now has totally gone dry, while in the few places where public water is available, an over populated residents scramble to get (Emeka, 2015). The lack of water supply contributes to slum formation.

The city was a unique city that shares great similarity with Lagos in Nigeria. Okpara (2013) agreed that they are the only towns with seaports and railway connection. This uniqueness lost flavor as the seaport and the railway terminus that were the elements around the building of the city lost the relative importance as the facilities no longer function. The city that was transformed to garden city is now called a garden city without gardens (Emeka, 2015). Onukwugha (2017) was emphatic that before the creation of the Federal Capital Territory, the city was the only Nigerian city noted for gardens and recreational parks, which earned her the garden city sobriquet, but today, the gardens and parks have all disappeared, leaving the once garden city with no gardens. Ihueze, Nwosu & Okorundu (2014) attested that haphazard, indiscriminate development, deteriorating environment, destruction of arable agricultural land, wetlands as well as aquatic life, and

wildlife are the direct results from population explosion and rapid economic development.

Sychyk (2016) asserted that Africa's turbocharged urbanization is propelled by organic population growth. It is almost a consensus that urbanization is a shift in population from the rural areas to the urban center. Mesh (2014) posited that it is a process wherein a gradual increase occurs in the proportion of the population in the urban centers (2014). Demographic partitions (2014) perceived urbanization as the increase in number of people which predominantly brings about physical growth of an area. Haase, Rink, Grossmann, Bernt & Mykhnenko (2014) posited that the menace is a universal issue and the route of transformation which cities across the world pass through to greatness.

What really constituted indiscriminate urban development is contentious. Haase et al., (2014) argued that the occurrence is universal with obvious determinants that do not follow a particular pattern as deteriorating locations in Detroit, USA, Halle in Germany, and Donetsk in Ukraine have the same characteristics, but with different causes of dwindling population, poor use of infrastructure, and disregard to planning policy. Wu (2015) called it dilapidated neighborhoods that the state must redevelop. Storpet & Scott (2016) conceived it as area with concentrated poverty, ethnic conflict, slum, social isolation, ecological challenges, homelessness, gentrification, violence, crime, unequal access to housing.

From the foregoing, it is not in doubt that indiscriminate development has enveloped the city. However from the analysis so far, it is clear that the urban setting

have participants who operate in it. These operators determine the activities that take place in the urban setting (Stone, 2014). This research will therefore determine the stakeholders and their role in the indiscriminate urban development of this city in Niger Delta Region of Nigeria.

### **Theoretical Framework**

Urban regime theory is about the study of urban governance (Stone, 1989) will be used to unravel the mystery surrounding indiscriminate urban development and provide the medium through which sustainable urban development can be construed. The theory is a famous paradigm that deals with urban politics and governance. Beal & Pinson (2015) asserted that the primary focus of the theory is the configuration of the power structure and the interaction between the coalition actors consisting of government, business and civic groups. It leads statehood transform into a network (Shin, Park & Sonn, 2015). Simone (2016) posited that the theory controls the errant forces that shape urban life. Rich & Tsitos (2017) argued that through the mechanism of regime theory, neoliberal governments have abdicated their responsibility of urban management to the coalition actors. The theory bears on the study and is considered very important in determining the various aspects of urban regeneration, just as cognizance is taken of criticisms advanced against the theory, hence caution will be taken in the application at the data analysis stage.

The Urban Regime Theory (URT) shows much dependence on the private sector activities by holding greater relevance towards the process of urban regeneration. A 1953 work by Dahl & Lindblom cited by Stone (2014) portrayed regime theory as an

examination of the relationship between business and government. The regime theory is used to analyze the relationship among actors that influences decision making of the urban setting. It is a complex interaction of politics, business, and civil society in the management of an urban area. This informal arrangement presented needed platforms that accentuate an understanding among the stakeholders.

Urban regime theory has four different variants of corporate /development regime theory, progressive regime theory, caretaker regime theory and intergovernmental regime theory (Stone, 2014). These theories are the combination and incorporation of all contextual factors in a given situation. They do not focus much attention on members of the stakeholders or the organizations, but rather interested on the impact of situational variables on their relationship (Gica, 2017).

The corporate / development regime theory promoted growth as well as reflecting the interest of major corporations in a city, while the interests of the poor and distressed areas of the city are not taken into consideration (Stone, 2014). The corporations are organizations and persons established by law to act. Progressive regime theory has more interest in the welfare and interests of the lower and middle class members of the city, as well as the environmental groups that are opposed to capitalist economic growth.

However, the caretaker regime theory does not support large scale development because they are afraid of tax increment and distortion in normal ways (Stone, 2014). Intergovernmental regime theory is found in areas and cities where needs are mismanaged, has financial issues and elected leaders in the areas are the actors in this regime theory.

Using the various urban regime theories to view our subject revealed that the city's development is propelled by the governing arrangement of the various stakeholders working towards actualizing their individual interests. The corporate / development regime theory is more peculiar to the city urban crisis. The city witnessed sporadic growth and development occasioned by many reasons especially the discovery of oil in Oliobiri and shipment of same through the seaport. This served as anchor in the indiscriminate urban development of Port Harcourt. The activities of the oil companies as precursor provided education, employment, services, and capital investments (Rich & Tsitsos, 2017). Patterson & Silverman (2014b) contended that the oil industry contribution to changes in cities is enormous. Though oftentimes, public institutions and oil companies have tried to uphold moral obligations by serving the communities through the provision of infrastructures with governments exhibiting weakness. Patterson & Silverman (2014b) further posited that this weakness is because neoliberal policies are used to govern developments, hence oil companies gain prominence. Gomez (2013) believed that these oil companies have in some cases been quite successful at ensuring socioeconomic and educational development some have irrevocably destroyed their reputations through their development strategies which are perceived as forced by other stakeholders.

This informal arrangement according to Stone seminal work on urban regime brought public sector, well capitalized profit, a web of other groups of developers, and community groups together to govern the urban landscape. Adams (2014) argued that these anchor institutions which he called Third sector organizations have over bearing

influence on the development of urban centers. These organizations pick up the slacks where governments fail. Silverman (2014) contended that they have little accountability to the public, lack transparency and democratic-making process but act for their own institutional selfish interests.

The activities of the oil companies brought competition in all aspects of the city which induced the crises of indiscriminate urban development. The corporate / development regime theory promotes growth as it reflects the interest of major corporations in a city, while the interests of the poor and distressed areas of the city are not taken into consideration. This relationship, it is argued allows business vantage and privilege position because of the enormous resources at its disposal. Warwick (2013) succinctly put it thus; because of the privileged position of business, her role in the environmental relationship is not that of an interest group, but a privilege position. Regime theorists have used this as starting point. Tsavadaridou& Metaxas (2015) posited that cities and enterprises as living and growing entities affect each other as well as the people living and working in them and their coexistence are controversial, either beneficial or problematic. Martin (2014) alluded that the relationship between enterprises and government are dynamic, either conflicting or harmonically, as enterprises rely on government for clean environment, educated and skilled manpower, infrastructural facilities, fair and equitable tax system, security and safety, whereas government seek the enterprises' support of participation in social events, offer of economic development through payment of taxes, provision of job opportunities, sustained environmental friendliness or complementing environmental protection. Dahl as cited by Tsavadaridou

& Metaxas (2015) argued that business activities bring atmosphere of controversy and contentions with different values of equity, fairness, equality among all citizens, and democracy.

First usage of the word regime in urban studies was to describe the cycle of powerful officials and top administrators following the advent of regime theory into urban politics. The regime theory is the aggregation of the power structure in the urban governing coalition with preconditions that lay in the free-market economy of fragmented powers and dispersed resources in the contemporary cities where local governments and private actors collaborate and depended on each other to govern (Stone, 2014). Stone cited by Camou (2014) argued that government is by itself an inadequate problem solver. May & Jochim (2013) posited that public policy impacts, and depends on complementary actions from non-governmental sources. Cucchiara (2013); and Eduardo (2013) asserted that the division of labor between state and market stems from the corresponding arrangement of the state political economy. Since urban regime theory is derived on social production, collaboration became inevitable in order that the fragmented powers and resources are aligned together to accomplish tasks and actualize urban regime.

For the core concept of the theory, Stone as cited by Stone (2014) posited that regime was an informal group which is stable with relative access to institutional resources that ensures a role in decision making for governance. Based on Stone's position, regime as a concept is likened to be informal, as the collaboration accentuated through networks of informal actors from the various institutional stakeholders. Jones-Correa & Wong (2015) clarified that this collaboration was not taken as needed, but as



given. It follows therefore that regime don't just exist in all cities. On issue of stability, it spans across many administrative periods. Ministry of Urban Development (2013) was in complete agreement as it asserts that the city is over one hundred years old with urban regime centering on predominantly four land-use types of residential, industrial, commercial and circulation spanning from the various era of colonial, regional and state. And this stability is ultimately reinforced by the regime's ability to successfully implement policy reform that integrates newcomers into the governing coalition, its partners and the wider community (Gica, 2017; Evans & Raven, 2016; and Eduardo, 2013). Ravazzi&Belligni (2016) postulated that the governing coalitions have the capacity to change urban policy mix in order to bring about changes in the economic and social strata of the city.

Though, Stone did not lay emphasis on it. Members of a regime are not equal as their role depends on the access they possess to institutional resources that help actualize governing objectives, which therefore gives them position in the coalitions. Kilburn (2014) argued that different urban issues evolved different regimes through which they exert varying degrees of influences based on the resources at their disposal which they contribute to the coalition. Stone as cited by Albino, Umberto-Berardi &Dangelico (2015) opined that the regime is not just as is the case with democratic politics, but stakeholders interested in exerting meaningful influence have an obligatory test of possessing political, economic, and social resources. Cohen-Vogel & McClendon (2017) assured of the position of members against questioning of the stories, images, and authority upon which regimes are established, as this might make politicians and non-

governmental leaders to gradually propel a loss of public confidence over them. It is therefore imperative to agree that capital resources and business sectors were determinant of actors' role in urban governance, as disadvantaged social groups that lack resources have more often failed to influence urban politics effectively. Added is that business sectors' interest in urban governance and developments are well structured and stronger than some social groups that resist urban development.

The urban regime theory (URT) therefore provided a theoretical framework that linked the many aspects of urban governance. Tsavdaridou & Metaxas (2015) opined that it engenders cross sectoral and intergovernmental coalition-building for urban development and lends its importance into the wider local politics. This is because the theory possesses capacity to contribute to the formulation of development strategies through the inquest into public-private partnership. It is a middle range theory which accommodates the privileged position of business, interested in the going of effective democratic politics. Fang & Pal (2016) posited that through the institutional setting, the partners align their interests towards land, development and growth. Fortner (2015) argued that economic and democratic forces shape urban administration by influencing officials through the activities of the partners whose capacities, position in the macro political and economic systems are reckoned with. This helps to hold businesses and groups to contribute towards effective shaping of government's agenda and actions.

Leaders and administrators are under pressure to accommodate interests of powerful actors like the business group, who holds the productive assets as state leaders' lacks the capacity to market decisions. Businesses optimal performance of social

responsibilities is the result of inducements and cooperation between them and not commands by the state. Regime theory deploys interdependence relationship of governmental and non-governmental forces to mitigate the economic and social challenges through focusing attention on cooperation and co-ordination of the coalition actors (Harding, 2000a; Stoker, ) as cited by Tsavdaridou & Metaxas (2015). Gica (2017) argued that regime is shaped by political, economic, and cultural contexts of a given society.

Regime advocates theorized that urban governance is characterized with decentralization and delegation of responsibilities by the state, financial impediments, and ever developing private sector through profit and non-profit organizations (Stoker) cited in Rich & Tsitsos, (2017). The governments as agents and catalyst for development work through the other partners to advance policies and programs in the economic development, human capital, security and crime prevention, as well as environmental protection issues.

It is, therefore, implicit that since business possesses enormous resources, it is invoked by government to participate in problems solving. Stone (2014) posited that to ensure viability of governing coalition, resources commensurate with policy agenda are mobilized. Harding as cited by Tsavadarisdou & Metaxas (2015) added that governing coalitions ensures that those with resources of finance, land, building, personnel, and political network, regulatory and other resources that they can deliver are targets of coalitions. Rosol, Beal & Mossner (2017) acknowledged the incorporation of enterprises into environmental issues of mainstream urban strategies. The coalition have effective

network approach which is a product of the cooperative efforts of different partners and their contending interests with strong relationship hinged on loyalty, solidarity, trust, and support for one another.

The task before this study is an understanding of how the coalition actors cause indiscriminate urban development of this city in Niger Delta area of Nigeria. Stone argued that some of the partners had independent existence through which they influence the governing coalition (2014). This is because when a particular policy is achieved, the coalition group dissolves when the objective of the governing coalition is integrated to other objectives that will ensure continuity. This can be likened to the root cause of the urban crisis.

Using the narrative of regime politics in analyzing the development of the city's oil induced governing coalition would present a governing arrangement. Stone (2014) description of Atlanta as biracial coalition with crisis in its history shares much similarity with our subject. Major events that led to the city's present state included it being the largest town and capital of a state, the political and administrative center of South-South zone also known as Niger Delta region of Nigeria and one the largest town in Nigeria. More importantly, the discovery of crude oil in commercial quantities in 1956 that precipitated the shipment of Nigerian crude oil from Port Harcourt contributed extensively to her development, modernization, urbanization, economic progression, growth and indiscriminate urban development.

Another is the land use planning of the city for which residential got highest concentration by successive administrations, leading to manifest problems in housing,

water supply, roads, drainages, power supply, waste management, education, health, and recreational activities. These are the catalysts to what we have in the city today.

It is very imperative to state that despite the crisis, the governing coalitions adapted each other without fundamental differences. Stone (2014) asserted that regime analysis inner core illuminated Atlanta's story of governing coalition. In our study area, regime theory is portrayed through the various planning schemes undertaken by successive regimes in the city. The town was established due to the need for a route to transport the mineral resources in the hinterland to Europe and other developed climes. The literature on the creation of the city are anonymous as to why Luggard chose the location (Okpara, 2013; Kio-Lawson & Dekor, 2014; Wokekoro & Owei, 2014; Onukwuugha, 2017; and Igwe, 2017). This is largely to satisfy the business interests of the colonial government and the Royal Niger Company. Also the use of the town as musters point for military operations by the allied nations during the first and second World wars drives home the tenets of the regime theory.

In course of its over one hundred years existence, the city has metamorphosed into the commercial nerve center of the South Eastern, the political and administrative center of Nigerian Niger Delta zone as well as the petroleum hub of Africa. These positions brought people from the rural areas, other states and foreign countries leading to parallel economic and urbanization growth that reshaped the civic life of the city to building of bridges of civic interaction, and entrepreneurship that brought a sporadic rise to the influx of people to the mega city. Stone (2014) painted the picture clearly when he concluded that the congruent interests hold the city's governing coalition together,

reinforced by selective incentives as facilitated by policy change. This is accentuated by the change from a small wharf town to an industrial and petroleum hub. The above theoretical background will be used to determine the causes of indiscriminate urban development of the City.

The benefit of using urban regime theory to undertake this study has helped to determine a perspective on urban governance. Blanco (2013) posited that the network governance analyzed the extent of innovation to traditional patterns. This is because it showed the propensity at which adopting institutional cooperation and engagement amongst the actors yielded desired objectives as well as tested how networked arrangements represent various interests based on trust.

Blanco (2013) also argued that regime theory analysis served as source of inspiration in the course of comparing network governance coalitions. Drawing from the Raval and Trinitat Nova comparism, it was revealed that variety of urban policy practices are developed within the paradigm of networking. It is also critical to note that the beliefs, ideas, and values of the actors contributed to the determination of network arrangement, policy choices, and outcomes. Blanco (2013) opined that the importance of local context and agency is necessary in the understanding of network coalitions.

#### **The role of governing coalition actors/stakeholders.**

Public administration practitioners reckoned that to the call for devotion of interest in the implementation of legislative statutes and court decisions requires devotion to administrative decisions (Sabatier & Mazmanian, 1980). Experts have carried out impressive works on the implementation of programs on sustainable strategy in

constrained economic times (Barnett, Darnell & Husted, 2015), urban development (Jerneck & Olsson, 2011), environmental issues (Amato, Zillante, & Amato, 2015), and health care services (Amerson, 2011). It is therefore imperative to investigate how policy implementation process assisted in bringing about the understanding of how an integration of the findings and insights into a framework support research work on policy issues. A comprehensive framework will be able to identify variables through which statutory characteristics, socioeconomic conditions, public opinion, and other factors have influenced the implementation process.

The literature on theoretical framework has provided evidence for both implementation theory and planning enforcement theory. De Gruyter (2016) stated that theoretical undertaking identifies opportunities that enhance effective implementation of new developments. The development in institutional theory has created an understanding of how managerial efforts accentuated implementation of public sector reforms. Stakeholders' engagement has served as the corner stone through which managerial initiative and institutionalized reforms are carried out.

The role of policy in setting priorities and actions are vital for the use and management of natural resources. Kalaba (2016) argued for examination of policy implementation through advocacy coalition and institutionalized frameworks. Kenbeek, Bone, & Bone (2016) agreed that theoretical framework explores the network system to aid policy implementation for resources management. The advocacy approach demonstrated that the influence of environmental constraint from stakeholders'

interaction on policy. Findings revealed that networking among stakeholders provided alternative approach in policy science that generates new assumptions for management.

The framework of determining sustainable development got a boost from the World Bank/Japanese International Corporation Agency. The collaboration emphasized that sustainable urban development must have a balance between urban environment and socioeconomic activities through an integrative strategic management framework of policies, institutions, laws, regulations, administration, public/private partnership, technologies, people's awareness, global environmental sustainability, and economic linkages, coordination among stakeholders of people, citizen, communities, governmental authorities, community based organization, and nongovernmental organizations depending on the necessary management tools (2015).

An effective urban management will be the result of enhanced planning practices. Alnsour (2015) assessment of coalition showed disconnects amongst the stakeholders, weak regulations, loose institutional arrangement, poor human resources productivity, and ineffective management that affected sustainable urban development.

Achieving the research goal of this work necessitated in depth exploration of elements that accentuate sustainable development. The benefits of urban regime theory framework ensures that as an environment based model integrates the stages of the policy cycle, incorporating aspects of the top down and bottom up approaches to implementation studies, scientific, and technical information. Its core values are the formation of coalitions and coordination to assist in the determination of the relevance of critical stakeholders in the sample population.



The regime theory demonstrated that the influence of behavior of rational and strategic actors on rules. The approach illustrated how policy actors maximize their ability (Sabatier & Weible, 2014). The approach views stakeholders as actors constrained by the institutional environment that influenced their behavior. The use of the analytical tools borrowed from the neoclassical economics offers an explanation of how the process created institutions like the Ministry of Urban Development and Physical Planning, whose responsibility entails controlling, regulating, and enforcing planning and development.

Urban regime theory entailed that stakeholders or coalition actors' behavior in the urban setting is the outcome of their engagement and collaboration. Crow, Albright, & Koebele (2015) argued that the regime theory is most developed and widely used in the United States as it provides the institutional environment, information, and enforcement mechanism that reduce uncertainty for the stakeholders about the behavior of each other. It follows that urban planning operations clearly entail collective approach need. Rădulescu, Stefan, Rădulescu, Rădulescu, & Rădulescu (2016) contended that these operations requires the organization of multiform partnerships of adhesion, mobilization of a large number of actors which includes initiators, supporters, entertainers, local communities, the state, professional, as well as economic, cultural, and social environment. The results of the interaction are exciting sustainable development, social cohesion, pollution control, greater coherence of the city, dynamic neighborhoods, and trade improving services (Gani, 2015); protection of natural, social, cultural, and built heritage (Alnsour (2016); diversification of activities, improving recreation, education,

and entertainment facilities (Emenike & Sampson, 2017); increasing the city's attractiveness and improving image of the city (Tsavdaridou & Metaxas, 2015): job opportunities development, informing, reorientation and training of citizens, creating, and structuring partnerships for sustainable development (Stone, 2014 ).

The broader trends in development school of thought have greatly shaped the urban sector management thinking. Wekwete (2015) contend that this has de-emphasized state intervention and kept faith on market forces allowing a synergy in the roles of both the state and private sectors. This is the foundation of the emerging public private model of new public service management that has given a reduced role for the state. Stone (2014) opined that the public private model doctrine entails that state provides an environment conducive to maximum participation by all the actors with agenda shifted more to social issues against the traditional physical planning. The underlying desire is more human oriented, focus on the living standards of urban households, more attention to the informal sector in order to reduce poverty, allow more access to justice, and answer broader governance questions (Wike, 2015).

The number of actors or stakeholders in urban management based on the urban regime theory principles have increased significantly. The rising number contributed immensely to the abandonment of master plans for more flexible and incremental planning as attention was shifted from predominant state planning to plan by governing coalition actors (Wekwete, 2015). In our subject of a city in the Niger Delta Region of Nigeria, the focus on blueprint land use planning and public sector investment planning is no longer fashionable, rather the state plays the role of enabler as emphasis is more on

coordination planning.

Stakeholders' importance in urban development cannot be over emphasized. This is because population growth in the urban landscape must occur on land which is under constant pressure for the use of basic infrastructure (IFC:2007). The challenges on use of land in the urban sector varies from city to city. Faced with the difficult situation of poor resources for an adequate urban management, the city became characterized with an out of control urbanization process (Rivers State Ministry of Urban Development & Physical Planning, 2013). The population expansion and inadequate housing forced the majority of urban residents and rural migrants into informal land and housing developments. These unfavorable conditions led to massive socioeconomic and indiscriminate development of uncontrolled urban sprawl, deterioration of open spaces, and transport problems of inaccessibility, traffic congestion, and air pollution (Emenike & Sampson, 2017). The stakeholders as key indicators in land use management in the urban development become subjects of discourse. Their roles and activities will be used to determine the city's indiscriminate development.

The urban regime theory entailed that stakeholder as key players of development in the urban setting have interest in city development. Stone (2014) acknowledged these interests because of the advantages they possess in the relationship. In evaluating the role of stakeholder in the urban sector, David & Steve (2012) opined that public authorities should seek to shape, regulate, and stimulate real estate development so that developers, land owners, and funders see real benefits in creating better places. Bolarinde (2018) argued that government's investment in real estate development is the driving force for

economic development.

Stakeholders in the urban sector of the city include ministries, department and agencies of Rivers State Government, estate developers and estate managers, community members, artisans, international oil companies, non-governmental organizations (NGO's), transporters, and religious organization.

**Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDA's) of Government.**

The relevant ministries department and agencies (MDA's) in urban development sector of Rivers State are those of the professional ministries, departments and agencies in the built environment. The following are identified as the key stakeholders in infrastructural development in the urban sector:

- 1) Ministry of Urban Development and Physical Planning
- 2) Greater Port Harcourt City Development Authority
- 3) Ministry of Works
- 4) Ministry of Lands
- 5) Ministry of Transport
- 6) Ministry of Power
- 7) Rivers State Urban Beautification, Parks and Garden
- 8) Rivers State Waste Management Agency
- 9) Ministry of Housing
- 10) Ministry of Environment
- 11) Office of the Surveyor General
- 12) Rivers State Boundary Commission

- 13) Rivers State Water Services Regulation Commission
- 14) Ignatius Ajuru University
- 15) Rivers State Investment Agency
- 16) Rivers State University
- 17) Port Harcourt City Local Government
- 18) Obio/Akpor Local Government

They are positioned to implement development programs in the urban sector.

They are therefore committed to:

Providing basic services for all citizens. These services include access to housing, safe drinking water and sanitation, nutritious food, healthcare and family planning, education, culture and access to communication technologies.

Ensuring that the citizenry have access to equal opportunities and face no discrimination. Everyone has the right to benefit from what their cities offer. The urban agenda takes into account the needs of women, youth and children, people with disabilities, marginalized groups, older persons, indigenous people, and other groups.

Promoting measures that support cleaner city. The government tackles issues of air pollution in our cities which is good both for people's health and for the planet. It portends therefore that the state will continue her unswerving effort to increase the use of renewable energy, provide better and greener environment, public transport, and sustainable management of the natural resources.

Strengthen resilience in our cities to reduce the risk and the impact of disasters.

Many cities have felt the impact of natural disasters and the government is more than

ever expected to implement, mitigate, and adapt measures to minimize these impacts. The measures include better urban planning, quality infrastructure, and improving local responses.

Take action to address climate change by reducing greenhouse gas emissions. The Government has committed to involve not just the local governments but all actors of society to take climate change action through the Paris Agreement on climate change.

Take action to enforce, respect the rights of refugees, migrants, and internally displaced persons regardless of their migration status. The government acknowledges the challenges posed by migration as well as the contributions made to urban life. Therefore measures are been established to mitigate the hardship encountered by migrants, refugees, and internally displaced persons and help them make contribution in the socioeconomic development of our urban landscape.

Improve connectivity, support innovative and green initiatives. This requires government to ensure the establishment of partnerships with businesses and civil society to evolve sustainable solutions to urban challenges.

Promote safe, accessible, and green public spaces. Facilitating human interaction through urban planning. This is accentuated through the provision of increasing public spaces such as sidewalks, cycling lanes, gardens, squares and parks. Sustainable urban design plays key role in ensuring the livability and prosperity of a city.

Many departments, commissions, authorities, and panels have roles in planning. The states and territories each have different bases for how referrals to specialist government agencies, departments (such as environment, infrastructure, and heritage

protection) and panels are triggered in the planning process. Some have direct responsibilities for implementation and enforcement under planning legislation, while others have an important influence on outcomes. Government land organizations (GLOs) are not regulators but can have an important impact on land availability. Changes in regulations have originated from intense lobbying processes and corruption of bureaucrats. Eduardo (2013) posited that individual builders and developers have ensured that laws are interpreted in their favor, as well as change of specific points in the regulations, also prevalent among the ministries, departments, and agencies in the governance of building regulations is the incidence of non-application or plain disobedience to rules which is enabled by the discretionary use of power by the bureaucrat. Spearman (2015) stated that the inability of government to demolish Sodom and Gomorrah results from the lack of political will. Due to fear of losing political support, successive governments refrain from tearing it down.

