Walden University
ScholarWorks

Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies

Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies Collection

2021

Effects of Latino Inequity in the Illinois State Government: An Analysis Through the Polarities of Democracy

Rebecca Sanchez

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.waldenu.edu/dissertations

Part of the Public Administration Commons, and the Public Policy Commons

Walden University

College of Social and Behavioral Sciences

This is to certify that the doctoral dissertation by

Rebecca Sanchez

has been found to be complete and satisfactory in all respects,
and that any and all revisions required by
the review committee have been made.

Review Committee
Dr. William Benet, Committee Chairperson,
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

Dr. Patricia Ripoll, Committee Member,
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

Dr. Victoria Landu-Adams, University Reviewer,
Public Policy and Administration Faculty

Chief Academic Officer and Provost
Sue Subocz, Ph.D.

Walden University
2021

Abstract

Effects of Latino Inequity in the Illinois State Government: An Analysis Through the Polarities of Democracy

by

Rebecca Sanchez

School of Public Policy, Walden University

Public Policy and Administration

Dr. William Benet

April 2021

Abstract

Hispanics in Illinois make up 17.5 % of the population yet are disproportionately represented in state government, composing only 6.5 % of the workforce. Unequal representation deprives ethnic and underserved groups of participating in program and policy decisions that provide communities opportunities. Hispanic leaders have expressed their concerns and dissatisfaction to state legislators and actively requested equity in the state's workforce. However, there were no studies that examined the perceptions of Hispanic community leaders in Illinois regarding solutions to address this disparity. To address this gap, a qualitative study using Benet's polarities of democracy as the theoretical framework was conducted. Purposeful sampling was used to select eight participants who were Hispanic leaders of community organizations and who had spent years advocating for parity in the state's hiring practices. Interview questions asked for their perceptions on barriers to or facilitators of hiring more Hispanics for Illinois state government. Following data coding, four themes emerged from the data analysis: Inequity, the absence of inclusion, the absence of outreach, and bias. The results indicated that these community leaders perceived the state had a bias and had made insufficient efforts to include hiring more Hispanics in state government. The findings could lead to positive social change by providing state leaders with insight to eliminate the significant racial gap in Latino representation.

Effects of Latino Inequity in the Illinois State Government: An Analysis Through the Polarities of Democracy

by

Rebecca Sanchez

School of Public Policy, Walden University

Public Policy and Administration

Dr. William Benet

April 2021

Dedication

To Latinas, who wonder if one day they too can become doctors.

Table of Contents

List of Tables v

List of Figures vi

Chapter 1: 1

Background 1

Problem Statement 3

Purpose of the Study 5

Research Question 5

Theoretical and Conceptual Frameworks 6

Nature of the Study 8

Definitions.....9

Assumptions.....10

Scope and Delimitations 12

Limitations 12

Significance.....13

Summary 13

Chapter 2: Literature Review.....14

Literature Search Strategy.....14

Theoretical Foundation 15

Conceptual Framework 15

Theoretical Framework 16

Participation and Representation 17

Human Rights and Communal Obligations 18
Diversity and Equality 18
Freedom and Authority 20
Justice and Due Process 20
Literature Review 21
Active and Passive Representation 22
Active Representation 23
Passive Representation 24
Increasing Diversity in the Workforce 25
Studies on Representative Bureaucracy 26
Educational Attainment 28
Facilitators of Representative Bureaucracy 28
Discrimination 31
Summary and Conclusions 37
Chapter 3: Research Method 38
Research Design and Rationale 38
Role of the Researcher 38
Methodology 39
Participant Selection Logic 39
Instrumentation 40
Data Collection 40
Data Analysis Plan 41

Issues of Trustworthiness....42
Credibility....42
Transferability....43
Dependability....43
Confirmability....44
Ethical Procedures....44
Summary....45
Chapter 4: Research Method....47
Demographics....47
Data Collection....47
Data Analysis....48
Evidence of Trustworthiness....50
Credibility....50
Transferability....50
Dependability....51
Confirmability....51
Summary....64
Chapter 5:....65
Interpretation of the Findings....65
Interpretation of the Literature on Representative Bureaucracy....65
Interpretation of the Polarities of Democracy....66
Limitations of the Study....68

Recommendations 68
Implications 70
Recruitment, Hiring, and Advancing 70
Targeted Recruitment and Funding 70
Mentoring/Internships 71
Latino Employment Program 71
Program Managers 71
Latino Employment Program Structure 72
Targeted Recruitment and Funding 73
Conclusion 74
References 77

List of Tables

Table 1. Illinois State Employees by Race 58

Table 2. Illinois Population by Race.....59

Table 3. Total Number of Hispanic Employees per Agency.....59

Table 4. Total Number of Exempt Agency Positions 60

Table 5. Frequency of Themes Addressed per Participant 70

List of Figures

Figure 1. Coded Employees in State Agencies, 2018 10

Chapter 1:

For democracy to succeed, all groups, regardless of race, ethnicity, or demography, must have equal access to government programs and opportunities essential for communities to thrive (Andrews et al., 2014; Seldon, 2015). In 2019 the representation of Hispanics in the State of Illinois' workforce was 6 % (Illinois Central Management Services). The same year, Hispanics represented 17% of the state's population (U.S. Census Bureau, 2019), indicating an inequality in terms of representation in state government. Without government employees who represent minority and underserved groups, segments of the population are excluded from government programs and services that can help improve opportunities for a better life (Andrews et al., 2014; Roch & Pitts, 2012; Warikoo, 2017). In this chapter, I described the study's background, problem statement, purpose of the study, research questions, theoretical and conceptual frameworks, the nature of the study, definitions, assumptions, scope, delineations, limitations, and its significance.

Background

In explaining his theory on representative government, Kingsley (1944) said government employees should represent different classes in society, rather than only one. When bureaucrats reflect the citizenry's background, they reveal the people's policy attitudes (Kingsley, 1944). When sociodemographics are parallel between government officials and citizens, bureaucratic responsiveness is facilitated. In 1944 he stated, "the democratic state cannot afford to exclude any considerable body of its citizens from full participation in its affairs " (p.128).

Van Riper (1968) posited that American public service requires two necessary conditions for an accurate representative bureaucracy. First, an administration must consist of a reasonable cross-section of its workforce regarding occupation, class, and geography. Second, it must be in general tune with the mores and attitudes of its society.

Ricucci et al. (2017) proposed a government administration should promote diversity within its organizations and more broadly throughout the nation. Bradbury and Kellough (2011) argued that when individual bureaucrats reflect the views of those with similar demographic backgrounds, there is a higher possibility for civil servants to take an interest in actively representing their groups. Through increased bureaucratic representation, workforce diversity can lead to more resources available for ethnic and minority groups, thus improving the quality of life for more segments of the population (Bradbury & Kellough, 2011). The results would enhance communities by offering them more resources and opportunities, which could help promote positive social change.

