Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies

2017

An Exploration of Efforts to Combat Human Trafficking in a Small Community

Shirley Konneh
Walden University

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.waldenu.edu/dissertations

Part of the Public Policy Commons

Walden University

College of Social and Behavioral Sciences

This is to certify that the doctoral dissertation by

Shirley Konneh

has been found to be complete and satisfactory in all respects,
and that any and all revisions required by
the review committee have been made.

Review Committee
Dr. Anne Hacker, Committee Chairperson,
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

Dr. Judith Fitzgerald, Committee Member,
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

Dr. George Larkin, University Reviewer,
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

Chief Academic Officer
Eric Riedel, Ph.D.

Walden University
2017

Abstract

An Exploration of Efforts to Combat Human Trafficking in a Small Community

by

Shirley D. Konneh

MBA, Walden University, 2012

BS, Worcester State College, 2005

Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Public Policy and Administration

Walden University

May 2017

Abstract

Human trafficking is a global crime that violates the rights of people by holding them in captivity and coercing them into sexual slavery or strenuous labor. It has become a growing phenomenon on Cape Cod, Massachusetts with no signs of stopping. Using John Kingdon's work on multiple policy streams as the primary theoretical foundation, the purpose of this case study was to identify the perceived barriers to implementing existing Massachusetts's policies targeting human trafficking on Cape Cod as experienced by social service providers and law enforcement. Data were collected from 6 participants through e-mail interview. These data were inductively coded and analyzed using Braun and Clarke's thematic analysis procedure. Findings indicate that participants perceived the key barriers to full implementation of state policy to be a lack of training, difficulties in forming and maintaining partnerships, gaps in policy, and funding deficiencies. Participants also consistently noted that vulnerable populations supply the demand for human trafficking, and vulnerable populations are one of the reasons why human trafficking continues to exist. The implications for social change include recommendations to local government policy makers to focus on building coalitions between law enforcement and social service agencies to capitalize on opportunities to engage in proactive policy making to ameliorate the social impacts of human trafficking, including recovery services for victims.

An Exploration of Efforts to Combat Human Trafficking in a Small Community

by

Shirley D. Konneh

MBA, Walden University, 2012

BS, Worcester State College, 2005

Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Public Policy and Administration

Walden University

May 2017

Dedication

I want to dedicate this study to victims and survivors everywhere. Most importantly, I dedicate this study to my support system. My mother who gave birth to me, raised me, and has stood by me through everything. My husband and my children who walked with me through this journey of education, have never left my side, and have been my biggest supporters throughout. I love you all unconditionally.

Acknowledgments

I would like to give glory and all honor to my Lord and Savior, Jesus Christ. He opened this door of opportunity for me that I never thought possible, and has granted me favor to complete it. I want to thank my husband Peter Konneh, who has been my backbone and strength, as well as, my children Peterlynn, Festus, and Kaitlynn Konneh. I give thanks to my Christian family for your countless prayers towards my success. I would also like to thank Dr. Hacker for your support, knowledge, and wisdom. Lastly, I need to give a generous thank you to the woman who was there from the very beginning and who I have always leaned on, my mother, Edith Finecountry.

Table of Contents

List of Tables

Chapter 1: Introduction to the Study

Human trafficking is a form of modern day slavery where men, women, and children are forced to do labor, or are sexually exploited by their employers. Soroptimist (2012) estimated that the sex trafficking industry generates $32 billion annually by trafficking 2.5 million people. Sexual exploitation of such magnitude has become a global problem, and has evolved to becoming the second largest crime sector in the United States (Goździak & Bump, 2008). The prevalence of this crime is the result of the secrecy, cost effectiveness, affordability, high demand, and huge profit margin gained by its perpetrators (McGough, 2013). Because this phenomenon is now being acknowledged as a global crisis, governments around the world have taken initiatives to try and put an end to this crime. The federal government has been proactive in responding to the influx of trafficking, but much more still needs to be done within local governments in order to control the rate of this growing crime.

The government has combatted the spread of human trafficking across the nation making strides; however, some states still remain at risk. For example, the state of Massachusetts had no initial plan to conquer the existence of sexual slavery in their state (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). There were no solutions on how to eradicate the problem, no policies on how to handle the issue, and no services to protect the individuals who suffered as a result of this crime (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). When former Massachusetts Attorney General Martha Coakley recognized the issue of human trafficking as a problem in the state, she recruited victim service representatives, law enforcement, and state and community agencies to combine their efforts to form an

interagency task force to tackle human trafficking (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). Although this was a huge step for Massachusetts, the continued occurrence of trafficking victims and the lack of resources to protect them would impede the initial goal developed by the interagency task force. There was a need for this study, to unravel what is preventing Massachusetts from providing such crucial services to those in need and protecting its current citizens from dangerous criminals.

Background of the Problem

Human trafficking has become a global phenomenon that captures the lives of people and takes away their basic freedoms. According to the International Labour Organization (ILO) (2012), nearly 21 million people across the world were forced into labour. Out of these 21 million victims, 11.7 million came from the Asia-Pacific region, 3.7 million from Africa, and 1.8 million from Latin America (International Labour Organization, 2012).

There are thousands of victims that are trafficked and forced into labor or sexually exploited within the United States alone. In 2013, information was obtained by the National Human Trafficking Resource Center Hotline (NHTRC) regarding an estimate of 5,214 human trafficking cases occurring in all 50 states (Polaris, 2014). The NHTRC hotline reported that 41% of those cases were sex trafficking and 20% were labor trafficking, where 85% of those victims in the sex trafficking cases were women, and 21% of the labor trafficking cases were men (Polaris, 2014). The National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (NCMEC) estimated that roughly 100,000 minors are engaged in the commercial sex trade (Polaris, 2014).

The NHTRC hotline was able to identify the top sex, labor, and child trafficking industries. The top sex trafficking industries were pimp-controlled prostitution in hotels or the streets, brothels, and escort services (Polaris, 2014). The top labor trafficking industries are domestic labor, restaurant or food service, peddling rings, traveling sales crew servitudes, and hostess/strip clubs (Polaris, 2014). The top child trafficking industries are pimp-controlled prostitution, peddling rings, pornography, escort/delivery service, commercial-front brothel, traveling sales crew, domestic work, restaurant/food service, personal sexual servitude, and hostess/strip club (Polaris, 2014). With human trafficking growing within the United States, the federal government took initiative in addressing it, raising awareness, bringing justice to victims, and prosecuting the perpetrators.

The United States initiated and executed the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) 2000 to address this crime (United States Department of State, 2014a). This law was created to clearly define human trafficking as a crime in order to aid in preventing it. Law enforcement did not know how to protect victims, but rather arrested them for prostitution. In terms of traffickers, their punishment never matched the severity of the crimes they committed (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2014). As new laws were passed, training was made available to police officials across the nation on how to identify the act of trafficking when it occurs, and what necessary measures need to be taken.

To aid victims of human trafficking, the U.S. government consists of many departments and agencies whose missions are to protect people's rights and secure their

freedoms. They do this by enacting and enforcing policies to help make us aware of the tragedies that go on and steps we can take to prevent it from continuing. The installment of the Office to Combat Trafficking in Persons, derived from the TVPA of 2000, has aided in the reduction of victims being trafficked each year (United States Department of State, 2014).

In Massachusetts, reported acts of trafficking were disguised as other forms of businesses such as massage parlors, health clubs, and other legitimate businesses (Raymond & Hughes, 2001). These types of venues were instrumental in driving trafficking activity. Services to combat trafficking are primarily located in the capital, Boston. This is where the attorney general's office is located and where a lot of services that caters to trafficking victims are. The manpower is in Boston, therefore, many cases are reported and prosecuted there (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). Trafficking can easily invade other parts of the state because anti trafficking task forces are not available everywhere.

Victims are recruited through various methods including abduction, coercion and pressure from family members (Raymond & Hughes, 2001). Geographically, it is convenient for traffickers to smuggle their victims through boarder states like Massachusetts, where Cape Cod connects to the harbor. Cape Cod is where most of Massachusetts receives its shipments because it protrudes into the Atlantic Ocean (National Park Service, 2014). The Cape has evolved from whaling and trading areas to becoming resort destinations, attracting wealthy families, celebrities, and other tourists. These include the large nearby islands of Martha's Vineyard and Nantucket that are

famous for summer tourist destinations, because they can easily be accessed by ferry from Cape Cod. Cape Cod is connected to the mainland by a pair of canal-spanning highway bridges. Cape Cod has a year-round population of about 220,000, and experiences a lot of tourists during the summer (National Park Service, 2014). Since it is a tourist's destination, and has easy access to transport goods through boats, it creates a huge opportunity for traffickers to transport victims to and from Cape Cod.

Victims rescued on Cape Cod have to travel roughly 60 miles north to the capital, Boston, before they can obtain adequate services. There is a district attorney's office located on the Cape, but they do not handle these types of cases. There are shelters available to people who have been domestically abused on the Cape, but sometimes there is no space available. If there is shelter, it is short term and not equipped to handle victims of human trafficking who need psychological, social, and legal services.

A study funded by the Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) and the Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation (ASPE), on the trauma female and children victims of sexual exploitation underwent, showed that these individuals had endured psychological damage from being brainwashed and held captive (Clawson, Salomon, & Grace, 2008). In addition, they had suffered behavioral problems such as post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD), which caused them to relive their victimization over and over again, emotional disorders, health problems, the abuse of substances, and anxiety or depression (Clawson, Salomon, & Grace, 2008). There was also report that due to the daily beatings, abuse, and repeated sex partners, victims

experienced stomach pain, headaches, and other unexplained ailments (Clawson, Salomon, & Grace, 2008).

The existing social service agencies located on Cape Cod are currently incapable of providing the support services identified in Massachusetts legislation to victims of human trafficking. Services such as emergency housing and transportation are needed immediately after a victim is rescued (Federal Strategic Action Plan, 2014). Also needed on Cape Cod are practitioners who are qualified to handle the delicacy of the matter. Victims need counseling and therapy to learn how to cope with the tragedy that happened to them (Federal Strategic Action Plan, 2014). In addition, case managers are needed to work with victims to get them assistance from the state which are steps to becoming free and independent of their traffickers. Legal assistance is needed as well for immigration services and to advocate for individuals who were trafficked into the United States.

The state of Massachusetts passed House Bill 3808, An Act Relative to the Commercial Exploitation of People. This bill enforced harsher punishments for traffickers, developed police task forces to investigate the crime, and provided services to assist victims (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). All these strategic plans, however, are not available on Cape Cod, leaving that population vulnerable to attacks. This study addressed the gap in research by uncovering what has prevented the state of Massachusetts from implementing current strategies on the region of Cape Cod.

Problem Statement

There have been many efforts targeting human trafficking made by federal governments all around the world, but not enough to contain the problem. Human

trafficking has become a worldwide epidemic with an average of 2.5 million people trafficked at any given time (United Nations Gift, 2013). Efforts to stop this problem include anti trafficking campaigns to raise awareness, and the implementation of combative police task forces targeting trafficking rings in order to rescue victims and arrest perpetrators.

United States government has become a leader in the fight against human trafficking with the U.S. State Department creating the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. Other federal departments in the United States have also started new anti trafficking initiatives, including the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) and the Department of Justice who recognized sexual slavery the imprisonment of people by robbing them of their civil rights (United States Department of State, 2014). However, trafficking still remains prevalent in the Border States where a lot of tourism occurs and people can be smuggled in hastily.

Cape Cod, Massachusetts is at the border of the state that boasts high tourist seasons, and has had incidences of human trafficking reported. Initially, no solid actions were taken by the state of Massachusetts to target this crime because they had no legal framework to punish traffickers or protect victims (Polaris, 2014). It was not until 2011 when former Governor, Deval Patrick, signed a bill into law that would combat the trafficking of humans and provides services to victims. Unfortunately, most of these services are based out of the capital of Massachusetts, which is Boston, and not available to other locations where there are needs (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). Since the law is fairly new, it makes it difficult for people to understand and enforce the law

(Rucke, 2013), as well as, afford additional programs outside of Boston to service victims on Cape Cod. Given that human trafficking cases do not get arraigned in Cape Cod's district courts, and there are not enough programs to service victims, there is no real way to measure how much trafficking actually occurs. The lack of information impedes Massachusetts from providing adequate services to victims to the Cape Cod region. Therefore, the goal of this study is to explore the challenges with implementing the law and services to the fullest extent on Cape Cod.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this research was to uncover what the perceived barriers are to implementing existing task forces and victim services on Cape Cod, MA according to the opinions of law enforcement and social service representatives. Currently there are Massachusetts policies and programs targeting human trafficking, but there is very little research to know if the efforts made have been successful, need improvements, or need to be eliminated. In addition, these programs are only available within certain regions of the state, but human trafficking occurs everywhere.

This research was a qualitative case study. I interviewed law enforcement officials and representatives from local social service programs with regards to obstacles they believe hinder the creation of efficient, social service programs that aid victims of human trafficking. The information obtained from these interviews provided insight on what the street level bureaucrats feel needs to be done to stem the tide of this crime. The data collected and analyzed will impact social change because strategies can get

developed on how to diminish the trafficking that occurs by raising awareness, reducing the supply, rescuing victims, and punishing traffickers.

Research Question

The research question for this study was: What are the perceived barriers to implementing existing Massachusetts's policies and services targeting human trafficking on Cape Cod as experienced by social welfare providers and law enforcement officials? In order to answer this question, the following subquestions were explored:

1. What are the observations regarding the implementation of existing laws and procedures on Cape Cod?

2. Which populations are perceived as being targeted for human trafficking on Cape Cod?

3. What are the beliefs that drive human trafficking on Cape Cod?

Theoretical Framework

Many researchers have addressed human trafficking in attempts to control it. It is essential to decipher the phenomenon behind human trafficking and how it has become customary practice. Multiple theories are needed to explain the issue of human trafficking and its growth over the years. The theories used for this study were Kingdon's multiple streams theory, Marxist and demand theories, and victimology. These theories helped contribute to my study. Multiple streams theory aided in understanding the legislative process Massachusetts underwent when beginning its efforts to target human trafficking, from deliberation amongst elected officials to passing an anti trafficking law. Marxism and demand theory contributed by understanding the nature of

human trafficking, what fuels it, and drives business to the border state of Massachusetts. Victiology theory helped by understanding the relationship between the trafficker and the victims, why certain populations are more at risk than others, and what programs and services are needed to better prepare and protect these populations. A synopsis of each theory is provided in this section, and will be further explained in Chapter 2 in a more elaborate format.

Multiple Streams Theory

Multiple streams theory is a system that has been used worldwide to aid with the policy formation process. The three streams, problem stream, policy stream, and political stream, were noted by Kingdon in 1984, who analyzed the decision making process in public policy (Kingdon, 1984; Protopsaltis, 2011). These three streams work together to push a public policy issue from debate to decision to changing public policy.

I applied the multiple streams theory in order to understand the policy implementation process in the U.S. Slavery and human trafficking is an infringement of human rights. It was not until the Emancipation Proclamation of 1863 and the 13th amendment of 1865 that abolished slavery; 246 years after the first Africans were brought to the United States to work as slaves. Today, the issue of human trafficking is an ongoing topic on the government's agenda. Multiple streams theory will demonstrate how a proposal leads to change in public policy, and what compulsory steps need to be taken to expedite the process.

Marxist and Demand Theory

Marxism is a political and economic theory developed during the mid nineteenth century by longtime friends, Marx and Engels. Their mission together was to explore socioeconomic problems derived from human nature (Thomas, 2013). Marxism became a collection of Marx and Engel's ideas centering on the working class people and the capitalists that exploit them for their own personal gain (Thomas, 2013). The middle and upper classes succeed and progressed on the shoulders of the lower classes. Marx advocated that the working class should reap the fruits of their labor, but unable to due to the capitalist system that exists (Berlin, 2013).

Marxist theory assisted in comprehending the existence and growth of human trafficking. The theory focused on the conflict with classes and societies, and how this impacts social change (Smith, 2012). Traffickers generally target vulnerable populations and sell them, so they are forced to do labor or are sexually exploited.

The theory of demand was developed in 1871 by Walras, Menger, and Jevons (Moscati, 2007). Demand, one of the fundamental principles of economic theory, is when a consumer is willing to pay for what they desire at any given time (Riley, 2012). Demand theory illustrated the correlation between the demand for goods by the consumer, and the prices for those goods. If the goods are unavailable, the demand and price for the goods can increase. Market demand totaled what everyone in the market craves (Riley, 2012). For example, there is a huge demand for prostitutes at large sporting events such as the World Cup or the Super bowl (Roe-Sepowitz, Gallagher, & Hickle, 2014). Demand theory identified the need for prostitutes to satisfy the desires of

the consumers (Lutya & Lainer, 2012). Lutya and Lainer (2012) categorized this demand

for prostitutes into purchasers of sex, profiteers from selling sex and sociocultural

attitudes towards sex. The profiteers from selling the sex are the suppliers or the

traffickers, and the one who demands the sex is the purchaser (Danailova-Trainor &

Belser, 2006).

Victimology Theory

Victimology is the study of when an individual is subjected to a crime, mistreated,

or exploited by their offender. It also explored how victims were treated by the world

after a crime has been committed against them, as well as, the psychological effects that

they endure (Sebba & Berenblum, 2014). The origin of the term victimology and the

notion to study it came from Mendelsohn.

Mendelsohn, also known as the father of victimology, introduced the term

victimology in his 1956 article, but first coined the term in 1947. Mendelsohn examined

the relationship between offenders and victims, and came to the conclusion that some

victims were involved in their offense (Mendelsohn, 1956). Others contributed to the

birth of the term victimology such as von Hentig and Ellenberger (Dussich, 2006;

O'Connell, 2008). They too felt that certain victims played a role in their own

victimization. Later on in 1968, Schafer would publish the first textbook of victimology

(Dussich, 2006).

Mendelsohn suggested that institutes be created that were dedicated to

victimology. The purpose of these institutes was to better investigate why certain

populations are subject to victimization, advance the study of victimology, and improve

overall practices on a global level (Wilson, 2009). From there, governments across the world embarked on new initiatives to better serve victims with recovery services and prevent more individuals from becoming victims. Trafficking victims are constantly victimized and exploited by their traffickers. Understanding the populations that are targeted and why they are being targeted, can aid in the reduction of people being forced into slavery, as well as, implementing quality programs that can better serve trafficked victims.

Nature of Study

Qualitative methodology was used for this study in order to achieve in-depth information that is rich and detailed. Qualitative methods do not test hypotheses like quantitative methods do, but rather explain certain aspects of the social world (Tavallaei & Talib, 2010). I investigated what administrators, the police, and social service representatives observe to be the hurdles in applying current Massachusetts' policies on Cape Cod that target human trafficking. Through qualitative research, new theories and ideas can be uncovered on how to implement new processes that target human trafficking (Khurana & Rosenthal, 2003) based on the information the participants provide.

The design used was a case study because it aided in drawing conclusions regarding a natural phenomenon from the data obtained from the lives of real people (Yin, 2003). Email interviews were performed with key people who were engrossed in trafficking cases such as social service representatives and law enforcement officials. The data received was then examined and interpreted using NVivo software. The data analysis exposed themes. Conducting interviews with social service providers and law

enforcement officials on Cape Cod permitted the opportunity to obtain the empirical knowledge of those that encounter human trafficking. Their feelings about human trafficking occurring on Cape Cod were explored, what they sense is being done in response to it, and what they believe needs to be done to successfully tackle the crime.

Definition of Terms

Coercion: Threats of serious harm or restraint; intimidation and humiliation; creating a climate of fear; enforcement of trivial demands; occasional indulgences; intense manipulation; emotional abuse; isolation; creating dependency and fear of independence (Polaris, 2014).

Exploitation: It is when someone benefits from the work of others through an unjust manner (Weeks, 2011).

Human trafficking: The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2014).

Involuntary servitude: Is when someone is forced to work for someone else against their will (Pope, 2010).

Johns: A client who pays to have sex with a prostitute (Merriam-Webster, 2014).

Organized crime: When groups of people engage in illegal behavior through a systematic fashion (Abadinsky, 2012).

Peddling ring: Selling of goods. Many children are subject to extreme abuse including willful mutilation to make them more easily pitied, and thus better potential earners. They may be disfigured by having an eye gouged out, a limb amputated, or being otherwise visibly scarred. Most children are bought or kidnapped, then forced to beg or pick pockets on the streets under threat of beatings and worse. Then their keeper takes all of their earnings (Fight Slavery Now, 2010).

Pimp: a person who controls prostitutes by taking a portion of their earnings when soliciting customers (Williamson & Cluse-Tolar, 2002).

Sex trafficking: When people are forced to have sex against their will for profit (Polaris, 2014).

Smuggling: It is when goods or people are transported illegally across international borders (Kyle & Koslowski, 2011).

Trafficker: Someone who is engaged in illegal trade (Brown, 2011)

Assumptions, Limitations, Scope and Delimitations

Assumptions

Assumptions are certain things about the research that are understood to be true and somewhat out of my control (Simon & Goes, 2013). The assumptions I researched about this topic that provided a guide for this study included, human trafficking continues to spread due to the demand and high profit margin (Fuchs, 2012). It is a secret, organized crime that makes it difficult to achieve accurate data (Fedina, 2014).

Vulnerable populations such as women, people who grew up in poverty, uneducated people, and people who lived through wars, at times can become victims of human trafficking (Macy & Graham, 2012).

Thousands of people are trafficked into the United States annually. Without accurate data, it becomes difficult for the federal government to create and implement laws geared towards the eradication of human trafficking on its territory (UNODC, 2014). Lastly, local governments, law enforcement, and prosecutors are finding it difficult to put traffickers in jail due to lack of understanding of the law and how to rule on a case with no previous cases to compare (Schauer & Wheaton, 2006).

Limitations

Limitations are what the researcher has no control over (Brutus, Aguinis, & Wassmer, 2013). Law enforcement and social service providers can only divulge certain amount of information in order to protect the privacy of victims and ongoing cases. Another limitation in this study was to get people of such high caliber to take the time to complete an interview in a timely manner. These are people who work countless hours to serve and protect all populations. Conducting my own research may interfere with their police work. Potential ways to address these matters is to have the interviews over the phone or done through email. These approaches allow the research to get done in a timely manner. Things I have no control over are the responses participants will provide to my interview questions. Since people want to impact the study and contribute to this cause, they may tell me what I want to hear. To eliminate any bias over the responses given from the interviews, I read each answer objectively with no preconceived notions

to uncover their real life experiences and opinions regarding human trafficking on Cape Cod.

Scope and Delimitations

Delimitations are what I can control determined by how I set the boundaries (Bloomberg & Volpe, 2012). The scope of the study explained what subject matter is being analyzed and sets the parameters (Simon, 2011). Because this study will be performed in Cape Cod County, participants are limited to this region. The population I interviewed was a small sample because no trafficking cases are prosecuted out of this region, and there are no recovery centers for human trafficking victims. The scope of this study investigated what social service workers and police officers believe to be the barriers to implementing existing Massachusetts' services and policies on Cape Cod. Victims were not interviewed to avoid reliving their circumstances and portraying their traumatic experiences since this is not a narrative study. Documents and policies were researched because this will be a case study. Since qualitative methodologies usually deal with small sample populations (Creswell, 2013), I was able to obtain different perspectives regarding this phenomenon and gather enough data to provide necessary results for my research question.

Significance of the Study

Government officials and key decision makers created policies and programs in Massachusetts to combat human trafficking after recognizing it was a problem. However, such policies have not been implemented on the southeast region of Cape Cod, with no apparent explanation. Researching this particular topic will raise awareness

regarding the rise of human trafficking, highlight what is lacking, scrutinize current policies, and evaluate the need for more social services to cater to victims on the Cape Cod region. The implications for social change are making those that are oblivious to this crime, more aware of how vast this epidemic has grown, who is at risk, and what improvements need to be made in addition to current Massachusetts' tactics. This awareness compels people to get involved, and motivates them to contact their local officials to take actions against this crime.

Summary

Human trafficking is a worldwide problem swiftly spreading, with no indication of slowing down. There is a demand for trafficking in persons because of the high profit margin and low risk. Thus, millions of lives are captured annually. There have been many endeavors made to combat this organized crime, but not enough to control it. Attempts were recently made in the state of Massachusetts to address human trafficking, but not on Cape Cod, leaving some populations susceptible to infiltration. The Cape Cod region of Massachusetts is an easy target for victims to be smuggled in because it lies on the border of Massachusetts and terrible tragedies are happening to them.

The purpose of this study was to discover what is preventing certain services from being employed in the area. Multiple streams theory, Marxist and demand theory, and victimology theory served as the theoretical framework for this research. A qualitative, case study was used and data was collected through the use of email interviews, in order to attain keen insights into the secret world of trafficking. The useful data collected and

interpreted brought to light hidden information regarding this covert operation that will be useful in slowing it down.

