2018

Exploring Ethnic Diversity on Managerial Choices in Nigeria.

Henry Odiri Imoni
Walden University

Walden University

College of Management and Technology

This is to certify that the doctoral dissertation by

Henry O. Imoni

has been found to be complete and satisfactory in all respects,
and that any and all revisions required by
the review committee have been made.

Review Committee
Dr. Donna Brown, Committee Chairperson, Management Faculty
Dr. Marcia Steinhauer, Committee Member, Management Faculty
Dr. Hamid Kazeroony, University Reviewer, Management Faculty

Chief Academic Officer
Eric Riedel, Ph.D.

Walden University
2018

Abstract

Exploring Ethnic Diversity on Managerial Choices in Nigeria.

by

Henry O. Imoni

MBA, Manchester Business School, 2013

BS, Usmanu Dan Fodio University, 1989

Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Management

Walden University

November 2018

Abstract

In Nigeria, most citizens between the ages of 20-60 believe that ethnicity is the leading

cause of discrimination. The central problem addressed in this study was how ethnic

diversity influenced managerial choices in Nigeria. The purpose of this qualitative case

study was to explore the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a Nigerian federal

traffic management agency to gain an understanding of how ethnicity influenced

managers' recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees. Complexity theory and

a consideration of African management practices constituted the conceptual framework.

Participants were 11 managers who were recruited from a Nigerian government agency

using a combination of purposive and snowball sampling. Data collection occurred

through interviews, observation, and government document reviews. Through use of

Yin's 5-step process for data analysis, data triangulation, and member checking, 10

themes emerged regarding managers' decisions: (a) federal character principle, (b) merit,

(c) ethnicity, (d) influence of godfathers, (e) favoritism, (f) promotion, (g) productivity,

(h) morale, (i) frustration, and (j) health challenges. A conclusion was that ethnicity

played a role in managerial choices. However, the execution of the current Nigerian law

to manage ethnic diversity allowed the alleged discriminatory actions of managers in

government agencies. Recommendations included a change in the implementation

strategy of the federal character principle to reduce incidences of discriminatory actions

in government agencies. This study may contribute to positive social change by providing

public service managers the knowledge to create an enlightened and fair public service,

free of ethnically induced barriers that have underpinned Nigeria's underdevelopment.

Exploring Ethnic Diversity on Managerial Choices in Nigeria.

by

Henry O. Imoni

MBA, Manchester Business School, 2013

BS, Usmanu Dan Fodio University, 1989

Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Management

Walden University

November 2018

Dedication

God, the Almighty, deserves the utmost dedication for my doctorate. He gave me life, sustained my life, granted me wisdom and the resources to achieve this milestone. Another source of strength and fortitude was my wife, Ahunna, who travailed with me throughout my doctoral program by creating the environment for me to thrive. She provided a listening ear on numerous occasions when I was frustrated along the way. For her role in my life and in this doctorate, she deserves as much honor as is bestowed upon me. I love you forever.

All my four children contributed immensely to this degree through numerous brainstorming sessions, academic research, and editing of my work. So, to Shawn, Stacey, Shantele, and Shane, thank you from a grateful and humble dad. Break greater barriers as I watch you surpass my feat.

Thanks to my beloved mother and my mother-in-law, who were and are more excited about my accomplishment than I am. Thanks for all your counsel and prayers. Together we have accomplished our goal. Finally, my thanks go to my late dad who several years before I started this doctorate prodded and cajoled me to push myself beyond what I thought was necessary at the time. In hindsight, I realize that I need this doctorate for continuous growth and development.

Acknowledgments

My deepest gratitude goes to my chair, Dr. Donna Brown, my methodologist, Dr. Marcia Steinhauer, and my URR, Dr. Hamid Kazeroony. To Dr. Brown, my knowledgeable and amiable chair, who patiently bore the brunt of my repeated errors in judgment, articulation, and writing and calmly navigated me through my maze of confusion, I am grateful. For me, the appellation *mentor* does not adequately describe her. Thank you, Dr. Brown.

To Dr. Steinhauer, my indefatigable second committee member, thanks for her precise and articulate counsel and intervention in my dissertation. Several times, she guided me in rephrasing my dissertation topic to save me some future complication. Thank you, Dr. Steinhauer. Thanks to the program director, Dr. Sandy Kolberg, who assigned Dr. Kazeroony as my URR. As a world-renowned expert in my field of study, Dr. Kazeroony helped to redirect my proposal to match up with current management thought; my proposal emerged better and more robust. I recall that Dr. Kazeroony's approval of my reworked proposal was one of the happiest experiences of my dissertation. Dr. Kazeroony, I appreciate your guidance.

Thanks to Dr. Samuel Aikhuomogbe, Dr. David Bassey, Dr. Aderonke Tayo-Tiwo, Dr. Adesina Adegunle, Henry Ationu (HEAT), Theresa Awala, and Julie Pettway Francis who provided listening ears and heads for collaboration and counsel. Kasia Disterhoft was my academic adviser and she was excellent in managing my affairs. Thank you, Kasia. Thanks to Walden University for providing the support structure that enabled me to concentrate on my studies. I enjoyed every bit of my doctoral journey.

Table of Contents

List of Tables

List of Figures

Chapter 1: Introduction to the Study

A recurring promise of successive Nigerian governments since independence in 1960 is to confront the social problems of unemployment and underemployment in Nigeria. However, irrespective of their efforts, these social problems persist. In 2016, the National Bureau of Statistics Report on unemployment and underemployment indicated that the economically active population within ages 15 and 64 living in Nigeria increased from 106.69 million in the second quarter of 2016 to 108.03 million (National Bureau of Statistics, 2016, p. 6). Unemployment and underemployment are only two of the problems confronting Nigeria; inflation and global competitiveness are other factors (National Bureau of Statistics, 2016). A reason for these social and economic problems according to Omotosho and Omotoso (2017) was the influence of ethnicity in the Nigerian public service. In this study, I explored the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in one federal traffic management agency (FTMA) in Nigeria. Specifically, I examined how ethnicity influenced managerial choices related to recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees.

The increase in unemployment and underemployment in Nigeria represented a 1.26% increase over the 2016 first quarter and a 3.57% increase when compared to the third quarter of 2015 (National Bureau of Statistics, 2016, p.6). The National Bureau of Statistics report indicated that the unemployment rate in the country for the third quarter of 2016 increased to 13.9% from 13.3% (p. 8). The increases in both economic benchmarks illustrate the urgent need for government and private sector employers to craft policies to reverse the increasing unemployment and underemployment trend

according to experts (Hassan, 2013; Olotu, Salami, & Akeremale, 2015; Omisore & Okofu, 2014). Aloko and Abdullahi (2014) postulated that Nigeria's elite might have unwittingly promoted rhetoric that fuelled the social differences using ethnicity and religion, and which resulted in unemployment.

As a multiethnic country, Nigeria has unlimited human resources to tap to harness opportunities and confront challenges according to Adegbami and Uche (2015). Meeussen, Otten, and Phalet (2014) presented a strong argument that ethnically diverse countries have the advantage of a more robust array of resources to employ whenever necessary when compared to monoethnic countries. Yet, in the view of some observers (Rindap & Mari, 2014), Nigeria's multiethnicity seems to have spurned managerial bias in public service. Studies by Asafa (2015), Omisore and Okofu (2014), and Rindap and Mari (2014) illustrated the problems of managerial bias in Nigeria that resulted in reduced productivity and suboptimal organizational effectiveness. The challenge for the Nigerian authorities is to take advantage of Nigeria's multiethnicity to unlock her potential while eliminating the incidences of perceived managerial bias.

Subsequent sections of this chapter contain the background of the study, the statement of the problem, the study purpose, the research questions, and the conceptual framework. In the conceptual framework section, I highlight the contextual, managerial, and environmental differences between the applications of Western-focused theories in Western countries and in developing countries. Chapter 1 also includes the nature of my study, definitions, assumptions of the study, scope and delimitations, limitations, and the significance of the research.

Background of the Study

For the purpose of my study, I use the term *managerial choice* as opposed to *decision-making*. An exception is when I discuss the literature on decision-making; when doing so, I use the term decision-making. When I developed my study, my focus was on the choices managers made and what the choices were based on, more so than their process of decision-making. Rusetski (2014) indicated that for a manager to make effective organizational choices, there needed to be a balance among multifaceted interests confronting the manager including particular circumstances, environmental factors, and stakeholders. A failure to identify and harness the information from the choices available to managers before decision-making might negatively impact organizational performance (Kelman & Hong, 2014). To achieve optimal organizational productivity, it is necessary for managers to consider all the underlying factors specific to each decision before making a choice.

Some recent researchers have made the argument that the task-centric and scientific management principles enunciated by Frederick Winslow Taylor, Henry Ford, Max Weber, and Henri Fayol did not apply universally (Haque, 2010; Kazeroony & Burr, 2017; Riggs, 2010). Haque (2010), Kazeroony and Burr (2017), and Riggs (2010) based their assertion on the different sociocultural experiences of those inhabiting Western developed countries as opposed to those inhabiting developing countries. Dent and Bozeman (2014) stated that contemporary realities such as globalization, racism, ethnicity, and culture had created some intriguing challenges for the practice of management as originally proposed by Taylor and others. Heyden, Sidhu, and Volberda

(2015) postulated that task-centric management was no longer the optimal solution for managing in today's world. The determination of managerial choices seems to depend on various factors.

Kazeroony and Burr (2017) concluded that local nuances and issues of cultural diversity influenced managerial choices. The assertion by Kazeroony and Burr supported the postulations by Haque (2010), Kazeroony (2016), and Riggs (2010) that the principles and practice of management prescribed by Taylor and colleagues were only fully applicable in Western countries. Other concepts advanced by scholars for managing in culturally diverse environments are cultural intelligence, which is the capacity to be effective in a culturally multicultural environment (Christiansen & Sezerel, 2013), knowledge transfer (Björkman, Stahl, & Vaara, 2007), multiculturalism, color blindness (Meeussen et al., 2014), and global localization (Appelbaum, Habashy, Malo, & Shafiq, 2012). Globally, other factors beyond Taylor's task-centrism and scientific management contribute to influence managerial choices.

In developing countries such as Nigeria, managers contend with variables such as ideological differences, normative inclinations, ethnicity, and postcolonialism when they make management choices (Haque, 2010; Kazeroony & Burr, 2017). Nigeria is a multireligious and multiethnic society with 371 ethnicities (Nigeria Local, 2014; Online Nigeria, 2016); the country's ethnic diversity highlights the pressure managers face in making managerial choices. Even with a constitution that advanced equal opportunity for all public service employees through the Federal Character Principle (FCP) to protect Nigeria's ethnicities (Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1999, p.49; Federal

Character Commission, 2017), studies indicate a detrimental multiethnic relationship in the public service (Barbarin & Richter, 2013). Some observers contend that the Constitutional provision of the FCP had nullified the principle of merit as a yardstick for employment and promotion (George, Yussuff, & Cornelius, 2017) and that, consequently, managers made choices based on subjective factors such as familiarity, ethnic similarity, and personal relationship (Anazodo, Okoye, & Chukwuemeka, 2012; Jacob, 2014; Rindap & Mari, 2014). In Nigeria, managers have to find a balance between the FCP and merit when making choices.

A federal government agency responsible for traffic management and control served as the host site for my case study. In conducting my investigation, I aimed to fill the gap in the literature on the role of ethnicity in a Nigerian traffic management and control agency. Previous studies had provided a general overview of the influence of ethnicity on management, such as those by Selvarajah and Meyer (2006), Franck and Rainer (2012), and Meeussen et al. (2014). I focused on a federal traffic management agency (FTMA) as the case for my investigation. The results of my study provide relevant knowledge to the management of the FTMA and similar government agencies about the role of ethnicity in managerial choices. Study results may also be useful to future researchers who might want to further the body of knowledge on this topic. The findings from my study might assist policy makers in drafting future government policies related to managing ethnicity in government agencies. Leaders of similar agencies might take advantage of the results and recommendations of my study both within Nigeria and internationally.

Problem Statement

Nigeria is one of the top five most diverse countries in the world, and ranks 45th

out of 47 countries globally that sustain diversity (George et al., 2017). Yet, studies

indicate that several decades of pronounced commitment for equal opportunities and

legislations, mandating equality have not addressed systematic discrimination in

recruitment and selection processes for employment opportunities (George et al., 2017;

Shen, Chanda, D'netto, Monga, 2009). Authors of Nigerian-focused studies agreed that

ethnicity was a critical factor to consider for various levels of decision-making

(Adegbami & Uche, 2015; Aker, Klein, O'Connell & Yang, 2014; Nnahuihe, Aghemalo,

& Okebugwu, 2014; Obo, Coker, & Omenka, 2014).

The general problem in Nigeria was that ethnicity was the cause for managerial

choices to be nuanced, subjective, and lean towards political or selfish interests (Jacob,

2014; Rindap & Mari, 2014), which could create systematic discrimination in processes

for employment opportunities. The specific problem was that employee experiences

created perceived discrimination, which led to reduced employee productivity

(Stevenson, 2014). The negative employee productivity caused by the perception in the

public service posed threats to Nigeria's economic development and its fragile unity

(Rindap & Mari, 2014).

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study was to consider the role of

ethnicity in managerial choices in a FTMA and how ethnicity influenced managers'

choices with regard to recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees. I collected

data from 11 managerial employees of a Nigerian FTMA and performed a document review.

Central Research Question

The central research question was, How does perceived managerial discrimination based on ethnicity sway employee productivity? The subresearch questions were as follows:

Sub Research Questions

1. What is the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in Nigeria's public service agencies?

2. How does ethnicity influence managers' choices regarding recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees?

Conceptual Framework

The conceptual framework for my study had two components: African management practices and complexity theory. African management practices come from African traditional beliefs, nuances, and culture (Kazeroony, 2016; Oghojafor, Alaneme, & Kuye, 2013). Consideration of the peculiarity of the African management practices was pertinent for my study because Western theories and models do not perfectly fit into the African setting (Haque, 2010; Kazeroony, 2016; Kazeroony & Burr, 2017; Oghojafor et al., 2013). One of the foremost proponents of administrative theory in developing countries was Fred Riggs, who postulated that the transition from agrarian to industrial economies caused cultural, economic, administrative, and social differences between developing and developed countries (Riggs, 2002). Consequently, existing Western theories and models were no longer a universal fit. Kazeroony (2016) advanced the

opinion that the situational and environmental basis for Western theories and models included formal, individualistic, competitive, democratic, modern, transactional, and other considerations. In most developing countries and certainly in Africa, the qualities and nuances that shaped management practices included respect for older adults, respect for others, equality, consensus, familiarity, and collective responsibility (Kazeroony, 2016).

Asante (2004) introduced and popularized the concept of Afrocentrism. Afrocentrism refers to methods and practices that promote transactions with Africans from an African interpretative lens as juxtaposed to Eurocentric perceptions (Asante, 2004). Ugiagbe and Ugiagbe (2015) provided an example of the futility of Eurocentrism on African countries as the unsuccessful imposition of World Bank policies in structural adjustment programs in various African countries including Nigeria in the 1980s that resulted in unexpected outcomes for African economies. Consequently, Ugiagbe and Ugiagbe advocated for a change in the mentality of African countries from Western theories and models to indigenous cultural and traditional practices as a way out of poverty. Jackson (2002) advanced the opinion that management in Africa privileged Western models, which placed pressure on African managers to meet Western standards without due consideration of African situational factors.

Complexity theory has various definitions. Thompson, Fazio, Kustra, Patrick, and Stanley (2016) suggested that complexity theory did not enjoy a universal definition and that theorists' failure to conceptualize a universal definition encapsulated the complexity of the theory. Thompson et al. indicated that the structure of complexity theory was

suited to the phenomenon of interest in this study. Mason (2007) defined complexity as the degree of diversity or heterogeneity occasioned by multifaceted factors such as customers, suppliers, and environmental, socio-cultural, technological, and political factors. Increasing disruption and complexity resulted in turbulence, and increased the difficulty in predicting outcomes that caused more change, and an increased need for adaptability (Mason, 2007). Mason (2007, 2015) defined turbulence as environmental and situational dynamism characterized by unexpected change.

Complexity theory was relevant as a conceptual lens for my study because the theory offers an explanation of the environmental, traditional, cultural, and situational convolution that arose from the application of Western theories and models to stimulate African management practices. George et al. (2017) stressed that the clash of styles between Western theories and African management practices was the outcome of the use of different managerial mindsets, with turbulence as a result.

Nature of the Study

Researchers agree that there are three principal research methods: quantitative, qualitative, and mixed methods (Kilburn, Nind, & Wiles, 2014; Lewthwaite & Nind, 2016; Merriam & Tisdell, 2015; Wisdom, Cavaleri, Onwuegbuzie, & Green, 2012). I conducted my study using the qualitative method. The qualitative method is inductive and comes from a naturalist perspective (Amitabh & Gupta, 2010). The use of the qualitative method enables researchers to understand why things happen the way they do (Barbour, 2010). Using a quantitative method, researchers aim to test the effect of variables on one another and replicate the process with another sample and in another

setting (Cole, Chase, Couch, & Clark, 2011). Researchers use the qualitative design to know and gain an understanding into the reasoning behind an action, thereby revealing insider perspectives of a situation (Eriksson & Kovalainen, 2015; Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). To understand how ethnicity influenced managers' choices in the FTMA regarding recruitment, placement and promotion, I used the qualitative method because of its depth of interaction and engagement with the stakeholders and the subject matter.

I conducted my research by using an exploratory case study design. A case study design entails the study of participants who are bounded by time or space (Yin, 2014). A case study design was appropriate because my research was externally focused; use of the design also provided the best option for gathering perspectives from multiple participants within the boundary of the host government agency. Yin (2014) posited that researchers are better able to answer questions "how" questions by using exploratory case studies; this was especially true in my case because I did not have any control over public policy managerial decisions. In addition, Yin (2013) stated that case study designs were more appropriate than other qualitative designs for exploring contemporary phenomena. I did not consider other qualitative designs for my study because their focus did not align with my study and consequently, were not a good fit. Kern (2016) advocated that triangulation be used by researchers to audit and confirm patterns and themes. I triangulated my data sources using semistructured interviews, observation, and document review to ensure study trustworthiness.

I opted not to conduct an ethnography because my focus was not limited to the culture of a group of people but included managers' choices in my host FTMA. Rhodes

(2014) stated that ethnography is an unstructured fieldwork that concentrates on the study of individuals' everyday life to explain the meaning behind the actions of the individuals. Neither was my study a phenomenological study because the focus was not to make sense of participants' feelings and essence of a lived experience (Gill, 2014) nor was it grounded theory. Merriam and Tisdell (2015) explained that a grounded theory aimed to develop a theory from the research findings. My study was not intended to be a narrative inquiry. Narrative inquiry is a methodical retelling of the story or lived experience of an individual or small group (Lindsay & Schwind, 2016). The differences in focus among the various qualitative designs showed that none of them aligned with the purpose of my study or my research question. The design that was the best fit was my selected design, the exploratory case study.

I used a purposive sampling method for my study as described by Eriksson and Kovalainen (2015), and Miles, Huberman, and Saldana (2014) with snowball sampling as a fallback option (Eriksson & Kovalainen, 2015). My sample size was between ten to twelve participants. All participants were employees of a FTMA at the managerial level. Data collection for my study involved the combination of face-to-face semistructured interviews, observation, and document review to ensure data saturation. In my data analysis, I utilized a combination of manual method and computer software to sort, code, develop themes, and analyze the data.

Definitions

To effectively undertake a discussion on how ethnicity influences managerial choices in a Nigerian FTMA, it was important to define certain key terms. Following are

the definitions of 11 terms that formed the foundation of my study and which are used throughout the study.

Diversity: Different identifying characteristics of minorities in a group including race, ethnicity, gender, age, religion, health, and education (Chen & Hamilton, 2015).

Ethnic diversity: The delineation of individuals by their culture, tribe, language or another distinguishing factor (Parboteeah, Seriki, & Hoegl, 2014).

Ethnicity: A commonality ascribed to individuals or human groups that share a common descent due to physical or traditional similarities (Baskerville, Wynn-Williams, Evans, & Gillet, 2014).

Federal Character Principle: A Nigerian Constitutional provision that seeks to guarantee a proportional representation for all opportunities in the Nigerian federation in such a manner to reflect diversity and portray equal opportunity for all (Cornelius & Greg, 2013).

Managerial choices: Alternative options available to managers based on management processes, strategic choices, organizational governance, stakeholder relationships, and business venturing (Kalm & Gomez-Mejia, 2016).

Managerial decision-making: Managers' ability to choose a plan of action from competing alternative plans to solve a particular problem (Al-Mamary, Shamsuddin, & Abdul Hamid, 2013; Djamasbi, Strong, & Dishaw, 2010).

Public servants: Individuals employed in the service of a government or government agency. Public servants encompass all administrative and technical levels and are professionals or experts in their particular vocation (Omisore & Okofu, 2014).

Public service: In Nigeria, agencies of government, civil service, legislature, and judiciary (Omisore & Okofu, 2014).

Quota system: An administrative system included in the Nigerian 1979 Constitution, which was intended to promote equity and fairness given Nigeria's diversity (Mustapha, 2010).

Race: The natural human uniqueness that distinguishes individuals from others and is responsible for actions that might be derogatory, discriminatory, or antagonistic to individuals with different uniqueness (Baskerville et al., 2014).

Racism: An oppressive system that allows for the domination, stigmatization, and exercise of privilege and power of one racial group over another (Malott & Schaefle, 2014).

Assumptions

One of the characteristics of a qualitative inquiry is a researcher's perspective of a phenomenon based on an understanding of the situation (Kemparaj & Chavan, 2013). For a particular purpose and often only temporarily, an assumption might mimic the truth (Vogt & Johnson, 2011). For my study, I made the following assumptions. I assumed that the topic of my study was relevant and highlighted a sociocultural problem confronting the Nigerian public service. I assumed that I would secure honest responses from the participants of my study and that the participants' responses would be impartial. I assumed that the participants' responses would provide thick and rich data, and the responses would be devoid of fear, recriminations, politics, or propaganda. In addition, I assumed that other materials that made up my data would be free of bias and political

influences. All these assumptions were necessary for the context of my study because it was plausible that participants might fake responses if they felt pressured in any manner.

Scope and Delimitations

The scope and delimitations of a study show the boundary of research conducted (Richards & Morse, 2013). The boundary of my study was limited to between ten to twelve managerial staff of a FTMA who served as the participants to achieve data saturation. Another boundary in my study was that all the participants were staff of the same FTMA, which meant that there was no consideration for managerial staffers of another government agency. The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study was to consider the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a FTMA and how ethnicity influenced managers' choices with regard to recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees.

The government agency selected for my study had a large number of employees to obtain an adequate sample size. To qualify for the study, participants had at least four years of working experience at this FTMA that made them eligible for placement and promotion according to the Nigerian public service regulations (Nigerian Public Service Rules, 2006). Selection of participants was through purposive sampling and when necessary, snowball sampling technique. A face-to-face interview for all participants was in an open-ended semistructured interview question format. For the findings of my study to be trustworthy, I outlined detailed descriptions of the process and the data was member-checked.

Limitations

Two limitations to my study were anticipated. The first limitation was obtaining honest feedback from participants and thereby leading to false conclusions. I mitigated this severe limitation by ensuring the confidentiality of the participants and partner agency. Next, I reiterated that my study was for academic purposes only and that my instrument was designed to leave out information that could be traced to a participant. There was the triangulation of my data sources to validate the responses obtained from interview sessions, observations of the participants, and a comprehensive documents review. The second limitation came from the data collection tool and this limitation was mitigated by my use of a snowball technique to secure participants. By applying a snowball sampling technique, a participant pointed me in the direction of another potential participant and assisted in encouraging others with similar experiences to serve as participants.

Significance of the Study

Ethnic diversity is a natural phenomenon that exists in most countries (Rubinstein & Brenner, 2014). Nigeria consists of an estimated 183 million individuals, 36 states, 774 local government areas (National Population Commission, 2017) and 371 different ethnicities (Nigeria Local, 2014; Online Nigeria, 2016). Nigeria's multi-ethnicity suggests a tendency to show favoritism to individuals because of ethnicity (Adegbami & Uche, 2015; Nnahuihe et al., 2014). Even where such an expected favoritism was not glaring did not imply that the decision maker did not harbor some form of bias. Consequently, the issue of the role of ethnicity in managerial choices that influenced

managerial decision-making was important in a country like Nigeria, which added to the significance of my study.

Significance to Practice

Rindap and Mari (2014) pointed out that ethnicity influenced almost every facet of the Nigerian society. Ogunrotifa (2012) postulated that in Nigeria, ethnicity resulted in narrow and personal interests that superseded national interests that led to violent agitations. Findings from my study assisted managers in the host FTMA to understand the role of ethnicity in their choices and be guided in future managerial choices. In addition, findings from my study revealed some Western-based theories and models used by managers in the FTMA that were not applicable to the FTMA because of particular traditions and nuances of the FTMA. My supposition was that when the public service workers perceived management to be fair, the productivity of the public servants increased. Loewenberger, Newton, and Wick (2014) noted that a harmonious work environment fostered innovation, as public service workers were more inclined to contribute and improve productivity.

Significance to the Body of Knowledge

Similar studies to my research that utilized government agencies in obtaining data included Ogunrotifa (2012), Omisore and Okofu (2014), Pitts and Jarry (2007), and Rindap and Mari (2014). However, no study existed that focused on Nigerian public service workers and how ethnicity influenced the decision making in the recruitment, placement, and promotion of public service workers. My study reduced the gap in knowledge by increasing the understanding of the role of ethnicity in managerial

choices regarding staff recruitment, placement, and promotion in the Nigerian public service. Implications might result in further studies in similar government agencies in developing countries; especially those characterized by multiple ethnicities. The results of my study might assist in further research and development of insight into decision-making practices that can provide fair hiring practices that may lead to a more harmonious work environment. In addition, findings from my study showed the origins of the current theoretical and conceptual framework for managerial choices in the FTMA and evaluated its success or failure to aid future managerial decision-making.

Significance to Social Change

My study highlighted a general social issue in Nigeria, especially in public service, in regard to the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a FTMA. The study might increase awareness to Nigerian managers of utilizing managerial models that are particular to the Nigerian environment. My research might create awareness that every Nigerian had responsibilities in the workplace, especially public service, irrespective of ethnic inclination that could translate to respectful interactions and exchanges without the allegation of perceived bias. The findings from this might assist managers in the Nigerian public service to mitigate and reduce divisive practices and rhetoric. The managers could enable the development of policies and processes that foster positive relationships between management and employees caused by a sense of fairness and equality in the Nigerian public service. In Nigerian public service, acting without bias might also mean impartial recruitment, placement, and promotion of deserving employees. In an

environment free of perceived bias, the public sector could contribute to the growth and stability of the country.

Summary

Chapter 1 contained a description of the challenges decision makers may face in Nigeria when using ethnicity as a yardstick. The conceptual framework of my study highlighted the inefficacy of Western focused managerial theories and models in the African managerial setting and how the misalignment of both the Western and African models might influence managerial choices. The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study was to explore the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a federal traffic management agency and how ethnicity influenced managers' choices of determining recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees. The exploratory case study design best explored my topic and provided the rigor for an in depth study of my area of interest. Chapter 1 comprised the intention for face-to-face semistructured interviews with a range of between ten to twelve participants, observation, and document review data collection instruments. Data analysis was accomplished using both manual analysis and NVivo 12 software.

Chapter 2 contained a review of past and current literature and provided an analysis and synthesis of scholarly discourse about the topic of ethnicity and managerial choices and decision-making. Chapter 3 involved details of the research methodology of my study, which included the participant selection criteria and plan for data collection and data analysis. Chapter 4 comprised the report of the data collection, participant demography, data analysis, and presentation of data. Chapter 5 consisted of the

interpretation of data, limitations of the study, implications of the study, and

recommendation for future studies.

Chapter 2: Literature Review

In Nigeria, what role, if any, ethnicity plays in managerial choices is debatable, especially considering Nigeria's multireligious and heterogeneous nature, with her 371 ethnicities (Nigeria Local, 2014; Online Nigeria, 2016). To ensure fairness and equitable development, the Nigerian Constitution recommended the FCP be used as a parameter for appointment and recruitment into government offices (Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1999, 2015, p. 49; Federal Character Commission, 2017; Omisore & Okofu, 2014). The general problem in Nigeria was that ethnicity was the cause for managerial choices to be nuanced, subjective, and lean towards political or selfish interests (Jacob, 2014; Rindap & Mari, 2014). The use of ethnicity in managerial choices could create systematic discrimination in processes for employment opportunities according to Rindap and Mari (2014). The specific problem was that employee experiences created perceived discrimination, which led to reduced employee productivity (Stevenson, 2014). The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study was to consider the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a FTMA and how ethnicity influenced managers' choices with regard to recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees.

In this chapter, I describe the literature search strategies I used to complete this chapter's literature review; I state the specific library databases, search terms, and other methods I used to obtain relevant historical and current literature for my study. Chapter 2 also includes an overview of the conceptual framework for my study and the evolution of management thought on the topic. Included in this chapter are discussions of diversity

and perceived discrimination and how both concepts led to group formation in select African countries. This discussion is followed by a review of the literature on multiculturalism and an analysis of managerial models of multicultural relationships including Hofstede, the GLOBE project, and postcolonialism. Next, I deliberate on racism and its consequences; I do so because racism is a likely consequence of globalization and multiculturalism according to Malott and Schaefle (2014). I then offer an explanation of decision-making and how managers make decisions based on available choices in the private and public sectors. Finally, I describe the structure of Nigeria's public service, explain the present recruitment strategies, and discuss challenges facing the public service.

The flow of the literature review is structured to provide an in-depth overview of the key terms of my study including ethnicity, diversity, discrimination, and managerial choices. Additionally, I arranged the literature review to illustrate to the reader the similarity and distinction between the Western context and the African context and how the African perspective influenced the key terms used in my study. Chapter 2 ends with the identification of the gap in the literature I aimed to fill and a summary of the chapter.

Literature Search Strategy

I used several sources to obtain information for the review of literature. I gained broad knowledge from multidisciplinary databases including ProQuest Central and EBSCOhost. Management and business databases including Emerald Management, SAGE Premier, EBSCOhost, ABI/INFORM, and ScienceDirect were helpful, along with

the search engines Google and Google Scholar in gaining relevant management perspectives.

I used several isolated keywords and phrases and a combination of keywords to perform the literature search including *ethnicity, race, diversity, culture, discrimination, bias, motivation, decision-making, managerial choices, managerial decision-making, public service, causes of discrimination, causes of bias, effects of racial discrimination, effects of bias, ethnicity in managerial decision-making, Nigerian civil service, cultural diversity, strategies and types of group formation, cross-cultural relationships, advantages of diversities, challenges of diversities, racial discrimination in government offices, racial discrimination in private organizations, racial discrimination in Africa, racial discrimination in other parts of the world, public service and federal government, public service and state government, public service and local government, African management practices, African management philosophy, African management thought, Eurocentrism, Africa, Nigeria, theory, developing countries, emerging countries, ethnic diversity, complexity theory, and managerial or diversity management.*

I limited the search to peer-reviewed journals whenever possible, and books published after 2012. I filtered the journal articles I obtained from searching Google and Google Scholar through Ulrich's Periodicals Directory to confirm that they were peer-reviewed journals. Not all the searches yielded many resources. I found few articles related to Nigeria's public service and none for the particular FTMA that partnered with me in this research, which indicated a gap in the literature.

Conceptual Framework

In my study, the conceptual framework was African management practices and complexity theory. The focus on African management practices was essential for the study because the practice of managerial decision-making in Africa is different from the practice of managerial decision-making in Western countries (Kazeroony, 2016; Kazeroony & Burr, 2017; Oghojafor et al., 2013; Oghojafor, Idowu, & George, 2012). The differences in managerial choices prevalent in African countries and Western countries originated from different environmental and situational factors (Haque, 2010; Kazeroony, 2016; Kazeroony & Burr, 2017; Riggs, 2010). The imposition of Western management theories in Africa without regard for particular African nuances was responsible for failed managerial practices in African countries, according to Jackson (2002) and, Ugiagbe and Ugiagbe (2015). There are differences in socio-economic conditions in different countries or regions that influence managerial choices. Consequently, the socio-economic and cultural conditions that exist in the Western developed countries are different from the socio-economic and cultural conditions in African countries, and these conditions influence managerial choices.

George et al. (2017), Kazeroony (2016), and Oghojafor et al. (2013) stated that the characteristics and strengths of African management practices included teamwork, respect for older adults, solidarity, a philosophy of all for one and one for all, and consensus. Some other strengths of African management practices included collective responsibility, interdependence, the sanctity of commitment, and respect for relationships (Kazeroony, 2016). Oghojafor et al. (2012, p. 74) proceeded to detail the following

attributes as core Nigerian values: consensus, competition and hero worship, coprosperity, extended family, respect for tradition, respect for older adults, and human relations orientation. Kazeroony (2016) described Western theories and models as foreign, domineering, consultative, democratic, autocratic, and formal. Other Western models and theories according to Kazeroony are transactional, modern, transformational, individualistic, and authoritarian. It is therefore imperative to understand the terrain and surrounding environment before deciding on what management style and principles to implement in order to yield the desired results.

Nyambegera (2011) described the difference in qualities and strengths of both the African management practices and the Western theories and models, stating that before colonialism, management practices did not constitute a challenge in African societies. Before colonialism, Africans lived and managed themselves based on culture and traditional practices (Nyambegera, 2011; Oghojafor et al., 2012). Inyang (2008) expressed the view that the colonialists' impression of Africa was a continent without adequate management structures, managerial inefficiencies, inappropriate management, and lack of qualified managers. Consequently, the colonialists established administrative structures alien to traditional African practices and introduced colonial organizations that exploited the resources of the African continent (Inyang, 2008). The erosion of traditional African management thought and practices by the Western colonialists resulted in undesirable outcomes for all the stakeholders (Eyong, 2017; Inyang, 2008).

Colonialism brought about a clash of cultures between the West and Africa, and the imposition of theories and models alien to African societies (Jackson, 2002;

Nyambegera, 2011; Oghojafor et al., 2012). Besides the clash of cultures between the West and Africa, colonialism highlighted differences between various African ethnicities and resulted to cultural boundaries that created a different type of awareness that was not compatible with the noble aims of the colonialists (Nyambegera, 2011; Oghojafor et al., 2012). The concept, African management practices shed some light into the factors that caused the disconnection in the successful application of Western theories and models in the African society. In my study, African management practices provided a means to understand the perceptions and perspectives of the managers in the FTMA in their recruitment, placement, and promotion strategies regarding the guiding theories or models used for decision-making. In addition, the influence of ethnicity in managerial choices was clearer.

The origin of complexity theory was the biological and physical sciences but lately complexity theory is applicable to social sciences (Chettiparamb, 2014; Gerwel Proches & Bodhanya, 2015). Complexity theory refers to the attempt to reconcile variable, dynamic, and nonlinear systems with structure and order (Mason, 2007, 2015; Meissner & Jacobs, 2016). Meissner and Jacobs (2016) stated that complexity theory exposes decision-makers to an alternative and nuanced perspective of issues. The focus of complexity theory is not to simplify systems, but to identify and adapt to unexpected occurrences, change, and complexities (Meissner & Jacobs, 2016). The failure of Western management theories and models to fit African management practices is due to complexities and unexpected occurrences germane to Africans (Kazerrony 2016; Kazeroony & Burr, 2017; Oghojafor et al., 2013).

Gerwel Proches and Bodhanya (2015) indicated that complexity theory is adept at analyzing various stakeholder relationships characterized by a lack of trust and transparency, overlapping opinions, uncertain future, and increasing demands. Curlee and Gordon (2013) posited that in using complexity theory as a lens, managers comprehend social behavior and align stakeholder perceptions, actions, and objectives to achieve organizational goals. As complex and nonlinear systems, individuals and groups are influenced by various stimuli rendering them unpredictable, and complexity theory best unravels and makes sense of the chaos (Bugra & Seker, 2013). Complexity theory analyzes interactions within and between systems and does not consider individuals, groups, organizations, and environment as closed systems (Montuori, 2013).

Mason (2015, p. 124) advanced the view that complexity has five concepts: self-organization, emergence, feedback, dependence on initial conditions, and attractors. Self-organization refers to innovative responses that emerge from disruptions that are neither instigated nor controlled by managers. Emergence refers to new actions taken consequent upon disruptive and unexpected occurrences. Feedback is either positive or negative. Mason stated that positive feedback propels change and pushes the system towards chaos, while negative feedback dampens change and pushes the system towards the status quo. Dependence on initial conditions indicates that in stable systems, minor disruptions results in minor systemic changes. Mason stated that in turbulent systems, minor disruptions potentially cause significant systemic changes. Mason referred to the attractor as a phenomenon that maintains systemic order while allowing change to occur.

Complexity theory provided for the various expected and unexpected nuances, complexities, and environmental and situational factors that might occur in managerial decision-making in the FTMA. Complexity theory enabled an individual to understand how managers decided who to recruit, where to deploy the recruits, and who was eligible for promotion in the FTMA. Nigeria is one of the most diverse countries on the planet (George et al., 2017) and one that is prone to discriminatory actions due to its diversity (Jacob, 2014; Rindap & Mari, 2014). Complexity theory provided managers in the FTMA a framework to incorporate all Nigeria's diversity and complexity to make choices that aligned with organizational goals and reduce the perception of discrimination (Curlee & Gordon, 2013; Mason, 2007, 2015; Meissner & Jacobs, 2016).

Literature Review

In this section, I review the literature on the topics diversity and perceived discrimination, group formation, multiculturalism, racism and consequences of racism, decision-making, and public service.

Diversity and Perceived Discrimination

In my study, diversity refers to human heterogeneous differences emanating from natural, situational, demographic, and environmental factors that are visible and invisible (Daya, 2014; Lee & Sharp, 2017). Diversity could be in the form of religion, gender, age, ethnicity, race, class, disability, and others (Daya, 2014; Lee & Sharp, 2017). The task managers face is how best to harness the benefits of diversity such as innovativeness and creativity, and reduce the tendency for discriminatory practices to achieve organizational goals (Daya, 2014; Kamwendo & Seretse, 2015). Stevenson (2014) posited that when

poorly utilized, diversity could negatively affect employees' commitment and productivity. Reduced employee productivity portends threats to Nigeria's economic development and its fragile unity (Gberevbie & Ibietan, 2013). Contrariwise, integration of individuals irrespective of diversity results in an increase in shareholder value (Ellis & Keys, 2015), inclusiveness and diversity management (Verma, 2014).