### **Community members**

Community is a social unit of people with a common religion, norms, values, or and identity. Rubenstein (1992) posited that human settlements/communities or villages are areas containing houses and related forms of buildings associated with an economic base, other social, and cultural amenities. The earliest form of villages or communities was formed through spatial conjugation in agriculture (Bates & Plog, 1990). Whiteford & Friedl (1992) opined that villages began to appear about 12,000 years ago when people began planting, harvesting crops, and domesticating animals within their spatial domain. Members of community share a sense of place that is situated in a given geographical

area (e.g., country, village, town, or neighborhood) along transportation routes. Durable relations that extend beyond immediate genealogical ties presented a sense of community. People take these social ties as important to their identity, practice, and rules in social institutions like family, home, work, government, society or humanity at large. By the definition, urban centers are also communities in their own ancient boundaries caught up by urbanization process or city growth.

In the city, communities play significant role in the urban sector, and are headed by community development committees (CDC) that direct their affairs.

Table 2 showing the communities in the city and their population strength.

<b>S/N</b>	<b>COMUNITIES</b>	<b>PROJECTED POPULATION (2017)</b>	<b>POPULATION CLASS</b>
1	Nkpolu-Oroworukwo	139,020	120,000 - 149,999
2	Mgbudunkwu	136,746	120,000 - 159,999
3	Oromerezimgbu	17,300	10,000 - 29,999
4	Orominieke	56,485	30,000 - 59,999
5	Orogbum	29,045	20,000 - 39,999
6	Elekahia	40,447	30,000 - 59,999
7	Oroabali	39,672	30,000 - 59,999
8	Orije Old GRA	14,485	10,000 - 29,999
9	Old Township	3,268	Less than 9,999
10	Bundu	42,954	30,000 - 59,999
11	Nkpogu	53,909	30,000 - 59,999
12	Amadi-Ama	18,586	10,000 - 29,999
13	Ukukalama	1,826	Less than 9,999
14	Somian-Ama	3,411	Less than 9,999
15	Fimie-Ama	3,302	Less than 9,999
16	Ozuboko	11,848	10,000 - 29,999
			90,000 - 119,999



17	Borikiri	103,616	10,000 - 29,999
18	Abuloma	27,623	10,000 - 29,999
20	Okuru-Ama	14,805	10,000 - 29,999
21	Azuabie-Ama	21,474	10,000 – 39,999
22	Eliozu	38,876	10,000 – 29,999
23	Rumukpoku	28,765	10,000 – 49,999
24	Rumuola	49,657	10,000 – 29,999
25	Elelenwo	20,875	10,000 – 29,999
26	Elieparonwo	29,678	10,000 – 29,999
27	Rumueme	27,987	10,000 – 49,999
28	Mgbuoshimini	49,596	10,000 – 49,999
29	Woji	48,768	10,000 – 39,999
30	Rukpoku	38,986	10,000 – 29,999
31	Rumuodomanya	21,365	10,000 – 39,999
32	Rumuepirikom	38,857	120,000 – 140,999
34	Rumuwoji	132,876	20,000 - 49,999
35	Rumubiakani	43,876	20,000 – 59,999
36	Rumuosi	58,789	10,000 – 49,999
37	Rumuibekwe	48,445	20,000 – 59,999
38	Rumuokwuta	52,789	20,000 – 59,999
39	Rumukwurushi	51,674	10,000 – 49,999
40	Rumuokoro	47,953	

Source : The Rivers State Statistical Agency (2015).

The communities as agents of development contributed to their development through the followings:

Environmental Sanitation -The activities covered here include de silting of drainages, refuse disposal, etc.

Sensitization - In areas of citizens sensitization, the CDC's play major role to give information on sensitive government policies. This may include immunization drives against polio, measles, hepatitis B, meningitis, and awareness on other facets of the lives of the populace.

Pressure Groups - CDC's act as pressure groups to attract development to their locality.

These include access roads, electrification projects, etc. The community has a key role in the planning and development of cities, towns, and rights under planning legislation.

When a new planning scheme is proposed by the MDA's, there is opportunity for community comment. The community also has the right to make submissions about some development applications and have appeal rights against some planning decisions. Some property owners want maximum flexibility in doing what they want with their land, and minimum flexibility for their neighbors. This often led to conflicts about development proposals.

The issues of poor planning control are evidenced in the communities as elected officers in the community development committees lack professional expertise of the built environment. They therefore cannot contribute meaningfully on issues of building developments control within their jurisdictions (Aprioku, 2017). This puts blight on the overall vista on the urban centers. Gani (2015) acknowledged that street trading plays a great role in the distribution of goods and services of many cities and town of the world. Streets traders are those people who offer goods and services for sale on primary streets or pavement. Street trading is a form of squatting involving perpetual displaying of goods along roadsides which occurs within established market places or outside, and the intersection of major roads. It is the act of engaging in commercial activities in illegal structures or open spaces within and outside the building line. This activity of street trading is perpetuated by the community members in most cases as they collect tolls from the vulnerable petty traders who cannot afford the payment of shops.

Accordingly, a building line is a line set parallel to the center line of a road within which no building or structure, permanent or temporally is permitted to be erected by the local planning authorities (Aprioku, 2017). Informal economic activity being an umbrella of

street trading activities has been a subject of controversy have taken over all empty spaces in our streets and roads as their primary locations for street trading. The informal sector is one of the highest offenders in the indiscriminate development of the city. They flout urban regulations, with impunity; embark on corrupting the system at the slightest opportunity.

### **Non-Governmental Organizations**

Non-Governmental Organizations are captured in Article 71 of the United Nations Charter (1945). They are generally referred to as non-profit entities independent of governmental influence, though receive government funding and support periodically. This civil society groups mobilizes the private sector for development initiatives, programs, raise awareness, and influence policies in pursuance of the ideals of egalitarian society and good governance (Bryson, 2012). They undertake diverse humanitarian projects to better the lots of the grass-roots.

According to World Bank, the diversity of NGOs strains any simple definition. They include many groups and institutions that are entirely or largely independent of government, but are humanitarian or cooperative rather than commercial objectives (Bryson, 2012). They are private agencies in industrial countries that support international development, indigenous groups organized regionally or nationally, and member groups in villages (Ackermann & Eden, 2011). NGOs as charitable groups mobilize private funds for development, distribute food, family planning services, and promote community organization. They also include independent cooperatives,

community associations, water-user societies, women's groups, and pastoral associations. Citizen groups that raise awareness and influence policy are also NGOs.

The roles and activities of NGOs are not limited to environment, social, advocacy, and human rights work. They work to promote social or political change on a broad scale or very locally. NGOs play critical role in developing society, improving communities, and promoting citizen participation. This study adopts the following important roles of the NGO's in the urban sector.

Development and Operation of Infrastructure: Community based organizations, and cooperatives can acquire, subdivide, develop, construct housing, provide infrastructure, operate, maintain infrastructure such as wells, public toilets, and solid waste collection services. They improve on road furniture like road signs, bus stops, traffic light, and road makings (zebra crossing). NGOs also engage in the development of building material supply centers and other community based economic enterprises. In many cases, they need technical assistance and advice from governmental agencies or higher level NGOs.

Supporting innovation, demonstration and pilot projects: NGO have the advantage of selecting particular places for innovative projects and specify in advance the length of time which they will be supporting the project overcoming some of the shortcomings that governments face in this respect. NGOs can also be pilots for larger projects by virtue of their ability to act more quickly than the government bureaucracy.

Facilitating communication: NGOs use interpersonal methods of communication, study the right entry points through that gain the trust of the community they seek to

benefit. They also have a good idea of the feasibility of the projects they want to take up. NGOs have the advantage with communicating with the policy making levels of government. They have information about the lives, capabilities, attitudes, and cultural characteristics of people at the local level.

They facilitate communication upward from people to the government and downward from the government to the people. Upward communication involves informing government about what local people are thinking, doing, and feeling while downward communication informs the people about what the government is planning and doing. NGOs use its unique position to share information horizontally, networking between other organizations engaged in similar work.

Technical Assistance and Training: Training institutions and NGOs partner to develop a technical assistance and training capacity programs to assist both the community members and governments.

Research, Monitoring and Evaluation: Innovative activities are carefully documented and shared for effective participation, and monitoring that would permit the sharing of results with the people themselves as well as with the project staff.

Advocacy: In many instances, NGOs have acted as spokespersons or ombudsmen for the poor and vulnerable in order to influence government policies and programs. This may be done through a variety of means ranging from demonstration and pilot projects to participation in public forums as well as the formulation and input into government policy and plans, help in publicizing results from research and case studies on issues

affecting the less privilege. NGOs play roles from advocates for the poor to implementers of government programs, from agitators and critics to partners and advisors, and from sponsors of pilot projects to mediators.

In exercising its role, NGOs are not dependent on government, though they exist for a variety of reasons which include accentuating the political or social goals of their members or funders such as improving the state of the national environment, encouraging the observance of human rights, improving the welfare of the disadvantaged. Though, NGOs in the city have not done much to improve the urban sector. Their programs have been concentrated in the sanitation and tree planting programs by Rotary club, sweeping of some streets in Old GRA by O.B. Lulu Briggs Foundation, and periodic complain and sensitization on peoples' rights to space by Rights Realization Center (Igwe, 2017). By their intentions and objectives which are not implemented, their silence and indifference have contributed to the indiscriminate urban development of the city.

### **Oil Companies.**

The city remains one of the fastest growing urban centers in the country in view of its strategic socioeconomic importance as the petroleum hub of Africa. The metropolis became one of Nigeria's most important industrial centers due principally to the presence of many oil companies (Adekola, et al., 2016). It is an important centre of retail and service companies that must service the oil majors in diverse service provision. The movement of Shell B. P. in 1957 to the city laid her industrial development (Kio-Lawson, 2013). The oil giant moved her residential and industrial bases from Owerri to Port

Harcourt to reap the benefit of the seaport, railway terminal and the new-found black oil. This movement attracted other oil and non companies to the growing city.

The preparation and delineation of the city Industrial Complex and Trans-Amadi Industrial Layout as site and service schemes in 1959 further attracted attention to her (Obinna, Owei & Mark, 2017). The Trans-Amadi Industrial layout is still the largest single industrial site in the city with a coverage area of 1,012.5 hectares linked by road and rail access. There are about 158 banks branches, 154 hotels, 7 multinational telecommunications companies, and a large number of local mobile phone, internet service providers, many other formal business organizations. Obinna, et al., (2017) opined that this is the benefit of the city's strategic importance to the Nigerian economy which is dependent on oil and gas exploration and exportation. It is also to be noted that on the eastern periphery of the city are located the Nigerian Petrochemical Plant and 2 petroleum refineries, while the Nigerian Liquefied Natural Gas Plant is located 40 km down the Bonny River with an international airport at Omagwa, a distance of about 24 km to the north of the city (Owei, 2007).

The old airport plays host to the Nigerian Air force and used by oil companies' light air crafts', just as there many private jetties servicing the oil companies, cements companies, and associated companies in the city. Wokekoro, et al., (2014) acknowledged that the service industry is the strength of the city's economy. SERAC (2007) reported that despite the astronomic growth in the urban center's economy, unemployment level is high with over 60% of households classified as low income with low living wage that is less than the national minimum wage of #18,000.

The oil companies' contribution to the socioeconomic development of the city is significant. They supported educational upliftment through the award of scholarship to students in their areas of operations which will enhance the growth of the city through manpower capital development (Adekola, et al., 2016). Companies like SHELL, AGIP, and CHEVRON contributed to the Nigerian economy through their energy production which provides electricity to the city (Rivers State Ministry of Energy, 2017). Their supplies of natural gas to many industrial customers who use same for power generation for the manufacture of domestic products that enable the city center function with ease.

Of importance is their revenue profile which they pay to federal, state and local governments. Oil exploration being the main stay of our economy is predicated upon the royalties, taxes, and levies that the companies pay to all levels of government in Nigeria (Rivers State Ministry of Energy, 2017). These revenues are used to provide infrastructural and other forms of development witnessed across the landscape.

The operations of the oil industry are dependent on high technology machineries and facilities. Oil companies therefore act as catalyst for innovation and change in concept, design, and introduction of the ever changing high technology that brings about the beautiful city (Adekola, et al., 2016).

Despite the many good activities of the oil companies to the society, its activities have brought untold hardship, wanton destruction, and environmental hazard to the urban sector. Kio-Lawson (2014); Wokekoro & Owei (2014); and Aprioku (2017) are in total agreement that the activities of the oil companies have caused so much environmental hazard, brought disunity, and crisis to communities, endanger marine, aquatic, and human



lives, damage our natural resources, pollute creeks, lakes, rivers, and distort the atmospheric condition.

The high migration to the city as result of the quest and search for the opportunities offered by the oil companies contributed to the traffic congestion. Emeka (2015) contended that the increase in population in the city also brought many cars and vehicles to compete for the road network thereby causing agonizing traffic congestion in the city.

High standard of living of the oil workers brought about disparity in the living standard in the city. Non oil company's workers with lower wages obtainable in their sector find it difficult in coping with their close neighbors and contemporaries in the oil industry (Ihuezee, et al., 2014). This disparity affected the housing development and pushed people into indiscriminate residential development to escape high rent (Emeka, 2015). The oil companies operations in the city led to high population and increase in house rent and cost of foods which raised the cost of living in the city (Emenike & Sampson, 2017).

### **Artisan**

Artisan is a skilled craft worker who makes or creates things by hand that may be functional or strictly decorative for example; furniture, decorative, artworks, sculptures, clothing, sellers of household items, tools, and mechanics etc.,.

Types of Artisans:

- Welders
- Traders

- Shoe cobblers
- Tailors
- Mechanics
- Carpenters
- Hair making
- Phone repairers, etc.

The artisan activities are an attribute of informal economy which increases the number of jobs through their enterprising activities. As a sector, it has capacity to enhance competition among its players due to the easy adaption to customers' needs and ultimately improves sales capacity (Wokekoro & Owei, 2014). Emeka (2015) contended that the informal sector has become a veritable tourist attraction as other sectors of the economy have taken advantage of the open nature of the transaction to do campaigns and events that promote their goods and services. The informal sector activities encouraged knowledge sharing among wide network of artisan enterprises which gives easy access to training and opportunities for business development.

Table 3 showing artisans, location and number.

<b>S/N</b>	<b>TYPES OF ARTISANS</b>	<b>LOCATION</b>	<b>POPULATION</b>
1	Phone Repair	Garrison Ogbunabali Eledenwo Choba Aggrey Road Woji	400 100 300 50 50 20
2.	Shoe Cobblers	Old Port Harcourt Township Abali park (Boro Park) Mile 1 & 3 Market	20 40 80
3.	Hair Making	Abali Park (Boro Park) Old Port Harcourt Township Around Rivers State University	50 25 40

		Mile 1	50
		3 Market	85
		Rumuola	60
		Choba / Uniport Junction	70
4.	Block Molding	NTA Road	15
		Eliozu Road	8
		East /West Road	79
5.	Welders	Eleme Road	6
		Mile 3	35
		NTA Road	10
		Railway Station Road Township	5
		East / West Road	37
6.	Mechanics	Ikoku Road	350
		Rumosi Road	50
		Mechanic Village Opp Ada George Road	100
		East /West Road	40
		Eastern By-Pass	36
7.	Carpenters	Plank shade Marine Base	200
		Timber Mile 2 Diobu	280
		Abuja Road, by RSU off Campus	250
		Navy market, Borikiri	140
		Ikwerre road, Mile 4	220
8.	Tailors	Township New Market	50
		Mile 1Market	80
		Mile 3 Market	130
		Oil Mill Market	250
		Creek Rd Market	200
		Choba Market	123
		Rumuosi Market	63
		Eliozu Market	104
		Rumukrushu Market	321
		Igwuruta Market	92
9.	Vegetables/Fruits	Township New Market	103
		Mile 1Market	234
		Mile 3 Market	214
		Oil Mill Market	123
		Creek Rd Market	129
		Choba Market	79
		Rumuosi Market	57
		Eliozu Market	84
		Rumukrushu Market	90
		Igwuruta Market	165
		Fruits Garden Market	302

10.	Personal wears/Effects	Township New Market Mile 1Market Mile 3 Market Oil Mill Market Creek Rd Market Choba Market Rumuosi Market Eliozu Market Rumukrushu Market Igwuruta Market	302 330 289 78 123 80 67 75 193 104
11.	Sea Foods	Township New Market Mile 1Market Mile 3 Market Oil Mill Market Creek Rd Market Choba Market Rumuosi Market Eliozu Market Rumukrushu Market Igwuruta Market	201 201 304 107 159 97 58 102 160 86
12.	Animal Diaries/Products	Township New Market Mile 1Market Mile 3 Market Oil Mill Market Creek Rd Market Choba Market Rumuosi Market Eliozu Market Rumukrushu Market Igwuruta Market	103 201 280 73 106 67 86 69 59 74

**Source: Field Survey 2018**

Urban planning in developing countries particularly in cities like Port Harcourt which had rapid urbanization is confronted with litany of problems from the informal sector. The activities of the informal sector include operating on streets and in other public places which are seen as undesirable activities, and illegal thus creating conflicts

between urban authorities whose duties are to keep their cities clean and against the urban informal sector operators who need space for their activities. Aprioku (2017) posited that in many cases, the authorities forcibly evict the informal sector activities in the name of urban order and cleanliness; yet, these evictions did not address the problem associated with the informal sector activities, rather relocates the problem and even exaggerates the conflicts between authorities and the sector. This is because operators return to the other places soon after being evicted from a point.

The sector was accommodated prior to the 1970s as no attention was paid to economic activities outside the formal economy. Studies of developing countries showed that the informal sector gained attention through the report by the International Labor Organization (ILO) in the early 1970s. Four, five decades later, the informal sector has gained life which is difficult to ignore as her importance to the socioeconomic activities of many cities particularly in developing economies is unprecedented (Kio-Lawson, 2014). Aprioku (2017) stated that the informal sector accounts for a higher percentage of total employment in many developing countries in Latin America, Sub-Saharan Africa, Middle East and Asia. The number of informal sector employment in urban areas was higher during the economic crisis in the late 1990s with the closure of many manufacturing and service organizations in the city (Emeka, 2015).

The growth of informal sector in the urban setting is nourished by the influx of migrants from rural areas surrounding urban agglomerations in search of greener pastures, survival, and work. With the inability of the formal sector to accommodate the

large numbers of unemployed persons, the available alternative or remedy becomes the informal sector which serves as the primary source of employment (Adekola, et al., 2016). Without the economic opportunities provided by the activities of the sector, the less privileged would have more of criminal elements and a larger burden for the society (Ihuezze, et al., 2014; and Gani, 2015). Their activities are not only within the domain of the poor as many middleclass people in urban landscape of the city benefited tremendously from the economic activities carried out outside the formal sector.

### **Transportation**

The planning and distribution of urban land use greatly influenced the movement of goods and people, thus the demand for transportation. Different types of urban land use include residential, industrial, commercial, recreational, educational, and administrative schemes. Spatial imbalances from the layout of land use created complex transport infrastructure and service problems. Aprioku (2017) posited that demand for transport outstrips supply in the city, 40% of the skilled manpower is employed and some 30% of the country's imports pass through here. Cities are never self-sufficient as food and raw materials from other areas, just as goods and waste material produced by cities also have to be moved. It implies therefore that cities can only function effectively when transport enables the movement of people and goods.

Mabogunje (1990) posited that transportation in urban Nigeria is largely an unregulated market and small scaled. The technology used is a combination of paratransit modes, consisting of shared taxis, mini buses, motor cycles, and converted motor-cycles, popularly known as kekenapep that have become dominant. This unorganized urban

transport system makes the city one of the cities in the world without organized transport system. The problems associated with transportation system contributed to the indiscriminate urban development of the city.

The unorganized nature of the transport system affected traffic planning and management of roads in the city traffic movement. Maintenance of traffic control infrastructure used by traffic police or wardens at traffic lights junctions is nothing to write home about as they are in dilapidated condition and unworkable (Emeka, 2015). The use of speed breakers to control traffic has worsened the poor traffic management and increased traffic jam in the roads and streets (Wokekoro, 2015). Enforcement of existing regulations on safe driving, use of defective vehicles, and road signs are characterized with fraud, corruption, and abuses by the law enforcements of the Nigerian Police Traffic Corp (NPTC), Vehicle Inspection Office (VIO), and Traffic Management Agency (TIMARV). These agencies have taken corruption to the next level (Ogionwo, 2017). The military Joint Task Force act in the guise of fighting the dreaded militancy in the Niger Delta but has added salt to injury in traffic management as their indiscriminate road blocks has become the biggest form of abuses and corruption in the transportation system of the city.

Some transport stakeholders are:

National Union of Road Transport Workers (NURTW)

Labor Mass Transit (LMT)

Mass Transit Scheme

Transport and Investment Cooperative Union Limited (RTICUL)

## Nigerian Legion Mass Transit Scheme

### **Developers**

Most development occurs through actions of private developers following approval of a development application. Developers have a key role in providing land and housing stock, as well as other privately owned facilities such as shops, offices, and industrial buildings. As applicants, developers have rights under planning legislation, such as time frames for deciding development applications and appeal rights against some planning decisions. Developers have an incentive to push planning and zoning rules in order to maximize returns on investment. This can lead to conflicts about development proposals.

The professional definition of the word estate means an interest one holds in land or landed property (Nwabuisi, 2013). The business dictionary defines a developer as a person or firm that improves on land with labor and capital in order to sell subdivided parcel of land or to build structures for rent and or sale. An estate developer as a person or body have interest in landed properties in order to sell subdivided plots or build structure for sell or rent.

Estate development, an integral part of town planning has the definitive role to provide developments that are convenient, safe, healthy, aesthetic, and sustainable. The creation of subdivision of layout for estate development regulates the city's landscape and structure that will ensure sustainable urban growth and economic viability (Rivers State Ministry of Urban Development and Physical Planning, 2013). Rapid growth in the urban sector in the last two decades has exerted enormous pressure on land use. The



resultant consequences include struggles for access to land and conflicts between indigenous urban communities and those who acquire or purchase land for private or public development (Owei, 2015). This urban expansion occurs mostly in an indiscriminate and unplanned manner without the necessary facilities like water, telephone, electricity services, roads, drainage, and other community infrastructure.

Studies have shown that unplanned, unregulated, and indiscriminate developments exist in Port Harcourt urban periphery in high volume. Owei (2015) suggested that the factors responsible for this decay include differential access to land, absence of a well defined land policy, inadequate planning controls, land development laws, and poor implementation of the Master Plans for the city. Unplanned development is a manifestation of the market inability to accommodate the need for land by different people especially these who cannot access land from the public sector. Urban communities, developers, and land speculators take advantage of the vacuums created by policy failure to acquire land with which they build shanties.

The Land Use Act of 1978 as the most important land document in Nigeria at all levels of government has been very problematic due to its poor implementation arising from failure to recognize the reality of customary land laws and traditional perceptions on land (Wokekoro, 2015). The implementation of the law took for granted institutional capacities that do not exist (Owei, 2015). The failure of the law to recognize the ease with which government officials circumvent official processes aided the indiscriminate development of the city as the local indigenous urban communities' contention for their

rights of inheritance to urban land in the city with a commensurate right to determine access propelled sales without adherence to town planning regulations and laws.

The developers are the greatest beneficiaries of the local communities' interests in the land. It has been established that the communities are critical stakeholders in the urban land. Land holding policy that does not aggregate the interest of community members has always been problematic as their response to public acquisition is always one of resistance (Ihueze, et al., 2014). Urban land use management in Port Harcourt is a demonstration of the institutional weakness and lack of continuity which is a catalyst for the indiscriminate urban development that has enveloped the city without offering a systematic response to urban growth of Port Harcourt City. The law's shortcomings as in failure to ensure implementation of master plan is a serious setback to physical planning in Port Harcourt. Owei (2015) posited that the Abuja and Port Harcourt experiences with respect to implementation of master plans has shown that it is more expensive to address distortions in the master plan than to systematically implement it from the start.

Table 4 showing list of Institutional Private Estate Developers in the city

S/N	Private Property	Location	Developer	Financing
1.	Shell Corporative	Eneka	Shell Staff	Seller finance
2.	Shell Residential	Mgbuesilaru Town,	Shell Plc	Resident
3.	Boeing luxury Estate	Omuodukwu, Igwuruta	Boeing limited	Mortgage
4.	Lekki Gardens	G.R.A Phase 1	Lekki Gardens	Seller finance
5.	Vintage Garden	NAF Estate Air force base	UACN PLC	Seller finance

Table 5 showing list of Public Sector (Government) Estate Developments in the city.

S/N	Public Property	Location	Developer	Financing
-----	-----------------	----------	-----------	-----------

1.	Aggrey Estate	Aggrey Road	Government	*
2.	Aggrey Low Cost	Aggrey Road	Government	*
3.	Marine Base Estate	Marine Base	Government	*
4.	Rumuibekwe Estate	Rumuibekwe	Government	*
5.	Ndoki Estate	Township	Government	*
6.	Elekahia Housing	Elekahia	Government	*
7.	Federal Low Cost	Rumeme	Government	*
8.	Peter Odili Estate	Trans Amadi	Government	*
9.	Iriebe Housing Estate	Iriebe	Government	*

Table 6 showing list of Public Private Partnership (PPP) Estate Development in the city

S/N	Public Property	Location	Developer	Financing
1.	RIVTAF Estate	Trans Amadi	PPP	Credit schemes
2.	Rainbow Town Estate	Trans Amadi	PPP	Credit schemes

### Religion Organizations

The believe that except a person is mad, he cannot enforce building regulations in Nigeria on religious organizations, nor muster the temerity and courage to demolish religious buildings including churches and mosques is a great contributor to the prevalence of indiscriminate urban development of the city. Akanni (2013) succinctly placed it on record thus: in fact, the Federal Capital Territory (FCT) authority decision to ensure that development in Abuja conforms to town planning regulation on stipulated building patterns of the city earned a former minister, Mallam Nasir el-Rufai, the nick name “mad man of Abuja”. The importance of town planning manifested in the repeated massive demolition of buildings which did not conform with the building patterns of the town planning regulations of the state. Efforts to restore order in the planning of our urban centers to give them touch of sustainable development through planning differentiation are thwarted with the proliferation of worship centers indiscriminately. Akintola (2000) captured it aptly that on every street, churches and mosques spring up

daily without recourse to town planning policies. Kawu, Ahmed & Usman (2012) opined that disorderly development has both cost and health implications. The indiscriminate development of worship centers in Nigeria lay foundation to religious conflict which is triggered by blockages of roads during services and pervasive media coverage (Akanni, 2013). It is expected that by their very nature and functions, worship centers are supposed to be within the reach of the worshippers, however distances between them has thrown serious implication for security and town planning.