Chapter 2: Literature Review

Introduction

Human trafficking is a crime plaguing millions of lives every day. People are at risk because they can be kidnapped, drugged, and forced into sexual slavery (McNulty, 2014). It is a transnational crime, fueled by globalization, with low risk and high profit margin (Polaris, 2014). It is growing at a rapid pace with no signs of decelerating, and governments across the world can barely keep up with this covert operation (Kara, 2011). For this research study, I reviewed literature relevant to the phenomenon of human trafficking.

The literature review illustrated that slavery was made legal centuries ago for individuals to perform certain labor services for their masters, and then aggressively progressed into sexual slavery (Whyte, 2013). Over the years, many governments and organizations have gotten involved in working towards the eradication of human trafficking. They are continuously strategizing on how to abolish it once and for all, in order for people to take back ownership of their lives (Rafferty, 2013). Their efforts included defining human trafficking in order to develop laws that provide stern punishments to match the severity of the crime (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2014). In addition, services were created for victims to recover from their horrific experiences. The TVPA was the most significant action the United States took to combat trafficking (United States Department of State, 2013a).

Although the United States has made sufficient efforts in fighting this crime, they are still behind in making recovery services available across the entire nation and

executing the laws that will imprison sex traffickers (Gallagher, 2011). Massachusetts does not have social service programs accessible to all areas where trafficking rings occur, especially in the southeast. Therefore, the purpose of this qualitative case study was to investigate what is preventing the Cape Cod region of Massachusetts from enforcing existing policies and recovery programs. Chapter 2 is comprised of the databases and search engines used, the key search terms, literature search strategy, theoretical foundation, and strategies to annihilate trafficking.

Literature Search Strategy

The databases used to research information about human trafficking were SAGE Publications, Sage Premiere, ProQuest, Google scholar, Criminal Justice Review, EBSCO*host*, MEDLINE, PubMed, and WebMD. The data search limiters I used ensured that the articles where peer-reviewed, scholarly journals, published from the year 2010 through 2016. Keyword search combinations used were human trafficking, forced labor, sex trafficking, child trafficking, sexual exploitation, prostitution, human trafficking initiatives, counseling, demand theory, Marxist theory, victimology, Kingdon's theory, statistics on human trafficking, social services, counseling, and victims of human trafficking. Data search limiters included scholarly, peer-reviewed journals, beginning with a 2010 publication date. The main themes of the literature review and how this section will be organized are as followed: Theoretical foundation with subsections multiple streams theory, Marxism and demand theory, victimology; human trafficking with subsections definition of human trafficking, studies performed on human trafficking by researchers, statistics on human trafficking, the nature of human trafficking; profile of

victims and traffickers; policy implementation process in the United States with subsections policies and initiatives to combat human trafficking in the United States, the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act; Senior Policy Operating Group; Massachusetts' policies on human trafficking; services needed for victims of human trafficking; media influence on human trafficking.

Theoretical Foundation

This section is structured into the subsequent subsections: Multiple streams theory, Marxism and demand theory, and victimology.

Multiple Streams Theory

Kingdon is an American politics specialist that developed three streams for the formation of policy. These three streams encompassed the problem, the policy, and the politics in order for policy makers within the government, to think beyond the traditional way of policy-making, and when urgent situations arise, they can become a priority on their agenda (Kingdon, 1984). Kingdon (1984) argued that political attention needed to be paid to problems that arise so that we can create policy and implement them. Ackrill, Kay, and Zahariadis have studied and applied the multiple streams framework to other democracies. Ackrill and Kay (2011) affirmed that multiple streams was being applied in many jurisdictions, such as the European Union policy, because of its capability to move the policy process forward. Zahariadis (2003) added that policies are made when ambiguity is present, demonstrating that policymakers can adopt multiple ways to think about an issue and manipulate the policy making process. He also argued

that certain policies are time sensitive and policy makers must act immediately (Zahariadis, 2007).

Kingdon has defined each stream to further explain this theory. He stated that problems are concerns that people want to address such as disasters, tragic events, or media attention to pertinent issues (Kingdon, 1984). The proposed policies are developed by experts in the field, political parties, or groups that share a common interest (Kingdon, 1984). The policy stream occurred when legislators, officials, academics, bureaucrats, and researchers produce policies, while appointed officials and political parties work to have their proposals become law (Kingdon, 1984). An example of Kingdon's theory was the result of the bombings of the Alfred P. Murrah Federal Building in Oklahoma and the World Trade Center in New York. Kingdon's theory was able to analyze the federal court's habeas corpus review of state murder convictions, capital sentences, and the Antiterrorism and Effective Death Penalty Act (Federman, 2010).

The bombing of the World Trade Center that took place in 1993, and the bombing of the Alfred P. Murrah Federal Building in 1995, put the reform of habeas corpus on the federal agenda, as well as, have the reform enacted into law (Federman, 2010). The purpose of habeas corpus was to validate if a person's arrest or imprisonment was legal (Duker, 1980). Eight days after the bombing, the Antiterrorism and Effective Death Penalty Act (AEDPA) was constructed and passed a year later (Beall, 1998; Department of Homeland Security, 2014). The AEDPA was a practical demonstration of multiple streams theory because one stipulation of the AEDPA was that it limited the power a federal judge can grant relief (Orye, III, 2002). In addition, the review of the 20-year

habeas corpus was a problem in itself, outlined by Kingdon's1984 theory, and the multiple streams process was able to address the need to review and overturn habeas corpus. The act created new constitutional law and had the ability to modify previous habeas corpus cases (Beall, 1998). Constitutional law is the interpretation and implementation of the United States constitution among different entities within a state (Schwartz, 2013). As a result of AEDPA, the person responsible for the bombing in Oklahoma was sentenced to death. Tragedies or unforeseen events can compel decision makers to act immediately then they previously would have on a similar matter.

The issue of human trafficking has gained attention over the years due to people becoming much more aware of the crime through various media outlets such as national movies and criminal television shows. Moreover, the value attributed to this hidden market that generates millions of dollars, has led people to want to learn more about this crime (Polaris, 2014). Human trafficking is the problem stream, proposals such as harsher laws and social service programs for victims to recover are the policy stream, and the need to create and enact the TVPA is the political stream. The United States recognized something needed to be done to try and suppress the problem of human trafficking.

The purpose of multiple streams theory was to accelerate the policy making process. Originally, Massachusetts had no agendas or policies in place to combat human trafficking until it grew to be a problem. This growing crime that violates the rights of the citizens of Massachusetts became the problem stream. The policy stream began shifting when former Attorney General Coakley and other policy decision makers

recognized something needed to be done, and proposed a bill that would make human trafficking a crime in Massachusetts (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). The political stream was the passing of House Bill 3808, An Act Relative to the Commercial Exploitation of People. Six years prior to Coakley's initiative, Senator Mark Montigny filed a bill that would target human trafficking and protect victims (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). Over the years, he continued fighting for this bill as he gained support from Attorney General Coakley when she was elected in 2006 (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). Due to their efforts, cases of human trafficking are now investigated, johns are arrested, and recovery services have been created specifically for victims of human trafficking.

Although Massachusetts has new policies set in place to end human trafficking, benefits derived from these policies are not implemented in the region of Cape Cod. No social services were created to cater to victims and cases are only prosecuted out of Boston. Multiple streams theory was applied to this topic to prove that when a critical problem arises in Massachusetts, legislators will expedite the policy making process to provide solutions. However, more information is needed on why these services are not made available on Cape Cod. According to Borrás and Radaelli (2011), researchers are able to outline the policy process using multiple streams, which makes for a more precise analysis.

Marxist Theory

Through the lenses of Marxism and demand theory, both economic theories will be used to explore what stimulates trafficking and how this industry continues to thrive.

These theories combined may explain how profiteers of prostitution exploit the

vulnerable and less fortunate to supply a market willing to pay for sexual servitudes

(Lutya & Lanier, 2012). During the mid-19ᵗʰ century, Karl Marx, a former philosopher,

along with Friedrich Engels, developed a theory that encompassed economics, society,

and politics, and called it Marxist theory (Marx, 1977). Marx believed that humans, who

once worked together in unity, were now motivated by material goods and owning their

own property. He believed this eventually created a division of labor and separation of

classes based on power and wealth (Tarrit, 2006).

In *Capital*, a critique of Marx' original book *Capital, Vol. 1* (1867), it was argued

that societies progress when there are struggles among classes. It also stated that

capitalists exploited laborers in order to gain huge profits (Marx, 1977). Capitalists had

the means and the skills to set up productions, but no money could be made without

production from labor. Laborers were underpaid for the value of work they created.

This depicted the struggle between classes according to Marx (1977). Burawoy and

Wright (2003) endorsed Marxism asserting that it is a weapon that can be used to attack

the notions of capitalism and give strength back to the working class. Marx believed so

much in what was owed to the working class that he participated in the labor movement

that would create the International Workingmen's Association (Smith, 2012). He

yearned for equality between everyone, regardless of his or her status. Everyone should

be paid based on the quality and time they put into their work (Callinicos, 2012).

Seventy years prior to Marx' arguments, in his book *Agrarian Justice (1797)*, Thomas

Paine insisted on the equality among men. Like Marx, Paine believed those that cultivate

the lands deserve the same benefits as the owners (Paine, 1797). Unfortunately, capitalism negates that and pushes for the exchange of lesser value for greater value in order to produce a profit (Bradley, Jr. & Donway, 2010). It ends up being the owner of a company who reaps those profits, not the laborer who invested their time and effort. Marx contended that capitalism created a never-ending cycle for the working class because in order to survive, they have no choice but to sacrifice their surplus to the capitalist (McGowan, 2013). The exploitation of these workers would eventually lead to a two-class society comprised of wealthy capitalists and underprivileged workers (Fuchs, 2012).

In today's society, Marxist theory continues to exist. Capitalists, who own most of society's wealth, Marx's bourgeoisie, still exploit their workers and command them to perform services for less than what they deserve or for nothing at all, through the transnational crime of human trafficking. The working class is susceptible to sex trafficking because traffickers are able to build this oppressive relationship with their victims and control them because they need to gain capital (Polaris, 2014).

Capitalists or traffickers oppress the working class in order to maximize profits, which builds the platform for degradation among victims. Williams and Satgar (2014) argued that Marxism could be applied in the 21st century by promoting a capitalist-free society with the use of democracy and modern approaches to politics, launched by regular people. In the instance of human trafficking, victims have had their powers stolen from them because they were under tyranny for such a long time, and forced to do unthinkable acts against their will (Oram, Stöckl, Busza, Howard, & Zimmerman, 2012).

To combat human trafficking today, people are able to work together for the common good without getting wealth involved. Policies such as the TVPA of 2000 have now been enforced, and many activists have launched organizations to raise awareness about human trafficking and how to prevent it.

Cape Cod, Massachusetts is a vacation spot for most tourists, as well as, a playground for traffickers to smuggle victims. Cape Cod is also known for its high cost of living, but consists of poor communities too (Vaccaro, 2014). A study conducted by the Cape Cod Young Professionals advocacy and networking group showed that the reason for young professionals leaving Cape Cod is due to the high cost of living not supported by low pay, lack of jobs, and lack of higher education (Vaccaro, 2014). In one Cape Cod county, Hyannis, roughly 500 homeless people ended up in shelters, while others sought refuge in motels or tents (Wireless Communication Association International, 2014). In Yarmouth county, over 250 children were living in foster care, and some of them ended up on the streets when they aged out of the system because they had nowhere to go (Wireless Communication Association International, 2014). These poor communities yielded vulnerable populations, making exploiting residents effortless. Marxist theory applies to human trafficking on Cape Cod because the vulnerable populations that arise from these poor communities, feed the demand for trafficking driven by the bourgeois that come to vacation during tourists' season. The theory helps to explain how low-income families continue to struggle, remain powerless, and fall victim at the hands of their oppressors, which contributes to the growth of human trafficking on Cape Cod.

Demand Theory

The theory of demand will illustrate the demand for human trafficking and why this business continues to augment. The labor recruitment of immigrants garners competitive production, making human trafficking a very profitable business for certain sectors of the first world economies (Bruckert & Parent, 2002). In the United States there has been a rebirth of sweatshop conditions in the garment, food, commercial construction, tourism, and transportation industries (Bruckert & Parent, 2002). Immigrants without papers were the most vulnerable for being recruited for these services, and then the profits would get shared among the recruiters (Bruckert & Parent, 2002).

The demand for prostitutes contributed to young women being trafficked and forced into prostitution. This incessant need for victims causes traffickers to harbor and transfer victims across states and countries (Lutya & Lainer, 2012). The huge profit gain traffickers will receive causes them to keep control of their victims by any means necessary, which includes scaring and forcing them to stay (Jakobi, 2012). There is a demand for quality goods at an affordable price, which human trafficking can provide and continues to drive businesses today.

During the 1800s, Walras, Menger, and Jevons contributed to the development of demand theory in order to understand consumer behavior (Moscati, 2007). They are considered the founders of the *marginal revolution* because they believed the price of a good or service is related to its marginal utility (Moscati, 2007). Because sexual services or domestic labor satisfy what the consumer craves, the consumer is willing to pay for the

unit of good or trafficked victim because the sexual services or domestic labor satisfies the consumer (Wheaton, Schauer, & Galli, 2010).

Economic theory can explain why lawbreakers continue to commit crimes. They perceive the rewards they will receive surpass any legal crimes they are charged with (Lutya & Lanier, 2012). Another aspect of this theory is that criminals justify the crimes they commit because they believe the benefits obtained from committing the crime far exceed the punishment they will receive (Lutya & Lanier, 2012). Thus, the costs of the prosecution and punishment rendered, determines the degree of the crime. Trafficking will occur even more if the punishment is less (Lutya & Lanier, 2012).

Human trafficking is a very competitive industry with many buyers and sellers. This particular market permits traffickers to act as intermediaries and provide employers with trafficked labor (Bales, 2005). Most buyers demand human trafficking victims because they have been exploited in the past and are used to deplorable working conditions around the clock (Bales, 2005). The price of a victim is based upon availability, their characteristics, the amount of similar products available, and the negotiating skills of the buyer or trafficker (Kara, 2011). The profits made are, selling a slave at market price and deducting the cost to clothe, feed, and transport the slave to its buyer.

Human beings are being bought in the same manner that property is purchased. These victims are owned and controlled in every aspect of their lives, and receive no money for being enslaved because the traffickers relish off of the money they obtain from selling people (Wheaton, Schauer, & Galli, 2010). Capitalism allows for human beings

to become more infatuated with wealth and power at the cost of another human being's basic rights. As long as victims still exist, human trafficking will remain a lucrative business that no profiteer will want to leave, continuing the vicious cycle of victimization.

Victimology

Victimology is a branch of criminology that involves the scientific study of victims and crimes. It also included human rights violations (Karmen, 2012). Furthermore, it examines the relationship between the victim and the offender that caused the victimization (Karmen, 2012). There were many founders and innovators of victimology including von Hentig, Ellenberger, and Schafer (O'Connell, 2008). However, one who is eminent is Mendelsohn.

Mendelsohn was a former defense attorney who became interested in studying victims. He interviewed them and learned that most of his victims had pre-existing relationships with their offenders. His research led him to believe that offenders were not the only ones to blame in the act of victimization, but that the victim played a part in it as well (Wilson, 2009). Hentig (1948) and Ellenberger also agreed with this notion based on their study of criminology. They, along with Mendelsohn, created their own taxonomies for victims in which victims possessed certain characteristics that may have contributed to their victimization (McEvoy & McConnachie, 2012). Mendelsohn arranged a way to classify victims into 6 different types. These classifications are, completely innocent victim, which is no provocation or facilitating behavior; victim with minor guilt, which is when the victim places him or herself in a compromising situation;

victim as guilty as offender, which is when the victim engages in vice crimes and was hurt; victim is guiltier than the offender which is when the victim provokes the causal act; most guilty victim is when the person initially was the offender, but then became hurt; and lastly the imaginary victim (Doerner & Lab, 2012, p 9). These classifications are used to determine just how much the victim is responsible for their own victimization (Doerner & Lab, 2012). Over the years, Mendelsohn would use the term general victimology to include victimizations beyond anyone's control (Wilson, 2009).

Part of the reason why victims are continuously exploited is due to the lack of understanding and false notions of victims who were forced into prostitution (Lutya & Lanier, 2012). At times, victims are viewed as prostitutes who voluntarily entered into this kind of work. In addition to fearing their capturers (Rieger, 2012), victims also fear of how society will view them, and therefore, are less likely to report any act of violence towards them. These circumstances made it difficult for researchers to obtain correct statistics, which led to reporting inaccurate data (Tyldum, 2010). It is especially difficult when it is viewed as normal to abuse women in certain regions of the world to adhere to traditional customs, thus, no one reports the crime of forced prostitution (Walklate, 2014). Vulnerable populations are usually targets of victimization (Todres, 2011), and these vulnerable populations include women. Underdeveloped countries are places where victims are most likely to get exploited since their anti trafficking laws are in-direct correlation with the economic status of the country (Tobolowsky, Gaboury, Jackson, & Blackburn, 2010). Whereas, wealthier countries are where victims are smuggled in (Tobolowsky et al., 2010). Violence against women has occurred for many

years, which has led them to be primary targets of victimization and human trafficking

(Walklate, 2014).

Victims are continuously used over and over again until the traffickers no longer

want them due to older age and over-abuse (Macy & Graham, 2012). Unfortunately, due

to the long-suffering victims endure, the victims may have a tendency to victimize other

individuals because that is all they know (Lanier & Henry, 2010). This is a way of

enforcing the power that was stolen from them. According to the 2009 National Crime

Victimization Survey, United States residents experienced roughly 20 million

victimizations, and 4.3 million were violent crimes (Truman, 2011). These violent

crimes consist of rape, assault, and robbery. These victims included children from 12 and

older, women, and men (Truman, 2011). The National Crime Survey (NCVS) collects

data annually by the United States' Census Bureau of Justice Statistics. Since many

victims in the world have their rights violated, the United Nations' General Assembly

implemented the Declaration on the Basic Principles of Justice for Victims of Crime and

Abuse of Power (Braithwaite, 2011). In addition to the protection of victims' rights, the

World Society of Victimology and the International Victimology Institute Tilburg,

developed the United Nations Convention for Victims of Crime and Abuse of Power

(United Nations, 2010).

During the 1970s when the crime victims' movement ignited, victimologist who

previously wrote that victims contributed to their own victimization, now stated that

victims had little to do with it (Burgess, Regehr, & Roberts, 2010; Garkawe, 2004; &

Tobolowsky et al., 2010). The movement changed people's way of thinking from the

social, economic, and political side (Burgess et al., 2010). It allowed legislation to

supply funding for victims' assistance programs, shelters, and sexual abuse treatment

programs across the entire nation. It also led to the creation of the Victims of Crime Act

(VOCA) (Burgess et al., 2010). Thousands of victim assistance programs were created

nationwide as a result of this act. It was during the 1990s that the government adopted

legislation that would protect victim's rights. The 21st century was committed to helping

victims by acknowledging the services they need to no longer be victims (Greene &

Beinhart, 2013). Nationwide there are currently victims' rights, programs catering to

victims, ongoing research on victimization, as well as, additional resources to fund future

endeavors to aid victims.

   Since its conception, the study of victimology has grown and it will continue to

evolve, and new discoveries of victimizations will be brought to light. New knowledge

will arise in order to comprehend the complexities of why certain people are victimized

over others (Dussich, 2006). Although the goal is to reduce the amount of victimizations

that occurs, governments all around the world will continue to provide services for

victims by improving or creating new policies.

   The study of victimology illustrated how vulnerable populations, such as those

located in the poorer communities of Cape Cod, are easily targeted and forced into

human trafficking. However, the crime victims' movement that ignited provided the

groundwork for future initiatives to be implemented to protect victims' rights (Burgess et

al., 2010). Although funding was made available for local governments to create services

to help victims recover, services are still not available on Cape Cod for unknown reasons.

With the installment of the Victims of Crime Act, going forward every victim has the opportunity to feel protected (McCart, Smith, & Sawyer, 2010). Unfortunately, that is not always the case in regions like Cape Cod where poor communities are fighting to survive.

<div align="center">**Human Trafficking**</div>

Definition of Human Trafficking

Human trafficking has existed for many centuries since the beginning of slavery. Human trafficking has been coined as modern day slavery (Ball & Pennington, 2011). During the 18th and 19th centuries, slavery was practiced in British North America (Stephen, 1830). It was in 1619 when the first blacks were shipped from Africa to America and sold into slavery (Lovejoy, 2012). Following the buying and selling of Africans was the white slave trade where female, English factory workers were sexually enslaved. According to Whyte (2013), white slavery shaped the future of human trafficking today. Today, across the world, millions of children are kidnapped, raped, beaten, and then sexualized (O'Connell Davidson, 2011).

Although there has been great debate on what should be included when defining human trafficking, the Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act (Trafficking and Violence Protection Act, 2000) defines human trafficking as the recruitment, harboring, transportation of an individual for labor services or the act of commercial sex through the use of force, fraud, and coercion (United States Department of State, 2010). The United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, article 3, paragraph (a) has a very similar definition, but also includes, the receipt of

persons by means of abduction or abuse of power through receiving or giving payments

in order to have control over another person and exploit them (United Nations on Drugs

and Crime, 2014). The purpose for the UNODC providing its own definition is so that

there is a universal definition of trafficking in persons, and domestic legislation can adapt

their own versions. The UNODC (2014) has also gone further to outline the elements of

human trafficking, which are the act, the means, and the purpose. The act involves how

the victims are transported; the means is how victims are forced; the purpose is why it is

done (United Nations on Drugs and Crime, 2014).

The United Nations plays an integral role in targeting human trafficking since

they have taking initiatives to assist other countries with strategizing, writing laws,

building partnerships, and providing additional resources to states when needed (United

Nations on Drugs and Crime, 2014). It was during the United Nations' Fourth World

Conference held in Bejing, China, when the issue of women being trafficked was

officially addressed and recognized as an act of violence against women (The United

Nations Entity for Gender Equality, 2011). It was from there that global efforts were

launched to start combating trafficking such as international conventions discussing what

intensifies trafficking, creating effective law enforcement teams, and establishing

rehabilitative programs (The United Nations Entity for Gender Equality, 2011). This is

all part of the United Nation's Palermo Protocols for all countries to follow in an effort to

respond to this organized crime.

There are various aspects of human trafficking. There were recent studies that

showed that most of the human trafficking that occurs in this world is comprised of

forced labor; this includes forced child labor (United States Department of State, 2010).

Martin and Callaway (2011) argued that rebel groups may also use children as

combatants. Sex trafficking makes up a smaller portion and also includes children.

However, Farr (2005) stated that sex trafficking is increasing with over 1 million

trafficked into the sex industry, with these victims getting younger in age. Forced labor

is when employers exploit their workers because they are in desperate need of work, or

need to pay off a debt (United Nations Gift, 2014). Through sex trafficking, people are

forced or coerced to engage in prostitution rings.

Studies Performed on Human Trafficking by Researchers

Human trafficking has occurred for many years. Thus, a plethora of studies have

been performed on this topic ranging from, understanding the motivation behind this

crime that caused it to spread so fast, to how to protect victims. A report submitted to the

United States Department of Justice in 2008, revealed that the gaps in literature regarding

human trafficking include, the degree of human trafficking that exists, the attributes of

each victim, the traffickers and their networks, and the effectiveness of government

related policies and protocols to target human trafficking (Goździak & Bump, 2008).

There was a qualitative study performed, where victims of human trafficking were

interviewed. The Institute on Domestic Violence and Sexual Assault Center conducted

the study for Social Work Research from the University of Texas at Austin. Findings

from the 2009 study, showed that victims require services for their long-term needs

because they face challenges such as, social interaction with others and economic

stability (Busch-Armendariz, Nsonwu, Heffron, Hernandez, & Garza, 2008).

Reichel and Winterdyk (2010) explored the practices employed by the U.S. and Canada when targeting human trafficking. They found that gaps in literature were, the lack of sufficient data, the inconsistency with defining human trafficking, identifying the characteristics of victims which could aid in avoiding victimization, and whether current efforts and approaches to human trafficking are measurable to determine if they are adequate. In another qualitative study, Troshynski and Blank (2008), interviewed human traffickers. They explored why traffickers engage in human trafficking, even though it is illegal, and their opinions concerning the business and the victims. Troshynski and Blank showed that it was difficult to interview traffickers. They have no empathy, and continue to support this business due to the large profit gap, and low risk of getting caught (Troshynski & Blank, 2008).

The gaps in research identified throughout the studies mentioned, correlate with what I want to uncover through my research. My research was to identify the barriers to implementing programs and policies targeting human trafficking on Cape Cod, according to the viewpoint of social service workers and law enforcement. In regards to human trafficking on Cape Cod, there is a lack of data, so the magnitude of the crime is unknown. In addition, there are no programs or government policies implemented on Cape Cod, thus, no way to measure any effectiveness. One study showed that traffickers are money motivated. Therefore, Massachusetts needs to have tools in place to punish traffickers that match the severity of their crimes. My research question was imperative to Massachusetts recognizing the challenges they face, so they can find ways to overcome those obstacles and truly exhaust all their efforts.