Discrimination is a prejudiced action, outlook, or treatment dispensed to an individual or group based on a prior bias (Mishra & Mishra, 2015). Harnois (2014) indicated that discriminatory practices could be unidimensional, oppositional, or intersectional actions against individuals or groups premised on a solitary metric or a combination of parameters. Chamberlain (2016) indicated that biases could be subtle or obvious. Subtle biases are mental blocks and beliefs that makes someone incapable of objectivity, whereas obvious biases are thoughts and interpretations capable of misleading an individual, especially when the individual dogmatically holds on to a position irrespective of the facts. Ethnicity/race, religion, gender, age, health, sexual orientation, and marital status are both broad types of diversity and potential causes of discriminatory actions (Elias & Paradies, 2016; Hedija, 2016; Souza & Cribari-Neto, 2015).

Ethnicity/Race. Ethnoracialism is a type of diversity and a potential cause of discrimination (Elias & Paradies, 2016; Gaddis, 2015; Lee & Sharp, 2017; Verissimo, Grella, Amaro, & Gee, 2014). Ethnicity and race are used synonymously in my study although Nittle (2016) suggested that ethnicity could be considered as a subset of race. In most parts of Africa, excluding South Africa, racial lines are much less defined and

ethnic differences are more clearly defined. Both ethnicity and race refer to a bias that has

roots in an individual's tribe. Parboteeah et al. (2014) postulated that there are both

benefits and weaknesses of ethnic diversity on decision-making and society. Elias and

Paradies (2016) indicated a positive correlation between racial discrimination and

negative health, manifested in anxiety, depression, and posttraumatic stress disorder

(PSTD). Debrah, Alidu, and Owusu-Mensah (2016) and Van der Meer and Tolsma

(2014) portrayed ethnic diversity as having a negative impact on society and could result

in conflicts that cause human, social, and economic losses.

Gaddis (2015) referenced prior research that showed racial and economic

inequality among the college educated. In a quantitative research that had a sample size

of 1008 pairs, Gaddis found that degree holders from elite universities had better chances

of attracting employers. However, discrimination was found to occur even in cases of

uniform educational degrees for White over Black employees. Additionally, the findings

showed that when White candidates received employer responses, they were for jobs with

higher listed salaries. For Black candidates with the same degrees, the reverse was true.

Gaddis' findings negated the notion that education was a great equalizer.

With an estimated population of 183 million people with 50.5% male and 49.5%

female (National Bureau of Statistics, 2016), Nigeria is the most populous African

country. Umukoro (2013) reported that the Nigerian population accounted for 47% of the

West African population and almost 20% of the entire sub-Saharan population. Nigeria is

a very diverse country, characterized with multiple ethnicities and divided along religious

lines (Umukoro, 2013). The exact number of distinct ethnic groups in Nigeria is not

known and varies depending on the source [e.g., 250 (Indexmundi, 2016); 350,

(Umukoro, 2013); and 371 different ethnicities (Online Nigeria, 2016)] and upwards of

500 distinct languages (IndexMundi, 2016) or 521 different languages (Online Nigeria,

2016). Due to its diversity, there are perceptions of discrimination in managerial choices

in Nigeria (Jacob, 2014; Rindap & Mari, 2014). However, besides ethnicity, perceived

discrimination also comes from religious, gender, sexual, age, and other differences

(Fernandez & Campero, 2016; Gaddis, 2015; Solaja & Ogunola, 2016; Tiwari & Dhatt,

2014).

 Religion. Religious difference is a type of diversity and another cause of

perceived discrimination (Tang, 2016). Ghumman, Ryan, Barclay, and Markel (2013)

noted that even though Title VII of the Civil Rights Act (CRA) of 1964, prohibited

employer discrimination on religious grounds, evidence showed that this practice was

still prevalent. Among other observations, Ghumman et al. (2013) stated that the

increasing religious diversity in the United States accounted for the increasing level of

discriminatory practices. Other studies showed that that the richer a society, the more

flexible were religious beliefs (Tang, 2016). Souza and Cribari-Neto (2015) found that

the level of religious beliefs and tolerance, national wealth, and the average citizenry

intelligence affected society's disposition towards homosexuality and resulted in

discriminatory behavior. Data for Souza and Cribari-Neto (2015) came from

representative samples from 52 countries from a global research project called World

Values Survey (WVS).

In a Nigerian focused study, Dowd (2016) found that leaders of Nigeria's Christian and Islamic religions were agents of religious tolerance and accommodation. The conclusion of Dowd (2016) was contrary to the perception that conflict was imminent and inevitable with Nigeria's almost even split in population between Christians and Moslems. Dowd (2016) arrived at a conclusion from a survey conducted in 2006 in four major cities in Nigeria: predominantly Christian Enugu, predominantly Moslem Kano, highly diverse Ibadan, and moderately diverse Jos. Another finding from the survey revealed more religious tolerance in the more religiously heterogeneous than homogenous areas (Dowd, 2014, 2016). A contrary opinion by Pate, Song, Abdullahi, and Umah (2014) postulated that a failure to convey the intent of Nigeria's two main religions by the religious leaders was responsible for over 50 ethno-religious conflicts between 1976-2009 that claimed over 100,000 lives. Pate et al. (2014) also stated that the Nigeria's current climate of discrimination and suspicion could be traced to its religious diversity.

Gender. Gender differences could cause discrimination and result in discriminatory actions. Fernandez and Campero (2016) revealed the problem of recognition of biases that impeded employee promotion beyond certain limits especially regarding race and gender ceilings that resulted from external recruitment and hiring processes. Fernandez and Campero found evidence of demand-related recruitment biases against women. The research by Fernandez and Campero came from data of 441 small and medium enterprises (SME) in the technology industry. A Czech public health sector research study showed the presence of a discriminatory wage gap based on gender

differences irrespective of similar competencies (Hedija, 2016). Findings showed that this gap mitigated in departments with female managers (Hedija, 2016).

In a study of wage disparity in the United States between 1970-2010, Mandel and Semyonov (2014) found more wage disparity in the public sector than the private sector and attributed this finding to the differences in the working hours between both sectors and the declining gender segregation in the private sector. Gender discrimination was not just limited to remuneration alone. In a study by Webster et al. (2016), findings showed restrictive high-ranking opportunities for women in academic surgery positions although the interviewees disavowed themselves from any discriminatory practice. As Benatar (2012) posited, discriminatory practices also existed against males. Situations such as an absence of immunity, forceful conscription into the military, sexual assault, or even the fact that females were more likely than males to win custody battles of children in a divorce are examples of discriminatory practices against males (Benatar, 2012).

Fapohunda (2016) advanced the opinion that in Nigeria, gender difference was directly responsible for discrimination and discriminatory actions to the female gender in a number of ways. Fapohunda (2016) indicated that gender disparities existed in education, political participation, employment opportunities, wage differences, and poverty levels in Nigeria. Some international organizations such as the United Nations and the British Council identified the lopsidedness in opportunities and developed programs to enlighten the Nigerian authorities and make the females more competitive (British Council Nigeria, 2014; United Nations Development Program, 2014).

Age. Urbancova, Cermakova, and Vostrovska (2016), and Vauclair, Lima, Abrams, Swift, and Bratt (2016) postulated that age differences were a cause of discriminatory practices in the workplace. Solaja and Ogunola (2016) stated the challenges of some employers to form successful multigenerational teams because of innate differences in perception, style, worldview, skill, and drive. In an experimental study using the socio emotional selectivity theory as a foundation, Simon, Suengas, Ruiz-Gallego-Largo, and Bandres (2013) found evidence of positive bias for senior citizens. Rood (2013) alluded to positive discriminatory practices including acts of courtesy, such as civility to the elderly, physically challenged, women, and children. Rood's conclusion emanated from the description and analysis of six textbooks that had foundations on neo-classical conception of rhetoric that highlighted civility in public conduct and discourse. Nwosu, Igwe, and Nnadozie (2016) posited a number of measures to bridge the generational differences in the workplace to avoid perceived discrimination: accommodation of differences, knowledge transfer, flexibility, respect, and others.

Health. Ben Halima and Rococo (2014) stated that an individual's health could be a source of discriminatory practice. Research by Ben Halima and Rococo (2014) revealed that individuals were unlikely to be part of the working population if they had a questionable state of health. In the United States, even before passage of the Affordable Care Act, employers were deliberately cutting costs by insisting on the recruitment of certified healthy employees and establishment of wellness and fitness programs for existing staff (Nash, 2015). Paetzold (2013) indicated that President Bush signed into law the Americans with Disabilities Amendment Act (ADAAA) to mitigate discrimination of

individuals with disabilities. From research conducted in Lagos Nigeria, Adeosun, Adegbohun, Jeje, and Adewumi (2014) found discriminatory actions against individuals living with schizophrenia. In addition to discriminatory actions, Adeosun et al. (2014) also indicated aggressive and inappropriate behavior against individuals living with schizophrenia from family members, friends, and caregivers.

Sexual Orientation. Souza and Cribari-Neto (2015) discussed the negative perceptions gay persons suffered in many countries and noted the positive correlation between a country's development level and attitude toward homosexuality. Hebl, Barron, Cox, and Corrington (2016) reported that in the United States, discrimination against the lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT) community persisted because of the absence of comprehensive anti LGBT legislation, inadvertently legalizing discrimination. Cavico, Muffler, and Mujtaba (2012) posited the reality in the United States of appearance-based discrimination, which is not a violation of present laws. The social implication was that employees were treated differently depending on the perceptions of how attractive employers viewed them and vice versa (Cavico et al., 2012).

Arceo-Gomez and Campos-Vazquez (2014) surmised that regulations such as for Mexican employers, which required employees to send their photographs during the recruitment phase, might inadvertently result in discrimination if the decision of who to hire relied on the assessment of the photograph by the hirer. Mize (2016) stated that lesbians earned higher wages than similar heterosexual females. The assertion by Mize (2016) showed the reality of situations where the discriminatory actions were not against but for individuals based on their sex or sexual orientation.

In Nigeria, there is little tolerance for individuals from the LGBT communities (Boladale, Olakunle, Olutayo, & Adesanmi, 2015). The intolerance is exacerbated because both major religions in the country are united in intolerance for LGBT individuals (Boladale et al., 2015; Dowd, 2016). In other forms of discrimination in Nigeria, some individuals undertake actions such as the bleaching of skin to alter their complexions to conform or suit particular tastes and preferences (Darj, Infanti, Ahlberg, & Okumu, 2015; Tumwine, 2015). The actions by the individuals who bleached the skin to gain some benefits indicated that discriminatory actions existed against individuals with a darker complexion.

Marital Status. Marital status could be a cause of societal and workplace discrimination. In a study conducted in Mexico, Arceo-Gomez and Campos-Vazquez (2014) found overwhelming evidence that marital status was a basis of discrimination, especially against females. Chiweshe, Chakona, and Helliker (2015) indicated that the patriarchic culture that exist in most African and middle-eastern countries is also a veritable promoter of discrimination through gender and marital subjugation and the imposition of limits on the female gender.

Advantages of Diversity. Prior research including Nathan (2014), Ozgen, Peters, Niebuhr, Nijkamp, and Poot (2014), Yanchick, Baldwin, Bootman, Carter, Crabtree, and Maine (2014), and Knights and Omanovic (2016) enumerated the advantages of diversity indicating that there were benefits to diversity. Innovation and productivity, cultural intelligence, and flexibility were advantages of diversity discussed.

Innovation and Productivity. Organizations that hire individuals with diverse

backgrounds benefit from the various experiences and perspectives the employees bring

that might enhance innovation and productivity (Adegbami & Uche, 2015; Meeussen,

Otten, & Phalet, 2014). Nathan (2014) stated that the constant mobility of skilled workers

across borders opens the possibility of a variety of perceptions, perspectives, and

differences in thoughts and actions. In a study of the immigrant population of firms in

Germany and The Netherlands, Ozgen et al. (2014) found a positive correlation between

the diverse immigrant population and productivity accentuated by increased firm-

innovativeness. This relationship did not hold true for unskilled workers in the same

study, which implied that possession of skills was a trigger for innovation in

organizations characterized by ethnic diversity. The notion of a positive effect on a firm's

innovation and productivity is not a universal opinion. Appelbaum, Kryvenko, Parada,

Soochan, and Shapiro (2015) found that the effect of ethnic diversity on productivity was

inconclusive. Management of diversity was what resulted in innovation and enhanced

productivity (Appelbaum et al., 2015).

Cultural intelligence. Cultural intelligence refers to exhibited intelligence in the

arena of cultural diversity and an individual's capacity for intelligent maneuverability in a

culturally diverse environment (Ang, Van Dyne, & Koh, 2006; Erez et al., 2013). The

four dimensions of cultural intelligence are metacognitive, cognitive, motivational, and

behavioral (Ang et al., 2006; Erez et al., 2013). Yanchick et al. (2014) believed that a

benefit of cultural diversity was the awareness and tolerance for individuals with diverse

cultures. From the analysis of the report of the 2013-2014 Argus Commission report,

Yanchick et al. (2014) stated that medical students who trained as part of a culturally heterogeneous community had better flexibility with patients from diverse backgrounds than medical students who did not have such training. With data from 485 participants of a United States university using regression analysis to determine the binary measure, depth measure, and breath measure, Crowne (2013) presented a somewhat different perspective on the argument that cultural exposure led to cultural intelligence by stating that cultural exposure did not result in emotional intelligence. An individual's awareness of diversity did not necessarily translate to an accurate expression of emotional actions.

Other perspectives. In a globalized business environment, as presently subsists, Knights and Omanovic (2016) indicated that diversity was a purposeful and deliberate corporate choice. The study of Knights and Omanovic (2016) adopted ethnography that took place in Sweden. Data came from three sources, archival research, observations of 19 meetings, and interviews with 23 participants (Knights & Omanovic, 2016). Jindal, Bagade, and Sharma (2013), and Knights and Omanovic (2016) pointed out that diversity was a necessary factor to better position businesses to meet global challenges and provide more tools to succeed in the market place.

Wuyts and Dutta (2014) found that corporate portfolio diversity resulted from strategic corporate diversity and that portfolio diversity did not necessarily translate to superior innovation or better products and services. Wuyts and Dutta applied secondary data obtained from FDA drug approvals, US Patent and Trademark Office, Recombinant Capital, and the National Bureau of Economic Research to 52 large pharmaceutical companies, and in addition to 432 observations. Rhode and Packel (2014) contributed by

stating the inconclusive findings that diversity produced better financial performance, although diversity led to broader perspectives in corporate boardrooms. The implication of this point is that whereas diversity has the advantage of breeding perspectives from multiple lenses, the benefits to the bottom line of businesses is at best inconclusive. Rhode and Packel's position came from survey findings and the analysis of various methodological approaches.

Flexibility. One of the benefits of diversity in organizations is flexibility. Diversity-oriented organizations could navigate and manage internal and external cultural differences through management policies and programs (Soldan & Nankervis, 2014; Verma, 2014). Organizations are better able to empathize with various environmental and internal diversity-related issues (Jindal et al., 2013). In addition, Verma (2014) alluded that diversity-oriented organizations were much less likely to engage in discrimination and discriminatory practices because of their inclusion policies.

Challenges of Diversity. Studies by Jindal et al. (2013), Knights and Omanovic (2016), Nathan (2014), Ozgen et al. (2014), and Yanchick et al. (2014) revealed that diversity brought benefits to organizations. However, other perspectives indicated that diversity comes along with organizational and managerial challenges capable of negative effects on organizations. Fujimoto, Hartel, and Azmat (2013) stated that it was not uncommon for organizations to suffer higher staff turnover, relational incongruences, and friction, exacerbated by stereotypical behavior and actions and perceived bias. Verma (2014) presented five challenges in the management of diversity: resistance to change, group cohesiveness and interpersonal conflict, resentment, fragmented communication,

and retention. Some reasons might be the notion that change is not needed or necessary, resistance from those likely to be affected, or trust and related switching cost issues (Zhou, 2014). Other reasons for organizational resistance to change include a fear of the future and an unwillingness to evolve (Loderer, Stulz, & Waelchli, 2016).

Verma (2014) indicated that group cohesiveness and interpersonal conflict is a challenge because management of heterogeneous as compared to homogeneous groups requires a different managerial skillset. Group cohesiveness and performance are inexorably linked together because the more cohesive a group, the better the group's productivity (Banwo, Du, & Onokala, 2015; Hall, 2015). However, Hall (2015) indicated that the rate of group cohesion is progressive in the various stages of an organization's group life cycle as originally presented by Tuckman (1965), which are forming, storming, norming, and performing.

Resentment is another challenge in managing diversity (Verma, 2014). Verma (2014) explained that resentment refers to the attitude individuals and groups exhibit when decisions are not collaborative and when decisions require forced compliance. Joshua and Taylor-Abdulai (2014) reported that a perception of discrimination or a lack of fairness could elicit employee resentment in the workplace characterized by diversity. Ethnocentrism, the projection, and imposition of a culture or belief above others because of the notion of superiority could lead to workplace resentment (Joshua & Taylor-Abdulai, 2014).

Rossini, Rincon, and Rutkowski (2015) posited that the fusion of national economies and markets through globalization brings along greater interactions among

diverse and geographically dispersed employees. Management needs to develop additional competencies in cosmopolitanism, intercultural communication, cultural sensitivity, and acculturation (Rossini et al., 2015). Bonaccio, O'Reilly, O'Sullivan, and Chiocchio (2016) reported on the significance of nonverbal communication in organizations. Diversity requires that individuals be sensitive to differences in others' perceptions, noting that what might be acceptable behavior for a group of individuals might be offensive to others (Bonaccio et al., 2016).

Verma (2014) stated the challenge of retaining female and ethnic minority employees who have relative higher employee turnover rates compared to male and ethnic majority employees with fewer turnovers. Verma posited that the reasons for the differences between both groups of employees are opportunities for career growth and levels of job satisfaction. Ali (2015) indicated that better organizational performance is more easily attainable with a gender diverse employee base. The findings of Ali came from a survey of 198 Australian organizations, and the primary focus was on the impact of a diverse gender workforce on an organization's productivity.

Group Formation

Besides natural factors such as common ethnicity from which groups could evolve, groups might form through common interests such as age groups, sexual orientation, or marital status (Nathan, 2015). However, Robbett (2015) stated that individuals with heterogeneous interests were known to have formed groups. Depending on the intra-group dynamics, Heckelman and Wilson (2014) postulated that groups might lead to positive or negative organizational growth. Gray et al. (2014) noted the existence

of groups, which have the "us versus them" trait, questioned whether the groups are homogeneous and sought to examine the areas of convergence that lead to the emergence of groups. From the study that used a model of reciprocity and transitivity as twin factors, Gray et al. (2014) found that groups were formed from continuous interactions of homogeneous populations when twin factors were present. Group formation did not necessarily require common identity, shared goals, or cultural differences. Individual differences spurned groups, and people exhibited differences because they belonged to different groups (Gray et al., 2014).

In a qualitative field study, Lewis (2016) presented a perspective that some studies erroneously attributed the emergence of violence to ethnic affiliations. The study by Lewis (2016) was a field study involving the formation and operations of 16 Ugandan rebel groups from 1986 to 2005. Lewis leveraged on knowledge from previous research that focused on data collection and analysis of previous conflicts up to 2014. Lewis obtained additional data in Uganda between August 2007 to January 2011, in 20 districts, and from 14 months of fieldwork. Lewis stated that ethnic affiliation was only an important point after the violence and was in itself, a result from initial stages of violence. Lewis' finding raised the question of whether ethnicity spurned group formation or do violence and agitations spur groupings.

Coevolution choices by decision makers could lead to group formation. In a multiple case study, Olsen (2016) espoused that both the state and institutional entrepreneurship shared responsibility for group formation through their choices of action and inaction using the concept of coevolution. Olsen utilized case studies from the

microfinance industry in Brazil and Mexico. Data came from interviews and archival records. Olsen stated that only groups that overcame challenges of collective action or were small and homogeneous could achieve preferred regulatory outcomes.

African countries have multifaceted avenues for group formation. Groups form along racial and ethnic lines, common language, religious affiliations, labor unions, and other forms of common interests. However, a cursory examination of African countries including South Africa, Ghana, Kenya, and Nigeria indicated that ethnicity might be the most prominent pivot for group formation. These countries have similarities with Nigeria in terms of multiracial/multiethnic diversity and how multiracial/multiethnic diversity results in-group formation.

Ethnic group formation in South Africa. Arch Bishop Desmond Tutu famously and fondly called South Africa the Rainbow Nation (South Africa History Online, 2015; World Elections, 2014) because of racial diversity. Although diversity and discriminatory practices existed pre-apartheid in 1948, the official segregation of South Africans by the apartheid government into White, Black, Colored, and Asian/Indian further exacerbated the fault lines resulting in different ethnic groupings (World Elections, 2014). Data showed that South Africa's hope for inclusion and official recognition for diversity resulted in the acknowledgment of 11 official languages (Brand South Africa, 2015; World Elections, 2014). Another action the South African authorities took to build unity in diversity was in the national anthem, which combined *Nkosi Sikelel' iAfrika* and *Die Stem van Suid-Afrika* in the traditional African song and the apartheid-era anthem respectively (World Elections, 2014).

Despite the concerted efforts of successive post-apartheid South African governments to reduce the inequalities prevalent in the country, data from World Elections (2014) showed stark differences in social and living standards, and economic achievements and potential. Although White South Africans ceded power democratically, the socio-economic landscape indices favored the White South Africans and revealed unequal standards (World Elections, 2014). Halberstadt et al. (2016) believed that racial differences facilitate the polling together of individuals or groups that enjoy or suffer from similar circumstances as they act as support structures for each other.

Ethnic group formation in Ghana. The Embassy of Ghana to the United States of America noted that Ghana had 75 different ethnic groups (Ghana Embassy, 2017). A breakdown from the same embassy and information from other Ghana-centric online publications noted that there were nine major ethnic groups (Ghana Embassy, 2017; World Atlas, 2016). This classification suggested that there are 66 minor ethnic groups in Ghana (Ghana Embassy, 2017). De Vries, Hamilton, and Voges (2015) indicated that in circumstances of ethnic diversity, ethnic groups gravitate towards each other and recognize their common identities. The fact that Jindra (2014) alluded to a tension between economic equality and diversity, which led to poverty, makes it more expedient for ethnic groups to positively harness their collective and collaborative energies through intra group synergies.

Ethnic group formation in Kenya. Kenya has more than 70 different ethnicities, with population ranging from the approximately 500 individuals of the El Molo tribe to some seven million individuals in the Kikuyu ethnic group (African Studies Center,

2017; The Center for Media and Democracy, 2012). Although Kenya is very diverse, there are only three broad languages spoken in the country: Bantu, Nilotic, and Cushitic (African Studies Center, 2017; The Center for Media and Democracy, 2012). Another fact about Kenya is that the tribes have particular skills, competencies, and interests. For example, the Luo, Kamba, Kalenjin, and Kikuyu tribes are artisans and traders, law enforcement agents, farmers, commerce and politics respectively (African Studies Center, 2017; The Center for Media and Democracy, 2012). This delineation represents ethnic group formation and the ethnic transfer of identity and values from one generation to another (African Studies Center, 2017; The Center for Media and Democracy, 2012).

Ethnic group formation in Nigeria. A consensus does not exist for the number of ethnic groups in Nigeria because of shifting boundaries, multilingualism, common descent, and logistical challenges (Mustapha, 2010). Indexmundi (2016) reported the number of ethnic groups in Nigeria as 250, and both Nigeria Local (2014) and Online Nigeria (2016) as 371. Mustapha (2010) stated that the largest three Nigerian tribes are Hausa, Yoruba, and Igbo and together, they account for 54% of the population. The Nigerian configuration seems to compel the other ethnic groups to align with any of these three along linguistic, political, and cultural lines to have access to appointments and opportunities (Mustapha, 2010).

Starting from the 1960 to 1999 Nigerian Constitutions, there were legal provisions of nondiscriminatory practices based on ethnicity (Mustapha, 2010). The intent of these provisions was to create a merit-based system of administration and dispensation of opportunities, scholarship, appointments, and so forth (Mustapha, 2010). In reality, the

largest ethnic groups acquired most of the opportunities offered because of their numerical advantage. Ethnic minority groups resorted to aligning with any of the large groups for access to beneficial opportunities (Mustapha, 2010). To redress this anomaly, the 1979 Constitution instituted the FCP and quota system (QS) as constitutional and administrative principles respectively (Mustapha, 2010). Subsequent Nigerian government policies to further recognize the marginalized ethnic groups were "zoning", "rotation", and "catchment area" regulations (Mustapha, 2010). Federal character principle, merit, quota system, zoning, rotation, and catchment area are government policies that revealed the expediency for ethnic minority groups in Nigeria to benefit from the Nigerian commonwealth. Mustapha (2010) stated that Nigeria seemed more of a power sharing arrangement and less of a federation.

Multiculturalism

The planning for ethnic differences and diversity is a critical success factor for all organizations (Cabrera & Unruh, 2013). Different managerial models of multiculturalism by Hofstede (1984), the Global Leadership and Organizational Behavior Effectiveness (GLOBE) project (House, Dorfman, Javidan, Hanges, & de Luque, 2013; Schlösser et al., 2013) and postcolonialism are relevant in the application of multicultural relationships globally and were helpful in my study. Furthermore, the discussion on the causes of discrimination, advantages of workplace diversity, and the challenges of diversity as evidenced in the literature provide additional lenses for explaining how diversity could influence managerial choices.

Managerial models of multicultural relationships. In multicultural

relationships, healthy, fixed, and regimented principles, and practices are no longer

universally tenable (Magda & Wachsmuth, 2014). Martin (2014) indicated that cultural

diversity had both positive and negative consequences in cross-cultural relationships. On

a positive note, cultural diversity could result in smoother integration, and on a negative

note, could lead to the creation of barriers. Bird, Mendenhall, Stevens, and Oddou (2010),

Caligiuri (2006), Cotae (2010), and Gabrielsson, Seristö, and Darling (2009) presented

intercultural competencies as they proffered suggestions for effective multicultural

management. Hofstede (1984) and the GLOBE Project provided some framework for

understanding and assessing interracial relationships on a global scale.

There is a growing school of thought that asserts that Western management

theories and practices do not fit universally. For instance, He (2011) postulated that

whereas Western management systems were system-focused, Chinese management

systems were human-focused and derived from Confucian ethics. Lee (2015) presented a

clear evaluation of the Chinese by describing the Chinese managerial mindset as a hybrid

between liberalism and conservatism. Kazeroony (2016) advanced the notion that

Hofstede's cultural dimensions did not capture the particular nuances in developing

countries such as Burungi bwansi, Kiringu, Ubuntu (p. 188), or Njiko ka (consensus),

Onye aghala nwanne ya (co-prosperity), and Igwe bu ike, which means unity is strength

(Oghojafor et al., 2013). Kazeroony and Burr (2017) argued that Hofstede propagated the

Newtonian positivist approach, which only advanced Western theories, models, and

mindset, akin to postcolonialism.

Hofstede's cultural dimensions to multiculturalism. Hofstede (1984) pioneered the provision of a structural basis to understand, plan, and manage multiculturalism and recognized the role culture played in shaping relationships as businesses turned global and inevitably traded beyond their home nations. The contribution of Hofstede provided a theory of how cultures differed, and how to predict human behavior based on cultural dimensions that inexorably resulted in differences in managerial decision-making. Hofstede formulated five cultural dimensions: Individualism-collectivism, power distance, uncertainty avoidance, masculinity-femininity, and long-term versus short-term orientation of thought (Hofstede, 1984).

Hofstede's conclusions came from employee responses to a survey at the IBM Corporation with subsidiaries in 67 countries. Hofstede surmised that occupational and employer differences did not account for dissimilar responses as compared to national differences. Aycan, Schyns, Sun, Felfe, and Saher (2013), Raskovic (2013), and Zheng (2010) postulated that the knowledge of cultural inclination of countries or societies of intended operation better-prepared businesses to train employees appropriately. Although the objective was to display the different orientations of various countries to assist organizations make informed market entry decisions, Hofstede's idea was limited in a number of ways. First, Hofstede's approach was positivist and did not explain the nuances of geographical areas such as sub-Sahara Africa (Kazeroony, 2016; Kazeroony & Burr, 2017; Oghojafor et al., 2013). Second, Hofstede's theory contributed to imposition of Western focused theories and models that did not fit the managerial

structure of countries in Africa resulting in failed managerial practices (Kazeroony, 2016; Kazeroony & Burr, 2017; Oghojafor et al., 2013).

   The GLOBE project. The Global Leadership and Organizational Behavior Effectiveness (GLOBE) research project involved 18,000 leaders in 62 countries that led to an extension of Hofstede's (1984) cultural dimensions to nine parameters irrespective of demography or culture (Welpe, 2013). The dimensions were performance orientation, assertiveness, and future orientation. Other dimensions were humane orientation, institutional collectivism, in-group collectivism, gender egalitarianism, power distance, and uncertainty avoidance. The GLOBE project team divided the world into clusters based on cultural orientation, understanding of leadership, and business ideas. The clusters are Sub-Sahara Africa, Eastern Europe, Middle East, Confucian Asia, Southern Asia, Latin America, Nordic Europe, Anglo, Germanic Europe, and Latin Europe (Javidan, Dorfman, De Luque, & House, 2006). In spite of the breakup of the world into clusters, Javidan et al. (2006) stated that there were cultural similarities across various cultures, and recommended that leaders and managers initiate relationships with multinational employees and diverse stakeholders from the areas of similarity. The classifications of the GLOBE Project were to equip would-be world leaders and managers with the requisite knowledge and information for multicultural ventures.

   Postcolonialism. Postcolonialism is a mindset that identifies the mentality and actions of colonies as barbaric, immature, developing, and primitive and elevates the mentality and actions of the colonialists as civilized, mature, developed, and progressive (Kazeroony & Burr, 2017). Kazeroony and Burr (2017) argued that postcolonialism

encouraged the use of Western theories, models, and paradigms without consideration for the particular culture, mindset, and nuances of developing countries in transacting and understanding the choices developing countries faced. Kazeroony (2016) postulated that the basis for managerial choices and decision-making in developing countries were Western values and principles that did not reflect the local nuances and did not adequately show the choices that best served the local indigenes.

The postulation of Kazeroony and Burr (2017) aligned with the assertion of Haque (2010) and Riggs (2010) that Western models of managerial processes are not compatible with the managerial processes in developing countries even to the extent of dysfunctionality. The incompatibility of Western models originated from differences in the culture, economy, and politics of developing countries (Haque, 2010; Riggs, 2010) and ideological lenses, symbolism, history, and artifacts (Kazeroony, 2016). Oghojafor et al. (2013) concluded that the application of Western management theories to Nigeria crippled the emergence and growth of indigenous management theories.

Oghojafor et al. (2013) reported that colonial administrators hoped that Western culture, values, and economic infrastructure could be seamlessly exported to Nigeria. However, Kazeroony (2016) stated that the basis of the African doctrine of management is local wisdom and practicality, which are as efficient as the Western management models. Kazeroony compared the strengths and qualities of both Western management theories and African management practices to highlight the impracticability of imposing one on the other: The Western model was formal, structured, authoritarian, domineering, participative, transformational, democratic, and modern among other qualities (p.198).

Contrariwise, the basis of the African management practice was relationships, ownership, collective responsibility, respect for others, interdependence; help to others, unity is strength, and compromise among other qualities (p. 198).

The similarity of some Western management theories and African management practices prompted Kazeroony (2016) to propose a continuing research that combines selected Western management practices and the strengths of the African management practices. Kazeroony (2016) indicated that certain aspects of Western theories and models could integrate with traditional African practices to develop a better managerial practice in Africa. Kazeroony (2016) advanced the notion that such a combination of management practices might form a unique management model that will guide managerial decision-making in African countries.

Fred Riggs was one of the earliest exponents of public administration in developing countries and was a proponent of comparative administration (Haque, 2010; Pollitt, 2010). Riggs (2002) identified the administrative, political, economic, social, and cultural differences of developing countries from developed countries as the nations transited from agrarian to industrial societies. In addition, Riggs postulated that the contemporary problems of diversity resulted from modernity and globalization, and that the problems exerted pressures on democratic institutions. Consequently, Riggs was adamant that existing models and theories could not fit universally (Pollitt, 2010). Although Riggs' theory endured criticism, even critics recognized the pioneering work of Riggs and conceded that the study of public administration would have been barren but for his theory (Peng, 2008).

Riggs (2010) called attention to three trends in understanding various approaches to public administration: normative approach to empirical approach, ideographic approach to nomothetic approach, and nonecological approach to ecological approach. Normative approach represents an ideal or utopic situation of what public administration ought to be. Empirical approach contains the facts of an issue and is a progression from what ought to be and ideographic approach represents studies embarked on the public administration of a single country or currency and nomothetic approach explains multi-level studies using multiple case studies. Nonecological approach is the study of public administration without consideration for contextual factors and the ecological approach to public administration is the best attempt to incorporate the factors of religion, tradition, and culture to public administration (Haque, 2010; Riggs, 2010).

Managing in a global environment. Various types of diversity are a characteristic of today's global business environment and because of diversities; uniform managerial strategies for all instances are likely to be unsuccessful (Raisio & Lundstrom, 2015). Consequently, understanding the nuances of the particular business environment and host community is a major managerial competence to avoid incidences and allegations of racism and discrimination (Brower & Mahajan, 2013). Scholars have postulated additional managerial models and concepts to effectively cope with diversity and combat perceived discrimination. For instance, in addition to multiculturalism, Meeussen et al. (2014) advanced the view that managers could apply color blindness in making organizational choices and decisions. Christiansen and Sezerel (2013) presented the concept of cultural intelligence as an effective managerial competence in a multicultural

environment. Dunn, Lafferty, and Alford (2012) stated that a capable manager must be culturally intelligent. Some other concepts are global localization (Appelbaum et al., 2012), and knowledge transfer (Avolio, Walumbwa, & Weber, 2009).

Racism and Consequences of Racism

Malott and Schaefle (2014) defined racism as an oppressive system that allowed for the domination, stigmatization, and exercise of privilege and power of one racial group over another. Ngo (2016) pointed out that racism transcends the transmission of behavior through words and actions. Words and actions that best describe racism are prejudice, segregation, apartheid, discrimination, antagonism, separatism, and intolerance (Benner & Wang, 2014; Marcellin, Bauer, & Scheim, 2013; Priest, Perry, Ferdinand, Paradies, & Kelahar, 2014). Racism is a critical social anomaly that has a negative impact on a population's health and quality of life (Gil-Gonzalez et al., 2014; Kwate & Goodman, 2015; Priest et al., 2014).

The justification of superiority results in discriminatory and derogatory actions, which creates power and social inequalities (Gil-Gonzalez et al., 2014). Priest et al. (2014) stated that racism gains expression through verbal insults, body language and facial expressions, threats, inaccurate or derogatory stereotypes, and profiling. Habtegiorgis, Paradies, and Dunn (2014) stated that racist behaviors from perpetrators stem from racist attitudes and results in experiences of racial discrimination of victims.

The postulation of Habtegiorgis et al. (2014) agreed with that of Ngo (2016), who stated that individuals' perceptions and orientations are the geneses of racism.

Racism produces segregation, fear, and *us versus them* mentality (Burrow, Stanley, Sumner, & Hill, 2014). Other consequences of racism not related to negative health outcomes include lost opportunities (Muammer, 2016), disunity (Bentacur, 2014), injustice (Asafa, 2015; Muammer, 2016), mutiny and chaos (Blasingame, 2015), and reduced appetite for work (Asafa, 2015; Blasingame, 2015).

Racial discrimination in Africa. Dionne (2015) examined the effect of social connectedness on cooperative behavior with respect to ethnic diversity and racial discrimination and sought to understand whether social networks could overcome the challenges associated with ethnic diversity and discrimination. Dionne's study adopted a quantitative approach and a quasi-experimental design and the sample size was 188 rural Malawians across ethnicities. Dionne found that ethnic diversity had no influence on participants' connections with a partner, but increased the possibility of cooperation between them. The relevance of Dionne's study was the addition of the concept of trust as a variable to determine the response of people in an ethnically diverse setting.

Xenophobia is a form of racism and has unpleasant consequences. In a study, Adjai and Lazaridis (2013) disclosed that Black South African citizens displayed xenophobic tendencies toward other Africans through discriminatory and prejudicial actions. Adjai and Lazaridis (2013) described xenophobia as the new racism that focuses on rejection and vilification of foreigners and outsiders to a community. Adjai and Lazaridis contrasted xenophobia as *new racism* to *old racism* by describing the old racism as propelled by perceptions of biological superiority, while the new racism was merely motivated by the disdain for a different race. Adjai and Lazaridis arrived at this

conclusion from their multi case study. Data came from interviews with 48 professionals and immigrants, archived materials, English and South African media reports, and official government documents.

Robinson (2016) revealed that contrary to the perception that loyalty and trust in African societies are exclusively tribal and not nationalistic, co nationality was as important as co ethnicity for loyalty and camaraderie. African citizens had as much pride in their nationality as their ethnicity, which suggested that ethnic neutrality existed within national boundaries. In the event of relatively weak national identifiers, there was greater trust for individuals from the same ethnicity. Findings by Robinson revealed a greater trust for co nationals in the event of strong national identifiers and came from a study with an experimental design. The field test and acquisition of participants took place in 16 Malawian villages and in all the village markets.

Racial discrimination in private organizations. Racism with its concomitant effects exists in private organizations (Bryson & Chevalier, 2015; Chavez, Ornelas, Lyles, & Williams, 2015; Davis, Frolova, & Callahan, 2015; Ishaq, Hussain, & Whittam, 2010). In a study of midsized to large organizations with a minimum of 500 employees operating in Australia, Davis et al. (2015) found a lack of understanding about how Australian companies perceived the issues of workforce diversity management (WDM), and equal employment opportunities (EEO). They examined how seriously Australian firms took the issue of diversity management and explored whether some notable Australian companies adopted best practices in their diversity management programs or not. The companies in the study were Australian Esso, Australian Digital, Honeywell,

and Westpac Bank. In a quantitative inquiry, 650 respondents who were midlevel managers completed self-administered questionnaires. Findings from the data showed that especially nonhuman resource managers did not appreciate the concept of WDM.