The conversion of houses and schools to religious centers of churches and mosques has become of considerable concern to the town planning officials. The sporadic rise brought concern of noise, disturbance generated and transferred to neighboring residents (Aprioku, 2017). Development control ensures orderly planning and growth of city or town through its regulation which provides standards that are adequate for all aspects of planning. It entails that there will be setbacks for critical infrastructures of water, telephone line, power line, drainage system, adequate light, ventilation, open spaces for relaxation and recreation. It ensures that residential, commercial, industrial, educational, and agricultural areas are properly and carefully zoned.

### **Summary and Transition**

This section provided a vast and rich literature of the city and stakeholders that caused the indiscriminate urban development. It reveals the shortcomings in existing policy and established how these shortcomings contributed to indiscriminate urban development in the city in line with the objectives of this study. The literature review

revealed that participation by the actors was the critical foundation upon which indiscriminate development thrived.

The role of stakeholders in invigorating planning machinery in the city to engender new planning paradigm into the planning and development of the city to achieve the smart city dream has become increasingly necessary. The rapid developmental dynamics has over time generated problems for urban planning and management. The contending interests of the stakeholders in the landscape have reduced the livability and functionality of the metropolitan city. Though putting an end to sprawl development seems impossible, there is the possibility of controlling such development in a planned and regulated manner. This is the challenge to urban planners in Nigeria. Efficient urban planning in the form of planned layouts, development control and other regulatory mechanisms must be put in place.

Indiscriminate development in developing nation blossom due to poverty induced rural urban migration, poor supply of affordable housing, poverty in urban centers, and the stiff competition for economic opportunities that induced the rural urban migration. Research findings indicates that cities in Nigeria, as in other developing countries are growing at a very rapid rate without a commensurate growth rate of social services and infrastructural amenities. The inequality has manifested in the environment, the quality of life with decay in educational facilities of primary and secondary school, unbalance ratio of population to health facilities, inadequate housing, lack of employment opportunities, and high crime rate.

The pattern, trend, and characteristics of urbanization in this city leave much to be desired in order to stem the growth of the city, control the high rate of rural-urban migration, and ensure sustainable development that will improve the quality of life in both urban and rural areas. Taking appropriate measures through appropriate stakeholders' engagement is inevitable, because they are critical contributors to the indiscriminate urban development that pervaded the city's landscape.

### **Chapter 3: Research Method**

The purpose of study was to determine the cause of indiscriminate urban development in this city in the Niger Delta Region of Nigeria. Indiscriminate urban development took a sporadic dimension from the 1990s to the 2000s creating the random urban development in the city that affected the socioeconomic life of the people and the city. Kio-Lawson & Dekor (2014); Wokekoro & Owei (2014); and Wike (2015) argued that the standard development indexes of education, economic activities, greening, health, housing, infrastructural facilities of electricity, road and drainage, water, recreation, and open space lost their bearing.

In this chapter, I outline the research methodology used in understanding the cause and role of stakeholders. This research and its findings have the potential of affecting urban sustainability. Development plans based on the conclusions and recommendation of this study will enjoy the benefit of the long range strategy that can increase competitive advantage.

#### **Research Design and Rationale**

Qualitative study provided the approach to explore the indiscriminate urban development in the City. The research design is the strategy for collection and analysis of data relevant to the research purpose from a neutral environment devoid of external constraints (Kemparaj& Chavan, 2013). Shaw, Scully, & Hart (2014) asserted that information gathered by the review in literature frames the design foundation. The research design includes the interpretive approach that will be used to analyze the data

gathered from the participants. The design involves identifying and understanding emergent themes. Ravitch & Carl (2016) stated that methods of data collection should be aligned to the research questions. Creswell (2014) posited that the research design consists of sampling, observational, statistical, and operational parts. The sampling part entails the methods through which items observed are selected, while the observational part relates to the situation or condition observing the events being tested. The statistical part is a consideration of the research questions that will be answered, and the data to be analyzed and operationalized part deals with the procedures for sampling.

The tradition of phenomenology was chosen to examine the indiscriminate space of urban development in the city. Phenomenological inquiry entails revealing the experiences of people from which others can derive knowledge (Jones, 2013). It discerns what those who witnessed the indiscriminate development experienced in the environment. A phenomenon can be described as a finite and definable experienced (Laureate Education, 2013). The experience range from that of an individual to a group of persons. The central phenomenon of this study was to understand the experience of participants in indiscriminate urban development.

The phenomenological tradition involves attempts to investigate the essence of phenomenon through the examination of the view of people who have experienced what is being complained about (Englander, 2012). It is the exploration of activities to gather information that will ensure an understanding of how people construct the meaning of an activity, event, and phenomena (Creswell, 2014; Kemparaj& Chavan, 2013). It is used to explore people's views and opinions on the realities of relationships (Chenail, 2011). The



phenomenological tradition allows researchers' to explore into the character's real live (Ho & Vieira, 2018). It enables viewers to hear directly from the characters as they respond to probing questions. The researcher is interested in the experience of an individual who saw the event happening.

Phenomenologist has argued that the importance of examining the appearance of a phenomenon to an individual subject is not the main issue but how the phenomenon is present to the subjective community (Zahavi, as cited by Englander, 2012). The phenomenology design does not diminish the efforts of the natural sciences as both the natural sciences and human sciences explain an understanding of the phenomenon.

To achieve quality of natural science research, phenomenon research design process must be methodologically articulated so that data collection and data analysis should be seen as single, unified process with the same underlying theory of science (Englander, 2012). The criteria of science require consistency of method to follow the same logic as part of the same theory of science (Finlay, 2012). Academic rigor is a factor in the establishment of research credibility. The quantitative approach uses standardized and statistical process that increases rigor and credibility (Yin, 2012), however, qualitative approach lack standardization. Therefore, an interview protocol is used in research for data analysis to ensure reliability and validity (Cronin, 2014). Qualitative researchers use deductive, inductive and abductive reasoning (Park & Park, 2013). Deductive reasoning starts with a general rule to a specific conclusion (Park & Park, 2013); inductive arguments move from specific and limited observation resulting to a conclusion (Kuosa, 2011), while abductive reasoning starts with incomplete

information and observation leading to an explanation of the phenomenon (Weeks & Schensul, 2014).

Abductive reasoning uses casual elements during data collection and analysis to create the themes from the responses from participants; hence there is equal level of rigor and creditability with the quantitative approach (Lukka, 2014). The phenomenal design yield in depth information that will develop professional knowledge that is related to the research question as well (J.Kim, Price, & Lau, 2014).

Qualitative research affords researchers opportunities to explore or describe the phenomenon using a variety of data sources. The researcher is allowed to explore individuals and organizations through complex interventions, relationships, communities, or programs (Yin, 2012). Qualitative researchers tells stories about products or services as beyond simple testimonials by presenting real-life examples of how to satisfy customers' needs and help them accomplish their goals based on the organization's work, value and effectiveness.

Kafle (2013) asserted that phenomenology can be used to describe the phenomenon through experience and understanding without any preconceptions and or theoretical orientation. Phenomenological research approaches of empirical transcendental were created by Husserl in 1970 focused on accurate description of the phenomenon and Heidegger's 2008 hermeneutics with an emphasis on the interpretation and the understanding of the phenomenon purpose (Bates, 2018). Both approaches rely on the lived experience of the participant for the description and interpretation of a phenomenon.

The hermeneutic phenomenological approach was used for this study to explore the indiscriminate urban development experience that is lived, understood, and can be interpreted by those who lived the experience (Kafle, 2013). I explored the experience of indiscriminate development from the first-person perspective and explained their descriptions, understanding, and interpretations of their experience.

Other methods of qualitative inquiry that could have been used to explore the indiscriminate urban development in the city included the narrative analysis and inquiry. This study approach provided narrow scope as the researcher focuses on folk tales to articulate the experiences of individuals, groups and communities that are marginalized by accounting for activities and events surrounding their lives (Creswell, 2014). Grounded theory attempts to develop a theory, while an ethnographical study will provide a description or interpretation of a cultural group or system (Azevedo & Ferreira, 2013). The qualitative case study design intersects the lived experiences and decision making processes to engender business knowledge needed (Merriam, 2014). Phenomenological inquiry reveals the experiences of people for others to derive knowledge (Jones, 2013). The phenomenological design brings out the how from events, experience and the common factors applicable to all to explain the fundamental nature of the issue (Spearman, 2015), and this assist the researcher's effort as it doesn't compare time period. The design facilitates inquiry that is necessary to test assertions within the problem statement, and provide collection paradigm that synthesizes multiple perspectives.

### **Role of the Researcher**

The researcher is a facilitator who work with other stakeholders to understand and address an issue of concern for a given group, association, and or community.

Bahrami(2015) contended that the researcher facilitate a conversation, and gather information that is used to inform and help others. The qualitative researchers influence and take effect from the research process. Validity in qualitative research is an important issue for the researcher who is the instrument of data collection because lack of adequate validity in data collection leads to the result not to be cited (Pezalla, Pettigrew, & Miller-Day, 2012; and Corbin & Strauss, 2014). The researcher as an instrument provides opportunities for other researchers to venture into an unknown world of phenomena through his questioning. As the researcher in this study, I am the primary instrument of data collection. To ensure full disclosure, as a former Honorable Commissioner of Urban Development and Physical Planning in Rivers State, I have contacts with all the stakeholder organizations and have interacted with them in my day to day activities. My experiences, skill, position, and the process I adopt in this qualitative research will have bearing in my role as the researcher.

Researchers have the main role of gathering data in all qualitative research because the researcher is the factor that validates the research data (Weeks & Schensul, 2014). Literature reviews begins a research responsibility that develops the scholarly foundation for dissertation work; additionally, as the primary data collector, organization and interpretation of the result of the research work as well as presenting the findings, areas for further research related to indiscriminate urban development and making of recommendations are my responsibilities as the researcher.

Interview protocol with open ended questions was used to provide the platform for exploration to facilitate the collection of information required to understand the subject in question (Walden University, Center for Research Quality,(n.d.-e); IRB, 2013). In compliance with standards, the pre interview protocol included consent form. The necessity for interview protocol form is to guide the researcher during development of the interview, defining the parameters for questions, responses, and remind him to obtain informed consent from the participants (Jacob & Furgerson, 2012). The ability to communicate and ask the rights questions helped to ensure that this qualitative research was conducted in appropriate ways (Weeks & Schensul, 2014). The attitude, ideal, philosophy, and world views of the researcher frames the literature he selects, review, design, collect data, and analyze the study (Fassinger & Morrow, 2013; Creswell, 2014).

There is the likelihood of bias occurring at any stage of the research process (Malone, Nicholl, & Tracey, 2014). The researcher must therefore remain aware of personal prejudices that may influence the responses of participants and affect data analysis. I have deployed my personal knowledge to assist in developing attitude of comprehensive approach to the issue. I eliminated bias to ensure validity during interpretation of responses by listening attentively and actively through summarizing responses and requesting clarification during follow up questions. The second interview session was used as another bias mitigation strategy. Lack of training in formal interview process and deliberate mindfulness creates bias during qualitative interview (Pezalla et al., 2012). I used measures to mitigate unintended bias that included heightened mindfulness to minimize undue influence during the interview, interpretation, and

analysis. Power imbalances are created by biases in the interview based on social, economic, political or ethnic characteristics (Anyan, 2013). Real or perceived power imbalance was mitigated by asking participants to use my first name during the interview to reduce much formality. The research has been reported in an unbiased way to improve veracity and validity.

### **Methodology**

Qualitative research method has been used to explore the issue. Creswell (2014) stated that the method can explain, clarify, and elaborate the meanings of different aspects of the human life experience and phenomenon. Qualitative method approaches provide flexibility and opportunities for in depth discussions about an experience (Logic-Maclever, Piacentini& Eadie, 2012). I have therefore interpreted people's experiences through this research because the research is about human activities. Experts agreed that qualitative method approaches include case study, ethnography, narrative analysis and inquiry, grounded theory, and phenomenology (Creswell, 2014; and Rudestam& Newton, 2015). Qualitative research approach is best for an exploratory research (Starke, 2013). Creswell (2014) contended that qualitative approach allows and ensure a systematic inquiry into the contending issue been described and I have used this to explain the phenomenon of indiscriminate urban development of Port Harcourt City. Ogwaw&Pongtanalert (2013) posited that the qualitative paradigm facilitates evolving conclusion. No research was discovered on the role of stakeholders in the cause of indiscriminate urban development. The purpose of this research effort was to find

meaning and understand through a phenomenological exposition the role and activities of stakeholders in indiscriminate urban development.

Reybold, Lammert, & Stribling (2013) posited that blending planning and discovering in qualitative research explains events that occur in the social phenomena. The quantitative approach uses standardized processes and statistical outcomes to ensure and determine rigor and research creditability (Creswell, 2014; Yin, 2012): It also use strategies of random sampling and numbers to achieve research goals (Reybold et al., 2013). On the other hand, the qualitative approach pursues its research objective through purposive sampling as a strategic tool to gather information within the context of the particular phenomenon Reybold et al., 2013). Mixed approaches combine qualitative and quantitative methodologies (Green et al., 2014). Our choice of qualitative approach provides a means of answering the overarching research questions which preserves the contextual fluidity and dynamism that identifies emerging themes from participant responses. Using purposive sampling strategy allows in depth qualitative examination of participants (Poulis, Poulis&Plakoyiannaki, 2013). Research biases are decreased by randomization which facilitates generalization to the sampling population (Green et al., 2014). Qualitative research explores participant's perception of an experience about an issue, whereas quantitative research counts responses (O'Reilly & Parker, 2013). Qualitative research is embedded with exploratory characteristics which reveals in depth knowledge about the given phenomenon as well as defeating the criticism that interpretative research lacks rigor (Kapoulas&Mitic, 2012). Nite& Singer (2012); Vaughan, Leming, Liu, &Jaselskis (2013) are of the opinion that the abstract nature of

qualitative research gives empowerment opportunities for researchers, participants, and readers to contribute to knowledge creation about the research issue.

### **Participants Selection Logic**

The study population of this research is the stakeholders in the urban planning and development sector of the city. The accessible population included participants from government agencies, policy practitioners, urban managers, developers, professional bodies in the built industry, informal trading groups, community leaders, non-governmental associations, religious organizations, market unions, drivers union, residents and artisans, etc. I gained access to the population through the generic mail sent to the head and leaders of the participants' organizations informing them of the research and intended usage of their members as participants. This letter is Appendix A.

The research interview questions collected information from the participants to reveal insight about their opinions on the subject. Jacob & Ferguson (2012) and Owen (2014) stated that through the interview process, the researcher will have an opportunity to gain deep information regarding the participant's professional experiences and views on the issue in question. Jefferies, Brewer & Gajeendran (2014) emphasized that interview protocol and procedures are important to mitigate bias, ensure reliability, and repeatability for future research. Protocol preparation entails obtaining permission before starting data collection; identifying the steps to take before, during, and after each interview; and developing questions designed to gain information regarding the cause of indiscriminate urban development in Port Harcourt. This strategy enabled me to examine



the data through a limited number of individuals that were used as participants of the study. Interview protocol is Appendix C.

I developed cooperation with the executives and leadership of the ministry and relevant associations whose membership will participate in the data collection. They wrote letters of cooperation to me indicating their willingness to partner with me and permission to their members to participate in the research. Through this communication mechanism, participant criteria and how the sector will benefit from the findings of the study was also conveyed. I took extra precautionary measures to protect participants' anonymity.

Another selection process factor that I considered is the alignment of participants' professional background and experience profile with the research design and purpose. To meet the criteria for participation in this research, participants must have at least 5 years experience working in the urban planning sector with demonstrable ability of the rudiments of the sector. Shofoluwe et al., (2012) agreed that job responsibilities of participants should entail primary knowledge of the industry's practice, policies, procedures, and regulations.

Methodologists are in agreement that adequate sample size is necessary for achieving data saturation in qualitative studies as consensus does not give numeric specificity (Jefferies, Brewer, & Gajeendran (2014). Participant pool consisting of experts in an industry, the sample size of less than 20 facilitates research efforts to gain in depth understanding of the issue in question (Owen, 2014). O'Reilly & Parker (2013) argued against numeric standard for qualitative research sample size as distinct characteristics

and nuances guide the different design approach, but rather information depth and breadth, available resources provide the structure that determines the appropriate sample size. In an exploratory research relating to the urban planning sector, the participant's professional experience and sector knowledge will provide the appropriate sample size for qualitative case study work (Hershkovitz & Forkosh-Baruch, 2013). Following the arguments, I decided and used 10 participants with professional expertise, management responsibilities from the participant pool to ensure that data saturation occurs. Interview process will continue to ensure participant responses aligns.

Depth of information and breadth juxtaposed with document analysis and data sources improved opportunities to drive data saturation (O'Reilly & Parker, 2013). Analyzed documents included archival records, brochures, organizational online records, textbooks, magazines, periodic reports, laws and policies in the literature review that related to the data collected. The participant pool included town planners, lawyers, architects, and trade union leaders. Also considered when determining the sample size is the professional relationship I will develop with the participants as well as the trust built to create amicable environment during data collection. The environment for truthfulness necessitates smaller sample size of participants. Baker, Edwards, & Doidge (2014) stated that with a research aim of exploring and discovering, emerging themes will reveal when saturation occurs.

Challenges arise in qualitative study when a predetermined number for the participant pool is taken. Reilly (2013) stated that member checking provides opportunity for participants to review and verify the interpretation by the researcher of their responses

in the interview. This reduces ambiguity and increase clarity of the work. Kemparaj& Chavan (2013) opined that qualitative research redundancy in response as well as information themes bring about data saturation and increase replicability. Trotters II, (2012) asserted that smaller sample sizes fit qualitative studies. Banawi & Bilec (2014) agreed that 20 interviews are sufficient population sample since the participant's experience and knowledge about the issue provide ample opportunities for in depth exploration that can answer the research questions. The 10 participants for this research are persons with relevant and extensive experience with operational activities in the urban planning sector and were therefore able to share adequate and veritable information. Banawi & Bilec (2014) supported the selection and interviewing of 10 experienced stakeholders in the urban sector with knowledge about the particulars of the study to achieve the saturation goal. Interviewing protocols presents opportunities that participants used to explain, clarify, and elaborate the questions as the platform for the emerging themes and ideas that explored the overarching research questions.

### **Instrumentation**

Different research methodology uses different data collection techniques. Quantitative research uses numbers and statistical analysis, while qualitative research uses words to collect and interpret data (Anyan, 2013). The design foundation and nature of data collection of research works are provided by the problem and purpose statement (Merriam, 2014).

I was the primary data collection instrument. Other instrument used included interviews, and documents analysis. This research work therefore used triangulation

strategy to align the data collected. It involves the use of different methods of observation, focus groups and in-depth interview in data collection in qualitative research (Creswell, 2014). Though, focus groups and individual interviews have the common methodological shortcomings as both are interviews of a kind, with their distinct characteristics. According to Lehner (2015), the use of different methods compensates for their individual limitations and exploits their respective benefits. Anyan (2013) argued that triangulation should be used to reduce the effect of investigator bias. Multiple data collection strategies add value to the work's relevance, because multiple view points and experience are realized hence, a detailed and broader picture to ensure trustworthiness of the study as well as conformability of the research.

In this work, observation of sites, interviews, sourcing of materials from websites and archival systems to retrieve information served as data collection mechanism to obtain the goal of the research on indiscriminate development. Creswell (2014) acknowledged that the use of secondary sources to gather data is very important and critical for a qualitative research, just as primary sources serves as an invaluable collection of historical or past works which contributed to the formation of culture, and ideals of the topic in issue. The usage of the methods will ensure better and further understanding of the complexities in the research topic being discussed. This is because even though the methods differ substantially, each possesses its own unique strengths, weaknesses, and a collaborative effort (Yin, 2012).

The qualitative interview tools will provide in depth examination of the subject based on participant's responses (Kemperaj & Chavan, 2013). The comprehensive interview enabled me to ask participants their perceptions and insights to the phenomenon of indiscriminate urban development in the city of Port Harcourt to ascertain actual facts. Yin (2012) supported that asking different persons the same questions will elicit broad and diverse representation that will aid the exploration of the research questions.

Document analysis by researchers ensures examination, evaluation and interpretation of written and electronic materials as an exploratory process in qualitative research. It provides empirical data for case studies which researchers use in framing the context from information gathered in the interviews and helps in data triangulation (Preitz, 2015). Document analysis will be continuous all through the data collection process. Information collected from documents such as company websites, other electronic and digital sources are very valuable in the provision of questions for the interview processes (Owen, 2014).

There shall an integration of document, in depth interview, response validation process and the observation as an important step. These will ensure accuracy during data interpretation, identification and discussion of themes, and data triangulation (d' Angelo & Brunstein, 2014). My research goal was to gather information urban planners need concerning indiscriminate urban development. A qualitative study using comprehensive interviews offers best data collection platform that will help answer the research question.

Owen (2014) opined that coupling qualitative interviews with documents analysis into the research process explore the experiences of participants.

The extensive review of literature on the subject provided the foundation for the interview questions. Jacob & Furgerson (2012) asserted that the purpose of interviews is to allow the participant and researcher flexibility during the discussion as well as constant comparison during data collection.

Specific strategies were incorporated to uncover deliberate lies. They include probing to elicit detailed data and iterative questioning, from which I returned to issues raised previously by another informant so as to extract related data through rephrased questions. This is meant to reveal contradiction, falsehoods, and give me the latitude to discard the suspect data. The usage was encouraging because it provided greater transparency as well as drew attention in the final research report, and offered possible explanations.

Peer scrutiny of the research project provided opportunities for colleagues, peers, and academic experts to scrutinize the research project to serve as feedback to me. The scrutiny brought fresh perspective that challenges the assumptions earlier made. Creswell (2014) contended that researcher closeness to the project frequently inhibits his or her ability to view it with real detachment. Questions and observations from reviewer helps in refinement of methods, development of greater explanation of the research design and strengthen the arguments in the comments provided. NVivo 10 CAQDA software was

used as the technology tool to organize, transcribe and interpret the interview as well as analyze the transcribed data from the interviews.

**(c) Procedures for recruitment, participation and data collection**

Participants that served in this study followed the process of recruitment, informing, collection of data, analysis of data, and validation of findings.

1. They were contacted through a generic mail to leaders and heads of stakeholder organizations.
2. Send request letters to prospective participants to indicate acceptance to participate.
3. Schedule meetings with participants who accepted to participate by calling me through the telephone.
4. The first 10 participants who called were schedule for the first interview after signing the consent Form. This first interview has questions as is attached in Appendix C with a conclusion informing participants of the second interview.
5. The second interview took place within two weeks after the first interview. It has questions listed in the attached Appendix C.
6. The time lag between the first and second interview was to allow for transcribing from the audiotapes and analysis according to outlined steps.

**Interviews**

The phone interview will ensure a full exploration of the meanings of the central themes in the subject as well as aid an understanding of the interviewee's mindset (Block

& Erskine, 2012). Despite the inconvenience provided by phone interview, it eliminates the opportunity provided by visual clues (Irvine, Drew & Sainsbury, 2013). Shaw, et al., (2014) believed that the associated benefits to phone interview outweighed the disadvantages of interviewer's non visual clues. Allen (2014) agreed that phone interview should be exploited as the cost effectiveness, convenience and anonymity of explaining personal experiences are far greater than the distortion perceived in data collected by lack of visual clues. Phone interview is expected to contribute significantly as a data collection tool in qualitative research.

Experts therefore advocate multiple sources for data gathering. According to Guba as cited by Spearman (2015), the use of different methods compensates for their individual limitations and exploits their respective benefits. Using multiple source methods in data collection will accomplish methodological triangulation (Spearman, 2015). In this research, I collected data through interviews, observations, photographs, videos and archived documents.

Rubin & Rubin (2012) posited that interview entails the posing of questions by a researcher to a participant through an alternating series of usually brief questions. In line therefore, I prepared questions for the session which lasted for 20 to 25 minutes each in order to elicit relevant information on the subject with a view to get greater knowledge about the issue in question. Laureate Education (2016a) summed that interviewing is a science which entails the use of strong, rigorous design, and procedure as well as an art which establish comfort zone for the participant to enable him to provide useful



information about the issue. It is therefore used as a method to understand the experiences of others.

The semi-structured interviews are conducted through open-ended questions that are characteristics of qualitative research (Trotter, et al., 2014). It is opined that qualitative interview has two features of natural flow, and rich detail. Rubin & Rubin (2012) agreed that interviews help researchers gain significant information about different ideas, themes, and events on the subject in issue. Interviewing as a technique for conducting qualitative research requires tactfulness and sensitivity. Laureate Education, (2016a) acknowledges that this produce strong and effective interview wherein the participant is engaged and encouraged to provide clear and useful information. Through this technique, the open-ended question used, will help for probing, balancing rapport as well as ensure neutrality through the use of appropriate body language (Anyan, 2013). I tenaciously applied the technique to provide clear explanation of what the participant actually said by listening to their inner voice or subtext, remained aware if they are tired or bored as well as being conscious of how much time already used and juxtaposed same with how many questions still remaining.