More inclusive bureaucratic representation improves the government's interaction with groups (Hadwiger, 1973). Citizens are more likely to partake in government programs when they see cultural similarities with program administrators (Hadwiger, 1973). Moreover, when bureaucrats share demographic characteristics with the citizenry, it affects citizens in a variety of settings and leads to more significant benefits (Andrews, Ashworth, & Meier, 2014; Keiser et al. 2002; Meier, Wrinkle, & Polinard, 1999; Selden, 1997and Roch & Pitts, 2012; Wilkins & Keiser, 2006; Wilkins & Williams, 2008). Representation can succeed when it influences attitudes, values, and opinions to the extent citizens cooperate and comply with government, thus coproducing important

policy outcomes (McLeod & Lobel, 1992; Milliken & Martins, 1996; Rice, 1994). Bureaucratic policy developments become more inclusive, and the bureaucracy's power better achieves the requirements of a democracy. Service-providing bureaucracies have been vital to democracy. It is the space where democratically elected officials fulfill the material needs of society (McLeod & Lobel, 1992; Milliken & Martins, 1996; Rice, 1994).

Demographic change can result in unprecedented population heterogeneity, and therefore, a diversification of policy needs (Favero & Molina, 2018). Citizens could be more likely to take part in government programs when they share cultural similarities with program administrators. And it can lead to more significant benefits (Andrews, Ashworth, & Meier, 2014; Keiser et al. 2002; Meier, Wrinkle, & Polinard, 1999; Selden, 1997; Roch & Pitts, 2012; Wilkins & Keiser, 2006; Wilkins & Williams, 2008. Organizational diversity can lead to creativity, innovation, and improved internal processes (McLeod & Lobel, 1992; Milliken & Martins, 1996; Rice, 2012).

Problem Statement

For equality and democracy to succeed, all groups, regardless of race, ethnicity, or demography, must have equal access to opportunities and programs that are essential to prosper (Seldon, 2015; Andrews et al., 2014). Underserved groups should have equal access to government jobs to aid their population (Seldon, 2015; Andrews et al., 2014). I gathered data involving Latino employment in multiple state agencies in Illinois. The results pointed to a gross disparity in terms of Latinos' employee representation. According to Illinois Central Management Services, in 2018, there were 50,049 coded

(non-exempt) employees, of which 69% were White but only 2,386 (6%) were Latinos (See Figure1). Without government employees who represent a variety of minority and diverse groups, segments of the population could be excluded from government programs and services which could improve opportunities for a better life (Andrews et al., 2014; Roch & Pitts, 2012; Warikoo, 2017).

Figure 1

Coded (non-exempt) Employees in State Agencies by race

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of the study is twofold. The first goal was to find the perceptions of Hispanic community leaders in Illinois. The second goal was to explore their perceptions through the lens of polarities of democracy. Bureaucratic representation is obligatory for democratic principles and democratic rule to succeed (Ricucci et al., 2017; Prewitt, 2010). Government inclusion of minorities and underrepresented groups helps meet diverse communities' needs by enabling them to reach administrative positions where they can influence policy (Prewitt, 2010).

In this study, I explored the gap in the literature regarding barriers to and facilitators of Hispanics achieving employment in Illinois state government. It involved focusing on the implications of underrepresentation of a specific minority group in a state government through the lens of polarities of democracy to determine if its hiring practices conformed with democratic principles. Studying this gap was essential to understanding the factors involved which are critical when developing policies to reach equity in terms of ethnic and racial bureaucratic representation. My analysis of community experts' perceptions may provide political and administrative officials insight into participants' perspectives regarding barriers to and facilitators of Hispanics becoming state bureaucrats.

Research Question

RQ: What are the perceptions of Latino community leaders regarding the barriers to and facilitators of Hispanics achieving bureaucratic representation within Illinois state agencies, as seen through the lens of the polarities of democracy theory?

Theoretical and Conceptual Frameworks

I applied Benet's polarities of democracy (2006, 2012, 2013) as my study's theoretical framework. For readers to understand Benet's theory, I first introduce Johnson's polarity management concept (1996), as this was the conceptual framework Benet used to develop his theory. Johnson (1996) said that within a dilemma, there are two interdependent poles. When these dilemmas exist, polarity management's objective is to maximize the positive aspects of both poles while minimizing their negative aspects. Polarities management refers to sets of opposites that cannot function well independently. Both sides of a polarity are interdependent, and it is not possible to choose one as a solution while neglecting the other. Polarity management exists when there is an unsolvable problem rather than a problem that could be solved (1992/1996). According to Johnson, unsolvable problems occur because there is a dilemma (polarity) that needs managing. In contrast, solutions for solvable problem exist if we can find them.

Johnson (1996) provided two definitive criteria for determining whether you had a polarity to manage or a problem to solve. Were there two interdependent poles? In terms of polarities as sets of opposites, he saw two types: either polarities of opposite meanings or polarities of doing and being. Johnson (1996) also said that "the clearest opposites … are the downside of one pole and the upside of the other. Conjointly, there was a push for a shift from one pole of polarity to the other. This was because those pushing were experiencing or anticipating the downsides of the present pole, which they identified as the problem. And they were attracted to the upsides of the other pole, which they identified as the solution" (p. 7). Johnson (1996) asserted a dynamic tension in all

polarities over whether to shift to the opposite pole, when and how. Further, when polarities were not recognized and managed, Johnson maintained there was a natural pattern of shifting from one polarity to the other.

According to Benet's polarities of democracy (2013), the purpose of democracy is to overcome oppression and build healthy, sustainable, and just communities. Specifically, democracy requires 10 elements that exist as five pairs of polarities: freedom and authority; justice and due process; diversity and equality; human rights and communal obligations; and participation and representation (Benet, 2013). Polarities of democracy seeks to maximize each of the 10 elements' positive aspects while minimizing the negative aspects of those elements. Polarities of democracy is essential to achieving the democratization of workplaces and society, and social and environmental challenges at a local and national level (Benet, 2013). For my research, I applied the polarities of democracy as a theoretical framework to analyze barriers to and facilitators of achieving representative employment for Hispanics within Illinois' state government. I employed the five pairs of polarities of democracy as they all applied to my study. To facilitate the understanding of the complex application of polarities of democracy, I have provided the following statement from Benet (2013):

> In American cities, one of the problems we face is the abandonment of poor communities by stores that provide fresh fruits and vegetables. Instead, we have so-called convenience stores that make their money through the sale of alcohol, cigarettes, and lottery tickets. In addition, they generally extract wealth from the community and fail to provide jobs for community residents. To counter this

> problem, the North East Area Development (NEAD) Corporation in Rochester, New York, has purchased and is managing a local convenience store. It is bringing in fresh fruits and vegetables that its customers would not otherwise have access to. They have to wrestle with the freedom–authority polarity, however. If they were to use their authority to run their business in the way they want, they would eliminate the negative factors (alcohol, cigarettes, and lottery tickets) that harm the community; but if they were to do that, their customers could use their freedom to patron a store that provides those elements. If that were to happen, the NEAD operation, which is keeping wealth in the community by hiring community residents, might go out of business, and all the positive elements of its operation would be lost. This is an ongoing dilemma with which NEAD will have to wrestle as it pursues positive social change. Through the application of the polarities of democracy model to guide and evaluate this social change effort, NEAD may be able to successfully manage the freedom–authority polarity in ways that allow it to both profitably operate its business while also addressing the health threatening behaviors of its customers. (p.35)

Nature of the Study

The method used for this research was a qualitative case study design. This method involves describing collective meanings of individual experiences among several people (Creswell, 2013). This study entailed evaluating individual's perceived barriers to and facilitators of Hispanics achieving representative employment within Illinois state

government. With the qualitative design, the researcher collects data from different sources. Yin (2009) defined six sources of data that the researcher may use to collect data: Open-ended, semi-structured interviews, which allow participants to express their perspectives regarding the phenomenon under study. Direct observation which involves the researcher collecting detailed data through observing a site or activities, participant observation collecting the research data by observing participants' activities. Documents related to the phenomenon under study. Physical artifacts related to the phenomenon under study. And archival data related to the study.