Using an experimental design, Bryson and Chevalier (2015) added to the discourse of racial discrimination in business by differentiating between taste-based and statistical discriminatory theories and practices. A taste-based practice is the propensity for someone to choose people of the same race or ethnic group for employment irrespective of competence. Statistical discrimination is possible in instances of information asymmetry, leaving potential employers little choice but to make choices based on characteristics such as race and age (Bryson & Chevalier, 2015). Data from the study was from a virtual labor market, specifically the fantasy football premier league of England. In this environment, hiring and firing decisions were made irrespective of race, but were based on available statistics of players. The sample size of employers, which was the same as the population of virtual football employers in England was 2.5 million individuals who signed up to play the fantasy game annually. The approximate number of virtual footballers available to the 24 clubs per season was 600. Conclusions from Bryson and Chevalier revealed that there was no evidence of discriminatory practice by the fantasy football employers either when they assembled their initial squads or during the season. The basis for their choices was available statistical information and budgetary constraints. Productivity drove employers' choice of players. The findings by Bryson and Chevalier showed that taste-based practices were isolated in virtual environments, especially when there was perfect information.

Chavez et al. (2015) investigated the relationship between discrimination in the workplace and alcohol and tobacco consumption using a large multistate sample of United States-based adult respondents. The study by Chavez et al. was a quantitative inquiry that had 70,080 respondents from pooled surveys conducted by telephone between 2004-2010. Chavez et al. found that workplace discrimination emanating from racial differences represented a risk factor for interracial consumers alcohol and tobacco. The study results also showed that groups of people that consumed either or both of alcohol and tobacco exercised discriminatory practices in varying degrees to others. They also found increased and consistent consumption of alcohol and tobacco among White nonHispanics and Black nonHispanics increased the incidences of workplace discrimination among the White nonHispanics and Black nonHispanics.

Ishaq et al. (2010) studied the effects of racism on limiting entrepreneurship of ethnic minority groups, mostly of the South Asian origin in Glasgow, and the potential impact on the local economy. Additionally, Ishaq et al. sought to understand whether racist tendencies acted as a barrier to entry for other entrepreneurs of South Asian origin. Ishaq et al. found that the entrepreneurial drive of the immigrant communities thrived because of racist barriers to employment opportunities. Ishaq et al. selected participants using a snowball method and used semistructured interviews to gather most of the data. The snowball sampling technique proved to be helpful in breaking down the suspicions and unwillingness of the respondents by starting with accessible respondents and having them reach out to others. The findings showed a diverse age group of entrepreneurs with the highest percentage aged 35-44 years. Most of the businesses had operated less than

three years reflecting that individuals sold their companies due to multiple factors. Sixty-four percent of respondents claimed racial abuse at their premises. Eighty-seven percent of the 64% who suffered racial abuse were men and 13% were women. Out of those abused, 73% said the abuses were only verbal, 7% alleged abuse with graffiti, 10% experienced verbal plus physical abuse, and so forth. Thirty percent of respondents noted that racism frequently occurred, 31% suggested racism rarely occurred, and 40% stated that racism only occurred occasionally.

      Racial discrimination in government agencies. In a multi case study by Soifer (2015) in South America, there was scant evidence that ethnic diversity resulted in racially discriminatory actions of reduced public good provision in Latin America, contrary to previous research. Soifer sought to examine the role of regionalism in the provision of public good and to question previous research that exclusively claimed that ethnic diversity was solely responsible for the discriminatory variation in public good provision. Soifer showed from cases in Ecuador and Colombia that demography and regional economics displayed as large population areas and distinct economic units were responsible for the variation in public good provision. Findings showed that due to different regional preferences in Ecuador resulting in political deadlock, public good provision was negatively affected. In the Colombian case, the regions preferred that provision of public good should be left to the regional administration. In both these instances, independent of ethnic diversity, regionalism was responsible for lower public good provision.

Using the theory of selective incivility, Cortina, Kabat-Farr, Leskinen, Huerta, and Magley (2013) advanced the notion that the concept of general incivility was a misnomer. In their opinion, general incivility was a modern appellation that represented discriminatory actions based on sex and race in work environments (p.1580). Incivility was the deliberate and subtle attempt and measures intended to denigrate an individual or group in the workplace, resulting in harm to the targeted individual or group (Cortina et al., 2013). Samples for this quantitative study came from 369 employees of a city government, 653 law enforcement agents, and 15,497 United States military personnel (Cortina et al., 2013). Results from Cortina et al. (2013) showed that individuals of color were more likely than their White colleagues to be targeted for racial abuse and discriminatory practices in government offices in the United States. In addition, women of color were more likely than their male counterparts to report such incidences. A reason that men of color were reluctant to report cases of incivility might be in the understanding that in the military, there was a greater threshold and preparation for fitness, abuse, and aggression (Cortina et al., 2013).

Iwara and Adams (2017) traced the history of discrimination by the Nigerian government and in Nigerian government agencies to the formation of Nigeria by the British colonialists. Iwara and Adams posited that there was a coerced amalgamation of the various ethnicities that did not allow for a negotiated union or understanding of the peculiarities of the various ethnicities. Due to the perception in many quarters of a lopsided union, and the perceived preference for some ethnicities by the British, discrimination became inevitable in Nigeria and in Nigerian government agencies (Iwara

& Adams, 2017). Discrimination in government agencies manifested in lopsided recruitments in the military and other government agencies and an uneven access to political and administrative power in Nigeria (Iwara & Adams, 2017).

The study by Okereke-Ejiogu, Asiabaka, and Umunakwe (2016) juxtaposed corruption and discriminatory practice in government agencies in Nigeria. Okereke-Ejiogu et al. (2016) stated that successive governments failed to reduce poverty among the rural populace of Nigeria, possibly due to a top-down attitude and noncollaboration with other stakeholders to service conception and delivery. Okereke-Ejiogu et al. affirmed that corruption was an aberration that involved the violation of legal, ethical, and moral rules and procedure, and facilitated discrimination by providing different opportunities to individuals. Data for the study by Okereke-Ejiogu et al. came from 216 respondents based in Imo State in Nigeria.

Decision Making

With globalization, competition, environmental concerns, and terrorism, decision-making strategies are no longer straightforward (Raisio & Lundstrom, 2015). Esan, Akanbi, Esan, Fajobi, and Ikenebomeh (2016) indicated that sifting through available choices, managers strive to prioritize issues requiring attention, choose between viable courses of actions, set goals, and improve the decision-making processes. Although decision-making is a continuous process, often the choices are off the mark (Hastie & Dawes, 2010). Iyengar (2011) reported that an average American makes approximately 70 decisions a day and that the typical CEO makes about 139 decisions a week. For organizations to be competitive (Garcia, Mendez, Ellis, & Gautney, 2014), effectively

manage complexity (Meadows, 2008), and minimize bias and automatic thinking (Hastie & Dawes, 2010), decision-making have to be controlled (Hastie & Dawes, 2010), and scientific (Stevenson, 2014).

Decision making in private organizations. Dalyander et al. (2016), Hastie and Dawes (2010), Okwir, Ulfrengren, Angelis, Ruiz, and Guerrero (2016), and Shahba, Arjmandi, Monavari, and Ghodusi (2016) were some of the numerous scholars who proposed processes to assist managers in organizational decision-making. Dalyander et al. evaluated collaborative structured decision-making (SDM) as an approach to add process understanding to mid construction decisions. Dalyander et al. proposed the deployment of SDM to achieve a unified course of action when confronted by multiple objectives. Through a formal process called PrOACT, Dalyander et al. developed a decision analysis theory to avoid psychological pitfalls capable of impeding objective, value-focused decisions. From a study, which adopted a qualitative approach to a case study design, Dalyander et al. found that SDM informed mid construction decisions in complex and dynamic environments and resulted in potential improvements in model implementation.

Okwir et al. (2016) conducted a quantitative study at Madrid-Barajas airport to determine whether collaborative decision-making (CDM) improved airport processes regarding turn around process (TAP). Collaborative decision-making was a standard process for airport operations for TAP that helped lower taxi times and other activities related to turnaround. The operational reductions in timing translated to improved operational efficiency and better profits (Okwir et al., 2016). Using data from 6500

observations from turnaround movements in 2014, Okwir et al. found no link between CDM performance indicators that impeded operational efficiency. Okwir et al. argued that there was not enough research on TAP that could be aligned with CDM operators and users and their collaborative output. The conclusion by Okwir et al. indicated the efficacy of stakeholder collaboration for better decision-making.

Shahba et al. (2016) investigated the strategies for waste management in iron mines to determine strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats (SWOT). Shahba et al. analyzed the factors of SWOT using two existing decision-making methods: Analytical hierarchy process (AHP), and technique for order preference by similarly to ideal solution (TOPSIS). Analytical hierarchy process calculates weights of evaluation criteria, and analyzes positive and negative tests of the SWOT factors. Shabha et al. found that the SWOT model was defective and SWOT factors could not be adequately ranked. A combination of the AHP and TOPSIS methods added to the SWOT analysis produced results that took all factors into consideration. Study results showed that strengths and opportunities of managing the mining wastes were more relevant than weaknesses and threats.

Kesler, Kates, and Oberg (2016) proposed a set of three actions that could result in better decision-making in large corporations: (a) the definition of the operating model, (b) encouraging better conversations, and (c) setting guardrails. Kesler et al. considered decision-making tools such as RACI (responsible, accountable, consulted, and informed) and RAPID (recommend, agree, perform, input, and decide) to be too simplistic and inadequate for complex circumstances.

Decision making in government agencies. In a quantitative inquiry that investigated the correlation between the autonomous and extrinsic motivations of local government managers and the expedition of citizens' involvement in decision-making, Huang and Feeney (2015) concluded that performance-based rewards did not translate to citizen participation. In addition, Huang and Feeney indicated that public service motivation had a direct and indirect positive effect on citizen involvement in government decision-making through person-organization value congruence. Data for the study came from a survey sponsored by the Institute of Policy and Civic Engagement (IPCE) of 2500 managers, randomly chosen from 500 United States cities between 2010-2012.

In a quantitative study to understand how European governments responded with new fiscal measures in response to the great depression, Raudia, Douglas, Randma-Liiv, and Savi (2015) discovered a general pattern towards centralized decision-making in 17 European countries. Raudia et al. stated that evidence revealed a culture of progressive centralization because the centralization of one part of a decision-making process resulted in further centralization downstream. Next, Raudia et al. found that more centralization resulted from a bigger failure rate to achieve higher organization goals. In addition, Raudia et al. discovered that when agency employees were more committed, there appeared to be a less need for centralized decision-making. Data for the study came from COCOPS, a comparative research management project in Europe that had 6701 senior-level managers as respondents.

In 2013, China proposed a plan for new urbanization to develop new urban cities with modern facilities all over the country (Wang, Xu, & Li, 2015). The Chinese

urbanization plan resulted in conflicts and competition between the central government and municipal governments and between the municipal governments and their officials. Wang et al. (2015, p.685) stated that the construction of the new urban areas, regional economic development, and livelihoods construction were the principal causes of the unhealthy inter local government competitions along. From the analysis of the data, Wang et al. concluded that the central government could reduce unhealthy competition among the local governments by strict regulations and control measures designed to improve market competition. In addition, Wang et al. recommended that the central government should provide punitive measures against local governments that exacerbated unhealthy competition through protectionism.

In 2014, relevant Nigerian government agencies displayed dexterity and precision in providing clear guidelines to the populace in combating the threat of the Ebola virus that ravaged some African countries about the same time (Fasina et al, 2015; Ogoina, 2015). The collective fight against the spread of Ebola in Nigeria indicated that certain decisions from government managers transcended the various types of diversity that likely breed suspicions among different groups and perceived discriminatory decisions (Fasina et al, 2015; Ogoina, 2015). Fasina et al (2015) and Ogoina (2015) postulated that the Ebola virus was effectively wiped out of Nigeria with clear managerial communication and decision-making.

Challenges in decision making. Irrespective of style, process, or strategy, managers strive to make effective decisions from available alternative choices to assist their organizations to maintain peak performance (Cotae, 2010; Dunn et al., 2012;

Ghasabeh, Soosay, & Reaiche, 2015). In a comparative case study of the board of

directors of four United States-based companies with a staff strength of 100-500, and

annual revenues between $18m-$60m, Stevenson and Radin (2015) reported that

informal networks among the board of directors affected the decision-making of the

board. The informal networks, which might be from everyday social habits or groups

formed a strong bond within the board and exerted influence and pressure on issues of

interest irrespective of whether the status of the board members was independent or

dependent (Stevenson & Radin, 2015). Informal social networks could mitigate

consensual and collaborative board decisions.

The second challenge to effective decision-making is indecision and delayed

decision-making by the decision maker (De Boer et al., 2015). In an exploratory

qualitative inquiry that explored the decision-making of relatives of severe stroke

patients, De Boer et al. (2015) found various results that suggested indecision, and a

reluctance to take necessary decisions. The participants in De Boer et al. (2015), which

took place between 2011 and 2013, came from purposive sampling from 15 individuals.

The participants answered in-depth semistructured interview questions.

The third challenge to effective decision-making is dogmatism (Nisbet, Cooper, &

Garrett, 2015). Dogmatic behavior is an unwavering attachment to creeds, beliefs,

morals, and experiences that restricts an accommodation of other perspectives and

perceptions. Relying on two sets of explanations called intrinsic thesis and contextual

thesis, Nisbet et al. (2015) found that conservative and liberal political doctrines

influenced politicians' perception of science. The intrinsic thesis revealed structural and

psychological differences between political persuasion and contextual thesis illustrated the notion that the differences in the perception of political doctrines are a consequence of the salience of science policy issues (Nisbet et al., 2015). Data for this quantitative study with an experimental design came from 1518 adults; issues of inquiry were fracking, human evolution, climate change, and nuclear power, which provided sharp ideological differences (Nisbet et al., 2015).

The fourth challenge to effective decision-making closely allied to dogmatism is bias (Bujar, McAuslane, Salek, & Walker, 2016). In a survey of 25 pharmaceutical companies and 14 regulatory agencies, Bujar et al. (2016) discovered that organizations had over confidence and intuition bias. Contrariwise, the regulatory agencies had stability bias and a preference for the status quo. The implication of these findings to practitioners was a recommendation for regular audit of current processes to determine the impact of bias to effective decision-making and when necessary, develop new tools and methodologies to decision-making.

Public Service in Nigeria

In Nigeria, public service encompasses agencies of government, civil service, the legislature, and judiciary (Omisore & Okofu, 2014; Yaro, 2014). Included in the Nigerian public service are the Armed Forces, police, and paramilitary organizations (The National Conference, 2014). Employees of government and government agencies are called public servants that cut across all administrative and technical levels and are professionals or experts in their particular vocation (Omisore & Okofu, 2014).

Federal public service. Public service in Nigeria is one of the most expansive

and expensive in the world, with 541 federal government agencies (The National

Conference, 2014). The Nigerian Director General of the Bureau of Public Service

Reforms stated that the number of Nigerian public service workers as at October 2015

was 89,226 individuals with about 3,000 individuals waiting to be uploaded to the

integrated system (Ndimele, 2016). With the deployment and implementation of the

Integrated Personnel and Payroll Information System (IPPIS), 65,000 ghost workers in

the federal public service were culled with a savings of $514 million in inflated salary

payments (Ndimele, 2016). Hira and Shiao (2016) stated that questionable and subjective

recruitment standards and biases resulted in the surreptitious recruitment of excess and

unwanted federal public servants. Yaro (2014) observed that most public service recruits

were ill equipped for the job, which was a form of double jeopardy for Nigeria because of

the extra cost on government resources and the lack of competence of the staff. Rasul and

Rogger (2013) posited that the scramble for public service employment is correlated to

the relative job security individuals enjoy in the public service. From their survey, Rasul

and Rogger (2013) found that the mean work tenure for Nigerian public servants is 13

years, with some senior staffers enjoying a mean tenure of 16 years.

State civil service. There are 36 states in Nigeria. The Federal capital territory

(FCT) has the same status as a state, but unlike the other states in Nigeria that have a

State Governor at the helm; a Minister of the Federal Republic of Nigeria governs the

FCT. The employees of State government ministries and agencies are called civil

servants. Yaro (2014) attested to the fact of similar recruitment standards in the state civil

service as obtained in the federal public service, which might suggest the possibility of subjective recruitment practices in the state civil service. Therefore, state governments strived to eliminate ghost workers from their payroll as well.

Local government civil service. The third tier of Nigeria's federal structure is the local government. There are 774 local government areas in Nigeria, and a local government chair heads each local area. The local government administration is closest to the populace and has functions designed to have a direct impact on the local people (Online Nigeria, 2002). Although they are civil servants, local government workers are called local government workers, probably to delineate them from state government workers and federal government workers. Even at the local level of governance, Ijewereme (2015) and Yaro (2014) stated that in Nigeria, discriminatory practices and corrupt tendencies exists in recruitment and promotion through nepotism, favoritism, and ghost workers.

Challenges confronting the Nigerian public service. Research on Nigerian public service including Ijewereme (2015), Osakede et al. (2015), and Yaro (2014) identified four challenges confronting the Nigerian public service: corruption, nepotism, discrimination, and political influences. In the following section, the social challenges and impacts of corruption, nepotism, discrimination, and political influences in Nigeria were discussed.

*Corruption***.** Corruption is the aberration of moral and ethical standards for personal gain (Ijewereme, 2015). Osakede et al. (2015) referred to corruption as an illegal and anti-social behavior that confers unmerited advantages to the actors. Osakede et al.

(2015) credited corruption with most of the other social problems in Nigeria such as kidnapping, poverty, insecurity, religious and ethnic crises. In the Nigerian public service, corruption manifests in a variety of ways including bribery, extortion, falsification, half-truths, and information asymmetry (Osakede et al., 2015). In a review of the literature, Osakede et al. found pervasive corruption in all aspects of the Nigerian fabric. In the public service, Osakede et al. found bureaucratic corruption that attributes directly to the public servants in the discharge of their duties. As staff of government, Osakede et al. (2015) stated that the corrupt actions of public servants weaken the moral and ethical authority of Nigerian managers.

Nepotism. Nepotism is an unmerited favor granted to an individual based on a family or ethnic relationship. Nepotism is allied with corruption (Osakede et al., 2015). In a study that used a comprehensive document review, Yaro (2014) discovered that the Nigerian Constitutional provision of the federal character principle served to enshrine mediocrity into the public service. Mediocrity was possible because of the need for ethnic balancing in recruitment processes, irrespective of competence and suitable candidates (Yaro, 2014). Yaro advocated for merit as the basis of recruitment instead of the present policies that sometimes guaranteed the employment of substandard staff.

Discrimination. Chamberlain (2016) identified mental blocks as capable of impeding objectivity in individuals, especially when individuals dogmatically held on to a position irrespective of the facts. Studies such as Osakede et al. (2015), Rasul and Rogger (2013), Rasul and Rogger (2015), and Yaro (2014) identified discrimination from a general perspective as a problem of the Nigerian public service.

Political influences. Every ministry, department, and agency (MDA) of the federal government of Nigeria has an appointee of the President as its head. In addition, in the areas constitutionally required, the President appoints a governing board (The National Conference, 2014). With vibrant political activism, Nigerian politicians, political office holders, and career public servants jostle to install their surrogates and cronies in every available opportunity irrespective of competence (Ijewereme, 2015; Yaro, 2014). The surrogates tend to bend the rules to favor their benefactors resulting in a vicious cycle of corruption and mediocrity (Ijewereme, 2015; Yaro, 2014).

Gap in the Literature

The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study was to explore the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a federal traffic management agency and how ethnicity influenced managers' choices of determining recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees. There had been previous studies that provided a general overview of the influence of ethnicity on managing, such as those of Selvarajah and Meyer (2006), Franck and Rainer (2012), and Meeussen et al. (2014). In addition, there was previous research that identified discrimination from a general perspective as a problem of the Nigerian public service such as Osakede et al. (2015), Rasul and Rogger (2013), Rasul and Rogger (2015), and Yaro (2014).

My study was unique in several ways as the research aimed to fill the gap in literature left by previous studies and adds to scholarship. First, I found no study that focused on any Nigerian MDA. Rasul and Rogger (2015) conducted the closest study I found that focused on ethnicity in the Nigerian civil service, which was a study on the

effect of ethnic diversity on project execution. Second, studies such as Osakede et al. (2015) and Yaro (2014) addressed the topic of corruption and recruitment processes in the Nigerian civil service respectively but from a general perspective. My study was a qualitative case study of a Nigerian federal traffic management agency (FTMA), which allowed me to gain deep insights into my research interest within that agency. Third, there was no known study that used African managerial practices and complexity theory as conceptual basis to explore the influence of ethnicity on managerial decision-making.

Fourth, unlike some Nigerian government agencies that operate from a central location or have a few regional offices, my partnering government agency has offices in most major locations in Nigeria. Finally, I found no study of ethnicity and the Nigerian public service that was a case study. My study provided relevant knowledge to the board and management of the government agency, to other agencies, and to future researchers that might want to further the course of the research. Future government policies might also benefit from my research. Other government agencies might take advantage of my study both within Nigeria and internationally.

Summary

Chapter 2 contained the literature search strategy and conceptual framework for my study that was African managerial practices and complexity theory. The two components of my conceptual framework highlighted the differences between managerial choices in Africa from the setting of Western societies, from where most theories and models emanated. Presented was an exhaustive literature of my topic including topics such as diversity and perceived discrimination, group formation, racism and its

consequences, decision-making, and public service in Nigeria. Stated was the pioneering

role of Hofstede (1984) and the GLOBE Project in understanding the nuances of

individuals and groups from around the world and the limitations of Hofstede's

perspective in Africa as explained by the concept of postcolonialism.

The research provided clarity about how racial and ethnic differences could

influence managerial choices and result in ethnic group formation in such African

countries as South Africa, Ghana, Kenya, and Nigeria. Interspersed with my review of

racism was my assertion that in Africa, ethnicity was more of a challenge than racism in

its strictest definition. Included in the chapter was a discussion on decision-making in

private institutions, decision-making in government agencies, and the challenges in

decision-making. In discussing the public service in Nigeria, presented were the three

levels of the Nigerian government: federal, state, and local government and the

differences among them. Finally, stated was a discussion on the gap in literature

illustrating a case for my study.

Chapter 3 contained the research methodology for my study including my choice

of design, data collection methods, participant inclusion criteria, data analysis strategies,

and ethical considerations for the study. Chapter 4 involved the report of the data

collection, data analysis, participant demography, and presentation of data from all data

sources. Chapter 5 encompassed the interpretation of data, limitations of the study,

implications of the study, and recommendation for future studies.

Chapter 3: Research Method

The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study was to consider the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a FTMA and how ethnicity influenced managers' choices with regard to recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees. I generated data for this exploratory case study from 11 participants using face-to-face semistructured interviews, observations, and document review. The documents I reviewed included handbooks, recruitment materials, annual reports, recruitment data, statistics on promotion, government documents and rules, and accessible media publications. The participants included managerial level employees of a FTMA in Nigeria who had a minimum of four years of experience serving as a manager. Findings from this research may assist management of the FTMA to understand the role of ethnicity in managerial choices within the FTMA and to create a more harmonious working environment in the future.

Chapter 3 includes a discussion of the case study design I used and a justification for its use, including how this design aligned with the problem statement, purpose statement, and research questions. In this chapter, I also deliberate on my role as a researcher in the study. Participant selection; instrumentation choices; procedures for recruitment, participation, and data collection, and the data analysis plan are also addressed. Chapter 3 concludes with a discussion of the issues of credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability, and an overview of the ethical procedures used in this study.

Research Design and Rationale

There was one central research question and two sub research questions for my study. The central research question was, How does perceived managerial discrimination based on ethnicity sway employee productivity? The first sub research question was, What is the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in Nigeria's public service agencies? The second sub research question was, How does ethnicity influence managers' choices regarding recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees? The central phenomenon of my study was to explore the influence of ethnicity in managerial choices in a Nigerian FTMA. To investigate the phenomenon, I used a case study design.

My choice of approach for my study was the qualitative method with an exploratory case study design. The choice of an exploratory case study design was because the use of such designs accommodates an in-depth and rigorous study of a subject matter within a context (Cronin, 2014; Yin 2014). Use of a case study design enables researchers to study and absorb subject matter and extract as much information as possible (Yin, 2014). A case study design is especially useful when the phenomenon being studied and the context within which the study is undertaken are not mutually exclusive (Yin, 2014). Use of such a design is also adequate and effective in the analysis of contemporary issues within the contexts they occur (Yin, 2014). Thomas (2015) explained that the goal of case study analysis was to find out how something happened, why it happened, and under what conditions it happened, as opposed to a statistical generalization that is characteristic of a quantitative method. In addition, with case study designs, researchers can use multiple data collection sources (Rossman & Rallis, 2012).

There are six types of case studies: descriptive, explanatory, exploratory, intrinsic, instrumental, and collective (Baxter & Jack, 2008; Stake, 1995). Researchers adopt descriptive case studies to describe phenomena and the real-life context in which the phenomena occurred (Baxter & Jack, 2008). An explanatory case study is better suited to explain causal relationships between variables and may be more applicable to the quantitative method (Baxter & Jack, 2008). The exploratory case study is preferred for studies where the concepts do not have a clear and predictable set of outcomes (Baxter & Jack, 2008). An intrinsic case study is one where researchers have a particular interest in a case irrespective of other cases or a general problem (Baxter & Jack, 2008; Stake, 1995). Researchers use the instrumental case study to understand something else from the study of a particular case (Baxter & Jack, 2008; Stake, 1995). Yin (2004) further categorized case study designs into single case study and multiple case studies. Baxter and Jack (2008) indicated that a collective case study has the same characteristics and is synonymous to multiple case studies.

The design choice for my study was an exploratory case study. I chose this specific design because I sought to explore issues that seemed not to have been addressed before in published research (Fahy, 2013), which include the role of ethnicity on managerial choices in a Nigerian FTMA. Findings from my study provided an initial process for evaluating existing publications against problems reported elsewhere with academic research (Fahy, 2013), laying the groundwork for future studies on this topic (Yin, 2014). Use of an exploratory study case design enables researchers to work with existing organizational and operational frameworks that precede a study (Berg, Lune, &

Lune, 2004). Verner and Abdullah (2012) advanced the opinion that an exploratory case study design is appropriate when a gradational framework would aid the understanding of an outcome.

I did not consider other qualitative designs because the focus of other designs did not align with the purpose of my study and consequently, were not a good fit. The focus of my study went beyond research into the culture of a group of people (see Merriam & Tisdell, 2015), to include managerial choices, which ruled out ethnography. The intent of phenomenology is to make sense of participants' feelings and the essence of a lived experience (Gill, 2014). A phenomenological design did not align with the focus of my study, and neither did a grounded theory study. Merriam and Tisdell (2015) espoused that the aim of researchers using a grounded theory design is to develop a theory from the findings of a study, which was not the aim of my study. Lindsay and Schwind (2016) stated that narrative inquiry is a methodical account of a story or lived experience of an individual or small group. My study was not intended to be a narrative inquiry. None of these designs aligned with the purpose of my study or research questions. A case study design seemed to be a better fit for my study purpose and focus.

Role of the Researcher

A qualitative research approach involves the study of subject matter within a context. During a qualitative inquiry, researchers occupy several roles (Stake, 1995). Stake (1995) stressed that researchers are fully immersed in the subject, yet researchers must remain emotionally detached to reduce or eliminate any bias and maintain scholarly integrity when carrying out the research. Qualitative research methods primarily consist

of face-to-face interviews, questionnaires, document review, and focus group interviews

amongst other methods (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). Qualitative research methods enhance

the dependability of study and authenticity of the collected data, while also ensuring the

quality assurance of the research (Cronin, 2014).

Researchers might introduce biases from their worldviews to studies, which affect

the studies' trustworthiness (Flynn & Black, 2013). As an individual, my worldview

leans towards complexity thinking and pragmatism. My complexity thinking worldview

indicates my belief in nonlinearity, emergence, adaptability, uncertainty, and coevolution

(Eriksson & Kovalainen, 2015). As a pragmatist, my focuses are on actions and

consequences of inquiry than the conditions that precipitate the actions (Eriksson &

Kovalainen, 2015). In qualitative studies and irrespective of worldviews, researchers

avoid as much as possible the influence of personal values and beliefs, demographics, or

any kind of relationship with the sample to obtain trustworthy results (Haahr, Norlyk, &

Hall, 2013; MacKenzie, 2016). In addition, in qualitative studies, researchers are

advocates, biographers, evaluators, teachers (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015; Stake, 1995), data

collectors, analysts (Collins & Cooper, 2014; Othman & Rahman, 2014), models and

mentors (Browning, Thomson, & Dawson, 2014). Cronin (2014), Leech and

Onwuegbuzie (2007), and Onwuegbuzie and Byers (2014) indicated that researchers

serve as the primary instruments of data collection, exploration, analysis, and

presentation.

Janesick (2011) postulated that an interview protocol acted as a guide for the

process of interviews to ensure data validity and dependability. The interviews were

recorded using two audio recorders and transcribed for coding purposes, thematic development, and data analysis. Two recording devices were used to guard against any malfunction in either of the recording devices. Details of data protection, data storage, and data destruction are further discussed in this chapter under the section labeled *ethical procedures*. In qualitative inquiries, personal bias is a challenge because the researcher is the primary instrument for data collection and analyses (Nichols, 2015). My role was as an observer only because I did not have any affiliation with the organization I used to recruit the participants. My interest in using the organization as my case study was unrelated to any previous connection.

Methodology

Researchers have the option of three approaches to conduct an inquiry namely quantitative, qualitative, and mixed method (Eriksson & Kovalainen, 2015; Onwuegbuzie & Leech, 2015). In a quantitative approach, researchers aim to test the effect of the independent variables on the dependent variables, describe the relationships between variables, and replicate the process with another sample in another setting (Frankfort-Nachmias, Nachmias, & Dewaard, 2015). Quantitative research is deductive, top down, and theory driven. A quantitative study has four main types of research design: classic experimental, quasi-experimental, cross-sectional, and pre-experimental (Frankfort-Nachmias et al., 2015).

A qualitative approach is typically inductive (Eriksson & Kovalainen, 2015; Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). In qualitative studies, the goal is to reveal a profound understanding of a phenomenon or situation. Qualitative research is bottom up and

theory building that involves generating new knowledge that might be used to generate hypotheses for subsequent research. Researchers conduct qualitative studies to seek answers to inquiries such as the considerations that influenced a result, and the epistemological and ontological premises for a response (Andrade, 2009). In seeking to understand phenomena, researchers adopt the qualitative approach to uncover layers of information capable of hiding the truth until the important theme is discovered (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). Irrespective of the qualitative strategy applied, this uncovering process is deliberate and painstaking. The most popular designs of the qualitative approach used by researchers are phenomenology, narrative, grounded theory, ethnography, and case study. Merriam and Tisdell (2015) presented different squalitative designs, each of which has unique qualities and challenges with subtle differences.

A mixed method study is a single research study that combines both quantitative and qualitative components simultaneously or sequentially (Bryman, 2014; Venkatesh, Brown, & Bala, 2013). In a study with a mixed research method, both the quantitative and the qualitative phases are necessary to generate answers to the research questions. Although mixed method is the most comprehensive and robust of all three approaches because of breadth and depth, the qualitative approach will be used. The decision was made to choose a case study design because case study provided the best possibility to answer the research questions and aligned with the research purpose. Within the qualitative paradigm, the exploratory case study design best allowed me explore my topic and provided the rigor desired. Yin (2014) indicated that the primary goal of a case study was the examination of phenomena in a specific location within a time frame.

Participant Selection Logic

Participants of my study were between ten to twelve employees of a federal traffic management agency (FTMA), with a minimum of 4 years of experience working with that government agency as a manager to ensure data saturation. The specification for a minimum working experience was necessary because a management level employee is eligible for promotion to the next level after four years (Public Service Rules, 2006). In the Nigerian public service, the lowest level that represented the most junior staff is level 4, the highest level that represented a director is level 16, and the management cadre is from levels 14-16 (Public Service Rules, 2006). In my partner FTMA, management cadre employees comprised of unit managers and departmental managers for a local, state, and federal office. Because the second sub research question concerned how ethnicity influenced managers' choices of determining workers' recruitment, placement, and promotion, it was expedient to ensure that the participants had enough experience with the FTMA to provide insights that addressed the research question. Fundamentally, the inclusion criterion to become a participant in my study was the conformity with the minimum number of years working with the government agency in a managerial capacity.

Participants were selected using purposive sampling as described by Merriam and Tisdell (2015). Purposive sampling is useful for qualitative inquiries and was helpful in my study due to its nonrandom characteristic (Maxwell, 2012). When the required number of participants for the study could not be secured through purposive sampling, a snowball sampling method was adopted. In a snowball sampling method, already secured

participants recommended other potential participants that faced similar circumstances as the initial participants ensuring qualified participants (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015).

A formal letter to the head of the local FTMA was sent informing him of the study and sought to obtain permission to use the agency as case study (see Appendix A). I attached a consent form to the letter. My chair vetted both documents before they were sent. The head of the agency requested for a follow-up visit to check for the feedback to the request. His intention was to pass on the letter to his superiors and obtain approval before formally permitting the partnership with the agency. The preemptive action of sending a letter to the FTMA was intended to reduce the anticipated delay after obtaining a clearance for data collection from Walden's Institutional Review Board (IRB).

Upon the receipt of a formal letter to me on behalf of the CEO of the FTMA, and consequent upon IRB approval to conduct my study, I sent another letter to the local head of the FTMA to notify him of my data collection instruments (see Appendix B). My data collection instruments were semistructured interviews, nonparticipant observations, and document review. A request in the letter to the local head of the FTMA was for access to the e-mail addresses of all the managerial employees of the FTMA who qualified to serve as participants in my study. I requested these addresses in order to send the expression of interest letter (see Appendix C) and consent form to the managerial employees prior to securing their participation in the study.

The head of the agency offered to identify qualified and experienced staffers located in various locations of the agency for my study. Although participants might be more quickly secured if he followed through with his promise, to ensure the credibility of

the study, I followed the original plan for selecting the participants directly using purposive sampling, which was through direct recruitment of participants. Interviews held in an environment and at a time that suited the participants and posed the least disruption to the participants' secular activities as recommended by Janesick (2011) and Yin (2014).

The number of participants in a case study design is variable and can range from one individual or case to multiple individuals or cases (Erikkson & Kovalainen, 2015; Yin, 2014). In qualitative studies, achievement of data saturation is found through the combination of interviews and other sources of data collection (Fusch & Ness, 2015). Fusch and Ness (2015) stated that scholars agreed that when there were no new codes, themes, data, and when the study was replicable, saturation had occurred. Face-to-face semistructured interviews of the participants added to observation and document review as data collection instrument. I expected to achieve data saturation in my study from the combination of all the data from my data sources.

Instrumentation

In qualitative inquiries, the researcher is the primary data collection instrument (Holloway, Brown, & Shipway, 2010; Marshall & Rossman, 2014; Merriam & Tisdell, 2015; Pezalla, Pettigrew, & Miller-Day, 2012). The data collection instruments were face-to-face semistructured interviews, observations of participants, and document review.

Interview method. Qualitative interviews are open-ended, designed to probe for deep meanings, patterns, reflections, and essence of the phenomenon (Marshall &

Rossman, 2014; Maxwell, 2012; Rossman & Rallis, 2012). Eriksson and Kovalainen
(2015) described interviews as creating access to someone else's mind to articulate their
stories. Merriam and Tisdell (2015) described interviewing as an art carried out daily and
in different forms to meet different needs. Consequently, interviews can be unstructured
(Marshall & Rossman, 2015), and can be either well conducted or poorly conducted
(Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). A well-conducted interview should leave the interviewee
with a feeling of interaction and exchange and not a sense of extraction or plunder
(Uribe-Jongbloed, 2014).

My interview protocol included the date, time, location, interviewer, and
interviewee on the cover page (see Appendix D). Included were the introductory
comments, purpose of the meeting, expected interview duration, personal benefits to me
and any benefits to the participant and the public. In addition, the interviewee was
notified of my plan for recording the interview, which was by electronic means, and
ascertained their approval to record or not to record. All interviewees were informed of
their rights, which included the right of a nonresponse to any question. Finally, I asked if
there were any pre-interview questions. If a willing participant did not want to be
recorded, I informed the participant that the recording was strictly for research and
intended to enable me fully capture every comment made between us to enable me to
transcribe them accurately. Following that, I notified the participant that the content of
the recording would be accessible to only me because I will do the transcription. In
addition, I reaffirmed the confidentiality of the interview. If after these steps, the
participant insisted on no recording, the interview would proceed while I would take as

many notes as possible. However, I actively recruited other participants that might not have issues with recording to complement the participants that did. I used the interviews of the first ten participants who permitted recording devices in their interviews. However, there was a consideration for the notes from the other participants to look out for discrepant information. The general aim was to make the interviewee as comfortable with the interview process as possible and provide alternative solutions to areas of discomfort.

My interviews were conducted in a face-to-face semistructured format. The semistructured format eliminated the possibility of a simple yes or no answer by providing the participants the platform to be expressive in conveying their opinions (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015; Yin, 2014). Yin (2014) stated that another benefit of open-ended questions was the possibility of follow-up questions, which might arise during the interview sessions. By using face-to-face interviews, the ability to note and record nonverbal communication was possible, which might not always agree with the verbal messages, thereby providing additional insights for my study.

Observation. Observation is probably the next most used qualitative data collection method after interviews. Even in approaches such as phenomenology and grounded theory whose main data collection source is interviews, observations add value to data collected, even if just for confirmation or triangulation of data sources (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). As a data collection method, observation is beyond the casual appreciation of a subject or object to a skilled and scientific approach to imbibing, recording, and documenting every possible observable action or event (Janesick, 2011; Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). Observation is a skilled art and science that involves a

comprehensive and systematic appreciation and documentation of the events, processes, or objects of study (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). Marshall and Rossman (2015) noted that researchers could identify themes through diligent study and note taking that a casual observer might miss. Skilled observation is an elaborate and comprehensive record for a study (Eriksson & Kovalainen, 2015). Ahn and Nelson (2015) and Koskinen (2013) identified researchers' dogma and bias as a weakness of observation as a data collection instrument. The implication is that researchers are unable to document and separate personal biases from what they are observing, leading to tainted perspectives (Ahn & Nelson, 2015; Koskinen, 2013).

I played the role of a nonparticipant observer in my study. In this way, observing my surroundings and the relationship dynamics between the employees of the FTMA without altering the conditions was possible (Parke & Griffiths, 2008). The span of my observations was for 3 weeks for a total of 24 hours, divided into 8 hours a week and 4 hours per session. The observation of my study participants was conducted at the worksite of the FTMA. I sought and received the necessary approvals from the relevant authority to conduct my observation in a nonparticipant status (Eriksson & Kovalainen, 2015). The design of my observation protocol included detailed descriptions of events, actions, and relationships I observed and my personal reflections from my observations (see Appendix E). My observations focused on relationship dynamics, productivity, and actions that assisted me to answer the study's research questions (Yin, 2014).