My interview sessions were aligned appropriately with the expectation and standard as good rapport and trust were established between my participants and I. Laureate Education, (2016a) cautioned that interviews characterized with confusion, anxiety, and discomfort will produce inadequate information. Effectiveness was achieved because boundaries were respected to encourage the participants to explore their

experiences in a sensitive and respectful manner. It is suggested that interviewees should not be probed in ways that will make them feel uncomfortable or look like a specimen in lab (Laureate Education, 2016a). I also avoided much detail that will make the participants uncomfortable, defensive, or unwilling to share information during the sessions. I stroked a balance between ambiguity and specificity in line with my professional calling as a researcher.

Reilly (2013) argued that allowing participants a higher degree of intimacy encourages them to reveal personal information in a real time face to face setting. To achieve the above, I evoked an array of significant feelings and experiences with them since I was working with a sample population that was easier to cover, and manage.

### **Observation method**

Observation method as data collection instrument is very valuable to qualitative research, because the data that will be collected from the sites will be of significant value. These sites will provide rich amount of data that will contribute immensely to the research in line with Walden University objective of ensuring positive social change (Walden University, Center for Research Quality, n.d.-e). Though the data collection method does not provide room for specific research questions to be asked, and it may be time-consuming, and stressful, but ensures accuracy of information. This approach is appropriate for qualitative study because it presents vivid meaning and understanding of the subjects and information collected. Ravitch & Carl (2016) argued that researchers utilized it as an efficient data collection method to gather data since it allows for

anonymity of participants, low cost implication, and large amount of data. The method's limitations includes difficulty in analysis as people may refuse to provide answers to questions, and the researcher is left to make judgment as to which data is useful and necessary, thereby introducing biases (Creswell, 2014). It a prominent task of qualitative research to minimize the flaws in observation and endeavor to gain truthful knowledge.

### **Data Analysis Plan**

Divan, Ludwig, Matthews, Motley & Tomlienovic-Berube (2017) stated that qualitative methods are widely used in learning and teaching research and scholarship. But the epistemologies and theoretical assumptions of the approach may not be familiar to all as they are sometimes challenging to science and engineering backgrounds (Rowland & Myatt, 2014); though it has a wide appreciation of the value of the methods (Rosenthal, 2016). There is litany of scholarly works on qualitative approaches. Maguire & Delahunt (2017) tended to focus more on assumptions, design, and data collection rather than the analysis process. Clarke & Braun (2013) advocated for clear guidance on the practical aspects of how to do qualitative analysis. Nowell, Norris, White & Moules (2017) explained that the lack of focus on rigorous and relevant thematic analysis has implications on the credibility of the research process.

### **Method of Analysis**

Braun & Clarke (2013); Braun, Clarke, & Gray (2017) recommended the use of relevant primary data through thematic analysis, one of the most common forms of analysis in qualitative research. Guest (2012) agreed that it is emphatic on pinpointing, examining, and recording patterns or themes within data sets that are important to the

description of a phenomenon associated to a specific research question. As a qualitative research tool, the method emphasizes organization with rich description of the data set and goes beyond simply counting phrases or words in a text but identifies implicit and explicit ideas within the data (Jankowski, Braun, & Clarke, 2017). Braun & Clarke (2013) suggested that it is the first qualitative method that should be learned because it enriches researchers with core useful skills that are necessary for the conduct of other kinds of analysis.

It is a method and not a methodology when viewed from learning and teaching perspective (Braun & Clarke 2013). This is a further advantage because unlike many other qualitative methodologies, thematic analysis is not tied to any particular epistemological or theoretical perspective (Alhojailan, 2012). It is a flexible method which gives considerable advantage based on the diversity of work in learning and teaching.

Thematic analysis has many different approaches (Alhojailan, 2012; Javadi & Zarea, 2016). Which also present some confusion about its nature as well as its distinction from qualitative content analysis<sup>1</sup> (Vaismoradi, Turunen & Bonda, 2013). Braun & Clarke (2013) offered a 6 step framework which is arguably the most influential approach as it is clear, and usable for thematic analysis in the social sciences. The goal of the analysis is the identification of important and interesting themes or patterns in the data to be used in addressing the research issue. Maguire & Delahunt (2017) stated that it is much more than simply summarizing the data as a thematic analysis must interpret and make sense of it. Part of the shortcoming of other methods is the usage of the main

interview questions as the themes (Braun & Clark, 2013). This means that the data have been summarized and organized and not analyzed.

The analysis is also related to phenomenology for its focus on human experience. Guest (2012) argued that the approach emphasized the perceptions, experiences, and feelings of participants as the main object or purpose of study. Phenomenology gives voice as a key component in qualitative research thereby allowing the respondents to discuss the subject in their own words, freely without the fixed response questions of quantitative studies.

Braun & Clarke as cited by Maguire and Delahunt (2017) distinguished two levels of themes as semantic and latent. Semantic themes are within the explicit or surface meanings of the data as such the analyst is not looking for anything beyond what has been said by participant or has been written. This gives sense of important themes even though some depth and complexity are lost despite representing rich description of the entire data. On the other hand, latent level looks beyond what a participant said but identifies or examine the underlying ideas, assumptions, conceptualizations, and ideologies that have been theorized to shape and inform the semantic content of the data (Braun & Clarke, 2006). It requires much interpretation of data, hence focus on a specific question and area of interest to the disadvantage of many data set. Despite the varied versions of thematic analysis, the widely cited approach is that developed by Virginia Braun and Victoria Clarke performed through the process of coding in six phases to create established and meaningful patterns (Guest, 2012).

Qualitative study is inherently an interpretive research. Creswell (2014) opined that the biases, values, and judgments of the researcher must be explicitly acknowledged to ensure trustworthiness on the findings. This openness is in line with ethical consideration (IRB, 2013). As the instrument for the collection and analysis, I shaped the work in order to be acknowledged as the tool of analysis. To this end, I created and maintained a reflexivity journal. Reflexivity as a process describes the documenting of close reflections of potential findings and implications of the research study (Saldana, 2016). I used this journal to record emergent patterns, themes, and concepts to ensure that during the coding process detailed records of the development of each of the codes and potential themes were secured. It was also meant to ensure that the changes made to themes and connections between them were incorporated into the final report. To assist the reader in understanding decisions made throughout the coding process (Saldaña, 2016). Upon completion of fieldwork and interviews, before beginning the data analysis stages, I took notes from the transcription and interviews by writing words that may be of importance to me during data analysis in the journal. It is argued that logging in ideas for future analysis will aid in getting thoughts and reflections which will serve as reference for coding ideas as the work move from one stage to the other in the analysis process (Saldaña, 2016). There is no finality or accuracy that the items written in the journal will contain considerations for further analysis. Creswell (2014) contended that researchers must be conscious and take into consideration that analytic memos will assist them in the future coding of potential overreaching themes.

In working with reflexivity journals, researchers must ensure that notes taken in the journals are different from the data. Experts contended the use of italics, bold letter or characters, and brackets to differentiate between data, journaling, writing the notes fully without abbreviations as these will assist the work in the final stages of analysis through the process of data complication and reduction (Saldaña, 2016). Using the analytic memos helped to reveal information about my thinking process with respect to the codes and categories that emerged in the analysis process. A critical outcome of qualitative data analysis is the interpretation of how each individual components of the study will relate to each other.

### **Research Question and Data**

The data to be used in this analysis will be extracted from responses to interview questions of 10 participants from the relevant stakeholders in the city urban setting. The full study involved 10 participants lasting about 50 minutes each for the 2 interviews. These will be transcribed verbatim. The research explored the cause of indiscriminate urban development in this Niger Delta City of Nigeria. Discussions focused on the role or activities of stakeholders which caused the indiscriminate urban development. The study got the ethical approval of Walden University Institutional Review Board (IRB, 2013). The permission of participants for the use of transcript extract was obtained through the consent form that each of them signed and returned to me. The original research questions are realistic as the research is interested in the stakeholders' personal accounts of their experiences and points of view. This is the basis of the structuring of the interview questions, management and the analysis.

There is a differentiation between top down or theoretical thematic analysis which is driven by a specific research question and /or the analyst's focus, and bottom up or inductive analysis driven by the data itself (Maguire & Delahunt, 2017). The analysis of this work was driven by the research question hence a top down analysis based on the extract from 10 stakeholders interviewed. Obviously this was a very limited data so the analysis was quite basic and limited.

Virginia Braun and Victoria Clarke developed the 6 phases as follows: familiarization with data, generating initial codes, searching for themes among codes, reviewing themes, defining and naming themes, and producing the final report.

### 3.1 Getting started.

The extract:

This was taken from the interviews conducted with stakeholders. The extract covered about 10 minutes of the interview questions and is available in Appendix D.

### 3.2 Research question:

In this research, I worked with two straightforward research questions:

1. What are the causes of the continuous indiscriminate urban development in this city?
2. What are the effects and consequences of indiscriminate urban development of this city?

Doing the analysis.

Braun & Clarke as cited (Maguire & Delahunt, 2017) provided a six-phase guide which is generally accepted as useful framework for the conduct of thematic analysis.



Table 7 showing the six phase thematic analysis guide.

Step 1: Become familiar with the data,	Step 4: Review themes,
Step 2: Generate initial codes,	Step 5: Define themes,
Step 3: Search for themes,	Step 6: Write-up.

Table 7: Braun &amp; Clarke's six-phase framework for doing a thematic analysis.

3.3 Step 1: Become familiar with the data. The first step in any qualitative analysis is reading and re-reading the transcripts. The interview extract formed the data. The researcher needs to be very familiar with the entire body of data or data corpus. Maguire & Delahunt (2017) reiterated that the researcher must be familiar with all the interviews and any other data that may be used before going further. It is very important and useful to make notes and jot down early impressions.

3.4 Step 2: Generate initial codes. At this phase I will start organizing my data in a meaningful and systematic way as it relates to the research questions. This coding process evolves through an inductive analysis which is not linear process, rather a cyclical process through which codes emerge from the research process (Guest, 2012). The cyclical process involves back and front movement between the phases of data analysis until you are satisfied with the final themes (Clarke & Braun, 2016). Thematic researchers are advised to go beyond surface meanings of the data and tell an accurate story that will make sense of the data and the meaning.

Saldaña (2016) referred to code as a word, phrase or short sentence that assigns, capture a salient, summarize attribute for a part of visual or language data, and the coding

start forming and shaping data around particular research questions. Coding reduces data into chunks of meaning (Maguire & Delahunt, 2017). Coding is done through different ways, and method to use is determined by researcher's perspective and research questions (Braun, Clarke, & Gray, 2017). I was concerned with addressing the specified research questions and analysis of the data; with this at the back of my mind I undertook a theoretical thematic analysis rather than an inductive analysis. Based on this, I coded each segment of data that is relevant to or captures something interesting about the research questions, that entails that not every piece of text was coded.

3.5 Step 3: Search for themes. A theme is a pattern that captures something significant or interesting about the data and /or research question. Braun & Clarke as cited by (Maguire & Delahunt, 2017) explained that there are no hard and fast rules about what makes a theme, but a theme is characterized by its significance. The presence of a very small data set (e.g. one short focus group) may bring about considerable overlap between the coding stage and the stage of preliminary identification of themes. In this study I have examined the codes and ensured that they fit together into a theme.

At the end of this step, I organized the codes into broader themes that said something specific about each research question. The themes were descriptive because they described patterns in the data relevant to the research question.

3.6 Step 4: Review themes. In this phase I have reviewed, modified and developed the preliminary themes that I have identified in Step 3 to determine if they make sense. The critical thing in this step is that I gathered all the data that are relevant to each theme together. Bree & Gallagher (2016) suggested doing this using the cut and

paste function in any word processing package like Microsoft Excel. Access to any qualitative data analysis software will make this process much quicker and easier however, it is not necessary as it can be done manually. However, I have used NinoV software to analyze my data set.

Following, I thought if the themes can work in the context of the entire data set. Bree & Gallagher (2016) contended that themes should be coherent and distinct from each other. Braun & Clarke as cited by (Maguire & Delahunt, 2017) contended that thinking will include:

Do the themes make sense?

Does the data support the themes?

Am I trying to fit too much into a theme?

If themes overlap, are they really separate themes?

Are there themes within themes (subthemes)?

Are there other themes within the data?

3.7 Step 5: Define themes. This is Braun & Clarke as cited by (Maguire & Delahunt, 2017). I resorted to critical thinking for the final and last refinement of the theme. The aim is the identification of the essence of what each theme is about includes:

What is the theme saying?

The interaction and relationship between subthemes and main theme

How the themes relate to each other?

3.8 Step 6: Writing-up. Traditionally the end point of research is reporting the findings, recommendations, and conclusion.

4. Concluding Comments. Analyzing qualitative data present some challenges more especially inexperienced researchers. In this research application of Braun and Clarke thematic analysis framework to the data drawn from stakeholders in the urban setting of Port Harcourt City will to a large extent contribute to social positive change.

In analyzing the data collected, I recorded and coded the transcript of the interview. The initial and open coding entails a description of content which is recognized as the main responses. The coded material was inspected, and scanned for likenesses and contrasts. A triangulation of patterns was also conducted to create new levels of comprehension for the research.

### **Issues of Trustworthiness**

Positivists often question the trustworthiness of qualitative research because their concept is not addressed in the same way as quantitative research (Devault, 2018). In quantitative research, trustworthiness is referred to as validity and reliability, while in qualitative research the concept is more obscure and put in different term which entails the establishment of the words in the research (Ravitch and Carl, 2016). Experts on research methods are in agreement that qualitative research incorporate measures to deal with the issues of reliability and validity (Frankfort-Nachmias, Nachmias, & DeWaard, 2015). Naturalistic investigators used different terminology to describe trustworthiness different from the positivist paradigm as findings are established by ensuring credibility, transferability, conformability, and dependability (Guba, as cited by Creswell,2014).

When a research is not sound scientifically, it is unlikely to result in trustworthy findings (IRB, 2013). A research may be a disservice to public health, policy, general

knowledge, and to future studies based on its outcomes. Research that is not scientifically sound is a reflection of lack of respect for participants whose time were wasted, funds, research resources, and personnel. However, there is disagreement within the scientific community about whether IRBs should engage in scientific review as it is argued that institutional scientific review and/or study section review are sufficient (Creswell, 2014).

Unethical practices led to the establishment of research ethics commissions and the regulations that have the force of law to govern research. Concerns about scientific misconduct were the reason for the establishment of a Federal Office of Research Integrity (ORI) as well as policies to encourage ethical research and other responsible conduct. The Office of Research Integrity engaged in education, research, and investigations as well as imposes sanctions for scientific misconduct. The definition of scientific misconduct and the U.S. federal policy governing is the products of the Office of Research Integrity. Of the allegations made to the Office of Research Integrity, about 2% result in findings of scientific misconduct of fabrication, falsification or plagiarism (Fanelli, 2009).

The art of qualitative research and trustworthiness entails the process through which the data should be refined systematically through thematic classification to answer the research question by first organizing the data into groups by similar attributes (Hu, Torr, & Whiteman, 2014). The use of software help to ensure trustworthiness, because the analysis captures the words and phrases associated with responses from participants, create categories consistency, and generate report based on percentage of frequency

(Bazeley & Jackson, 2013). I used Nvivo software to contribute to trustworthiness for the findings and results

### **Credibility**

This is important in research effort as it gives the work respectability. Fan (2013) stated that it will undergird the credibility of outcomes and conclusions and upholds the confidence of the qualitative researcher. Devault (2018) posited that credibility contributes substantial to belief in the trustworthiness of data as credibility is addressed with the attributes of prolonged engagement, persistent observations, triangulation, referential adequacy, member checks, and peer debriefing. Through triangulation, the same research questions are put to different participants in the study, data collected from different source, different methods are used to answer the research questions. I asked the participants to review the data collected through the interview and juxtapose same with my interpretation of the data from interview entailing member checks. The member checks process is appreciated by participants as it affords them the opportunity to verify their statement (Devault, 2018). Trust is the foundation of the member check process as it builds confidence that ensures that findings are true and accurate.

Qualitative researchers use triangulation to portray that the research findings are credible.

### **Transferability**

This is the demonstration by qualitative researcher that the research findings will be applicable in other contexts (Braun, Clarke, & Gray, 2017). Other context implies similar situations, populations, and phenomena. The researcher undertaking a qualitative

research use thick description to show that the findings from the research will be applicable to other contexts, circumstances, and situations. Transferability entails generalizing the findings from a particular study or research effort to other situations and circumstances similar to the one under study. This process is not within the purview of the naturalistic research objective (Guba, as cited by Creswell, 2014).

Frankfort-Nachmias, et al., (2015) contended that data collection in qualitative study context defines the data as well as contribute to the efficacy of the interpretation of the data and limits generalization in qualitative research. This sampling method ensures that characteristics of individual members of the sample population are considered to ensure they relate directly to the research questions (Rustedam & Newton, 2015). To this end, I used purposive sampling to ensure transferability to maximization of specific information relating to the context wherein I collected the data.

### **Conformability**

The degree of neutrality of research findings is critical and important to conformability process (Frankfort-Nachmias, et al., 2015). The implication is that the results and findings of the qualitative research will be based on the responses from participants and not on the researcher's personal bias or motivations. I ensured that my personal bias do not skew my interpretation of what the participants responded to questions to fit any narrative. Devault (2018) canvassed the establishment of conformability in the qualitative research to provide audit trail which highlights all the steps in data analysis to provide rationale for the decisions made.

### **Dependability**

Dependability in qualitative research indicates trustworthiness by showcasing the extent to which the study if repeated through other researchers will have the findings remaining consistent (Singh, 2014). It follows that if other researchers are replicating my study, enough information should be available to them from my research report to enable them do so as well as obtain the same and similar findings as my study did. Devault (2018) concurred that qualitative researchers should use inquiry audit to ensure establishment of dependability as outside persons are required to review, examine the research process, and the data analysis to ensure that the research findings are consistent and repeatable.

#### **(d) Ethical Research**

Experts are in agreement that qualitative research poses ethical issues and challenges unique to the study of human beings as the interpersonal relationships developed are critical because, the researchers and participants engage in dialogic process that evokes stories and memories that are remembered and reconstituted in ways (Rustedam & Newton, 2015; Walden University, Center for Research Quality (n.d.-e), Ethical issues are raised as the relationships not only provide qualitative research data, but develop intimate interactions among them. The researcher is the primary data collection instrument. This present factors framed around exploration foundation related to personal opinions about the issue of indiscriminate urban development and attitudes of environmental sustainability (Reybold et al, 2013).

Researchers have an obligation to follow ethical standards so that human dignity are respected as well as conform to academic principles (McCormack, et al., 2012).



Walden University, Center for Research Quality, (n.d.-e;) and IRB, 2013) provided that the researcher must ensure the protection of personal information of participants.

Frankfort-Nachmias, et al., 2015) and McCormack, et al., (2012) agreed that this will ensure integrity, and protection of participants' anonymity. These safeguards are necessary in every phase of the participatory research process (Jenkins, 2012).

I adhered to rules and ensured that participants did not undergo process that would have exposed them to danger, psychological, mental, or physical threats. Vulnerable persons like minors, pregnant women, emotional, mental patients or persons with disabilities were not part of the study. Upon receipt of IRB approval for data collection, I commenced the process by sending generic mails to the leadership of relevant organizations informing them of granting permission to their members to participate in the study. See Appendix A. In my continued bid to protect human elements, those who participated signed the consent form.

The participants in this study were adult male and female volunteers who are free to participate or not. There was no difficulty experienced by any participant in this study hence there was no need for referral to the local services. Participants were informed of their freedom to withdraw their consent and participation at any time they feel uncomfortable, however, I did not have any withdrawal by any participant. Transcripts, audiotapes, and files have been secured my home study. In removed any information that can identify any participants from the transcripts before data validation.

I was mindful of the impact, questions would have on subjects especially those who are vulnerable, and therefore adopted reflexive approach to minimize the risk of

harmful effects. IRB (2013) require qualitative researchers to protect human instruments through proper harnessing of their interpersonal skills in natural settings and study processes. Relational ethics approach addresses how qualitative proposals are interpreted by research ethics committees and how it protects vulnerable respondents. It follows that the research governance can be enhanced by shared ownership and willingness to engage in mutual dialogue (Walden University, Center for Research Quality., n.d.-e). This enabled me to review the understanding of roles and functions in the assessment of research protocols.

It is agreed that qualitative researchers have great responsibility and play many different roles because the research deals with sensitive topics that can pose emotional trauma and other risks to both parties (Rustedam & Newton, 2015). Devault (2018) suggested preventive measures that included official arrangements for a peer support program aimed at improving psychological fitness in the form of a professional confidence building module, offering adequate supervision to provide opportunities for self-development, self-care, and facilitating the process of self-reflection and self-monitoring To this end, I discharged my responsibility and obligation in compliance with IRB approval which entails examining data collection and analysis methods that must comply with existing laws and moral standards.

Also to be considered are strategies for emotional distancing. Appropriate planning would be in place before the commencement of the fieldwork. I took deliberate measures and efforts in the conduct and level of relationship development, self

disclosure, objective displays of emotion during the interviews, and ending the relationships.

Qualitative researchers have a prominent task of minimizing flaws in observation and must endeavor to gain truthful knowledge (Frankfort-Nachmias, et al., 2015). I continuously updated my investigative skills of methodology and novel techniques to carry out this study. The qualitative research setting requires close work collaboration with team members and under direct supervision to discuss and resolve issues as they arise. I developed practical strategies and communicated them. They were of great benefit and assisted in conducting this qualitative research which I expect will make a difference in people's lives, improve society, and provide a framework for sustainable urban development without any ethical disturbances.

Research design and methods must be appropriate to the topic being researched otherwise the effort is a waste of time and resources, disrespectful to subjects, staff and the scientific enterprise (IRB, 2013). I adopted IRB guides that ensured careful preparation of the research plan and peer review which helped ensured that the results are scientifically valid and reliable, that data acquired were methodologically appropriate, transparent, analyses appropriate to what participants consented to.

Aside from direct treatment of human and non-human subjects, the conduct of research is important with ethical considerations. For example, strict adherence to the research design, protocol and analytic plan is critical to data integrity (Rustedam & Newton, 2015; Walden University, Center for Research Quality (n.d.-e). Avoidance or disclosure of the financial and personal conflicts of interest affect subject recruitment as

well as real or perceived objectivity or bias in recruitment and in analysis and reporting results (Creswell, 2014). These aspects of research behavior, along with adherence to accepted scientific practice, such as honesty in authorship, data collection, analyses and reporting, avoiding conflicts of interest of reviewers, avoiding misconduct and misbehavior and reporting it if present, all contribute to research ethics. I ensured strict compliance with these requirements.

It is therefore imperative that the research potential has sufficient quality to contribute to knowledge that justifies involving humans or animals as well as utilizing other resources. Ethical considerations help decide whether the research should even be done, and if so, how it should be pursued. Ravitch & Carl (2016) agreed that how research is conducted not only affects those directly involved, but also the public's perception of science and scientists. Results from research provide a basis for further studies, and also influence public policy and legislation. Challenges to scientific integrity can erode public confidence and belief in the findings of a work of research, hence, I maintained a transparent, competent, honest, and follow ethical rules and guidelines with regard to my research subjects. No matter how good the system intends to protect human, animal, and environmental welfare as well as encourage ethical behavior, the actual conduct of research cannot be monitored all the time. I ensured appropriate behaviors, closely monitored, and ensured strict obedience to mitigate breaches which may not be intentional, innocent misconduct, and unintentional outcomes of practices.

### **Summary and Transition**

In this Chapter 3, I have espoused the details of the study through purpose statement, present the research method, design, role of the researcher, the participation criteria selection, and population sample size. The chapter also provided explanations about data collection instruments, data organization and data analysis. In also treated issues of ethics, trustworthiness to ensure transparency and replication of the work. The activity of this chapter is leading to the next chapter to conduct the research, present the details of the results.

## **Chapter 4: Results**

### **Introduction**

In Chapter 4, the data collection, analysis, and results of the study will be discussed. The aim of this study was to understand the cause of indiscriminate urban development in this city in Niger Delta Region of Nigeria. The qualitative research method with a phenomenological study technique was used to conduct this study. Findings from the work may enhance urban planning and development to ensure sustainable development of urban centers.

### **Research Questions**

1. What are the causes of the continuous indiscriminate urban development in the city?
2. What are the effects and consequences of indiscriminate urban development of the city?

### **Setting**

My research study was approved by the Walden University IRB on February 28, 2019 via approval #02-28-19-0571210. I recruited the participants through snowball sampling. Generic mails were sent to leadership and heads of stakeholder organizations who had agreed to cooperate with me for the study. I followed up by sending letters of invitation and the IRB approved consent forms to participants in the organizations. The first 10 volunteers who returned the consent forms formed my participant pool. All the participants were resident and working in Port Harcourt City, Nigeria. I used telephone interviews to collect data from the participants between March 06 to April 02, 2019.

### **Demographics**

The 10 participants in this study were over the age of 18, and are stakeholders in the urban planning and development sector of this city in Niger Delta area, who have been in the sector for more than 5 years and above. They are drawn from stakeholder organization as follows: two government officials, two professional association leaders, two developers, one community leader, one from non-governmental organization association, and two trade unionists. Participants recruited acknowledged full understanding of the research by signing the consent form, agreeing to the telephone interview and to be recorded. A total of 20 interviews were conducted for the 10 participants with each having 2 interview sessions over a period of 2 weeks and all by phone. The data collection procedure described in Chapter 3 was consistent for all participants. I assigned each participant a seven-character data number, used same during the recording and listed them in their consent form. However, in the discussion I labeled them as Participant 1, Participant 2, and Participant 3, etc.

Participants' identification was not critical in this study, as managing their confidentiality and privacy is my responsibility as the researcher. This is an ethical standard that researcher owes participants (Stellefson et al., 2015). They all voluntarily agreed to participate in the study.

Table 8

Table showing the participants' demographics which enabled them to be chosen.