Among the qualitative research design choices available for researchers are narrative, grounded theory, ethnography, case studies, and phenomenology (Creswell, 2013). The narrative research method involves exploring individual lives and individual experiences. Grounded theory research involves developing a theory grounded in data and using proven theoretical frameworks that acknowledge polarities and challenges and provide solutions. Ethnographic research involves describing and interpreting a group's culture and is the least effective in terms of understanding participants' experiences. Phenomenology involves group lived experiences. I used the case study design, which allowed me to discover contemporary phenomena in a real-life holistic setting.

Definitions

Hispanics are people whose heritage originated in Spain, whether they were born there or in another Spanish speaking country. It is the traditional and historic name attributed to this ethnic population, as recognized by the United States Census.

Latino and *Hispanic* are mostly interchangeable. Latino is more contemporary and employed to name the ethnic groups and the cultures of people originating from Latin America, even if they were born in the United States. Latino is limited to people who originated from Latin America, Cuba, Puerto Rico, and the Dominican Republic. Of note, although the media denotes Hispanics as "people of color or Latinx", Hispanics generally self-identify as Hispanic or Latinos. I find that identifying non-Whites as "people of color" is offensive and discriminatory.

Assumptions

My assumptions addressed four philosophical principles: ontology, epistemology, axiology, and methodology. I listened to community leaders' perceived realities and perspectives on barriers to and facilitators of Hispanic employment in Illinois state government. I presumed that I would transcribe all interviews and code them accurately (Yin, 2013). I expected that all participants would answer truthfully and that I would administer all interviews with consistency (Yin, 2013). My primary assumption was that the study's data would supply public administrators with suggestions on how to increase Latino representation in government.

The subject of ontology is the study of the categories of things that exist or may exist in some domain. What there is and what can be known about (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). This means that some researchers treat the phenomenon under study as an independent and single reality. That it does not accept the knowledge claims by understanding different respondents' interpretation given to the reality. My assumption was that one reality existed.

Epistemology is the study of the nature and scope of knowledge and justified belief. It analyzes the nature of knowledge and how it relates to similar notions such as truth, belief, and justification. Likewise, it deals with the means of production of knowledge and skepticism about different claims of knowledge. The epistemological question is, what is the nature of the relationship between the knower and would-be knower and what can be done? The answer that can be given to this question is constrained by the answer already given to the ontological question (Paul, 1993). Therefore, I assumed that allowing participants to voice their reality would have generated truth from their perspectives.

Axiology relates to the values a researcher applies to the subject studied. I employed the five pairs of polarities of democracy theory (Benet, 2013). I listened to participants' multiple voices assuming they would describe consistent experiences. And I expected that Benet's polarities of democracy theory would allow me to develop an analysis that would lead to recommendations for policy initiatives to create positive social change.

Methodology is the process used to collect and conduct research. Based on my assumptions on ontology, epistemology, and axiology, I devised a qualitative study to explore Hispanic community leaders' perceptions. By following a semi-structured interview protocol with participants, I gathered data that led me to discover their real lived experiences and their perceptions of the barriers to and facilitators of employment for Hispanics in the state's government.

Scope and Delimitations

This study's research problem involves perceptions of Hispanic community leaders from nongovernmental organizations that support the Hispanic community of Illinois. I only selected Hispanic community leaders in Illinois, which may have delimited the ability to apply the study's findings to other populations. Consequently, results obtained from this study only apply to Hispanic community leaders in Illinois.

Limitations

Qualitative studies have several limitations. First, the amount of time and frequency of the interviews can affect results. Next, results could be limited geographically. The same results may not generate in different demographic areas. My participants were a small sample and were not representative of a variety of ethnic backgrounds. Specifically, my participants were purposely selected based on their experience and expertise, which affected my ability to address gender or age in their selection. According to Creswell (2013) the following factors may weaken a study. There is not a set sampling size for qualitative studies, yet it should be large enough to sufficiently describe the phenomenon of interest, address the research questions, uncover a variety of opinions, and be limited to the point of saturation (Creswell, 2013).

Moreover, I worked in Chicago, Illinois as a political reporter, where I wrote about social challenges for the Hispanic population. I also was an employee of that state government. As a result, because my professional experience could have influenced the study, I was cautious to remain objective regarding participants' opinions. Any other

preconceptions that could have influenced the study's outcomes were identified, managed, minimized, or eliminated through my mindfulness and sense of accountability.

Significance

The purpose of this qualitative case study was to gain knowledge and explore Hispanic community leaders' perceptions of barriers to and facilitators of hiring Latinos within government agencies in the State of Illinois. By interviewing these leaders, I aimed to examine Hispanic representation through the lens of the polarities of democracy. This study's approach may lead to future research on bureaucratic representation in public organizations. This study was unique due to my professional experience as a former employee in the Illinois government.

Summary

Public administrators should be aware of barriers to equity and equality for ethnic communities and devise public policies and programs to increase democratic values. It is necessary to recruit from underrepresented and historically disadvantaged members of society. Such discretionary authority is critical to the proper functioning of public organizations. Governments with democratic principles such as the United States must regulate the implementation of bureaucratic authority over public policy (Capers, 2017). According to Meyers & Nielsen (2012), bureaucrats often act as enforcers or regulators of public policies and laws. They uphold statutes and ensure that recipients of goods and services do as well. While governments may display external policies, in their internal environment they may impose unwritten norms, values, and expectations that become a part of its ethos or culture (Capers, 2017).

Chapter 2: Literature Review

In Chapter 1, I stated that for equality and democracy to succeed, all groups, regardless of race, ethnicity, or demography, must have equal access to opportunities and programs that are essential to prosper (Seldon, 2015; Andrews et al., 2014). I suggested that government inclusion of minorities and underrepresented groups can help meet diverse communities' needs by enabling them to reach administrative positions where they can influence policy (Prewitt, 2010). Bureaucrats can often engage in boundary-spanning activities that allow them to maintain significant discretionary levels to operate semi-independently and control or influence the way rules affect them, beyond what is formally authorized (Meyers & Nielsen, 2012). As a result, these bureaucrats can select, influence, or adapt programs to help their own communities (Capers, 2017).

Literature Search Strategy

Chapter 2 includes reviews of current related literature regarding the facilitators of bureaucratic representation and the barriers to its attainment. The literature review includes peer-reviewed and scholarly journal articles, published dissertations, books, and government documents. I included studies from online databases available through the Walden University Library: Academic Search Complete/Premier, ProQuest Central, International Public Management Journal; Journal of Public Management and Social Policy; Public Performance and Management Review; Sage Publication; ProQuest Dissertations and Theses; Public Administration Reviews, Sage Journals, and LexisNexis Academic. I found authentic government documents through Google and government

organizations such as the US Census Bureau, and the Illinois Department of Central Management Services.