Statistics on Human Trafficking

Researchers have explored organized crime, but there still is not enough information or accurate statistics to describe the reality or severity of this crime. The current estimates on human trafficking victims are very limited. Due to the sophistication of how traffickers can open and close trafficking rings, many cases go undetected (Polaris, 2014). Trafficking is a very complex crime, which makes it very difficult to precisely estimate the extent of this underground activity (Giang University, 2009). My approach with focusing on the implementation process of policies and programs, should shed some light on how vast the issue of human trafficking is on Cape Cod.

Since the intervention of the Bush Administration in 2000, there was a 71% decrease in the human trafficking estimates from 50,000 in 2000 to 14,500 in 2004 (Weitzer, 2012). Although this is an improvement, there are still 800,000 to 900,000 annually victims that are trafficked across national borders, with 14,500 to 17,500 of them trafficked into the United States according to the United States Department of State (2010). It is estimated that 96% of those victims were women, and at least half were both male and female children (Schauer & Wheaton, 2006). The United States is ranked as the second largest market for women to be trafficked and sexually exploited (Schauer & Wheaton, 2006). In the 2013 fiscal year, the Department of Homeland Security's Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) program and Homeland Security Investigations (HIS), reported that 1,025 investigations were opened that could pertain to human trafficking, which was an increase from 2012 (United States Department of State, 2014a).

Different reports are often generated on the amount of person(s) that are

trafficked each year. These facts are mostly based on victims who were identified

(Goździak & Collet, 2005). Most is due to the death of victims and lack of witnesses to

testify. Furthermore, these are secret underground organizations, where trafficking rings

can open as fast as they close (Wheaton, Schauer, & Galli, 2010).

These trafficking rings target vulnerable populations that are unaware that this

crime exists, or get lured under false pretenses (Todres, 2011). Due to the difficulty to

retrieve accurate estimates on the trends of trafficking and how many people are actually

trafficked every year, it becomes nearly impossible to develop methods that target human

trafficking and create victim recovery services (Goździak & Collet, 2005). Even with

awareness raised concerning human trafficking, there is still little research being

conducted. A majority of the research that has been performed has been on women and

children, not enough on men and boys. Thus, not a sufficient amount of literature exists

regarding this problem.

The Nature of Human Trafficking

Human trafficking has become a billion-dollar industry. This crime competes

with drug trafficking and the illegal arms/guns trade, and still continues to grow

(Goździak & Bump, 2008). The International Labor Organization conducted a study that

estimated the profits garnered from human trafficking could exceed $31 billion dollars

(Rahman, 2011). Contributing factors as to why this crime continues to exist includes

poverty and lack of awareness (Hall, 2013). Human trafficking affords the opportunity

for criminals to make billions of dollars in profits due to the low-risk nature of this

organized crime, by capitalizing on the demand for people and the unlimited supply

(Goździak & Bump, 2008). Reasons behind the rise in human trafficking over the years

are globalization, free markets, and lack of awareness, natural disasters, poverty,

corruption, and gender discrimination (Shelley, 2003). This has created desperate

situations where people exploit vulnerable populations just to survive. There is also a

huge demand for human trafficking because of the huge gain and very little investment.

There is a huge demand for prostitutes at Super bowl games because sporting

events of this magnitude can yield crowds in millions, thus, traffickers see the Super bowl

as a lucrative opportunity. They know they can utilize the massive crowds to their

advantage, and increase their profits in one day by simply advertising sexual services

prior and during the Super bowl (Roe-Sepowitz, Gallagher, & Hickle, 2014). At times,

adverts are not even needed, and generally men are just looking for sexual favors, which

increase the demand for prostitutes during these events (Miller, 2012). The National

Center for Missing and Exploited Children estimated that 10,000 prostitutes were brought

to the 2010 Miami Super Bowl, and during the 2011 Super Bowl in Dallas, 133 underage

arrests were made for prostitution. During the 2014 Superbowl, hosted in New Jersey,

the FBI partnered with local law enforcement to not only raise awareness about human

trafficking, but to also complete their undercover child sex trafficking operation where

they were able to rescue 16 juveniles and arrest more than 45 pimps (Singer, 2014). Some

of the pimps and their associates claimed to have traveled to New Jersey strictly to

prostitute women and children (Singer, 2014). Although law enforcement was able to be

proactive in targeting human trafficking, these services are not available everywhere to effectively reduce this crime.

Profile of Victims and Traffickers

Vulnerable populations have been more susceptible to human trafficking. This vulnerability includes poverty. Poverty is one huge factor as to why certain populations fall victim to human trafficking, especially among immigrants (Logan, Walker, & Hunt, 2009). Poverty allows for some people to be born into slavery. There was a case in the state of Ohio where parents sold their kids, who were as young as 6, for sex in exchange for cash and drugs according to the Columbus Dispatch (Johnson, 2014). Since some families live in severe economic situations, they feel compelled to sell a member of their family into slavery to make ends meet and afford a better opportunity for the entire family. Traffickers have the ability to submit fraudulent contracts guaranteeing certain regards and compensation (Polaris, 2014). This ruse permits traffickers to continue with their crimes, causing families to lose everything, including the dignity of the ones they sold.

Methods to lure victims include offering false employment, forced drug addiction, and promises of a better life (Polaris, 2014). Other ways to obtain victims are through kidnapping, coercion, and physical force. Those that run away from home are more susceptible to trafficking according to a 2007 CBS report (Logan, Walker, & Hunt, 2009). McNulty (2014) argued that runaway children are part of an extremely vulnerable population, where they can be lured into human trafficking. In an article written by Vines (2012), Dr. Lee who is the founder of the rescue organization, Children of the

Night, said children who are trafficked have come from crack houses, drug addicted parents, or parents in prison. These children figured life on the streets was much better than the life they were living at home (Vines, 2012). Lack of awareness, poverty, and vulnerability are what causes people to become victims of human trafficking. According to interviews conducted by Logan, Walker, and Hunt (2009) on victims who were forced into the industry, victims were promised a better life and opportunity, so they voluntarily signed up for work in hopes of going to America. Weitzer (2014) researched that victims were coerced into human trafficking as well. However, when they arrived, their documents were confiscated and they were forced into a different reality from which they originally signed up for (Logan et al, 2009). Others are forced into slavery to pay an incurred debt due to fraudulent charges put on them through the criminal justice system (Logan et al, 2009).

In order to keep their victims so they do not flee, traffickers brainwash them, watch them very closely, and keep them isolated. This information was provided by some victims who shared their stories with My Fox Houston Television Network (Keith, 2013). To stay ahead of law enforcement, victims can be moved swiftly. Some are not even smuggled across borders, but rather held captive in their own homes (McGough, 2013). If victims were kidnapped, their families were threatened, as well as, their own lives. There are also language barriers that keep victims from escaping, or fear of deportation, making it nearly impossible for victims to cooperate with authorities (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2014).

Traffickers can be anybody ranging from blue-collar workers to close relatives. The corruption within the government adds to human trafficking, and does not force traffickers to be held accountable for their actions (Logan et al, 2009). A report completed by Surtees (2008) concluded that strangers recruited the Moldovans from Eastern Europe, whereas 80% of Albanians of Southeaster Europe knew their recruiters. Out of those recruiters, a majority of them were boyfriends, fiancés, or husbands (Surtees, 2008). Vocks & Nijboer (2000) performed another qualitative study in Europe, incorporating interviews with 72 women. The results of the study proved that most recruiters were friends or family members of the victims, and handled all of the traveling arrangements and documents. Results from a study performed on Vietnamese migrants working in Cambodian brothels, showed their reasons for engaging in that line of work were due to economic freedom and the ability to become more self-sufficient (Agustin, 2007). There was also a study on Russian women who sold sex in Norway (Jacobsen & Skilbrei, 2010). They did this because they had a desire to enhance their financial status not only for themselves, but for their families as well (Jacobsen & Skilbrei, 2010). According to these women, prostitution provided financial freedom and allowed them to gain their independence (Jacobsen & Skilbrei, 2010).

Policy Implementation Process in the United States

Policies take place when there are crucial issues that the government immediately becomes concerned about. When a problem arises, the government develops a plan to resolve it. In doing so, they must assure they have clear and concise goals they want to accomplish, develop alternatives, and then assess the impact the decision will have on the

people because everyone's rights need to be respected (Gauchat, 2012). Once a plan has developed, implementation and application of the law comes through the three branches of government, legislative, executive, and judicial (United States House of Representatives, 2014). Gauchat's (2012) study on public trust in science in the United States, supported the argument that the policy making process at times can be a struggle between officials and citizens. This is due to it being difficult for the two sides to agree during the policy making process because personal interests and desired outcomes.

American citizens have the right to propose legislation and assist in writing a bill if they feel the need to do so, but it is solely up to Congress to introduce new legislation. After a bill is introduced, it is referred to the subcommittee for review. If approved by the full committee, it gets forwarded to the House or Senate (United States Senate, 2014). Debates and amendments to the bill are allowed while being considered. The Senate and the House of Representatives then must vote on it, and the majority wins. The President can now sign the bill or veto it (The White House, 2014). When President George W. Bush was in office, he made a declaration during his inauguration that the United States policy will be, to support the growth of democracy in every nation to end global tyranny (Bush, 2005). He also addressed that all human beings have rights, and no one should be treated like a slave (Bush, 2005). Although new policies were created that targeted trafficking, it became difficult to apply the various initiatives that would support victims, and also enforce the law so that traffickers would receive severe penalties.

Policies and Initiatives to Combat Human Trafficking in the United States

The United States has led the forefront in combatting human trafficking, allowing other countries to follow their example. The United States has all the resources to conduct research to better equip them for a huge task such as the obliteration of slavery (Chuang, 2010). The anti-slavery movement was what led the initiative to begin developing laws that would end slavery. It was the Civil War between the United States and the Confederate states from year to year, and Abraham Lincoln's Emancipation Proclamation of 1863 that began to eradicate slavery back in the 1800s (The Library of Congress, 2014). It would be the 13[th]amendment to the United States Constitution that abolished slavery, and the 19th amendment that gave women the right to vote (The Library of Congress, 2014). The term trafficking was not yet introduced until the 1904 International Agreement for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic, followed by the 1910 International Convention for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic (Sasaki, 2012). These were the first legislative moves passed.

During the 1990s, President William Clinton's administration began efforts to combat human trafficking, partly due to the realization that people were being smuggled into the United States. There were a growing number of men and women being trafficked into the country and forced to work in sectors ranging from domestic work to sexual slavery (Chuang, 2010). Clinton developed a policy framework known as the "three p's", which stood for prosecution of trafficking, prevention of trafficking, and protection of trafficked persons (Ross, 2014). Congress passed the bill for anti

trafficking, and President Clinton signed it into law Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) 2000 (Stolz, 2010).

When President George W. Bush took office, the Bush administration expanded the (TVPA) and the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Person(s) (J/TIP). In 2002, President Bush endorsed the goals set out by the Protection Act by signing the National Security Presidential Directive 22 (Fong & Berger Cardoso, 2010). This permitted federal agencies to increase their efforts and collaborate in order to combat trafficking (Global Issues, 2003). President Barack Obama continued Bush's efforts by raising awareness, creating laws with harsher punishments for traffickers, and providing recovery services for victims. He even went on to declare January as human trafficking awareness month. On this day, events take place to help raise awareness among the general public (Kloer, 2011).

TVPA is a federal statute that was passed by the United States Congress. This act is to provide protection for people who may be in the United States illegally because they were victims of human trafficking (Crane & Moreno, 2011). Through this act, victims are allotted certain benefits and services to help them on the path to recovery. To obtain such benefits is a difficult process because the victims may have to confront their traffickers if they are asked to testify against them in a court case. The goals of TVPA with Federal and state support are to prevent trafficking globally, provide adequate services for victims, and indict traffickers based on the magnitude of their crime (Chakraborti, 2014).

In addition to rescuing and protecting victims, the United States also needs to go after the traffickers. Thus, the TVPA also provides the necessary tools to arrest, prosecute, and punish criminals to the fullest extent of the law because it is now a federal crime (George, 2012). This means that the trafficker's punishment, if found guilty, will match with the severity of the crime he or she committed. The act gets renewed to ensure the United States continues its efforts to aid thousands of individuals each year. However, since this is a new law and there are no existing precedents to follow, prosecutors find it difficult to indict johns on any charges of trafficking (Ren, 2014). They have little to no guidance on how to prepare and win their cases. Thus, in fear of ruining their reputation, prosecutors choose to charge johns with a lesser crime (McGough, 2013).

The Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons was created by the TVPA, which secured the guarantees of freedom from modern slavery and involuntary servitude set forth in the United States Constitution (Sanchez & Stark, 2014). There are three distinct sections of this office, which are Reports and Political Affairs, International Programs, and Public engagement (United States Department of State, 2014b). Out of these offices, they investigate human trafficking rings occurring domestically and internationally to arrest and prosecute 'johns', raise awareness through numerous campaigns, and provide recovery services (United States Department of State, 2014b). Another initiative developed by the Office to Monitor Trafficking in Persons, and has been implemented in most police departments across the United States, is police task forces. Special training is offered to members of police departments on learning how to

identify and rescue victims, as well as, investigate traffickers. A study conducted in

South Africa, where investigating officers were interviewed on the complexities of

understanding the human trafficking cases they were working on, reported the importance

of accurately identifying victims when trying to investigate and prevent human

trafficking (Poelmans, Elzinga, Dedene, Viaene, & Kuznetsov, 2011).

Enacted out of the TVPA were the President's Interagency Task Force to Monitor

and Combat Trafficking in Persons (PITF). It is a cabinet-level entity coordinating

efforts to end human trafficking. This task force is used to evaluate how far the United

States, as well as foreign countries, has gone with their efforts to combat human

trafficking (Greene & Beinhart, 2013). Some of its goals are to develop methodologies to

conduct research and gather data pertaining to this crime, engage in expanding

relationships with leaders domestically and internationally to monitor trafficking, and to

raise awareness (Cornell University Law School, 2013). The agencies that are

determined to aid in anti-trafficking efforts are the United States Department of State, the

United States Department of Health and Human Services, the United States Department

of Justice, the United States Department of Labor, and the United States Department of

Homeland Security.

The United States Department of Health and Human Service plays a part in

implementing laws that cater to victims of human trafficking. They aim to improve the

health of all American citizens, and protect people who cannot fend for themselves.

Through this office, victims of human trafficking are verified that they truly are victims,

and not people who voluntarily entered into prostitution; this process is called

certification (Macy & Graham, 2012). With this certification, victims are allowed to receive federally funded benefits (Federal Government Efforts, 2012).

The United States Department of Justice (DOJ) enforces laws and administers justice. They investigate human trafficking cases and prosecute traffickers (Federal Government Efforts, 2012). They also assist victims in reporting their traffickers (Kotrla, 2010). DOJ continues to partner with the Department of Labor, the FBI, and the DHS ICE division, to identify and develop more labor trafficking cases through their inter-agency Anti-Trafficking Coordination Team Initiative (The United States Department of Justice, 2014). The Civil Rights Division of DOJ created the Human Trafficking Prosecution Unit (HTPU) in 2007 (The United States Department of Justice, 2014). This unit consists of the nation's top human trafficking prosecutors, who work closely with Assistant United States Attorneys and law enforcement agencies in investigating human trafficking cases (Siskin & Wyler, 2011).

The United States Department of Labor is a cabinet-level department that is responsible for all divisions of employment and providing support to those that earn wages, retired, or seeking employment. Through their One-Stop Career Center System, which victims can use with their Health and Human Service (HHS) certificate, victims have access to the Department's educational and training services, where they can obtain assistance with job searches, coaching, and placement (Moser, 2012). The system can also refer supportive services such as transportation, childcare, and housing for victims (Crane, 2013).

The United States Department of Homeland Security (DHS) emerged after the terrorist attacks on September 11th, 2001. The department was formed in order to protect the United States and all its territories from attacks, natural disasters, and any other emergencies (Kyle & Koslowski, 2011). Being the third largest governmental agency, DHS acquires the resources to investigate cases of human trafficking (Ren, 2014). It also has a number of agencies that can identify human trafficking victims and award certain victims of human trafficking, a (T) Nonimmigrant Status (T-visa). The T-visa permits victims to stay and work in the United States for a certain amount of time if they agree to testify against their traffickers (DHS, 2014).

DHS has also taken initiatives to combat human trafficking, as well as, the National Institute of Justice (NIJ). DHS has investigated trafficking operations, arrested traffickers, and provided immigration assistance and protection for victims (Department of Homeland Security, 2014). They launched their Blue Campaign in 2010, which strengthened their anti-trafficking techniques by working with other governments, organizations, and law enforcement agencies around the world. The NIJ has also made strides in authorizing and funding research on trafficking issues since 1998 (Goździak & Collet, 2005). These projects focused on the exploitation of children, the aftermath of sex trafficking, and victims who were smuggled and trafficked in both China and the Ukraine (Goździak & Collet, 2005).

J/TIP, in collaboration with DHS, has helped to raise awareness and educate people about human trafficking through various training materials (United States Department of State, 2013). Many police departments have incorporated this training

into their sector. Police officers are free to sign up and receive the necessary training to prepare them for the human trafficking world (Farrell, 2012). This training is called Combating Trafficking in Persons (CTIP) Awareness Training, and is also available to take while in the army (U.S. Army, 2013).

The Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act

The Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act (TVPRA) was introduced to the House of Representatives in 2011, as a means of ensuring grants are not denied to institutions that morally stand against providing particular services to individuals (United States Department of State, 2013b). On March 2013, President Obama signed the reauthorization of TVPA, re-authorizing the country's most important tool in their anti-trafficking efforts (United States Department of State, 2013b). This bill will allow J/TIP to allocate resources to countries overseas seeking to put a stop to human trafficking. Since the new President, Donald Trump, took office in January 2017, he still continues the fight against human trafficking. During his first month of power, more than 1,500 arrests were made in conjunction with sex crimes (Pullen, 2017). In the following month, President Trump issued 3 new executive orders that outlines his criminal justice priorities (Pullen, 2017). This included human trafficking because it is a part of a foreign based crime.

The UNODC established the U.N. Global Initiative in 2007. The creation of the United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (Nguyen, 2010) was a necessary step for all leaders to come together and discover ways to combat human trafficking. This has developed partnerships globally, which was an important lead to

take because of the existing partnerships and resources the U.N. has. This was created

because the U.N. knew the magnitude of this crime and how far it has spread, that the

government would simply not be able to tackle this issue alone (United Nations Global

Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking Hub2007).

Senior Policy Operating Group

The Senior Policy Operating Group (SPOG) was created as a result of the

TVPRA. This group consists of senior officials that coordinate interagency policy,

grants, and research (Fordyce, 2012). Strategies are developed and geared towards anti

trafficking, which includes campaigns, trainings, research to produce statistics for reports,

grants, and additional programs (United States Department of State, 2013b). These

groups of individuals are a huge component in America's efforts to end human

trafficking.

The U.S. government has increased its efforts in developing strategies to combat

human trafficking by calling on prominent leaders. Its latest efforts involved partnering

with Faith-based and Neighborhood Organizations to help raise awareness. Additional

strategies include innovative technology to assist task forces in capturing traffickers, by

creating and using mobile apps to connect victims to services that will help them.

Massachusetts Policies on Human Trafficking

Massachusetts was once a state that had no methods in place to combat the human

trafficking that occurred. There was a bill introduced in 2009 that passed the state

Senate, but failed to pass the House. Martha Coakley was the former Massachusetts

Attorney General, who along with legislators, law enforcement, and advocates, came

together to create and implement a law that would make human trafficking a crime in the state of Massachusetts (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). This bill would allow law enforcement to investigate cases of human trafficking, enforce harsher punishments on traffickers, and provide recovery services for victims (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). Coakley acknowledged the bill was a necessary step because human trafficking is a threat to the public safety and human rights to the Commonwealth of Massachusetts. On November 21st, 2011, House Bill 3808, An Act Relative to the Commercial Exploitation of People, was signed into law by former Governor Deval Patrick of Massachusetts (Dess, 2013).

This act has been an ongoing effort originated by Senator Mark Montigny, who started the process 6 years ago (Government of Massachusetts (2011). He knew this crime needed to be stopped and victims required protection and services to help them get back to a normal life. After many years of petitioning this bill, Massachusetts has the most comprehensive laws targeting human trafficking in the country according to Representative Eugene L. O'Flaherty after 47 other states have already passed their bills (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). Massachusetts is now on the top tier according to the U.S. Trafficking in Person(s) report due to the improvements they have made. Instead of targeting and arresting prostitutes, police are now going after the people who pay for the sex, and the criminals that pimp them out (Ren, 2014).

The Massachusetts law on human trafficking went into effect on February 19th, 2012. Titled, An Act Relative to the Commercial Exploitation of People, authorized the creation of an interagency task force to investigate trafficking rings in Massachusetts,

increase penalties for existing crimes, forced those that are mandated reporters to report the crimes, and sanctioned money made from trafficking to be placed into a trust fund for victims (Dess, 2013). Based on this law, human trafficking is now considered a felony. Thus, the punishment for those caught engaging in acts of trafficking serve a mandatory-minimum term of 5 years, with a possible maximum sentence of 20 years, and a fine of up to $25,000 (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). Businesses engaged in the use of human trafficking for sexual favor, can be fined up to $1 million. When the victim is under the age of 18, the offender can be sentenced to maximum life in prison (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). To tackle the issue of demand, those who paid for sex would also be penalized. If a person was convicted for the solicitation of a prostitute, they could be sentenced up to 2.5 years and pay a fine of up to $5,000. If sex was solicited with a minor, that person offender could face a maximum of 10 years if convicted (Government of Massachusetts, 2011).

Since the implementation of this law, it is difficult for people to interpret and truly know who should be held accountable as reported by Mint Press News (Rucke, 2013). Not 1 of the 11 district attorneys in the state of Massachusetts have yet to prosecute the buyers and sellers in human trafficking crimes committed or been charged to pay any fines 2 years after executing this law (Rucke, 2013). According to a report in the Boston Globe, the majority of cases against men arrested for enlisting the services of a prostitute since 2012 in Suffolk County, Massachusetts, have been dismissed, reduced, or continued without guilty findings (Rucke, 2013). Also, Michael Shively, senior associate with the Cambridge research company Abt Associates, stated there was a lack of funding and

manpower to gather enough evidence to convict the traffickers. Most district attorneys

do not want to bother or invest their time to try and defend these types of cases, nor do

judges because they see that it is the fault of the victims (Rucke, 2013).

Coakley continued to address the issue of human trafficking by initiating

additional training for task force members to increase awareness, and ensure that the law

is being utilized correctly and to the fullest extent. The interagency task force was

designed to target this crime through service development, demand reduction, system

change, public awareness, and training (Human Trafficking Initiative, 2014). It is

comprised of 19 members from various backgrounds including academia, prosecutors,

and police officers. With this law, DCF can now get more involved with providing

services to victims of human trafficking which includes all social and legal services that

are funded by the state (Kotrla, 2010). For those victims that are children, DCF will

provide an advocate to accompany the child for any court appearances they may have to

make (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). There is a tremendous need for victim

services because victims need to feel protected in order to gain courage to come forward,

testify against their traffickers, and put them away in jail.

The current Attorney General, Maura Healey, has definitely followed in the

footsteps of Martha Coakley. Healey recognizes this is an ongoing crime, and

partnerships need to be made to effectively combat the crime. The Human Trafficking

Division in the Attorney General's office is comprised of 3 Assistant Attorney Generals,

2 victim witness advocates, outreach coordinators, and 4 police troopers who have been

trained to prevent and prosecute human trafficking cases (Government of Massachusetts,

2016). The current Governor of Massachusetts, Charlie Baker, and the Lieutenant

Governor, Karyn Polito announced in 2016 at a press conference that the government was

creating a human trafficking unit within the State Police department (Government of

Massachusetts, 2016). This initiative will assist in investigations of human trafficking

and bring collaborations with the Department of Children and Families. Also in 2016,

Senator Dan Wolf, who represents Cape Cod and the Islands district, announced that the

Senate passed S.2444, An Act to strengthen the current anti-human trafficking law. The

bill would seek to increase protection for survivors of human trafficking, as well as,

training for law enforcement (Wolf, 2016).

Steps are now being taken to improve the methods that are currently used to

estimate human trafficking in Massachusetts. Massachusetts created the Child Sexual

Exploitation Database through the SEEN Coalition (formerly the Teen Prostitution

Prevention Project) in Suffolk County (Clawson, Layne, & Small, 2006). This will help

in obtaining reliable data on how many people are actually trafficked, in order to better

target the crime. For example, in 2003 only five teen prostitutes were recorded by

Suffolk County, but then jumped to 59 in 2005. Out of those, 58 were female and one

male (Clawson, Layne, & Small, 2006). Providers in Boston believe this increase is due

to more awareness being raised (Clawson, Dutch, Solomon, &Grace, 2009).

Services Needed for Victims of Human Trafficking

The act of human trafficking continues to wreak havoc on the lives of individuals.