<i>Participant Description</i>			
Participant	Actors in the city	Active in the sector for more than 5 years	Experienced indiscriminate Urban development

Participant 1	Yes	28 Years	Yes
Participant 2	Yes	15 Years	Yes
Participant 3	Yes	32 Years	Yes
Participant 4	Yes	30 Years	Yes
Participant 5	Yes	10 Years	Yes
Participant 6	Yes	30 Years	Yes
Participant 7	Yes	34 Years	Yes
Participant 8	Yes	15Years	Yes
Participant 9	Yes	34 Years	Yes
Participant 10	Yes	33 Years	Yes

### **Data Collection**

I used the data collection stage to achieve the followings: (a) engagement with my participants; (b) application of interview questions; (c) data collection, analysis, and coding; and (d) interpretation and reportage of data. Based on the purposive sampling and applying the snowballing technique, I reached out to each participant who consented to be a part of the participant pool on an individual basis at different intervals by phone calls and face to face interviews. All of the participants written to, not more than 15 persons volunteered to participate in the study; hence the first 10 people who returned their consent forms were chosen. All the participants called to seek clarification.

The interviews had two sessions. Session 1 ranged from between 15 minutes to 25 minutes among the participants and included information such as description of indiscriminate development, role of stakeholders, and description of stakeholders' activities that caused indiscriminate development, the perception of how legal frameworks affected the development of the city, and what to be done to accentuate proper planning and development of Port Harcourt City.

Session 2 was between 10 minutes to 25 minutes with rephrased questions to elicit further responses from participants' personal knowledge and experiences regarding



the cause of indiscriminate urban development of this city, the participants' personal opinion on the consequences of indiscriminate urban development in the city and asked for suggestions on how to ensure sustainable urban development of the city. This session was conducted to add value to the first interview session as falsehoods, contradictions, and biases would have been detected and discarded as suspect data. I secured the data collected from the participants on my computer to ensure the accuracy of the analysis.

During the interview, introductions were exchanged with light conversation to build rapport, and make the participant comfortable with both the setting and the time to complete the interview. Privacy and confidentiality were confirmed to them. I also informed them that the interviews will be recorded electronically, the manner and duration of the storage, and the study purpose. The consent and withdrawal option were read verbatim to the participants, and they all signed the consent form.

The data collection through the telephone interviews from the participants was conducted between March 6, to April 2, 2019. I used the interview question in conducting all the interviews. See Appendix C. I took field notes in pen and paper; copied recorded data from the electronic recorder to my personal computer immediately after each interview; labeled each as Participant 1, 2, 3, etc., and securely stored and backed up the data. The interviews were transcribed verbatim within 24 hours of the data collection. At the last participant, the process has reached point of saturation as no new information was being collected.

### **Data Analysis**

In this analysis section, the data has been collected from the transcripts of the interviewees who participated in the study. I have also labeled the participants as participant 1, 2, and 3, etc. to ensure their confidentiality, privacy and protection from identification and any reprisal. I pre-coded the data to provide parameters to place emphasis on the specific data that answered the research questions. Thematic analysis with the aid of NVivo qualitative software was used as the method of analysis in the study. The NVivo software was chosen because of the reliability of its data mining capabilities. It allowed me upload the transcribed interviews in order to code the data based on themes and units of observation. These features were important because my data analysis relied on the thematic approach and the information allowed me to complete the analysis.

### **Coding**

The coding convention outlined by NVivo allows for reliable analysis of themes. This convention has been used in many other studies (Bailey et al., 2018). Data were collected and coded under 7 questions. All the same responses to each question were grouped to form codes. The sources were not further coded because the interviews were the only sources used for this study. The source data consisted of 20 audio interview recordings, which were transcribed and uploaded into NVivo. The data analysis process generated 6 thematic labels critical to the central question regarding the role of stakeholders in the indiscriminate urban development: (a) Limited knowledge, (b) Passive role, (c) Yes to experiencing the problem, (d) Yes to contributing to the problem, (e) Weak regulatory framework and (f) Synergy as what is to be done.

Table 9 showing the frequency of responses by the respondents

Frequency Table

---

<u>Codes</u>	<u>Frequency</u>
Personal knowledge (Emergent Theme)	$f=20$
Passive role (Emergent Theme)	$f=17$
Contributed to the problem (Emergent Theme)	$f=17$
Experienced the problem (Emergent Theme)	$f=17$
Weak regulation framework (Emergent Theme)	$f=15$
<u>Synergy is what is to be done (Emergent Theme)</u>	$f=14$

### Findings

I analyzed the data in sections in order to document the findings and then identify the themes. The interview process was divided into 2 sessions to ensure the provision of accurate themes from the findings that was used to answer the research questions.

Findings show the participants' responses to interview 1 as presented in Table 9.

#### Interview One

During the interview participants were asked about their personal knowledge of the indiscriminate urban development, their role and activities in the indiscriminate urban development, what developments contributed to the growth of indiscriminate urban development, the effect of regulatory framework on urban development of Port Harcourt and what they think can be done to ensure proper planning and physical development.

The transcript findings reported that all the 10 participants had limited information on the activities of stakeholders as well as acknowledged that they played critical and enormous role that contributed to the problem. Participants indicated on the recorded interview that they had in various ways contributed to the indiscriminate urban development in the city.

It was a consensus by them that weak regulatory framework and associated

implementation have affected the urban development of the city. They all believed that their different activities need awareness, collaboration and synergy to ensure sustainable development of the city.

The breakdown of coded results for interview 1 can be seen in table 10 below.

Table 10 showing participants responses in interview 1.

#### Interview 1 Responses

<b>Participants</b>	<b>Personal Knowledge</b>	<b>Role or Activities</b>	<b>Contributed to the Problem</b>	<b>Experienced the Menace</b>	<b>Regulatory Framework</b>	<b>What is to be done</b>
<b>Participant 1</b>	Limited	Passive	Yes	Yes	Weak	Synergy
<b>Participant 2</b>	Limited	Passive	Yes	Yes	Weak	Synergy
<b>Participant 3</b>	Limited	Passive	Yes	Yes	Weak	Synergy
<b>Participant 4</b>	Limited	Passive	Yes	Yes	Weak	Synergy
<b>Participant 5</b>	Limited	Passive	Yes	Yes	Weak	Synergy
<b>Participant 6</b>	Limited	Passive	Yes	Yes	Weak	Synergy
<b>Participant 7</b>	Limited	Passive	Yes	Yes	Weak	Synergy
<b>Participant 8</b>	Limited	Passive	Yes	Yes	Weak	Synergy
<b>Participant 9</b>	Limited	Passive	Yes	Yes	Weak	Synergy
<b>Participant 10</b>	Limited	Passive	Yes	Yes	Weak	Synergy

#### Interview 2

This second session of the interview process was used to elicit further information from the participants on their responses. I returned to issues already raised in the first interview session with a view to extract related new data by rephrasing my questions. This is to detect contradictions, biases and falsehoods and therefore discard suspected data. Participants were also asked to make further comment if any that was not provided in the interview questions. However, all responses from participants were the same as recorded in the first interview transcribed above.

## Themes

The data analysis process generated six thematic labels relating to the central question regarding the role of stakeholders in the indiscriminate urban development: (a) Limited knowledge, (b) Passive role, (c) Yes to experiencing the problem, (d) Yes to contributing to the problem, (e) Weak regulatory framework and (f) Synergy as what is to be done.

After coding the findings, the above themes were deduced from the data. 9 men and 1 woman participated, and all agreed that there was indiscriminate urban development in the city. Other themes found included that participants had limited personal knowledge of the activities of the stakeholders in the urban setting. The main theme discovered in the study was that all participants stated that their activity was the key factor in the cause of indiscriminate urban development of the city. This is because of their nonchalant attitude towards urban planning regulations and rules. This nonchalant attitude of their role in sustainable development is transcribed to be passive. The stakeholders from ministries, departments, and agencies of government were not serious with implementation of urban planning regulations and rules. Other stakeholders from the private sectors capitalized on the vacuum created by the public stakeholders to engage in all manners of unplanned, haphazard, and illegal development in the city.

All participants indicated that they experienced indiscriminate urban development and were unanimous in the theme of creating synergy as what is to be done to accentuate sustainable urban development in the city. Synergy in this context is the cooperation, collaboration, and engagement of all the stakeholders in the urban setting of the city.

### **Evidence of Trustworthiness**

In this study, I am solely responsible for all the numerous data collection approaches. These approaches enhanced trustworthy, steadfast, faithful and accountable data collection process, tabulation, calculation, analysis, and interpretation of the data and reporting of the findings in an objective manner (Creswell, 2014). The method and technique used in this study couple with the objective and goal of the study has underpinned the outcome of the study. I have also used Nvivo software to achieve trustworthiness. Richness of qualitative research entails that data must be coded and interpreted correctly during the collection and evaluation process to ensure a level of trustworthiness (Moretti, et al., 2011). This section was organized as stated in chapter 3 under the subsections of validity and reliability of qualitative data and ethical procedures.

#### **Validity and Reliability of Qualitative Data**

This qualitative phenomenological study has validity and reliability established through credibility, transferability, dependability, and conformability.

#### **Credibility**

Credibility is the degree to which the results of the study accurately describe the phenomenon of study. Frankfort-Nachmias, et al., (2015) argued that credibility or internal validity is one of the most important factors to establish trustworthiness and entails how the findings meet with reality. I achieved credibility through the second interview by rephrasing the questions and transcription reviews for accuracy. I also used data triangulation to add credibility by comparing the interviews of all the participants as they possess experiences about the phenomenon of study, and the emergent themes were

from their responses. Data triangulation validates data and research through cross verification of the same. I have therefore strengthened the research with increased credibility and validity of the data.

This study's credibility was also enhanced by member checking and transcript review. After transcription of data, I sent to each interviewee, copy of their respective transcript for verification to confirm that their responses were accurately captured. Confirmation about the accuracy of the transcripts enhanced the credibility of the data from which my findings were drawn.

I also used saturation to improve the credibility of this research. Merriam & Tisdell (2013) referred to saturation as the point at which the inclusion of more participants in the research will no longer produce new information and cannot change the narrative of data collected in any meaningful way. The 10 participants repeated the same things about indiscriminate urban development of the city the same way in the two interview sessions. Achieving saturation demonstrated that sufficient confirmatory support has been found for each theme which increased the legitimacy of my findings.

A final method through which I enhanced credibility was reflexivity. Petty et al., (2012) referred to reflexivity as the researcher's conscious awareness of personal biases. To mitigate this influence on the research, I used bracketing or epoché practice during the data collection by setting aside my personal biases, preconceptions, and approached the data from objective stance.

Transferability

In qualitative research, the reader has the task of determining transferability. Transferability or external validity is the extent to which the study's findings can be applied to other situations (Ravitch & Carl, 2016). This study finding will be applicable to similar urban development researches, stakeholders, and investors with similar experiences. It is accomplished when the reader agrees that the findings are sufficient and relatable with a broader applicability (Tracy, 2010).

Transferability can be established by the rich, thick description referencing the setting, the participants, and the findings of the study (Frankfort-Nachmias, et al., 2015). Qualitative researcher has the responsibility to describe the context of the study and its participants in such detail that will enable replication. In line therefore, I provided a rich, and thick description of the context of the study, the participants, and supported the findings of this work through the use of summaries of participants' interview responses for the reader to have a deep understanding of the participants' perspectives.

#### Dependability

Dependability in qualitative research entails that the study processes should be reported in detail to enable future researchers to repeat the work even though the same results will not be obtained (Creswell, 2014). I established dependability through audit trails, which involves thorough and detailed description of the methodological steps I followed in the collection of documentation for all aspects of the research. Using the audit trail, other researchers following the procedures used in this study will replicate the study, and the same emergent themes will be endorsed by other different participants to prove that the findings are accurate and stable.



## Conformability

Conformability in qualitative research is the degree to which the research results can be confirmed or corroborated by other researches (Creswell, 2014). I therefore ensured that the data and interpretations of the findings are not figment of my imagination, but clearly derived from the data. I also established conformability through reflexivity, the process of reflecting critically on myself as the researcher. Through the reflexivity strategy, I reflected on any biases that I have about the effects of the current indiscriminate urban development enveloping the city.

## Results

The results of this work are based on the NVivo analysis through the themes created from the data. I discussed the research questions and results below.

### Research Questions

1. What are the causes of the continuous indiscriminate urban development in the city?

My research finding showed accurately what other researchers had expressed in the literature review that stakeholders are critical players in the urban setting hence their role and activities determines and influence the urban setting. Stone (2014) in postulating the Urban Regime Theory stated that the urban setting is ruled by a governing coalition comprising business, civil society and government. The coalition actors are the stakeholders, whose interests are divergent and conflicting. My literature revealed that ministries, departments, and agencies of State Government in the urban sector, greater city development authority, professional associations, estate developers and managers,

community members, artisans, international oil companies, non-governmental organizations (NGO's), transporters, and religious organization are the stakeholders in the city urban setting. The theory entails that stakeholders must work together cooperatively and collaboratively toward some end. In this city's urban setting, the regime theory principle of cooperation and collaboration among stakeholders was missing. The failure of the stakeholders to cooperate and collaborate promoted indiscriminate development in the city. This disconfirm with the principle that they must cooperate for regime to exist.

The city has corporate / development regime that is characterized with sporadic growth and development. My results showed that the stakeholders acted independently to pursue their individual self-interests. That prompted them to disregard the city's regulatory framework, thus promoting haphazard urban development.

I also discovered that the stakeholders tried to justify their informal relationship with provision of infrastructures, socio-economic, and educational support. My literature review contended that this policy gave business prominence. The stakeholders benefit from this informal arrangement, and acted independently to pursue their individual self-interests. Stone (2014) in the regime theory contended that capitalized profit accrued to the state, and a web of other stakeholders. All the participants in their responses believed that business induced crises of indiscriminate urban development in the city with their activities. This confirms with the characteristics of corporate / development regime theory which promote growth for the major corporations in a city, without corresponding consideration for the poor and distressed areas in the city.

Not every city has an urban regime. However, this city has a development regime. The regime theory advocated that for urban regime to exist there must be laws. In the present context, there are stakeholders who make laws in the city setting. The ministries, departments, and agencies particularly the Ministry of Urban Development and Physical planning created the rules, regulations, and policies guiding the urban setting of the city. The implementation of these laws will ensure sustainable development of the city. There are avalanche of literature which proved the existence of these laws. All the participants acknowledged the availability of relevant laws to accentuate sustainable development in the city. My findings have established that there are laws for planning and development of the city which are meant to guide the actions of the stakeholders. Their lack of cooperation and collaboration lead to weak regulatory operation in the city.

It is in this stead that experts have argued that their perception of what happens in the urban setting is determined by their interest. It implies that their knowledge is based on what interest they are protecting and therefore limited. Their personal knowledge of what constitutes indiscriminate urban development in my finding is the emergent theme which occupied a significant position. All the participants responded to having limited knowledge of it. Since the stakeholders who are supposed to control, protect, supervise, and monitor the spate of development in the urban setting of the city have limited knowledge about the subject of indiscriminate urban development, it follows that they cannot deliver on development control. In the literature, I took a painstaking effort to determine what the stakeholders are supposed to do that will ensure sustainable development and what they are doing that contribute and promote indiscriminate urban

development. Participants reported in the interview that stakeholders lack knowledge about what is expected from them in the discharge of their responsibilities. My findings revealed that stakeholders from the ministries, departments, and agencies do not know that they are to provide a lead that will ensure the cooperation and collaboration of others. My further finding revealed that they do not believe in the regulatory framework, as they disregard development plans, give approvals without recourse to development plan, engage in corrupt practices, do not implement, and enforce necessary sanctions as at when due, do not ensure compliance with the laws, and this ignorance contributed to the indiscriminate urban development witnessed in the city. On the part of business, it was more interested in satisfying its interest. The activities of developers is all about building to maximize profit irrespective of the land use of what they are building and where. The community members were interested in the sale of land without ensuring that the land is supposed to be planned in line with land use application for sustainable development. The transporters and artisans preoccupation is the proliferation of motor parks and markets without a concurrent determination of the effect of the development. From the above, I have ample evidence that the governing coalition actors were preoccupied with actualization of their divergent interests. Participant #1 wanted me to know that the critical stakeholders are too powerful because they exert too much pressure and influence on the system. Participant #4 stated that:

All the stakeholders have a role to play in the urban setting, failure to positively play their roles led to where we are in today, because their non-compliance to appropriate plan, regulations, laws, and policies amounted to indiscriminate urban development that we enjoy.

All the participants in their responses agreed that they had limited knowledge about what their role should be, and that their passive roles and various activities contributed to the indiscriminate urban development. The regime theory earlier analyzed that the relationship among actors influenced decision making of the urban setting as it is a complex interaction of politics, business, and civil society in the urban management.

The regime theory according to Stone (2014) aggregated power structure in the urban governing coalition in the free-market economy where powers are fragmented and resources dispersed between private actors and government as they collaborate and depend on each other to govern. Stone as cited by Camou (2014) argued that government is an inadequate problem solver. May & Jochim (2013) summed that the impacts of public policy depends on complementary actions from the private players. Regime theory reliance on social production and collaboration between government and private ensured that fragmented powers and resources are aligned to accomplish various interests and weaken the institutions of state.

The availability and existence of regulatory framework of laws, regulations, and policies guiding the urban setting of the city has been acknowledged. It is argued by scholars that stakeholders disregard the regulatory framework which resulted to great negative implication for the urban landscape. The participants responded that stakeholders acted in total and direct contravention of the regulations, laws, and policies. This disregard and contravention is evidence of lack of cooperation and collaboration among the stakeholders and is against the regime theory principle of cooperation and collaboration among the governing coalition actors. The failure to cooperate and

collaborate is one way through which they caused indiscriminate development in the city. I found out that the different stakeholders were behaving in ways that are incongruent with urban planning.

This confirmed the extensive findings of earlier studies in which concerns were noted about the collaboration, powers, and resources sharing between state and private (Owie & Obinna, 2014). Wike (2015); and Igwe (2017) posited that significant information abound about stakeholder's attitude to laws and regulations and the need to abide by the various rules and regulations guiding our urban setting. Participant #9 told me that enough attention has not been paid to regulatory framework as they are not been enforced due to lack of political will and rampant corruption in the system. Participant #10 stated that limited implementation of the laws, rules, regulations, and policies of urban planning and development is the foundation of indiscriminate urban development of our city.

In the assessment of Jones-Correa & Wong (2015), this collaboration was not taken as needed by state, but as given by private. Regime concept is informal because it is entered by networks of informal actors who are riding on the back of state to satisfy their interest. In this research, I find out that it is emphatic that stakeholders as informal actors with their divergent interests do not believe in the regulatory framework because they did not contribute to its making. Participant #2 shared the sentiment clearly when he said that:

The stakeholders from government ministries, departments and agencies are responsible for the weak regulatory framework which led to massive disobedience and eventually caused the

indiscriminate urban development.

Participant #3 likened the weakness in the regulatory framework as the product of the political class that circumvents laws to satisfy political pressure coupled with poor funding associated with state agencies as being responsible for poor urban planning and management in the state. Participant #4 told me that the theme of regulatory framework has two dimensional effects on the urban setting. He contended that regulatory framework has affected the city positively in the planned areas because of laws and policies, while the unplanned areas are the products of weak regulatory frameworks with its consequences of haphazard and unplanned development.

It can be recalled that Stone (2014) concluded that this informal arrangement had presented needed platforms that accentuate an understanding among the stakeholders. All participants expressed extreme remorse and regret for their inactions that resulted in the problem. Most participants recounted their difficulties and frustrations in urban planning and management as it is today. Some reported feelings of helplessness, worthless, and other self-degrading feelings of outcast in the urban setting. Participant #7 suggested the declaration of emergency in the urban sector of the city. The government is supposed to provide the lead and platform that will ensure engagement of all stakeholders, he stated.

The regime theory framework linked the many aspects of urban governance by engendering cross sectoral and intergovernmental coalition building in the urban setting. Studies has shown that government as agent and catalyst for development advances policies and programs that benefits society through the other partners in economic development, human capital, security and crime prevention, as well as environmental

protection issues. My findings supports the position of regime theory because government leadership in the urban landscape is derived by statute of constitutionalism through the provisions of the Land Use Act 1978, whose provisions vested with the governor all lands in a state. The state therefore has authority to engage all the stakeholders and form a synergy that can address the urban problem. Participant #4 responded that regular, comprehensive, and effective enforcement of urban planning can be the product of synergy of all stakeholders. He reaffirmed that:

Synergy is the beginning of the success of sustainable development through periodic review of master plans, create development control mechanism, establish physical planning authorities and appropriately approve land use.

Participant #5 stated that lack of political will, policy inconsistency, and absence of engagement of the stakeholders is the reason for our city's degradation, and we can change the narratives through synergy of all the actors in the urban setting. In his comments, Participant #6 opined that once the full structure of physical planning is put to use in the state, indiscriminate urban development will give way. Implementation will have all the stakeholders engaged, and this engagement must be through an open, transparent, and fully participatory process as any one ignored might be the most important in the setting. He used the metaphor of a school setting where the school authority asked his 9 year old daughter what she want done in the school. It is because the authorities realized that she is a key stakeholder and used the principle of engagement. Further findings shows that the bane of the Greater City Master Plan is that key



engagement of the stakeholders was not activated, after all life is for the living and planning is life.

2. What are the effects and consequences of indiscriminate urban development of this city?

My findings in this research is in complete agreement with what other researchers revealed that socio-economic, environmental, and health related issues are the consequences and effects of indiscriminate urban development. Regime theory emphasized that sustainable urban governance must draw a balance between urban environment and socio-economic activities. This is because an integrative framework of laws, regulations, policies, institutions, administration, public-private partnership, technologies, global environmental sustainability and economic linkages, and coordination among stakeholders depends on the necessary strategic management tools. These operations require the organization of multiform partnerships of adhesion, mobilization of a large number of actors which includes initiators, supporters, entertainers, local communities, state, professional, as well as economic, cultural, and social environment.

Results of the interaction will include exciting sustainable development. they are social cohesion, pollution control, greater coherence of the city, dynamic neighborhoods, and improved trade services (Gani, 2015); protection of natural, social, cultural, and built heritage (Alnsour (2016); diversification of activities, improving recreation, education, and entertainment facilities (Emenike & Sampson, 2017); increasing the city's attractiveness and improving image of the city (Tsavdaridou& Metaxas, 2015): job

opportunities development, informing, reorientation and training of citizens, creating and structuring partnerships for sustainable development (Stone, 2014 ). All the participants responded that as stakeholder they are key players of development in the urban setting because they have interest in city development. Stone (2014) acknowledged these interests because of the advantages they possess in the relationship. Participant #4 in his own comments agreed that all the stakeholders as actors in the urban setting of the city have realized their role in creating the indiscriminate development is affecting the citizenry negatively. Participant #9 believed that the strong role available for stakeholders were not utilized, and the passive nonchalant attitude adopted by them lead to ineffective city management with its negative consequences. Participant #2 recollected a personal life experience about urban development:

I remember vividly in the early 70s when my father tried adding a projection to one of his properties along Ikwerre road, he was stopped, made to pay a fine and the cost of removal of the illegal structure based on the urban regulations.

Participant #8 stated that as stakeholders, they are part of the public authority that should seek to shape, regulate, and stimulate the real estate development so that developers, land owners, and funders who are also stakeholders would see real benefits in the creation of better urban places because investment in urban sustainability is the driving force for economic development.

Previous researches stated that stakeholders' cooperation and collaboration in urban development is necessary because population growth in the urban landscape must occur on land which is under constant pressure for the use of basic infrastructure. The

challenge on land-use in the urban sector is very critical and high. My literature indicated that the difficult situation of poor urban management and policy failure led the city to be characterized with haphazard urbanization process which resulted to population expansion and inadequate housing. All the participants reckoned that the vast majority of urban residents and rural migrants ventured into informal land and housing developments. My findings showed that these unfavorable conditions led to massive socioeconomic and indiscriminate development of uncontrolled urban sprawl, deterioration of open spaces, transport problems of inaccessibility, chaotic traffic congestion, motor parks in all the roads, markets in all the streets, and total breakdown of law and order in the urban setting.

The urban regime theory entails that stakeholders are key players of development in the urban setting with interest in city development. Stone (2014) acknowledged these interests because of the advantages they possess in the relationship. The city regime theory as earlier stated is corporate / development regime theory. It has witnessed sporadic growth and development which is anchor for indiscriminate urban development. The stakeholders' enormous activities provided education, employment, services, and capital investments. The businesses as stakeholders in the urban setting with public institutions have tried to justify their relationship with provision of infrastructures, socio-economic, and educational support to the communities with governments exhibiting weakness. Earlier researches posited that this weakness is because of the neoliberal policies used to govern developments through which business gain prominence.

The regime theory principle stated state and business use this informal arrangement to benefit themselves. All the participants agreed that business induced crises of indiscriminate urban development through their activities. This is in line with the characteristics of corporate / development regime theory which promoted growth for the business in a city and care less for the poor and distressed areas in the city. It is therefore my contention that business in the environmental relationship has shifted from interest group to a privilege position.

It is therefore, the limited knowledge about what constitute indiscriminate urban development, how through their inaction, and their passive roles that stakeholders allowed skepticism and indifference to envelope the urban setting that caused the indiscriminate urban development of the city, Nigeria.

### **Summary**

For this study, perception of 10 stakeholders in the urban sector were explored about the cause of indiscriminate urban development and its effects on the sustainable development of the city. The in depth semi-structured interviews were transcribed and analyzed. Themes were identified through the phenomenological method and NVivo software which I used to code and answer the research questions. The first research question, what are the causes of the continuous indiscriminate urban development in the city had answers from participants revealing that they are critical players as the governing coalition actors deriving power from the informal relationship in the urban setting. It well established their activities determined and influenced the urban setting. My findings showed and proved that pursuit of divergent interests beclouded them from realizing that

they have enormous role placed on them by regime theory. Consequently, their limited knowledge deprived them from working cooperatively, unable to provide a synergy that will ensure collaboration to monitor, supervise, and control development. The second research question, what are the effects and consequences of indiscriminate urban development of the city, equally had answers from data showing that socioeconomic, environmental and health related issues are the consequences and effects of indiscriminate urban.