Document review. The final instrument for my study was the review of documents. As a data collection instrument, document review involves an examination of

all relevant and accessible documents related to a study (Zakaria, 2015). The documents were in paper or electronic forms (Adham et al., 2015). Documents reviewed for my study included handbooks, recruitment materials, annual reports, recruitment data, statistics on promotion, government documents and rules, and accessible media publications. Yaro (2014) posited that a benefit of a document review was its robustness and flexibility. The formal letter sent to the local Head of the FTMA included a request for all the relevant documents to be available for my review. I set a time for the review in collaboration with the administrative office in-house as most of the documents were controlled and not permitted offsite. Edelman (2012) stated that identifying and reviewing relevant documents assisted researchers a faster access to information.

Procedures for Recruitment, Participation, and Data Collection

There was an application for approval by the IRB at Walden to use the FTMA to partner with me on my case study and to gain access to the participants. In addition, I required the official consent from the head of the FTMA to use the agency as my case study. Before approval of my proposal, I sought and secured permission from my chair to send a letter to the FTMA to determine their interest in my study for two reasons. First, I suffered a setback in my earlier choice of another Nigerian government agency. Second, the process of securing official permission for studies such as mine takes time because of the official protocol that includes the approval by the chief executive officer of the agency. The initial contact inquiring their interest early in the process was to avoid the lag associated with bureaucratic delays. The FTMA partnering with me in the study has offices in various locations throughout Nigeria. My participant sample was between ten

to twelve employees of managerial level. To be selected for the study, the participants

needed to have worked with the FTMA for a minimum of four years, which ensured that

they had either been promoted from one level to another or were at least eligible for

promotion according to the Nigerian Public Service Rules (2006).

The head of the FTMA offered to identify competent and qualified employees that

could serve as the participants, which is a form of purposive sampling. I declined this

offer because of the possibility of bias. There were two participant-selection strategies for

my study. The first was a purposive sampling strategy. Eriksson and Kovalainen (2015)

stated that purposive sampling ensured the selection of information-rich participants for a

study. This sampling strategy eliminated a random selection of participants, who might

not have the required competence and experience for my study (Maxwell, 2012) and

select key participants for my study (Eriksson & Kovalainen, 2015; Wang, Rafiq, Li, &

Zheng, 2014). In the event that there were not sufficient willing and available participants

from my first sampling strategy, the second strategy to adopt was a snowball sampling

strategy. With this sampling strategy, one participant recommended to me other

participants that were knowledgeable, experienced and willing to serve as the participants

(Miles et al., 2014). Wang et al. (2014) posited that informal networks served to cut

through barriers associated with data collection.

I conducted all the interviews and performed the observations. Regarding

document review, I did a comprehensive review and analysis of the documents. I

requested for documents that I did not have direct access from relevant FTMA officials.

Irrespective of whether my required number of participants were collected by purposive

or snowball sampling strategy, I wrote expression of interest letters to each participant using their e-mail addresses notifying them of what my study was about and their required role. My letter notified them of their rights, and a consent form to the letters was attached that I required them to complete and return using my e-mail address. I considered participants' reply to my e-mail as signifying consent to participate in my research.

I conducted all the interviews within a two-week period to ensure that there was no time lag, which might slow down my study. There were personalized appointments with each participant for the interview. The interviews, which lasted approximately one hour, had questions traced to my conceptual framework and designed to answer my study's research questions. In concert with the participants, the interviews held in private places where both the participant and I were expressive and without the risk of a loss of privacy or eavesdropping such as private rooms in libraries, accessible conference rooms, and the worksite at the close of business.

Data for my study were stored manually, electronically, and by computer software. Hsueh, Lin, and Lin (2011) stated that improper data storage was a potential area of weakness for most studies and one that called the trustworthiness of research to question. During the face-to-face interviews with the participants, there were notes in a bullet-point format that enabled me to concentrate on the interviewee. The notes were used to record my observations of nonverbal cues and complemented the electronic recording of each interview session (Onwuegbuzie & Byers, 2014). I used two different recording devices to record the sessions to guarantee that I did not lose valuable material

due to any malfunction. After the transcription of each interview, I uploaded the transcribed material to NVivo 12.

After transcription and analysis of the interview material, I sent the transcribed material and my interpretation from the interview data to each of the participants by e-mail for verification and authentication. Even at this point, participants could change their opinions if they chose because it was important to accurately present the participants' perspectives. Yin (2014) advised researchers to be adaptive and be good listeners. Merriam and Tisdell (2015) described participant verification and authentication process as member checking, involving a layer of comfort to participants, in the knowledge that they were neither misquoted nor misrepresented.

Data Analysis Plan

The best-executed data collection plan would not produce correct findings without an effective data analysis plan. Yin (2014) explained that researchers required more than the knowledge of data analytic tools to have a successful research study; they needed to have a data analysis strategy. In addition to myself as an instrument, I used semistructured face-to-face interviews of between ten to twelve employees at a FTMA, nonparticipant observation, and a comprehensive document review to collect data and ensure saturation. The conceptual framework of my study provided a structure of the interview questions and the basis and need for the observations and document review respectively. Information from each of these sources of data provided the insights needed to explore the role of ethnicity in managerial choices.

My data analysis strategy included a combination of manual and computer assisted coding. There are two types of coding: precoding and open coding (Miles et al., 2014). I adopted precoding and thematic generation. Precoding entails that researchers have predictive or preemptive mind-sets before the coding of qualitative data (Miles et al., 2014). Merriam and Tisdell (2015) referred to precoding as deductive analysis. Miles et al. (2014) referred to precoding as deductive coding. Miles et al. (2014) explained that precoding was helpful in qualitative studies, especially for new researchers and in cases of time constraint. Miles et al stated that an advantage of precoding to researchers is that the practice is not random.

Precodes came from my conceptual framework, research questions, and/or problem statement (Miles et al., 2014). An advantage of precoding was that precodes assisted me to better articulate what the data revealed without having to make sense of it as the data emerged. I used a combination of descriptive coding and in vivo coding to sort the transcribed data. The coding methods involved the diligent reading and examination of the transcript for words and phrases that conveyed deep meaning from the participants. Coding is a subset of patterns and themes (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). Themes emerged from blocks of similar codes (Miles et al., 2014). Some of the themes I expected emerged from my data including bias, favoritism, frustration, productivity, and Quota System. As Merriam and Tisdell (2015), and Miles et al. (2014) indicated, precoding does not preclude me from being open to emerging codes and themes from the data. In qualitative studies, pre-codes are only a starting point for the coding process.

I used NVivo 12, developed by QSR International. QSR International (2014)

stated that NVivo 12 is a user-friendly application used to analyze a large amount of data

via a simple and efficient sorting system. NVivo 12 functions include its multi lingual

functionality (though all of my interviews were in English), information organization

through codes, cases, files, and themes (QSR International, 2018; Richardson, Earnhardt,

& Marion, 2015). In addition, I kept track of the participants' thoughts and ideas with

memos and annotations. NVivo simulated data patterns and enabled me to probe the data

using text search, word frequency, and coding queries. In addition, NVivo enabled me to

easily export and import documents from most other software and applications (QSR

International, 2014). Another feature of NVivo and a benefit for my study was its

multidimensional visual display. In this way, NVivo formatted results in charts, bars,

tables, and any other format that suited the researcher. In spite of all these stated benefits

to my study, the note of caution from Yin (2014) who stated that NVivo and all other

computer programs were not the main catalysts of research was instructive. Instead

computer programs are there to assist researchers. The warning from Yin (2014) implied

that it was my responsibility to drive my study and not expect NVivo 12 to dictate the

pace and strategy of my study.

Hussein (2015) stated five types of triangulation: data, theoretical, investigator,

analysis, and methodological triangulation. My study had data triangulation to ensure its

dependability and confirmability. Data triangulation is the use of multiple data sources to

ensure data robustness (Hussein, 2015). As a means of triangulating the data sources and

achieving data dependability, the coding and generation of themes for my study used data from the interviews, observations, and document review.

In the course of my research, I came across discrepant data. Njos, Jakobsen, Fosse, and Engelsen (2014) indicated that differences in timelines, attitudes towards knowledge, knowledge application, and organizational dimensions could result in discrepant information. Given that I intended for my research to be trustworthy, I checked to ensure that there were no flaws from the evidence that supported any discrepant information. When there were none, I admitted the discrepant data as part of the findings of my study. The admission of the discrepant data strengthened the transferability of my study because of the reporting of all validated opinions.

Issues of Trustworthiness

In a qualitative inquiry, the determination of trustworthiness of a study is between the phases of data collection and reporting (Elo et al., 2014). In qualitative content analysis, Elo et al. (2014) stated that trustworthiness includes dependability, credibility, transferability, conformability, and authenticity. This framework is an extension of Houghton, Casey, Shaw, and Murphy (2013) and Lincoln and Guba (1985) that did not have authenticity as part of the framework of trustworthiness. The premise of trustworthiness of research is to convey the point that there is intellectual rigor in a study and that the researchers spare no effort to validate findings (Elo et al., 2014; Houghton et al., 2013). Mill and Ogilvie (2002) proffered a different perspective for assessing the rigor of a study. Mill and Ogilvie said that a full disclosure by participants, understanding, and accommodation of different communication styles, and the

encouragement of reciprocity from both researchers and participants were crucial to determine the rigor of a study.

Credibility

Credibility is similar to internal validity. Elo et al. (2014) described credibility regarding accurate identification and description of all participants of a study. Houghton et al. (2013) posited that the strategies to ensure the credibility of studies included the following: triangulation, member checking, prolonged engagement, persistent observation, and peer debriefing. I ensured credibility by adopting the following measures: First, I conducted face-to-face semistructured interviews with between ten to twelve managerial employees of the FTMA. I gained additional insights from my nonparticipant observations and obtained addition information from my comprehensive document review to ensure saturation. Second, through the process of member checking, I had the participants review my interpretations from their comments to confirm that my understanding represented their responses to interview questions. Where there were misunderstandings or discrepancies, I made the adjustment and utilized both sources of data. Third, I designed my interview sessions to be engaging. Each interview was estimated to last approximately one hour. Within this duration, I asked and obtained responses to all my interview questions unless a participant declined to answer some questions. During the interviews, I ensured that neither the participant nor I veered off-topic. My observations encompassed the period before, during, and after the interview sessions.

Transferability

Transferability in qualitative studies is similar with external validity. Transferability means the possibility to extrapolate findings from one setting to another without losing its meaning (Elo et al., 2014; Houghton et al., 2013). For a study to be transferable, it must be comprised of thick descriptions (Houghton et al., 2013). I provided comprehensive details of my selected research approach, design, and method so that current and future researchers would have a clear view of how my study evolved. Although my case study was on a Nigerian government traffic management and control agency, I presented the details in such a way that transferability is possible to other government agencies and large private multi ethnic organizations. The determination of whether study results can be generalized to other settings or cases is the responsibility of the researchers (Marshall & Rossman, 2015; Stake, 1995).

Dependability

Dependability in qualitative studies is what reliability is to quantitative studies. Elo et al. (2014) indicated that the dependability of a study referred to data stability irrespective of time and condition. Houghton et al. (2013) stated that dependability in qualitative inquiries was possible through audit trails and reflexivity. In my study and through my audit trail, I presented the various choices and decisions I made and showed my rationale for the actions. Triangulation of data sources was another strategy I used to ensure dependability of my study. The interviews, observations, and document review complemented and reinforced each other, which made my study robust. In addition to the audit trail and triangulation, I used a process called reflexivity to make my study

dependable. Through the diligent recording of processes, events, and milestones in my journal, I showed how I connected ideas gained from other scholars to what my study reported.

Confirmability

Confirmability in qualitative inquiries is what objectivity is in quantitative studies. As a framework for trustworthiness, the thrust of confirmability is to determine that I took objective steps to obtain the decisions made (Houghton et al. 2013). Through the audit trail, discussed were the various options available and the choices made, which made my study confirmable. In addition, through my reflective journal, I discussed my mindset, motivations, and the unique circumstances behind my decision-making in all the aspects of my study including the choice of case study, coding and thematic generation, decision about transcription, etc.

Ethical Procedures

Unattended and unresolved ethical issues and bias can damage the credibility of a qualitative study. Some ethical issues concern trust and transparency (Yardley, Watts, Pearson, & Richardson, 2014), deception (Haahr et al., 2013), confidentiality of participants (Huang, O'Connor, Ke, & Lee, 2014; Merriam & Tisdell, 2015), obtaining approval from relevant authorities (Huang et al., 2014), and badgering or bullying (Smit & Scherman, 2016). Researcher bias can occur when personal history, experience, and education affect the interview questions and approach to the study (Smit & Scherman, 2016). Bias can also occur when the interviewer asks leading questions or displays suggestive body languages or signal to influence the interviewee (Haahr et al., 2013).

I took the following steps to mitigate ethical concerns: first, I applied for the approval of the IRB of Walden University to conduct my data collection. The IRB is akin to a protector of the integrity of a research and all the parties in the research. The approval of the IRB is a validation of the thrust of a study and a tacit permission to collect data for the study. Second, irrespective of whether I selected the participants through purposive sampling or snowball sampling, in line with my interview protocol, I wrote personalized letters to all the participants to obtain their consent. Huang et al. (2014) explained that an informed consent showed that participants were fully aware of the study purpose and accepted their role in participating. In the letter, I stated the purpose of the study and the research questions of the study. I also stated their right to refuse to participate in the study before, during, or after participating and their right to decline to answer any question they found uncomfortable.

Third, I took measures to guarantee the confidentiality of the participants. One of the measures was not to label the data with the original names of the participant. Instead, I used identifiers that enabled me only to match a set of responses with each participant. Another measure was to personally do the transcription to avoid voice recognition from a hired transcriber. I ensured that information from one participant was not transferred to another participant. In addition to the guarantee of the participants' confidentiality, I notified them of my willingness to have them proof read the transcribed interview and my interpretation by sending it to them by e-mail, to guard against misrepresentation or misquote.

Throughout my study, I was deliberate not to mention the particular FTMA location that partnered with me in my research to protect their confidentiality. Bojanc and Jerman-Blazic (2013) noted that confidentiality was blocking unauthorized individuals from having access to data. I kept all physically collected data including recordings and transcribed materials in a secured safe deposit box at a Fidelity Bank PLC branch in Port Harcourt, Nigeria for the required five year period after graduation. Additionally, all data on electronic files were password coded and inaccessible to anyone but me for the five-year duration after graduation. I will destroy all the data from the study after the mandatory five years of graduation by retrieving and shredding all the paper documents, ripping apart all the tapes, and deleting all the files stored on my computer. Upon the conclusion of my study, I will send my complete dissertation and a two-page summary via e-mail to the head of my partner agency. Additionally, I will e-mail a two-page summary of the results of the study to all participants.

Summary

In Chapter 3, my choice for a qualitative approach to my study was explained and justified. The exploratory case study was the best design suited for my study because it brought up issues not addressed in published research. The exploratory case study allowed me work with existing organizational and operational frameworks that preceded my study in my host site and thus provided me the best possibility for answering the research questions. I indicated that between ten to twelve employees of the FTMA from the managerial level would be the participants for my study and that these staffers must

have been engaged with the FTMA for a minimum of four years to be eligible for promotion according to the Nigerian public service rules.

In addition to face-to-face semistructured interviews, indicated was that I collected data through nonparticipant observations and document review. In this chapter, I explained that data was processed through manual transcription, coding, and thematic generation. The computer software NVivo 12 enabled the generation of additional codes and themes, and in organizing and presenting the results. The integrity of the study was addressed through data triangulation, member checking, thick descriptions, and keeping an audit trail.

Chapter 4 comprised the report of the data collection, data analysis, participant demography, and presentation of data from all data sources. Chapter 4 yielded 10 emergent themes for the study. Chapter 5 contained the interpretation of data, limitations of the study, implications of the study, and recommendation for future studies.

Chapter 4: Results

Chapter 4 contains the presentation of the findings and analysis from my data collection that came from interviews, observations, and document review. The face-to-face semistructured interviews were with eleven managers of a FTMA. For the interviews, there was a prepared protocol that had 11 semistructured questions (Appendix C) inspired by my conceptual framework and research questions. The second data source was through my nonparticipant observations. The duration of my observations was 3 weeks for a total of 24 hours, divided into 8 hours a week and 4 hours per session, and the observations of participants were conducted at the worksite of the FTMA. The third data source was through a comprehensive document review. Documents reviewed included handbooks, recruitment materials, annual reports, recruitment data, statistics on promotion, government documents and rules, and accessible media publications. The computer software NVivo 12 assisted me in completing my analysis, having manually started the analytic process.

My data sources enabled me to study the purpose of this exploratory case study. The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study was to consider the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a FTMA and how ethnicity influenced managers' choices with regard to recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees. The findings from the data collection shed light on answering my central research question and two sub research questions. My central research question was, how does perceived managerial discrimination based on ethnicity sway employee productivity? The first sub research question was: what is the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in Nigeria's

public service agencies? The second sub research question was: how does ethnicity influence managers' choices regarding recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees? The following sections of Chapter 4 comprise a discussion of the following broad topics in order: research setting; demographics; data collection; data analysis; evidence of trustworthiness; and the study results. Chapter 4 concludes with a summary and transition to Chapter 5.

Research Setting

The host site for the study was one of the Nigerian government agencies responsible for traffic management, which for the purposes of my study was called a federal traffic management agency (FTMA). The FTMA has a central office and multiple regional offices located around the country. My host site was one of the regional offices, which contained a total population of 164 employees including 24 managers. Based on my observations and interviews, major policy decisions funnel down from the central office of the FTMA, while administrative and operational decisions and actions are made at the regional offices. The major role of the regional offices is the management of traffic control at the regional and state levels. Although there were no changes in the research setting from the proposal, there was a change in the headship of my host site after the IRB approval. I had written for permission to conduct my interviews and to recruit participants to the head of the FTMA and obtained approval only to have to repeat the process a few days later after the agency's leadership changed. Apparently, the redeployment seemed to catch the former FTMA head by surprise, and there was not a

handover of my request and the previous approval. After my first meeting with the new head of the FTMA, I prepared the same letter for approval, which was secured.

I subsequently conducted face-to-face semistructured interviews with 11 managers of the FTMA. Each of the managers had a minimum of 4 years of working experience with the FTMA, which was a minimum requirement needed for consideration as participants. The interviews were held within a 2-week period at agreed times and in the offices of each participant. Some interviews were held as early as 8 am, a few after office hours, and some on weekends. Even on weekends, the participants requested that the interviews be held in their offices. The timing of the interviews was intended to align with the time the participant was most comfortable and to ensure minimum intrusions. All the interviews lasted between 20 minutes, which was the shortest duration, and 52 minutes, which was the longest duration. This time frame excluded the introductory and housekeeping sections of the meeting, which lasted between 5-8 minutes.

Prior to commencement of the interviews, the participants confirmed that they had received a personalized introductory letter for the interview (see Appendix D) and signed the consent forms in my possession. I verbally restated the purpose of the interview and the expected role of the participants in the study. I notified the participants that they should expect to receive the analyzed material for member checking prior to my examination of the data. In addition, I notified the participants that the data would be retained for 5 years post interview, after which the data would be destroyed without recourse to them as required by the Walden IRB. The interview protocol was a guide to

ensure that, during the interview sessions, participants and I do not veer off topic and that consistency was maintained throughout all the interviews.

Demographics

The participants for my study were 11 employees of a managerial cadre of a FTMA. My inclusion criterion was that the participants must have a minimum of 4 years of working experience with the government agency because the participants needed to be able to answer questions regarding promotion in the FTMA. My decision was motivated by the Nigerian Public Service Rules of 2006 that specified that public service officers were eligible for promotion to the next rank after 4 years. The interviews were held within a 2-week period and at the offices of the participants based on their preferences.

Prior to approaching Walden University's IRB, I sent a formal letter that I addressed to the head of the government agency requesting permission to use the agency as the host site for my research (see Appendix A), to which I attached a consent letter for the head of the government agency to complete and return to me. My approach was to act proactively to reduce the anticipated delay associated with the Nigerian public service to secure the relevant approvals, and to be certain that the agency gave consent. With a letter addressed to the Walden IRB dated July 31, 2017; the FTMA approved my request to be the partner agency for my study.

After securing Walden University IRB permission to use the FTMA as my case study (approval number 05-25-18-0480843), I sent a letter to the local head of the FTMA in which I introduced my study and requested e-mail addresses of 13 eligible participants of the FTMA (see Appendix B). On receipt of the e-mail addresses, I addressed an

introductory letter to each of the 13 potential participants (see Appendix C). Attached to

the introductory letters were consent forms, which the participants completed and

returned to be considered as participants for my study. Presented in Table 1 are the

demographics of the participants of my study.

Table 1

Demography of 11 Participants

Participants	Region	Level	Years of service
Participant 1	Southeastern Nigeria	Junior manager	10-15
Participant 2	Southeastern Nigeria	Senior manager	20-25
Participant 3	Southern Nigeria	Middle manager	20-25
Participant 4	Southern Nigeria	Junior manager	5-10
Participant 5	Northcentral Nigeria	Senior manager	20-25
Participant 6	Southeastern Nigeria	Senior manager	20-25
Participant 7	Southern Nigeria	Senior manager	20-25
Participant 8	Southwestern Nigeria	Senior manager	20-25
Participant 9	Southern Nigeria	Senior manager	20-25

Table continues.

Participants	Region	Level	Years of service
Participant 10	Northwestern Nigeria	Senior manager	20-25
Participant 11	Southern Nigeria	Senior manager	20-25

Data Collection

Upon my receipt of the approval to collect data from Walden University IRB with Reference Number 05-25-18-0480843, I proceeded to recruit participants for my study. There was a two-pronged plan for participant recruitment. The first plan was to identify and directly recruit participants through purposive sampling. My second plan, which was a fallback option, was to select participants through snowball sampling if complete recruitment was not possible through the first method. My letter to the head of the FTMA post IRB approval requesting permission to collect data included a request for e-mail addresses of 12 managers (see Appendix B). The head of the agency assigned one of his senior subordinates to provide the e-mail addresses and provide all the assistance I requested for the study. I received the e-mail addresses of 13 managers after 3 days after receiving approval from the FTMA boss.

Having identified all the potential participants for my study, I sent introductory letters by e-mail to all individuals notifying them of what my study was about and what their required role in it would be (see Appendix C). The introductory letters informed them of their rights and included a request to have them complete the consent form that I attached to the letters. The letters sent and responses received indicated that participants were fully aware of and consented to my request and to their responsibility in my study.

All 13 potential participants endorsed the consent form and became confirmed participants. The proposed total number of participants for my study was between 10-12 individuals, and the interviews were through a face-to-face, semistructured format.

I conducted interviews with 11 individuals though participant responses became repetitive after eight interviews. Out of the 13 individuals who gave consent for the interview, four were inaccessible and showed signs of disinterest with regard to being interviewed. The four individuals resisted my repeated attempts to agree to a time for the interviews. In one instance, a potential participant claimed to be on the way out of the office for an official engagement and could not spare a minute with me to plan for the interview. In another instance, the prospective participant shut the door on me at the entry to the office and asked not to be disturbed. To recruit more participants, I initiated my backup participant recruitment plan, which was snowball sampling. Through snowball sampling, I was able to recruit two participants to replace the four individuals who indirectly declined to participate in the study though they endorsed the consent form. The snowball sampling strategy could have yielded more participants if necessary, but I had achieved data saturation. I conducted interviews with nine of my original 13 participants and two from my subsequent recruitment for a total of 11 interviews.

Prior to the start of the face-to-face semistructured interviews, I verbally stated the purpose of the interview, the expected role of the participant in my study, and my commitment to send the analyzed material to each participant for auditing and consent prior to utilizing the data. In addition, I notified the participants individually that the data would be active but securely kept for 5 years post interview, after which they would be

destroyed without recourse to the participants. To stay on track throughout the interviews, the interview protocol served as a guide. The interviews held within a two-week period and at the offices of the participants.

Recording of 10 out of the 11 interview sessions was through manual and electronic means using note taking and two recording devices: an audio recorder and my smartphone. One of the participants declined to be recorded, so I took notes manually. For the 10 interviews that were recorded, my phone was disabled from receiving calls and messages, so as not to corrupt or truncate the recording and distract both the interviewee and myself. Manual note taking highlighted some points and identified potential codes and themes. There was exercised care to ensure that my notes were as brief as possible and to maintain eye contact and interest with the interviewees in the course of the interviews. Additionally, the notes were brief to enable me to observe all nonverbal cues the participants exhibited in the course of the interviews.

Another source of data collection in my study was observation. There was a nonparticipant observation in some cases before the interviews and in other cases, after the interviews. Specifically, observations occurred over a period of three weeks of two sessions per week. Each session lasted for four hours making a total span of observation to be twenty-four hours. The observation of twenty-four hours was exclusive of the observation that occurred during the interview sessions. Through this data source, recorded were the relationship dynamics between the participants and colleagues and noted were every detail of the participants conduct in handing down instructions to subordinate staffers and taking directives from superior employees. My IRB approval for

observation was restricted to the participants only and precluded me from recording

comments and responses from nonparticipants of the study. The only instances back and

forth interactions were noted in my observation were when two or more participants

engaged in a discussion or meeting. My observations were permitted only when the

discussions and meetings were of a nonsensitive or classified nature; in such instances, I

was politely requested to vacate that office. Because the observations were

nonparticipatory, there was the care to be as nonintrusive as possible.

The final source of my data collection was document review. To have access to

the required documents for my study, I referred to my letter to the local head of the

agency where there was a request for access for some specified documents for my review

(see Appendix B). Upon securing the approval to review available documents, I was

directed to the library within the FTMA. The documents planned for review were

sections of the Nigerian Constitution that advocated the federal character principle,

Public Service Rules 2006, handbooks, recruitment materials, annual reports, recruitment

data, statistics on promotion, government documents and rules, and accessible media

publications. The documents, book, and magazines available to me and reviewed were

FTMA regulations on maintenance of discipline, FTMA criteria for promotion of

employees, FTMA 2016 annual report, and FTMA milestones 2007-2014. The stated

documents are descriptive names; the actual names of the documents are concealed to

protect the confidentiality of the agency. Other reviewed documents were from the

website of Federal Character Commission (another Nigerian government agency) and the

website of the FTMA. There was no access to recruitment data; I was referred to the

FTMA central office for that document. Adhered to were all the laid out plans for data collection in my Chapter 3 without deviation. There were no unusual or unanticipated circumstances during data collection.

Data Analysis

My data analysis strategy entailed the utilization of the combination of manual and computer-assisted coding. Utilized were precoding and thematic generation to sort and make sense of the data. The precodes emerged from the conceptual framework of the study, research questions, and/or research problem of the study (Miles et al., 2014). In the study, themes emerged from blocks of similar codes (Miles et al., 2014). Bias, favoritism, frustration, productivity, and quota system were some themes that were correctly predicted might emanate from the study. The fact of precoding did not preclude me from being open to emergent codes and themes from the data. Inductively, other themes that emerged from the data were federal character principle, merit, godfatherism, morale, and promotion.

Data analysis involved the transformation of raw data into manageable and meaningful pieces of knowledge through reduction of the volume of fresh data, filtration of the data, thematic identification, noting discrepant data, and effective communication of the findings (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). Maxwell (2013) advised qualitative researchers not to wait till the end of data collection to start the data analysis process. Consequently, transcription of my data began within a few hours of receipt, even when there was more data to collect. In this manner, there was a constant mental picture of the study and the elimination of the possibility of forgetting some material or the potential

discouragement associated with sifting through the quantum of collected data (Maxwell, 2013).

The transcription process for the interviews involved the transfer of each recorded interview to my laptop computer and a further transfer of the recording from my computer to an online transcription website called temi.com. An individual that successfully used it for research purposes recommended the transcription website. Within a few minutes, temi.com produced the transcription from each recording. On a close inspection, temi.com was unable to accurately decipher the spoken words, possibly because of different styles of diction and intonation of the participants. The tool was helpful because all the words were typed, howbeit inaccurately. The next step was, I listened to each recording and corrected all the errors from the transcription website. The observations and the notes from the reviewed documents were already in text format and did not require a further transcription. All I did was export the two data sources from my diary to my computer.

I applied the 5 steps recommended by Yin (2014) to transform the raw data into communicable findings. The five steps are (a) data compilation, (b) data disassembly, (c) data reassembly, (d) data interpretation, and (e) data conclusion and presentation. The process of data compilation included familiarizing myself with the transcribed data that came from all my data sources namely, face-to-face semistructured interviews of 11 officers of the FTMA, nonparticipant observations, and a comprehensive document review. This step involved a thorough reading of all the triangulated data to begin the process of forming codes, themes, and patterns. Next, I exported the transcribed

interviews, observations, and notes from the reviewed documents to NVivo 12 for further analysis. The data compilation phase included data categorization by data sources and the coding using the combination of descriptive coding and in vivo coding (Miles et al., 2014).

Descriptive coding involves the assignment of words and short phrases to summarize a passage of data, while in vivo coding is a coding method that highlights the exact words from the data (Miles et al., 2014). In addition to the stated method of coding and thematic generation, NVivo assisted with confirming the themes and organizing the data. The data reformulation step involved identifying emergent themes, which replaced blocks of codes in addition to the emergent themes that stood alone. In this step was the process of connecting one data source to another. Data was additionally connected to extant literature, conceptual framework, and research questions to gain a sense of what the findings revealed. Data interpretation involved a review of phases 1-3 for accuracy and objectivity. In addition, there was an exploration of the possibility of merging themes and codes to a smaller number for a smoother data communication. Data conclusion and presentation was achieved with the assistance of NVivo 12. There was the presentation of the results of the findings using formats such as tables and figures. Yin (2016) advanced the opinion that computer software such as NVivo 12 was helpful to sort, code, and generate themes from multiple data sources to produce structured, organized, and understandable results.

There were various opinions from the interviews as to what the role of ethnicity was in influencing managerial choices in the Nigerian public service. Additionally, there

were contradictory perspectives suggesting that ethnicity influenced choices in the recruitment, placement, and promotion of public servants in Nigeria. I recorded the variety of perceptions and together they made my study more robust. Only 5 out of my 11 participants mentioned one of the themes from the results called health challenges, but the theme was listed among other themes and considered discrepant.

The observations and document review provided perspectives that validated the themes from the study. The document review was more limited than observations in supporting some themes such as influence of godfathers, favoritism, frustration, morale, and health challenges. Sections in the reviewed documents belonging to the FTMA that discussed recruitment and promotion were silent on FCP as a parameter. What stood out in those documents was merit and there was no reference to the FCP, which was contrary to the constitutional provisions. Further research may unearth the reason for the omission because the FCP is law for all government agencies. In the study results section, the evidence for all the themes will be revealed from each the three different data sources. Evidences from the documents reviewed were presented with utmost care to protect the anonymity of my host agency. This action meant that direct references to the agency and referencing were altered.

Evidence of Trustworthiness

In this section of Chapter 4, I explain how the trustworthiness of the study was achieved by specifically discussing the study's credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability.

Credibility

The credibility of my study was in adopting the following three measures: First, the triangulation of my data sources including face-to-face semistructured interviews with 11 officers of a FTMA, nonparticipant observations, and a comprehensive document review. Second, the interview sessions had a design to be prolonged and engaging with each interview timed for one hour. Though some interviews were shorter, the participants responded to all the interview questions and the insights provided added to the quality of the study. Third, through the process of member checking the research participants reviewed my understanding from all the data sources to confirm that my interpretation of the data accurately represented their opinions. All 11 participants confirmed my analysis for their interviews individually. In the process of member checking, three participants adjusted earlier responses and both the previous and adjusted perspectives used in the study. The data was only considered viable for use in the study after the process of member checking.

Transferability

To ensure transferability, provided were comprehensive details of my selected research method and design so that current and future researchers would have a clear idea of how the study evolved and arrived at its conclusions. Presented were the details of the study in such a way that it could be replicated in other government agencies and in large private multi ethnic organizations. For instance, stated were the strategies for participant recruitment and detailed were the processes undertaken to gain access to the host site for my study.

Dependability

In my study and through my audit trail, explained were the various choices and decisions made in the study and my rationale for the actions. For instance, explained was the reason to adopt a snowball strategy to recruit the last 2 participants for my study after some participants opted out, even after signing my consent form. The participants that opted out of my study had been recruited through purposive sampling. Triangulation of data sources was another strategy utilized to ensure the dependability of the study. The interviews, observations, and document review of the study complemented and reinforced each other, which made the study robust. In addition to the audit trail and triangulation, reflexivity was another tool utilized to make the study dependable. Through the diligent recording of processes, events, and milestones in my journal, explained was how the ideas gained from other scholars translated to what obtained in my study (Houghton et al., 2013).

Confirmability

The proof of the confirmability of the study was in the fact that there was an audit trail, which presented the various options available and the choices made. In addition, through my reflective journal, I kept a record of my mindset, motivations, and the unique circumstances behind my decision-making throughout all the aspects of the study.

Study Results

The study results section contained the systematic presentation of my data collection from my data sources, which were semistructured interviews, nonparticipant observations, and a document review. The data presentation was presented thematically

and based on participant responses to each interview question, observation, and the related document reviewed. Themes assisted to answer the study's central research question and two sub research questions.

My central research question (CRQ) was, how does perceived managerial discrimination based on ethnicity sway employee productivity? The first sub research question (SRQ1) was: what is the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in Nigeria's public service agencies? The second sub research question (SRQ2) was: how does ethnicity influence managers' choices regarding recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees?

Figure 1
Word Cloud from data sources

Figure 1 is a Word Cloud depiction of the themes and codes that emanated from the study. Promotions, recruitment, ethnicity, et al., were among the most discussed issues among the participants and from the other data sources. The themes for my study emanated from codes from the participants' responses to the interview questions and triangulated using my other data sources. Nonrecurring themes were presented as discrepant information. My transcriptions replaced all vulgar and inappropriate phrases and words to make them fit for public reading.

Table 2

Emergent Themes From all Data Sources

S/No	Themes	Questions answered	Participant response (%)
01	Federal character principle (FCP)/Quota system	SRQ1 and SRQ2	100%
02	Merit	SRQ1 and SRQ2	100%
03	Ethnicity	CRQ, SRQ1 and SRQ2	86%
04	Influence of godfathers	CRQ, SRQ1 and SRQ2	62%
05	Favoritism/bias	CRQ, SRQ1 and SRQ2	81%
06	Promotion	CRQ and SRQ2	90%
07	Productivity	CRQ and SRQ2	86%
08	Morale	CRQ and SRQ2	100%
09	Frustration	CRQ	86%
10	Health challenges	CRQ	33%

As depicted in Table 2, there were 10 emergent themes from the data. Five of the themes provided insights to answer the sub research question 1 (SRQ1). There were 8 themes that related to sub research question 2 (SRQ2) and 8 themes pointed to the central research question (CRQ). Out of the 10 emergent themes, 8 themes provided insights to more than one research question.

Emergent Theme 1: Federal Character Principle/Quota System

I paired the FCP and the QS because the participants used them interchangeably. The FCP and QS are constitutional and administrative principles respectively stated in the 1979 Nigerian Constitution (Mustapha, 2010). In Nigeria, the purpose of FCP and QS are to provide equitable distribution of opportunities along regional, state, ethnic lines.

Table 3

Federal Character Principle/Quota System

No. of participants	Files	References
10	21	76

Interviews. The first of two interview questions that elicited responses that generated this theme was: How do the recruitment policies in federal government agencies influence managerial choices of recruitment into this government agency? The second interview question was: What role does the federal character principle or quota system play in the managerial choices of whom to recruit, place in a certain position, and promote in this government agency? Table 3 depicts the frequency of this theme from the interviews and showed that 10 out of the 11 participants responded using this theme. The following comments provided support for Theme 1:

- Participant 1. The Federal Character Commission decides the general recruitment, and they decide how many people can come from each state. What they (the FTMA) try to do is to ensure that no region or no state is being marginalized when it comes to recruitment. They try to ensure that all states

are represented the way it should be. The quota system is necessary to ensure balance.

- Participant 11. We also have the federal character principle or quota system that determines how many candidates from each state gets recruited. This policy is from the federal government. The quota system is aimed at creating a balance in the system by ensuring that every state in the federation is represented.

- Participant 2. In Nigeria, the quota system plays a very major role because of Nigeria's multi-ethnicity, because some states feel marginalized while some other states may have a higher number in a particular recruitment exercise, so the government tries to regulate it. During recruitment, the quota for the various states is reviewed. From the time of recruitment, quota system comes into play.

- Participant 3. Because of the various ethnic groups, recruitment has to be based on quotas. This structure ensures that every state is taken into consideration. After meeting all the other requirements, when it comes to recruitment, all the ethnic groups must be reflected in the recruitment. The representation is first between the different states and then within each state, there is an allocation within the various ethnic groups. Though quota system ensures that everyone is represented, one of the disadvantages of the quota system is that the right or best people may not have his or her way in terms of progression in the job. For instance, due to the quota system in this agency,

there are some states where in terms of the ranking; there is no movement

because, for that particular state, the quota is full. While in some states, from

junior to senior level is an express progression.

- Participant 6. Well, it is very clear in this agency that the issue of federal

  character principle ensures that every state receives consideration in

  recruitment. This reason explains why when you come in here, you will see

  people from all states of the federation and even at the management level. As

  far as I know, we have people from every corner. If that is not wide enough,

  they then take people from geopolitical zones. So every state is considered in

  recruitment. Even the recruitment exercise that was just advertised had every

  state in consideration. Whenever an exercise is done like this, they do not

  choke it with people from one place or region. They spread it out so that every

  state has a quota.

Observations. As indicated in the preceding section, ten out of eleven

participants contributed to the theme of FCP. My general sense from all the participants

was that they were knowledgeable about the FCP and how the FCP affected recruitment,

placement, and promotion in government agencies. In the question of recruitment, all the

participants inferred that they gained employment through this law and were calm

discussing it. On the issue of the FCP and promotion however, there were facial

expressions and reactions that conveyed different meanings. Participants P2, P3, P5, P7,

P8, P10, and P11 showed signs of agitation and frustration. Participant P3 was visibly

angry and sad, while P11 attributed the stagnation of his career to the FCP.