Further, it contains articles on representative bureaucracy, diversity, public administration, discrimination in employment, bias, ethnic groups, organizational culture, and workforce diversity. My search terms were *Hispanics in Illinois, Hispanics in Illinois government, Latino nonprofits, Latino community organization, representative bureaucracy*, *civic organizations*, *minorities in state governments*, *diversity in state governments*, *equality*, *social equity*, *Hispanics in the federal government*, *equal employment opportunities*, *racial minority representation*, *organizational performance*, *organizational mission*, *diversity*, *education*, and *agency goal achievement*.

Theoretical Foundation

For my theoretical framework, I used Benet's polarities of democracy (Benet, 2020). For my conceptual framework I used Johnson's polarities management (1996). I introduce them in reverse order because to understand Benet, it is first necessary to understand Johnson.

Conceptual Framework

For my conceptual framework I used Johnson's polarities management theory. I introduce Benet and Johnsons' polarities' theories in reverse order because to understand Benet, it is first necessary to understand Johnson. Polarities management is a way of leveraging the conflicts between opposing dilemmas with the highest possible benefit. For a polarity to exist, two criteria are considered: first, an ongoing difficulty, and second, that two interdependent poles exist (Johnson, 1992,1996.) I selected Johnson's

(1996) polarities management concept to comprehend how polarities are ongoing, chronic issues that are unavoidable and unsolvable. This framework allowed me to understand the differences between solving problems and managing polarities. Polarities have negative and positive aspects, and the key to polarity management is to use them to maximize the positive aspects and minimize the negative aspects (Johnson, 1996).

Theoretical Framework

According to Benet (2020), democracy is a form of governance that should be an either/or solution to oppression in both the workplace and society. Its purpose should be to overcome oppression, achieve human emancipation, and develop healthy, sustainable, and just organizations and communities. To better comprehend my choice for a theoretical framework, it was first necessary to understand Johnson's polarity management concept, which was the basis for Benet's theory (2013) on polarities of democracy. According to Benet there is no agreement on a definition of democracy that could guide social change efforts. He envisioned the polarities of democracy as a unifying theory of democracy to teach healthy, sustainable, and just social change efforts. The polarities of democracy theory consists of 10 elements, organized as five polarity pairs: freedom and authority, justice and due process, diversity and equality, human rights and communal obligations, and participation and representation. In this concept, each element has positive and negative aspects, and the objective is to successfully manage the polarities to maximize the positive factors and minimize the negative aspects (Benet, 2013).

Democracy as an overall concept for the workplace or society is a solution to the problem of oppression (Benet, 2006, 2012b). And the state's failure may contribute to unsustainable and unjust social conditions instead of a democracy. Just as bureaucratic representation incorporated the need to increase minority community power, so does the polarities of democracy theory. Likewise, the polarities of democracy is central to developing programs and policies regarding integrating minorities into government.

Therefore, because it incorporated into my research, I used polarities of democracy (2013) as a theoretical framework since it allowed me to analyze barriers to and facilitators of achieving representative employment for Hispanics in the state of Illinois. More specifically, I applied the framework as a lens to examine experiences and perceptions of the study's participants while aligning the polarity pairs to Latinos' rights to participate in state government. Through the lens of polarities of democracy, I identified the five polarity pairs in my study: participation and representation, human rights and communal obligations, diversity and equality, freedom and authority, and justice and due process.

Participation and Representation

Benet (2013) theorized that the positive aspects of the participation and representation polarity must be optimized to promote democracy as "a means to overcome oppression" (p. 32). However, this polarity's negative aspects could also cause bureaucrats to feel overwhelmed with more work or to become apathetic (Benet, 2013). Representation at a societal level demonstrates a form of legitimation where citizens can find a means to provide political and ideological input. Community members'

participation and representation as bureaucrats could increase confidence in the system of representation, access to government bureaus, and democracy. Both representative bureaucracy and polarities of democracy share the same ideals for democracy. The search for the representation of diverse interests within public organizations is driven mainly by the belief that bureaucracy may serve democratic principles better if it reflects citizens' demographic characteristics (Rourke 1978). Representation of diverse groups, in other words, helps ensure pluralism in the implementation of public policies and programs (Denhardt and de Leon, 1995).

Human Rights and Communal Obligations

This polarity addresses human rights of minority groups who are marginalized by omission and therefore excluded from participation in the democratic system, further exemplifying the absence of representative bureaucracy for minority groups such as Latinos in Illinois. Communities, organizations, and individuals must connect to avoid the violation of human rights (Benet, 2006 & 2013). Corresponding relationships among community members and organizations are communal obligations that, when appropriately used, can increase the protection of human rights. When these rights are ignored, results may prove detrimental for the community (Benet, 2006 & 2013). While a positive aspect of human rights is the rights themselves, the negative parts are repercussions for violating these rights (Benet, 2006).

Diversity and Equality

This polarity also relates to my study since it was an essential element to achieving a diverse but equal workforce in the Illinois' State government. The

representative bureaucracy theory focuses on how diversity helps bring equality for all societies. Benet posits that the diversity and equality pair offers the earliest evidence regarding the effectiveness of using polarity management to gain both poles' upsides while also minimizing each pole's downsides. Benet explores the upsides and downsides of diversity and equality; the historical evidence indicating that the effective management of this polarity characterized our earliest civilizations; and how society moved toward an emphasis on diversity without a corresponding focus on equality. He ponders how this resulted in conditions of dominance and oppression in both the workplace and society. He states that the effective management of this polarity in maximizing both poles' upsides while minimizing the downsides could reduce violence, domination, and oppression in both the workplace and society.

To specify the upsides and downsides of diversity and equality, he first explores the strengths and limitations cited by Butts (1980), who includes both elements in his civic values theory for a democratic society. While Butts does not present them as paired elements, in examining democracy in the United States, Butts does argue that equality contributes both to the cohesion of society and diversity, while diversity benefits the individual. According to Benet (2013), the upsides of diversity include serving as a motivating force for creativity, hard work, diligence, competitiveness, and commitment to excellence. These traits enhance the workplace's performance, thus benefitting both the individual and the organization. Additional upsides of diversity include the protection of an individual's rights and personal beliefs. Whereas the downsides of diversity contain the creation of rigid, hierarchical relations of power, leading to the institutionalization of

dominance and oppression in both the workplace and society in terms of race, gender, class, and extreme poverty. The upsides of equality include eliminating rigid hierarchical relations of power, which could result in the possible destruction of poverty and the promotion of self-esteem.

Benet (2013) stipulates that the negatives of equality include the stifling of motivation, creativity, hard work, diligence, commitment to excellence, loss of protection, and respect for individual rights and differences. As with diversity, the positive and negative of equality provide benefits and negatives for individuals and the organization (or society). Based on these upsides and downsides, Benet argues that failure to manage the polarity of diversity and equality may lead to severe discrimination based on race, gender, and class.