## **Chapter 5: Discussion, Conclusions, and Recommendations.**

### **Introduction**

The purpose of this qualitative study was to explore the cause of indiscriminate urban development of a Niger Delta City in Nigeria and its attendant effects and consequences. The phenomenon was studied through data obtained by telephone interview of 10 stakeholders in the sector who are above 18 years old, and practicing in the city with over 5 years of experience in their respective organizations.

The findings generated from this study will contribute to the literature on urban development and sustainable development, particularly the role of stakeholders. This chapter will include a focus on the implications and insights of the study findings.

I placed the themes derived from the participants' responses as drivers of proactive urban planning that drive sustainable development into the urban setting of the city and other urban climes. The key findings of this study included six major themes of: (a) limited knowledge, (b) passive role, (c) yes to experiencing the problem, (d) yes to contributing to the problem, (e) weak regulatory framework and (f) synergy as what is to be done.

### **Interpretation of the Findings**

The concept of sustainable development was propagated more than 20 year ago by the United Nations under the aegis of Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Scholars have debated the achievability of the sustainable development goals and some have taken positions that sustainable development cannot be achieved economically, environmentally, and socially simultaneously (Towah, 2019). Wike (2015) argued that to

avoid compromising our society, people must do what is required as the needs of society are ever changing.

Sustainable development has continued to enjoy the support from the international community. Anan (2012) posited that the world cannot continue acting, producing, and consuming unsustainably; hence, society needs to act immediately primarily on water, energy, human health, and biodiversity needs for the world to achieve sustainable development. These needs are products of environmental sustainable development. The city went through an evolutionary trend of planned and developed city. The city may rise again from the indiscriminate urban development and implement planned development, good governance in the urban setting, and sustainable development. Efforts are geared towards resuscitating and recovering the garden city.

The theoretical framework for this study was the urban regime theory (URT) by Stone (2014). The theory includes dependence on the private sector participating in the urban management. In the theory, Stone portrayed regime theory as an examination of the relationship between business and government in the urban setting. The regime theory is used to analyze the relationship among actors who influence decision making of the urban setting. It is a complex interaction of politics, business, and civil society in the management of an urban area. This informal arrangement presented platform that accentuate an understanding among the stakeholders.

### **Theme 1: Limited Knowledge**

The interplay between stakeholders in an urban setting is a concern in urban planning. Stakeholders' understanding of the subject can be limited, restricted, confined;

and narrow (Smit, 2018). Experts have argued that stakeholders' knowledge of the urban setting is important in sustainable development. In this research, all of the participants confirmed that they had limited knowledge of what is expected from them in the discharge of their responsibilities. Ministries, departments, and agencies do not understand certain aspects of the governance processes to function adequately; hence, many cases of fragmentation and a lack of coordination between urban coalition actors.

All the government stakeholders can play role in governing urban setting. Limited knowledge of the government stakeholders is the product of weak, disorganized, inadequately trained human power, negligence, and corrupt practices. The case of this city reflects the typical complexity of Africa urban governance. The urban planning laws were created and administered by the state unlike other climes where it is a local affair. Although it was meant to have a municipal board (Urban and Town Planning Law, 2003) the Governor of Rivers State has not officially established this board because it is a not priority because it was a local government issue. State agencies like Water Board whose objective is to produce water, Greater City Development Authority with a mandate to deliver a new city, and State Housing and Property Development Authority with housing projects also play direct role in the city. For example, the Ministry of Land and Survey allocates land within the city area and do not allocate according to approved land-use. The activities of these state agencies do not fall into the line of urban planning. The above scenario limits the capacity of the government stakeholders to have optimal knowledge of urban planning and development.



Also, the role of these stakeholders is often further complicated by the lack of will as it allows the patronage system of political parties to influence its processes and procedures (Obeng-Odoom, 2017). The political patronage system enables political parties that focus on providing benefits to their constituents and do not focus on the procedures for implementation of urban planning. This encouraged haphazard, unplanned and illegal development in the city. All of the participants responded that indiscriminate development assumed an unprecedented proportion since the advent of the current political dispensation in the state because the political office holders will not allow the real urban planning process to be followed. This deprivation limits the knowledge of the stakeholders.

A typical characteristic of urban governance is the role played by community leaders in urban governance. There are 40 communities in the city with leadership that do not have any formal training or experience in urban planning, but have vantage position because of the virgin land in their communities that is purchased by other stakeholders for purposes of development. The community leaders as stakeholders sell land to those who want to engage in development despite the land-use. If properly planned by the relevant stakeholders and communicated through cooperation, collaboration, and synergy will engender sustainable development. Their lack of knowledge or limited knowledge by their indisposition to urban regulations present a scenario where they allow, encourage, and support the building of shanties, and unplanned, unapproved, haphazard, and illegal structures. In most cases they supervise the building on setbacks and sanitary lanes that are supposed to be for infrastructural facilities of drainages, culverts, telephone, and

electricity. All of the participants agreed that the community leaders' ignorance and lack of knowledge in urban planning and development is also a cause of indiscriminate development in all of the areas of the city where planning have not been done.

Private sector organizations play a role in urban governance. Stone (2014) asserted that regime theory is an examination of the relationship between business and government in the urban sector. This regime principle placed expectations on the private sector. The private sector is the major partner to government in the urban setting. The private sector should be interested and supportive of urban planning procedures. This interest will equip the private sector with adequate knowledge of urban planning. Attainment of its interest is the primary objective of the private sector, and to achieve it, they circumvent urban planning regulations. The participants admitted that the private sector do not support urban planning because they subvert the sector by not adhering to the regulations, do not develop based on land use, do not seek for approval, and use corrupt practices to get their ways in the urban setting. Participant #10 explained the private sectors' display of lack of knowledge:

Their actions are damaging to the poor, as they force them off their land, prevent informal trading which they perceive as opposition to their dominance, use all manners of inducement to manipulate the civil servants to get on the other side of the divide.

Developers play a role in the urban transformation of Port Harcourt City through investment in large development projects, estates, and shopping malls etc. The influence of these stakeholders on the government stakeholders is found not to follow urban planning regulations. Also, informal business plays a role in urban governance. Their

lack of knowledge is evident by the ways through which they carry out their activities. Owei and Wokekoro (2014) posited that this group has succeeded in converting every available setbacks on the major roads and streets into markets; hence, there are more informal illegal trading points than designated markets in the city.

Stakeholders' perception of what happens in the urban setting is determined by their interest. Their knowledge is based on what interest they are protecting. Their personal knowledge of what constitutes indiscriminate urban development in the findings was an emergent. All of the participants responded that they have limited knowledge. The stakeholders are supposed to control, protect, supervise, and monitor the spate of development in the urban setting of the city have limited knowledge about the subject of indiscriminate urban development; hence, they could not deliver on development control. I have made efforts to determine what the stakeholders are supposed to do to ensure sustainable development and what they did that contributed and promoted indiscriminate urban development. Participants agreed that the stakeholders lacked the knowledge about what is expected from them in the discharge of their responsibilities. My findings revealed that stakeholders from the ministries, departments, and agencies do not know that they are to provide a lead that will ensure the cooperation and collaboration of others.

A proactive system projects, anticipates, and plan for the needs of society to evolve development that targets the future needs. This is necessary to sustainable development. People within a framework should know the body of rules, procedures, and operations of the sector or institutions in order to deliver reliable, quality, effective, and efficient services. It means that public administration that collect revenues should do so

honestly; allocate, and invest the funds wisely, and manage the public goods of land and natural resources. The urban development initiatives in the city have created major impacts and push for sustainable development.

My finding confirms the believe that coalition actors or stakeholders are the decisions makers whose actions influences and determines what happens in the urban setting. Their behavior in the urban setting is determined by their interest. I conclude that their knowledge is based on what interest they are protecting and therefore limited.

The city urban setting provided an environment for its stakeholders to take active part in decision making, and plan for its sustainability. However, this active decision making was not made; hence, the desired impact was not also made for the City. I therefore canvas for inclusivity in urban planning as the key to service delivery. Urban planning is an interdisciplinary field that encompasses social, engineering, and design sciences. It is also a technical and political process whose major preoccupation is the design, planning, and development of land use to ensure a sustainable built environment for physical layout of human settlements that ensures public welfare, protection of the environment, social, and economic engagement.

The usage of this interdisciplinary field guided the orderly development in the rural, suburban, and urban areas of the city. Active practice of the discipline brought about the planning of settlements, communities, and is responsible for the planning and development of infrastructural facilities of water uses, electricity, telephone, parks and recreations, agricultural land, and conservation of natural environment.

All of the participants in their responses believed that limited knowledge ( $f=20$ ) of what constitutes indiscriminate urban development was responsible for their role ( $f=17$ ); hence, their activities contributed to the problem ( $f=17$ ). Practicing urban planning is devoid of any particular discipline, but the synergy and active engagement of stakeholders ( $f=14$ ) by the institutions undertaking the out development is paramount. However, the limited knowledge of the stakeholders did not motivate and encourage the participation of the private sector in the planning of key initiatives that will ensure sustainable development.

The stakeholders must be concerned with research and analysis, strategic thinking, public consultation, policy recommendations, implementation, and management to ensure effective enforcement of the rules, procedure, and operations of urban planning.

**Thematic Label 2: Passive role.**

The stakeholders are the actors in the urban setting, whose roles intertwine, influence, and determine the outcome of urban development. They are supposed to participate actively in the urban planning process. As active participants, they are of the team to organize, plan, and work together to accomplish the goals of sustainable development. However, passive people are docile, waiting for miracle to happen. The stakeholders in the city urban setting adopted a complacent, lackadaisical, docile and passive attitude towards the planning and development of the city. They didn't understand their role in the urban setting; hence, their behavior was as if nothing was happening in the sector or it did not concern them. There was cooperation and

collaboration among the stakeholders to ensure effective planning rather they were interested in their individual objectives.

I used this qualitative study to explore and determine the role and activities of the stakeholders in the indiscriminate urban development of the city. Their passive role ( $f=17$ ) was a most used phrase in the participants' response, and it was an answer to the research problem of indiscriminate urban development of the city. Urban management is intended to ensure effective and efficient use of land space through optimal planning and development for the betterment of society. To achieve this, requires involvement and creating a synergy of all stakeholders ( $f=14$ ).

All the participants discussed the role of the stakeholders and agreed that it was necessary to ensure sustainable development in the city. Participant #2 opined that the urban government should be open, supportive of informal actors, with appropriate mechanisms for their participation in policy-making, and implementation of urban setting activities because the activities of all the stakeholders if well harnessed would have prevented the indiscriminate development in the city. Participant #7 stated that society will benefit from the opportunities of active stakeholders' participation. The strong social capital from the structure of society that will be connected would have made their voices heard by members of society and policy makers.

An open democratic system encourages participation to grow interactions between policy, legal provisions, and elements of the micro context with all of the facilitators from local officials, community, and professional organizations to result in efficiency and effectiveness of urban management (Malik, 2017). All of the participants

agreed that active participation in urban management leads to sustainability in the environment. Participant #6 called for a holistic approach that will integrate all stakeholders in solving the problems confronting the urban areas. All of the parties must make contribution to the planning, not the passive role that stakeholders displayed that created the indiscriminate urban development.

The participants discussion of their passive role ( $f=17$ ) in the urban setting agreed that their participation as necessary from the beginning. Their participation would have ensured contributions that would lead to realization of the full benefit of urban planning and development to the city. Participant #7 stated that they were indifferent and each has their own disposition of engagement, indiscriminate development took over the city. Participant #9 believed that the role available for stakeholders was not utilized. The passive nonchalant attitude adopted by stakeholders lead to ineffective city management. The correct and optimum role is based on individual understanding and working together to ensure that their activities lead to sustainable development.

### **Thematic Label 3: Yes to experiencing the problem**

The incidence of noncompliance with urban rules and regulations is a ubiquitous problem in the city urban setting. This problem of lawlessness by the stakeholders is the product of the passive role and indifference exhibited by them. The lead stakeholders in the city urban setting include the government ministries, departments, and agencies. These lead stakeholders did not provide leadership that would have engaged other stakeholders for cooperation and collaboration. The inability to engage created a situation where all of the stakeholders operated individually to satisfy their personal objective.

This did not confirm to Stone (2014) assertion that the stakeholders as governing coalition actors come together to influence and determine the activities of the urban setting. All of the participants confirmed that because there was no engagement and collaboration, the stakeholders have limited knowledge about the rules and regulations of the urban sector. The situation led to misdemeanor like corrupt practices, negligence, insubordination, nepotism, absence from work, fake and illegal approval, developing against urban laws, allowing trading on unauthorized places, and setting up motor parks in every junction. The absence of synergy in the sector made the issue of controlling, supervising, and monitoring of physical development in the city very difficult. The human power from the lead stakeholder was not sufficient to contend with the rapid growth enveloping the city. Despite the availability of regulatory framework to guide planning and development in the city, indiscriminate development continued because all of the other stakeholders were not carried along by the lead stakeholder.

All of the participants acknowledged that they experienced the problem. They reported experiencing the problem ( $f=17$ ) in all aspects of the city life. Participants described the experiences as excruciating and frustrating. Participant #10 recounted the implication of building close to drainage without allowing setback as required by urban regulatory framework until the heavy rains of September to December, 2012. The experiences are almost the same for many of the participants as they have experienced the problem in one form or the other. Participant #4 explained that he lack words to explain his ordeal from the activities of a motor park he helped got approval against town planning rules. Participant #7 feel disappointed that due to ignorance he assisted a friend



to setup an auto mechanic workshop in a planned residential area against all the rules, complains by the residents association, and reports of his subordinates. The auto shop has converted the area to a auto mechanic village. The reports from all of the participants gave tales of regrets over their roles ( $f=17$ ). These real life experiences of the problem ( $f=17$ ) has come to terms with the reality of the fact that they contributed to the problem ( $f=17$ ). The flashbacks about the actions they took as stakeholders in the creation of indiscriminate development in the city is giving them feeling of negative self-awareness.

The effects of the indiscriminate development are felt both at homes and offices. According to the participants, they started understanding and feeling the pains of the indiscriminate development as they experience the consequences and realized how difficult it was living with it. Participant #9 remembered the period when urban rules and regulations were the determinants for development in the city. He recollected vividly in the 70s when his father tried adding a projection to one of his properties along a major road, the development was stopped and the illegal structure removed, the father paid fine and cost of removal of the illegal structure based on urban regulations. Chaos has become the order of the day as planning is no longer part of urban development.

Assessing the city using the infrastructural, environmental, and socio-economic indicators, the urban planning and development regulatory frameworks showed there are impressive achievements. In its 100 years of its existence, the city has witnessed tremendous urban planning and development which culminated to growth, infrastructural development, and economic fortunes before the downwards trends. The problem of

indiscriminate development has its consequences of haphazard and unplanned development, poor housing system, and poor drainage system (Owei & Obinna, 2014). Jam packed and chaotic traffic situation, land misuse, lack of greenery, overcrowded roads, market and motor parks streets (Owei & Wokekoro, 2014). Poor urban serenity, poor sanitary conditions, lack of access to water, poor health care facilities, and poor educational facilities (Igwe, 2017). This situation is staring all the stakeholders at their faces; hence, the acknowledgement of yes to experiencing the problem ( $f=17$ ).

**Thematic Label 4: Contributing to the problem.**

The stakeholders adopted passive role that contributed to the problem through their inactions. It is alleged that they gave tacit support by not discouraging the haphazard, unplanned, and illegal development. The lead stakeholder (government) did not provide room for engagement and collaboration among the stakeholders. Other stakeholders did not get adequate knowledge about the rules and regulations of the urban sector and therefore did not also provide support to the urban mechanism. This created a passive role for the stakeholders in urban management and resulted to misdemeanors of corrupt practices, negligence, insubordination, nepotism, and absence from work. Also, fake and illegal approval, development against urban laws, allowing trading on unauthorized places, and setting up motor parks at every junction became the order of the day leading to continuous indiscriminate urban development of the city.

A system can be said to be effective when it has the capacity to formulate policies that essentially advance its course and sustain development. An active system must anticipate and respond to evolving challenges. This is accomplished through deliberate,

targeted, and proactive planning to ensure effective delivery which is missing in the city urban system. The finding in this thematic label showed that effective contribution of the stakeholders that will ensure planned development for the city was missing. The stakeholders are institutions that must deliver reliable and quality services for their various interests, just as the public management regime must be accommodating for efficiency and effectiveness of greater public good. Development initiatives must therefore be paramount to the system players. There are evidence to show that collaboration and synergy from the stakeholders was missing ( $f=14$ ). The synergy would have ensured that effective urban planning devoid of individual interest.

Finding showed further that there are competing interests of business and government in the urban setting. It is the contended that all of the stakeholders as actors are constrained by their institutional environments that influence their behavior in the urban governance. All of the participants expressed reservation and frustrations that their demeanor was contributing to the indiscriminate urban development of the city. Their responses were consistent with each other. Participant #5 explained how he found himself in a very difficult situation over an indiscriminate development that he had to contend with and described contributions from stakeholders as abysmal failure. Participant #6 described stakeholders' contribution to the problem ( $f=17$ ) as very nauseating they allowed their individual interests to prevail over and above the corporate interest of the city. It was agreed that the missing point was because there was no meeting point.

Participant #4 observed that all of the stakeholders as actors in the urban setting of Port Harcourt are disappointment to themselves. This is their actions and attitude that contributed the malady that the city is witnessing. Participant #8 betrayed his emotion in his description of the feeling upon realization that he has contributed to the problem of indiscriminate development of the city as a stakeholder. He described his generation of stakeholders in the city as failures who didn't live up to their responsibilities as leaders. Participant #2 observed stated that their contributions to the problem cannot be divorced from their lack of knowledge because they were not taken on board; hence, they didn't have commitment to the urban setting. Participant #7 acknowledged that the city is the desired destination. This is because of the aesthetic skyline, serene landscape, free flowing traffic, land-use built up, the hospitable nature, and economic importance to all. However, the stakeholders' indifference and lack of support to the control and supervising mechanism contributed to the unplanned and haphazard development witnessed in the city. I contended that all of the stakeholders played role that contributed to the indiscriminate urban development of the city because their passive attitude did not discourage the activities of illegal and haphazard development.

All of the stakeholders were engaged in competing and divergent indiscriminate development particularly between the government and native communities. Participant #2 stated that for more 20 years, that the government has not undertaken urban planning, rather native planning by communities in the city. There is no physical planning, but building plan approval. Participant #1 agreed with the observation, he opined further that is one of causes of the failure of the Master Plan of 1975, just as the 2009 Greater City

Plan has also not taken off. There is the need to integrate the 1975 plan and the 2009 plan so that the city can be opened up. Participant #10 commented that commercial activities overtook residential development in the city due to the activities of the informal sector. The sector was spreading at a fast rate as the sector that provides easy employment to the large number of job seekers in the town.

**Thematic Label 5: Weak regulatory framework.**

The city has a development regime with stakeholders who make laws for her. Stone (2014) stated that for urban regime to exist there must be laws. The laws are made by the ministries, departments, and agencies of government. The laws are implemented to ensure sustainable development of the city. It is attested to that there urban planning and development laws are available for the city. The participants confirmed the existence of laws to ensure sustainable development of the city. I have established that the planning and development sector of the city has laws to ensure her development. The application of these laws is the missing pin. This led to the weak regulatory operation in the city.

Participants reported that the weak regulatory operation is based stakeholders limited knowledge about the sector. My finding revealed that the lead stakeholder (government) was not able to provide the lead to ensure the cooperation and collaboration of others based on its limited knowledge of the working mechanism of urban planning. The lead stakeholder further weakened the laws due to lackadaisical implementation of the regulatory framework by disregarding development plan, gave approvals without recourse to development plan, engage in corrupt practices, do not implement and enforce necessary sanctions as at when due, do not ensure compliance with the laws. All of the

other stakeholders like the business community were interested in satisfying its interest, and capitalized on the inherent weakness exhibited the lead stakeholder to work against the laws. Developers were interested in commencing and completing their projects at the shortest possible time frame, so they exploited the opened window to undertake development against the dictates of the laws. Communities found allies in the poor implementation of the laws and exploited same to their advantage. The transporters and artisans enjoyed the weak application of the laws, they proliferate motor parks and markets indiscriminately at every open space and junction within the city. Inability to provide leadership for implementation of the regulatory framework elicited spontaneous reaction of disobedience which led to weak regulatory operation. Stakeholders' non-compliance to appropriate plan, regulations, laws, and policies contributed to the indiscriminate urban development. This is because the development actions that the stakeholders embarked were not in conformity with the laws and are therefore against the laws.

It is contended that disregard of the laws by stakeholders resulted to great negative implication in the city urban sector. The participants were unanimous in their responses about this contention as they acted in total and direct contravention of the regulations, laws, and policies. Stone (2014) posited that urban regime presents a platform for the governing actors to determine and influence the outcome in the urban setting. This platform ensures cooperation and collaboration that develops synergy for all to actively participate. Disregarding and contravening of the laws is evidence of lack of

cooperation and collaboration among the actors. The failure to cooperate and collaborate consequently contributed to the indiscriminate development in the city.

This thematic label has adherence to rule of law by instituting laws, regulations, rules, and policy frameworks that will enhance good urban governance and ensure sustainable development. Good governance as catalyst to sustainable development holds the key to building stable and secure environment and society through inclusive growth. Strong regulatory framework provides fair, accountable, and reliable institutions that bind the stakeholders together. Regulatory frameworks in the urban setting are necessary regulations, relevant rules, laws, policies, and associated regulatory bodies.

The place of urban regulatory frameworks in the diverse societal endeavors cannot be over emphasized because these frameworks outline the measures of burden through which activities in the urban sector are guided, supervised, controlled, monitored and operated upon. Stakeholders are aware of these frameworks when they begin to operate in the sector. Organizations need these regulatory frameworks to understand the procedures that must be followed because the regulatory framework outlines the stipulations to be followed in order to be properly registered and operate legally.

Compared to other sectors, the urban regulatory framework is vibrant; such that individuals who run against the system has penalty to contend by facing the law. Though, the process has been not without shortcomings. For instance, some of the laws, policies, and regulations are becoming obsolete, grossly outdated and traceable to the pre independence era and requires changes, but support and obedience is the critical issue that needs to remain steadfast in ensuring that the environment becomes accommodative

of everybody for peaceful co-existence, effective, and efficient urban planning and development. Also some issues in the urban regulation framework as far as the city is concerned has posed a critical challenge, especially relating to sustainable engagements and synergy ( $f=14$ ). Legislation appertaining to environment protection seems inadequate as provisions fall short of current realities. For an example, land use policy is disjointed and barely followed.

I had earlier revealed that the principles of urban regime theory stated that all actors in the urban setting are critical coalition members. This has increased the number of stakeholders in urban management. This rising number seems unmanageably with the urban setting as they have resorted to abandonment of master plans for more flexible and incremental planning thereby shifting attention from predominant state planning to coalition actors planning. Participant # 5 lamented that the urban sector in the city accounts for more than two third of the state internally generated revenue and employs about one million people directly and indirectly with thousands of laborers. The sector has grown rapidly with associated cost to environmental standards.

There are weak regulatory framework ( $f=15$ ) to enforce the environmental standards to accentuate sustainable development. Urban regulatory framework in the city is good as they are meant to fulfill the purpose for which they were enacted. Their usefulness and functionality is encapsulated in the descriptions of their key objectives in creating planned land-use that enable the guidance and control of orderly growth of towns and cities in Rivers State. Participant #7 observed that the implementation of measures within the framework of urban planning and development policy is



characterized by inefficiency and poor work outcome. This is because no coordinated overall strategy is in the system to meet the challenges of the sector. Participant #3 suggested the need for the creation of appropriate mechanism to ensure that the planning and development dimension is integrated into a synergy ( $f=14$ ). This will bring all stakeholders to engage, collaborate, and live up to their responsibility in the urban setting.

The large informal sector that characterized the city urban setting thrived through dependence on the weak regulatory framework ( $f=15$ ). The lack of effective monitoring and enforcement mechanism, inefficiency in the enforcement of urban laws helped the informal sector to thrive in their trading activities which are conducted on the setbacks, available spaces on the sidewalks, along streets, and roads to swell indiscriminate urban development of the city. This stems from the inability of the stakeholders to appropriately discharge their responsibilities, come together, and form a synergy. All the participants observed that weak enforcement is the product of lackadaisical attitude from the stakeholders. This support the assertion that passive role ( $f=17$ ) of the stakeholders contributed to the problem ( $f=17$ ). The stakeholders as representatives of the public should be meaningfully engaged and synergy created ( $f=14$ ) in governance of the urban setting, and should be allowed to participate in shaping the decisions that impact them through appropriate planning mechanism.

The city's case indicates that there are regulatory frameworks. Society cannot achieve sustainability, stability, and progress without laws through which values are

cultivated (Alliance for Development, 2014). Sustainable development entails efficient use of resources to futuristic planning wherein resources are used while considering future generations and economic performance. This can be actualized through the presence of stability, engagement, and synergy ( $f=14$ ) owing to good governance practices devoid of weak regulatory framework ( $f=17$ ). The engagement of stakeholders in the planning mechanism is indicative of a system that synergizes for optimum realization of given objectives (Aprioku, 2017). This is an area where many feel that state control in the urban sector has not created the atmosphere for realistic urban planning as their strong hold that limit the involvement of stakeholders has stifled the implementation of regulatory framework. The synergy from engagement of all the stakeholders will attract to the planning process the strength of implementation, enforcement of the laws, and regulations of the urban sector. It would be a call to duty and would successfully advocate for better performance by all in the urban planning and development (Berry & Wilcox, 2015). For example, the proliferation of motor parks and markets in the city would have been averted if the transport union and the local governments were engaged in the planning process. It is therefore imperative that all the stakeholders in the city urban setting must be on the same page and synergize to give the city the desired all inclusive planning.

This synergy also played a vital role in demanding transparency and accountability in the planning process to promote good governance which in turn contributes to equitable development. The role of synergy is crucial as it helps to build strong collaborations among the stakeholders and foster togetherness, harmony, and

development, as well as seeking more coordination with the government's led planning initiatives (International Peace Institute, 2017).