Most survivors do not know how to handle the emotional and physical ramifications it

takes on their lives. Many victims require services that cater to their specific traumas

(Fong & Berger Cardoso, 2010). Especially those that are taken from their own country and smuggled into an unknown country of where they know no one, and are forced into sexual slavery with strangers.

The primary language of the victims that contact the National Human Trafficking Resource Center hotline were English, Spanish, Tagalog, Amharic, Russian, Korean, Mandarin, Arabic, Portuguese, and Cantonese (Polaris, 2014). These different nationalities were smuggled from all over the world into the United States. Once the victims are rescued, most of the services they request are crisis case management, extractions, emergency shelter, transportation, and medical assistance (Polaris, 2014).

Trafficking can take a huge toll on the lives of people. If the appropriate care is not given right away when a victim is rescued, it can diminish the likelihood of a speedy and successful recovery. A variety of services are required for victims if they want a chance at a normal life (Peters, 2013). Services such as food and shelter are available on Cape Cod. However, it lacks specialty services such as mental health and substance abuse treatment. Additional services are long-term and can range from case management to victim advocacy to medical and dental care (Ren, 2014). Paths to recovery include support groups, immigration, education, and employment services (Federal Strategic Action Plan, 2014).

Media Influence on Human Trafficking

The influence of media in today's modern world is significant. Thus, the U.S. is able to increase its efforts on combating human trafficking by raising awareness through television, radio and social media outlets (Martinelli, 2012). Under the Presidents

Interact task force is a Public Engagement section. The Public Engagement section acts as a liaison between J/TIP and Congress, the media, government and non-governmental organizations, businesses, school institutions, and the general public (United States Department of State, 2013a). It is through this section that political leaders are able to provide updates on the current status of human trafficking through various media outlets. This has tremendously aided in increasing the amount of information that gets delivered to the public regarding this topic because media, including social networking, is targeting the issue and delivering it to the public (United States Department of State, 2013a). People are now able to obtain alerts and news feeds regarding status updates on human trafficking.

The Department of Health and Human Services also continued its effort in combating human trafficking by launching a multi-million-dollar campaign in 2004 called the Rescue and Restore Victims of Human Trafficking (Okech, Morreau, & Benson, 2012). This was a campaign to raise awareness, educate healthcare providers, social service organizations, and law enforcement. They accomplished this by distributing brochures. Out of this campaign, coalitions were established that created public service announcements to encourage victims to come forward (United States Department of Justice, 2007).

Barriers to Implementing Policy

The formation and implementation of policy can be an arduous task. When there is a perceived problem, community leaders and officials come together to develop ways to resolve the problem. Once policies were created to attack human trafficking, law

enforcement officials were unable to fully comprehend the law and thus, could not enforce it (Clawson et al., 2009). There is a lack of consistency at the local level of law enforcement agencies. In addition, there is no national consensus on how to identify victims or what the protocol is when approached by a victim (Farrell, 2012). In order for services provided for victims to be effective, there needs to be collaboration between social service providers, health care providers, and other agencies (Clawson, et al., 2009).

One barrier that has been identified is the inability for victims to come forward and admit that they are victims who need help (Venetis, Argibay, Jean-Francois, & Fishman, 2012). Since the trafficking of persons is a covert operation, some victims are secretive about what they have been through, and at times refuse to disclose any personal information about themselves. There are also language barriers between the victim and police when a victim is smuggled in from another country (Clawson et al., 2009).

In two thousand and fourteen, former Governor of Massachusetts, Deval Patrick, offered to provide shelter for 1,000 children from Central America for at least one month. These children had fled from various countries due to violence and poor economic conditions according to DHS (Murphy & Dumcius, 2014). There were two locations Patrick suggested which were in Western, MA and the Joint Base Cape Cod in Bourne, which is a military facility. Even after Hurricane Katrina, housing for survivors was provided on Camp Edwards in Bourne (Murphy & Dumcius, 2014). In the end, housing these children was no longer needed by Massachusetts, but the fact remains that space was made available for victims on an emergency basis in Cape Cod.

Other local officials did not agree with Patrick making such a haste decision without considering the economic impact it would have on the commonwealth. However, Patrick saw this as a humanitarian crisis, and felt the need to intervene (Murphy & Dumcius, 2014). Human trafficking is humanitarian crises where countless victims are violently abused every day. If there are locations on the Cape that children from Central America can obtain refuge for at least 24 hours, then the same services should be made available to Massachusetts' citizens who have been subjected to human trafficking on the Cape and islands. My goal for this research study was to find out what are the perceived barriers to implementing existing social service programs regarding human trafficking, that are implemented everywhere else but the Cape Cod region.

Summary and Conclusions

Major themes were discovered after performing the literature search including the economics demand for human trafficking, the victimization of vulnerable populations, and the political process when creating policy. Economics seemed to be the driving force behind human trafficking due to the supply of victims and demand for prostitutes (Wheaton, Schauer, & Galli, 2010). In addition, traffickers are driven to engage in such a crime because of the monetary gain. With regards to victims, there is a seemingly endless supply of victims because regardless of race, gender, economic status, victims are coerced, kidnapped, beaten, and forced into slavery (Lutya & Lainer, 2012). However, those that suffer from poverty or lack of an education are more susceptible to the crime of human trafficking.

The policy process involves a dire issue that needs immediate response, but can take years before it is legislatively addressed. Since human trafficking has become this global phenomenon, governments all over the world have had to create public policy that tackles this crime and help emancipate people who have been tormented for so many years. In addition to harsher laws, victim services are also needed, especially on Cape Cod.

This qualitative study should help Massachusetts with identifying the necessary steps to effectively address human trafficking. It will help in understanding which populations are targeted so they can be helped before they become victims, which will reduce the supply. In addition, it will provide citizens with information that will help to raise their awareness, and thereby, make them stronger advocates in the policy process. Furthermore, after performing the interviews, data from my study should reveal what the barriers are, so Massachusetts can develop methods on how to overcome them.

Chapter 3: Research Method

Introduction

The trafficking of human beings is rapidly spreading worldwide with no signs of slowing down because of the incessant demand for the endless supply of human beings. Victims get smuggled internationally and domestically, enabling the continuous supply of victims for this covert operation (Kleemans, 2011; Wheaton, Schauer, & Galli, 2010). The purpose of this qualitative research study was to examine what law enforcement officials and social welfare providers on Cape Cod believe to be obstacles when implementing existing Massachusetts' policies and programs targeting human trafficking. Uncovering this information may provide Massachusetts policy decision makers the knowledge and tools to better cater to victims of human trafficking, and enforce harsher punishments upon traffickers. This section will provide the rationale for the research design, the role of the researcher, the methodology, population and sampling, data collection method, content validity, data analysis, issues of trustworthiness, and ethical procedures.

Research Design and Rationale

The study performed addressed the research question: What do social service workers and law enforcement perceive as being the barriers to implementing existing Massachusetts' policies targeting human trafficking on Cape Cod? After careful review of the different methodologies, a qualitative method was selected for the purpose of this research. A qualitative study was best suited because it provided data for my research question, which allowed me to go in depth regarding a social marvel (Creswell, 2013).

Quantitative methodology was not selected because it would only provide statistical information because social phenomenon gets investigated through the use of numerical data. This type of research is used to test hypothesis, search for a breadth of information, or to study a quantitative subject (Jupp & Garwood, 2006). Tavallaei and Talib (2010) stated that qualitative methods have the ability to describe, analyze, and interpret the aspects of the social world. With this methodology, researchers are able to search for deeper understandings uncovering the meanings behind certain human behaviors (Maxwell, 2013). It also aids in finding and selecting the best way to implement new processes that will better fight human trafficking. Through interviews and observations, qualitative data provide some answers to questions we as humans simply do not understand (Merriam, 2009). I interviewed those who were appointed to handle the implementation of public policies on Cape Cod, such as social welfare providers and law enforcement officials. The ability to gain direct insight from those involved with human trafficking cases afforded the opportunity to learn best practices, which can then help the welfare of people throughout the Commonwealth of Massachusetts. I did not interview victims of human trafficking in this study because it is unnecessary to make them re-live their trauma.

Case Study Design

A case study was selected for this research study in order to understand Massachusetts' capabilities when combating human trafficking. Case studies are used to analyze a person, a group, or an event (Yin, 2014). Case studies have a history of being popular among researchers in various disciplines (Creswell, Hanson, Clark Plano, &

Morales, 2007). It aided in providing insights to issues, and helped the researcher achieve a better understanding of complex situations that can take place in natural settings (Creswell, 2013; Yin, 2013). Case study methods provide the opportunity to give a voice to the powerless that are usually not heard (Tellis, 1997). Those are the people who have encountered human trafficking cases and interact with victims. However, since they are not the key decision makers, at times their ideas or different approaches go unheard. Through a case study, the issue of trafficking on the Cape was observed through multiple angles.

A case study design was chosen because it provided the ability to test and apply my selected theories to this real life phenomenon of human trafficking. Ethnography was not selected because this research does not involve observing a cultural phenomenon and how people live their lives (Watras, 2010). The use of a narrative design would require me to interview victims and have them re-live their experience, which I wanted to refrain from (Creswell, 2007). Phenomenological research would not provide the data needed for my research since the human trafficking phenomenon and the lived experiences of people is not being studied (Norlyk, 2010), but rather the perceived barriers to implementing public policy and social service programs that target the issue. Lastly, grounded theory was not used because the goal is not to develop new theories from the data collected (Birks & Mills, 2011).

A case study is also known as a triangulated research strategy that consists of the data, the investigators, and theories (Tellis, 1997; Yin, 2009). This design helped to draw conclusions regarding this natural event from the data obtained on the lives of real people

who have encountered human trafficking (Yin, 2009). Since I studied a particular region of Massachusetts, I concentrated on the empirical knowledge of those that are directly involved in human trafficking cases such as social and political figures, as well as, multiple data sources.

Role of the Researcher

My role as the researcher was that I was the instrument that collected the data. I selected participants most appropriate for this study who provided pertinent and valuable information towards this crucial topic (Merriam, 2014). As a professional, I eliminated bias and remained objective during the entire process by removing any pre-conceived notions I had, and concentrated on their answers (Chenail, 2011). To avoid bias, I made sure I was not guided by emotions, and focused on the issue at hand. One method applied to avoid bias is intellectual honesty. Intellectual honesty prevents my beliefs from interfering with accessing the truth, and allows for the facts to be presented without bias (Guenin, 2002; Toledo-Pereyra, 2005). Moreover, bias was avoided altogether because I was not present for the interviews. The interview questions were submitted to participants via email, therefore, I could not influence the answers of the participants.

An additional procedure I followed was to make sure I did not select a sample population based on the desire to achieve my research goals (Yin, 2014). To achieve this, some of my sample population consisted of commonwealth workers who do not have a personal mission or agenda, but simply want to provide services to the public. My personal background in recruitment and human resources allowed me to remain objective throughout the interview process and focus more on the answers given. As the

interviewer, my role as the researcher was to take the lead and establish rapport with the

participants so they felt comfortable sharing their personal experiences with me regarding

human trafficking (Guest, Bunce, & Johnson, 2012). I was able to accomplish this during

the preliminary introduction. My goal was to make them feel independent and treat them

with respect so they did not feel like they were being exploited (Maxwell, 2012). At the

end, I combined all my data and resources, coded it to look for themes, and then provided

my results for the research.

Data Collection Method

There are many forms of data collection in qualitative research such as interviews,

observations, and field notes. Interviews provide a variety of rich data and information to

analyze (Turner, 2010). Often times, interviews are coupled with other forms of data

collection in order to provide the researcher with a well-rounded compilation of

information for analyses (Turner, 2010). The data collection method I selected for my

research was interviewing those directly involved with human trafficking cases on Cape

Cod, and then I examined the policies and processes related to how these cases are

handled in order to triangulate the data. I analyzed documents, procedures, and any other

pertinent information relevant to human trafficking. Then I interviewed people based on

the findings from the documents.

The literature presented in Chapter 2 of this proposal aided in formulating the

questions for the participants. The interview questions used for this research study

(Appendix A) were taken from a human trafficking questionnaire developed by Stop

Violence Against Women, an advocacy group (Stop Violence Against Women, 2009).

The questions used were to gather information from law enforcement officials regarding their initiatives when targeting human trafficking. The questionnaire was distributed through surveymonkey.com. These questions were then altered to cater to my specific research by implementing research from the proposed theories in my theoretical framework found in the literature review. These questions coincide with Kingdon's multiple streams theory, Marxism/demand theory, and victimology. They are 15 open-ended questions with prompts to enable the participants to freely express their experiences with human trafficking on Cape Cod.

The following are the exact questions that were presented to the participants and are also found in Appendix A:

1. Would you please explain the types of services your organization provides?

2. What is your role in the organization?

3. What do you know about the human trafficking that exists on Cape Cod?

- What have you seen or heard of regarding human trafficking in you area?

4. What do you feel drives human trafficking on Cape Cod?

- Why do you think it exists in your area?

5. What has Massachusetts developed to combat trafficking in persons?

- Please provide substantive criminal laws and procedures, mechanisms for civil remedies, witness protection in court proceedings, and witness security outside of courts. Please provide the legal citation, common name, text, or common name of the law in your answer or provide an Internet address if possible.

6. What is your experience regarding the implementation of existing Massachusetts'
   laws and procedures on Cape Cod?

- Please provide specific examples if relevant.

7. What are the formal procedures, protocols, or policies in place that provide
   instructions for law enforcement on how to identify and respond to human
   trafficking cases?

- Who would you to contact for victim assistance?

8. What challenges has your organization faced when implementing existing laws
   and policies targeting human trafficking?

9. What training on human trafficking is made available to your staff?

10. How do you feel Massachusetts has addressed the prevention of human
    trafficking?

11. What improvements need to be made?

12. What is your understanding of the populations that are more at risk of being
    targeted for human trafficking on Cape Cod?

13. What services does Massachusetts provide victims of human trafficking (e.g.
    protection, deportation, referrals, victim advocates, legal, medical, or financial
    assistance)?

- Are these methods regularly used?

14. What challenges or barriers affect service delivery to victims?

15. How do you feel government officials with whom your organization interacts,
    understand the nature of trafficking? Please provide examples of agreement, or

misconceptions or misunderstandings related to trafficking in persons, particularly those that might affect effectiveness at detecting and combating human trafficking?

A best practice I used during the interview process was to ask questions that yielded answers correlating to my research matter. It is suggested by Yin (2009), that in order to conduct a proper and thorough case study, the researcher must be able to ask good questions and interpret the responses accordingly. Throughout the interviewing process, I was able to garner in-depth information regarding the experiences of the participants and their viewpoints on what was being done to combat human trafficking in Massachusetts because their answers were submitted through email. I utilized a semi structured interview protocol since structured interviews with a strict protocol tend to produce quantitative data (Delport & Roestenburg, 2011). I wanted the participants to feel comfortable with me in order to expand upon their answers. Seidman (2012) argued that in-depth interviews should be done with skill to reduce stress and keep the participant comfortable. With a semi structured interview, it is more personable, and I had the free will to deviate from an original question based on the response the participant provided (DiCicco-Bloom & Crabtree, 2006). To ensure I covered all aspects of human trafficking on Cape Cod, it was vital that I prepared a list of questions beforehand, unlike unstructured interviews (Stuckey, 2013).

Since state employees and nonprofit workers usually encounter heavy workloads, my participants answered the interview questions through emails, with the option to follow up over the phone in case a question arose or further explanation was needed.

Technology has advanced with smart phones such that work related matters can be done

through a phone. This method helped with saving time and costs related to traveling, and

can be done any time of the day (Opdenakker, 2006). Ratislavová and Ratislav (2014)

researched the benefits of performing interviews through email. After interviewing

Czech women who suffered a perinatal loss, it was discovered that the women preferred

their interviews be done through email because of the anonymity and being in the

comfort of their own home, while others found the emails convenient due to their

workload. In addition, Ratislavová and Ratislav concluded that it was cost effective to do

email interviews rather than face-to-face interviews because of the savings from not

traveling. According to Bampton and Cowton (2002), the email interview or the e-

interview accommodated all participants, including the researcher. It also allowed for the

participant to develop a more robust answer. Email interviews are methods that can be

used in qualitative research to produce in-depth, online narratives, and are the most

feasible substitute when face to face interviews cannot be done (Bampton, Roberta, &

Cowton, 2002; Burns, 2010; James, 2007; Turner, 2010).

Before sending the interview questions to participants, there were certain

procedures that I had to follow. The prelude to the interview encompassed certain

elements to ensure the participants were informed on what the study was about. In the

preliminary letter to the executive directors or those who were in charge, I explained the

research being done. Once I garnered permission for their organization to participate in

my study, I then sent a letter of cooperation to other staff members to participate. Then a

consent letter was sent to the participants beforehand so they were aware of what to

expect and what is expected of them. The consent form notified them that their

participation was voluntary, their personal information will remain confidential, and the

length of the entire interview process (Tabor, Stock, Brazg, McMillin, Dent, Yu, &

Bamshad, 2012). I gave them an ample amount of time over a course of 4 weeks to

answer the questions thoroughly.

The protocol for the interviews was to have the participants respond to the email

interview questions in a detailed, essay format, and allow the opportunity for me to

respond with follow up questions (Appendix A). The follow up questions will be to ask

the participants to elaborate or clarify concepts. At the time no one responded to the

questions, a reminder email was sent out twice a week conveying the importance of

completing the interviews on time. At the time a participant ignored the timely requests

or refused to respond during the study, it was considered abandonment, and a

replacement was solicited, if and when more responses were needed.

In the event that I am unable to attain enough data through email, I will use

telephone interviews as my next plan. The use of telephones to conduct interviews in

qualitative research is widely used. Cachia and Millward (2011) argued that telephone

interviews in qualitative research are a viable source of data collection. Data can be

collected easily, while still maintaining personal contact with the participant. Sturges and

Hanrahan (2004) performed their own qualitative study comparing face-to-face

interviews with telephone interviews. Their findings revealed that both data collection

methods yielded similar results (Sturges & Hanrahan, 2004). To verify the obtained data

received by the telephone interviews, I will do a member check to ensure accuracy of the

responses made by the participants. This is performed to increase the validity, credibility, and transferability (Bryman, 2004). The same procedures for the email interviews with regards to sending out preliminary and consent letters will be followed for the telephone interviews as well. A separate consent letter, specifically for phone interviewing, was sent to the participants beforehand.

Population and Sampling

Research on this topic required data that would allow for an understanding of the root of modern day slavery and identify methods to end it. Creswell (2007) stated it is vital to select appropriate candidates for interviews. Snowball sampling was selected for this study, which is a type of purposive sampling (Griffith, Morris, & Thakar, 2016). Purposive sampling focuses on particular characteristics of a population to help answer questions regarding an event (Palinkas, Horwitz, Green, Wisdom, Duan, & Hoagwood, 2013). Snowball sampling allowed me to recruit colleagues or acquaintances of the existing subjects that I purposely selected (Griffith, Morris, & Thakar, 2016). This particular sampling was effective when recruiting participants because of the covert nature of human trafficking, and that not everyone may be exposed to it or aware of it. Snowball sampling allowed for existing participants to refer individuals they knew had knowledge of a particular subject, which contributed valuable data to the research. To avoid bias, I sent a letter of cooperation to all staff members, including those recommended to me by their managers who gave them permission to participate. Best practices to use when selecting participants is to identify their age, gender, status, role,

and that they have some knowledge of the topic being researched. This will help to yield credible witnesses for the interviews (Turner, 2010).

A small sample population was utilized in order to establish meaningful relationships with the participants so that I could continue to obtain more in-depth answers during and after the interviews (Crouch & McKenzie, 2006). Guest, Bunce, & Johnson (2006) suggested having a goal of 12 people for sample populations in qualitative research. Thus, my goal was to interview at least 12 people. In the end, I was only able to obtain 6 participants. The populations targeted were local law enforcement officials, advocates, case managers, and counselors from the nonprofit organizations that provide relief services to victims of domestic abuse and sexual assault. I also reserved the option to send letters to licensed social workers and the district attorney's office on Cape Cod if needed. I would like to interview up to three representatives from each sector because I am looking for saturation. Saturation occurs when no new information transpires during the data collection (Saumure & Given, 2008). This allows for a diversity of opinions that are not relied heavily upon one sector.

These particular groups of occupations were selected because they are the people responsible for implementing procedures created by the government. According to Goździak and Bump (2008), there were numerous studies that heavily relied on interviews with service providers since they are the ones who have direct contact with victims. They are also the people who cannot do anything without authorization from the administrators, who then get their authorization from the government.

Participants were selected before the interviews were conducted. To identify these individuals, information about agencies and services located on Cape Cod were found on the Massachusetts' government website. There are two shelters on Cape Cod I identified that caters to women and children who have survived domestic violence. One of the shelters has a high-risk team, a SAFEPLAN program, and civilian advocates. I have the names of the executive directors of these agencies and their direct phone numbers. The executive directors of these shelters will then put me in contact with the police chiefs of the Yarmouth police department and the Falmouth police department since they have partnered before when it comes to organizing events that address human trafficking. To recruit the people I want to interview, I sent preliminary letters to the executive directors informing them of my research and sought permission to speak with their staff. Since I am interviewing people from various backgrounds, there was no specific criteria I chose because lower or higher ranking representatives may have encountered different experiences while investigating this crime.

Content Validity

It is difficult to obtain accurate information on a crime like human trafficking as it sometimes does not get reported. Validity of research being performed is imperative in verifying if the results can be used or not. Validity is used to eliminate any threats to a design or measurement (Drost, 2011). That is why when going forth with this research, it was critical to ensure the validity by following established procedures. One way was to solicit participants that were believed to be appropriate for the study. In addition, asking interview questions that will address the topic of the research is important (Shenton,

2004). Content validity is used to ensure that the interview questions truly measure the construct in question, and the responses I receive back are not influenced by outside factors (Bhattacherjee, 2012). Another way to assess content validity is to depend on people familiar with the construct being measured (Bhattacherjee, 2012).

Data Analysis

Data collected needs to be analyzed and interpreted in order to learn the outcome of the research. Creswell (2013) stated that the basic structure involves preparation of data, reducing data to apply themes to the data, and lastly representation of the data. The method I have chosen to organize the data is coding. Coding helps to simplify transcripts of data, so that it becomes more manageable to identify patterns (Gläser & Laudel, 2013). Codes are categories, such as mnemonic devices, that are assigned to specific text (Saldaña, 2012). Coding is important to be able to assess different theories and cross reference information from the data collected. It allows the researcher to take their data and separate it into categories and themes in order to observe certain patterns and potentially build theories from there (Bergin, 2011).

The initial stage of my data analysis involved the use of open coding to code the data collected from the answers retrieved from the participants who were interviewed. Open coding is when ideas transpire from raw data, and are put into theoretical categories (Benaquisto, 2008). When reviewing the data, I began to identify important components and code them. Throughout reading the emailed answers, I looked for certain phrases and terms. Important keywords I identified during the interviews were demand, which correlates with economic theory, and also vulnerability that connects to victimology

theory. As the interviews progressed, more codes emerged that supported these theories. In addition, axial coding began to surface during the open coding process.

Axial coding was the next step in my data analysis process. Axial coding helped to identify any relationships within the categories created, and ensure all the crucial aspects of the data had been identified (Wicks, 2010). This got achieved by reviewing my text alongside my identified categories, to confirm that they coincide with the answers from the interviews. To organize the data so that patterns and themes became more evident, the coding was entered into a matrix (Saldaña, 2012).

Techniques to code data are by hand or to use software such as NVivo. NVivo can be used to organize an assortment of data and then cross-reference that information (Bazeley & Jackson, 2013). Utilizing a tool such as NVivo software helps researchers to organize the immense amount of data collected during the data collection phase. Table 1 illustrates the preliminary coding framework associated with my research question and the sub questions used to explore the central research question. The categories identified in Table 1 were derived from three theories introduced in this research paper, multiple streams, Marxism/demand, and victimology.

Central Research Question:

What are the perceived barriers to implementing existing Massachusetts's policies and services targeting human trafficking on Cape Cod as experienced by social welfare providers and law enforcement officials?

In order to answer this question, the following sub questions will be explored.

Sub questions:

1. What are the observations regarding the implementation of existing laws and procedures on Cape Cod?

2. Which populations are perceived as being targeted for human trafficking on Cape Cod?

3. What are the beliefs that drive human trafficking on Cape Cod?

Table 1.
Preliminary Codebook

Codes	Theories	Categories	Descriptions	Column D
Laws	Multiple Streams theory	Implementation of Laws and Procedures	This is observed when implementing existing laws and procedures.	
Vulnerable	Victimology	Target population for human trafficking	This population is more at risk for being a target of human traffic.	
Demand	Marxist/Demand theory	Driving human traffic	This what is believed to be driving human trafficking.	