Document review. The Nigerian Constitution (1999, section 14.3) stated, "The composition of the Government of the Federation or any of its agencies and the conduct of its affairs shall be carried out in such a manner as to reflect the federal character of Nigeria and the need to promote national unity, and also to command national loyalty, thereby ensuring that there shall be no predominance of persons from a few state or from a few ethnic or other sectional groups in that government or in any of its agencies" (Nigerian Constitution, 1999). Section 14.4 from the Nigerian Constitution (1999) added, "The composition of the government of a state, a local government council, or any of the agencies of such government or council, and the conduct of the affairs of the government or council or such agencies shall be carried out in such manner as to recognize the diversity of the people within its area of authority and the need to promote a sense of belonging and loyalty among all the people of the federation."

The Federal Character Commission was inaugurated to implement the constitutional provision of the FCP. Among the functions of the Federal Character Commission are, "to work out an equitable formula, subject to the approval of the president, for the distribution of all cadres of posts in the civil and public service of the federation and of the state, the armed forces, the Nigerian police force and other security agencies, bodies corporate owned by the federal or a state government and extra-ministerial departments and parastatals of the federation and states" and "to promote, monitor and enforce compliance with the principles of proportional sharing of all bureaucratic, economic, media and political posts at all levels of government" (Federal Character Commission, 2017). The constitutional provision and its implementation by the

Federal Character Commission provided the kennel for the adoption of the FCP as a

parameter for recruitment, placement, and promotion in the FTMA.

Emergent Theme 2: Merit

Merit was the next most mentioned parameter for recruitment, placement, and

promotion in the FTMA. Table 4 shows that all participants contributed to the generation

of this theme. Though merit is not stated in the Nigerian Constitution, merit is applied in

the FTMA after the FCP allotment as a basis for ensuring that the most qualified

individuals secure recruitment or promotion.

Table 4

Merit

No. of participants	Files	References
11	21	63

Interviews. From the interview question: What role does merit play in the

recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees in this government agency?

Participants' responses revealed some confusion as to the role merit plays in recruitment,

placement, and promotion in the FTMA. In some cases, the principle of merit was

confused for the FCP. The participant responses that follow lend credence for and against

merit:

- Participant 11. As far as I know, merit plays little to no role. Maybe a single

    digit percentage of staffs in this agency were really recruited via merit. Merit

    only comes into play after all the godfathers in the system have filled up their

slots according to the rules of the quota. The remaining candidates are then selected on merit. I believe that merit should be considered first and that the most qualified hands should be taken. In that way, the quality of employees in the agency will improve.

- Participant 3. Assuming there is an allocation of seven individuals to a state, though there are up to two thousand candidates. If a person does very well in the exam or is the best, that individual's position is assured. If in a state, there are about five ethnic groups. Assume that an ethnic group from that state already has its quota filled and during the interview process, the best performing candidate is from that ethnic group, that individual will not be dropped.

- Participant 5. Merit is always the best because it is based on performance. When you recruit mediocre individuals, you will have mediocre productivity, which is not good for any system. Just like the promotional exercises we go through, someone might score the minimum score for promotion, but the next question is how many vacancies are available to be filled? If for instance everyone who comes from my state scores above the required marks for promotion, do we then say they all get promoted? No, because it conflicts with the character commission. So, the discrepancies we see in rating have something to do with where someone comes from. If I had my way, I will still suggest the merit system.

- Participant 6. The point is we consider merit and then tailor it to picking individuals from every state in the country. We make it wide so every state is involved. When every state is involved, we then go to each state and then pick the best. If you just push it on to merit alone, you may find out that individuals from one section of the country may excel beyond the others. At the end of the day, the recruitment is lopsided. You may also find out that this potential recruit may be better in the examinations but when it comes to the real work, the other individual is better. This is why you give consideration. An individual may not be that good academically or in that specific exercise but may excel in others. You may see somebody with distinction from the university, but at the interview, some are good writers or good speakers or good personalities and so on. You may see some who are not physically attractive or what not, but the individual is intelligent. This is why in recruitment a lot of factors are considered. It is not all about intelligence. Some individuals may have the physical features that make them attractive for recruitment but they may not have the intelligence. During the interview and examinations, we consider their scores in the oral interview (the person's ability to communicate), his writing abilities or capacity and his intelligence quotient. We give the candidate a few tasks and see what he or she can do with it. These are the things we consider. The type of work we do, if we take only citizens from one section, you may find yourself in a place where being fluent in the local language is needed, and we do not have anyone from there

because we do not have a diverse staff. One may be posted to a place where

knowledge of the local culture and language are critical for communication

and cooperation instead of English. These are the things we look at. However,

even when we take from a state, we take the best.

Observation. There were different levels of animated responses to this theme.

Participants P2, P7, and P9 were excited by the role merit played in recruitment and

promotion choices in the agency. Participant P7 and P9 stated that merit accounted for as

high as 30%-40% of recruitments and promotion. Participants P1, P5, and P8 were more

hopeful and laid back than excited with merit as a managerial tool for recruitment and

promotion. In the other extreme were Participants P4, P10, and P11 that advanced the

opinion that merit had an insignificant role in managerial choices for recruitment and

promotion. All the participants displayed understanding and appreciation for merit.

Participants P1, P4, and P5 stated that merit was more dominant than the FCP for

managers in recruitment and promotion decisions.

A closer analysis of the participant responses to merit revealed that confusion

existed as to why different participants wanted merit as a dominant managerial yardstick

of choosing who to recruit or promote. Participants such as P2, P3, P5 and P11 that were

passed up for promotion suggested that they suffered the delay because merit was not the

primary factor for promotion. Contrariwise, Participants such as P1, P4, P6, and P9

attributed their consistent promotion to merit.

Document review. Documents available and reviewed indicated the application

of merit for promotion exercises in the agency. There was no specific mention of merit in

recruitment or placement in the agency. Even with that omission, the need for the most qualified employees cannot be over emphasized. Civil service recruitments particularly need to follow an acceptable standard and structure that guarantees employee productivity (Igbokwe-Ibeto, Justine, & Agbodike, 2015). The application of merit for recruitment in the civil service ensures that prospective employees are motivated to join and not to perceive civil service opportunities as mere safe working environments (Ciobanu, 2015). As Participant P1 espoused, "Merit should be the basis managers use in making employee related decisions because it ensures that the best candidates rise to the top" (Semistructured Interview, 2018).

Emergent Theme 3: Ethnicity

Most of the participants brought up the issue of ethnicity even when the questions pointed to another direction. The participants viewed ethnicity in terms of regional, state, and tribal diversity (Parboteeah, Seriki, & Hoegl, 2014). Baskerville, Wynn-Williams, Evans, and Gillet (2014) advanced the opinion that ethnicity refers to individuals or human groups that share a common descent due to physical or traditional similarities.

Table 5

Ethnicity

No. of participants	Files	References
10	18	54

Interviews. Almost all the interview questions elicited answers from all my participants that pointed towards ethnicity. Table 5 indicates that all but one of my

participants in 54 references alluded to ethnicity. The following participant responses supported this theme:

- Participant 2. In Nigeria, tribalism plays a role and so cannot be ruled out. If you have an individual from your tribe as the head, it definitely goes a long way to favor you in one or two things. Ethnicity cannot be ruled out in Nigeria, because Nigeria is very diverse ethnically. Even in a state, apart from the eastern states where one language is spoken, other states such as Rivers, Benue and Plateau states have as many as 10 to 13 different languages, so ethnicity is definitely a key player. People see each other as coming from the same tribe or speaking the same language or speaking the same dialect and so on. If an individual from your tribe is on top, that individual may want to place you strategically to favor you or for you to be a source of vital information. That individual must place surrogates as a feedback mechanism. When you have your own ethnic group in positions of authority, you feel secure to an extent. You have the confidence that you would not be betrayed. Additionally, there are ethnic group meetings where issues are discussed on how to tackle different things or project different things or defend things. These incidences cannot be ruled out in Nigeria, and they are present in this agency. That feeling of protection is a major advantage because you would not be betrayed easily. You also get feedback about different people's opinions about you around the office.

- Participant 4. There are cases where there is discrimination because of state of origin but in very isolated cases.

- Participant 6. At the topmost level, I have not seen or experienced ethnicity. At that level, you see people from different ethnic groups working closely with the top managers and personnel. People who are the confidants of the boss are from other tribes. At every other rank, every state is covered. At my own rank, every ethnicity is represented.

- **Participant 7.** Ethnicity plays a role although it depends on the individual. This reason explains why when a person is appointed, people from the same ethnic group begin to celebrate. Some people are biased because of ethnicity, some others because of personal loyalty or any other reason as the case may be.

- Participant 8. I know that in the more advanced economies like the US and Great Britain, things of this nature does not exist. Those nations encourage merit and the emphasis is not placed on quota or ethnic diversity. If you are American, you are American, regardless of your skin color. Here in Nigeria, your language or cultural difference has a role to play.

Observation. In my observations before the interviews and after the interviews, I noticed that the participants were civil to each other irrespective of ethnicity but gravitated to one another because of ethnicity. I witnessed numerous discussions that seemed to be of a personal nature between participants from the same ethnicity. At other times, there were some personal conversations between any of the participants and a

nonparticipant of my study from the same ethnicity. The issue of the same ethnicity was obvious because the individuals communicated in vernacular. In an occasion, a subordinate from the same ethnicity with a participant interrupted a meeting of the boss and another individual and spoke in a local dialect. While I witnessed camaraderie between the participants and other FTMA staffers based on ethnicity, there was no occasion that I witnessed where it seemed that differences in ethnicity affected the civility or productivity in the workplace.

Document review. Participants of the study interpreted Nigeria's multi ethnicity as tribal and discriminatory. Observations revealed the existence of cliques due to ethnicity. But some documents reviewed projected Nigeria's diverse ethnicity as something to cherish and protect. The Nigerian Constitution (1999, section 15.2) stated, "Accordingly, national integration shall be actively encouraged, whilst discrimination on the grounds of place of origin, sex, religion, status, ethnic or linguistic association or ties shall be prohibited." One of the oversight duties of the Federal Character Commission (2017) is to provide "modalities and schemes, subject to the approval of the president, for redressing the problem of imbalances and reducing the fear of relative deprivation and marginalization in the Nigerian system of federalism as it obtains in the public and private sectors." The implication of that section of the Nigerian constitution and the function of the Federal Character Commission is the promotion of Nigeria's diversity. The spread of FTMA offices in Nigeria supports the point of inclusion of every section of Nigeria. There are a total of 250 offices of the FTMA, divided between regions, states, and units.

Emergent Theme 4: Influence of Godfathers

Godfatherism or the influence of godfathers is prevalent in the Nigerian society (Sule, Sani, & Mat, 2018). In Nigeria, godfathers are gender-neutral individuals that use their wealth and clout to influence political, social, economic, and other issues that both affect themselves and other individuals (Nkwede, Ibeogu, & Nwankwo, 2014). Through their activities, godfathers strategically plant surrogates and loyalists; demand and expect loyalty from their followers. Table 6 depicts the frequency of this theme among the participants and Table 6 also showed that 8 participants indicated that godfatherism was a phenomenon in the FTMA.

Table 6

Influence of Godfathers

No. of participants	Files	References
8	13	41

Interviews. Some participant responses gave the sense that godfatherism is as big an influence on recruitment, placement, and promotion as is FCP and merit. The following participant responses provided evidence:

- Participant 10. We once had the head of our agency recruit more than the allotted vacancies from his state allowed, such that in subsequent recruitment exercises, that state lost out completely. Senators and other top politicians decide who is eligible in Nigeria and who gets in. Some of these candidates do not come through examinations. Lists are just given and the people are

recruited just like that. Even the offices that approve the funds requested for the exercise will give you a list of names of candidates that should be hired. The national assembly will also submit their own names of candidates. We live in a time when if you know no one, then you get nowhere. From the very top, there are lists. I am talking about the Presidency, the Senators, and other politicians. So when things like this are going on, how would the head of this agency not also join them and bring in people from his own ethnicity or family?

- Participant 11. When it comes to recruitment in this agency, a lot of godfatherism comes into play. A lot of our personnel are recruited based on whom they know. These godfathers make the required calls or get their candidates on the necessary lists, and they are recruited irrespective of their test scores or physical fitness and so on. Sometimes, they completely bypass the recruitment exercise to get in.

- Participant 2. If I may mention the other factors, the other factors account for about sixty to seventy percent as the case may be. Some of these factors include godfatherism. In Nigeria, godfathers are everywhere, both in politics, government and government agencies. If you have a godfather, he/she goes a long way to defend you in so many things including promotion.

- Participant 4. I know very well that in the course of my training, the larger chunk of the number that was recruited or that was finally assembled for training were from the north. While some states from the south only had about

25 successful candidates, there were states from the north that had as many as 40-45 candidates. This demography drew our attention as to why certain states had such numerous candidates. Most of the states from the north had significantly more candidates than the states from the south. Of course, you also know that there were particular levels of interest. The factor of godfatherism, man-know-man and so on were also at play.

Observation. From my observations, what I could sense from the participants regarding this theme was frustration and resignation. There seemed to be a general feeling that nothing can challenge the influence of godfathers in the FTMA. Participant P2 attributed managerial choices in recruitment and promotion based on godfatherism to as high as 60%. Participants including P1, P4, P10, and P11 seemed to be irritated by this additional hurdle that FTMA employees must conquer to be promoted. Participant P7 advanced the opinion that 100% of all FTMA recruits through the process called replacement were candidates of godfathers. The way the participants hated the concept of godfatherism suggested that they would revel in having a godfather figure. My assertion is because I sensed that beneath the deep anger might also be a jealousy for the employees that benefit from godfatherism.

Document review. There was nothing from the reviewed documents that recognized the existence and influence of godfathers in the FTMA. Osakede and Ijimakinwa (2016) advanced the opinion that godfathers are benefactors that like to determine who, what, when, and how in power centres and they achieve their purposes through scheming, coercion, and manipulation techniques. The actions and activities of

godfathers could be loud or by stealth (Osakede & Ijimakinwa, 2016). As far as Participants P1, P2, P4, P5, P6, P7, P10, and P11 were concerned, whether loudly or by stealth, godfatherism existed in the recruitment, placement, and promotion processes in the agency.

Emergent Theme 5: Favouritism/Bias

Table 7

Favoritism/Bias

No. of participants	Files	References
9	17	49

Interviews. Table 7 reveals the frequency of this theme among the participants. Table 7 also shows that 9 out of 11 participants considered the issue of favouritism or bias a serious enough issue for discussion in the FTMA. The following participant responses captured some conflicting accounts of the participants that elicited this theme:

- Participant 11. There is a lot of marginalization in the recruitment and even promotion. If the man at the top is from your ethnic group, you are more likely to enjoy more benefits than others. The favouritism flows from the top of the organisation all the way down to the bottom. So as different staffs from the same ethnic group get promoted, all their juniors who are on good terms with them also get promoted. There is also more protection accorded to an employee when the man at the top is from the ethnic group. I have mentioned the lists submitted by the presidency and so on. Well, the candidates on that

list are also afforded certain benefits that others would not get. A few examples of these benefits could include prompt promotion, juicier placements than others and protection in cases where there has been some malpractice. There is definitely an open bias in this agency, but also in other federal agencies and ministries.

- Participant 3. There are no special privileges in this agency. Everyone has to do his or her work. Regardless of whether an individual is from my state or even local government area, the individual has to work diligently.

- Participant 6. What I love is hard work. If any individual works right, you are my friend. If you are my brother and you are lazy, I cannot even work with you. I base my likeness for anyone on the staff's ability to deliver. Do your work, be diligent, comport yourself, know the regulations and keep to them, and we are friends.

- Participant 7. In 2014, while serving in southwest Nigeria, I was called in by my boss and informed of a screening process taking place. I knew we were not conducting a recruitment exercise at the time and so I asked how come. He said that the state governor had been given 15 slots to fill in the agency from the headquarters of the agency. He also informed me that he had received a call from the head of a department and was told to screen the candidates thoroughly so that they were not screened out when they got to camp. So I was called to handle the screening and ensure that all these people passed. I grudgingly obliged because I had candidates I would have liked to

get in as well, and yet I was called to conduct the screening process for

candidates brought by another individual. You should note that this was not a

general interview, if it was I would have gladly done it as my job. Because

these recruits used the back door, you cannot trust their commitment to the

agency; they are simply there for the money. We have had these types of

problems since replacements became part of the norm at this agency.

Observation. In my observations, there was the sense that the participants were

acting out their assertions that they did not have biases based on ethnicity. Some

participants claimed that favouritism only existed based on hard work and diligence. At

other instances, the participants spoke vernacular and local dialects to some colleagues in

the presence of other colleagues, which suggested bias. In my findings, I witnessed broad

scale camaraderie among the various strata of staff without reservations. One of the

participants was so peeved and fearful for any reprisals that the participant declined to be

recorded. The participant suggested that the influence of a particular cult group

dominated the affairs of the agency and that unmerited favours are more liberally

extended to that group.

Document review. As with the influence of godfathers, there were no available

documents that buttressed favouritism in the FTMA. A study focused on the central

office of the FTMA, where all the agency documents are domiciled might reveal the

existence of godfatherism and favouritism in employment, placement, and promotion in

the FTMA. The dearth of available documents however, did not negate the perspectives

of Participants P1, P2, P3, P4, P6, P7, P8, P10, and P11 that opined the existence of

favouritism in FTMA processes. Participant P6 stated that he tended to favour

hardworking and diligent subordinates over others irrespective of ethnicity.

Emergent Theme 6: Promotion

Table 8

Promotion

No. of participants	Files	References
11	19	62

Interviews. Table 8 shows that the 11 participants considered this theme a serious

issue in the FTMA and there were 62 references to this theme from the interviews. Most

of the participants have had to endure long delays between levels in the FTMA. A few of

the participants that had better fortune were depressed on behalf of some colleagues who

were passed over for promotion. All participants agreed that promotion as and when due

was a sine qua non for motivation. From the participant responses, there were diverse

reasons for promotion delays. The following responses captured the feelings of the

participants on this theme:

- Participant 10. Promotion is by merit. You have to be computer-literate or ICT

    oriented to get through the exam and then get through. Apart from the quota

    system that determines how many people will be taken per state, promotion is

    definitely achieved through merit.

- Participant 11. As far as promotion is concerned, if you know someone with

    some influence, you are sure to be promoted regardless of how the exams go.

There is a delayed promotion in the agency due to the limited vacancies at the senior positions. As a result, ranks in levels 13 and 14 are congested because many individuals are coming in and very few are moving on.

- Participant 3. The major problem has been the promotion exercise. Previously, promotions were not regular. There were situations when employees stayed for years without being promoted. In many other organisations, promotions are yearly. There was once a time in this agency, before 2008, no one could predict when promotions would be carried out. Because of what happened in the past with promotions or lack thereof, so many people were delayed and stagnated. I should note however that in this agency, exceptional performance irrespective of where you come from is considered during promotion exercises.

- Participant 4. I am due for a promotion and should be moving this year. But in truth, I was due for promotion a year ago, and we were told to wait for a year. Instead of a 3-year waiting period, we waited for 4 years. Of course, I am not happy about that. But speaking about myself generally, I have not really suffered as many delays as I have heard from other colleagues.

- Participant 5. Once we say a certain number must come from a particular state, it is possible that some candidates would miss out. But with the state of unemployment in the country, there will be no lack of qualified hands. However, it may not be at the same level when it comes to the scores in the exercise. So someone with a lower score can be recruited from a state, while

someone with a much higher score from another state may miss out. This situation is what exists with placement and promotion. To move levels at some point, I spent almost 7 years. At that time, they were still backdating the dates of promotion but without salary arrears. This notional review came up around 2008. Right now someone does not get promoted from the date due, rather from the date you are decorated in your new level, which is not a healthy development in any public service. I stand to say it without fear that it is not done anywhere. There are many of us who were promoted in December. Even if one would not be paid for all the years, they can at least pay you for some delayed years, especially considering when you became qualified into that level.

- Participant 6. There was a time before now in the system when promotions were not coming as at when due for one reason or the other until the management came up with a clear policy. At certain levels, one would be there for 3 years and at another level, one would be there for 4 years. So the moment you get to the end of the 3 years at the level that should last for 3 years, you get ready to be promoted. The only problem you may have is when you go there and you do not pass the examination, then you wait for a year and then write again. So that is the thing, the issue on promotion has been straightened up. Management has come out with a clear-cut policy, and they have stood by it. We have not missed an opportunity for promotion when due. You may be unfortunate to have people from your state, a lot of them, and

then you do not make it. Then you come back and wait for another year for

the next opportunity. That is how it is. We are spreading as an organisation.

Once upon a time, we were not as widespread as we are now and so the

positions to fill were limited and the candidates were numerous. However, we

are spreading now and going into many local governments. I personally

believe that with time, that problem of people being stagnated will be taken

care of. Stagnation in the sense that you do not make it because of the number

of people from your state.

- Participant 9. If you were not promoted last year, you have to wait. We have

    policies in place and rules for these things. It all depends on the number of

    vacancies available at that time. As we progress through the ranks, it gets

    tighter for us the officers. Additionally, as we go higher, we have to consider

    geopolitical zones and all that, so not everyone is going to get promoted. As

    the case may be and the vacancies available, it may be the best two, five, ten

    or any number from each state. So definitely, merit comes into it.

Observation. All the participants provided emotional responses about the topic of

promotion in the FTMA. Only Participants P1, P4, P6, and P9 seemed not to have

experienced significant delays in promotion, although I sensed unease with them about

how the next round of promotions might affect them. Irrespective of whether the

participants had enjoyed regular promotions or not, all the participants had either endured

significant promotion delays or knew colleagues that currently endured a promotion

stagnation. I found that even the participants that had regular promotions such as P9

found it difficult to be exuberant because of the extent of sadness experienced by other colleagues that had unpleasant experiences. Participants such as P2, P3, and P11 seemed resigned to the fact that they might not progress further in the FTMA because of the stagnation they currently endure. Another emotion I recognized was hopelessness. Participants P3 and P5 alluded to the point that the best part of their working life was past and options outside the FTMA were nonexistent.

Document review. There were useful documents available and reviewed from the FTMA library. One of them aptly titled criteria for the promotion of employees provided a description of the requirements that qualify an employee of the FTMA for promotion from one rank to the other. The books do not have an online version and they were mostly internal documents. Care was taken to mask the agency as I reveal the promotion processes stated in the reviewed books. There were five promotion processes in the FTMA: (a) APER rating, (b) physical exercise, (c), computer based examination, (d) interview, and (e) seniority (Criteria for the Promotion of Employees, 2018). The APER form is an internal assessment tool for judging employees. A managerial employee completes the form by assessing the overall performance and productivity of a subordinate over a given period of time. In the book was the comment; "the satisfactory APER score for the years of awaiting promotion exams remains the fundamental instrument of assessment for promotion of staffs. The cut off point shall be an average of C, which is 60-70% for promotion eligibility. The use of APER form as an instrument for assessing staffs shall be taken seriously" (Criteria for the Promotion of Employees, 2018, p. 16).

Other factors considered for promotion include educational qualifications and disciplinary records. A quote from the book on educational qualifications was; "educational qualifications shall be considered in promotion as certain positions cannot be attained without acquiring specific educational qualifications as prescribed by the civil service regulations and FTMA scheme of service (Criteria for the Promotion of Employees, 2018, p. 16). Regarding discipline, a quote was, "the absence of a disciplinary case against a staff shall be a strong determining factor for promotion but queries that are satisfactorily resolved shall be discounted. It could however be considered in determining selection between equally qualified staffs in the event of limited vacancies" (Criteria for the Promotion of Employees, 2018, p. 16).

From the reviewed documents, there were different levels of qualification assessments for promotion. The junior cadre of staffs did not require an examination, but gain promotion to the next level after completing a three-year cycle in a position. The middle level employees made up of junior to middle level managers write promotional examinations and are promoted based on merit. The senior managers write exams and are interviewed before promotion. "The exam/interview materials shall be drawn from: (1) staff writing, (2) current affairs, (3) theory and practice of agency operations, and (4) drills and command administration. The maximum score for the exams shall be 50 marks and staff must have 50% of the maximum marks to qualify for consideration for promotion" (Criteria for the Promotion of Employees, 2018, p. 17). Additionally, the senior managers "shall be assessed on papers presented, projects executed; conferences, workshops, and courses attended" (FTMA Annual Report, 2016). The passing score is

60% and assessment would be based on (1) exams - 50%, (2) interview - 20%, (3) APER – 20%, (4) seniority – 5% (1 mark for each year), (5) physical fitness – 5% after maturity; Total 100% (Criteria for the Promotion of Employees, 2018, p. 8).

There was a section entitled: selected employees from equally qualified employees for promotion. This section read: "where vacancies are limited for promotion of eligible staffs, the following additional criteria may be considered in addition to the above for selection: (a) number of years staffs overshot their waiting period, (b) representation of geopolitical zones to reflect national character, (c) transfer of service anomalies, (d) undue advantage of placement at time of enlistment, (e) educational background, (f) positions of responsibility held, and (g) undue accelerated promotion" (Criteria for the Promotion of Employees, 2018, p. 17). From all documents accessed and reviewed, there was clarity that there was a defined structure and process to promotion in the FTMA. Adherence to the rules might be debatable when consideration is given to participant responses. Additionally, all documents seemed to focus on parameters one could consider as merit; there was not a mention in any FTMA document regarding the FCP.

Emergent Theme 7: Productivity

Table 9

Productivity

No. of participants	Files	References
11	19	62

Interviews. Most of the participants indicated that the ambiance in the agency generated by the subjectivity of the recruitment, placement, and promotion policies negatively impacted on their productivity. A few participants stated that their productivity was not affected though they suffered from alleged discriminatory practices. All 11 participants contributed to this theme as Table 9 showed. The following participant responses buttressed this theme:

- Participant 3. My productivity and morale were affected, and I was demoralized as I saw junior officers and my mates promoted above me.

- Participant 4. The feeling of missing out on what I am due because of ethnicity will negatively affect my morale and productivity. Even right now, I have the feeling of inadequate compensation for my service and of being cheated.

- Participant 5. Merit-based system can act as a motivator to staff to become more productive in their service. The knowledge that irrespective of my effort, I may suffer some consequences based on my ethnicity can make me hide my skill or reduce my effort.

- Participant 6. Those whose promotions were delayed suffered from low morale and dissatisfaction with the system, which affected their productivity.

- Participant 7. My promotion was delayed a few times. Initially, when the promotion finally came, the dates would be backdated but without pecuniary compensation. But lately, even the backdating process is no longer in effect

and still there is no compensation for the delay. While I was stagnated I was
not happy and it affected my dedication to my employer.

- Participant 1. Even if you perceived that you been victimized, there really is
not much that can be done. Most of my years were spent in northwest Nigeria.
Feeling victimized there was only going to affect my work. I decided that no
matter what was happening there, I had to show an example by working hard
so that at the end, they still fall back to me. So if you feel victimized and you
withdraw, you are only inviting the problem on yourself. So even if one feels
victimized, he must put in his best. The people whom you feel are victimizing
you will still return to you when they see your quality. So throughout my stay
in Kano, I tried to do my best and be the best I can. So in the end, they still see
that you are relevant and there is no way you can be pushed aside. But if you
feel victimized and then withdraw, you only render yourself irrelevant.

Observation. My observations revealed that productivity was negatively affected
especially as the morale within the agency was so low. Many of the participants seemed
to be resigned to the circumstances and might only be doing enough to remain in the job.
Though all the participants stated that promotion delays negatively affected productivity,
in my observations, I did not witness evidence of insubordination or a refusal to carry out
official duties; in fact, the opposite was true. For instance, P1 and P4 had to abort my
interviews and later reschedule when superiors needed their attention. In aborting the
interviews, I thought that P1 was enthusiastic about the assignment. I remembered that P1
said that he would rather work diligently irrespective of challenges so as to remain

relevant. While all the participants were in their offices, I sensed that there was the feeling of wanting to be left alone. I felt that vibe from Participants P2, P3, P5, and P11. These participants were some of the participants that had endured stagnation in promotion.

Document review. There were inserts in the accessed documents that alluded to rewards for productivity. A section titled accelerated promotion stated, "Accelerated promotion is earned when an employee in addition to the conditions for normal promotion, exhibits extra ordinary/outstanding and remarkable qualifications that make him/her stand distinctly above peers. In this case his/her reporting officer could make a special recommendation for promotion earlier than the stipulated waiting period without loss of consideration for promotion when due in future as an incentive for greater performance" (Criteria for the Promotion of Employees, 2018, p. 16).

Contrariwise, the FTMA Regulations on Maintenance of Discipline (2005, p. 10) listed penalties for an established loss of productivity for staffers. Some punitive actions include, reduction in rank, loss of seniority, forfeiture of pay, and scandalous behavior. Scandalous behavior was described as "defamatory report, rumour, slander; disgraceful, shameful, shocking, or improper or discreditable conduct exhibited by an employee capable of bringing the name, reputation of a member of the agency into disrepute or which is unbecoming of an employee."

Emergent Theme 8: Morale

Table 10

Morale

No. of participants	Files	References
11	21	40

Interviews. Morale in the agency is connected with productivity. Some participants stated that watching others gain promotion and being left behind due to quota restrictions were demotivating. Table 10 revealed the frequency of this theme among all the participants. The following participant responses further buttressed the observed low morale in the agency:

- Participant 1. In this organisation, some people have been affected because their mates in other regions are ahead of them because of the quota system. When there is a system where someone can rise easily and others in the same circumstance but from other states cannot do the same breeds depression and a low morale for the job.

- Participant 10. I have a colleague who is supposed to be on the same level as me but for one reason or the other, he still has two promotions to catch up with me and we are mates (age and otherwise). We were in camp together. Meanwhile, I am also catching up with others as well. If you look at the productivity and morale of the man, it is too low. He is forgetful on the job and often sleeps during the lectures. You can imagine him saluting his mates

as his seniors. It must be demoralising. Someone who has been through that sort of experience cannot be expected to perform at the maximum level.

- Participant 11. Well, we have a lot of troubled individuals here. For these individuals, their attitude and commitment to work are definitely affected negatively.

- Participant 2. People aren't comfortable with the delay. Promotions are essential to employee happiness and satisfaction. It motivates one to do their work. The joy that comes from promotions are enormous and motivates one to do even more, but when stagnant, it becomes an issue. I have been stagnant at different points for no reason but that there is no vacancy.

- Participant 3. When making employee-related decisions, managers should bear in mind that it is the employees that make them successful. All efforts should be put in place to ensure that employees are happy. If the employees are unhappy, then the organization will not get good results. So motivating employees is important. It's negative. When you see your juniors ahead of you due to the delay, it demoralises a person. Some people have been in the system for 10-15 years. If there is better movement in other places (agencies), they will move. If there is no movement, people will not be happy and while there is very little that can be done, they will not be happy.

Observation. During the interviews, at least 9 of the participants displayed facial signs of frustration and Participant P3 alluded to regret and the dearth of other opportunities. Participants such as P5 that was close to retirement seemed resigned to fate

and had assumed the noble role of mentoring younger and junior officers to avoid some

of the administration and policy changes he endured. Most of the interview sessions were

akin to counselling sessions because there are no allowed means of venting frustrations in

the FTMA. Even the quarterly durbar (a one hour frank and open forum without

recriminations) had become a witch-hunting tool.

My observations revealed the physical environment of the agency as decrepit,

stuffy, and unkempt. I noticed very stained walls and offices, broken down tables, chairs,

and shelves. The offices seemed overcrowded. Also noticed were nonfunctional electrical

appliances such as electric fans and air conditioners. Of the over 30 offices I visited, only

in one office was the air conditioner functional. Some offices seemed like changing

rooms because I saw several personal clothing of the employees hanging around; some in

an orderly fashion, but many not so much so. In all the offices, the tables were filled with

several files, papers and books to the extent that in some cases, I had to remove a pile of

files etc. to have a direct eye contact with the participant. It occurred to me that the

physical environment of this agency was enough to depress an employee, especially one

that was already demotivated because of administrative reasons.

Document review. As discussed in this theme under the section observation,

there is a quarterly event in the agency called the durbar. The design of durbar is to

discuss general agency issues including areas of concern. In the durbar meeting, all topics

are permitted and without the fear of recrimination. Participants P2, P3, P4, and P7

opined that the durbar no longer acted as was originally intended because there were

established instances of persecution post durbar. Documents reviewed showed that

FTMA staffs had at least one other way to express frustration or seek appeal as the

following direct quote showed: "any staff that is aggrieved with any promotion matter

shall comply with section X of the FTMA condition of service on grievance procedure.

The appeal shall be lodged within three months from the date of the promotion" (Criteria

for the Promotion of Employees, 2018, p. 8).

Emergent Theme 9: Frustration

Table 11

Frustration

No. of participants	Files	References
10	18	57

Ten participants contributed to this theme as Table 11 depicted and made 57

references. The frustration was more so because a majority of the participants had over

20 years of working experience in the agency, and they did not see any viable alternative.

I had a sense that the participants were fearful both of the present and how they would

cope in the future. The following participant responses supported this theme:

- Participant 11. We have a lot of troubled employees here. As for their coping

  mechanism, if these individuals have their way, they will riot and sabotage the

  system in the process. Staffs are already on the verge of losing it as it is.

  People are not being compensated adequately, not being promoted and all this

  is due to foundational problems, and some will say cultism. It is frustrating to

  tell you the truth.

- Participant 2. The management will say there is no vacancy; all the vacancies are filled up. One time, I spent 8 years at a level, and I was not comfortable with it. In fact, it was frustrating knowing that your mates in other agencies are moving forward and you are stagnant. Staffs are not comfortable with the delay. Promotions are essential to employee happiness and satisfaction. It motivates one to work. The joy that comes from promotions is enormous and motivates one to do even more, but when stagnant, it becomes an issue. I have been stagnant at different points for no reason because that there was no vacancy in my state. I feel very bad. In this agency, for instance, we are not permitted to demonstrate our frustration. There is a limit to which one can write petitions against the incumbent. So, if you feel bad, you hold it to yourself. Durbar (a quarterly meeting in the agency) is the only avenue to show frustration. During the Durbar, they declare immunity hours. It can be 1 or 2 hours. At this point, a staff can say anything and be free from punishment; you can freely speak your mind. But then, given this opportunity, some senior officers will hold it against that staff for speaking out. So this has effectively made staff keep shut their mouths during these immunity hours.

- Participant 3. It is possible to see an individual that is 8 years junior promoted swiftly while you remain in the same place. This situation is one of the disadvantages of the quota system. It does not let you progress as you should, and it is quite frustrating. Once they promote you, irrespective of how many years you have been kept waiting, the date of your promotion is the date you

begin to enjoy the benefits of the promotion. No one considers the past. Some

people have been in the system for 10-15 years. If there is no movement,

people will not be happy and while there is very little that can be done, they

will not be happy.

- Participant 7. If one had been at a rank for 20 years without promotion, it is

the year that the promotion comes that is the year you get promoted. My

current level was not backdated to reflect when I was actually due for

promotion. I should have been in my current rank since 2010 but my

promotion kicked into effect in 2016. The same individual/s have been at the

top since I came into this service. The feeling among many is that the top is

not giving any room for the employees below to grow. However, because

there is very little that can be done, we accept it. I believe that in a military

setting for example, there would have been some sort of revolt, but since we

are where we are, there is very little that can be done.

Observation. Frustration was the verbal expression emanating from the morale of

the participants from the interviews. The question about whether it was possible to wear

frustration on a face was resoundingly answered in the affirmative among the

participants. Even the participants that were not directly affected by irregularities in

recruitment, placement, and promotion in the FTMA displayed verbal and nonverbal

signs of frustration. I had the sense that all of them wanted better working conditions,

better salaries and allowances, and a system that did not churn out dissatisfied employees.

With the current economic conditions in Nigeria characterized by a high cost of living, a high level of inflation, and reduction in the value of the local currency, the participants appeared frustrated. However, what appeared to irk the participants the most was the point of delayed promotions and without monetary compensation. Additionally, I sensed frustration when the participants discussed how contemporaries that were recruited on the same day as they, were now their bosses because of FCP, restrictions on merit, and influence of godfathers.

Document review. There were multiple sources of frustration among the participants. All the participants converged on the point that the recruitment, placement, and promotion policies were doctored because of external influences. The message the participants conveyed was that there was uncertainty about promotions and this uncertainty meant stagnation in a position. Though documents reviewed showed a merit based system, participants were quick to disagree based on personal experiences and the experiences of other FTMA colleagues.

Emergent Theme 10: Health Challenges

Table 12

Health Challenges

No. of participants	Files	References
5	7	10

Interviews. In my study, health challenges was considered as discrepant information because this theme was the least mentioned by the participants by a wide

margin and based on occurrences might not have qualified as Table 12 revealed. As a result, my opinion was to present this theme as a discrepant information. Noteworthy was how sparsely this theme was mentioned in view of other themes in the study. The following participant responses confirmed the seriousness of this theme in my study:

- Participant 7. The death rate in this agency is very high. There are those who cannot handle it and develop complications like high blood pressure and a stroke and pass away. There are those who just take things as they come. I once had an admin officer in southern Nigeria where I was posted. His mates were heads of state offices and other senior positions, but he was still at my level. He, however, was not affected by it. He had the mentality to just accept things as they came to him. The individual is, however, an exceptional case. Individuals are affected negatively in their productivity, their health, psychologically and emotionally.

- Participant 8. You will discover that there are people who have died through depression or the trauma. When you take the statistics of the people who have died in this agency, you will have found that the majority have been at level. When things are not happening, as they should, you discover that staffs that are hypertensive get affected and others who have other conditions cannot cope.

Observation. Only Participants P6, P7, P8, P9, and P10 mentioned the effects on employee health that the situation in the agency had. All the participants seemed in reasonable health considering their experiences.

Document review. There were no documents accessible that revealed the rate of mortality within the agency. As a government agency, all FTMA staffs enjoy medical care from certified private and public health institutions. While there are multiple factors including age and lifestyle that could be responsible for failing health, Participants P6, P7, P8, P9, and P10 attributed failing health and mortality of FTMA employees to working conditions in the agency.

Summary of Emergent Themes

The thrust of my study was the exploration of the role of ethnicity in the choices managers make when deciding recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees in the FTMA. The themes from the findings showed that ethnicity influenced managerial choices through the application of the FCP. The FCP was identified as the dominant yardstick guiding managerial choices, and merit, to sort employees in the event of multiple qualified individuals. Additional perspectives were provoked by some interview questions that described personal experiences of the participants and experiences of colleagues known to them. The interview questions were: What were your experiences when you became eligible for promotion? What role did ethnicity play in your recruitment, placement, and promotion? In your organization, what privileges does ethnicity confer to employees? What are the benefits of having employees who are from your ethnicity work under you and what are the challenges? And how do individuals who perceive themselves as victims of discrimination by managerial decisions concerning recruitment, placement, and promotion due to ethnic bias perceive their situation and how

are they coping with it? The perspectives from my study provided for rich and thick descriptions of the managerial choices and experiences in the FTMA.