Freedom and Authority

This polarity stipulates that while freedom should be a condition for democracy, a level of authority is required to create stability and order in society. Benet contends that the allowed freedom components promote a less "oppressive and demeaning work environment" (pp. 84-85). Thus, current, and future Latino civil servants in Illinois could have enough freedom at work to feel unoppressed while at the same time abiding by the rules and not abusing that freedom.

Justice and Due Process

In this polarity public and civil servants have the opportunity for justice in cases where they seek reparations for discrimination, bias, or other conflicts with their colleagues, superiors, and the system. Under such circumstances, due process is

necessary for citizens to abide by the rules of a real democracy. Benet (2006) proposes that another upside to justice could lead to just or equitable treatment within all of society. While the due process polarity's upside consists of restricting the use of power, it also may amend unfair circumstances or conditions, uncivil or offensive behavior; and prevent infringements on individual and group rights. For Benet, justice acts as a tool to overcome oppression and constrain the use of power. It provides support to individuals who lack power, it offers protection, including for the least advantaged individuals, and promotes opportunity for all members of society.

Literature Review

That government bureaucracy devised and formed public policies, due to the acknowledged exercise of bureaucratic discretion in administrative decision making was widely accepted and understood (Chaney & Saltzstein, 1998: Lipsky, 1980; Maynard-Moody & Musheno, 2003; Meier, 2000; Rourke, 1984; Sowa & Selden, 2003). Such unrestricted authority was vital to the necessary functioning of public organizations. Yet, bureaucratic influence posed a considerable difficulty. Governments with democratic principles, such as the United States, needed to regulate the enactment of bureaucratic authority over public policy, even when public servants had significant knowledge and public support (Rourke, 1984). Bureaucratic power was one of the principles and continuing conflicts within the study of public administration (Rourke, 1984).

Meier (1997) suggested that the heads of agencies were responsible for setting the tone of their organization, influencing the culture, and establishing the agencies' mission and purpose. He concluded that the benefits agency heads held over

organizational objectives and goals were integral for them in defining their jobs as state executives.

Roman (2017) theorized that public servants influenced public policy and stakeholders more than they realized. Jingrui, Luning & Yuqiang (2019) postulated that the public sector's role in shaping today's society had shifted from government to governance. They argued the public sector served to establish a plurilateral governance model with the collaborative involvement of multiple stakeholders such as government agencies, citizens, enterprises, and nonprofit organizations rather than a hierarchical government exercising power, pushing information, and dispensing services.

Active and Passive Representation

Scholars such as Mosher (1968) and Meier (1997) divided representative bureaucracy into two parts – active and passive representation, while others did not differentiate. The latter referred to the extent to which the public workforce mirrored the demographic characteristics of citizens but was not actively supportive. In contrast, active representation such as policymaking or implementation occurred when employees advocated for individuals who shared their demographic characteristics. Crotty (2006) hypothesized that bureaucracies should push for their sociological counterparts' needs and interests in the general population. While Lim (2006) said minority bureaucrats could produce benefits for their social group indirectly by working to change the behavior of other policy participants, such as majority group bureaucrats. The notion that the link from passive to active representation is mediated by bureaucrats' values and attitudes also received some indirect support from studies showing that the relationship between female

bureaucrats and female citizens is stronger in a bureaucracy with a low level of hierarchy (Keiser et al. 2002).

In a study Nicholson-Crotty et al. (2016) found that black students were more likely to be in a gifted program if they had a black teacher. And that female victims of sex crimes were more willing to report them to female police officers who, in turn, became more active in enforcing sexual assault laws.

Studies of state-run government agencies (Andrews et al., 2014) tested whether passive representation of diverse ethnic groups was linked to active representation and whether the presence of various groups of people working and running the agencies resulted in the interest of these minority communities to influence policy outcomes. Passive representation translated into active representation for minority clients similarly across various organizational contexts (Meier & Bohte, 2001; Watkins-Haynes, 2009).

Active Representation

According to Moscher, (1968) active representation called upon officials from disadvantaged groups to actively use their position to promote the group's interests from which they belonged. He posited that bureaucrats were expected to push for their sociological counterparts' needs and interests in the general population. He also argued for disadvantaged groups to actively use their position to promote the interests of their communities.

However, it appeared that active representation was only possible in jobs that allowed for discretion (Meier & Bohte, 2001). Not all minority officials used the opportunity to actively represent their segment of the population (Groeneveld & Van de

Walle, 2010). The existing literature on active representation suggested that much of it arose through pre-employment socialization and occurred outside of the individual's awareness (Riccuci & Van Ryzin, 2017). However, the topic was insufficiently explored in the literature and represented a gap in understanding how active representation ensues (Riccuci & Van Ryzin, 2017).

Passive Representation

Mosher (1968) pointed to the importance of passive representation. When the bureaucracy's demographics reflected those of society, it enhanced government legitimacy. In active representation, individuals or administrators use their voice and press the interests and desires of those they are presumed to represent, whether they are the whole or a segment of society. Passive representation relied on how well individual administrators within government agencies mirrored the entire population (Mosher, 1982; Pitkin, 1967). The benefits of such representation were apparent: a broadly representative government suggested a form of open service and one in which there was equal opportunity. Thus, passive representation in government bureaucracies expressed critical democratic values and served essential goals related to fairness and equity in society, especially when coupled with effective diversity management (Riccuci & Van Ryzin, 2017).

Seldon (2006) said, "In a global economy–and with a foreign policy premised on human rights and dignity – lacking a diverse workforce is embarrassing to the United States, undermines its credibility, and hurts its business success in dealing with other nations" (p. 911). Without passive representation, there may be consequences such as

having a continued absence or gross underrepresentation of specific categories of people, equal opportunities, programs, and suggested barriers to their entry or advancement (Mosher, 1982).

Increasing Diversity in the Workforce

The extent of representation was measurable in terms of race and ethnicity. Kranz (1976) suggested that race and ethnicity were predictors of representative attitudes and likely included adult experiences that reinforced these attitudes and perceptions. Similarly, others linked the effects of race and ethnicity with public policy output (Meier & Stuart, 1992; Monroe, 1975). Meier & Steward (1992) discovered that employing minority public school teachers and principals was associated with fewer disciplinary actions against minority students. They said it was clear evidence that race and ethnicity mattered in public policy development and implementation. In this case, bureaucrats had enough discretion and inclination to convert values based on their demographic origins into policies that benefitted their demographic groups (Brudney et al., 2000).

Selden (1997) conducted a comprehensive analysis of the theory of representative bureaucracy using the Farmers Home Administration and found it impacted both active and passive representation. He discovered that districts with higher percentages of minority supervisors awarded more Farmers Home Administration Rural Housing loans to minority applicants, indicating that racial and ethnic minority representation made a difference in allocating resources. Selden (1997) asserted that "an effective means of ensuring that minority interests were represented in administrative decision-making processes was to employ minority administrators" (p. 142).