Assessing the city using the infrastructural, environmental, and socio-economic indicators, the urban planning and development regulatory frameworks showed impressive achievements. This is because the city had witnessed continued urban growth based on some land use planning. It has been a beehive of stagnation and depreciation of infrastructures with poor state of infrastructure in the unplanned areas of the city. All the participants observed that indiscriminate development has blocked the drainages; disrupt telephone, electricity, and water right of ways on the roads, streets, and avenues. This has lead to a deprived outlook for the environmental aesthetic of the city portraying that the current regulatory framework has not achieved the desired objectives. Hence, the need for review with necessary institutions put in place to preserve the health of the urban sector and articulate the guidepost for sustainable development. The weak institutional framework that also exacerbate the socio-economic difficulties due to weak and poor practices, inadequate research input, and poor funding.

The city urban setting therefore faces an intellectual challenge in terms of better understanding of how to review, learn, revise, and improve their regulatory systems. Articulating regulatory solutions, whether copycatted or home grown will require care (Hodge, 2007). Acknowledgment of the fundamental role of political governance from the stakeholders over technical and economic regulatory arrangements of government is critical and important. This is because government regulations are typical largely built on home grown regulatory solutions. The stakeholders as actors in the coalition in the urban

setting have great influence in the system. Stone (2014) contended that stakeholders or coalition actors' behavior in the urban setting is critical as the outcome of their engagement and collaboration ( $f=14$ ) affects the urban setting.

A further crucial matter is the dual role of government as both a developer and a regulator. Governments around the world act in its traditional form as a primary development mechanism. In transferring this regulatory role, assumptions about the power and legitimacy of the coalition are often taken for granted. This brings about weak regulatory governance. Caution and learning is needed in articulating regulatory reforms towards haste idealistic reform models. Hodge (2007) therefore opined that regulatory regimes from other jurisdictions can be adapted to another governance system through improved home grown solutions.

**Thematic Label 6: Synergy as what is to be done.**

The net result of the wide range of urban governance actors with their interests in urban governance processes in the city believed that urban governance appears to have and or lack semblance of coherence. It is fragmented, disjointed, and split by deep antagonisms when stakeholders do not work together (Alnsour, 2016). All of the participants responded that there is a continuous challenge of each other's legitimacy and participation in the urban governance process. (2014) argued that lack of coordination, cooperation, and collaboration has always characterized most issues among stakeholders. Participant #6 reported that government stakeholders lack the ability to enforce regulations because of the limited support from all of the other stakeholders.

Effective leadership endeavors to derive positive responses with regards to the system structure as well as the general society at large. The role of stakeholders is significant at the grass root and the governing coalition. The success of sustainable development in any setting is impracticable without the private sector. It has been revealed that there is much dependence on the private sector participation in the urban setting.

All participants expressed extreme remorse and regret for their inactions that resulted in the problem. Most participants described the difficulties and frustrations in urban planning and management as it is today. Some reported feelings of helplessness, worthless, and other self-degrading feelings. Many of the participants described feeling like an outcast. Participant #7 suggested the declaration of emergency in the urban sector of the city attributing the situation to lack of political will on the part of government and its ministries, departments, and agencies. The government is supposed to provide the lead and platform that will ensure engagement of all stakeholders. The leadership by government is constitutional based on the provisions of the Land Use Act 1978 which vested all lands in a state with the Governor for the people. He restated that all stakeholders must come together and form synergy as the very key that will address the urban menace as no one stakeholder can change the narrative. Participant #4 agreed that regular, comprehensive, and effective enforcement is a product of synergy of all stakeholders. He reaffirmed that:

Synergy is the beginning of the success of sustainable development through periodic review of master plans, create development control

mechanism, establish physical planning authorities and appropriately approve land use.

Participant #5 believed that lack of political will, policy inconsistency, and absence of engagement by the stakeholders is the reason for our city's degradation. This can only be addressed through synergy among all the actors in the urban setting, he concluded. In his comments, Participant #6 believed that the lack of full implementation of the extant laws in the sector is a bane in physical planning process. Implementation of the full structure of physical planning will have all the stakeholders engaged. This engagement must be through an open, transparent, and fully participatory process as any one ignored might be the most important in the setting.

Participant #9 used the metaphor of a school setting where the school authority asked his nine year old daughter what she want done in the school. The authorities realized that students are key stakeholders and decided to use the principle of engagement to ensure that all stakeholders are on the same page. He further buttressed his argument that the bane of the Greater City Master Plan is that key engagement of the stakeholders was not activated, after all life is for the living and planning is life. I found out that enforcement of available legislations will lead to creation of synergy among the stakeholders. This is because no one set of stakeholders will be at its end and know what is happening at the other end. Findings showed that there is need for political will that will implement the various laws, regulations, and policies on urban development. Once the regulatory framework is effective, stakeholders will be effectively engaged and since they are the major cause of indiscriminate development, as they become aware of the laws, obey them, indiscriminate development will cease. Lack of engagement denied the

urban setting the much needed synergy for all the actors to play active role that ensures sustainable development.

All the participants commented that corrupt activities among the stakeholders as well as lack of fund in the ministries, departments, and agencies denied the much needed synergy. Participant #8 cited lack of enough professional human power, corruption in the system, and lack of engagement of stakeholders as responsible for poor planning and physical development of the city. Participant #9 betrayed his emotion and stated thus, we are in a terrible situation now, we need engagement, communication, and deep thinking by all about our city, we need synergy among all actors in the urban system, just as there must be political will to engage. Participant #10 stated that government believed in itself as the beginning of our predicament, and summed that lack of engagement and synergy is the course of the failure. It follows that engagement of all the stakeholders and providing leadership by government will ensure the much needed synergy.

The use of interdisciplinary, cross-sector, and policy approaches to solve urban planning and development problem entails drawing inputs from various stakeholders (Onyango & Obera, 2015). In this way, available limited skills and resources needed to deal with urban problems in the city will be pooled together, used to leverage more resources bringing the various interests together to develop holistic, inclusive, and sustainable strategies. For this collaboration to be effective requires access to information and data, because it is crucial for effective governance. World Bank (2017) stated that government ministries, departments, and agencies are wary of making data accessible to the public domain. This is an essential ingredient for effective engagement of the

stakeholders in collaborative governance. To better understand and collaboratively design interventions to improve the quality of urban planning and development narratives, the stakeholders must understand the existing urban governance processes and downplay their competing interests. Through the creation of synergy, all the stakeholders will have access to information and relevant data that will aid successful collaboration on planning and managing the city. The urban setting is messy and conflicting unless there is collaborative governance which will facilitate engagement and collaboration among urban governance actors to bring about synergy that will contain urban challenges effectively.

### **Limitations**

This research had the participation of only ten persons above the age of 18 years, with 5 years experience in the urban sector of this city in the Niger Delta area of Nigeria. These 10 participants were all highly interested, enthusiastic, and focused on their career path. Some of them are in the public sector with others in the private sector organizations that are critical and major stakeholders. The participant pool covered local governments, state institutions and agencies, professional associations, non-governmental organizations, developers and the informal sector.

### **Recommendations**

The growth of urban areas holds great promise for the people and their productive activities. Also unregulated and unplanned growth creates issues of urbanization. These challenges include socio-economic, environmental, and health



related issues. They are threat to national security and key indicators of sustainable development.

City planners and policy makers must realize that promoting proper planning and development in the urban setting requires an integrated, multi level approach to problem solving that requires the involvement and engagement of the stakeholders, and not a single model, quick fix, one dimensional approach. It is only when people see their importance from others' activities that they can positively have an aspiration for the future of the pending issue. They can be expected to respond creatively and actively look for options to improve the situation in difficult circumstances. Effective strategy to achieve this objective requires sensitivity, respect for local context, inclusiveness, proper orientation as key elements of engagement, and good governance which will accentuate sustainable development in the city.

Further research will be necessary to find out the level of indiscriminate urban development of this Niger Delta City in Nigeria. This research had eliminated one critical cause of the problem which many, including myself, was not looking as one reason for the problem until I commenced this study. Research into the activities of the stakeholders in the urban setting of this city is a good lead on how to address and redeem the garden city status of the town. The central theme discovered in this study is the need for creation of synergy among all the stakeholders. The need for engagement cannot be over emphasized as effort should be geared towards ensuring that planning by all takes a center stage in the urban sector.

The issues of participatory urban governance as the findings shows will engender strategic governance decisions takes place at all levels, eliminate political interference, and aggregate the needs of all the stakeholders into an integrated planning and development platform. This engagement will improve urban socio economic variables, environmental degradation, and failing health standards. Given the financial requirements of addressing urban planning, the state needs increasing participation and partnerships in order to fully engage.

This research work is expected to spark further research and actions. Future studies to explore how to improve urban planning and development from the standpoint of the stakeholders is necessary. There is also room for further research on how regulatory framework will aid urban planning and development. Future studies will also explore how engagement and synergy in the urban setting will lead to sustainable urban development.

### **Implications**

This study from its evidence based research findings will provide for policymakers the appropriate change mechanism necessary for the urban setting. These findings are applicable to all the stakeholders as the participants acknowledged that their roles and activities had a direct impact in the crisis that happened in the city urban setting.

The results of this study have positive social change through the provision of information to policymakers, developers and other institutional organizations. Findings of the work show that the regulatory framework of urban planning and development is

weak, obsolete, and are not been enforced or implemented. It followed therefore that effort should be made to enforce our laws to enhance the practice of town planning and management of urban space usage. With proper and effective urban planning, development efforts will be undertaken within the contemplation of planning and development framework that will ensure efficient and effective sustainable development in the city.

Another positive social change implication to the society is the imperative that socio economic activities of the city will improve tremendously. With proper and effective planning, the consequences or negative effects of indiscriminate urban development will be eradicated, and urban development will be undertaken devoid of corrupt practices which affect revenues accruable to government. This is because those sharp practices that negate transparency and accountability will be removed from the system.

Also the environmental issues that arise from indiscriminate urban development will be alleviated from the city. The result of my findings indicates failure on the part of the stakeholders is due to improper and poor planning. The study proffers the solution as stakeholders' engagement and synergy that would bring planning by all. This all inclusive planning strategy will address haphazard and unplanned developments that caused the indiscriminate development. The State Government should ensure that all stakeholders participate in the planning and development of the city.

This study is significant as it will contribute immensely by filling the gap occasioned by lack of literature on the cause of indiscriminate urban development of the city.

Emenike & Sampson (2017) contended that absence of relevant records, poor planning, overcrowding, absence of internal facilities, and poor quality housing contributed to the demeaning of sustainable urban development of the city. Adekola, et al., (2016) stated that paucity of research and planning created room for the unprecedented level of random development in the city. Lack of knowledge on the subject has made the city managers relax while the decay was taking place. It therefore, means that an understanding of the cause by those charged with the responsibility of managing the city space will enable them to curtail, control and regulate indiscriminate development before it gets out of proportion.

The study will be significant as it will serve as my modest contribution to sustainable urban development which will ensure positive social change. The change will improve the society as this study will help policymakers understand why the city deteriorated and will help them to make policy changes to address these issues and help the city to thrive again. The citizenry will derive maximum benefits accruable from the oil and gas nerve center. It will also assist scholar practitioner through the gaps for future research that it will create.

Synergy has significant implications for treating a wide range of social issues and problems associated with urban planning and development. The importance of engagement with stakeholders in the urban setting would reduce the effects of prejudice and discrimination amongst them. The promotion of synergizing with all the stakeholders through meaningful engagement, and the resultant inclusive planning, and development methods would greatly impact the urban setting. The problems caused by human error

when other persons are not involved would be minimized when many professionals and interested parties are part of the planning process. Some of these problems include over-reliance on standardized, monotonous procedures, loss and poor monitoring attention of planning, and development activities.

All of the participants exhibited poor work performance of limited knowledge and passive role thus accepting greater societal burdens. These symptoms of personal inhibition limit one's expected performance and pose significant risks to society if not handled. Although the data concerning the poor work performance is not available to this study, but the prevalence of limited knowledge and passive role present room for further study. Additional study is required to provide effective handling strategy to equip stakeholder organizations. Just as support to stakeholder organizations member through awareness and enlightenment about their role in urban planning and development is necessary.

### **Conclusions**

Findings from this study leads to the conclusion that: The indiscriminate urban development of this Niger Delta City attained a worrisome level to all and sundry. The unplanned and haphazard development has both socio economic and environmental impacts on the city and its residents. The activities of the stakeholders as the actors in the urban governance of the city are major cause of the ugly indiscriminate development. The stakeholders did not put in enough effort to curb, control, monitor, supervise, and enforce town planning rules and regulations. The government as the major controller of land and initiator of land use failed on its part to provide the platform that would

engender the much needed active participation of other stakeholders as the government alone cannot accentuate sustainable development that will provide for the development of the city. The buy in of all stakeholders was missing hence there was no synergy and engagement of these critical and important actors. They instead disregarded planning rules and regulations. With engagement and synergy the stakeholders will change their passive attitude about the sustainable development, and become aware, interested, and involved in maintenance of urban planning rules and regulations. The inherent failure of regulatory framework will change with engagement and synergy among the stakeholders.

The consequences of the indiscriminate development include loss of land space and associated uses, lack of access to infrastructural and utility services, incidences of flooding, erection of sub standard buildings, unregulated conversion of land uses, poor drainage system and internal circulation, rampant motor parks and markets, and traffic congestion. The strengthening of planning institutions, effective coordination, and collaboration among the stakeholders is therefore recommended. This engagement strategy has the potential of arresting indiscriminate development which has characterized the city as result of the activities of the stakeholders. Consequently, this will reverse from building plan approval to planning for development, planning, directing, and managing development. Concomitantly, the adoption and implementation of the planning, managing, and directing development will promote orderly physical development in the urban fringes.

## References

- Abah, D. A., & Naankiel, P. W. (2015). Structural adjustment program in Nigeria and its implications on socio-economic development, 1980-1995. *Researchgate*, 36(7), 191-200.  
Retrieved from: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/318755508>.
- Ackermann, F., & Eden, C. (2011). *Making strategy: Mapping out strategic success*. London, England: Sage.
- Acosta, G. M. (2012). *A review of the Department of the Army's decentralized cost benefit analysis process* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 3539046).
- Adams, C. T. (2014). *From the outside in: Suburban elites, Third-sector organizations, and the reshaping of Philadelphia*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Adekola, J., Fischabacher-Smith, M., Fischabacher-Smith, D., & Adekola, O. (2016). Health risk from environmental degradation in the Niger Delta, Nigeria. *Environment and Planning C. Politics and Space*, 33(2) 334-354.
- Ahmed, A., Kawu. A. M., & Usman, A. U. (2014). Learning from tradition: Elements and practice of urban development control in Zaria City, Nigeria. *American International Journal of Contemporary Research*, 2(4).
- Akanni, A. A. (2013). Location of mosques and town planning laws in Nigeria: Imperatives for integration. *Ilorin Journal of Religious Studies*, 3(1).
- Albino, V., Umberto-Berardi, U., & Dangelico, R. M. (2015). Smart cities: Definitions, dimensions, performance, and initiatives. *Journal of Urban Technology*,



22(1), 3-21.

- Alholjailan, M.I. (2012). Thematic Analysis: A critical review of its process and evaluation. *WestEast Journal of Social Sciences*, 1(1), 39-47.
- Allen, M. D. (2014). Telephone focus group: Strengths, challenges, and strategies for success. *Qualitative Social Work*, 13(4), 571-583.
- Alnsour, J. A. (2016). Managing urban growth in the city of Amman, Jordan. Retrieved from <http://web.b.ebscohost.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/chost/detail?vid=4&sid=b6b18.b61-80fa-45f0-9a17-abebdc>.
- Amata, L. H., Zillante, A., & Amato, C. H. (2015). Corporate environmental claims: A game theory model with empirical results. *Social Responsibility Journal*, 11(1), 36-55.
- Annan, K. (2004). The causes of conflict and the promotion of durable peace and sustainable development in Africa. *African Renaissance*, 1(3), 9-42.  
<https://hdl.handle.net/10520/EJC10050>
- Anthony, O. O. (2012). The domestic and international implications of fuel subsidy removal in Nigeria. *Arabia Journal of Business and Management Review*, 1(6).
- Anyan, F. (2013). The influence of power shifts in data collection and analysis stages: A focus on qualitative research interview. *Qualitative Report*, 18(18), 1-9.
- Atela, J. O., Quinn, C. H., Minang, P. A., Duguma, L. A. & Houdet, J. A. (2016). Implementing REDD+ at the national level: Stakeholders engagement and policy coherence between REDD+ rules and Kenya's sectoral policies.

*Forest Policy and Economics*, 65. doi/5019897151630014.

- Azevedo, S., & Ferreira, F. I. (2013). Participation and learning in a Jenaplan School in the Netherlands: An ethnographic research with children. *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 82, 599–603.  
doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.06.316.
- Baker, S. E., Edwards, R., & Doidge, M. (2014). How many qualitative interviews is enough? Expert voices and early career reflections on sampling and cases in qualitative research.
- Bailey, E. (2014). Redefining comprehensive urban management in Kingston Metropolitan Region, Jamaica. *Journal of Place Management and Development*. Retrieved from  
<http://search.proquest.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/central/docview/1508431560/fulltext/95FC94F6E669443DPQ/5>.
- Banawi, A., & Bilec, M. M. (2014). A framework to improve construction processes: Integrating lean, green, and six sigma. *International Journal of Construction Management*, 14(1), 58-71.  
doi/10.1080/15623599.3013.875266.
- Bates, W. L. (2018). A phenomenological examination of prisonization and the psychological effects of incarceration. *Walden University Scholar Works*. Retrieved from  
<https://scholarworks.waldenu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=6332&context=dissertation>.

- Baxter, P. & Jack, S. (2008). Qualitative case study methodology: Study design and implementation for novice researchers. *The Qualitative Report*, 13(4).
- Bazeley, P., & Jackson, K. (2013). *Qualitative data analysis with NVivo* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed). London, England: SAGE Publications.
- Beal, V. & Pinson, G. (2015). From the governance of sustainability to the management of climate change.
- Berry, J. M., & Wilcox, C. (2015). *The interest group society*. Abingdon, England: Routledge.
- Blanco, I. (2013). Analyzing urban governance networks: bringing regime theory back in. *Environment and Planning C: Government and Policy*, 34. 276-291.  
doi.10.1068/c11174.
- Block, E. S., & Erskine, L. (2012). Interviewing by telephone: Specific considerations, opportunities, and challenges. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 11(4), 428-445.
- Bouglet, J., Joffre, G., & Simon, E. (2012). How to reconcile business with sustainable development: Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertation and Theses database. (UMI No. 3603033).
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2013). *Successful qualitative research: A practical guide for beginners*. London, England: Sage.
- Braun, V., Tricklebank, G., & Clarke, V. (2013). "It shouldn't stick out from your bikini at the beach": Meaning, gender, and the hairy/hairless body. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 37(4), 478-493.
- Braun, V., Clarke, V., & Gray, D. (Eds.), (2017). *Collecting qualitative data: A practical*

*guide to textual, media and virtual techniques*. London, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Bree, R., & Gallagher, G. (2016). Using Microsoft Excel to code and thematically, analyze qualitative data: a simple, cost-effective approach. *All Ireland Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education (AISHE-J)*, 8(2), 2811-28114.
- Bryson, J. M. (2012). *Strategic planning for public and non-profit organizations: A guide to strengthening and sustaining organizational achievement*. (4<sup>th</sup> ed). San Francisco: Jossey- Bass.
- Buckley, V. (2013). Planning + Development: Key stakeholders in the planning system. *Planning Academy*. 6(3). 102-110.
- Camou, M. (2014). Labor-community coalitions through an urban regime lens: Institutions and ideas in building power from below. *Urban Affairs Review*, 50 (5) 623- 647.
- Chenail, R. J. (2011). Ten steps for conceptualizing and conducting qualitative research studies in a pragmatically curious manner. *The Qualitative Report*, 16(6), 1713-1730.
- Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2013). Teaching thematic analysis: Overcoming challenges and developing strategies for effective learning. *The Psychologist*, 26(2), 120-123.
- Cohen-Vogel, L. & McLendon, M. (2017). Policy regimes theory. *Politicalframes*. Retrieved from <https://politicalframes.wikispaces.com/Urban+Regime+Theory>.
- Clavier, C., & O'Neill, M. (2017). The role of policy coalitions in Understanding community participation in healthy cities projects. *Springer*, 3(1),46-50.
- Creswell, J.W. (2014). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

- Crow, D. A., Albright, E. A., & Koebele, E. (2015). Environmental rulemaking across states: Process, procedural access, and regulatory influence. *Environment and Planning C: Politics and Space*. doi/abs/10.1177/0263774x15606922.
- Cucchiara, M. B. (2013). *Marketing schools, marketing cities: Who wins and who loses when schools become urban amenities*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- D' Angelo, M. J., & Brunstein, J. (2014). Social learning for sustainability: Supporting sustainable business in Brazil regarding multiple social actors, relationships and interests. *International Journal of Sustainable Development and World Ecology*, 21(3), 273-289. doi/10.1080/135045909.2014.902868.
- De-Gruyter, C. (2016). *Travel plans for new residential developments: Insights from theory and practice*. Part of the Springer theses: Singapore.
- Denzin, N. K. (2012). Triangulation 2.0. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, 6(2), 80-88. doi/10.1177/1558689812437186.
- Devault, G. (2018). Establishing trustworthiness in qualitative research. What are qualitative research processes?. *The Balance Small Business*, 3(1), 39-43.
- Divan, A., Ludwig, L., Matthews, K., Motley, P. & Tomlienovic-Berube, A. (2017). A survey of research approaches utilized in the scholarship of learning and teaching publications. *Teaching & Learning Inquiry*, [online] 5(2), 16.
- Drabble, L., Trocki, K. F., Salcedo, B., Walker, P. C., & Korcha, R. A. (2015). Conducting qualitative interviews by telephone: Lessons learned from a study of alcohol use among sexual minority and heterosexual women. *Qualitative Social Work*. doi/10.1177/1473325015585613.
- Earle, L. (2017). Addressing urban crises: Bridging the humanitarian-development divide. War in cities. *International Review of the Red Cross*. 98(1), 215-214.
- Eastern Region Law of Nigeria 83(1955).

- Eastern Region Law of Nigeria 55 (1956).
- Eastern Region Law of Nigeria 246 (1958).
- Eduardo, M. (2013). Government, political actors and governance in urban policies in Brazil and São Paulo: concepts for a future research agenda. *Brazil Political Science Review*, 7 (3).
- Egwu, S. G. (2014). *Beyond the revival of old hatred: The State and conflicts in Africa*, in Shedrack, G.B. (ed). Introduction to Peace and Conflicts Studies in West.
- Emeka, E. (2015). Eight things you notice on your first visit to Port Harcourt. Retrieved from <http://www.travelstart.com.ng/blog>.
- Emenike, G. C. & Sampson, A. P. (2017). Predominant dwellings and their neighbourhood environment qualities in Port Harcourt metropolis, Nigeria: An implication for planning. *IQSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 22 (4) 4, 69-76.
- Englander, M. (2012). The Interview: Data collection in descriptive phenomenological human scientific research. *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology*, 43(1), 13-35.
- Englander, M. (2012). The Interview: Data collection in descriptive phenomenological human scientific research cited by Zahavi, D. (2001b). Beyond empathy: Phenomenological approaches to inter subjectivity. *Journal of Consciousness Studies*, 8(57):15-16.
- Evans, J., Karvonen, A. & Rovens, R. (eds). (2016). *The experimental city*. London: Routledge.
- Fassinger, R., & Morrow, S. L. (2013). Toward best practices in quantitative, qualitative, and mixed- method research: A social justice perspective. *Journal for Social Action in Counseling & Psychology*, 5(2), 69–83.

- Finlay, L. (2012). Unfolding the phenomenological research process: iterative stages of seeing aesh. *Journal of Humanistic Psychology, 5*(2), 39-40.  
doi//10.11770022167812453877.
- Fortner, M. J. (2015). Straight, no chaser theory, history, and muting of the urban state. *Urban Affairs Review, 52*, (40). 591-621.
- Frankfort-Nachmias, C., Nachmias, D., & DeWaard, J. (2015). *Research methods in the social sciences* (8th ed.). New York, NY: Worth.
- Gani, B. A. (2015). Effects of street trading on urban areas in Nigeria. *Global Advanced Research, 6*(3), 101-110. Retrieved from [garj.org/full-articles/effects-of-street-trading-on-urban-areas-in-nigeria.pdf?view...](http://garj.org/full-articles/effects-of-street-trading-on-urban-areas-in-nigeria.pdf?view...)
- Gica, D. G. (2017). Urban regime theory and CBOs. Political frames. Retrieved from <https://politicalframes.wikispaces.com/Urban+Regime+Theory>.
- Gomez, M. (2013). *Race, class, power and organizing in East Baltimore*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.
- Green, C., Duan, N., Gibbons, R., Hoagwood, K., Palinkas, L., & Wisdom, J. (2014). Approaches to mixed methods dissemination and implementation research: Methods, strengths, caveats, and opportunities. *Administration and Policy in Mental Health and Mental Health Services Research, 5*(4), 1–16. doi.org/10.1007/s10488-014-0552-6.
- Grooms, W., & Boamah, E. F. (2017). Towards a political urban planning: Learning from growth machine and advocacy planning to plannitize urban politics. *Planning Theory, 4*(3), 1-21. doi.10.1177/1473095217690934.