Table 13 presents a snapshot of all the themes and the data sources that contributed to the themes. There were no accessible documents for some themes including influence of godfathers and bias. The themes merit, promotion, productivity, and morale had inputs from all the data sources, while health challenges recorded the least input in the study. I considered health challenges a discrepant data and chose to include it in my study because of its current and future ramifications if not redressed. Health challenges was discrepant because it did not poll enough responses from my data sources.

Table 13

Snapshot for Data Sources per Emergent Theme

	P1	P2	P3	P4	P5	P6	P7	P8	P9	P10	P11	Obser-vation	Doc. reviews
FCP/QS		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Merit	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Ethnicity	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X
Godfathers	X			X	X	X	X			X	X	X	
Bias	X	X	X	X		X	X	X		X	X	X	
Promotion	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Productivity	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Morale	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Frustration	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X
Health Ch.						X	X	X	X	X		X	X

Table 14 shows a summary of the findings of the study, the stakeholders who are impacted by the emergent themes, and the implications to the stakeholders. Themes such

as FCP, merit, ethnicity, godfatherism, and promotion are shown to impact the individual,

FTMA, and society. Favoritism directly affects both the individual staff and the FTMA,

while the FTMA enjoys or suffers the direct impact of employee productivity. The

themes: morale, frustration, and health challenges most affect the individual, though there

would be fallout on the organization as well.

Table 14

Summary of Findings

Themes	Impact levels	Implications
Federal character principle/Quota system	Individual, organizational, and societal.	Merit is sacrificed for political expediency to achieve equity among ethnicities.
Merit	Individual, organizational, and societal.	FCP is the recognized law for distribution of positions. Merit follows after the FCP.
Ethnicity	Individual, organizational, and societal.	Formation of ethnically based groups, mutual suspicions, and antagonism.
Influence of godfathers	Individual, organizational, and societal.	Undue advantage, discontent, and shaping future demography of the agency.

Favoritism/Bias	Individual and organizational.	Alienation and the formation of cliques.
Promotion	Individual, organizational, and societal.	Allegations of bias, subjectivity in managerial choices, external influences, and merit-based promotions.
Productivity	Organizational	Reduced productivity, low morale.
Morale	Individual	Reduced output, nonchalance, and emotional detachment.
Frustration	Individual	Same as above, and depression.
Health challenges	Individual	Reduced output and fear for the future.

Summary

Chapter 4 contained the demographics, research setting, data collection, data analysis, evidence of trustworthiness, and the description of the main themes. The data resulted from the interview responses of 11 employees at a federal traffic management agency (FTMA) in Nigeria. All the participants met the inclusion criteria for my study, which was as a staff of the FTMA at a managerial level for a minimum of 4 years. Other data sources that combined with the interviews enabled me to triangulate the data with

nonparticipant observations and comprehensive document review. The accessible

documents were FTMA regulations on maintenance of discipline, FTMA criteria for

promotion of employees, FTMA 2016 annual report, FTMA milestones 2007-2014, and

relevant agency websites. Ten themes emerged from the precodes before data collection

and emergent codes post data collection. Nvivo 12 software application assisted with

further data analyses. The ten themes individually and collectively provided insights and

related to the central research question, two sub research questions, and conceptual

framework. Chapter 5 contains the interpretation and analysis of the findings, the

limitation, the recommendation, and the social change implications of the study.

Chapter 5: Discussion, Conclusions, and Recommendations

The focus of this qualitative case study was on exploring the influence of Nigeria's multiethnicity on managerial choices in the public sector using a FTMA. The literature I reviewed revealed that Western-styled management practices do not provide a model for management in African countries. African countries possessed traits, traditions, and challenges that make the application of Western theories and models untenable (see Kazeroony, 2016; Kazeroony & Burr, 2017; Oghojafor et al., 2013). One such challenge is alleged discrimination due to multiethnicity. Incidences of corrupt and discriminatory employment practices in Nigeria are well established (see Rindap & Mari, 2014). My study was meant to shed light on the public sector recruitment, placement, and promotion practices in the FTMA. Insights from my study may shed light on current practices within the FTMA, and possibly lead to the validation, tweaking, or removal of practices that are inimical to the well-being of the FTMA as well as serve as a guide to leaders of similar agencies.

The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study was to consider the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a FTMA and how ethnicity influenced managers' choices with regard to recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees. I used the qualitative method, with an exploratory case study design, to conduct my investigation. Data came from semistructured interviews of 11 managers of the FTMA. Other data sources included nonparticipant observations and a comprehensive document review. The documents accessed were FTMA regulations on maintenance of discipline, FTMA criteria for promotion of employees, FTMA 2016 annual report, and FTMA milestones

2007-2014. Table 15 displays the 10 themes that emerged from the analyses of the data

and the study question for which they provided insights.

Table 15

Relationship Between Emergent Themes and Research Questions

Themes	Central research Question	Sub Research Question 1	Sub Research Question 2
FCP		x	x
Merit		x	x
Ethnicity	x	x	x
Godfathers	x	x	x
Favoritism	x	x	x
Promotion	x		x
Productivity	x		x
Morale	x		x
Frustration	x		
Health Ch.	x		

The themes were FCP/QS, merit, ethnicity, and influence of godfathers,

favoritism/bias, promotion, productivity, morale, frustration, and health challenges. The

FCP, merit, ethnicity, the influence of godfathers, and favoritism provided insights to

answer the study's first sub research question. The FCP, merit, ethnicity, godfatherism,

favoritism, promotion, productivity, and morale related to my study's second sub

research question. The following themes provided insights to answer my study's central

research question: ethnicity, godfatherism, favoritism, promotion, productivity, morale, frustration, and health challenges.

Interpretation of Findings

Existing literature on some related topics and concepts for the study including ethnic diversity, managerial decision-making, public service, sources of discrimination, racial discrimination, and Nigerian civil service, converge on at least two points. First, motivated employees are vital for organizational profitability and productivity (Adegbami & Uche, 2015; Meeussen, et al., 2014; Yanchick et al., 2014). Second, discouraged employees can create an organizational climate capable of negatively impacting the organization (Darj, et. al., 2015; Elias & Paradies, 2016; Fapohunda, 2016; Fujimoto, et al., 2013). The findings from my study confirm both perspectives. I present my interpretations thematically to align with the format of Chapter 4, and with regard to how they answer the study questions. In the next section, I discuss the study's research questions and my interpretation of the themes generated from analysis of the data. The central question I sought to answer was, How does perceived managerial discrimination based on ethnicity sway employee productivity? The 2 sub research questions were as follows:

1. What is the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in Nigeria's public service agencies?

2. How does ethnicity influence managers' choices regarding recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees?

Emergent Theme 1: Federal Character Principle/Quota System

In Nigeria, the FCP or QS is law, and the principles of this law apply in all Nigerian government agencies. The Nigerian government established this law to ensure equitable distribution of opportunities in government agencies including opportunities for contracting, recruitment, placement, and promotion (Federal Character Commission, 2017). The action by the Nigerian government is recognition of how delicate the Nigerian psyche is on issues that bother on ethnicity. Extant literature by Kazeroony (2016), Kazeroony and Burr (2017), Oghojafor et al. (2013), and Oghojafor, Idowu, and George (2012) supported the notion that African management practices must be locally promoted to accommodate peculiar African complexities.

All the participants were aware of the law and supported the intent of the law. The FCP introduces actions that may be discriminatory because it involves the allocation of opportunities to various ethnicities irrespective of competence (Federal Character Commission, 2017). The participants reacted differently to the FCP depending on how the FCP advanced or limited their progress. On the one hand were the participants who secured employment and were promoted when due in the FTMA due to the FCP, and therefore profess the benefits of this law. In contrast were other participants who are in the majority who had stagnated at some point in their careers in the FTMA due to this law. There is the argument that the FCP is not responsible for the stagnation of staffs of the FTMA. Such proponents stated that the individuals stuck in a position did not pass the promotion examinations in their states of origin. Consequently, the individuals did not qualify to be promoted based on the vacancies available to that state. The counter-

argument is that the FCP is responsible for the token allocation of vacancies to each state that does not consider that better candidates abound.

In addressing how this theme answers the first and second sub research questions, this theme indicates that the FCP plays a role in managerial choices in government agencies. The FCP also determines how recruitment, placement, and promotion exercises are conducted. The findings of my study revealed that the FCP came into being in the first instance because of Nigeria's issues with ethnicity and the government's intention to provide equity. What currently obtains is the distribution of recruitment, placement, and promotion opportunities in the FTMA along ethnic lines irrespective of qualification or competence. The situation in the FTMA regarding the FCP confirms Jacob (2014), and Rindap and Mari (2014) that postulated that ethnicity was the cause for managerial choices to be nuanced, subjective, and lean towards political or selfish interests. Data from my study agrees with Omeje, Egwa, and Adikwu (2016), who advanced the opinion that the application of FCP was fraught with bias. My study's findings also support Stevenson (2014), who indicated that employee experiences created perceived discrimination, which results in reduced employee productivity.

Emergent Theme 2: Merit

In the issue of recruitment, placement, and promotion in Nigerian government agencies, merit applies only after FCP. During recruitment in the FTMA, FCP is utilized to spread the vacancies across all 36 states of Nigeria according to a prearranged formula or managerial expediency. Data revealed that within the allocation to a state, merit comes to play to determine the recruits to fill the vacancies. The determination of merit is by

physical fitness, age, educational qualifications, and a successful computer tested examination. Documents reviewed and corroborated by the participants of the study stated that the best candidates from all the combined categories candidates are recruited subject to the available vacancies allotted to that state.

The pattern for promotion in the FTMA is similar to the pattern for recruitment. Each state is allotted vacancies for each position nationwide and there is internal competition among qualified staffs within each state. From the results, I found that oftentimes the available vacancies might be as restrictive as 2 vacancies per state, while there might be as many as 25 competitors for those 2 vacancies from some states. In the end, only 2 staff will be promoted to the next level for that year, leaving 23 staff to wait another year to compete again. In this scenario, some of the participants stagnated in a position for as much as 11 years. There is a contrary scenario where the allotted vacancy for a state is 2, and there are only 2 competitors for those positions in that state. The participants revealed that this scenario is akin to an automatic promotion irrespective of the performance of those 2 candidates.

As Participant P8 stated, merit is popularly used in Western countries because it is detribalized and neutral to all races and ethnicities. That participant hoped for the use of merit as the parameter for recruitment, placement, and promotion in the FTMA. What that individual might not recognize is that in the Western countries, most individuals that miss out on opportunities are calm about their loss because they trust that the system was not rigged and accept that the most qualified individual secured the opportunity (Roex, Huijts, & Seiben, 2018; Solt, et al., 2016). Findings from my study agree with Igbokwe-

Ibeto, Justine, and Agbodike (2015), and Ijewereme (2015), who postulated that the orientation in Nigeria is currently different because citizens representing ethnicities and states that continually miss out on opportunities mostly allege discrimination, oppression, and a rigged process.

As is the case with the FCP and because of Nigeria's diversity, the theme, merit plays a crucial role in managerial choices in the FTMA, and in recruitment, placement, and promotion processes. Evidences from triangulated sources shown in chapter 4 under this theme revealed that intra-state recruitment and promotion processes are carried out using merit, because at this stage, FCP's role would be over. In this scenario, managers deploy all the tools listed and described in the agency manuals to determine the most qualified candidates.

Emergent Theme 3: Ethnicity

Ethnicity is a touchy subject in Nigeria and one that evokes strong passions irrespective of perspective of the argument. In the FTMA, data revealed that analysis for almost every choice management takes is from an ethnic prism. Ethnicity in this context includes the delineation of Nigeria along regional, state, and tribal lines. This theme shed light on the central research question and two sub questions. In the FTMA, participant responses and observations showed that ethnicity is indirectly responsible for reduced employee productivity because of alleged discriminatory actions. Ethnicity also plays a role in managerial choices in Nigerian government agencies and in recruitment, placement, and promotion processes in the FTMA. Some participant responses indicated that employees' happiness is positively related to the presence of a boss from the same

region/state/ethnicity as they. The assertion resonates with Criado, Herroros, Miller, and Ubeda (2015), who stated that a reason for employee happiness is the feeling of brotherliness, protection, and advantage with the boss. However, Stevenson (2014) opined that diversity could negatively affect employees' commitment and productivity, when not harnessed properly. My study confirms Gberevbie and Ibietan's (2013) assertion that diversity could become a threat to Nigeria's economic development and its fragile unity. My observations revealed cliques among the FTMA employees along the lines of language. In an instance, one of the participants that hailed from the same region as me was elated and wanted to transfer our interview from the dingy office where we were to a more convenient office that belonged to "our brother".

Data revealed that there were some outliers in which when a boss is from the same region/state/ethnicity, the mood of the subordinates is one of sadness. This mood may be because of the history of some tribes known for their tribalism and loyalty to everyone from the same region. The reverse is true for a few tribes known to be more liberal and sometimes hostile to individuals from the same region. Data results revealed that most participants in the study were ethnically biased. The participants questioned and applauded every management decision from ethnically tinted lens. For instance, there were comments that suggested that a skewed recruitment exercise that alienated some tribes was because the bosses are from another tribe and are reticent of individuals from another tribe.

Emergent Theme 4: Influence of Godfathers

Universally, there is an acceptance that wealthy and powerful individuals and families wield significant influence in decision-making and allocation of patronages. The same is true in the FTMA and findings support Alao, Ajike, and Ibrahim (2016), who posited the preponderance of godfathers in Nigeria's socio-political environment. Data from my study confirms Olayinka and Adesina (2015), who postulated that a forensic investigation of the influence of godfathers in Nigeria showed that godfathers promote corruption in Nigeria. In the FTMA, the influence of godfathers extends beyond a suggestion or an appeal for consideration to an imposition. The quota system and subsequently merit are the approved methods for recruitment, placement, and promotion in government agencies such as the FTMA.

The influence of godfathers provided vital insights that answered all the study's research questions. Results from my study showed that in the FTMA, the perception is that godfatherism exists and negatively impacts managerial choices in recruitment, placement, and promotion, which negatively impacts employee productivity. Godfathers achieve this goal by coercion and the use of political and economic power (Ijewereme, 2015). Findings confirm Alao, et al. (2016), and Olayinka and Adesina (2015), who postulated that godfathers play as significant a role as the quota system and merit in the Nigerian public service. Additionally, godfathers use the influence and power available to them to bend the rules and force managers to kowtow to their whims. The imposition of godfathers in the administration and operation of the FTMA results in conflicting emotional responses depending on the individual. For the individuals that bypassed the

recruitment processes, for instance, they feel thankful that they have a godfather to propel their careers. Contrariwise, those that might have been denied promotion for instance, not due to the quota system or a lack of merit, are unhappy with the influence of godfathers.

Results from the data revealed that although there are cycles for recruitment to the FTMA that are widely publicized, there are recruitment exercises that take place that are not publicized. These unpublicized recruitment exercises are more selection exercises than recruitment exercises because in some cases, letters of appointment are handed out to selected candidates without going through the recruitment process. These selection exercises are called replacements. My findings revealed that 100% of the selected recruits during the replacement exercises are candidates of godfathers. The net effect of the selection on the participants (and they claimed that it is FTMA wide) is that the morale of staff of the FTMA is lowered and their productivity reduced. They have the feeling of being underappreciated. Though godfathers do not necessarily have to be of the same ethnicity as protégés, findings from my study indicated that the external influences on the FTMA are ethnically induced.

Emergent Theme 5: Favouritism/Bias

The FCP, ethnicity, and godfatherism inadvertently result in favoritism because of their influences on managerial processes in the agency. As with ethnicity and godfatherism, this theme provided insights to all the research questions of my study. The study confirms existing literature that a leadership style that displays favoritism toward a section of employees results in divided followership and results in multiple outcomes (Sharma, Schuster, Ba, & Singh, 2016). Leaders that show favoritism to sections of

employees might have some successes but ultimately, will have to contend with the fallout from the despised employees (Sharma, et al., 2016). From my findings, I could decipher both active and carefree FTMA employees. My interface with the participants made the reasons for the employee attitude clearer. Some individuals could care less because they do not expect to be summoned and their input is rarely sought making their contribution to the FTMA negligible. Abdullah and Marican (2017) referred to employees' carefree attitude as deviant behavior. While the other staff that seem to have a good working relationship with their superiors have a sense of value to the FTMA.

Data results revealed that favoritism was not a product of only FCP, ethnicity, and godfatherism. Favoritism was also a product of hard work and diligence. Two senior FTMA managers stated that their relationship to their subordinates was not based on how the subordinates came to the FTMA or where they are from. Rather, they were swayed by subordinate attitudes including hard work, diligence, and the willingness to learn. The 2 FTMA managers stated that because the FTMA is a government agency, employees tended to take more liberty than if it was a private organization, especially when the employee has a protective godfather figure. Both managers indicated that for that reason, they were both unwilling and impatient with anyone with an attitude; they would rather work with the employees that are ready to work hard. This picture confirms the point that there are cliques and divided followership in the FTMA. Findings from my study resonate with Abdullah and Marican's (2017) assertion that an organization that does not pull all its employees in the same direction is flirting with disaster.

Emergent Theme 6: Promotion

Insights from this theme provided useful information to answer the central research question and the second sub research question of my study. Results showed that there is reduced productivity by FTMA staffs based on perceived ethnically induced discriminatory practices by managers. Additionally, managerial choices in the FTMA revealed the influences of ethnicity. Staff promotion is a stimulus and motivator to staff for recognition, prestige, and higher responsibilities. Data from my study supported Sitati, Were, and Waititu (2016), who described promotion in terms of a reward and recognition for better performance. Findings also agree with Pearce (2011), who opined that employees lose the appetite to work hard when they perceive that promotion is either reserved for others or is unattainable.

The promotion process in the FTMA is based on the vacancy allotted to a state or region to satisfy the FCP and irrespective of merit. Currently, this system, designed to ensure equity and fairness result in disgruntled employees that have been repeatedly passed over for promotion. Only a negligible percentage of the FTMA employees carry over their sympathy for this system of promotion to their daily chores. For others, this promotion process is rigged and unfair.

There is no telling the amount of damage to the image of the FTMA and to the operations of the FTMA the unhappy employees are capable. Some of the participants had to endure stagnation multiple times and as was the case of one participant, held up in a position for 11 years after becoming due for promotion to the next level. Hitherto, there was a system where the promotions were backdated though there were delays. This

situation assisted to make the recently promoted staff eligible for promotion to the next

level or two levels, depending on the delay. This system was abolished in 2008 and since

then, irrespective of the long years of stagnation, promotion date was the date of

promotion and not when the promotion became due. Another issue of concern to all staff

of the FTMA was that there was no pecuniary compensation for all the years of

stagnation when the promotion became due. Findings confirmed Ali and Ahmad's (2017)

postulation that employees place a premium on pay, promotion, and recognition in

achieving job satisfaction.

From the management perspective, individuals can only be promoted when the

vacancies exist. However, public service rules state that promotion for managerial level

cadre staff of the federal government is automatic after every four years (Nigerian Public

Service Rules, 2006). The schism between the public service regulation regarding

promotion and the availability of vacancies in the FTMA is a source of problem. Added

to the staff frustration is the fact that most times, junior staffs are promoted above the

senior staff because of a combination of FCP, vacancy availability, and influence of

godfathers.

Emergent Theme 7: Productivity

Promotion delays did not affect 2 out of my 11 participants. Consequently, I can

conclude that the attitude to the job of the 2 participants would not have been negatively

affected due to promotion delays, and they remain motivated to contribute positively to

the FTMA. Findings confirmed the study by Damiani, Pompei, and Ricci (2016) that

surmised that variables including wage increases and staff promotion are positively

related to enhanced staff productivity. Because these individuals work in a system, they are aware of the pains colleagues suffer on account of promotion delays. Participant P11 described the dynamics that existed between the fortunate and unfortunate staffers of the FTMA. The description was one of awkwardness when both sets of staffers meet especially in instances where both sets of staffers were recruited on the same day and had grown together in the system until now. Another scenario that cannot be good for ambiance is one where one's former boss is now a subordinate or vice versa. Nine out of the 11 participants interviewed had gory tales to tell about their experiences in the FTMA resulting from managerial choices based on ethnicity as exemplified by the FCP. Another issue was that most participants had spent a minimum of 20 years working experience with the FTMA, which meant that the better part of their adult working lives was in the FTMA.

This theme provided clues to answer the study's central research question and the second sub research question. Participant responses and data from other sources showed that most staffs were just going through the motions and doing just enough not to be sacked. Productivity from staff members was low. In a lot of ways and by admission, productivity was low because the system of the FTMA did not deserve better. This situation is dangerous both for the FTMA and for citizens of Nigeria that depend on the FTMA to carry out its specialized functions. As Participant P3 eluded, the system in the agency invites corrupt practices from the staffs of the agency as it becomes evident that the staff needs cannot be satisfied by the FTMA. The fact that most of the participants in my study and by extension, staffs of the FTMA allege discriminatory practices in the

administration and operation of the FTMA further exacerbates the point of a drop in employees' productivity.

Emergent Theme 8: Morale

Like productivity, this theme provided useful material to answer the study's central research question and the second sub question. Results indicated that there was a low morale among FTMA staffs. Morale followed on from productivity. The way they are differentiated in my study is that productivity concerns staff output while morale concerns the mood or attitude of the FTMA employees. Results showed a near total unhappiness and carelessness from the participants in my study because of managerial choices that are ethnically induced. The morale in the FTMA confirms literature that ethnic diversity could have a negative societal effect and could result in conflicts that cause human, social, and economic losses (Debrah, et al., 2016; Van der Meer & Tolsma, 2014). Findings also support Rindap and Mari's (2014) postulation that discriminatory managerial actions due to diversity exist in government agencies.

The fact of subjectivity in recruitment, placement, and promotion processes in the FTMA adds to depress the staff. Most of the interviews seemed like an opportunity for the participants to vent pent-up frustrations, maybe because the durbar meetings no longer satisfied this function. Another factor that might have contributed to low staff morale was the working environment within the FTMA. The physical environment of the agency was decrepit, stuffy, and unkempt. There were stained walls and offices, broken down tables, chairs and shelves, and poor lighting and the offices seemed overcrowded. The electrical appliances such as electric fans and air conditioners were nonfunctional. Of

the over 30 offices entered, only in one office was the air conditioner functional. Some offices seemed like changing rooms because there were several pieces of personal clothing of the employees hanging around; some orderly, but many not. In all the offices, the tables were filled with several files, papers and books to the extent that in some cases, I had to remove a pile of files etc. to have a direct eye contact with the participant.

It is unclear whether the conditions the workers operate in have been reported for renovation. But there are very senior managers that operate from that building, so it is unclear what to make of staff comfort in that working environment. What is irrefutable is that the environmental conditions of the agency are enough to depress an individual and I imagine that could lead to a low morale and affect the productivity of the employee.

Emergent Theme 9: Frustration

There is a palpable feeling of frustration among the staffs of the FTMA and this theme provided insights to answer the central research question of the study. When participants were not complaining about the effects of the quota system, the grouse was favoritism, godfatherism, promotion/lack of promotion, environment, etc. This theme confirmed existing studies by Lee and Reade (2015), and Reade and Lee (2016) that advanced the opinion that ethnic diversity or conflict induces frustration, lowers productivity, job satisfaction, and organizational commitment.

In recognition of the need to bond with the staff, the management of the FTMA instituted what is referred to as durbar. Durbar is a quarterly forum where there is a one to two hour segment where staffs can say anything that concerns them without recriminations or the fear of an unpleasant reaction. Results revealed that this well-

thought-out initiative failed because staff that vented concerns suffered some form of discrimination or push back from superior managers. The result of the failure of this initiative is that by the nature of the job the FTMA does, the staffs do not have any avenue to confront an issue of concern to them.

Results revealed that another source of frustration among the participants of my study was the realization that their best days might be behind them and that they were no longer candidates for job migration. The point that they had spent the best part of their working lives in the FTMA and without commensurate progress was too much for most staffers to bear. Participant P3 stated that the remuneration of staff was barely able to enable them to feed their families, and not to talk of saving for retirement. Another result of frustration was frayed tempers, resignation to an uncertain fate, reduced productivity, enmity, jealousy, and a tendency for illegal actions. Frustration with the FTMA blinds the eyes of most of the FTMA staff to some successes and progress achieved by the FTMA.

Emergent Theme 10: Health Challenges

Results indicated a high mortality rate among staff of the FTMA, which was attributed to the working conditions in the FTMA. The implications from participant responses to this theme were that discriminatory actions existed in the agency and the actions swayed employee productivity. Some other staff of the FTMA suffer from other health related diseases including high blood pressure, hypertension, and depression, et al. One of the participants described some colleagues as psychologically damaged and traumatized. The perceived systemic managerial discriminative actions ultimately negatively impacts on the FTMA statutory functions (Wegge, Shemla, & Haslam, 2014).

With incidences of failing health and mortality, staffs of the FTMA may put in less than their best effort on the job especially as they contend with several issues that may cause these health challenges.

Conceptual Framework

The interpretation of the results of my study was through the lens of the conceptual framework of the study. The conceptual framework for my study was built on African management practices and complexity theory. The main thrust of the concept African management practices was that Western styled management theories and practices are not suited to management practices in Africa (Kazeroony, 2016; Kazeroony & Burr, 2017; Oghojafor et al., 2013). Findings in my study confirmed existing literature that advocated the use of African management principles for African countries. Data also supported Riggs (2002) that posited that the transition from agrarian to industrial societies caused administrative, economic, and other differences between developing countries and developed countries; making Western theories and models an ill fit for developing countries.

This research showed that Hofstede's cultural dimensions and the GLOBE project were incompatible with management practices in Africa because they represented the Newtonian positivist approach. Additionally, the findings confirmed Kazeroony and Burr (2017) who argued that both Hofstede's cultural dimensions, and the GLOBE project did not capture the nuances of African administrative and cultural peculiarities. The main point for the concept of complexity theory in my study was that management in Nigeria was a fluid and complex situation because of the many variables. Meissner and Jacobs

(2016) advanced the opinion that the focus of complexity theory is not to simplify

systems, but to identify and adapt to unexpected occurrences, change, and complexities.

In Nigeria, the adaptation to complex situations resulted in the legal promulgation of the

federal character principle to provide an equitable balance among Nigeria's diverse

ethnicities.

Limitations of the Study

In Chapter 1, I anticipated two limitations of my study: First, the possibility of

dishonest feedback and second, the possibility that all participants might be recruited

through snowball sampling. Having concluded the study, both anticipated limitations did

not happen. Replacing the previously stated limitations are three new limitations to the

study. First, through both purposive and snowball sampling, I was unable to obtain a

more balanced demography of the participants to better represent the regional diversity of

Nigeria. A more balanced participant demography might have yielded a different result

because all regions in Nigeria would be represented and the perspectives on the federal

character principle versus merit argument might be different.

The second limitation is that the results from the interviews mirror the

perspectives of the employees that are not part of the policymakers or management team

of the FTMA. I did not gain access to that level of employee in the FTMA. All the

management team in the FTMA works in the central office. A perspective from the

policy-making management staff of the FTMA may have shed insights not presented in

my study. My submission is that there may be differing perspectives between the decision

maker and the individual that is affected and is merely interpreting the decision. The third

limitation is the possibility of a biased presentation of data based on my worldview. Having all the participants review my understanding of the individual interviews through member checking mitigated this limitation. During the member checking process, three of the participants altered their original statements and my understanding of what they conveyed and their new ideas presented.

Participant P5 wanted the study to explicitly indicate that he did not receive any monetary compensation for the 8 years delay on a position. My report to him stated that there were no remunerations for delayed promotion. Participant P6 wanted the transcripts changed to indicate that the FCP was not responsible for delayed promotion of FTMA employees. Rather that the responsibility rested on the failure of the staff to excel in the promotion examinations to fill the available vacancies. My interpretation of his interview had shown that the FCP caused the limited vacancies. Participant P7 wanted my report to indicate that all the new FTMA recruits through the process of replacement were candidates of godfathers. My report had stated that most of the recruits came through external influences.

Recommendations

The method for my study was a qualitative exploratory case study design. Although no study is infallible, qualitative studies suffer more from the issue of generalization because the focus of qualitative studies is the depth and not the breadth of the research. Having identified the issues in the FTMA, which may also be symptomatic of other Nigeria government agencies, a research balance is necessary to understand the extent of the issues raised in my study. My first recommendation for future studies will

be for a quantitative study. A well-developed questionnaire in a quantitative study that focuses on the themes from my study may provide a broad perspective of all the staff of the FTMA. The quantitative design can also assist to establish the perspectives from a cross-section of levels in the FTMA and will not be limited to the participants of a qualitative study.

From documents reviewed, the FTMA that acted as the host site for my study has a total manpower of 164 individuals, and my host site is only one out of the 37 offices in state capitals in Nigeria and the federal capital territory. This demography indicates the potential for a quantitative study, especially as the issues have emanated from this qualitative research. The second opportunity for future research is inspired by the limitation of my study that showed that the demography of participants was imbalanced. A qualitative study in another FTMA where the researcher has access to participants from all the six geopolitical zones of Nigeria might reveal perspectives not contained in this research. Though the themes may be similar, the lens from which FTMA staff from different regions and states may perceive it may be different. The demography of the staff of my host site indicated a skewed representation in favor of the southern states. Though the reasons for this case may be genuine and legal, the same reasons may be true for another FTMA in a northern state office but with a predominantly northern workforce. The perspective from a FTMA in a northern state on the themes emanating from this research will enable the central FTMA to understand whether the issues raised in the study are local or generic.

The third recommendation for future researchers is an exploratory case study design and a qualitative method to understand the perspectives of the top management and policymakers in the FTMA. Perspectives and themes emanating from this research are exclusively from managers that are not involved with the policy making and execution. The participants in my study are not part of the top management of the central FTMA. This point indicates that orders and instructions are handed down to them as anyone else although they are senior staffers. The best perspectives of the participants are the interpretations they offered for the issues generated in the study and how the issues affected them. The participants do not have the view from the top that instigates the employee policies the FTMA apply.

The fourth recommendation for future researchers is a study grounded in the conceptual framework of my study, African management practices. This conceptual framework advanced the opinion and was supported by literature that there are particular traits and nuances in African management that makes Western theories an ill fit. A multi case study involving other government agencies in Nigeria will either ground the proposition of African management practices or limit it to just my host site. In such a study, future researchers can establish the pervasiveness of the African management practices. Initially, the study could be a multi case study of Nigerian agencies alone. Such a study could also be extended to agencies in other African countries to confirm or disconfirm extant literature on the topic.

Implications

Nigeria is the most populous African country with an estimated 183 million

individuals, 36 states, 774 local government areas (National Population Commission, 2017) and 371 different ethnicities (Nigeria Local, 2014; Online Nigeria, 2016). Nigeria also currently has the biggest economy in Africa. Due to Nigeria's multi-ethnicity, every choice and decision managers make come under scrutiny. Such scrutiny is to determine that there are no extenuating motives aimed at favoritism to individuals because of ethnicity (Adegbami & Uche, 2015; Nnahuihe et al., 2014). The peculiarity of the Nigerian diversity makes the issue of the role of ethnicity in managerial choices an important study.

Implication for Social Change

My study highlighted a social issue at my host site that might be symptomatic in other Nigerian government agencies, regarding the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a FTMA. The study revealed the adaptability of the leaders in Nigeria that necessitated the drafting of the federal character principle (FCP) and quota system into the Constitution. The FCP represents a peculiar African management practice used in government agencies based on Nigeria's complexity and intended to ensure an even spread of recruitment, placement, and promotion in government agencies. Findings from my study revealed that merit is also used as a parameter for recruitment, placement, and promotion in government agencies, but only after the deployment of FCP.

On an individual level, my research pointed out the influence of FCP and ethnicity on the participants in the FTMA. The study results indicated that 82% of the participants are frustrated, disillusioned, and hapless. The participants feel that way because they have been and some are still stagnated in their previous ranks because of a

lack of vacancies. The Nigerian public service rules state that promotion in the civil service to the next level should be between 3-4 years, but some of the participants have remained at the same level for between 7-11 years. The reason for this delay was because there were limited vacancies allotted to each state and some states have qualified candidates that far exceed the number of vacancies.

Conversely, there are some other states that do not have enough candidates to fill the quota for those states or may have just about enough individuals to fill up that state quota. For example, there are some states with 2 vacancies but with 25 qualified candidates, while there are other states with 2 vacancies but with only 2 qualified candidates. This scenario causes a barrier to promotion within some states and a rapid promotion in others. Results showed that merit alone does not determine the promotion of individuals to the next level; godfatherism and favoritism play a role. The concept of merit comes to play after vacancies are allotted to states and regions. This scenario means that there are often more qualified individuals that are not promoted because they are from the wrong state.

On an organizational level, findings in the study showed that godfatherism and favoritism account for the remaining recruitment, placement, and promotion opportunities left by the FCP in the FTMA. The influence of godfathers and benefactors mean that the best individuals are neither recruited nor promoted. Findings revealed that some recruits skip the recruitment processes because of the caliber of benefactor. Results from this research clearly communicate the effects of subjective hiring and promotion practices on the staffers of the FTMA. The morale of the participants in the FTMA

should be a source of concern for the management of the FTMA because, by admission,

the productivity of the affected workers and others in that category has significantly

declined.

Comments from Participants P5 and P6 indicated that they are prepared to work

with only those that are hardworking and diligent. Admirable as that may sound, it only

papers over the cracks and does not resolve the fundamental concerns agitating the

disgruntled staff. The findings from my study may assist managers in the FTMA to

mitigate and reduce divisive practices and rhetoric. The managers can enable the

development of policies and processes that foster positive relationships between

management and employees caused by a sense of fairness and equality in the FTMA.

On a societal level, and in the Nigerian public service, acting without bias might

also mean impartial recruitment, placement, and promotion of deserving employees. In an

environment free of perceived bias, the public sector can contribute to the growth and

stability of the country. My study highlighted a general social issue in Nigeria, especially

in public service, regarding the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a FTMA. The

study reinforced the knowledge to Nigerian managers about the role of the FCP in the

recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees into government agencies. The

study also highlighted the negative effect on employee morale and productivity external

influences including godfathers brought, especially in the issues of recruitment and

promotion in the FTMA.

My research shed light on the limitations of the FCP and proffered suggestions on

how the implementation of the FCP can improve to eliminate suggestions of ethnically

induced bias. As public servants and a microcosm of Nigeria's diversity, my study showed FTMA managers and Nigerian public service managers the danger of divisive practices and rhetoric to one another with a view to mitigating and reducing them. Finally, the managers can facilitate the development of policies and processes that engender positive relationships between management and employees caused by a sense of fairness and equality.

Theoretical and Empirical Implication

Though some similar studies existed, none focused on any Nigerian government agency nor used the conceptual framework in my study. There was also no study that focused on Nigerian public service workers and how ethnicity influenced the choices in the recruitment, placement, and promotion of public service workers. My study used the concepts of African management practices and complexity theory to establish the inadequacy of Western theories and practices as a template in African countries. The study reduced the gap in knowledge by increasing the understanding of the role of ethnicity in managerial choices regarding staff recruitment, placement, and promotion in the Nigerian public service. The implications from this research are the need for a broader knowledge of the pervasiveness of the role of multiethnicity in other government agencies and how FCP and merit aid recruitment, placement, and promotion. The results from my study highlight the need to revisit the policy of FCP in government agencies and design a policy that addresses the shortcoming of FCP as it is currently.

Implications for Practice

Results from this research showed that most staff of the FTMA are demoralized,

depressed, and upset with the recruitment, placement, and promotion processes in the FTMA. The mood and attitude of 9 out of the 11 participants in my study are counter-productive and capable of tarnishing the image of the FTMA. There is no evidence of an ownership of the business of the FTMA because the staffs seem detached and nonchalant. Findings from my study uncovered some practical measures that the FTMA should consider to mitigate the depressed mood of the FTMA employees.

First, the execution of the FCP and the interface between the FCP and merit regarding recruitment, placement, and promotion in the FTMA should be reengineered. What currently obtains is, using the FCP; there is the allocation of vacancies to each state for recruitment, placement, and promotion. After the allocation of vacancies to each state, through merit, candidates are recruited and promoted. However, this situation raises the issue of imbalanced interests in the FTMA between different states and imbalanced educational backgrounds between the southern and northern states. These imbalances mean that some states may have as much as 50 potential new recruits but with a vacancy of five. Contrariwise, other states may have potential new recruits of four, and an allocation for the same five spaces.

From the results of my study, there is also the scenario where the pass mark for recruitment or promotion is 60% with an equal allocation of five spaces between states. Some states may have as much as 25 individuals surpass the 60% but only the top five will be admitted or promoted as the case may be. While the best from other states may be 52% and the FTMA is compelled to admit the top five individuals from that state despite the fact that they scored below 60%. The case just described is common in the FTMA

and is responsible for staff stagnation, which results in low productivity.

I recommend a change in the execution of the FCP and merit where recruitment is determined from the FCP and merit but with consideration for the percentages of interest between the states. For instance, if there is a recruitment exercise for 100 employees, there should be the consideration for the states of origin of the number of interested individuals nationwide. There is the possibility that some states may produce 250 interested individuals and others as low as 20. Based on the data, the FCP can allocate vacancies to all the states based on percentage of interest. If 20% is allotted to each state based on qualified applicants, the state that has 250 individuals will potentially have 50 new recruits and the state that had 20 interested individuals will potentially offer 4 new recruits.

Second, with what the findings from my study showed, I recommend that individuals that were passed up for promotion for 3 successive years due to a limited allocation of vacancy to that state should be preferred over the others from that state in the 4th year promotion exercise irrespective of performance in the promotion examination. This practice provides some form of hope and will reduce the despair of perpetual stagnation. Additionally, I propose that there should be monetary compensation per year to FTMA employees for delayed promotion. The amount is not as relevant as the gesture.

Third, I recommend that the quarterly durbar exercises in the FTMA should revert to the original intent, which is to create a forum where FTMA workers can confront the ills perceived in the system without recrimination. The current format where FTMA staff

suffer psychological trauma after a durbar for speaking up must stop or the exercise should be discontinued. There should be established ways the FTMA workers can express grievances. It is not implausible to think that sometimes the authority figures in the FTMA are oblivious of certain situations, so avenues should exist and be used appropriately. Finally, I recommend a renovation of the offices of the FTMA. I have the opinion that in a better equipped and functioning office, the ambiance in the FTMA will improve. My recommendation is a direct result from verbal and nonverbal cues I obtained from the participants in the course of my observations.