Studies on Representative Bureaucracy

Many studies on representation focused on the implications of bureaucratic representation for fairness and equity in policymaking and implementation. Performance-oriented reforms led scholars and practitioners alike to question whether public organizations that reflected their clients' demographic makeup had seen any overall improvements in organizational performance (Andrews et al., 2014; Groenveld et al., 2015). An underexplored possibility in the representative literature were public employees who had advocated for their demographic group at the expense of other groups or organizational roles. Such use of representative bureaucracy could have led to the question of zero-sum games: when more representation by one group in a public organization benefits that group at the expense of others (Hindera, 1993; Meier et al., 1999; Mosher, 1968). Scholars (Meier et al., 1999; Rocha & Hawes, 2009) called for more studies considering the role of circumstantial factors in the relationship between bureaucratic representation and overall organizational performance (Andrews, Ashworth & Meier, 2014). They claimed that the more appropriate question to ask was when had representative bureaucracy improved overall performance, rather than questioning whether it had (Keiser et al., 2002).

Other research found differences between the approach and ideas of diverse ethnicities (Hongseok 2019). Groups varied in the levels of importance placed on a series of individual characteristics of the organization. One study analyzed how different groups (race/ethnicity) identified the importance of values or plans (Andrews et al., 2014; Andrews et al., 2015). Other studies of policy outcomes aggregated at the organizational

level found a positive relationship between increased representation by a certain group and overall organizational performance (Fernandez & Lee, 2016; Hong, 2016). By contrast, Andrews et al. (2005) showed that increased minority representation in local government in the United Kingdom lowered the overall citizen satisfaction with the government. While in the United States, a study by Hongseok (2019) examined the relationship between racial minority representation in federal agencies and the agencies' goal achievements considering the moderating role of organizations' missions and diversity climates. The panel data analysis showed that increased minority representation lowered the agencies' goal achievement (Hongseok, 2019).

Yet, a positive relationship existed between two agencies that mainly promoted social equity for disadvantaged populations and fostered a positive diversity climate in the workplace (Meier & Bohte, 2001; Watkins-Haynes, 2009). These findings suggested that minority employees could better contribute to organizational success in agencies where they had balanced advocacy and regulatory roles, and their treatment was fair and respectful (Hongseok, 2019).

For minority street-level bureaucrats the internal environment bore less of an impact on their representative behavior because they operated semi-independently from the pressures and influence of their offices (Meier & Bohte, 2001; Watkins-Haynes, 2009). And empirical findings on representation's positive effect on minority outcomes supported these results on street-level bureaucrats, (Keiser et al., 2004; Keiser & Soss, 1998; Marvel & Resh, 2015) who may have used this coveted discretion to represent minority interests. Or to obtain resources and benefits for their demographic group,

mostly when the organization's norms and policies were vague or decentralized (Meier & Bohte, 2001; Watkins-Haynes, 2009).

Educational Attainment

According to the 2018 study by the National Department of Education, in Illinois, the percentage of adults who had not completed high school was higher for Hispanic adults (33 %) than for adults in any other racial or ethnic group. While White adults had the lowest (8 %). The fact that Hispanics had the highest disparity in educational attainment meant a smaller pool of educated Latino candidates qualified for public sector employment.

Facilitators of Representative Bureaucracy

Studies demonstrated that internships were a valuable tool for exposing students to professional work experience (Cantor, 1995; Sweitzer, 1999). According to Bell (1994), "Exposing college students to meaningful project management tasks, which involve regulatory issues, administration of public personnel, budgetary process, municipal financing...amplifies and breathes reality into their academic experience" (p.483). Thus, for Latinos in Illinois, internships could become an essential tool for increased recruitment.

Moreover, mentoring was another process of transferring organizational knowledge and experience to students or young adults who may not have the opportunity to gain that experience (Peters, 2011). Mentoring was a developmental work relationship in which the mentor supported the personal and professional growth of the protégé. (Lapointe & Vandenberghe, 2017). Kram & Isabella (1985) perceived that mentors

provided young adults with career-enhancing functions, such as sponsorship, coaching, facilitating, exposure, visibility, challenging work, or protection, all of which helped the younger person establish a role in the organization or prepare for advancement. Sands et al., (1991) defined mentorship as a person serving as a guide or sponsor to advise and protect by taking a special interest in another's development.

Through psychosocial functions, including role modeling, acceptance-and-confirmation, counseling, and friendship, a younger manager received support to develop a sense of competence, confidence, and effectiveness in the managerial role. The favorable outcomes of mentoring relationships, such as employee socialization, promotions, job satisfaction, and organizational commitment, have inspired companies to implement structured formal mentoring programs (Allen et al., 2004; Baugh & Fagenson, 2007; Eby & Dolan, 2015; Son & Kim, 2013; Wanberg et al., 2003).

Career-related support functions within the organization included mentor sponsorship, exposure, visibility, coaching and challenging assignments (Allen et al., 2004; Kram, 1985). Protégé psychosocial benefits included role modeling, acceptance, counseling, and developing friendships (Kram 1985). Mentee growth was facilitated through strategies, such as collaborations, sponsorships, training, support, challenge, advancement, and socialization (Bland et al., 2009). Further, two-way knowledge sharing where senior employees taught new junior employees business acumen, while new junior employees taught technical skills to the veterans was an added benefit (Closser, 2000). This form of reverse mentoring enabled knowledge sharing between veterans and newcomers (Biss & Dufrene, 2006; Zachary, 2005).

Kohli et al. (2011) asserted that providing access to mentoring, training, and other possibilities could increase government diversity. The expanding of a diverse workforce increased the need for cross-cultural mentoring, leveraging diversity, and building a more inclusive, functional, and practical organization (Zachary, 2005). Cross-cultural mentoring encompassed individual and cultural diversity, including race, gender, behaviors, values, and customs unique to a geographic location or country. And those who participated in a cross-cultural mentoring relationship gained diverse and broad perspectives that allowed them to better appreciate and adjust to cultural differences (Zachary, 2005). As they increased mutual understanding of their cultures, they could communicate more openly and honestly and make better business decisions (Zachary, 2005).

Lack of access to mentoring relationships was one of the top barriers to career success for minority women (Blake-Beard et al., 2008). According to Ortiz-Walters & Fullick (2015) mentors assumed a specific risk when mentoring minorities. Because given their disparity, these protégés were highly visible, as were their success and failures which could reflect on their mentors. Luecke (2004) noted that people generally seek out and maintain mentoring relationships with people who are like them in terms of race, gender, and interests. For instance, Gonzalez-Figueroa and Young (2005) found that Hispanic women preferred to be mentored by those of the same ethnicity because they were perceived to be more effective.

Organizational commitment was essential to developing effective mentoring relationships, as was the determination of the protégé (Linehan & Scullion, 2008).

Mentoring provided an opportunity to identify and develop future leaders outside and inside the organization (Donner & Wheeler, 2007). Bodkin (2016) concluded that there was limited literature regarding mentoring in government organizations, with much of the available research focused on mentoring relationships in private sector jobs. According to Bodkin (2016), mentorship has cascading benefits, in that those who have experienced it were more likely to act as mentors themselves, extending the help to a larger population.