Issues of Trustworthiness

Methods have been established over the years to ensure trustworthiness of various research studies. For the purposes of research, trustworthiness means the results reported are unassailable (Given & Saumure, 2008). The maintenance of credibility throughout the study can address the trustworthiness. One method was to have the data scrutinized by peers (Shenton, 2004). Another method was the use of iterative questioning (Shenton, 2004; Srivastava & Hopwood, 2009). Iterative question is a strategy used to ensure trustworthiness by rephrasing a previous question to make certain there are no contradictions to the previous statement given (Shenton, 2004; Srivastava & Hopwood, 2009). Four criteria suggested by Lincoln & Guba (1985) to ensure valid interpretation of data are neutrality, consistency, truth-value, and applicability. Neutrality is ensuring that the researcher is free of bias and is established by confirmability (Diebel, 2008). If the research were repeated and the findings were consistent, this would prove the dependability of the data (Todres, 2003). Truth-value is determined by the credibility, which is the conviction that the findings are authentic. Applicability is ascertained with transferability. To ensure transferability, I would provide a detailed account of my work so that others can apply the same procedure to another situation and achieve the same results (Shenton, 2004). As long as the instructions are detailed and very specific, the study can be repeated, deeming the study to be dependable since patterns can be identified.

Ethical Procedures

Human trafficking is an extremely delicate matter that should be handled with care. Therefore, principles of ethical conduct will be upheld throughout this study. The IRB approval number to conduct this study is 02-26-16-0251253. The populations targeted for participation were law enforcement and social service providers, and not victims. Before emailing the interview questions to my participants, I sent a letter of introduction informing the participants what the study was about, and what I hoped to achieve. I made sure they knew they did not have to feel threatened by me, they were made aware that I respected each and every one of their individual human rights, and that their names will remain anonymous (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001). These assurances were addressed in the informed consent letter. Participants knew beforehand that this study was voluntary, and that there was no monetary gain stated in the informed consent letter. Therefore, all data retrieved from participants was safely stored in a file on my computer with a password needed to access. This eliminated anyone from gaining possession, and kept their identity confidential. I can ensure confidentiality since I will be the only point of contact for this study.

Summary

The purpose of this qualitative study was to identify perceived barriers from local law officials, on the implementation of current Massachusetts' policies and programs geared towards human trafficking. Addressing this pertinent information will supply leaders with the knowledge on how to create or improve their methods of combating human trafficking on Cape Cod. The data collection method were email interviews with

local law enforcement, social service representatives, and other key people who are immersed in this crime. To analyze the data, coding techniques with qualitative data analysis were used to provide results that will yield answers to allow government leaders to better tackle this crime.

Chapter 4: Results

Introduction

Human trafficking is a human rights violation that continues to deprive people of their freedom, by forcing them to perform actions against their will. This critical issue has triggered governments to construct and enforce laws against this practice and create services for victims (Burke, 2015). Massachusetts is one of many states that has made efforts to combat human trafficking.

The purpose of this research was to determine what hindered the implementation of certain programs targeting human trafficking on Cape Cod, Massachusetts as identified by law enforcement and social service representatives, in order to fully understand the execution of programs, what drives human trafficking, and who is more at risk of being trafficked on Cape Cod. The interview questions used in this qualitative, case study were derived from the theoretical framework that identified the theories of Kingdon's multiple streams theory (1984), Marxist theory (1867) coupled with demand theory (1871), and Mendelsohn's victimology theory (1956).

Information regarding the setting, how research participants were recruited, specifics of the data collection method, and themes from coding that emerged from the data analysis will be furnished in Chapter 4. Evidence of trustworthiness through credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability will be discussed. Lastly, details of the results and a summary of the findings with relations to the research question will be provided in this chapter.

Setting

A qualitative case study was selected for the purposes of this research using email interview questions as a form of data collection. Participants for this study were located by searching for social service agencies such as domestic abuse shelters, in conjunction with police departments on Cape Cod. I then cross-referenced that information with names and agencies provided to me from the Bristol County's Assistant District Attorney. Furthermore, I read local online newspaper articles that featured human trafficking topics. In these articles were interviews with state employees who had experience with human trafficking or knew of someone who had been trafficked on Cape Cod. I then identified which state entity they worked for. Since all the participants work in the public sector, their contact information was obtained by searching the Massachusetts state website which provides a list of agencies that help certain populations.

The social service agencies that were contacted to participate in the study all came from non-profit organizations in the Cape Cod region. One of the organizations that participated in this study is an emergency shelter on Cape Cod that helps families gain their independency after escaping from domestic violence. Another nonprofit organization that participated provides services to its community of all ages. The other organization helps children who have suffered from sexual abuse. The remaining participants both came from police departments who represent different communities. These were the organizational conditions that the participants work in. The interviews did not physically take place at their location, but were done through email. The 15

open-ended questions (Appendix A) were emailed to the participants, and then

participants responded with their answers through email.

Demographics

Research participants were identified by targeting those directly involved with

human trafficking cases, as well as, those who are involved with the implementation

process of certain programs and laws targeting human trafficking on Cape Cod. The only

pre-qualifying criterion for participant selection was that they have encountered human

trafficking. Therefore, participants were not selected based on age, income, and race, nor

did the study collect information related to these because it was irrelevant to the research.

These participants consisted of 4 women from 3 separate non-profit agencies that provide

services to women, children, or the entire community who need assistance on Cape Cod.

Two of the women were executive directors of their organizations and the other 2 held

mid management roles. The remaining two participants were men who are law

enforcement officials who work in separate police departments on Cape Cod. One was a

police chief and the other was a police captain. Table 2 shows participants by gender and

organization. To maintain confidentiality, each participant was identified using

acronyms: SS for social service and PD for police department, followed in numerical

order.

Table 2.

Demographics of Individual Participants

Acronym	Gender	Role in the Organization	Organization	Organization Type
SS1	Female	Executive Director	Women's Shelter	Human Services
SS2	Female	Psychotherapist	Women's Shelter	Human Services
SS3	Female	Director	Child Advocacy	Human Services
SS4	Female	Program Director	Community Service	Human Services
PD1	Male	Chief of Police	Law Enforcement	Local Police Department
PD2	Male	Police Captain	Law Enforcement	Local Police Department

Data Collection

In order to obtain data, a semistructured email interview was conducted with the participants. Once participants were identified in accordance with the approved research protocol, they were approached with a phone call, followed by an email. I have nearly 10 years of experience as a recruiter in human resources, therefore, I felt more than capable to cold call and recruit individuals. A phone call was first made to the organization to garner participation from executive directors explaining the purposes of my research. Then executive directors were emailed a preliminary letter that followed proper IRB protocol. The IRB approval number is 02-26-16-0251253. Then a letter of cooperation

was emailed to the executive directors who then forwarded this email to their employees who could volunteer at their own will. Once they agreed to take part in the study, they were sent a consent form. Once the participants consented with an, "I consent" email, the email was then copied to Walden University's IRB email to ensure suitable consent was obtained.

Fifteen open-ended questions, with prompts, were sent to participants through email. The questionnaire can be found in Appendix A of this dissertation. Originally I wanted to obtain 12 participants from the various sectors for purposes of saturation as discussed in Chapter 3 (Saumure & Given, 2008). I was able to obtain saturation through the 6 individuals that participated because I received similar answers from the law enforcement officials and the social service representatives that are identified in the results section of this chapter.

The participants were a mix of men and women, supervisors and subordinates, in order to obtain various viewpoints. Originally a total of 18 people were identified and invited to participate in the study because this was the number of social service and law enforcement organizations available on the Cape Cod region that may have experienced human trafficking. Nine of those people were from police departments, 8 came from shelters and social service programs, and 1 came from the Department of Homeland Security. The individual from the Department of Homeland Security opted out of participating. Three out of the 18 people that were identified and invited to participate never responded to my email invites after 2 phone calls and 2 emails. Six out of the 18 people identified refused to partake in my study because they stated that they had not

experienced human trafficking in their region, and thus felt they could not contribute to my research. I even followed up by noting that any knowledge they had regarding the topic would be helpful, but the individuals still declined. Since the study was voluntary, I could not force anyone to participate.

Three out of the 18 people who initially agreed to participate in my study failed to respond to the email interview questions after the deadline, followed by 3 phone calls and 3 emails. In the end, a total of 6 people out of the original 18 people invited responded with answers to the interview questions through email. Out of those that responded, 2 came from local police departments and 4 from non-profit, social service organizations. This small sample did allow for more meaningful relationships with the participants because I did not have to spread my attention across so many people, and I could focus on obtaining more in-depth answers (Crouch & McKenzie, 2006).

The entire interview process took a total of 3 months, beginning the first week of March till the end of May 2016. This length of time involved ongoing phone calls and emails every time 2 weeks passed, which was the time allotted to complete the interview as stated in the consent letter. Some of the participants included two interviews from the same organization in order to adhere to the approved IRB process. For example, the executive director of the social service agency was contacted first in order to garner participation, and then I was able to interview their subordinate. This helped with gaining a different perspective from those who work directly with victims and enforce the law versus those who work primarily in administration. Once their answers were returned back to me, a thank you email was sent to the participants for their cooperation.

To enhance security, the answers from the participants were stored in a folder that was saved on my laptop computer protected by a confidential password.

Data Analysis

The interview protocol allowed for participants to provide comprehensive answers via email to the questions regarding human trafficking. Before they sent their answers, they were able to research, cite, review, and then submit their answers (Bampton & Cowton, 2002). Participant answers were read through methodically in order to identify significant themes. Organizing the data was a crucial part in examining the data in order to identify certain themes (Creswell, 2013). Coding allowed for the evaluation of different theories to be cross-referenced with information collected from the data (Bergin, 2011).

The answers from the participants were first scrutinized using open coding. This allowed me to put the raw data into categories. I began coding the data that was relevant to the study by looking for certain idioms. I then cross-referenced this information with my preliminary coding framework found in Table 1. Relationships were identified between the codes using axial coding. Axial coding aided with uncovering core themes and identifying the connections between the codes (Wicks, 2010). NVivo software was then used to organize the data so that the information could be cross-referenced (Bazeley & Jackson, 2013).

The data were interpreted to generate patterns during the cross case analysis stage. During the iterative process, I utilized the same coding process to analyze the data to ensure the same results were obtained (Shenton, 2004; Srivastava & Hopwood, 2009).

While coding, I was looking for themes that reinforced the ideas from Kingdon's multiple streams theory, Marxist theory and demand theory, and victimology found in my preliminary codebook. New codes emerged from the analyzed data, in addition to the preliminary codebook, which served as the basis for the 3 themes discovered in this study. The three themes are barriers to implementing policy and services, populations at risk, and demand. Table 3 illustrates the final codebook with emerging codes, and how the coding plan was deduced from the selected theories with reference to the research questions.

Table 3.

Final Codebook with Themes

Themes	Codes	Theories	Categories	Research Questions
Barriers to Implementing Policies and Services	Laws/policies Training Partnerships	Multiple streams theory	Barriers to implementation of laws and procedures	What are the observations regarding the implementation of existing laws and procedures on Cape Cod?
Populations at Risk	Vulnerable	Victimology	Target population for human trafficking	Which populations are perceived to be targeted for human trafficking on Cape Cod?
Demand	Demand Money Drugs	Marxist/Demand theory	Driving human trafficking	What are the beliefs that drive human trafficking on Cape Cod

Interpretation of the data will further be discussed in the results section of this chapter. There were no discrepant cases because the data collected corroborated with each other and did not challenge the selected theories (Yilmaz, 2013). No data negated previous emergent themes, but rather added value.

Evidence of Trustworthiness

Credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability were maintained throughout the study to ensure trustworthiness. Participants were specifically selected based on their knowledge of the human trafficking that occurs on Cape Cod through snowball sampling, which is a type of purposive sampling (Griffith, Morris, & Thakar, 2016; Palinkas et al, 2013). Since these interviews were done through email, participants were able to validate their work before submission. Since the findings were authentic, this established credibility. In addition, the use of a case study and the triangulation of data aided in credibility (Yin, 2009).

A detailed account of data collection methods and analysis was provided in Chapters 3 and 4, so that researchers can duplicate the same procedures (Thomas & Magilvy, 2011). This was done to ensure transferability. Since the themes emerged from the data and quotes from participants were similar, this corroborated transferability as well. The consistency throughout the data collected demonstrated dependability (Thomas & Magilvy, 2011). Since interviews were done through email, both the researcher and participants were able to remain neutral. The neutrality maintained for the duration of the data collecting and the consistency in the findings warranted confirmability and dependability.

Results

In this section, results will be presented in the order of the interview question to demonstrate natural progression. These interview questions were derived from the central research question and theoretical framework. The data collected from the participants did correlate with the codes presented in the preliminary codebook. However, there were additional codes that materialized from the data in addition to the preliminary codebook. These data driven codes were direct responses from participants, which supported the connection between the central research question, the theoretical framework, and the interview questions. The coded data progressed into themes, and the relationship between the themes and the theoretical framework will be presented in Chapter 5.

Existence of Human Trafficking

All six participants were asked what they knew about the human trafficking in their area. The responses to these questions varied, which introduced new codes. Three out of the six participants said they learned about the existence of human trafficking in their area due to the implementation of Massachusetts initiatives to combat human trafficking. These initiatives included training, campaigns to raise awareness and educate the public, interagency task forces, and building partnerships between local agencies. Training was an emergent code and the most coded data that appeared through all of the participant's answers. Education and raising awareness were all products of training, so they were made into sub codes. All of these emergent codes uncovered the theme of barriers to implementing policies and services. Table 4 illustrates the frequency of the

most mentioned codes to the least mentioned. The remainder of this section illustrates

why they are the most frequently mentioned codes supported by participant answers and

interpretation of the data.

Table 4.

Frequency Table

Codes	Frequency
Training	40
Partnerships	32
Vulnerable	28
Laws	27
Funding	17
Demand	13
No knowledge	7
Location	6
Prevalent	5
Timing	2
No formal policy	3
Slow moving	1

Since training was an emergent code and the most discussed term, this was a

surprise for the researcher. Initially it was assumed that demand drove human

trafficking. Although demand plays a huge part in human trafficking, lack of training,

education, and awareness are just as detrimental. I also thought funding would be the biggest barrier. However, there are so many churches and people in the community getting together to raise awareness because that is what the concern is. No one is holding fundraisers, just raising awareness. Without training, people, such as law enforcement, would not know how or what to fight if they do not understand the nature of trafficking or realize that it even exists. Additional training on the topic could aid in preventing human trafficking from spreading.

These new initiatives were enacted out of Massachusetts' anti trafficking law. This is corroborated by participant SS1 when she stated she knew human trafficking existed due to the creation of a task force and social service agency that partnered with her organization to address the issue. The organization that participant SS3 works at also partnered with other agencies to provide training and raise awareness in the community. Participant PD2 responded by saying:

> Human trafficking has been a topic of annual police training conducted by the Municipal Police Training Counsel in recent years. Officers have been trained to recognize indicating factors for the possibility of Human Trafficking, particularly in the cases of Drug Exploited Youth, and Commercially Sexually Exploited Children. There have been CSEC cases investigated on Cape Cod.

All of the participants were required to be trained on human trafficking due to the new initiatives enacted out of the new law. Participants also felt strongly about the need for additional training in order to educate those directly or indirectly involved with cases of human trafficking. They each spoke on how law enforcement needed training on how to

identify and separate prostitutes from victims. In addition, social service representatives need training on how to respond and help victims of human trafficking.

Additional items conveyed by other participants were trading sex for drugs. The codes trading sex for drugs and money were sub codes for demand. Demand was uncovered as a theme because it was frequently mentioned throughout the data and a topic that participants were very concerned with. Participant SS2 stated:

> Human trafficking is more prevalent seasonally, when tourists swarm to the Cape for the summer. There are a significant amount of hotels/motels on the Cape. Heroine is also epidemic on Cape Cod so there is significant amount of trafficking in trade for drugs/money.

Participant PD1 echoed the same sentiments in terms of trading sex for drugs by saying, "Prostitution does exist and seems to be more common for those seeking to pay for drugs. On-Line advertising by transient individuals and groups offering prostitution is evident." Participant SS1 said that it was "… suspected that one of our clients was trading sex for alcohol." Participant SS4 knew human trafficking existed but was unclear of its prevalence in her area. Participants confirmed that human trafficking existed due their experience with prevention methods and the substance abuse epidemic occurring causing people to sell themselves to survive.

Drives Human Trafficking

The next question asked participants what they felt drove human trafficking in their region. Most of the responses were a collection of demand, selling sex for drugs and money, the internet, and location. Selling sex for drugs and money were used as sub

codes for demand. Demand was the fifth most coded data, and therefore, one of the

themes revealed. Due to the heroin epidemic on Cape Cod and Massachusetts altogether,

certain populations are selling themselves for drugs. Moreover, there is a huge demand

for sexual services. To promote these services, certain websites have been identified by

the participants as places perpetrators go to look and pay for such services. Furthermore,

Cape Cod is located on the border of Massachusetts which makes it easy for victims to be

smuggled in and out of the state.

In the data, participants acknowledged the demand was great and that is why

johns found any means to traffic victims across the country. To supply the demand,

traffickers forced people against their will into trafficking. This included transferring

victims across borderlines. In addition, victims are forced to sell themselves for drugs

and money in order to survive. Sexual servitude is what consumers desired, and johns

were willing to do anything to give consumers what they want, in exchange for money.

Law enforcement who were usually there at the scene of the crimes could attest to this.

Participant PD1 stated, "money and drugs… Streets sources have given

information, on-line advertisements (Craigs List, Back Page), arrest reports." Participant

SS1 concurred with, "I think the internet and social media makes it very easy for young

people to be exploited." Participant SS2 had a response of, "poverty, tourism, heroin and

other substance use. Actually, it is driven by demand." Participant SS4 said, "demand,

substance abuse, close proximity to Boston, destination location, access with boats."

This is a significant finding because demand plays a large role in the continuity of human

trafficking. Participant SS3 articulated:

Our location is known for vacationing and is a perfect area for pimps to move

children in and out of our area, particularly in the summertime. We are also an

easy access to the 95 corridor and see cases from NY and Boston often.

Cape Cod is a border state that provides easy access to and out of the country. It was

acknowledged by participants in the data that its location has made it easier for traffickers

to transfer victims in and out of the state. It is also a high tourist area where people

usually come to visit during the summer months. People have the opportunity to look at

advertisements online for specific services to feed their demand for sex in exchange for

money. Noted by participant SS3, Cape Cod continues to be an attractive destination for

people to buy sex because vulnerable populations live on Cape Cod, which feeds the

demand. The data did identify that individuals are willing to sell their bodies for drugs or

money. Money is a huge inducement for traffickers to kidnap, coerce, and force victims

into selling themselves, which has created a profitable market. Although demand and

selling sex for drugs were recurring codes, location and internet were also vital in the

growth of human trafficking.

Combatting Human Trafficking

Each participant was asked to discuss their knowledge regarding what

Massachusetts has developed to combat the issue of human trafficking. Many of the

participants discussed the new trainings and partnerships formed. Partnerships was the

second most coded term, which also contributed to the theme of barriers to implementing

policies and services. Without partnerships between law enforcement and social service

agencies, training cannot be effectively performed, and victims will suffer. These new

developments are a derivative of new Massachusetts' laws. Laws were the sixth most

coded data.

Since the new anti-trafficking law was passed, many participants discussed the

importance of the act and all of the brand new initiatives that were a result of it.

Participants SS1 and SS4 cited training, the creation of task forces, and changes in laws

as to what Massachusetts has developed to combat human trafficking. Participants PD1

and PD2 discussed that there have been new changes in law, as wells as, educating the

public to raise awareness. Participant PD2 also provided a link to a website that his

department regularly used for guidance,

http://www.representingmatraffickingvictims.org/. This website is actually a guide for

attorneys who would represent victims of human trafficking in Massachusetts. Most

importantly, the website provides training on how to identify victims, work with

vulnerable populations, and learn about the resources available to victims in

Massachusetts. Participant SS2 supplied the legal citation for the new law, An Act

Relative to the Commercial Exploitation of People, which became the first anti-

trafficking legislation passed in the state of Massachusetts,

http://www.mass.gov/mdaa/docs/legal-updates/humantraffickinglegalupdate.pdf.

Participant SS3 elaborated on the statewide initiatives by discussing the creation of

> … an advisory board and steering committee to address these issues with children
>
> and create protocol around it. We are almost a year into this initiative. We have
>
> also had hundreds of people in this field trained on awareness of this issue and
>
> will continue that process over the next few years… Safe Harbor provisions in the

MA trafficking law defines "sexually exploited child" as: "Any person under the age of 18 who engages, agrees to engage or offers to engage in sexual conduct with another person in return for a fee or in exchange for food, shelter, clothing, education or care." CSEC is child abuse requires that mandated reporters file a report of suspected abuse and neglect (51A) on behalf of child victims of commercial sexual exploitation. No force required. No transportation required.

Training and partnerships were needed in order to help raise awareness for residents who never knew this issue occurred. According to participants, Massachusetts has developed a number of initiatives which enabled neighboring agencies to partner together.

Implementation of Laws and Formal Procedures

Participants were asked to discuss their experience with regards to the implementation of existing laws and procedures in their region. A majority of the social service participants acknowledged they were not directly involved with the implementation of laws. Participant SS2, who represents a social welfare agency, stated, "We have not been involved with the law concerning this issue." This particular sector is more victim focused by providing individuals with relief and referring them for additional services to help them recover. Human trafficking is part of their in-service training, however, they have no procedure in place for survivor mentors yet. Thus, some services are referred to the organizations that have received more training in recovery services. Participant SS3 stated, "our experience is that it has been slow moving and makes its way to various counties over time." This participant and her services have directly dealt with cases of human trafficking. She has partnered with other agencies to

provide training on the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children initiative, and is identified as the go-to agency for victims of abuse. Slow moving was the least most mentioned code, but a term I believe most of the participants would agree with, but did not directly say. Since participants indicated in their responses that there are no formal policies in place on how help victims or the fact that awareness still needs to be raised among the communities, one can conclude that law and procedural implementation has been slow moving, even though the anti-trafficking law was passed back in 2011.

Participant PD1 commented on there only being a few cases of the new human trafficking statue since the new law was passed in 2011. In addition, there are no formal policies on human trafficking in their police departments. Participant PD2 communicated that his department usually contacts the Municipal Police Training Committee to acquire training curriculums. With regards to victim assistance, he cited:

> The … District Court has Victims/Witness Liaisons. The … Police Department has a Domestic Violence Liaison. We partner with numerous care providers in the surrounding community for a variety of supports, depending upon the needs of the individual.

These responses indicated that there has been a lot more education and support services by different organizations because the new law brought forth many initiatives by the state to begin targeting human trafficking. These initiatives were more than Massachusetts had ever done to combat the issue, but it was revealed that more still needs to be done.

Barriers to Law Implementation

Since the social service representatives are not directly involved with

implementing laws, they have not directly experienced any barriers. This finding was

unanimous across all the social service representatives. Participant SS4 simply stated,

"We have yet to face this." They are more involved with servicing victims, and do not

have authority regarding the implementation of laws. However, a certain barrier they

have experienced with regards to service delivery is funding. Funding was a new code

that was revealed numerous times throughout the data by participants. This is clearly

articulated when participant SS3 states, "Funding, collaboration with partner agencies,

lack of policies" is a barrier to law implementation. Participant PD1 stated, "the biggest

challenge is not having the resources to spend the time to do proactive investigations. We

react to situations as they are presented to us."

The state capital of Boston has the resources to create task forces and provide

shelters and recovery services for victims. This is known because these services exist

and were documented in the literature review. Therefore, Cape Cod only has the

capability to react to situations than be proactive. Furthermore, prosecutors are unable to

indict traffickers on charges of human trafficking because there is a lack of funding and

manpower to gather enough evidence to convict them. With regards to safe housing, there

are only domestic violence shelters, homeless shelters, and child abuse centers on Cape

Cod of whom do not cater specifically to the human trafficking population.

Availability of Human Trafficking Training

When participants were asked what training on human trafficking is made

available to them, an overwhelming response supported that training has been made

available to their organizations. Since the implementation of new laws and initiatives,

training on combatting human trafficking and identifying victims has been developed and

is currently being used by the participants. Participants identified a variety of trainings

made available to them in the Cape Cod region. Participant SS2 responded with:

> 5 staff are trained via My Life My Choice on The Commercial Sexual
>
> Exploitation of Children: Understanding and Responding to Victims. For Girls:
>
> LCSW, Intake Coordinator For Boys and Transgendered Youth: LMHC Clinical
>
> Director.

Participant SS3 utilized the same My Life My Choice for training as well. My Life My

Choice is a non-profit organization based out of Boston, Massachusetts, that is comprised

of a staff of survivors working to end the commercial sexual exploitation of children and

empowering youth (My Life My Choice, 2017). Participant SS4 shared that, "various

webinars are offered regularly, as well as, attending conferences where workshops are

offered on the topic." The police departments that have encountered human trafficking

have received in service training on the topic. This is due to the fact that these men

investigate cases of human trafficking, and are usually the first to rescue victims from

their traffickers. The training helps them to identify who are the victims.