Conclusions

In my study, I focused on the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a federal traffic management agency and how ethnicity influenced managers' choices of determining recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees. The 11 participants of the study were managerial-level employees of the FTMA. African management practices and complexity theory were the conceptual frameworks that guided the study and the analysis of the data. Findings revealed that ethnicity was a major influence on managerial choices in the FTMA. The participants revealed that though the federal character principle is the principal yardstick for recruitment, placement, and promotion in the FTMA, the FCP have resulted in skewed recruitment and promotion stagnation. The application of the FCP buttressed literature from Chapter 2 that indicated that nuances and management practices synonymous with Africa exist that makes Western theories and models an ill fit.

My study revealed 10 themes that in combination provided insights to answer the study's central research question and 2 sub research questions. Among the themes, the influence of godfathers and other vested interests was responsible for some workers enjoying accelerated mobility and choice posting, while the majority of the qualified and experienced workers stagnate. Verbal and nonverbal cues from the participants revealed a displeased, depressed, and distraught FTMA workforce that resulted in lower productivity. Recommendations proffered include a rework in the execution of the FCP and merit as parameters for recruitment, placement, and promotion. Another recommendation is the creation and strengthening of avenues to redress employee concerns.

The FTMA authorities can recognize and demonstrate that the FTMA employees are its greatest assets or risk being pulled down by the size of discontent currently pervading the FTMA. My analysis leads me to conclude that ethnicity plays a role in managerial choices in government agencies, but ethnicity is not Nigeria's problem. The problem is reengineering the laws that manage Nigeria's ethnic diversity factoring current realities. As a microcosm of Nigeria, the public service can lead the way to breaking down barriers based on ethnicity that have created economic and social stagnation in Nigeria over time. The public service can act as a catalyst and example for a harmonious coexistence to the larger Nigerian society and to other multi ethnic African countries. My study aims to contribute to positive social change through the provision of knowledge to create an enlightened and fair public service, free of ethnically induced barriers that have been the bane of Nigeria's underdevelopment.

References

Abdullah, A., & Marican, S. (2017). Relationship between leadership perception and
engagement in workplace deviant behavior. *Malaysian Journal of Social
Administration, 11*(1), 131-150. Retrieved from
https://ejournal.um.edu.my/index.php/MJSA

Adegbami, A., & Uche, C. I. N. (2015). Ethnicity and ethnic politics: An impediment to
political development in Nigeria. *Public Administration Research, 4*(1), 59-67.
doi:10.5539/par.v4n1p59

Adeosun, I. I., Adegbohun, A. A., Jeje, O. O., & Adewumi, T. A. (2014). Experiences of
discrimination by people with schizophrenia in Lagos, Nigeria. *Journal of Public
Mental Health, 13*, 189-196. doi:10.1108/JPMH-06-2013-0038

Adham, K. A., Sarkam, S. F., Ghanie, S. K. M., Kasimin, H., Muhammad, N. S., & Said,
F. S. (2015). A cybernetic approach to inclusive growth analysis: A case of one
district. *Systemic Practice and Action Research, 28*, 595-612.
doi:10.1007/s11213-015-9348-1

Adjai, C., & Lazaridis, G. (2013). Migration, xenophobia and new racism in post-
Apartheid South Africa. *International Journal of Social Science Studies, 1*, 192-
205. doi:10.11114/ijsss.v1i1.102

African Studies Center. (2017). *Kenya – Ethnic groups*. Retrieved from
http://www.africa.upenn.edu/NEH/kethnic.htm

Ahn, R., & Nelson, M. R. (2015). Observations of food consumption in a daycare setting.
Young Consumers, 16, 420-437. doi:10.1108/YC-05-2015-00531

Aker, J. C., Klein, M. W., O'Connell, S. A., & Yang, M. (2014). Borders, ethnicity, and trade. *Journal of Development Economics, 107*, 1-16. doi:10.1016/j.jdeveco.2013.10.004

Al-Mamary, Y. H., Shamsuddin, A., & Abdul Hamid, N. A. (2013). The impact of management information systems adoption in managerial decision making: A review. *Management Information Systems*, *8*, 10-17. Retrieved from https://www.jmis-web.org/issues

Alao, D. O., Ajike, C. A., & Ibrahim, M. N. (2016). Environmental factors and local government administration in Nigeria: A study of Ede North and Ede South local government area of Osun State, Nigeria (1999-2014). *Kuwait Chapter of Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review, 5*, 28-42. Retrieved from https://www.arabianjbmr.com/kuwait_index.php

Ali, M. (2015). Impact of gender-focused human resource management on performance: The mediating effects of gender diversity. *Australian Journal of Management, 41*, 376-397. doi:10.1177/0312896214565119.

Ali, M. Z., & Ahmad, N. (2017). Impact of pay promotion and recognition on job satisfaction (A study on banking sector employees Karachi). *Global Management Journal for Academic & Corporate Studies, 7*, 131-141. Retrieved from https://gmjacs.bahria.edu.pk

Aloko, S. M., & Abdullahi, U. (2014). Ethnicity, religion, and the future of Nigerian democracy. *Scientific Research Journal, 2*, 12-18. Retrieved from http://www.scirj.org

Amitabh, M., & Gupta, R. K. (2010). Research in strategy-structure-performance construct: Review of trends, paradigms and methodologies. *Journal of Management and Organization*, *16*, 744-763. doi:10.1017/S183336720000184X

Anazodo, R. O., Okoye, J. C., & Chukwuemeka, E. E. (2012). Civil service reforms in Nigeria: The journey so far in service delivery. *American Journal of Social and Management Sciences, 3*, 17-29. doi:10.5251/ajsms.2012.3.1.17.29

Andrade, A. D. (2009). Interpretive research aiming at theory building: Adopting and adapting the case study design. *The Qualitative Report, 14*, 42-60. Retrieved from https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr

Ang, S., Van Dyne, L., & Koh, C. (2006). Personality correlates of the four-factor model of cultural intelligence. *Group & Organization Management, 31*, 100-123. doi:10.1177/1059601105275267

Appelbaum, S. H., Habashy, S., Malo, J. L., & Shafiq, H. (2012). Back to the future: Revisiting Kotter's 1996 change model. *Journal of Management Development*, *31*, 764-782. doi:10.1108/02621711211253231

Appelbaum, S. H., Kryvenko, O., Parada, M. R., Soochan, M. R., & Shapiro, B. T. (2015). Racial-ethnic diversity in Canada: Competitive edge or corporate encumbrance? Part one. *Industrial and Commercial Training, 47*, 302-309. doi:10.1108/ICT-03-2014-0012

Arceo-Gomez, E. O., & Campos-Vazquez, R. M. (2014). Race and marriage in the labor market: A discrimination correspondence study in a developing country.

American Economic Review: Papers & Proceedings, 104, 376-380.
doi:10.1257/aer.104.5.376

Asafa, J. (2015). The triple causes of African underdevelopment: Colonial capitalism,
State terrorism and racism. *International Journal of Sociology and Anthropology,
7*, 75-91. doi:10.5897/IJSA2014.0572

Asante, M. K. (2004). *The Afrocentric idea. African American communication and
identities*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage

Avolio, B. J., Walumbwa, F. O., & Weber, T. J. (2009). Leadership: Current theories,
research, and future directions. *Annual Review of Psychology, 60,* 421-449.
doi:10.1146/ annurev.psych.60.110707.163621

Aycan, Z., Schyns, B., Sun, J-M., Felfe, J., & Saher, N. (2013). Convergence and
divergence of paternalistic leadership: A cross-cultural investigation of
prototypes. *Journal of International Business Studies, 44*, 962-969.
doi:10.1057/jibs.2013.48

Banwo, A. O., Du, J., & Onokala, U. (2015). The impact of group cohesiveness on
organizational performance: The Nigerian case. *International Journal of Business
and Management, 10*, 146-154. doi:10.5539/ijbm.v10n6p146

Barbarin, O. A., & Richter, L. M. (2013). *Mandela's children: Growing up in post
apartheid South Africa*. New York, NY: Routledge.

Barbour, A. (2010). Exploring some ethical dilemmas and obligations of the
ethnographer. *Ethnography and Education, 5*, 159-173.
doi:10.1080/17457823.2010.493399

Baskerville, R. F., Wynn-Williams, K., Evans, E., & Gillet, S. (2014). Researching ethnicity in the Pacific region. *Pacific Accounting Review, 26*, 302-323. doi:10.1108/PAR-05-2012-0018

Baxter, P., & Jack, S. (2008). Qualitative case study methodology: Study design and implementation for novice researchers. *The Qualitative Report, 13*, 544-559. Retrieved from https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/

Benatar, D. (2012). *The second sexism. Discrimination against men and boys.* Chichester, England: Wiley-Blackwell.

Ben Halima, M. A., & Rococo, E. (2014). Wage differences according to health status in France. *Social Science and Medicine, 120*, 260-268. doi:10.1016/j.socscimed.2014.09.035

Benner, A. D., & Wang, Y. (2014). Demographic marginalization, social integration, and educational success. *Journal of Youth Adolescence, 43*, 1611-1627. doi:10.1007/s10964-014-0151-6

Bentacur, J. J. (2014). How much control do Latinos and African Americans have of their mutual relations? *Latino Studies, 12*, 353-373. doi:10.1057/lst.2014.43

Berg, B. L., Lune, H., & Lune, H. (2004). *Qualitative research methods for the social Sciences*. Boston, MA: Pearson.

Bird, A., Mendenhall, M., Stevens, M. J., & Oddou, G. (2010). Defining the content domain of intercultural competence for global leaders. *Journal of Managerial Psychology, 25*, 810–828. doi:10.1108/02683941011089107

Björkman, I., Stahl, G. K., & Vaara, E. (2007) Cultural differences and capability transfer in cross-border acquisitions: The mediating roles of capability complementarity, absorptive capacity, and social integration. *Journal of International Business Studies*, 38, 658-672. doi:10.1057/palgrave.jibs.8400287

Blasingame, J. Jr. (2015). The Port Chicago 50: Disaster, mutiny, and the fight for civil rights. *English Journal, 105*, 114-116. doi:10.1353/bcc.2014.0143

Bojanc, R., & Jerman-Blazic, B. (2013). A quantitative model for information security risk management. *Engineering Management Journal, 25*, 25-37. doi:10.1080/10429247.2013.11431972

Boladale, M., Olakunle, O., Olutayo, A., & Adesanmi, A. (2015). Sexual orientation and quality of life among students of Obafemi Awolowo University (OAU), Nigeria. *African health Sciences, 15*, 1065-1073. doi:10.4314/ahs.v15i4.3

Bonaccio, S., O'Reilly, J., O'Sullivan, S. L., & Chiocchio, F. (2016). Nonverbal behavior and communication in the workplace: A review and an agenda for research. *Journal of Management, 42*, 1044-1074. doi:10.1177/0149206315621146

Brand South Africa. (2015). *South Africa's population*. Retrieved from https://www.brandsouthafrica.com/people-culture/people/population

British Council Nigeria. (2014). *Gender impact report*. Retrieved from www.britishcouncil.org

Brower, J., & Mahajan, V. (2013). Driven to be good: A stakeholder perspective on the drivers of corporate social performance. *Journal of Business Ethics, 117*, 313-331. doi:10.1007/s10551-012-1523-z

Brown, H., & Jones, J. A. (2015). Rethinking panethnicity and the race-immigration divide. An ethnoracialization model of group formation. *Sociology of Race and Ethnicity, 1*, 181-191. doi:10.1177/2332649214558304

Browning, L., Thompson, K., & Dawson, D. (2014). Developing future research leaders: Designing early career researcher programs to enhance track record. *International Journal for Researcher Development, 5*, 123-134. doi:10.1108/IJRD-0802014-0019

Bryman, A. (2014). June 1989 and beyond: Julia Brannen's contribution to mixed methods research. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology, 17*, 121-131. doi:10.1080/13645579.2014.892653

Bryson, A., & Chevalier, A. (2015). Is there a taste for racial discrimination amongst employers? *Labour Economics, 34*, 51-63. doi:10.1016/j.labeco.2015.03.002

Bugra, O. Z. E. R., & Seker, G. (2013). Complexity theory and public policy: A new way to put public management and governance in perspective. *Journal of Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences, 18*(1), 89-102. Retrieved from http://iibfdergi.sdu.edu.tr/en

Bujar, M., McAuslane, N., Salek, S., & Walker, S. (2016). Quality of regulatory decision-making practices: Issues facing companies and agencies. *Therapeutic Innovation & Regulatory Science, 50*, 487-495. doi:10.1177/2168479016628573

Burrow, A. L., Stanley, M., Sumner, R., & Hill, P. L. (2014). Purpose in life as a resource for increasing comfort with ethnic diversity. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin, 40*, 1507-1516. doi:10.1177/0146167214549540

Cabrera, A., & Unruh, G. (2013). Think global, act local? Think again. *People and Strategy, 36*, 5-6. Retrieved from https://www.hrps.org

Caligiuri, P. (2006). Developing global leaders. *Human Resource Management Review, 16*, 219-228. doi:10.1016/j.hrmr.2006.03.009

Cavico, F. J., Muffler, S. C., & Mujtaba, B. G. (2012). Appearance discrimination in employment: Legal and ethical implications of "lookism" and "lookphobia". *Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal, 32*, 83-119. doi:10.1108/02610151311305632

Chamberlain, R. P. (2016). Five steps toward recognizing and mitigating bias in the interview process. *Strategic HR Review, 15*, 199-203. doi:10.1108/SHR-07-2016-0064

Chavez, L. J., Ornelas, I. J., Lyles, C. R., & Williams, E. C. (2015). Racial/ethnic workplace discrimination: Association with tobacco and alcohol use. *American Journal of Preventive Medicine, 48*, 42-49. doi:10.1016/j.amepre.2014.08.013

Chen, J. M., & Hamilton, D. L. (2015). Understanding diversity: The importance of social acceptance. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin, 41*, 586-598. doi:10.1177/0146167215573495

Chettiparamb, A. (2014). Complexity theory and planning: Examining 'fractals' for organizing policy domains in planning practice. *Planning Theory, 13*(1), 5-25. doi:10.1177/1473095212469868

Chiweshe, M. K., Chakona, L., & Helliker, K. (2015). Patriarchy, women, land and livelihoods on A1 farms in Zimbabwe. *Journal of Asian and African Studies, 50*, 716-731. doi:10.1177/0021909614541083

Christiansen B., & Sezerel, H. (2013). Diversity management in transcultural organizations. *Global Business Perspectives, 1*, 132–143. doi:10.1007/s40196-013-0013-8

Ciobanu, A. (2015). Civil servants' recruitment and selection practices in European union member states. *Management Research and Practice, 7*, 21-33. Retrieved from http://mrp.ase.ro

Cole, C., Chase, S., Couch, O., & Clark, M. (2011). Research methodologies and professional practice: Considerations and practicalities. *Electronic Journal of Business Research Methods, 9*, 141-151. Retrieved from www.ejbrm.com

Collins, C. S., & Cooper, J. E. (2014). Emotional intelligence and the qualitative researcher. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 13*, 88-103. doi:10.1177/160940691401300134

Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria 1999. (2017). Retrieved from http://www.nigeria-law.org/ConstitutionOfTheFederalRepublicOfNigeria.htm#Arrangement_of_Sections

Cornelius, O. O., & Greg, E. (2013). Federal character principles, nation building and national integration in Nigeria: Issues and options. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences, 4*, 33-39. doi:10.5901/mjss.2013.v4n16p33

Cortina, L. M., Kabat-Farr, D., Leskinen, E. A., Huerta, M., & Magley, V. J. (2013).

    Selective incivility as modern discrimination in organizations: Evidence and

    impact. *Journal of Management, 39*, 1579-1605. doi:10.1177/0149206311418835

Cotae, F. (2010). Looking at the link between leadership, organizational learning and the

    internationalization sigmoid. *Global Management Journal, 2*(1), 5-18, Retrieved

    from https://journals.indexcopernicus.com

Criado, H., Herreros, F., Miller, L., & Ubeda, P. (2015). Ethnicity and trust: A

    multifactorial experiment. *Political Studies, 63*(1), 131-152. doi:10.1111/1467-

    9248.12168

Cronin, C. (2014). Using case study research as a rigorous form of inquiry. *Nurse

    Researcher, 21*, 19-27. doi:10.7748/nr.21.5.19.e1240

Crowne, K. A. (2013). Cultural exposure, emotional intelligence, and cultural

    intelligence: An exploratory study. *International Journal of Cross Cultural

    Management, 13*(1), 5-22. doi:10.1177/1470595812452633

Curlee, W., & Gordon, R. L. (2013). *Successful program management: Complexity

    theory, communication, and leadership*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press

Dalyander, P. S., Meyers, M., Mattsson, B., Steyer, G., Godsey, E., McDonald, J.,…

    Ford, M. (2016). Use of structured decision-making to explicitly incorporate

    environmental process understanding in management of coastal restoration

    projects: Case study on barrier islands of the northern Gulf of Mexico. *Journal of

    Environmental Management, 183*, 497-509. doi:10.1016/j.jenvman.2016.08.078

Damiani, M., Pompei, F., & Ricc, A. (2016). Performance related pay, productivity and wages in Italy: A quantile regression approach. *International Journal of Manpower, 37*, 344-371. doi:10.1108/IJM-12-2014-0265

Darj, E., Infanti, J. J., Ahlberg, B. M., & Okumu, J. (2015). The fairer the better? Use of potentially toxic skin bleaching products. *African Health Sciences, 15*, 1074-1080. doi:10.4313/ahs.v15i4.4

Davis, P.J., Frolova, Y., & Callahan, W. (2015). Workplace diversity management in Australia: Equity, diversity, and inclusion. *An International Journal, 35*, 81-98. doi:10.1108/EDI-03-2015-0020

Daya, P. (2014). Diversity and inclusion in an emerging market context. *Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal, 33*, 293-303. doi:10.1108/EDI-10-2012-0087

De Boer, M. E., Depla, M., Wojtkowiak, J., Visser, M. C., Widdershoven, G. A., Francke, A. L., & Hertogh, C. M. (2015). Life-and-death decision-making in the acute phase after a severe stroke: Interviews with relatives. *Palliative Medicine, 29*, 451-457. doi:10.1177/0269216314563427

Debrah, E., Alidu, S., & Owusu-Mensah, I. (2016). The cost of inter ethnic conflicts in Ghana's northern region: The case of the Nawuri-Gonja conflicts. *Journal of African Conflicts and Peace Studies, 3*(1), 1-27. Retrieved from https://scholarcommons.usf.edu/jacaps

De Vries, H. P., Hamilton, R. T., & Voges, K. (2015). Antecedents of ethnic minority entrepreneurship in New Zealand: An intergroup comparison. *Journal of Small Business Management, 53*, 95-114. doi:10.1111/jsbm.12195

Dent, E. B., & Bozeman, P. (2014). Discovering the foundational philosophies, practices, and influences of modern management theory. *Journal of Management History, 20*, 145-163. doi:10.1108/JMH-09-2012-0056

Dionne, K. Y. (2015). Social networks, ethnic diversity, and cooperative behavior in rural Malawi. *Journal of Theoretical Politics, 27*, 522-543. doi:10.1177/0951629814556173

Djamasbi, S., Strong, D. M., & Dishaw, M. (2010). Affect and acceptance: Examining the effects of positive mood on the technology acceptance model. *Decision Support Systems*, *48*, 383-394. doi:10.1016/j.dss.2009.10.002

Dowd, R. A. (2014). Religious diversity and violent conflict: lessons from Nigeria. *Fletcher Forum World Affairs, 38*, 153-168. Retrieved from www.fletcherforum.org

Dowd, R. A. (2016). Religious diversity and religious tolerance: Lessons from Nigeria. *Journal of Conflict Resolution, 60*, 617-644. doi:10.1177/0022002714550085

Dunn, T. E., Lafferty, C. L., & Alford, K. L. (2012). Global leadership: A new framework for a changing world. *S.A.M. Advanced Management Journal*, *77*, 4-14. Retrieved from http://www.worldcat.org/title/sam-advanced-management-journal/oclc/1607578

Edelman, B. (2012). Using internet data for economic research. *Journal of Economic Perspective, 26*, 189-206. doi:10.1257/jep.26.18

Elias, A., & Paradies, Y. (2016). Estimating the mental health costs of racial discrimination. *BMC Public Health, 16*, 1-13. doi:10.1186/s12889-016-3868-1

Ellis, K. M., & Keys, P. Y. (2015). Workforce diversity and shareholder value: A multilevel perspective. *Review of Quantitative Finance and Accounting, 44*, 191-212. doi:10.1007/s11156-013-0403-7

Elo, S., Kaariainen, N., Kanste, O., Polkki, T., Utriainen, K., & Kyngas, H. (2014). Qualitative content analysis. A focus on trustworthiness. *SAGE Open*, 1-10. doi:10.1177/2158244014522633

Erez, M., Lisak, A., Harush, R., Glikson, E., Nouri, R., & Shokef, E. (2013). Going global: Developing management students' cultural intelligence and global identity in culturally diverse virtual teams. *Academy of Management Learning & Education, 12*, 330-355. doi:10.5465/amle.2012.0200

Eriksson, P., & Kovalainen, A. (2015). *Qualitative methods in business research: A practical guide to social research.* Los Angeles, CA: Sage.

Esan, O. T., Akanbi, C. T., Esan, O., Fajobi, O., & Ikenebomeh, P. I. (2016). Application of quantitative techniques in decision making by healthcare managers and administrators in Nigerian public tertiary health institutions. *Health Services Management Research, 29*, 50-61. doi:10.1177/0951484816662490

Eyong, J. E. (2017). Indigenous African Leadership: Key differences from Anglo-centric thinking and writings. *Leadership, 13*, 1-21. doi:10.1177/1742715016663050

Fahy, P. J. (2013). Uses of published research: An exploratory case study. *International Review of Research in Open and Distance Learning, 14*(1), 145-166. doi:10.19173/irrodl.v14i1.1382

Fapohunda, T. M. (2016). Diversity and gender parity in Nigeria: A situation analysis. *Academic Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies, 5*, 254-260. doi:10.5901/ajis.2016.v5n3s1p254

Fasina, F. O., Shittu, A., Lazarus, D., Tomori, O., Simonsen, L., Viboud, C., & Chowell, G. (2014). Transmission dynamics and control of Ebola virus disease outbreak in Nigeria, July 2014 to September 2014. *Euro Surveillance, 19*, 1-8. Retrieved from https://www.eurosurveillance.org

Federal Character Commission. (2017). *Functions of the Commission*. Retrieved from http://federalcharacter.gov.ng/functions-of-the-commission/

Ferdinand, A. S., Paradies, Y., Perry, R., & Kelaher, M. (2014). Aboriginal health promotion through addressing employment discrimination. *Australian Journal of Primary Health, 20*, 384-388. doi:10.1071/PY14035

Fernandez, R. M., & Campero, S. (2016). Gender sorting and the glass ceiling in high-tech firms. *ILR Review, 20*, 1-32. doi:10.1177/0019793916668875

Flynn, S. V., & Black, L. L. (2013). Altruism–Self-Interest Archetypes: A Paradigmatic Narrative of Counseling Professionals. *The Professional Counselor*, *3*, 54-66. doi:10.15241/svf.3.2.54

Franck, R. & Rainer, I. (2012). Does the leader's ethnicity matter? Ethnic favoritism, education, and health in Sub Saharan Africa. *The American Political Science Review, 106,* 294–325. doi:10.1017/S0003055412000172

Frankfort-Nachmias, C., Nachmias, D., & DeWaard, J. (2015). *Research methods in the social sciences* (8th ed.). New York, NY: Worth.

Fusch, P. I., & Ness, L. R. (2015). Are we there yet? Data saturation in qualitative research. *The Qualitative Report, 20,* 1408-1416. Retrieved from https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr

Fujimoto, Y., Hartel, C. E. J., & Azmat, F. (2013). Toward a diversity justice management model: Integrating organizational justice and diversity management. *Social Responsibility Journal, 9,* 148-166. doi:10.1108/17471111311307877

Gabrielsson, M., Seristö, H., & Darling, J. (2009). Developing the global management team: A new paradigm of key leadership perspectives. *Team Performance Management: An International Journal, 15,* 308-325. doi:10.1108/13527590911002104

Gaddis, M. S. (2015). Discrimination in the credential society: An audit study of race and college selectivity in the labor market. *Social Forces, 93,* 1451-1479. doi:10.1093/sf/sou111

Garcia, F., Mendez, D., Ellis, C., & Gautney, C. (2014). Cross-cultural, values and ethics differences and similarities between the US and Asian countries. *Journal of Technology Management in China, 9,* 303-322. doi:10.1108/JTMC-05-2014-0025

Gberevbie, D. E., & Ibietan, J. (2013). Federal character principle and administrative effectiveness in the Nigerian public service: Challenges and prospects for sustainable development 1999-2012. *Journal of Sustainable Development in Africa, 15*, 46-61. Retrieved from http://www.jsd-africa.com

George, O., Yussuff, K. M., & Cornelius, N. (2017). The good, the bad, and the ugly in the melting pot: The challenges of Nigerianising diversity management. *Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal, 36*, 238-254. doi:10.1108/EDI-10-2015-0088

Gerwel Proches, C., & Bodhanya, S. (2015). Exploring stakeholder interactions through the lens of complexity theory: Lessons from the sugar industry. *Quality and Quantity, 49*, 2507-2525. doi:10.1007/s11135-014-0124-6

Ghana Embassy. (2017). *Population*. Retrieved February 7, 2017 from http://www.ghanaembassy.org/index.php?page=population

Ghasabeh, M. S., Soosay, C., & Reaiche, C. (2015). The emerging role of transformational leadership. *The Journal of Developing Areas*, *49*, 459-467. doi:10.1353/jda.2015.0090

Ghumman, S., Ryan, A. M., Barclay, L. A., & Markel, K. S. (2013). Religious discrimination in the workplace: A review and examination of current and future trends. *Journal of Business Psychology, 28*, 439-454. doi:10.1007/s10869-013-9290-0

Gil-Gonzalez, D., Vives-Cases, C., Borrell, C., Agudelo-Suarez, A. A., Davo-Blanes, M. C., Miralles, J., & Alvarez-Dardet, C. (2014). Racism, other discriminations and

effects on health. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health, 16*, 301-309. doi:10.1007/s10903-012-9743-y

Gill, M. J. (2014). The possibilities of phenomenology for organizational research. *Organizational Research Methods, 17*, 118-137. doi:10.1177/1094428113518348

Gray, K., Rand, D. G., Ert, E., Lewis, K., Hershman, S., & Norton, M. I. (2014). The emergence of "us and them" in 80 lines of code: Modeling group genesis in homogeneous populations. *Psychological Science, 25*, 982-990. doi:10.1177/0956797614521816

Haahr, A., Norlyk, A., & Hall, E. OC. (2013). Ethical challenges embedded in qualitative research interviews with close relatives. *Nursing Ethics, 21*(1), 6-15. doi:10.1177/0969733013486370

Habtegiorgis, A. E., Paradies, Y. C., & Dunn, K. M. (2014). Are racist attitudes related to experiences of racial discrimination? Within sample testing utilizing nationally representative survey data. *Social Science Research, 47*, 178-191. doi:10.1016/j.ssresearch.2014.05.002

Halberstadt, J., Jackson, J. C., Bilkey, D., Jong, J., Whitehouse, H., McNaughton, C., & Zollmann, S. (2016). Incipient social groups: An analysis via in-vivo behavioral tracking. *PLOS ONE*, 2-14. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0149880

Hall, T. (2015). Does cohesion positively correlate to performance in all stages of a group's life cycle? *Journal of Organizational Culture, Communications and Conflict, 19*, 58-71. Retrieved from

https://www.abacademies.org/journals/journal-of-organizational-culture-communications-and-conflict-home.html

Haque, M. S. (2010). Rethinking development administration and remembering Fred W. Riggs. *International Review of Administrative Sciences, 76*, 767-773. doi:10.1177/00208523103943320

Harnois, C. E. (2014). Are perceptions of discrimination unidimensional, oppositional, or intersectional? Examining the relationship among perceived racial-ethnic-, gender-, and age-based discrimination. *Sociological Perspectives, 57*, 470-487. doi:10.1177/0731121414543028

Hassan, O. M. (2013). Curbing the unemployment problem in Nigeria through entrepreneurial development. *African Journal of Business Management, 7*, 4429-4444. doi:10.5897/AJBM2013.7177

Hastie, R., & Dawes, R. M. (2010). *Rational choice in an uncertain world* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

He, N. (2011). Case Study on the influence of Chinese traditional philosophy to the enterprise management. *Journal of Management and Strategy*, *2*, 73-76. doi:10.5430/jms.v2n3p73

Hebl, M., Barron, L., Cox, C. B., & Corrington, A. R. (2016). The efficacy of sexual orientation anti discrimination legislation. *Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal, 35*, 449-466. doi:10.1108/EDI-07-2016-0060

Heckelman, J. C., & Wilson, B. (2014). Interest groups and the "rise and decline" of growth. *Southern Economic Journal, 81*, 435-456. doi:104284/0038-4038-2012.213

Hedija, V. (2016). Gender wage differences in the Czech public sector: A micro level case. *Review of Economic Perspectives, 16*, 121-134. doi:10.1515/revecp-2016-0009

Heyden, M. L. M., Sidhu, J. S., & Volberda, H. W. (2015). The conjoint influence of top and middle management characteristics on management innovation. *Journal of Management, 20*, 1-25. doi:10.1177/0149206315614373

Hira, A., & Shiao, K. (2016). Understanding the deep roots of success in effective civil services. *Journal of Developing Societies, 32*, 17-43. doi:10.1177/0169796X15609711

Hofstede, G. (1984). Cultural dimensions in management and planning. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management, 1*, 81-99. Retrieved from https://link.springer.com/journal/10490

Holloway, I., Brown, L., & Shipway, R. (2010). Meaning not measurement: Using ethnography to bring a deeper understanding to the participant experience of festivals and events. *International Journal of Event and Festival Management, 1*, 74-85. doi:10.1108/17852951011029315

House, R. J., Dorfman, P. W., Javidan, M., Hanges, P. J., & de Luque, M. F. S. (2013). *Strategic leadership across cultures: GLOBE study of CEO leadership behavior and effectiveness in 24 countries*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications.

Houghton, C., Casey, D., Shaw, D., & Murphy, K. (2013). Rigour in qualitative case-study research. *Nurse Researcher, 20*, 12-17. Retrieved from https://journals.rcni.com/nurse-researcher

Hsueh, S. C., Lin, J. Y., & Lin, M. Y. (2011). Secure cloud storage for convenient data archive of smart phones. *IEEE*, 156-161. doi:10.1109/ISCE.2011.5973804

Huang, W. L., & Feeney, M. K. (2015). Citizen participation in local government decision making: The role of manager motivation. *Review of Public Personnel Administration, 36*, 188-209. doi:10.1177/0734371X15576410

Huang, X., O'Connor, M., Ke, L-S., & Lee, S. (2014). Ethical and methodological issues in qualitative health research involving children: A systematic review. *Nursing Ethics, 23*, 339-356. doi:10.1177/0969733014564102

Hussein, A. (2015). The use of triangulation in social science research: Can qualitative and quantitative methods be combined? *Journal of Comparative Social Work, 4*(1), 1-12. Retrieved from http://journal.uia.no/index.php/JCSW

Igbokwe-Ibeto, Justine, C., & Agbodike, F. (2015). Recruitment policies in the Nigerian civil service and their implications on employees' performance. *Kuwait Chapter of the Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review, 5*, 34-48. Retrieved from https://www.arabianjbmr.com

Ijewereme, O. B. (2015). Anatomy of corruption in the Nigerian public sector: Theoretical perspectives and some empirical explanations. *SAGE Open*, 1-16. doi:10.1177/2158244015581188

Indexmundi.com. (2016). *Nigeria demographics profile 2016*. Retrieved January 19,

    2017 from http://www.indexmundi.com/nigeria/demographics_profile.html

Inyang, B. J. (2008). The challenges of evolving and developing management indigenous

    theories and practices in Africa. *International Journal of Business and*

    Management, 3, 122-132. doi:10.5539/ijbm.v3n12p122

Ishaq, M., Hussain, A., & Whittam, G. (2010). Racism: A barrier to entry? Experiences

    of small ethnic minority retail businesses. *International Small Business Journal,*

    28, 362-377. doi:10.1177/0266242610363523

Iwara, I. E., & Adams, J. A. (2017). National question and political recession in Nigeria:

    A case for holistic restructuring. *Socialscientia Journal of the Social Sciences and*

    Humanities, 2(1), 15-29. Retrieved from

    https://journals.aphriapub.com/index.php/SS/index

Iyengar, S. (2011). *How to make choosing easier*. Retrieved from

    http://www.ted.com/talks/sheena_iyengar_choosing_what_to_choose.html

Jackson, T. (2002). Reframing human resource management in Africa: A cross-cultural

    perspective. *International Journal of Human Resource management, 13*, 998-

    1018. doi:10.1080/09585190210131267

Jacob, R. I. (2014). Ethnic conflict between the Muslims and Christians in Nigeria: The

    dilemma of decision-making of the political elites. *International Journal of*

    Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding, 1(1), 1-11.

    doi:10.18415/ijmmu.v1i1.6

Janesick, V. J. (2011). *Stretching exercises for qualitative researchers* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Javidan, M., Dorfman, M., De Luque, M. S., & House, R. J. (2006). In the eye of the beholder: Cross-cultural lessons in leadership from Project Globe. *Academy of Management Perspectives, 20*, 67-90. doi:10.5465/AMP.2006.19873410

Jindal, S., Bagade, S. D., & Sharma, P. (2013). Impact of work force diversity on work culture of Indian organizations. *Journal of Business Management & Social Science Research, 2*, 1-5. Retrieved from http://borjournals.com/a/index.php/jbmssr

Jindra, M. (2014). The dilemma of equality and diversity. *Current Anthropology, 55*, 316-334. doi:10.1086/676457

Joshua, B. M., & Taylor-Abdulai, H. (2014). Making ethnic differences count at the workplace: A new paradigm shift for managing diversity in Ghana. *European Journal of Business and Management, 6*, 159-164. Retrieved from https://iiste.org/Journals/index.php/EJBM

Kalm, M., & Gomez-Mejia, L. (2016). Socioemotional wealth preservation in family firms. *Revista De Administração, 51*, 409-411. doi:10.1016Zj.rausp.2016.08.002

Kamwendo, G., & Seretse, T. (2015). Linguistic and religious diversity and inclusivity in the Botswana school curriculum. *Journal of Asian and African Studies, 50*, 533-541. doi:10.1177/0021909614547626

Kazeroony, H. H. (2016). *Sustainable management development in Africa: Building capabilities to serve African organizations* (H. H. Kazeroony, Y. Du Plessis, & B.

B. Puplampu, Eds.). New York, NY: Routledge.

Kazeroony, H. H., & Burr, C. (2017). *Rejecting Postcolonial Framework in Researching Gender, Race, and Diversity in Organizations*. European Academy of Management (EURAM), Glasgow, Scotland.

Kelman, S., & Hong, S. (2014). This could be the start of something big: Linking early managerial choices with subsequent organizational performance. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, *25*(1), 135-164. doi:10.1093/jopart/muu010

Kemparaj, U., & Chavan, S. (2013). Qualitative research: A brief description. *Indian Journal of Medical Sciences, 67*, 89-98. doi:10.4103/0019-5359.121127

Kern, F. G. (2016). The trials and tribulations of applied triangulation: Weighing different data sources. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research,* 1-16. doi:10.1177/1558689816651032

Kesler, G., Kates, A., & Oberg, T (2016). Design smart decision-making into the organization. *People and Strategy, 39*, 36-40. Retrieved from https://www.hrps.org

Kilburn, D., Nind, M., & Wiles, R. (2014). Learning as researchers and teachers: The development of a pedagogical culture for social science research methods? *British Journal of Educational Studies, 62*, 191-207. doi:10.1008/00071005.2014.918576

Knights, D., & Omanovic, V. (2016). (Mis) managing diversity: Exploring the dangers of diversity management orthodoxy. *Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal, 35*(1), 5-16. doi:10.1108./EDI-03-2014-0020

Koskinen, K. U. (2013). Observation's role in technically complex project

implementation: The social autopoietic system view. *International Journal of*

Managing Projects in Business, 6, 349-364. doi:10.1108/17538371311319061

Kwate, N. O. A., & Goodman, M. S. (2015). Cross-sectional and longitudinal effects of

racism on mental health among residents of Black neighborhoods in New York

City. *American Journal of Public Health, 105*, 711-718.

doi:10.2105/AJPH.2014.302243

Lee, H-J., & Reade, C. (2015). Ethnic homophily perceptions as an emergent IHRM

challenge: Evidence from firms operating in Sri Lanka during the ethnic conflict.

The International Journal of Human Resource Management, 26, 1645-1664.

doi:10.1080/09585192.2014.958514

Lee, B. A., & Sharp, G. (2017). Ethnoracial diversity across the rural-urban continuum.