Discrimination

Discrimination against minorities and other disadvantaged groups in job recruitment received widespread attention in the social policy arena and academic research (Brief et al., 1995; Brief et al., 2000; Dipboye & Colella, 2005; Tomaskovic-Devey & Stainback, 2007; Ziegert & Hanges, 2005). Scholars asserted that members of underserved groups, such as Blacks and Latinos, faced more barriers for their career goals than members of privileged or majority groups (Bertrand & Mullainathan, 2004; Dovidio & Gaertner, 2000; Roscigno et al., 2012; Zick et al., 2008). However, such discrimination depended on several factors: type (Krings & Olivarez, 2007, Watson et al., 2011) and status (Powell & Butterfield, 2002; Stewart & Perlow, 2001) of the job, and the level of influence of homosocial reproduction (the tendency of people to select incumbents who are socially similar). Selection on social similarity played a crucial role in shaping the demographic composition of organizations, as well as the structure of opportunity within the organization, (Kanter, 1977; Reskin et al., 1999) the promotion of equal employment opportunity goals, (Comer et al., 1998; Powell, 1993; Powell &

Butterfield, 2002) the organizational culture of the company, and the job sector (Catanzarite, 2000; Heckman, 1998; Tomaskovic-Devey et al., 2006).

Available research explained racial discrimination in selection decisions with the ethnic segmentation of the job market and the persistence of occupational stereotypes (Comer et al., 1998; King et al., 2006; Knight et al., 2003; Lipton et al., 1991; Terpstra & Larsen, 1980; Watson et al., 2011) of attributes and positions of jobholders (Berger et al., 1998). This latter theory suggests that people form expectations about others' competence based on inferences from the status value assigned by society to their characteristics. Since some social groups (e.g., White men) are in higher positions and considered more competent than ethnic groups and women, decision-makers may favor White male applicants in top management (Knight et al., 2003; Powell & Butterfield, 2002). Studies have shown that some jobs or fields seem taken by members of specific ethnic groups (Catanzarite, 2000; Waldinger & Bailey, 1994).

At stake is the general issue of the difficulties experienced by members of minorities in job-seeking processes and the specific nature and status of available jobs (Ndobo et al., 2018). Focusing on the type of employment and the categorial standing of the applicant might enable researchers to consider the discrimination process as a multi-faceted phenomenon (Ndobo et al., 2018). For instance, cases of reverse discrimination and outgroup favoritism in recruitment have suggested that the native-born advantage is irrelevant (Ndobo et al., 2018).

We could consider workplace discrimination as an indicator of a mismatch between the jobseeker and the type of job to be filled (Ndobo et al., 2018). The negative

effect of ethnic segmentation of the job market, such as minimizing the importance of occupational stereotypes on the one hand, and the tendency to justify the unequal system of categorial status (Kay et al., 2009; Kay & Jost, 2003) should matter. What also matters is an individual's tendency to discriminate implicitly, rather than explicitly, in non-discriminatory social contexts (Brief et al., 2000; Dovidio & Gaertner, 2000; Petersen & Dietz, 2005). One study examined the challenges posed by workforce diversification and explored possible approaches to meet the organizational challenges of change successfully (Hewins-Maroney & Williams, 2013). It found that public administrators had a pivotal role in making the changes necessary to successfully manage diversity and to transition the workforce entrants into productive employees (Hewins-Maroney & Williams, 2013). Social categorization causes individuals to build stereotypes about groups, which leads to self-segregation and discrimination (Choi & Rainey, 2010). While a diverse workforce's accommodation remains ideal, studies indicate that diversity could have paradoxical effects on the work environment. For example, a diverse workforce could enhance and distress the work atmosphere affecting employee and organizational functioning (Kochan et al., 2016).

Although in most democratic societies, workplace discrimination is unacceptable, the persistence of bias could explain the occupational stereotype and the very structure of the labor market. According to the professional stereotype perspective, (Comer et al., 1998; King et al., 2006; Knight et al., 2003; Lipton et al., 1991; Terpstra & Larsen, 1980; Watson et al., 2011) individuals hold a preconceived attitude about members of specific social categories, who they expect have the adequate profile and would be efficient at a

given job. It echoes the social identity theory, (Tajfel & Turner, 1986) which holds that individuals classified under different social categories are associated with additional attributes, prescribed behaviors, and status values. Consequently, employers and recruiters unconsciously develop mental imagery (Fiske & Taylor, 1991) about the future employee's characteristics. This preconception can influence hiring decisions and the belief that applicants from specific social categories do not apply for jobs they perceive are impossible to attain, given personnel's bias in human resources (Ndobo et al., 2018). The very organization of the labor market could potentially induce persisting discrimination.

In 2019, the French government initiated ministerial declarations to regulate the number of immigrants with access to the national labor market. The result was the issuance of quotas and lists curbing specific sectors open to foreign employees. Regardless of their legality, this type of decision contributes to the rationalization of occupational stereotypes and the labor market's consequent ethnic and racial segmentation. Thus, not only could these directives have influenced professional portrayals, but they could have obliterated alternative beliefs in positive professional and social change (Doeringer & Piore, 1971; Hudson, 2007). Studies revealed that as a source of bias, the labor market structure is another source of discrimination that depends on internal factors. The labor market has two sides—"good jobs" (primary market) and "bad jobs" (secondary market), with the former offering higher wages and better working conditions than the latter (Doeringer & Piore, 1971; Hudson, 2007).

This dual structure elicits the prevalent separation between the dominant and the dominated. Because of the unequal status assigned by society (Berger et al., 1998) to both group categories and because of the different expectations regarding their respective professional competencies, members of dominant groups have seemed more suitable in the primary market, while members of dominated groups were considered an appropriate match in the secondary market. Indeed, the organization of the labor market in terms of ethnic niches (Catanzarite, 2000) and "racial tasks" (Wingfield & Alston, 2014, p. 276) has been a direct consequence of these opposing expectations. Job-related segregation has been a form of labor specialization involving a specific group's tendency to concentrate on an activity or job.

For members of segregated groups, the labor market organization in terms of ethnic niches was the main factor in their marginalization. Such exclusion was caused either independently or jointly by employers' reluctance to hire minority workers, who they placed at the end of the job queue (Kaufman, 2002; Semyonov & Herring, 2007; Tomaskovic-Devey, 1993). The result was the incapacity of minority workers to be competitive, negotiate their work conditions, or only be of interest to employers if they accepted low-paying jobs. Historically, employers have devalued the wages in segregated jobs occupied by minority workers (Catanzarite, 2003; Huffman & Cohen, 2004; Kmec, 2003). The massive biases and implicit displays of ethnic and racial workplace discrimination are vastly known (Embrick, 2005; Embrick & Henricks, 2013, 2015; Fraser & Kick, 2000; Van Laer & Janssen, 2011). In the US, because of the Equal Employment Opportunity Law (EEO), which prohibits discrimination based on a person's

race, color, religion, sex, national origin, age, or disability, businesses and government organizations often include an EEO statement in their job applications meant to protect them from accusations of racist or discriminatory hiring practices. In turn, this has created an illusion. Workplace discrimination has not disappeared. Instead, it has become increasingly subtle (Catanzarite, 2003; Huffman & Cohen, 2004; Kmec, 2003).