Perceptions with Addressing Human Trafficking

Participants were asked to respond to how Massachusetts has addressed the issue

of human trafficking. Although participants acknowledged that Massachusetts has come

a long way from the state they were in before, more still needs to be done.

Participant SS3 acknowledged this when she said:

Various counties have addressed this issue based on the need. Overall, MA is

ahead of the curve especially in Boston where the child exploitation piece has

been functioning for over 10 years. The rest of MA is just getting into this issue.

Other participants focused on how certain initiatives have aided in raising awareness in

the community. Educating people enables them to empathize and not judge; help and not

blame. For example, the law enforcement participants both agreed that Massachusetts

has addressed human trafficking due to the mandatory training they have to receive.

Prior to the anti-trafficking law, there were no policies in place when human trafficking

first appeared.

Participant SS2 noted:

With the help of specific agencies bringing this agenda to light, we are beginning

to recognize that this problem exists, as well as the scale of concern. On the

Cape, a task force is being formed with Cape wide agency involvement. We are at

the very initial stages of recognition in the state, and the beginning of stages of

bringing law enforcement on board.

Participant SS4 said, "I think the state has started to address the issue however, as always,

there can still be more training on recognizing and how to address victims by law

enforcement and the legal system." The responses from participants demonstrate that Massachusetts has begun efforts in combatting human trafficking by providing trainings and raising awareness to the public. However, they also identified the need for additional training, funding, and collaboration.

Improvements Need to be Made

Participants were then asked what improvements they felt needed to be made to effectively combat human trafficking. Identified by participants was the need for more funding, trainings, and harsher punishments against perpetrators. Participant SS4 explained that more training opportunities are needed and organizations need to be made aware of the resources that are available. Participant SS2 proclaimed:

Funding for programing for victims. Specific designated programs on the Cape would be helpful wherein funding is funneled for support for these particular victims. Enforcement of laws, as well as consistent training of law enforcement and regarding the importance of looking at these victims as victims rather than perpetrators of a crime. Criminalize the person(s) creating the tracking issues and anyone associated with supporting their endeavors.

Participant SS3 uttered the same sentiments by stating, "statewide policies, more funding, law enforcement operations actually going out to recover kids, prosecution of offenders, awareness of the issue in the community, additional trainings." Participant PD1 mentioned that in order to combat human trafficking effectively from their end, they need additional resources to investigate cases of suspected human trafficking. These resources will help to pay for the man power to rescue victims and retrieve the evidence needed to

convict the criminals. Participants also acknowledged that additional funding would aid in supplying recovery services and programs for victims.

Populations at Risk

Participants were asked which populations they felt were more at risk of being targeted for human trafficking. People who suffer from drugs, substance abuse, poverty, immigrants, children in the foster system were just a few of the populations identified by participants as vulnerable populations that are constantly being targeted for human trafficking. This coded data, driven by participants, revealed the theme of populations at risk because vulnerable was the third most mentioned term. Learning vulnerable populations were contributing factors to human trafficking supported the information found in the literature review. Since this is a sensitive issue, traffickers are usually the main focus because they are the wrong doers. However, these targeted populations provide an endless supply for the demand. Thus, without the supply, you cannot feed the demand of human trafficking.   One recommendation would be to possibly shift the focus towards making these populations impervious, which would then become an economic issue.

When discussing vulnerable populations, participant SS1 communicated children, domestic violence victims, anyone is at risk of being targeted. Participant SS2 went in depth by stating

Usually vulnerable populations, people living in poverty, people with addiction issues, unmonitored youth, children from homes with abuse, neglect, ectetcetera …Girls who have not reached 18 years of age, who own or have access to a cell

phone, ipad or laptop, want more independence, have ability to be in the

community without adult supervision, feel judged and feel like others don't get

them, want to fit in, want to be "in love", are willing to do whatever it takes to

maintain friendships and/or romantic relationships. People with histories of

trauma: sexual, physical, neglect. Those is foster care. Other risk factors: Loss of

parent, mental health concerns, learning disabilities/cognitive limitations, racism,

sexism, classism. LGBTQ youth are at higher risk.

Participant SS3 commented that, "foster care and kids in state programs are the most

vulnerable and there is no system in place to keep kids from running from programs."

There are many low income families on Cape Cod, as well as, homeless people. They

targeted populations for traffickers to recruit because these populations need money to

survive as identified by the participants. Women are considered vulnerable populations,

and therefore, are victimized and targeted for human trafficking as well. Participant SS4

cited undocumented immigrants would be at risk of being targeted because they are

considered vulnerable populations. Participant PD1 conveyed that, "18-23 year olds who

have little structure as well as female teens who are in dysfunctional environments." At

risk populations such as the homeless, drug addicts, women, children, and individuals

that were previously victimized, feed the supply for the demand of human trafficking.

The predators control these populations either by manipulating victims into believing

their predator is their only form of survival, or instilling fear in them.

When law enforcement can appropriately identify these individuals while

investigating, it can provide the opportunity for services to be rendered to victims, which

in turn, can reduce the amount of people getting trafficked. It is not a cure, but services provided to addicts such as rehab, a shelter for the homeless, and education on human trafficking, can aid in reducing the amount of vulnerable populations made available, and hopefully minimize the amount of trafficking that occurs on Cape Cod. If there is no supply, then hopefully the trafficking and exploitation of humans diminishes.

Services Provided to Victims

Each participant was asked to provide information regarding the services offered to victims by the state. Participants recognized there are various services in place throughout the commonwealth, but they could only provide responses based on the sectors they serve in. Moreover, some of the services needed by victims are not available where they live, so victims are referred out. Participant SS2 explained that:

> Commercial Exploitation of children is fillable with DCF. We are mandated reporters, reports automatically go to DA's office… New mandates and a new 51A form is currently being implemented that specifically asks questions regarding both sexual exploitation and human Trafficking.

Participant SS4 responded with, "advocates, referrals, legal assistance, is my understanding. Advocates would be able to assist him/her to navigate the systems and best meet their needs." Participant PD2 expressed that services available for victims are provided by the Victim Witness department of the District Attorney's Office. The police department aids in rescuing victims, but they do not have the training or the resources to properly help victims to recover.   In fact, many of the responses from participants

included referring victims to services outside of their organization and their area. Except for participant SS3 whose organization helps victims of abuse.

Challenges and Barriers Affecting Service Delivery to Victims

Participants were asked to discuss what challenges they perceive are affecting service delivery to victims. Funding and location were barriers identified by all the participants. Funding is needed in both sectors to effectively service victims. Participant SS2 stated, "lack of funding across the board from law enforcement to victim service programs. Lack of safe housing for victims under 18 or for victims without children." Participant SS3 discussed:

Services not in place, lack of understanding of the issue, having to change the lens of thinking from prostitution to victimization, lack of funding, belief it does not happen in this community, issue of statewide foster and placements-no mechanism to keep kids in placements, no resources for child protection statewide.

Participant PD1 added, "victims are from other areas and may not take advantage of the local services." He is arguing that individuals who have been trafficked or victimized may not be able to trust those that are looking to help them. Thus, victims may not know where to find recovery services or are unaware they even exist.

Although, Massachusetts has launched new initiatives, some of these initiatives are not fully comprehended by those that are supposed to enforce them. Additional education is needed so people understand the issue and realize that it does exist, and

know how to better respond. Furthermore, there are not enough resources to help victims

or protect vulnerable populations from being targeted.

Perception of Government's Understanding of Human Trafficking

The final question revolved around what participants believed their government

understood about human trafficking. Participants eluded to the fact that education on the

issue is still needed. A good understanding about the severity of human trafficking in the

state and how to effectively target it, will have to come from leadership and then filter

down to those on the forefront who encounter victims and johns. Social service

representatives and law enforcement can empathize with what victims endure and realize

they need proper services to help them cope with their trauma. At times it can be difficult

to convey this message to those at the top of the hierarchy. Especially leaders who may

not view human trafficking as a top priority. However, these participants who are

directly involved with rescuing victims have a better understanding of this crime, but

require support from their government.

Participant SS3 communicated:

> That is difficult to say statewide. I know that on the Cape and Islands, there is
>
> much support from the Cape delegation and much support from our partner
>
> agencies, but without the community awareness, it is difficult to effectively assist
>
> with these cases. There is a notion that this does not happen on Cape Cod and
>
> once we overcome that , it may become easier. But right now, it is an uphill
>
> battle.

Participant SS2 agreed that:

> The focus has been on looking at these persons as the perpetrator of the crime, a
> lack of understanding of trauma and survival in these populations. Lack of
> understanding of the victim's relationships to their "captors." Lack of knowledge
> of Biderman's Chart of Coercion as well as the Understanding of Stockholm
> Syndrome and Trauma Bonds. Seems as though it is easier to treat these victims
> as criminals makes their job less complicated.

Participant SS4 stated:

> I am hopeful that although Martha's Vineyard does not see a prevalence of human
> trafficking, that government officials are aware that this does not mean it may not
> be present here, just unreported, and that if assistance is needed from the
> government officials, that they would not hesitate to provide that assistance.

PD1 articulated, "in my 36 years of Law Enforcement there has never been a clearer and
specific focus on human trafficking by law enforcement across the board and beyond."
It is apparent that there is concern from participants that the government has not grasped
the gravity of how fast this crime is spreading and endangering current residents.
Education and training is needed so that both law enforcement and social service sectors
can appropriately help victims and combat human trafficking.

Summary

Through this study, the researcher sought to identify the barriers to implementing
existing laws and social service programs on Cape Cod according to the observations of
law enforcement and social service representatives. The interview questions were

derived from selected theories that were closely related to the central research question.

A case study design was selected because it provided the ability to test and apply the

selected theories to this real life phenomenon of human trafficking. After collecting and

coding the data from participants, it was discovered that lack of training, partnerships,

policies, and funding were all barriers when it comes to combatting human trafficking on

Cape Cod. In addition, demand drove human trafficking, and vulnerable populations

were more at risk for being targeted because they supply the demand. This coded data

connected to the 3 themes identified in the final codebook which were barriers to

implementing policies and services, populations at risk, and demand. These themes

correlated with the theoretical framework. In the next chapter, I will present an

explanation of the findings with relation to the theoretical framework, along with

recommendations for future research.

Chapter 5: Discussion, Conclusions, and Recommendations

Introduction

Human trafficking is a worldwide phenomenon where human beings are captured, tortured, and sold. This research was intended to uncover the obstacles to applying laws and programs on Cape Cod as observed by social service representatives and law enforcement officials. Since this crime has spread, there is a need to identify hurdles that prevent victims from being served and protected, and traffickers from being prosecuted to the fullest extent of the law. Open ended interview questions were submitted to individuals by email. This method of data collection ensured trustworthiness, since participants were responsible for writing their own answers.

After analyzing and coding the data, key findings showed that the obstacles were lack of training, partnerships, funding, and vulnerable populations that feed the demand for trafficking in persons. The themes identified correlate with the theoretical framework and provide answers to the research study. These themes are barriers to implementing policies and services, populations at risk, and demand.

Interpretation of key findings and its relation to the theoretical framework will be explained in this chapter. Furthermore, a discussion on the study limitations, recommendations, and implications will be presented.

Interpretation of the Findings

This section will interpret the findings. The themes that emerged from the coded data appropriately relate to the theoretical formwork selected for this research study. I will explain how the theories of Kingdon, Marxist and demand, and victimology,

correspond with the identified themes of barriers to implementing policies and services, populations at risk, and demand. These themes are presented in the order of frequency.

Theme: Barriers to Implementing Policy and Services

The purpose of this study was to identify the barriers to implementing existing policies and services targeting human trafficking according to social service representatives and law enforcement. There were specific barriers to implementing policy and services that were unanimously identified by the participants. Participants discussed the need for policies to be put into place and for laws to be enforced to stop the spread of human trafficking. In addition, partnerships were mentioned so that the social service and law enforcement sectors could collaborate on trainings and build task forces. Education and raising awareness were sub codes for the single most mentioned code of training. Trainings were first introduced to participants as part of the initiatives derived from the Act Relative to the Commercial Exploitation of People in Massachusetts. These trainings were vital in the prevention of human trafficking according to participants.

Due to the magnitude of human trafficking and its growth over the years, it has become a top priority for Massachusetts to tackle. The creation of a task force on Cape Cod was initiated and training was made available to law enforcement. Education was needed so that law enforcement and prosecutors could understand the law, and know how to proceed with targeting and convicting traffickers. Overall awareness was needed throughout the communities so that all residents of Cape Cod could feel empowered to be mandated reporters if they suspect human trafficking is occurring. The trainings were

needed so that law enforcement officials could better comprehend what human trafficking is versus prostitution, and stop treating victims as criminals.

This response from Massachusetts correlates with Kingdon's multiple streams theory. Multiple streams theory encouraged policy makers to think beyond traditional policy making methods so that when pressing issues arise, there is an urgency to move certain policies to the top of their political agenda (Kingdon, 1984). Multiple streams theory consists of the problem, policy, and political streams. With regards to Massachusetts, human trafficking is the problem stream, policy implementation and trainings is the policy stream, and the creation of An Act Relative to the Commercial Exploitation of People in Massachusetts is the political stream. At first Massachusetts political officials were unaware this crime existed in their state. Due to the lack of awareness, they did not meet the minimum standards for targeting human trafficking according to the United Nations (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2014). When they realized human trafficking was a threat, this is when officials progressed to meet and exceed the minimum standards.

An Act Relative to the Commercial Exploitation of People, Chapter 178 being signed into law in 2011, was a crucial step for Massachusetts in combating human trafficking. The Act introduced human trafficking to people who may not have known that it existed. It also ignited a lot of initiatives such as law enforcement training in order to understand the nature of human trafficking and decipher between prostitution and human trafficking. Under this bill, law enforcement has the authority to investigate cases of human trafficking. This put pressure on johns because they could now be arrested for

breaking the law because it was now a felony to commercially exploit people. In addition, recovery services were now made available to victims (Government of Massachusetts, 2011). Out of this bill interagency task forces were created, as well as, those that are mandated reporters were now compelled to report the crimes. All the participants interviewed are mandated reporters, and have had to report suspected crimes to the proper authorities for investigation.

The findings from this study extended knowledge in this discipline because research with regards to human trafficking on Cape Cod has yet to be conducted since An Act Relative to the Commercial Exploitation of People was passed in 2011. Participants indicated there were no formal policies and procedures in place to target human trafficking, which caused them to react to situations or refer services outside of their jurisdiction. The act was passed in response to the human trafficking that had already occurred, and not to prevent it. There were many initiatives unveiled as a result of the law, but participant answers reflected the need for more training. Thus, understanding the hurdles to implementing policies and services can help guide political leaders on where to allocate their resources and identify next steps. In addition, this study provides the opportunity to assess current methods and make future recommendations to effectively target human trafficking.

Theme: Populations at Risk

Human trafficking does not discriminate. Regardless of race, age, education, and socio-economic status, anyone is a target and can be forced against their will into prostituion. Traffickers tailor their methods when it comes to recruiting victims.

However, traffickers do target specific populations because they are perceived as being easily manipulated (Butler, 2014). The theory of victimology discussed populations that are more at risk than others. Victimology is when an individual is endangered, mistreated, or exploited by their offender (Sebba & Berenblum, 2014). Participant answers identified what populations were more at risk for being targeted for human trafficking.

These populations included runaways or children in the system, whom easily gets lured by traffickers by enticing them with money and a certain lifestyle. Other populations are undocumented immigrants who were in fear of being deported back to their country. They were then tricked into human trafficking by promises of a better life or employment. Once the victims were engrossed in this life, traffickers brainwashed them and isolated them to keep them from leaving (Butler, 2014). Additional targeted populations consist of low-income families and homeless people who need the money to survive. Women are also considered a vulnerable population, and therefore, are victimized and targeted for human trafficking (Todres, 2011). Other populations continue to be at risk due to geography and monetary purposes.

These vulnerable populations are also targeted because they are addicted to drugs, as mentioned by some of the participants. Those that suffer from drug addiction tend to sell sex for drugs. Perpetrators are aware of this and use drugs to coerce individuals into trafficking. This continues the ongoing cycle of trafficking because johns use drugs to keep their victims. Victims are not stable enough to leave on their own and are dependent on drugs and their manipulative owners. Therefore, victims are worked

tirelessly providing sex against their will in hidden markets such as brothels, which keeps them victimized.

Theme: Demand

Demand was a theme identified when participants were asked what they felt drove human trafficking on Cape Cod. The issue of demand has been a huge contributing factor to the growth of human trafficking. When demand increases, it creates a need for more victims. Demand theory demonstrated the relationship between the demand for goods by the consumer, and the cost for those goods (Riley, 2012).

Demand theory coincides with the demand that drives human trafficking on Cape Cod. There is a need for sex by consumers, and they are willing to pay for it. Cape Cod is a huge tourist attraction where people fly from all over the world to visit. These large crowds are breeding grounds for sex trafficking. As the demand increases, traffickers will continue to find victims and sell them to the highest bidder. Traffickers use the internet to sell their victims because there are specific websites where they can advertise trading people for money. According to recent data obtained from the human trafficking division out of Attorney General, Maura Healey's office:

> There are over 9,000 searches for sex-buying opportunities in Boston each day, with an average of 20,000 ads for paid sex posted monthly in Greater Boston, according to figures provided by Healey's office. Each ad gets an average of 52 unique responses and the peak time that people in Boston search online to buy sex is 2 p.m. (Lannan, 2016).

The perpetrators that feed the supply demanded by consumers continuously exploit victims. The data showed that human trafficking continues to exist on Cape Cod due to the demand. In a radio interview conducted by Boston Public Radio, Attorney General Healey conveyed:

> …Her main concern is stopping the demand, which she says will stop the flow of human trafficking into Mass. This market only exists because there's a demand for it," she said. Buyers, we're going to hold you accountable too. We're going to take names, we're going to take numbers, we are going to hold you accountable (Bedford 2016).

The vulnerable populations that are targeted, controlled, and sold fuels the demand. The profit margin is so large that it makes perpetrators continue to commit these crimes. It was agreed by the participants that as long as the demand is there and vulnerable populations are readily available, human trafficking will continue to exist not only on Cape Cod, but everywhere.

The exploitation of these victims illustrated Marxist theory. In order to supply a market that is willing to pay for sex, johns exploit vulnerable populations. Victims are treated as property, and johns sell them for money. Marxist theory dealt with the notion that people are motivated by material goods and the property they own (Marx, 1977). Marxist theory also believed in people getting paid for all the work they do. These victims are forced to perform sexual services numerous times without pay and without their freedom (Marx, 1972). Capitalists, at the expense of another human being's life,

take wealth and power away from these victims by using them to service their own personal need.

Limitations of the Study

This research was ultimately limited due to the unwillingness of individuals to participate. Those that did participate, were limited in how much they could disclose because they represent the Commonwealth. Primarily law enforcement officials could not provide specific information about ongoing human trafficking cases in Massachusetts or give an accurate depiction of how they feel regarding the lack of policies and programs. There were no concerns with regards to confidentiality because people were willing to help due to the severity of this issue. Although efforts were made to contact the western and eastern parts of the Cape Cod region, many were hesitant in participating because they did not feel they could add value to my research. This was based on their opinion that they do not experience much human trafficking in their specific area.

In addition, churches were not contacted to participate in this research, yet they are the social organizations that usually arrange meetings to help raise awareness about human trafficking. Victims may also feel comfortable going to church viewing it as a safe haven. Research done in the future could benefit from contacting religious organizations because they may be the first point of contact for victims.

Lastly, since the beginning of my study, authors have added new knowledge and research to existing theories. One theory in particular was Kingdon's multiple streams theory. According to authors Howlett, Mcconnell, and Perl (2014), there is an opportunity of having more than 3 streams, and rather 5 streams. The additional 2

streams, process and programme, would dive deeper into how policies are established and analyzing the sequence of the streams (Howlett, Mcconnell, & Perl, 2014). This potential 5 stream process can be studied for future research and its application to the policy decision and making process. I did not dive into these additional streams because the authors even acknowledged the limitations of this model due to the complexity of adding 2 more streams to a 3 stream process that has been functioning on its own for decades (Howlett, Mcconnell, & Perl, 2014). There is also no evidence that the 5 streams would result in the formation of new policy.

Recommendations

This qualitative case study was designed to understand what impediments prevent current programs and policies from being executed on Cape Cod. This type of research is capable of being repeated in other communities. Particularly communities where funding and manpower is not accessible. Communities that may not have the resources available to target this crime can begin to develop ways on how to overcome barriers utilizing this research.

The results of this study were able to fill in gaps in knowledge regarding human trafficking on Cape Cod. However, it is recommended for future research to include participants from local churches and schools as well. Schools especially should be contacted since the targeted populations identified by the research participants were school-aged individuals. An additional perspective would be to speak with victims in order to fully understand the services they require to begin the path to recovery.

Implications

This study has many implications for social change. Understanding human trafficking more in depth allows people to fight more for the freedoms and human rights of victims/survivors. This research is capable of raising awareness that human trafficking does exist and can easily occur in the places most would not think it would. Cape Cod is an expensive place to live, and even Presidents have visited this specific location for vacations. However, as expensive as it is, it has created homeless communities due to the inability to afford the cost of living. These homeless communities are part of a vulnerable population that is targeted because it fuels the demand for human trafficking.

Additional vulnerable populations that require help are those suffering from substance abuse. It was acknowledged that there is an opioid crisis in Massachusetts that is also contributing to the vulnerable populations that are at risk of being trafficked. Rehabilitation and educational services are recommended so that the number of at risk populations can be reduced, thus, unable to feed the supply. Any opportunity to save a life from drug or physical abuse is an act of social change.

Three themes emerged from this study: barriers to implementing policy and services, populations at risk, and demand. These themes can help bring to light additional efforts that need to be made by the state of Massachusetts to effectively target human trafficking as observed by the social service representatives and law enforcement who come in contact with these cases the most. It is recommended that campaigns to raise awareness continue to increase, as well as training. Social service providers should work together with police departments to provide additional training on how to identify

prostitutes as victims and not criminals. These collaborations only increase the number of people working together to obliterate human trafficking. Furthermore, as barriers to program and service implementation are identified, changes to policy or new policies can be created, which could possibly generate funding for the change, and could develop programs for victims.

Conclusion

Human trafficking is a global crisis and has spread rampantly across Massachusetts. Now that most governments are aware of this issue, they are taking vital steps to target the crime and eradicate it. According to participants, Massachusetts has come a long way with regards to combatting human trafficking, but much more still needs to be done. In the beginning, Massachusetts did not even recognize human trafficking as a problem in their state. When they became aware of the crime due to its prevalence, that is when the state embarked on coordinating initiatives, including the creation of interagency task forces to keep the crime from growing. I then embarked on this research study and was able to build a theoretical framework that aided in explaining the barriers to implementing these initiatives targeting human trafficking on Cape Cod, as perceived by social service representatives and law enforcement officials. Data collected from this qualitative case study corresponded with the selected theories discussed in the literature review, which were Kingdon's multiple streams theory (1984) and the implementation of laws, victimology, as presented by Mendelsohn (1956) which identified the populations being targeted for human trafficking, and Marxist/demand theory, which drives human trafficking.

Data obtained from providers who work with participants who were ensnared in the crime provided rich information that those at the government level may not be aware of. These social welfare providers and law enforcement officials identified some of the obstacles faced when combating human trafficking on Cape Cod. Some of these obstacles included lack of training and partnerships for residents and law enforcement, so they can learn to separate human trafficking from prostitution, and be more proactive in investigating cases and arresting traffickers. Funding was also identified which prevented services from being delivered to victims. Another obstacle was the need to identify the vulnerable populations and provide services for them so they do not become a target. If these targeted populations are not helped, they will continue to fuel the supply for the demand by customers.

The data from this study was collected in 2016 before President Trump's inaguration in 2017. In the new administration, new polices have been executed, including the President's executive order on travel bans, and how it has impacted on immigration. Future research could be done on the effects these new policies have on human trafficking. This study can have tremendous impact on social change and public policy. Findings from this study can aid in changing the lens of how people view prostitution versus human trafficking. The literature and data from this study can cause Massachusetts residents and others to get more involved in combatting this crime by becoming activists and invoke change by reaching out to politicians and representatives to create better policies. By getting involved and understanding the process, people can

now begin to hold each other and those enforcing the law accountable for their parts in

eradicating human trafficking.

References

Abadinsky, H. (2013). *Organized crime* (10th ed.). Belmont, CA: Cengage Learning.

Abrams, L. S. (2010). Sampling 'Hard to Reach' populations in qualitative research: The case of incarcerated youth. *Qualitative Social Work, 9*(4), 536-550. doi:10.1177/1473325010367821

Ackrill, R. & Kay, A. (2011). Multiple streams in EU policy-making: The case of the 2005 sugar reform. *Journal of European Public Policy 18*(1)*,* 72-89.doi: 10.1080/13501763.2011.520879

Administration for Children and Families. (2013). Human trafficking fact sheet. Retrieved from http://archive.acf.hhs.gov/trafficking/about/TVPA_2000.pdf

Agustin, L. (2007). *Sex at the margins: Migration, labour markets and the rescue industry.* New York, NY: Zed Books Ltd.