The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, 672(1),

26-45. doi:10.1177/0002716217708560

Lee, Y. L. (2015). Chinese CEOs: Are their managing philosophy and practices

influenced by the Western management principles? *Asian Journal of Business*

Research, 5(1), 29-44. doi:10.14707/ajbr.150009

Leech, N. I., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (2007). An array of qualitative data analysis tools: A

call for data analysis triangulation. *School Psychology Quarterly, 22*, 557-584.

doi:10.1037/1045-380.22.4.557

Lewis, J. I. (2016). How does ethnic rebellion start? *Comparative Political Studies*, 1-31.

doi:10.1177/0010414016672235

Lewthwaite, S., & Nind, M. (2016). Teaching research methods in the social sciences: Expert perspectives on pedagogy and practice. *British Journal of Educational Studies, 64*, 413-430. doi:10.1080/00071005.2016.1197882

Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Lindsay, G. M., & Schwind, J. K. (2016). Narrative inquiry: Experience matters. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research, 0*(0), 1-7. doi:10.1177/0844562116652230

Loderer, C., Stulz, R., & Waelchli, U. (2016). Firm rigidities and the decline in growth opportunities. *Management Science*, 1-20. doi:10.1287/mnsc.2016.2478

Loewenberger, P. A., Newton, M., & Wick, K. (2014). Developing creative leadership in a public sector organization. *International Journal of Public Sector Management, 24*, 190-200. doi:10.1108/IJPSM-11-2012-0152

MacKenzie, C. A. (2016). Filtered meaning: appreciating linguistic skill, social position and subjectivity of interpreters in cross-language research. *Qualitative Research, 16*, 167-182. doi:10.1177/1468794115569564

Magda, K., & Wachsmuth, M. J. (2014). Discerning the body in cross-cultural relationships: A critical analysis of missional partnership in Southeastern Europe. *Kairos: Evangelical Journal of Theology, 8*(1), 25-43. Retrieved from https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_kairos-01.php

Malott, K. M., & Schaefle, S. (2014). Addressing clients' experiences of racism: A model for clinical practice. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 93*, 361-369. doi:10.1002/jcad.12034

Mandel, H., & Semyonov, M. (2014). Gender pay gap and employment sector: Sources of earnings disparities in the United States, 1970-2010. *Demography, 51*, 1597-1618. doi:10.1007/s13524-014-0320-y

Marcellin, R. L., Bauer, G. R., & Scheim, A. I. (2013). Intersecting impacts of transphobia and racism on HIV risk among trans persons of colour in Ontario, Canada. *Ethnicity and Inequalities in Health and Social Care, 6*, 108-120. doi:10.1108/EIHSC-08-2013-0010

Marshall, C., & Rossman, G. B. (2014). *Designing qualitative research* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Marshall, C., & Rossman, G. B. (2015). *Designing qualitative research* (6th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Martin, G. C. (2014). The effects of cultural diversity in the workplace. *Journal of Diversity Management, 9*, 89-92. doi:10.19030/jdm.v9i2.8974

Mason, R. B. (2007). The external environment's effect on management and strategy: A complexity theory approach. *Management Decision, 45*(1), 10-28. doi:10.1108/00251740710718935

Mason, R. B. (2015). Price tactics for a turbulent environment: A complexity theory view. *International Business & Economics Research Journal, 14*(1), 123-134. doi:10.19030/iber.v14i1.9036

Maxwell, J. A. (2012). *Qualitative research design. An interactive approach*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage.

Meadows, D. H. (2008). *Thinking in systems: A primer*. White River Junction, VT: Chelsea Green.

Meeussen, L., Otten, S., & Phalet, K. (2014). Managing diversity: How leaders' multiculturalism and colorblindness affect workgroup functioning. *Group Processes and Intergroup Relations, 17*, 629–644. doi:10.1177/1368430214525809

Meissner, R., & Jacobs, I. (2016). Theorizing complex water governance in Africa: The case of the proposed Epupa dam on the Kunene river. *International Environmental Agreements: Politics, Law and Economics, 16*(1), 21-48. doi:10.1007/s10784

Merrriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2015). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation* (4th ed.). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis. A methods sourcebook*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Mill, J. E., & Ogilvie, L. D. (2002). Establishing methodological rigour in international qualitative nursing research. A case study from Ghana. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 41*, 80-87. doi:10.1046/j.1365-2648.2003.02509.x

Mishra, B., & Mishra, J. (2015). Discrimination in the workplace. *Journal of Higher Education Theory and Practice*, 15, 64-72. Retrieved from http://www.na-businesspress.com/jhetpopen.html

Mize, T. D. (2016). Sexual orientation in the labor market. *American Sociological Review, 81*, 1132-1160. doi:10.1177/0003122416674025

Montuori, A. (2013). Complexity and trandisciplinarity: Reflections on theory and

 practice. *World Futures, 69*, 200-230. doi:10.1080/02604027-2013-803349

Muammer, A. K. (2016). Racial inequality and some examples. *Journal of Social and*

 Administrative Sciences, 3, 47-55. Retrieved from

 http://kspjournals.org/index.php/JSAS

Mustapha, A. R. (2010). *Ethnic minority groups in Nigeria – Current situation and major*

 problems. Retrieved from http://www.nigerianmuse.com

Nash, D. B. (2015). Worksite wellness: Culture and controversy. *Journal of Healthcare*

 Management, 60, 316-318. doi:10.1097/00115514-201509000-00004

Nathan, A. (2015). Sorting and statistiscal discrimination in schools. *Atlantic Economic*

 Journal, 43, 271-287. doi:10.1007/s11293-015-9457-3

Nathan, M. (2014). Same difference? Minority ethnic inventors, diversity and innovation

 in the UK. *Journal of Economic Geography, 15*(1), 129-168.

 doi:10.1093/jeg/lbu006

National Bureau of Statistics. (2016). *Demographic statistics bulletin 2015*. Retrieved

 from http://www.nigerianstat.gov.ng/report/490

National Bureau of Statistics. (2016). *Job creation survey, 2nd and 3rd quarters 2016:*

 Summary findings and selected tables. Retrieved from

 http://www.nigerianstat.gov.ng/report/488

National Bureau of Statistics. (2016). *Unemployment/underemployment report Q3 2016*.

 Retrieved from http://www.nigerianstat.gov.ng/report/481

National Population Commission. (2017). *Nigeria's population now 182 million – NPC.* Retrieved from http://www.population.gov.ng/

Ndimele, M. (2016). *How to make the public service great again*. DG BPSR. Retrieved from https://www.naija.ng/663463-wow-guess-number-civil-servants-nigeria.html#663463

Ngo, H. (2016). Racist habits: A phenomenological analysis of racism and the habitual body. *Philosophy and Social Criticism, 42*, 847-872. doi:10.1177/0191453715623320

Nichols, A. L. (2015). What do people desire in their leaders? The effect of leadership experience on desired leadership traits. *Leadership & Organization Development Journal, 37*, 658-671. doi:10.1108/LODJ-09-2014-0182

Nigeria Local. (2014). *A complete list of ethnic groups in Nigeria*. Retrieved January 19, 2017 from http://www.nigerialocal.com.ng/complete-list-ethnic-groups-nigeria/

Nisbet, E. C., Cooper, K. E., & Garrett, R. K. (2015). The partisan brain: How dissonant science messages lead Conservatives and Liberals to (dis) trust science. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, 658*(1), 36-66. doi:10.1177/0002716214555474

Nittle, N. K. (2016). *What is the difference between race and ethnicity*? Retrieved from http://racerelations.about.com/od/understandingrac1/a/The-Difference-Between-Ethnicity-And-Race.htm

Njos, R., Jakobsen, S-E., Fosse, J. K., & Engelsen, C. (2014). Challenges to bridging discrepant knowledge bases: A case study of the Norwegian center for offshore

wind energy. *European Planning Studies, 22*, 2389-2410.

doi:10.1080/09654313.2013.843651

Nkwede, J. O., Ibeogu, A. S., & Nwankwo, O. U. (2014). Political godfatherism and

governance in a developing democracy: Insight from Nigeria. *Academic Journal*

of Interdisciplinary Studies, *3*, 137-143. doi:10.5901/ajis.2014.v3n4p137

Nnahuihe, N. S., Aghemalo, A., & Okebugwu, N. E. (2014). Ethnicity and electoral

behavior in Nigeria. *European Scientific Journal, 2*, 159-178. Retrieved from

https://eujournal.org/index.php/esj/article/view/4141/3977

Nwosu, M. C., Igwe, K. N., & Nnadozie, C. O. (2016). Managing generational diversity

in the workplace: Implications for the digital era university library management.

International Journal of Applied Technologies in Library and Information

Management, 2, 28-44. Retrieved from http://www.jatlim.org

Nyambegera, S. M. (2011). Ethnicity and human resource management practice in sub-

Saharan Africa: The relevance of the managing diversity discourse. *The*

International Journal of Human Resource Management, 13, 1077-1090.

doi:10.1080/09558190210131302

Obo, U. B., Coker, M. A., & Omenka, J. A. (2014). The State as an instrument of

primitive accumulation: The Nigerian example, 1999-2013. *Journal of Law,*

Policy and Globalization, 26, 67-73. Retrieved from

https://iiste.org/Journals/index.php/JLPG

Oghojafor, B. E. A., Alaneme, G. C., & Kuye, O. L. (2013). Indigenous management

thoughts, concepts and practices: The case of the Igbos of Nigeria. *Australian*

Journal of Business and Management Research, 3(1), 8-15. Retrieved from

http://www.ajbmr.com

Oghojafor, B. E. A., Idowu, A., & George, O. J. (2012). Application of management

theories and philosophies in Nigeria and their associated problems. *International*

Journal of Business and Social Science, 3, 72-81. Retrieved from

http://www.ijbssnet.com

Ogoina, D. (2015). Behavioral and emotional responses to the 2014 Ebola outbreak in

Nigeria: A narrative review. *International Health, 8*(1), 5-12.

doi:10.1093/inthealth/ihr065

Ogunrotifa, A. B. (2012). Federal civil service reform in Nigeria: The case of democratic

centralism. *Radix International Journal of Research in Social Sciences, 1*, 1-45.

Retrieved from https://www.academia.edu

Okereke-Ejiogu, E. N., Asiabaka, C. C., & Umunakwe, P. C. (2016). Corruption-related

factors limiting the success of community and social development projects

(CSDP) in Imo State, Nigeria. *American Journal of Rural Development, 4*, 59-64.

doi:10.12691/ajrd-4-3-1

Okwir, S., Ulfrengren, P., Angelis, J., Ruiz, F., & Guerrero, Y. M. N. (2016). Managing

turnaround performance through collaborative decision-making. *Journal of Air*

Transport Management, 58, 183-196. doi:10.1016/jairtraman.2016.10.008

Olayinka A., & Adesina, J. O. (2015). Corruption and the Nigerian development

quagmire: Popular narratives and current interrogations. *Journal of Developing*

Societies, 31, 421-446. doi:10.1177/0169796X15590323

Olotu, A., Salami, R., & Akeremale, I. (2015). Poverty and rate of unemployment in
Nigeria. *International Journal of Management, 2*(1), 1-4.
doi:10.1353/eca.2004.0018

Olsen, T. D. (2016). Rethinking collective action: The co evolution of the state and
institutional entrepreneurs in emerging economies. *Organization Studies*, 1-22.
doi:10.1177/0170840616670440

Omeje, J. C., Egwa, E. I., and Adikwu, V. O. (2016). Impact of quota system and
catchment area policy on the university admissions in North Central Nigeria.
SAGE Open, 1-6. doi:10.1177/2158244016654951

Omisore, B. O., & Okofu, B. I. (2014). Staff recruitment and selection process in the
Nigerian public service: What is to be done? *International Journal of Human
Resource Studies, 4*, 280-293. doi:10.5296/ijhrs.v4i3.6367

Omotosho, B. J., & Omotoso, O. (2017). Cultural and creative industries as approaches
for reducing youth unemployment in Nigeria. *Social Science Research*, *3*(1), 140-
162. Retrieved from https://www.journals.elsevier.com/social-science-research

Online Nigeria. (2002). *Local government*. Retrieved from
http://www.onlinenigeria.com/government/adv.asp?blurb=143

Online Nigeria. (2016). *Nigerian languages*. Retrieved from
http://www.onlinenigeria.com/languages/languages.asp

Online Nigeria. (2016). *Tribes in Nigeria*. Retrieved from
http://www.onlinenigeria.com/tribes/

Onwuegbuzie, A., & Leech, N. L. (2005). On becoming a pragmatic researcher: The

importance of combining quantitative and qualitative research methodologies.

International Journal of Social Research Methodology, 8, 375–387.

doi:10.1080/13645570500402447

Onwuegbuzie, A. J., & Byers, V. T. (2014). An exemplar for combining the collection,

analysis, and interpretations of verbal and nonverbal data in qualitative research.

International Journal of Education, 6, 183-246. doi:10.5296/ije.v6.1.4399

Osakede, K. O., & Ijimakinwa, S. O. (2016). Political godfatherism and democratic

consolidation in Nigeria: Empirical evidence from Oyo State and Kwara State.

Arabian journal of Business and Management Review (Oman Chapter), 5, 1-12.

Retrieved from https://www.arabianjbmr.com

Osakede, K., Ijimakinwa, S., Adesanya, T., Ojo, A., Ojikutu, O., & Abubarka, A. (2015).

Corruption in the Nigeria public sector: An impediment to good governance and

sustainable development. *Review of Public Administration and Management, 4*,

76-87. Retrieved from http://www.arabianjbmr.com

Othman, Z., & Rahman, R. A. (2014). Attributes of ethical leadership in leading good

governance. *International Journal of Business and Society, 15*, 359-372.

Retrieved from http://www.ijbs.unimas.my

Ozgen, C., Peters, C., Niebuhr, A., Nijkamp, P., & Poot, J. (2014). Does cultural diversity

of migrant employees affect innovation? *International Migration Review, 48*,

377-416. doi:10.1111/imre.12138

Paetzold, R. L. (2013). Introduction to symposium on disability discrimination and law. *Employee Rights & Employment Policy Journal, 17*(1), 1-3. Retrieved from https://home.heinonline.org/titles/Law-Journal-Library/Employee-Rights-and-Employment-Policy-Journal/?letter=E

Parboteeah, K. P., Seriki, H. T., & Hoegl, M. (2014). Ethnic diversity, corruption and ethical climates in sub Saharan Africa: Recognizing the significance of human resource management. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management, 25*, 979-1001. doi:10.1008/09585192.2013.815251

Parke, J., & Griffiths, M. (2008). Participant and non participant observations in gambling environments. *Enquire, 1*(1), 1-14. Retrieved from https://www.nottingham.ac.uk/sociology/documents/enquire/volume-1-issue-1-parke-griffiths.pdf

Pate, U. A., Song, A. H., Abdullahi, M., & Umah, A. M. (2014). Religious diversity and national integration in Nigeria. *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences, 4*, 112-114. Retrieved from https://iiste.org/Journals/index.php/RHSS

Pearce, J. (2011). *Strategic Management Formulation Implementation and Control* (11th ed.). Buxton, England: McGraw Hill

Peng, W. S. (2008). A critique of Fred W. Riggs' ecology of public administration. *International Public Management Review, 9*(1), 213-226. Retrieved from http://journals.sfu.ca/ipmr/index.php/ipmr

Pezalla, A. E., Pettigrew, J., & Miller-Day, M. (2012). Researching the researcher-as-instrument: An exercise in interviewer self-reflexivity. *Qualitative Research, 12*, 165-185. doi:10.1177/1468794111422107

Pitts, D., & Jarry, E. (2007). Ethnic diversity and organizational performance: Assessing diversity effects at the managerial and street levels. *International Public Management Journal, 10*, 233-254. doi:10.1080/10967490701323738

Pollitt, C. (2010). Riggs on comparative public administration: looking back half a century. *International Review of Administrative Sciences, 76*, 761-766. doi:10.1177/0020852310386440

Priest, N., Perry, R., Ferdinand, A., Paradies, Y., & Kelahar, M. (2014). Experiences of racism, racial/ethnic attitudes, motivated fairness and mental health outcomes among primary and secondary school students. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence, 43*, 1672-1687. doi:10.1007/s10964-014-0140-9

QSR International. (2014). *NVIVO 12 just got even better*. Retrieved from https://www.qsrinternational.com/nvivo/enabling-research/nvivo-12-update

Raisio, H., & Lundstrom, N. (2015). Real leaders embracing the paradigm of complexity. *Emergence: Complexity and Organization, 1*, 1-6. doi:10.17357.583ff4f75416d52b11d1a684687091a9

Raskovic, M. (2013). Measuring culture effect size differences in Slovenian and Portuguese leadership practices: Cross-cultural leadership universality or contingency? *South East European Journal of Economics and Business, 8*, 7-15. doi:10.2478/jeb-2013-0004

Rasul, I., & Rogger, D. (2013). Management of bureaucrats and public service delivery: Evidence from the Nigerian civil service. *Economic Journal*, 1-58. Retrieved from https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/loi/14680297

Rasul, I., & Rogger, D. (2015). The impact of ethnic diversity in bureaucracies: Evidence from the Nigerian civil service. *American Economic Review: Papers & Proceedings, 105*, 457-461. doi:10.1257/aer.p20151003

Raudia, R., Douglas, J. W., Randma-Liiv, T., & Savi, R. (2015). The impact of fiscal crisis on decision-making processes in European governments: Dynamics of a centralization cascade. *Public Administration Review, 75*, 842-852. doi:10.1111/puar.12381

Reade, C., & Lee, H-J. (2016). Does ethnic conflict impede or enable employee innovation behavior? The alchemic role of collaborative conflict management. *International Journal of Conflict Management, 27*, 1-44. doi:10.1108/IJCMA-09-2014-0071

Rhode, D. L., & Packel, A. K. (2014). Diversity on corporate boards: How much difference does difference make? *Delaware Journal of Corporate Law, 39*, 377-426. Retrieved from http://www.djcl.org

Rhodes, R. A. W. (2014). 'Genre blurring' and public administration: what can we learn from ethnography? *Australian Journal of Public Administration, 73*, 317-330. doi:10.1111/1467-8500.12085

Richards, L., & Morse, J. M. (2013). *Readme first for a user's guide to qualitative methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Richardson, T. M., Earnhardt, M. P., & Marion, J. W. (2015). Is project management still an accidental profession? A qualitative study of career trajectory. *Sage Open*, 1-10. doi:10.1177/2158244015572098

Riggs, F. W. (2002). Globalization, ethnic diversity, and nationalism: The challenge of democracies. *ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, 581*(1), 35-47. doi:10.1177/000271620258100105

Riggs, F. W. (2010). Trends in the comparative study of public administration. *International Review of Administrative Sciences, 76*, 750-760. doi:10.1177/00200852310386437

Rindap, M. R., & Mari, I. M. A. (2014). Ethnic minorities and the Nigerian State. *An International Journal of Arts and Humanities, 3*, 89-101. doi:10.4314/ijah.v3i3.8

Robbett, A. (2015). Voting with hands and feet: The requirements for optimal group formation. *Experimental Economics, 18*, 522-541. doi:10.1007/s10783-014-9418-8

Robinson, A. L. (2016). Nationalism and ethnic-based trust: Evidence from an African border region. *Comparative Political Studies, 49*, 1819-1854. doi:10.1177/0010414016628269

Roex, K. A., Huijts, T., & Seiben, I. (2018). Attitudes towards income inequality: Winners versus losers of the perceived meritocracy. *Acta Sociologica*, 1-17. doi:10.1177/0001699317748340

Rood, C. (2013). Rhetorics of civility: Theory, pedagogy, and practice in speaking and writing textbooks. *Rhetoric Review, 32*, 331-348. doi:10.1080/07350198.2013.797879

Rossini, M. O., Rincon, S., & Rutkowski, A-F. (2015). The Link Class Project: Collaborative virtual teams between Peru and The Netherlands. *Journal of Economics, Finance and Administrative Science, 20,* 137-140. doi:10.1016./j.jefas.2015.10.001

Rossman, G. B. & Rallis, S.F. (2012). *Learning in the field: An introduction to qualitative research*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage.

Rubinstein, Y., & Brenner, D. (2014). Pride and prejudice: Using ethnic-sounding names and inter ethnic marriages to identify labour market discrimination. *Review of Economic Studies, 81*, 389-425. doi:10.1093/restud/rdt031

Rusetski, A. (2014). Pricing by intuition: Managerial choices with limited information. *Journal of Business Research*, *67*, 1733-1743. doi:10.1016/j.jbusres.2014.02.020

Schlösser, O., Frese, M., Heintze, A. M., Al-Najjar, M., Arciszewski, T., Besevegis, E., ... Gaborit, M. (2013). Humane orientation as a new cultural dimension of the GLOBE project: A validation study of the GLOBE scale and out-group humane orientation in 25 countries. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 44*, 535-551. doi:10.1177/0022022112465671

Selvarajah, C., & Meyer, D. (2006). Archetypes of the Malaysian manager: Exploring ethnicity dimensions that relate to leadership. *Journal of Management and Organization, 12*, 251–269. doi:10.1017/S1833367200003990

Shahba, S., Arjmandi, R., Monavari, M., & Ghodusi, J. (2016). Application of multi

    attribute decision-making methods in SWOT analysis of mine waste management

    (case study: Sirjan's Golgohar iron mine, Iran). *Resources Policy, 51*, 67-76.

    doi:10.1016/j.resourplo.2016.11.002

Sharma, N., Schuster, P. L.-T., Ba, T., & Singh, V. K. (2016). Effect of workplace

    incivility on job satisfaction and turnover intentions in India. *South Asian Journal*

    of Global Business Research, 5, 234-249. doi:10.1108/sajgbr-02-2015-0020

Shen, J., Chanda, A., D'netto, B., & Monga, M. (2009). Managing diversity through

    human resource management: An international perspective and conceptual

    framework. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, *20*, 235-

    251. doi:10.1080/09585190802670516

Simon, T., Suengas, A. G., Ruiz-Gallego-Largo, T., & Bandres, J. (2013). Positive bias is

    a defining characteristic of aging to the same extent as declining performance.

    International Journal of Psychology, 48, 704-714.

    doi:10.1080/00207594.2012.718781

Sitati, N., Were, D. S., & Waititu, D. G. A. (2016). Effects of job promotion on employee

    retention in hotels in Kenya. *Strategic Journal of Business & Change*

    Management, *3*, 957-972. Retrieved from http://www.strategicjournals.com

Smit, B., & Scherman, V. (2016). A case for relational leadership and an ethics of care

    for counteracting bullying at schools. *South African Journal of Education, 36*, 1-

    9. doi:10.15700/saje.v36n4a1312

Soifer, H. D. (2015). Regionalism, ethnic diversity, and variation in public good

    provision by national states. *Comparative Political Studies, 49*, 1341-1371.

    doi:10.1177/0010414015617965

Solaja, O. M., & Ogunola, A. A. (2016). Leadership style and multigenerational

    workforce: A call for workplace agility in Nigerian public organizations.

    International Journal of African and Asian Studies, 21, 46-56. Retrieved from

    https://iiste.org/Journals/index.php/JAAS

Soldan, Z., & Nankervis, A. (2014). Employee perception of effectiveness of diversity

    management in the Australian public service: Rhetoric and reality. *Public*

    Personnel Management, 1-22. doi:10.1177/0091026014533093

Solt, F., Hu, Y., Hudson, K., Song, J., & Yu, D. (2016). Economic inequality and belief

    in meritocracy in the United States. *Research and Politics*, 1-7.

    doi:10.1177/2053168016672101

South Africa History Online. (2015). *The homelands: Race and ethnicity in South Africa*.

    Retrieved from http://www.sahistory.org.za/article/race-and-ethnicity-south-africa

Souza, T. C., & Cribari-Neto, F. (2015). Intelligence, religiosity and homosexuality non

    acceptance: Empirical evidence. *Intelligence, 52*, 63-70.

    doi:10.1016/j.intell.2015.07.003

Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Stevenson, W. (2014). *Operations management* (12th ed.). New York, NY: McGraw-

    Hill/Irwin.

Stevenson, W. B., & Radin, R. F. (2015). The minds of the board of directors: The effects of formal position and informal networks among board members on influence and decision-making. *Journal of Management and governance, 19*, 421-460. doi:10.1007/s10997-014-9286-9

Sule, B., Sani, M. A. M., & Mat, B. (2018). Godfatherism and political party financing in Nigeria: Analysing the 2015 general election. *Geografia-Malaysian Journal of Society and Space, 14*(1), 1-14. doi:10.17576/geo-1401-01

Tang, T. L. P. (2016). Theory of monetary intelligence, money attitudes-religious values, making money, making ethical decisions, and making the grade. *Journal of Business Ethics, 133*, 583-603. doi:10.1007/s10551-014-2411-5

The Center for Media and Democracy. (2012). *Ethnic groups of Kenya*. Retrieved from http://www.sourcewatch.org/index.php/Ethnic_Groups_of_Kenya

The National Conference. (2014). *Report of the committee on public service*. Retrieved from http://www.slideshare.net/OgilegwuAjahCaffodil/report-of-the-committee-on-public-service-in-one

Thomas, G. (2015). *How to do your case study*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Thompson, D. S., Fazio, X., Kustra, E., Patrick, L., & Stanley, D. (2016). Scoping review of complexity theory in health services research. *BMC Health Services Research, 16*, 1-16. doi:10.1186/s12913-016-1343-4

Tiwari, G. N., & Dhatt, H. K. (2014). Contribution value of spiritual intelligence, emotional intelligence and self-efficacy in academic achievement of B.Ed student

teachers. *International Journal of Modern Social Sciences, 3*, 51-65. Retrieved

from http://www.modernscientificpress.com/journals/ijmss.aspx

Tuckman, B. W. (1965). Developmental sequence in small groups. *Psychological*

Bulletin, 63, 384-399. doi:10.1037/h0059886

Tumwine, J. K. (2015). University students' sexual orientation, contraception and toxic

skin bleaching products. *African Health Sciences, 15*, 1. doi:10.4314/ahs.v15i4.1

Ugiagbe, E. O., & Ugiagbe, I. (2015). Transcending the Eurocentric development

paradigms in Nigeria: The traditional age grades in discourse. *Journal of Siberian*

Federal University. Humanities & Social Sciences, 3, 366-376.

doi:10.17516/1997-1370-2015-8-3-366-376

Umukoro, N. (2013). Poverty and social protection in Nigeria. *Journal of Development*

Societies, 29, 305-322. doi:10.1177/0169796X13494281

United Nations Development Program. (2014). *National human development report*

2014. Retrieved from www.ng.undp.org

Urbancova, H., Cermakova, H., & Vostrovska, H. (2016). Diversity management in the

workplace. *Acta Universitatis Agriculturae et Silviculturae Mendelianae*

Brunensis, 64, 1083-1092. doi:10.11118/actaun201664031083

Uribe-Jongbloed, E. (2014). A qualitative methodology for minority language media

production research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 13*, 135-150.

doi:10.1177/146879410100100303

Van der Meer, T., & Tolsma, J. (2014). Ethnic diversity and its effects on social

    cohesion. *Annual Review of Sociology, 40*, 459-478. doi:10.1146/annurev-soc-

    071913-043309

Vauclair, C-M., Lima, M. L., Abrams, D., Swift, H. J., & Bratt, C. (2016). What do older

    people think that others think of them, and does it matter? The role of meta

    perceptions and social norms in the prediction of perceived age discrimination.

    Psychology and Aging, 31, 699-710. doi:10.1037/pag0000125

Venkatesh, V., Brown, S. A., & Bala, H. (2013). Bridging the qualitative-quantitative

    divide: Guidelines for conducting mixed methods research in information

    systems. *MIS Quarterly, 37*, 21-54. doi:10.25300/MISQ/2013/37.1.02

Verissimo, A. D. O., Grella, C. E., Amaro, H., & Gee, G. C. (2014). Discrimination and

    substance use disorders among Latinos: The role of gender, nativity, and

    ethnicity. *Journal of Public Health, 104*, 1421-1428.

    doi:10.2105/AJPH.2014.302011

Verma, A. (2014). Valuing diversity: Strategies and implications for organizational

    success. *Prestige International Journal of Management and Research, 7/8*, 31-38.

    Retrieved from http://www.worldcat.org/title/prestige-international-journal-of-

    management-and-research/oclc/879027993

Verner, J. M., & Abdullah, L. M. (2012). Exploratory case study research: Outsourced

    project failure. *Information and Software Technology, 54*, 866-886.

    doi:10.1016/j.infsof.2011.11.001

Vogt, W. P., & Johnson, R. B. (2011). *Dictionary of statistics & methodology: A nontechnical guide for the social sciences*. New York, NY: Sage.

Wang, C. L., Rafiq, M., Li, X., & Zheng, Y. (2014). Entrepreneurial preparedness: An exploratory case study of Chinese private enterprises. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research, 20*, 351-374. doi:10.1108/IJEBR-06-2013-0079

Wang, D., Xu, H., & Li, X. (2015). How to reduce local government decision-making competition in China's new urbanization process. *Kybernetes, 44*, 671-691. doi:10.1108/K-06-2014-0119

Webster, F., Rice, K., Christian, J., Seemann, N., Baxter, N., Moulton, C-A., & Cil, T. (2016). The erasure of gender in academic surgery: A qualitative study. *The American Journal of Surgery, 212*, 559-565. doi:10.1016/j.amjsurg.2016.06.006

Wegge, J., Shemla, M., & Haslam, S. A. (2014). Leader behavior as a determinant of health at work: Specification and evidence of five key pathways. *German Journal of Research in Human Resource Management, 28*, 6-23. doi:10.1688/ZfP-1014-01-Wegge

Wisdom, J. P., Cavaleri, M. A., Onwuegbuzie, A. J., & Green, H. (2012). Methodological reporting in qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods health services research articles. *Health Services Research, 47*, 721-745. doi:10.1111/j.1475-6773.2011.01344.

World Atlas. (2016). *Ethnic groups and tribes in Ghana*. Retrieved from http://www.worldatlas.com/articles/ethnic-groups-and-tribes-in-ghana.html

World Elections. (2014). *Race, ethnicity and language in South Africa*. Retrieved from

    https://welections.wordpress.com/guide-to-the-2014-south-african-election/race-

    ethnicity-and-language-in-south-africa/

Wuyts, S., & Dutta, S. (2014). Benefiting from alliance portfolio diversity: The role of

    past internal knowledge creation strategy. *Journal of Management, 40*, 1653-

    1674. doi:10.1177/0149206312442339

Yanchick, V. A., Baldwin, J. N., Bootman, J. L., Carter, R. A., Crabtree, B. L., & Maine,

    L. L. (2014). Report of the 2013-2014 Argus Commission: Diversity and

    inclusion in pharmacy education. *American Journal of Pharmaceutical*

    Education, 78, 1-6. doi:10.5688/ajpe7810S21

Yardley, S. J., Watts, K. M., Pearson, J., & Richardson, J. C. (2014). Ethical issues in the

    reuse of qualitative data: Perspectives from literature, practice, and participants.

    Qualitative Health Research, 24, 102-113. doi:10.1177/1049732313518373

Yaro, I. (2014). Recruitment and selection in the Nigerian public service: nature,

    challenges and way forward. *British Journal of Economics, Management &*

    Trade, 4, 1005-1017. doi:10.9734/BJEMT/2014/7941

Yin, R. K. (2013). Validity and generalization in future case study evaluations.

    Evaluation, 19, 321-332. doi:10.1177/1356389013497081

Yin, R. K. (2014). *Case study research: Design and methods* (5th ed.). Thousand Oaks,

    CA: Sage.

Yin, R. K. (2016). *Qualitative research from start to finish* (2nd ed.). New York, NY:

    The Guilford Press.

Zakaria, Z. (2015). A cultural approach of embedding KPIs into organizational practices. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management, 64*, 932-946. doi:10.1108/IJPPM-08-2014-0127

Zheng, J. (2010). Cross-cultural study on French and Chinese Managers' use of power sources. *International Journal of Business and Management, 5*, 219-225. Retrieved from http://www.ccsenet.org/journal/index.php/ijbm

Zhou, T. (2014). Examining continuance usage of mobile Internet services from the perspective of resistance to change. *Information Development, 30*, 22-31. doi:10.1177/0266666912468762

Appendix A: Sample Letter of Cooperation

May 23, 2017
xxxxxxxxx
xxxxxxxxx
Attention:

Dear Sir,
OFFICIAL REQUEST TO USE YOUR FEDERAL GOVERNMENT AGENCY AS
CASE STUDY FOR MY DOCTORAL DISSERTATION
As part of my doctoral studies and requirements with the Walden University based in the
United States of America, I am designing and conducting dissertation on the topic
Exploring Ethnic Diversity on Managerial Choices in Nigeria. With your permission, I
would like to use your government agency as my case study site to collect data on my
topic. The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study was to consider the role of
ethnicity in managerial choices in a FTMA and how ethnicity influenced managers'
choices with regard to recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees. The central
research question I plan to address from my findings is: *How does perceived managerial
discrimination based on ethnicity sway employee productivity?* There are two sub
research questions for this study: *What is the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in
Nigeria's public service agencies*? *How does ethnicity influence managers' decisions
regarding recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees?*

Sir, what I am asking from you is your approval to use your government agency
as my case study site. Second is your kind permission to permit me to interview ten to
twelve staff of your government agency as my participants. I would be flexible in
scheduling the interviews whenever most convenient for the participants and for being
the least disruptive to the daily work. Third, in the event of your approval, I would
require you to complete a form indicating your consent, which I will submit to Walden
University's Institutional Review Board (IRB).

The principal goal of the IRB is to ensure the safety and comfort of all
participants, and protection from harmful and unethical practices. As part of sound ethical
practices, I guarantee the confidentiality of all my participants and your government
agency, and after the data collection, I will have participants check the transcribed data to
ensure that they were not misquoted or misrepresented.

My study may provide relevant knowledge to the board and management of your
government agency and to future researchers that may want to further the course of the
research. Future government policies may also benefit from my research. Similar
agencies to your agency may take advantage of my study both within Nigeria and
internationally.

Thank you sir for your time as I await your response.
Yours truly,

Henry O. Imoni

Appendix B: Request for Data Collection from Local Head of Agency

October 27, 2017

Xxxxxxxx
Xxxxxxxx
Xxxxxxxx
xxxxxxxx

Dear Sir,
Re: OFFICIAL REQUEST TO USE XXXXXXXXXX AS CASE STUDY FOR MY
DOCTORAL DISSERTATION

The above subject matter refers please.
Consequent on the approval by the XXXXXXX through a letter with reference
XXXXXX for me to conduct my study with the XXXXXXXX as host site, I wish to
convey my readiness to start. To ensure a seamless exercise, I wish to make the following
comments and make some requests for your kind approval.

    a.   I wish to conduct interviews with 12 XXXXX employees in grade level 14-16
       only and have a minimum working experience with the XXXXXX of 4 years.
    b.   I request the e-mail addresses of all eligible XXXXXX officers that are within
       grade level 14-16 because I will send personalized expression of interest letters
       and a consent form to each individual to obtain their consent prior to scheduling
       for interviews.
    c.   As part of my data collection, I will conduct a nonparticipant observation in your
       premises during work hours for three weeks in four-hour sessions per time.
       Consequently, I solicit your kind permission to attend some meetings and stay in
       some common areas as I observe the work dynamics, operations, and conduct of
       my participants as well as the work environment.
    d.   Another data collection method in my study is the review of documents. For my
       study, the documents I solicit your permission to review onsite and return include
       handbooks, recruitment materials, annual reports, recruitment data, statistics on
       promotion, government documents and rules, and accessible media publications.

    I promise to ensure that my activities in your workplace will not constitute any
disruption to your operations. Kindly convey to me your understanding and acceptances
to my humble prayers to enable me commence this phase of my dissertation.

Yours truly,

Henry Imoni

Appendix C: Expression of Interest E-mail to Potential Participants

Doctoral Research Study

My name is Henry O. Imoni, a doctoral student at Walden University. My focus of study is in Management with a specialty in Leadership and Organizational Change. Dr. Donna Brown, faculty member of the College Of Management and Technology is the chair of my committee who supervises my work. I have applied and received approval of my study to conduct it by the Institutional Review Board to ensure the safety and well being of participants taking part in the study. I have official permission from the head of your government agency to invite qualified employees of your agency such as you to participate in this research study. This e-mail will fully inform you about my study to enable you to make an informed decision whether to serve as my participant for this study or not.

My research purpose.

The purpose of this qualitative exploratory case study was to consider the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in a FTMA and how ethnicity influenced managers' choices with regard to recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees.

What does your solicited participation in this research involve?

There will be a total of ten participants that work in your government agency for this study. If you agree to participate in this study by signing the Consent Form attached to this letter, I will interview you in a face-to-face semistructured interview. The interview will last a maximum of one hour from the point when I ask the first question. All the interview sessions will be recorded to ensure that I do not miss out on any vital information. In the course of the interview, I may also take notes. All the recordings, and transcribed information you provide will be kept confidential. You can choose not to answer any question and/or withdraw from participating in the interview at any time, even after your initial consent without a penalty or recrimination. After the interviews are transcribed, I will provide you an opportunity to review the transcribed material through a process called member checking. Your review of the transcript ensures that I have captured from your responses what you intended. If not, I am prepared to adjust the transcript.

Guarantee of confidentiality

I take the issue of the confidentiality of your interview seriously and will not disclose any information to any individual unless the law requires the disclosure. In transcribing the interviews, I will use identifiers such as Participant A, to refer to every participant and not any reference to actual names. In addition, I will not state any information that could be traced back to you. The results of the study may be used at an aggregate level, in reports, presentations and publications; never at a personal level.

Confirmation of participation

Attached to this letter is a Consent Form that you are required to indicate, "I consent" in and return back to me by return e-mail. For the purposes of this research, should you choose to indicate, "I consent" and return to me, it means that you have read this letter, understood the content, and consent to participate as one of my interviewees. Please print a copy of this consent information for your records. I solicit your response no later than (date here). After this date I will assume that you declined to participate in this study. I am happy to respond to any questions or concerns you might have about the research. I can be reached at on (redacted) or e-mail with address (redacted).

Appendix D: Interview Protocol

Topic: Exploring Ethnic Diversity on Managerial Choices in Nigeria.

Central research question

How does perceived managerial discrimination based on ethnicity sway employee

productivity?

Sub research questions

1. What is the role of ethnicity in managerial choices in Nigeria's public service

agencies?

2. How does ethnicity influence managers' decisions regarding recruitment, placement,

and promotion of employees?

Date:

Time:

Location:

Interviewer: Mr. Henry O. Imoni

Interviewee:

Notes to interviewee:

I appreciate the time you devoted for this interview. Your input to my study will

contribute to available knowledge in this area. Please be assured of the

confidentiality of your responses and your person.

Estimated length of interview: 1 hour

Number of questions: Eleven major questions and possibility of sub- questions.

Semistructured Interview Questions

1. What are the eligibility criteria for recruitment to this government agency?

2. How do the recruitment policies in federal government agencies influence managerial choices of recruitment into this government agency?

3. What role does merit play in the recruitment, placement, and promotion of employees in this government agency?

4. What role does the federal character principle or quota system play in the managerial choices of who to recruit, place in a certain position, and promote in this government agency?

5. In your opinion, what factors should managers take into consideration in making employee-related decisions in this FTMA?

6. What were the factors that influenced your posting to your current department?

7. What were your experiences when you became eligible for promotion?

8. What role did ethnicity play in your recruitment, placement, and promotion?

9. In your organization, what privileges does ethnicity confer to employees?

10. What are the benefits of having employees who are from your ethnicity work under you and what are the challenges?

11. How do individuals who perceive themselves as victims of discrimination by managerial decisions concerning recruitment, placement, and promotion due to ethnic bias perceive their situation and how are they coping with it?

Appendix E: Observation Protocol

Tentative Schedule	(Tuesdays and Thursdays 10:00am-2:00pm) for 3 weeks
Date:	
The Background: Describe in detail the physical setting.	
The People: Provide details and record the human interactions and relationships.	
The Productivity: Describe how the human interactions affect the productivity in the worksite.	

Time	Observation	Reflections