- Guest, G. (2012). *Applied thematic analysis*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Ho, P., & Vieira, M. M. C. (2018). Case studies in food and environmental health. *Qualitative Research Guide, 5(2), 149-157*,
- Heidhues, F., & Gideon, O. (2011). Lessons from structural adjustment program and their effects in Africa. *Quarterly Journal of International Agriculture, 1(50), 201-239*.
- Hershkovitz, A., & Forkosh-Baruch, A. (2013). Student-teacher relationship in the Face book era: The student perspective. *International Journal of Continuing Engineering Education and Life Long Learning, 23(1), 33–52*. doi/10.1504/IJCEELL.2013.051765.
- Hodge, G. (2007). Regulatory frameworks for urban services. Retrieved from <https://www.oecd.org/gov/regulatory-policy/39218313.pdf>.
- Hu, J., Torr, J., & Whiteman, P. (2014). Australian Chinese parents' language attitudes and practices relating to their children's bilingual development prior to school. *Journal of Early Childhood Research, 12, 139–153*. doi/10.1177/1476718X13515429.
- Igwe, C. E. (2017). Our environment, our heritage, environmental sustainability: Right for all. Key note presentation by Honorable Commissioner Chinyere Igwe Rivers State Ministry of Urban Planning and Physical Development to Rivers State House of Assembly House Committee on Environment Port Harcourt, Environmental Summit, June, 5<sup>TH</sup> -10<sup>TH</sup> 2017.
- Igwe, C. E. (2018a). HSE implementation – key to profitability in the downstream oil and gas sector. Keynote address by Honorable Commissioner Chinyere Igwe,



Rivers State Ministry of Energy and Natural Resources to the annual general meeting of downstream sector operators, organized by Department of Petroleum Resources on June, 21<sup>st</sup> 2018.

Igwe, C. E. (2018b). Investment opportunities in the energy sector of Rivers State. A special presentation by the Honorable Commissioner Chinyere Igwe Rivers Ministry of Energy and Natural Resources at PHACCIMA 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter General Forum, on June, 27<sup>th</sup> 2018.

Innes, J. E., & Booher, D. E. (2010). *Planning with complexity: An introduction to collaborative rationality for public policy*. New York: Routledge. -  
Institutional Review Board (2013). Walden University.

Irvine, A., Drew, P., & Sainsbury, R. (2013). Am I not answering your questions properly? Clarification, adequacy and responsiveness in semi-structured telephone and face-to-face interviews. *Qualitative Research*, 13, 87-106.

Jacob, S. A., & Furgerson, S. P. (2012). Writing interview protocols and conducting interviews: Tips for students new to the field of qualitative research. *Qualitative Report*, 17(42), 1-10.

Jankowski, G., Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2017). Reflecting on qualitative research, feminist methodologies and feminist psychology: In conversation with Virginia Braun and Victoria Clarke. *Psychology of women section review*, 19 (1). 43-55.

Javadi, M., & Zarea, M. (2016). Understanding thematic analysis and its pitfalls. *Journal Of Client Care*, 1 (1). 33-39.

- Jefferies, M., Brewer, G. J., & Gajendran, T. (2014). Using a case study approach to identify critical success factors for alliance contracting. *Engineering, Construction and Architectural Management*, 21(5), 465-480. doi./10.1108/ECAM-01-2012-0007.
- Jega, A., (2012). Identity transformation and identity politics under structural adjustment Nigeria. Sweden, *Nordik Africa*, Upssala.
- Jega, A. (2013). The State and identity transformation under structural adjustment in Nigeria, in Jega, A., (ed), Identity transformation and identity politics under structural adjustment in Nigeria. Sweden, *Nordik Africa*, Upssala.
- Jewitt, C. (2012). National centre for research methods working paper: An introduction to using video for research. *Institute of Education*, London.
- Jones, R. C. (2013). Examining leadership styles and financial performance within rural electric cooperatives (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertation and Thesis database. (UMI No. 3561539).
- Kalaba, F. K. (2016). The barrier to policy implementation and implications for Zambia's forest ecosystems. *Forest Policy and Economics*. Vol. 69. /pii/5019897151630014.
- Kafle, N. P. (2013). Hermeneutic phenomenological research method simplified. Bodhi: *An Interdisciplinary Journal*, 5(1), 181-200.
- Kapoulas, A., & Mitic, M. (2012). Understanding challenges of qualitative research: rhetorical issues and reality traps. *Qualitative Market Research: An International Journal*, 15(4), doi./10.1108/13522751211257051

- Kemparaj, U., & Chavan, S. (2013). Qualitative research: A brief description. *Indiana Journal of Medical Sciences, 67*(3), 89. doi./10.4103/0019-5359.121127.
- Kenbeek, S.D., Bone, C., & Mseley, C. (2016). A network modeling approach to policy implementation in natural resources management agencies. *Computers, Environment and Urban Systems, 57*(3), 120-141.
- Kim, J., Price, M., & Lau, F. (2014). The case study research method: Overview and proposed guidelines for reporting and evaluation illustrated with health informatics case studies. *International Journal of Health Information Management Research, 2*(1), 13–30.
- Kundert, J. (2012). *Battling drug addiction in the heartland [Video file]*. Retrieved from Walden University database.  
<https://msu.edu/user/mkennedy/digitaladvisor/Research/interviewing.htm>.
- Kio-Lawson, D., & Dekor, J. B. (2014). Port Harcourt, the garden city: A garden of residents nightmare. *World Environment, 3*(2), 19-23.
- Kio-Lawson, D. (2013). Marginal settlement in Port Harcourt, the garden city. The geography of “horror” scientific and academic publishing. *World Environment, 3*(3). 77-84.
- Klieman, K. A. (2012). U.S. oil companies, the Nigerian civil war, and the origins of opacity in the Nigerian oil industry. *Journal of American History, 99* (1). 250-267. doi./10.1093/jahist/jas072.
- Kumar, S., & Kumar, U. (2014). Environment and sustainable development. *Vidhigya*

9(1).

Kuosa, T. (2011). Different approaches of pattern management and strategic intelligence.

*Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 78(3), 458–467.

doi/10.1016/j.techfore.2010.06.004.

Laureate Education. (2013). Phenomenological research. Retrieved from

[http://researchcenter.waldenu.edu/Research\\_Tutorials/Phenomenological\\_Research/index.html](http://researchcenter.waldenu.edu/Research_Tutorials/Phenomenological_Research/index.html).

Laureate Education (Producer). (2016a). *Doctoral research: Interviewing techniques,*

*part one* [Video file]. Baltimore, MD: Author. Retrieved from Walden

University databases.

Laureate Education (Producer). (2016). *Introduction to coding* [Video file]. Baltimore,

MD:

Lehner, M. (2015). Translating sustainability: The role of the retail store. *International*

*Journal of Retail and Distribution Management*, 43(4/5), 386-402.

doi/10.1108/IJRDM-02-2014-0013.

Lombard, M. (2016). Land tenure and conflict in urban. *Global Urban Research*

*Centre*. Mexico.

Logic-Maclver, L., Piacentini, M., & Eadie, D. (2012). Using qualitative methodologies

to understand behavior change. *Qualitative Market Research: An*

*international Journal*, 15,70-86. doi//10.1108/1352275121119208.

Lukka, K. (2014). Exploring the possibilities for causal explanation in interpretive

research. *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, 39(7), 559–566.

doi./10.1016/j.aos.2014.06.002

- Maguire, M., & Delahunt, B. (2017). Doing a Thematic Analysis: A Practical, Step-by-Step Guide for Learning and Teaching Scholars. *Autumn 2017*, 3.
- Malik, A. (2017). The role of stakeholders related to the management of ecological function of urban green open space. Case Study: City of Depok, Indonesia. *Earth and Environmental Science* 99. doi :10.1088/1755-1315/99/1/.
- Malone, H., Nicholl, H., & Tracey, C. (2014). Awareness and minimization of systematic bias in research. *British Journal of Nursing*, 23(5), 279–282.
- Maykut, P. & Morehouse, R. (1990). *Beginning qualitative research: A philosophic and practical guide*, London: Falmer Press. The Falmer Press Teachers' Library.
- Marques, E. (2013). Government, political actors and governance in urban policies in Brazil and São Paulo: concepts for a future research agenda. *Brazil Political Science Review*, São Paulo, 7 (3).
- McCormack, D., Carr, T., McCloskey, R., Keeping-burke, L., Furlong, K. E., & Doucet, S. (2012). Getting through ethics: The fit between research ethics board assessments and qualitative research. *Journal of Empirical Research on Human Research Ethics*, 7(5), 30-66. doi./10.1525/jer.2012.7.5.30.
- Merriam, S. B. (2014). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. John Wiley and Sons.
- Moncada, E. (2013). The politics of urban violence: challenges for development in the global south. *Springer Science+Business Media*.
- Morris, L. (2013). Three dimensions of innovation. *International Management Review*,

9(2), 5-10.

Nieves, J. and Haller, S. (2014). Building dynamic capabilities through knowledge resources. *Tourism Management*, 40, 224-232.

doi./10.1016/j.tourman.2013.06.010.

Nigerian Town and Country Planning Ordinance (1946).

Nigerian Population Commission (2016). Population estimates.

Nite, C., & Singer, J. N. (2012). Qualitative inquiry: Quality research for connecting with and affecting change in sport populations. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 12(1), 88–97. doi./10.1108/14439881211222750.

Nwabugo, E. N. (2011). The story of structural adjustment program in Nigeria from the perspective of organized labor. *Australian Journal of Business and Management Research*, 1(7).

Nowell, L. S., Norris, J. M., White, D. E., & Moules, N. J. (2017). Thematic analysis: Striving to meet the trustworthiness criteria. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 16 (1), 1-13.

Ogawa, S., and Pongtanalert, K. (2013). Exploring characteristics and motives of consumer innovations: Community innovators vs. independent innovators. *Research Technology Management*, 56(3), 41-48.

doi./10.5437/08956308X5603088.

Owe, G. T. (2014). Qualitative methods in higher education policy analysis: Using interviews and documents analysis. *The Qualitative Report*, 19(26), 1-19.

Okpara, S. (2013). Periscoping Port Harcourt City. *Nigerian Tide Newspaper*.

- Oppong, B. E. (2016). Slum or sustainable development? A case study of Sodom and Gomorrah in Accra, Ghana. *Minnesota State University, Mankato*, ProQuest Dissertations Publishing. Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/central/docview/1696181078/fulltext/95FC94F6E669443DPQ/10?accountid=14872>.
- Oriye, O., & Fakere, A. A. (2015). Urban land use in the city of Akure, Nigeria. *Ethiopian Journal of Environmental Studies & Management* 8(5):471-483, doi:10.4314/ejesm.v8i5.1.
- Obinna, V. C., Owei, O. B., & Okwakpam, I. O. (2010). Impacts of urbanization on the indigenous enclaves of Port Harcourt and concomitant policy measure. In: *The Social Sciences*, 5(3).
- Onu, B., Surendran, S. S., & Price, T. (2014). Impact of inadequate urban planning on municipal solid waste management in the Niger Delta Region of Nigeria. *Journal of Sustainable Development*, 7(6).
- Ostby, G. (2016). Rural-urban migration, inequality and urban social disorder: Evidence from African and Asian. *Conflict Management and Peace Science*, 33(5), 491-515. doi.10.1177/0738894215581315.
- Owei, O. B., Obinna, V. C., & Ede, P. N. (2010). The challenges of sustainable land use planning in Nigerian Cities: The case of Port Harcourt. 46th *ISOCARP Congress*.
- Owei, O. (2015). Distortions of the urban land market in Nigerian cities and the implications for urban growth patterns: The case of Abuja and Port

Harcourt.

- Owen, G. T. (2014). Qualitative methods in higher education policy analysis: Using interviews and document analysis. *The Qualitative Report*, 19(26), 1–19. Retrieved from <http://www.nova.edu>.
- Oyesiku, O. K. (2015). City live ability: Implications and challenges. Lead paper presented at the Commonwealth Association of Planners, *West Africa Workshop*. Lagos.
- Patterson, K. L., & Silverman, R. M. (2014b). Institutions and the new normal for community development. In Patterson, K. L. and Silverman, R. M. (Eds), *Schools and urban revitalization: Rethinking institutions and community development*, 3(5),3-13.New York, NY: Routledge.
- Park, D. Y., & Park, M. (2013). Examining the features of earth science logical reasoning and authentic scientific inquiry demonstrated in a high school earth science curriculum: A case study. *Journal of Geoscience Education*, 61(4), 364–377. doi./10.5408/12- 360.1.
- Pezalla, A. E., Pettigrew, J., & Miller-Day, M. (2012). Researching the researcher-as instrument: An exercise in interviewer self-reflexivity. *Qualitative Research*, 12, 165–185. doi./10.1177/14687941111422107.
- Port-Harcourt Area Planning scheme Order in Council 29 (1947).
- Port Harcourt-Obio Planning Authority in Section 10 of Eastern Nigeria Law (1947).
- Poroma, C., David, U. J., & Jackson, O. R. (2015). Oil economy and female prostitution in Port Harcourt. *International Letters of Social and*



*Humanistic Sciences*, 42.121-132. doi:10.18052.

- Poulis, K., Poulis, E., & Plakoyiannaki, E. (2013). The role of context in case study selection: An international business perspective. *International Business Review*, 22(1), 304–314. Doi./10.1016/j.ibusrev.2012.04.003.
- Proitz, T. S. (2015). Leveraging outcomes as a key concept in policy documents throughout policy changes. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research*, 59(3), 272-296.
- Prowise, M., & Camfield, L. (2013). Improving the quality of development: What role for qualitative methods in randomized experiments? *Progress in Development Studies*, 13(1). 51-61. doi./10.1177/14649934121300104.
- Ravitch, S. M., & Carl, N. M. (2016). *Qualitative research: Bridging the conceptual, theoretical, and methodological*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Rădulescu, C. M., Stefan, O., Rădulescu, G. M. T., Rădulescu, A. T. G. M., & Rădulescu, M. V. G. M. (2016). *Management of stakeholders in urban regeneration projects*. Case study: Baia-Mare, Transylvania.
- Rast, J. (2015). Urban regime theory and the problem of change. *Urban Affairs Review* 51(1), 138-149. doi.10.1177/1078087414559056.
- Ravazzi, S., & Belligni, S. (2016). Explaining “power to”: incubation and agenda building in an urban regime. *Urban Affairs Review*, 52(3)323-347. doi.10.1177/1078087415598579.
- Rebisi Progressive Movement (2006). *Rebisi kingdom of Port Harcourt: Evolutionary landmarks*. Port Harcourt : Maurison Communications Limited.
- Rehm, M., & Ade, R. (2013). Construction costs comparison between green and

- environmental office buildings. *Building Research & Information*, 41, 198-208. doi./10.1080/09613218.2013.769145.
- Reilly, R. C. (2013). Found poems, member checking and crises of representation. *The Qualitative Report*, 18(15), 1-18.
- Reybold, LE., Lammert, J. D., & Stribling, S. M. (2013). Participant selection as a conscious research method: Thinking forward and the deliberation of “emergent” findings. *Qualitative Research*, 13(4), 699-716.
- Rich, M. A. & Tsitsos, W. (2017). New urban regimes in Baltimore: Higher education anchor institutions and arts and culture-based neighborhood revitalization. *Education and Urban Society*. doi.10.1177/0013124517713607.
- Rivers State Government (2009). The Greater Port Harcourt City Development Authority Law No. 2 of 2009.
- Rivers State Ministry of Energy and Natural Resources (2017). *Energy policy*. Rivers State.
- Rivers State Ministry of Urban development & Physical Planning (2013). Catalogue of illegal and indiscriminate development. *Road Map for Sustainable Development*.
- Rivers State Physical Planning Law, No. 6 (2003). The Rivers State of Nigeria.
- Rosenthal, M. (2016). Qualitative research methods: Why, when, and how to conduct Interviews and focus groups in pharmacy research. *Currents in Pharmacy Teaching and Learning*, 8(4), 509-516.

- Rubin, H. J., & Rubin, I. S. (2012). *Qualitative interviewing. The art of hearing data*. London, England :SAGE Publications.
- Sabatier, P. A., & Weible, C. M. (2014). *Theories of the policy process* (3rd ed.). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Saldaña, J. (2016). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Seidman, I. (1998). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A Guide for researchers in education and the social sciences*. Teachers College Press.
- Shaw, D., Scully, J., & Hart, T. (2014). The paradox of social resilience: How cognitive strategies and coping mechanism attenuate and accentuate resilience. *Global Environmental Change, 25*, 194-203.
- Shah, S. (2014). *Theories of social change: Meaning, nature and processes*. Retrieved from <http://www.sociologydiscussion.com/sociology/theories-of-social-change-meaning-nature-and-processes/2364>.
- Shin, H., Park, S. H. & Sonn, J. W. (2015). The emergence of a multiscalar growth regime and scalar tension: The politics of urban development in Songdo New City, South Korea. *Environment and Planning C: Government and Policy, 33*, 1618-1638. doi.10.1177/06374x15614442.
- Shofoluwe, M., Ofori-Boadu, A., Waller, L., & Bock-Hyeng, C. (2012). Quality improvement practices of award-winning residential builders and housing developers. *International Journal of Industrial Engineering & Production Research, 23*(1).

- Silverman, R. M. (2014). Anchoring community development to schools and neighborhoods: A renewed tradition of putting people first. In Patterson, K. L. and Silverman, R. M. (Eds), *Schools and urban revitalization: Rethinking institutions and community development*, 5( 5), 14-27. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Simone, A. (2016). Urbanity & generic blackness. *Theory, Culture & Society*, 33 (7-8) 183-203. doi/10.1177/0263276416636203.
- Singh, A. (2014). Conducting case study research in non-profit organizations. *Qualitative Market Research: An International Journal*, 17, 77-84. doi./10.1108/QMR-04 2013-0024.
- Spearman, P. (2015). Using sustainable development as a competitive strategy. Walden University. Doctoral Dissertation. Retrieved from waldenulibrary.com.org.
- Starke, P. (2013). Qualitative methods for the study of policy diffusion: Challenges and available solutions. *Policy Studies Journal*, 41. 561-582. doi./10.1111/psj.12032.
- Stone, C. N. (2005.) Looking back to look forward: Reflections on urban regime analysis. *Urban Affairs Review*,40 (3), 309-41.
- Stone, C. N. (1989). Regime politics: Governing Atlanta, 1946-1988. *Studies in Government and Public Policy*. Lawrence, Kan.: University Press of Kansas.
- Stone, C. N. (2013). The empowerment puzzle: In pursuit of a new dimension in

- governing the city. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Political Science Association, Chicago.
- Stone, C. N. (2014). Reflections on regime politics from governing coalition to urban political Order. *Urban Affairs Review* 51, (1), 101-137.
- Stone, C. N. & Stoker, R. P. (2015). *Urban neighborhoods in a new era*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Sunday-Ehiokioya, A. R. (2017). Indiscriminate waste disposal: its implications and the way Forward. *The Nigerian Observer*.
- The Commission on Global Governance (1995). *Our Global Neighborhood*. Oxford University Press.
- The Township Ordinance No. 29 (1917).
- Tilaki, M., Javad, M., & Hedayati, M. (2015). Exploring barriers to the implementation of city.
- Topper, C. (2014). *Bringing the natural world to Hong Kong* (Video file). Retrieved from Walden University database.
- Towah, W. (2019). The impact of good governance and stability on sustainable development in Ghana.
- Town and Country Planning Law CAP 126 (1963).
- Tracy, S. J. (2013). *Qualitative research methods: Collecting evidence, crafting analysis, communicating impact*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Trotter II, R. T. (2012). Qualitative research sample design and sample size: Resolving city unresolved issues and inferential imperatives. *Preventive Medicine*, 55. 398–400. doi./10.1016/j.yjpm.2012.07.003.

- Trotter, A. R., Matt, S. B., &Wojnar, D. (2014). Communication strategies and accommodations utilized by health care providers with hearing loss: A pilot study. *American Journal of Audiology*, 23(1), 7-19. doi/10.1044/1059.0889(2013/12-0065).
- Tsavadarisdou, M., &Metaxas, T. (2015). A theoretical framework on CSR and urban development. *Munich Personal RePEC Archive*.
- UN- HABITAT (2008). The State of African Cities. Nairobi, Kenya.
- University of Toronto (2017).Urban planning and development. *Geography and Planning*.
- U.S. Agency for International Development (1966). *The Pearson Report*.
- Vaismoradi, M., Turunen, H.,&Bondas, T. (2013). Content analysis and thematic analysis: Implications for conducting a qualitative descriptive study. *Nursing and Health Sciences*, 15(3), 398-40.
- Vaughan, J. L., Leming, M. L., Liu, M., &Jaselskis, E. (2013). Cost-benefit analysis of construction information management system implementation: Case study. *Journal of Construction Engineering & Management*, 139(4), 445–455. doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)CO.1943-7862.0000611.
- Ya'u, Y. K. (2012). The youth, economic crisis and identity transformation: The case of the Yandaba in Kano, in Jega, A., (ed) Identity transformation and identity politics under structural or see Momoh, A., Youth culture and area Boys in Lagos, in Jega, A., (ed) identity transformation and identity politics under

structural.

Walden University (2015). Social change. Retrieved from

<https://www.waldenu.edu/about/social-change-development-strategy>.

Walden University, Center for Research Quality, (n.d.-e;)

Wang, X. (2012). Urban sprawl and sustainable development in China. *Illinois Institute of*

*GTechnology*, ProQuest Dissertations Publishing. 3536583. Retrieved from

<http://search.proquest.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/dissertations/docview/1314435875/abstract/73CDEB202FD54901PQ/15?accountid=14872>.

Warwick, M. (2013). Only Business Can End Poverty Retrieved from

<http://businesssolutiontopoverty.com/only-business-can-end-poverty>.

Wekwete, K. H. (2015). Urban management: The recent experience. Retrieved from

[archive.unu.edu/unupress/unupbooks/uu26ue/uu26ue10.html](http://archive.unu.edu/unupress/unupbooks/uu26ue/uu26ue10.html).

Wike, N. E. (2015). New Rivers Vision. *Rivers State PDP Governorship Manifesto*.

Wokekoro, W. & Owei, A. B. (2014). An assessment of residential quality of old Port

Harcourt Township, of Port Harcourt Municipality. *International Journal of Science and Science (IJSR)*, 3(2).

World Weather Information Service, Port Harcourt (2016).

Appendix A: Generic mail to Organizations

Chinyere Igwe  
Doctoral Candidate  
Public Policy and Law

**REQUEST FOR APPROVAL TO CONDUCT RESEARCH.**

My name is Chinyere Igwe and I am a doctoral candidate at Walden University. I am conducting dissertation research on the cause of indiscriminate urban development in Niger Delta Region cities in Nigeria. There are a plethora of studies on indiscriminate urban development. What is not known, however, is the role of stakeholders/coalitions actors in urban governance of cities in Niger Delta Region in Nigeria. This research will provide insight into how the activities of the coalition actors cause indiscriminate urban development in Niger Delta cities.

Your immeasurable assistance is very important in conducting this research. I would solicit the cooperation of members of your association involved in landscape development and management. Identification of stakeholders with major interests in the management of urban development is also of great importance to this work. Upon identification, I would like to meet with them to discuss the nature of this study. The participants of this study need to be residents and involved in physical development of projects in this Niger Delta City of Nigeria, in the public or and private sectors. The participants are free to choose whether or not to participate and can discontinue participation at any time. Information provided by the participants will be kept strictly confidential.

I would welcome a telephone call from you to discuss any questions you may have concerning this study and your role in identifying research participant

Sincerely,

Chinyere Igwe  
Doctoral Candidate  
Walden University



Appendix B: Invitation for Participation.

Chinyere Igwe  
Doctoral Candidate  
Walden University

**REQUEST FOR YOUR PARTICIPATION.**

My name is Chinyere Igwe and I am a doctoral candidate at Walden University. I am conducting dissertation research on the cause of indiscriminate urban development of this Niger Delta City in Nigeria. There is a plethora of studies on indiscriminate urban development. What is not known, however, is the role of stakeholders/coalitions actors in the urban governance of the Niger Delta Region cities in Nigeria. This research will provide insight into how the activities of the coalition actors cause indiscriminate urban development in this Niger Delta City.

Your immeasurable assistance is very important in conducting this research. I am very conscious that your time is important to you and would appreciate your consideration to participate in this study. To fully understand your experience, we need to talk on two separate occasions for approximately 20 minutes each meeting. These meetings will be by telephone conversation, so you can be at any location of your choice and you will not be required to do anything that will inconvenience you. The sole purpose of the meetings is simply to know and understand your experience of being a resident and or developer or a stakeholder in the urban sector of the city.

All information gathered will be kept strictly confidential. Please contact me at your earliest convenience to schedule a date and time that we can discuss.

Chinyere Igwe  
Doctoral Candidate  
Walden University

## Appendix C: Interview Protocol

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Location: \_\_\_\_\_

Name of Interviewer: \_\_\_\_\_

Name of Interviewee: \_\_\_\_\_

Interview Number: One

1. Please tell me how you would describe indiscriminate urban development?
2. How would you describe your role as a stakeholder in the urban setting?
3. How would you describe the activities of stakeholders in the urban setting that caused indiscriminate development?
4. What are the developments, you would agree has contributed to growth of indiscriminate urban development of the city?
5. How did you experience urban development in the city?
6. How do you think law, regulations and policies of government has affected urban development in the city?.
7. What do you think is not been done to ensure proper planning and physical development?

## Interview Protocol

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Location: \_\_\_\_\_

Name of Interviewer: \_\_\_\_\_

Name of Interviewee: \_\_\_\_\_

Interview Number: Two

1. How has indiscriminate urban development affected the city?
2. What are your experiences when interacting with other stakeholders who had engaged in indiscriminate urban development of the city?
3. What would you do to motivate stakeholders towards ensuring sustainable urban development in the city?
4. What do you suggest that should be done to ensure sustainable urban development of the city?

Appendix D:		Coding Matrix Sample	
Participant	An actor in the city	Active in the sector for more than 5 years	Experienced indiscriminate urban development
Participant 1	Yes	28 years	Yes
Participant 2	Yes	15 years	Yes
Participant 3	Yes	32 years	Yes
Participant 4	Yes	30 years	Yes
Participant 5	Yes	10 years	Yes
Participant 6	Yes	30 years	Yes
Participant 7	Yes	34 years	Yes
Participant 8	Yes	15 years	Yes
Participant 9	Yes	34 years	Yes
Participant 10	Yes	33 years	Yes