Alvarez, M. B. & Alessi, E. J. (2012). Human trafficking is more than sex trafficking and prostitution implications for social work. *Affilia, 27*(2), 142-152. doi: 10.1177/0886109912443763

Anderson, J. E. (2014). *Public policymaking.* Boston, MA: Cengage Learning.

Bales, K. (2005). *Understanding global slavery.* Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press

Ball, A. D. & Pennington, J. R. (2011). Book review: Sex trafficking: Inside the business of modern slavery. *Journal of Macromarketing, 31*(4), 410-411.doi: 10.1177/0276146711414711

Bampton, R & Cowton, C. J. (2002). The e-interview. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, *3*(2), Art. 9. Retrieved from http://nbn-resolving.de/urn:nbn:de:0114-fqs020295.

Bassiouni, M. C. (2014). *International extradition: United States law and practice*. United Kingdom: Oxford University Press. http://scholarcommons.usf.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1002&context=oa_textbooks

Bazeley, P. & Jackson, K. (Eds.). (2013). *Qualitative data analysis with NVivo*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications Limited.

Beall, J. A. (1998). Are we only burning witches? The Antiterrorism and Effective Death Penalty Act of 1996's answer to terrorism. *Indiana Law Journal*, *73*(2). Retrieved from http://www.repository.law.indiana.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1933&context=ilj

Bedford, T. (2016). AG Healey: Sex Trafficking Is A Growing Problem In Mass. Retrieved from http://news.wgbh.org/2016/12/20/boston-public-radio-podcast/ag-healey-sex-trafficking-growing-problem-mass

Benaquisto, L. (2008). *Open coding.* In Given, L.M. *The sage encyclopedia of qualitative methods, vol 2.* doi: 10.4135/9781412963909

Berg, M. T., Stewart, E. A., Schreck, C. J., & Simons, R. L. (2012). The victim-offender overlap in context: Examining the role of neighborhood street culture. *Criminology*, *50*(2), 359-390.doi: 10.1111/j.1745-9125.2011.00265.x

Bergin, M. (2011). NVivo 8 and consistency in data analysis: reflecting on the use of

a qualitative data analysis program. *Nurse Researcher*, *18*(3), 6-12. Retrieved

from http://www.qdatraining.eu/publications/Michael_Bergin-

Berlin, I. (2013). *Karl Marx* (5th ed.). Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Bhattacherjee, A. (2012). Social Science Research: Principles, methods, and practices

(2nd ed.). *USF Tampa Bay Open Access Textbooks Collection.* Book 3. pp. 1-

142. Retrieved from http://scholarcommons.usf.edu/oa_textbooks/3

Birks, M. & Mills, J. (2011). *Grounded theory: A practical guide*. Thousand Oaks, CA:

Sage publications.

Bloomberg, L. D. & Volpe, M. (2012). *Completing your qualitative dissertation: A road

map from beginning to end*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Borrás, S. & C. M. Radaelli. (2011). The politics of governance architectures: creation,

change and effects of the EU Lisbon Strategy. *Journal of European Public

Policy, 18*(4), 463-484.doi: 10.1080/13501763.2011.560069

Bradley, Jr., R. L. & Donway, R. (2010). Capitalism, socialism, and "The middle way":

A taxonomy. *The Independent Review, 15*(1), 71-87. Retrieved from

http://www.independent.org/pdf/tir/tir_15_01_5_bradley.pdf

Braithwaite, J. (2011). In search of restorative jurisprudence. In M. Tonry (Eds.), *Why

punish? How much? A reader on punishment* (pp. 337-352). New York, NY:

Oxford University Press.

Brown, G. (2011). Women and children last: The prosecution of sex traffickers as sex

offenders and the need for a sex trafficker registry. *Boston College Third World*

Journal, 31(1). Retrieved from

http://lawdigitalcommons.bc.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1001&context=twlj

Bruckert, C & Parent, C. (2002). Trafficking in human beings and organized crime: A

literature review. *Community, Contract and Aboriginal Policing Services*

Directorate. Retrieved from

http://dspace.cigilibrary.org/jspui/bitstream/123456789/22297/1/Trafficking%20I

n%20Human%20Beings%20and%20Organized%20Crime%20A%20Literature%

20Review.pdf?1

Brutus, S., Aguinis, H., & Wassmer, U. (2013). Self-reported limitations and future

directions in scholarly reports analysis and recommendations. *Journal of*

Management, *39*(1), 48-75.doi: 10.1177/0149206312455245

Bryman, A. (2004). Member Validation and Check. In Michael S. Lewis-Beck, Alan

Bryman & Tim Futing Liao (Eds.), *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Social Science*

Research Methods. doi http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781412950589

Burawoy, M. & Wright, E. O. (2003). Socialism and Marxism. In J. Turner (Eds.),

Handbook of Sociological Theory (pp 459-484). New York, NY: Plenum

Publishers.

Burgess, A. W., Regehr, C., & Roberts, A. R. (2010). *Victimology: Theories and*

applications. Sudbury, MA: Jones and Bartlett Publishers

Burke, F. (2015). Innovations in the Fight against Human Trafficking: Advocates'

Perspectives and Proposals. *NYL Sch. L. Rev.*, *60*, 615.

Burns, E. (2010). Developing email interview practices in qualitative research.

Sociological Research Online, 15(4), 8. Retrieved from

http://www.socresonline.org.uk/15/4/8.html>

10.5153/sro.2232

Busch-Armendariz, N. B., Nsonwu, M. B., Heffron, L. C., Hernandez, M., & Garza, J.

(2009). A research study on human trafficking victims: Survivors speak out about

long-term needs. Retrieved from

http://www.utexas.edu/ssw/dl/files/cswr/institutes/idvsa/publications/survivorsspe

akout.pdf

Bush, G. W. (2005). Inaugural address, January 20, 2005.*Public Papers of the

Presidents of the United States: George W. Bush, 2005 (In Two Books), Book I—

January 1 to June 30*.

Butler, C. N. (2014). Kids for Sale: Does America Recognize Its Own Sexually Exploited

Minors as Victims of Human Trafficking. *Seton Hall L. Rev.*, *44*, 833.

Cachia, M. & Millward, L. (2011). The telephone medium and semi-structured

interviews: A complementary fit. *Qualitative Research in Organizations and

Management: An International Journal*, *6*(9), Iss: 3, 65 - 277.

doi10.1108/17465641111188420

Callinicos, A. (2012). *The revolutionary ideas of Karl Marx* (2nd ed.). Chicago, IL:

Haymarket Books.

Chakraborti, A. (2014). Alien human-trafficking victims in the United States:

Examining the constitutionality of the TVPA and INA's assistance

requirements.. *University of Pennsylvania Journal of Law and Social Change*, *17*, 55-55. Retrieved from

http://scholarship.law.upenn.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1164&context=jlasc

Chenail, R. J. (2011). Interviewing the investigator: Strategies for addressing instrumentation and researcher bias concerns in qualitative research. *Qualitative Report*, *16*(1), 255-262.Retrieved from

http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/WQR/interviewing.pdf

Chuang, J. A. (2010). Rescuing trafficking from ideological capture: Prostitution reform and anti-trafficking law and policy. *University of Pennsylvania Law Review*, 1655-1728. Retrieved from https://www.law.upenn.edu/live/files/27-chuang158upalrev16552010pdf

Clawson, H. J., Dutch, N., Solomon, A., &Grace, L. G. (2009). Human trafficking into and within the United States: A Review of the Literature. *U.S. Department of Health and Human Services.* Retrieved from

http://aspe.hhs.gov/hsp/07/humantrafficking/litrev/

Clawson, H. J., Salomon, A., & Grace, L. G. (2008). Treating the hidden wounds: Trauma treatment and mental health recovery for victims of human trafficking. *U.S. Department of Health and Human Services* Retrieved from

http://aspe.hhs.gov/hsp/07/humantrafficking/Treating/ib.htm

Coakley, M. (2013). Fight human sex trafficking. *Worcester Telegram & Gazette.* Retrieved from

http://www.telegram.com/article/20130117/NEWS/101179850/1020

Contreras, P. M., Kallivayalil, D., & Herman, J. L. (2017). Psychotherapy in the

    Aftermath of Human Trafficking: Working Through the Consequences of

    Psychological Coercion. *Women & Therapy*, *40*(1-2), 31-54.

    doi: 10.1080/02703149.2016.1205908

Cornell University Law School. (2013). Interagency Task Force to monitor and combat human

    trafficking. Retrieved from http://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/text/22/7103

Crane, A. (2013). Modern slavery as a management practice: Exploring the conditions

    and capabilities for human exploitation. *Academy of Management Review*, *38*(1),

    49-69.doi:10.5465/amr.2011.0145

Crane, P. A. & Moreno, M. (2011). Human trafficking: What is the role of the health

    care provider? *Journal of Applied Research on Children: Informing Policy for*

    Children at Risk 2(1). Retrieved from

    http://digitalcommons.library.tmc.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1033&context

    =childrenatrisk

Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five*

    approaches (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications

Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five*

    approaches (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Creswell, J. W., Hanson, W. E., Clark Plano, V. L., & Morales, A. (2007). Qualitative Research Designs: Selection and Implementation. *The Counseling Psychologists, 35*(2), 236-264.doi: 10.1177/0011000006287390

Crouch, M. & McKenzie, H. (2006). The logic of small samples in interview-based qualitative research. *Social Science Information, 45*(4), 483-499.doi: 10.1177/0539018406069584

Danailova-Trainor, G. & Belser, P. (2006). *Globalization and the illicit market for human trafficking: an empirical analysis of supply and demand*. International Labour Office Geneva.

Delport, C. S. L. & Roestenburg, W. J. H. (2011). Quantitative data-collection methods: questionnaires, checklists, structured observation and structured interview schedules. *Research at grassroots for the social sciences and human service professions* (4th ed). Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Dess, M. (2013). Walking the freedom trail: An analysis of the Massachusetts human trafficking statute and its potential to combat child sex trafficking. *Boston College Journal of Law & Social Justice*, *33*, 147. Retrieved from http://lawdigitalcommons.bc.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1030&context=jlsj

DiCicco-Bloom, B. & Crabtree, B. F. (2006). The qualitative research interview. *Medical Education*. Vol. 40, pp. 314-321. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2929.2006.02418.x

Diebel, A. E. (2008). Neutrality in qualitative research. In Alice E. Diebel (Eds.), *The Sage Encyclopedia of qualitative research methods* Vol. 2. doi.org/10.4135/9781412963909

Doerner, W. G. & Lab, S. P. (2012). *Victimology* (6th ed.). Burlington, MA: Anderson Publishing

Drost, E. A. (2011). Validity and reliability in social science research. *Education, Research and Perspectives, 38*(1), 105.

Dussich, J. P. J. (2006). Victimology - Past, present and future. *National Criminal Justice Reference Service*, No. 70, pp. 116-129. Retrieved from http://www.unafei.or.jp/english/pdf/RS_No70/No70_12VE_Dussich.pdf

Dussich, J. P. (2014). Teaching victimology in America: From on the job training (OJT) to PHD. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, (ahead-of-print), 1-15.doi: 10.1080/10511253.2014.967508

Farr, K. (2005). *Sex Trafficking: The global market in women and children* (1st ed.). New York: Worth Publishers.

Farrell, A. (2012). Improving law enforcement identification and response to human trafficking. In J. Winterdyk, B. Perrin, & P. Reichel (Eds.), *Human trafficking: Exploring the international nature, concerns, and complexities* (pp. 181-206). Boca Raton, FL: Taylor and Francis Group.

Federal Strategic Action Plan on Services for Victims of Human Trafficking in the United States 2013-2017. (2014). Retrieved from http://www.ovc.gov/pubs/FederalHumanTraffickingStrategicPlan.pdf

Federman, C. (2010). Habeas Corpus in the Age of Guantanamo. *Annals Fac. L.*

    Belgrade Belgrade L. Rev., 215.

Fedina, L. (2014). Use and misuse of research in books on sex trafficking:

    Implications for interdisciplinary researchers, practitioners, and advocates.

    *Trauma Violence Abuse.*doi: 10.1177/1524838014523337

Fight Slavery Now. (2010). Begging and peddling operations. Retrieved from

    http://fightslaverynow.org/why-fight-there-are-27-million-

    reasons/otherformsoftrafficking/begging-and-peddling-operations/

Fong, R. & Berger Cardoso, J. (2010). Child human trafficking victims: Challenges for

    the child welfare system. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, *33*(3), 311-316.doi:

    10.1016/j.evalprogplan.2009.06.018

Fordyce, E. M. (2012). Identifying the unknown: Challenges and solutions to US human

    trafficking investigations. *PublicINReview*, *1*(1), 23-32. Retrieved from

    https://journals.iupui.edu/index.php/spea/article/view/3818/3759

Fuchs, C. (2012). Capitalism or information society? The fundamental question of the

    present structure of society. *European Journal of Social Theory, 16*(4), 413-434.

    doi:10.1177/1368431012461432

Gallagher, A. T. (2011). Improving the effectiveness of the international law of human

    trafficking: A vision for the future of the US Trafficking in Persons reports.

    Human Rights Review, *12*(3), 381-400. Retrieved from

    http://works.bepress.com/anne_gallagher/16

Garkawe, S. (2004). Revisiting the scope of victimology – How broad a discipline

should it be? *International Review of Victimology, 11*(2-3), 275-294.doi:

10.1177/026975800401100205

Gauchat, G. (2012). Politicization of science in the public sphere a study of public trust

in the United States, 1974 to 2010. *American Sociological Review,77*(2), 167-187.

doi: 10.1177/0003122412438225

George, C. (2012). Jailing the johns--The issue of demand in human sex trafficking.

Florida Coastal Law Review, 13, 293-347. Retrieved from

http://works.bepress.com/cheryl_george/5

Giang University. (2009). A quantitative analysis on human trafficking: The case of

an Giang province. Retrieved fromhttp://www.no-

trafficking.org/reports_docs/estimates/uniap_agu_estimates_report_vn.pdf

Given, L. M. & Saumure, K. (2008). Data Saturation. In Alice E. Diebel (Eds.), *The*

Sage Encyclopedia of qualitative research methods Vol. 2.

doi.org/10.4135/9781412963909

Given, L. M. & Saumure, K. (2008). Trustworthiness. In Alice E. Diebel (Eds.), *The*

Sage Encyclopedia of qualitative research methods Vol. 2.

doi.org/10.4135/9781412963909

Gläser, J. & Laudel, G. (2013). Life with and without coding: Two methods for early-

stage data analysis in qualitative research aiming at causal explanations. *Forum:*

Qualitative Social Research,14(2), Art. 5. Retrieved from http://nbn-

resolving.de/urn:nbn:de:0114-fqs130254.

Global issues: Responses to human trafficking. (2003). *Journal of the U.S. Department of State,* 8(2). Retrieved from

http://photos.state.gov/libraries/korea/49271/dwoa_120909/ijge0603.pdf

Goździak, E. M. & Bump, M. N. (2008). Data and research on human trafficking: Bibliography of research-based literature. *Institute for the Study of International Migration.* pp. 4 – 47. Retrieved from

https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/224392.pdf

Goździak, E. M. &Collett, E. A. (2005). Research on human trafficking in North America: A Review of Literature. *Institute for the Study of International Migration, 43*(1-2), 99-129. doi: 10.1111/j.0020-7985.2005.00314.x

Greenbank, P. (2003). The role of values in educational research: The case for reflexivity. *British Educational Research Journal, 29*(6), 791-801. doi: 10.1080/0141192032000137303

Greene, N. L. &Beinhart, E. (2013). Combating human trafficking-The US Government's response: A panel and a perspective on counter-trafficking in persons. *ISLA Journal of International & Comparative Law, 20*, 49-195

Griffith, D. A., Morris, E. S., & Thakar, V. (2016). Spatial Autocorrelation and Qualitative Sampling: The Case of Snowball Type Sampling Designs. *Annals of the American Association of Geographers*, *1(15)*, 773-787

Guenin, L. M. (2005). Intellectual honesty. *Springer, 145,* Iss.2, pp 177-232.doi: 10.1007/s11229-005-3746-3

Guest, G., Bunce, A., Johnson, L. (2006). How many interviews are enough? An

experiment with data saturation and variability. *Field Methods, 18*(1), 59-82. doi

10.1177/1525822X05279903

Hall, J. (2013). Introduction In *Children's human rights and public schooling in the

United States* (pp. 1-16). Boston, MA: Sense Publishers

Helton, M. (2016). Human Trafficking: How a Joint Task Force between Health Care

Providers and Law Enforcement Can Assist with Identifying Victims and

Prosecuting Traffickers. *Health Matrix*, *26*, 433.

Houghton, C., Casey, D., Shaw, D., & Murphy, K. (2013). Rigour in qualitative case-

study research. *Nurse researcher*, *20*(4), 12

17.doi.org/10.7748/nr2013.03.20.4.12.e326

Howlett, M., Mcconnell, A., & Perl, A. (2014). Streams and stages: Reconciling

Kingdon and Policy Process Theory. *European Journal of Political Research, 54*,

419-434. doi: 10.1111/1475-6765.12064

Hunt, S. (2013). Deconstructing demand: The driving force of sex trafficking. Brown

Journal of World Affairs,19(2). Retrieved from

http://www.demandabolition.org/wp-

content/uploads/2013/07/brown_journal_6_2013.pdf

International Labour Organization. (2012). 21 million people are now victims of forced

labour, ILO says. Retrieved from http://www.ilo.org/global/about- the-

ilo/newsroom/news/WCMS_181961/lang--en/index.htm

Jacobsen, C. M. &Skilbrei, M. (2010). 'Reproachable victims'? Representations and

    self-representations of Russian women involved in transnational prostitution.

    Journal of Anthropology, 75(2). doi:10.1080/00141841003764013

Jakobi, A. (2012). Human trafficking. In *G. Ritzer (ed.). Blackwell encyclopedia of*

    globalization, 953-956. doi: 10.1002/9780470670590

James, N. (2007). The use of email interviewing as a qualitative method of inquiry in

    educational research. *British Educational Research Journal, 33*(6), 963-976.doi:

    10.1080/01411920701657074

Johnson, A. (2014). Ohioans selling sex with their own kids. *The Columbus Dispatch.*

    Retrieved from http://www.dispatch.com/content/stories/local/2014/07/10/child-

    trafficking-study.html

Kara, S.(2011). Supply and demand: Human trafficking in the global economy. *Harvard*

    International Review, *33*(2), 66. New York, NY: Columbia University Press

Karmen, A. (2012). *Crime victims: An introduction to victimology* (8th ed.). Belmont,

    CA: Cengage Learning

Keith, D. (2013). Human trafficking victims share their stories with Fox 26 News. *My*

    Fox Houston Retrieved from

    http://www.myfoxhouston.com/story/23672987/2013/10/11/human-trafficking-

    victims-share-their-stories-with-fox-26-news

Khurana, A. & Rosenthal, S. R. (2003). Towards holistic "Front Ends" in new product

    development. *Journal of Product Innovation, 15*(1), 57-74.doi: 10.1111/1540-

    5885.1510057

Kingdon, J. W. (1984). *Agendas, Alternatives, and Public Policies*. London, England: Longman Classics.

Kleemans, E. R. (2011). Expanding the domain of human trafficking research: introduction to the special issue on human trafficking. *Trends in Organized Crime*, *14*(2), 95-99.doi:10.1007/s12117-011-9139-8

Kloer, A. (2011). Coalition launches campaign for National Human Trafficking Awareness Day. Retrieved from https://www.change.org/p/tell-the-president-congress-to-protect-funding-extend-critical-anti-trafficking-legislation/u/4e8662f3e82eb76536000e94

Kotrla, K. (2010). Domestic minor sex trafficking in the United States. *Social work*, *55*(2), 181-187.doi: 10.1093/sw/55.2.181

Kyle, D. & Koslowski, R. (2011). *Global human smuggling: Comparative perspectives* (2ⁿᵈed). Baltimore, MD: The John Hopkins University Press.

Lanier, M. & Henry, S. (2010). *Essential Criminology* (3ʳᵈed). New York, NY: Westview Publishers.

Lannan, K. (2016). AG Healey: Target demand to counter trafficking, sex rings. *Telegrm.com*. Retrieved from http://www.telegram.com/news/20161221/ag-healey-target-demand-to-counter-trafficking-sex-rings

Lincoln, Y.S. & Guba, E.G. (1985). Naturalistic Inquiry. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.

Logan, T. K., Walker, R. & Hunt, G. (2009). Understanding human trafficking in the
United States. Vol. 10, No. 1. Sage Publications.
doi:10.1177/1524838008327262

Lovejoy, P. E. (2012). *Transformations in Slavery: A History of Slavery in Africa* (3rd
ed.). New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.

Lutya T. M. & Lanier, M. (2012). An integrated theoretical framework to describe
human trafficking of young women and girls for involuntary prostitution. *Public
Health-Social and Behavioral Health*. Retrieved from
http://cdn.intechopen.com/pdfs/36964/InTech-
An_integrated_theoretical_framework_to_describe_human_trafficking_of_young
_women_and_girls_for_involuntary_prostitution.pdf

Macy, R. J. & Graham, L. M. (2012). Identifying domestic and international sex-
trafficking victims during human service provision. *Trauma Violence Abuse,
13*(2), 59-76.doi: 10.1177/1524838012440340

Martin, S. & Callaway, A. (2011).Internal Displacement and Internal Trafficking:
Developing a New Framework for Protection. In K. Koser and S. Martin (Eds.)*,
The Migration-Displacement Nexus: Patterns, Processes, and Policies* (pp. 216-
238). New York and Oxford: Berghahn Books

Martinelli, D. (2012). U.S. media's failure to set the agenda for covering sex
trafficking. *Elon Journal of Undergraduate Research in Communications, 3*(2).

Marx, K. (1867). *Capital* (1st ed.). Moscow, Russia: Progress Publishers.

Marx, K. (1972). *The marx-engels reader* (Vol. 4). New York: Norton Publishers.

Marx, K. (1977). *Capital* (Vintage Books ed.).Vol. 1. New York, NY: Random House, Inc.

Marx, K. & Engels, F. (2012). *On religion*. Mineola, NY: Courier Dover Publications.

Government of Massachusetts. (2011). Governor Patrick signs anti-human trafficking legislation. Retrieved frhttp://www.mass.gov/governor/pressoffice/pressreleases/2011/111121-antihuman-trafficking-bill.html

Government of Massachusetts. (2014). Human trafficking initiative. Retrieved from http://www.mass.gov/ago/about-the-attorney-generals-office/community-programs/anti-human-trafficking/

Government of Massachusetts. (2016). Governor Baker Signs Landmark Opioid Legislation into Law Retrieved from http://www.mass.gov/governor/press-office/press-releases/fy2016/governor-signs-landmark-opioid-legislation-into-law.html

Government of Massachusetts. (2016). Governor Baker, AG Healey, Mayor Walsh Announce Anti-Human Trafficking Policies. Retrieved from http://www.mass.gov/ago/news-and-updates/press-releases/2016/2016-04-19-anti-human-trafficking.html

Government of Massachusetts. (2016). Lt. Governor Polito Announces New Policies Targeting Human Trafficking in Recognition of Sexual Assault Awareness Month. Retrieved from http://www.mass.gov/governor/press-office/press-releases/fy2016/polito-

announces-policies-targeting-human-trafficking.html

Maxwell, J. A. (2012). *Qualitative Research Design: An Interactive Approach: An Interactive Approach*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Maxwell, J. A. (2013). *Qualitative research design: An interactive approach* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

McCart, M. R., Smith, D. W., & Sawyer, G. K. (2010). Help seeking among victims of crime: A review of the empirical literature. *Journal of Traumatic Stress, 23*(2), 198-206.doi: 10.1002/jts.20509

McDonald, D. (2010). Dentist accused of trading sex for drugs. Cape Cod Times. Retrieved from http://www.capecodtimes.com/article/20101215/news/12150322

McEvoy, K. & McConnachie, K. (2012). Victimology in transitional justice: Victimhood, innocence and hierarchy. *European Journal of Criminology, 9*(5), 527-538.doi: 10.1177/1477370812454204.

McGough, M. Q. (2013). Ending modern-day slavery: Using research to inform U.S. anti-human trafficking efforts. *National Institute of Justice Journal*. No. 271. Retrieved fromhttp://www.nij.gov/journals/271/anti-human-trafficking.htm

McGowan, T. (2013). *Enjoying what we don't have: The political project of psychoanalysis*. Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press.

McKee, K. A., & Kohm, L. M. (2015). Examining the Associations between Sustainable Development Population Policies and Human Trafficking. *Michigan State International Law Review 1(23.1),* 1-37.

McNulty, M. S. (2014). Human trafficking: crime in our own backyard. *Home*

healthcare nurse, *32*(4), 243-247. doi: 10.1097/NHH.0000000000000047

Meho, L. I. (2006). E-mail interviewing in qualitative research: A methodlogical

discussion. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and*

Technology, 57, Iss.10, pp 1284-1295.doi: 10.1002/asi.20416

Mendelsohn B (1956) A new branch of bio-psychological science: La victimology.

Revue Internationale de Criminologie et de Police Technique 10: 782–789.

Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation.*

(2nd ed.). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass

Merriam, S. B. (2014). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San

Francisco, CA: John Wiley & Sons.

Moscati, I. (2007). History of consumer demand theory 1871-1971: A Neo-Kantian

rational reconstruction. *Euro Journal History of Economic Thought, 14*(1), 119-

156.doi: 10.1080/09672560601168504

Moser, K. (2012). Prevention, prosecution, and protection: A look at the United States'

Trafficking Victims Protection Act. *International Journal of Business and Social*

Science, *3*, 1-14. Retrieved from

http://ijbssnet.com/journals/Vol_3_No_6_Special_Issue_March_2012/28.pdf

Miller, C. (2012).   Spotlight on human trafficking and Super bowl XLVI. *Public IN*

Review, 1(1), 21-22. Retrieved from

https://journals.iupui.edu/index.php/spea/article/viewFile/3817/3758

Murphy, M. & Dumcius, G. (2014). Massachusetts offers to take in kids crossing

border. *The Enterprise.* Retrieved from

http://www.enterprisenews.com/article/20140718/News/140716293#140716293/?

Start=1&_suid=14127072591400608345046950024

Myers, K. C. (2016). Neighbors of Wilfin Road house say visitors were frequent since

current tenants moved in. Cape Cod Times. Retrieved from

http://www.capecodtimes.com/news/20160429/man-arrested-on-human-

trafficking-prostitution-charges

My Life My Choice. (2017). Retrieved from http://www.fightingexploitation.org

National Center for Missing and Exploited Children. (2014). Child sex trafficking.

Retrieved from www.missingkids.com

National Park Service. (2014). History and culture. Retrieved from

http://www.nps.gov/caco/historyculture/index.htm

Nguyen, J. (2010). Three Ps of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act: Unaccompanied

undocumented minors and the forgotten P in the William Wilberforce Trafficking

Prevention Reauthorization Act. *Washington and Lee Journal of Civil Rights and*

Social Justice. 17, 187. Retrieved from

http://scholarlycommons.law.wlu.edu/crsj/vol17/iss1/11/

Norlyk, A. (2010). What makes a phenomenological study phenomenological? An

analysis of peer-reviewed empirical nursing studies. *Qualitative Health*

Research, 20(3), 420-431.doi:10.1177/1049732309357435

Novick, G. (2008). Is there a bias against telephone interviews in qualitative research?

Res. Nurs. Health 31(4), 391-398. doi: 10.1002/nur.20259

O'Connell Davidson, J. (2011). Moving children? Child trafficking, child migration, and child rights. *Critical Social Policy, 31*(3), 454-477. doi: 10.1177/0261018311405014.

O'Connell, M. (2008). Victimology: A social science in waiting? International Review of Victimology, 15(2), 91-104. doi:10.1177/026975800801500202

Okech, D., Morreau, W., & Benson, K. (2012). Human trafficking: Improving victim identification and service provision. *International Social Work*, *55*(4), 488-503. doi:10.1177/0020872811425805

Opdenakker, R. (2006). Advantages and disadvantages of four interview techniques in qualitative research. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, *7*(4), Art. 11. Retrieved from http://nbn-resolving.de/urn:nbn:de:0114-fqs0604118.

Oram, S., Stöckl, H., Busza, J., Howard, L. M., & Zimmerman, C. (2012). Prevalence and risk of violence and the physical, mental, and sexual health problems associated with human trafficking: systematic review. *PLoS medicine*,*9*(5), e1001224.doi: 10.1371/journal.pmed.1001224

Orb, A., Eisenhauer, L., &Wynaden, D. (2001). Ethics in qualitative researchJournal of Nursing Scholarship, 33(1), 93-96. Retrieved from http://www.columbia.edu/~mvp19/RMC/M5/QualEthics.pdf

Orme, J., & Ross-Sheriff, F. (2015). Sex trafficking: policies, programs, and services. *Social work*, swv031. doi: 10.1093/sw/swv031

Orye, B. R., III. (2002). The failure of words: Habeas corpus reform, the antiterrorism and effective death penalty act, and when a judgment of conviction becomes final

for the purposes of 28 U.S.C. 2255(1). William and Mary Law Review, 44(1).

Retrieved from

http://scholarship.law.wm.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1397&context=wmlr

Paine, T. (1797). *Agrarian Justice.* London: Adlard.

Palinkas, L. A., Horwitz, S. M., Green, C. A., Wisdom, J. P., Duan, N., & Hoagwood, K. (2013). Purposeful sampling for qualitative data collection and analysis in mixed method implementation research. *Administration and Policy in Mental Health and Mental Health Services Research*, 1-12.doi: 10.1007/s10488-013-0528-y

Peters, A. (2013). Disparate Protections for American Human Trafficking Victims. *Cleveland State Law Review, 61*, 1. Retrieved from http://engagedscholarship.csuohio.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1396&context =clevstlrev

Poelmans, J., Elzinga, P., Dedene, G., Viaene, S., &Kuznetsov, S. O. (2011). A concept discovery approach for fighting human trafficking and forced prostitution. In *Conceptual Structures for Discovering Knowledge* (pp. 201-214). Kyalami, Midrand South Africa:Springer Berlin Heidelberg.

Polaris. (2014). 2012 State ratings map. Retrieved from http://www.polarisproject.org/what-we-do/policy-advocacy/national-policy/state-ratings-on-human-trafficking-laws/2012-state-ratings

Polaris. (2014). Human trafficking trends in the United States. Retrieved from http://www.polarisproject.org/resources/hotline-statistics/human-trafficking-trends-in-the-united-states

Polaris. (2014). Sex trafficking in the U.S. Retrieved from

      http://www.polarisproject.org/human-trafficking/sex-trafficking-in-the-us

Polaris. (2014). The victims. Retrieved from http://www.polarisproject.org/human-

      trafficking/overview/the-victims

Pope, J. G. (2010). Contract, race, and freedom of labor in the Constitutional law of

      "Involuntary Servitude". *The Yale Law Journal*, *119*(7), 1474-1567. Retrieved

      from http://www.jstor.org/stable/25681947

Protopsaltis, S. (2011). Multiple streams framework. *Encyclopedia of Public*

      Administration and Public Policy. (2nded). doi: 10.1081/E-EPAP2-120041416

Pullen, L. C. (2017). Cautious Optimism for Transplantation Under Trump

      Administration. *American Journal of Transplantation*, *17*(2), 309-310.

Rafferty, Y. (2013). Ending child trafficking as a human rights priority: Applying the

      spectrum of prevention as a conceptual framework. *Violence Against Girls and*

      Women: International Perspectives [2 volumes]: International Perspectives, 133.

Rahman, M. A. (2011). Human trafficking in the era of globalization: The case of the

      trafficking in the global market economy. *Transcience Journal 2,* 54-71.

      Retrieved from http://www2.hu-

      berlin.de/transcience/Vol2_Issue1_2011_54_71_Glossary.pdf

Ratislavová, K. & Ratislav, J. (2014). Asynchronous email interview as a qualitative

      research method in the humanities. *Springer Journal 24,* Iss.4, pp 452-460.

      doi: 10.2478/s13374-014-0240-y

Raymond, J. G.& Hughes, D. M. (2001). Sex trafficking of women in the United

     States. Retrieved from http://www.uri.edu/artsci/wms/hughes/sex_traff_us.pdf

Ren, X. (2014). Legal protection and assistance for victims of human trafficking in the

     United States. In I. Vanfraechem, A. Pemberton, & F. M. Ndahinda, *Justice for*

     Victims: Perspectives on Rights, Transition and Reconciliation, 140. New York,

     NY: Routledge.

Rieger, A. (2007). Missing the mark: Why the Trafficking Victims Protection Act fails

     to protect sex trafficking victims in the United States. *Harvard Journal of Law &*

     Gender, 30(1), 231-256. Retrieved from

     http://www.law.harvard.edu/students/orgs/jlg/vol301/rieger.pdf

Riley, G. (2012). Understanding demand. Retrieved from

     http://tutor2u.net/economics/revision-notes/as-markets-demand.html

Roe-Sepowitz, D., Gallagher, J. & Hickle, K. (2014). Exploring sex trafficking and

     prostitution demand during the Super Bowl. Retrieved from

     http://mccaininstitute.org/applications/Exploring_Sex_Trafficking_and_Prostituti

     on_Demand_during_the_Super_Bowl_.pdf

Ross, M. (2014). A Diamond in the Rough: The Transnational Duty to Prevent Human

     Trafficking in the Protocol. Duke Journal of Gender Law & Policy

     , 21, 325-401. Retrieved from http://scholarship.law.duke.edu/djglp/vol21/iss2/3

Rucke, K. (2013). Mass. sex trafficking law not used to prosecute 'Johns'. *Mint Press*

     News. Retrieved from http://www.mintpressnews.com/mass-sex- trafficking-

     law-used-prosecute-johns/175179/Saldaña, J. (2012). *The coding manual for*

qualitative researchers (2nd ed.).Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications.

Saldana, J. (2012). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*. Thousand Oaks,

CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Sanchez, R., & Stark, S. W. (2014). The hard truth about human trafficking. *Nursing*

management, *45*(1), 18-23. doi: 10.1097/01.NUMA.0000440630.411242.

Sasaki, A. (2012). Human trafficking and slavery: Current anti-trafficking efforts in

Japan. doi: 10.5772/48559

Schauer, E. J. & Wheaton, E. M. (2006). Sex trafficking into the United States: A

literature review. *Criminal Justice Review, 31*(2), 146-169. doi:

10.1177/0734016806290136

Schwartz, B. (2013). *American constitutional law*. New York, NY: Cambridge

University Press.

Sebba, L. & Berenblum, T. (2014). Victimology and the sociology of new disciplines:

A research agenda. *International Review of Victimology, 20*(1), 7-30.

doi: 10.1177/0269758013511657

Seidman, I. (2012). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in*

education and the social sciences. New York, NY: Teachers college press.

Shelley, L. (2010). *Human trafficking: A global perspective.* New York, NY:

Cambridge University Press.

Shenton, A. K. (2004). Strategies for ensuring trustworthiness in qualitative research

projects. *Education for Information*, Vol 22, pp. 63– 75. Retrieved from

http://www.angelfire.com/theforce/shu_cohort_viii/images/Trustworthypaper.pdf

Simon, M. K. (2011). *Dissertation and scholarly research: Recipes for success*. Seattle, WA: Dissertation Success, LLC.

Simon, M. K. & Goes, J. (2013). Dissertation and scholarly research: Recipes for Success. CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform.

Singer, M. (2014). FBI rescues 16 juveniles in Superbowl human trafficking operation. *CBSSports.com*. Retrieved from http://www.cbssports.com/nfl/eye-on-football/24429762/fbi-rescues-16-juveniles-in-super-bowl-human-trafficking-operation

Smith, D. N. (2013). *Marx at the margins: On nationalism, ethnicity, and non-western societies, by Kevin B. Anderson*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2010. Rethinking Marxism, *25*(1), 130-134.

Soroptimist. (2012). Sex Slavery/Trafficking. Retrieved from https://www.soroptimist.org/trafficking/faq.html

Srivastava, P. & Hopwood, N. (2009). A Practical Iterative Framework for Qualitative Data Analysis. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 8*(1). Retrieved from https://ejournals.library.ualberta.ca/index.php/IJQM/article/download/1169/5199.

Stephen, J. (1830). *The Slavery of the British West India Colonies Delineated: Being a delineation of the state in point of practice* (Vol. 2). J. Butterworth and Son.

Stolz, B. A. (2010). Human trafficking. *Criminology & Public Policy*, *9*(2), 267-274. doi: 10.1111/j.1745-9133.2010.00625.x

Stuckey, H. L. (2013). Three types of interviews: Qualitative research methods in social health. *Journal of Social Health and Diabetes*, *1*(2), 56.doi: 10.4103/2321-0656.115294

Sturges, J. E. & Hanrahan, K. J. (2004). Comparing telephone and face-to-face qualitative interviewing: A research note. *Qualitative Research 4*(1), 107-118. doi: 10.1177/146879410404111

Surtees, R. (2008). Traffickers and trafficking in southern and eastern Europe: Considering the other side of human trafficking. *European Journal of Criminology, 5*(1), 39-68.doi: 10.1177/1477370807084224

Tabor, H. K., Stock, J., Brazg, T., McMillin, M. J., Dent, K. M., Yu, J. H., & Bamshad, M. J. (2012). Informed consent for whole genome sequencing: a qualitative analysis of participant expectations and perceptions of risks, benefits, and harms. *American Journal of Medical Genetics Part A, 158*(6), 1310-1319.doi10.1002

Tarrit, F. (2006). A brief history, scope, and peculiarities of "Analytical Marxism". *Review of Radical Political Economics, 38*(4).doi: 10.1177/0486613406293223

Tavallaei, M. & Talib, M. A. (2010). A general perspective on role of theory in qualitative research. *The Journal of International Social Research*, *3*(11). Retrieved from http://www.sosyalarastirmalar.com/cilt3/sayi11pdf/tavallaei_abutalib.pdf

Taylor, L. D. (2010). *Consumer demand in the United States*: *Prices, income, and consumption behavior* (3rd ed.). Springer: New York.doi: 10.1007/978-1- 4419-0510-9

Teddlie, C. & Yu, F. (2007). Mixed methods sampling: A typology with examples. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research, 1*(1), 77-100.doi: 10.1177/2345678906292430

Tellis, W. (1997). Application of a case study methodology. *The Qualitative Report, 3*(3). Retrieved from http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR3-3/tellis2.html

The Advocates for Human Rights. (2009). Stop violence against women. Retrieved from www.stopvaw.org/uploads/2009_tip_report_questionnaire

The Library of Congress. (2014). Primary documents in American history. Retrieved from http://www.loc.gov/rr/program/bib/ourdocs/13thamendment.html

The United States Department of Justice. (2014). Human Trafficking Prosecution Unit. Retrieved from http://www.justice.gov/crt/about/crm/htpu.php

The White House. (2014). The legislative branch. Retrieved from http://www.whitehouse.gov/our-government/legislative-branch

Thomas, E., & Magilvy, J. K. (2011). Qualitative rigor or research validity in qualitative research. *Journal for specialists in pediatric nursing*, *16*(2), 151-155.

Thomas, P. (2013). *Karl Marx and the Anarchists library editions: Political science* (Vol. 60). New York, NY: Routledge.

Tobolowsky, P. M., Gaboury, M. T., Jackson, A. L., & Blackburn, A. G. (2010). *Crime victim rights and remedies* (2nd ed.). Durham, NC: Carolina Academic Press.

Todres, J. (2011). Widening our lens: Incorporating essential perspectives in the fight against human trafficking. *Michigan Journal of International Law, 33,* 53-76. Retrieved from http://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1958164

Todres, L. (2003). The status of method: Flexibility, consistency and coherence. *Qualitative Research, 3*(3), 345-357. doi: 10.1177/1468794103033004

Toledo-Pereyra, L. H. (2002). Intellectual Honesty. *Journal of Investigative Surgery*, 15(3), 113-114. Retrieved from http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/12139782

Troshynski, E. I. & Blank, J. K. (2008). Sex trafficking: An exploratory study and interviewing traffickers. *Trends in Organized Crime, 11,* 30-41. doi:10.1007/s12117-007-9015-8

Truman, J. L. (2011). *Criminal Victimization (2009)*. DIANE Publishing.

Turner, III, D. W. (2010). Qualitative interview design: A practical guide for Novice investigators. *The Qualitative Report, 15*(3), 754-760. Retrieved from http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR15-3/qid.pdf

Tyldum, G. (2010). Limitations in research on human trafficking. *International Migration*, *48*(5), 1-13.doi: 10.1111/j.1468-2435.2009.00597.x

United Nations. (2010). UN convention on justice and support for victims of crime and abuse of power. Retrieved from http://www.worldsocietyofvictimology.org/publications/Draft%20Convention.pdf

United Nations Entity for Gender Equality. (2011). Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing 1995. Retrieved from http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/

United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking. (2014). Human

trafficking: The facts. Retrieved from

http://www.unglobalcompact.org/docs/issues_doc/labour/Forced_labour/HUMAN

TRAFFICKING-_THE_FACTS_-_final.pdf

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. (2014). Human trafficking. Retrieved

from http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/what-is-human-

trafficking.html

United States Army. (2013). Combatting trafficking in persons. Retrieved from

http://www.combat-trafficking.army.mil/training.htm

United States House of Representatives. (2014). Branches of government. Retrieved

from http://www.house.gov/content/learn/branches_of_government/

United States Senate. (2014). Legislative process: How a senate bill becomes a law.

Retrieved from

http://www.senate.gov/reference/resources/pdf/legprocessflowchart.pdf

United States Department of Homeland Security (2014a). Combating human trafficking.

Retrieved from http://www.dhs.gov/topic/human-trafficking

United States Department of Homeland Security. (2014b). Antiterrorism and Effective

Death Penalty Act of 1996. Retrieved from

http://www.uscis.gov/iframe/ilink/docView/PUBLAW/HTML/PUBLAW/0-0-0-

8598.html

United States Department of Justice. (2007). Attorney General's annual report to

Congress on U.S. government activities to combat trafficking in persons fiscal

year 2006. Retreved from

http://www.justice.gov/archive/ag/annualreports/tr2006/agreporthumantrafficing2006.pdf

United States Department of State. (2010). What is human trafficking? Retrieved from http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/fs/2010/144400.htm

United States Department of State. (2013a). Human trafficking awareness training: "TIP 101". Retrieved from http://www.state.gov/j/tip/training/index.htm

United States Department of State. (2013b). President's Interagency Task Force. Retrieved from http://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/reports/pitf/

United States Department of State. (2014a). Office to monitor and combat trafficking in persons.

Retrieved from http://www.state.gov/j/tip/

United States Department of State. (2014b). State documents. Retrieved from http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/226849.pdf

Vaccaro, A. (2014). Cape Cod study shows jobs, cost of living drive young professionals away. *Boston.com.* Retrieved from http://www.boston.com/business/news/2014/06/18/cape-cod-study-shows-jobs-cost-living-drive-young-professionals-away/8vZfCSkM88qnMPN67ikgBO/story.html

Venetis, P., Argibay, C., Jean-Francois, N. A., & Fishman, P. (2012). Prevention of human trafficking II. *Women's Rights Law Reporter*, *34*, 215. *Retrieved from* http://law.rutgers.edu/humantrafficking

Vines, J. J. (2012). Sex-trafficked youth: Invisible in America. Retrieved from

     http://www.1800runaway.org/assets/1/7/Frontline_Winter_2012.pdf

Vocks J. & Nijboer, J. (2000). The promise land: A study of trafficking in women

     from central and eastern Europe to the Netherlands. *European Journal on*

     Criminal Policy and Research, 8(3), 379-388.doi: 10.1023/A:1008785214932

Walklate, S. (2014). Sexual violence against women: Still a controversial issue for

     victimology. *International Review of Victimology*, *20*(1), 71-84.doi:

     10.1177/0269758013508681

Watras, J. (2010). Ethnography and ethics: A critique of Gregory Bateson (1904-1980).

     Journal of Ethnographic and Qualitative Research, 5(2), 127-137. Retrieved

     from http://www.cedarville.edu/event/eqrc/journal/journal.htm

WCAI. (2014). Two Cape Cods: Hidden poverty on the Cape and Islands. Retrieved

     from http://www.wgbh.org/wcai/tcc.cfm

Weeks, J.(2011). *Capital, exploitation and economic crisis*. New York, NY: Taylor &

     Francis

Weitzer, R. (2012). Sex trafficking and the sex industry: The need for evidence-based

     theory and legislation. *The Journal of Criminal Law & Crimonology, 101*(4).

     Retrieved from

     http://www.law.northwestern.edu/jclc/backissues/v101/n4/1014_1337.Weitzer.pd

     f

Weitzer, R. (2014). New directions in research on human trafficking. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, 653*(1), 6-24. doi: 10.1177/0002716214521562

Wheaton, E. M., Schauer, E. J., & Galli, T. V. (2010). Economics of human trafficking. *International Migration, 48*(4), 114-141. doi 10.1111/j.1468-2435.2009.00592.x

Whyte, C. (2013). Praise be, prostitutes as the women we are not white slavery and human trafficking–an intersectional analysis;
pp. 125-141. Springer Fachmedien Wiesbaden.doi: 10.1007/978-3-531-93168-5_6

Wicks, D. (2010). Coding: Axial Coding.In A. J.Mills, G. Durepos, & E.Wiebe (Eds.), *Encylopedia of case study research*. doi: 0.4135/9781412957397

Williams, M. & Satgar, V. (2014). Marxisms in the 21st century: Crisis, critique and struggle (Democratic Marxism Sereis). Johannesburg, South Africa: Wits University Press

Williamson, C. & Cluse-Tolar, T. (2002). Pimp-controlled prostitution: Still an integral part of street life. *Violence Against Women, 8*(9), 1074-1092. doi: 10.1177/107780102401101746

Wilson, J. (2009). *The Praeger handbook of victimology*. Santa Barbara, CA: Greenwood Publishing Group

Winterdyk, J. & Reichel, P. (2010). Introduction to special issue: Human trafficking issues and perspectives. *European Journal of Criminology, 7*(1), 5-10. doi: 10.1177/1477370809347894

Wolf, Dan. (2016). Anti-Human Trafficking Bill Passes Senate. Retrieved from

    http://senatordanwolf.com/pressreleases/anti-human-trafficking-bill-passes-senate

Yilmaz, K. (2013). Comparison of Quantitative and Qualitative Research Traditions:

    epistemological, theoretical, and methodological differences. *European Journal*

    of Education, *48*(2), 311-325.

Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research: Design and methods* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks,

    CA: Sage Publications

Yin, R. K. (2013). Validity and Generalization in Future Case Study Evaluations.

    Evaluation, 19(3), 321-332.doi: 10.1177/1356389013497081

Yin, R. K.(2014). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA:

    Sage publications.

Young, R. (2009). Data on human trafficking: A consideration of approaches.

    Retrieved from

    http://webcache.googleusercontent.com/search?q=cache:jcQlfsRxeWgJ:www.co

    mbathumantrafficking.org/LiteratureRetrieve.aspx%3FID%3D40961+&cd=4&hl

    =en&ct=clnk&gl=us

Zahardiadis, Nikolaos, 2003: *Ambiguity and Choice in Public Policy: Political Decision*

    Making in Modern Democracies. Georgetown UP.

Zahariadis, N. (2007). The Multiple Steams Framework: Structure, Limitations,

    Prospects. In P. A. Sabatier (Ed.), *Theories of the policy process* (pp. 65-87).

    Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Appendix A: Email Interview Questions

Email Interview Questions

The following questions were taken from a human trafficking questionnaire developed by Stop Violence Against Women, an advocacy group (www.stopvaw.org, 2009). The questions used were to gather information from law enforcement officials regarding their initiatives when targeting human trafficking. The questionnaire was distributed through surveymonkey.com. These questions were altered to cater to my specific research by implementing research from the proposed theories in my theoretical framework located in the literature review. These questions coincide with Kingdon's political streams theory, Marxism, and victimology.

1. Would you please explain the types of services your organization provides?

2. What is your role in the organization?

3. What do you know about the human trafficking that exists on Cape Cod?

- What have you seen or heard of regarding human trafficking in you area?

4. What do you feel drives human trafficking on Cape Cod?

- Why do you think it exists in your area?

5. What has Massachusetts developed to combat trafficking in persons?

- Please provide substantive criminal laws and procedures, mechanisms for civil remedies, witness protection in court proceedings, and witness security outside of courts.

- Please provide the legal citation, common name, text, or common name of the law in your answer or provide an Internet address if possible.

6. What is your experience regarding the implementation of existing Massachusetts' laws and procedures on Cape Cod?

• Please provide specific examples if relevant.

7. What are the formal procedures, protocols, or policies in place that provide instructions for law enforcement on how to identify and respond to human trafficking cases?

• Who would you to contact for victim assistance?

8. What challenges has your organization faced when implementing existing laws and policies targeting human trafficking?

9. What training on human trafficking is made available to your staff?

10. How do you feel Massachusetts has addressed the prevention of human trafficking?

11. What improvements need to be made?

12. What is your understanding of the populations that are more at risk of being targeted for human trafficking on Cape Cod?

13. What services does Massachusetts provide victims of human trafficking (e.g. protection, deportation, referrals, victim advocates, legal, medical, or financial assistance)?

• Are these methods regularly used?

14. What challenges or barriers affect service delivery to victims?

15. How do you feel government officials with whom your organization interacts, understand the nature of trafficking? Please provide examples of agreement,

or misconceptions or misunderstandings related to trafficking in persons,

particularly those that might affect effectiveness at detecting and combating

human trafficking?