Many scholars have tried to develop a range of mechanisms (Fazio & Olson, 2003; Greenwald et al., 1998) to unveil the bias beyond individual's desirable behaviors. Discourse analysis has been one of several means (Augoustinos & Every, 2007; Billig, 2001; Bonilla et al., 2000; Condor et al., 2006) employed to eliminate inherent prejudices through words. However, studies have shown that diverse populations tend to relate more to others with whom they share similar characteristics: demographics, age, ethnicity, culture, religion, and socioeconomic status. And some scholars reached the belief that public servants and administrators preferred those with whom they related and had similar interests while discriminating against others (Brudney, 2000).

Although U.S. laws do not allow bias, people can subconsciously favor others they resemble (Brudney, 2000). An examination of Hispanic employment discrimination litigation between 2011-2014 (LaVan & Katz, 2017) revealed that nearly three in every 10 Hispanic workers felt discriminated in their employment; and had reported they suffered racial slurs at work. One in four thought they were paid less and had lower career advancement prospects than their White counterparts (Gibson, 2016; Marin & Marin, 1991; Stone et al., 2006). Research by Ortega et al. (2014) found that discrimination perceptions differed between White managers and Hispanic managers.

Mexican American managers believed that affirmative action policies were more helpful, and that workplace discrimination was more damaging to their careers than to those of their White peers (LaVan & Katz, 2017).

Summary and Conclusions

This study's purpose was to fill the gap in the literature that excluded research on Latino leaders' perceptions of the barriers to and facilitators of the state hiring Hispanics as seen through the lens of polarities of democracy. My research may help advance scholars and policymakers' understanding of occupational stereotypes for ethnic and racial communities. The problematic long-term consequences of such a situation are worth investigating to further positive social change. Society should work hard toward its proclaimed objective of reaching social equality by allowing everyone the same opportunities and enabling their potential professional mobility. The workplace implications for Hispanic employment in Illinois matters within the context that Hispanics are the fastest and largest growing ethnic group in Illinois. As their community grows, so will their needs for fair government representation.

Chapter 3: Research Method

Bureaucratic representation has been obligatory for democratic principles and democratic rule to succeed (Prewitt, 2010; Ricucci et al., 2017). Government inclusion of minorities and underserved groups can help meet diverse communities' needs by enabling them to reach administrative positions where they could influence policy (Prewitt, 2010). Organizational diversity can lead to creativity, innovation, and improved internal processes; it can facilitate meeting the population's demands and can improve productivity (McLeod & Lobel, 1992; Milliken & Martins, 1996; Rice, 1994). My study focused on disparities in the representation of Latinos employed by the state of Illinois. In doing so it addressed a gap in the literature regarding how these inequities affected the Hispanic community.

Research Design and Rationale

The research questions involved Latino community leaders' perceptions regarding barriers to and facilitators of Hispanics achieving representative employment within the government of the State of Illinois. Following the case study protocol in qualitative research, my approach was appropriate for this study based on Creswell (2009) and Yin's (2013) interpretations that a case study approach was an empirical inquiry investigating contemporary issues of a real-life situation.

Role of the Researcher

I served as a critical research instrument in collecting and interpreting data in the form of interviews. I was diligent during data collection and minimized any biases. To be effective in gathering accurate data, I showed understanding without judgment, openness,

sensitivity, respect, awareness, and responsiveness, while not seeming to agree or disagree with participants' responses or experiences.

I maintained neutral and did not engage in personal conversations during interviews with any former work contact who may have inadvertently become a participant in the study. As a past employee of the State of Illinois, I had contacts with former Latino colleagues and community leaders with whom I had discussed government bureaucracy, the challenges of running successful programs, and of making significant policy changes. Qualitative researchers generally take many steps to avoid having their views and experiences permeate the study. I was cautious of such preconceptions and was objective throughout the interview process.

Methodology

A qualitative case study is a research methodology, a research strategy, and an empirical inquiry investigating a phenomenon within its real-life context. It is a descriptive and exploratory analysis of a person, group, or event. A methodology is a process used to collect and conduct research. By following a semi-structured interview protocol with participants, I gathered data that led me to discover experiences of Hispanic participants regarding their perceptions of barriers of and facilitators to Latinos getting hired by Illinois state government.

Participant Selection Logic

Participants in my study were Latino community leaders who had knowledge of the state’s hiring practices and its employee demographics. I identified potential candidates by examining websites of Hispanic organizations in Illinois. My selection of

participants was based on brief exchanges to assess their knowledge of the subject and the years of experience they had working for Hispanic organizations. My selection included eight participants who each had a minimum of 10 years of experience working with Latino communities. There were five women and three men.

Instrumentation

Together with Benet, Chair for my dissertation and the author of polarities of democracy, we developed semi-structured, open-ended interview questions as a form of instrumentation during this study. We reviewed the instrument to ensure the questions related to the study's focus, avoided ambiguity, reduced repetition of questions, adjusted word choice to establish authenticity, and aligned with my theoretical framework. But most importantly, as the author and subject matter expert, Benet ensured that the theoretical framework questions regarding polarities of democracy were used as the lens to determine if hiring practice were conformant with democratic principles (See Appendix A). I was confident that the instrumentation aligned with the theoretical framework to discover participants' experiences and ensure content validity. My data consisted of statistics from the U.S. Census Bureau and the State of Illinois' websites, which provided information regarding population demographics, the state's personnel by ethnic group, and Latinos' employment by agency. My interviews included an email request form (See Appendix B).

Data Collection

The sample size used in qualitative research methods is often smaller than that used in quantitative research methods because the qualitative case study employs a semi-

structured interview approach (Creswell, 2013; Francis et al., 2010). All data were recorded utilizing Zoom audio-video, with participants' knowledge ahead of the interviews. The duration for each interview was 30 to 70 minutes long, which allowed for the collection of rich and thick data. (Dworkin, 2012).

I collected information from interviews on lived experience descriptions. Participants understood that they could withdraw at any time, all information would be kept confidential, and any follow-up required would occur using each participant's contact information. At the end of each meeting, I provided a closing summary and allowed each participant to ask questions. I then informed them how to contact me to make any additions or deletions to their responses.

Data Analysis Plan

Creswell (2014) stated that case study data collection involves a range of procedures that allow researchers to develop detailed descriptions of their case. To minimize concerns of validity, employing various practices may reduce the redundancy of data gathering, prevent procedural challenges, and strengthen a study (Bloomberg & Volpe, 2012). These methods included interviews, document reviews, observation, and critical incident reports (Bloomberg & Volpe, 2012). Even though surveys and questionnaires were traditionally linked to quantitative studies, qualitative studies provide corroboration and supportive evidence. Before data analysis can begin, the researcher must develop a management plan to sort data. Analyzing raw data leads to an organized coding process to track relevant material. Since my interviews were recorded, listening to the audio numerous times facilitated my transcriptions and notes to develop coding

categories and themes. However, there were so many categories which emerged that sorting them was overwhelming. After a Zoom meeting with my Chair and second committee member, it was easier to identify the most significant codes. Using Benet's theoretical framework also allowed me to monitor coding to find themes regarding the construct of polarities of democracy.

Issues of Trustworthiness

In place of the validity required in quantitative studies to measure and validate research, the appropriate term is trustworthiness in qualitative studies, based on four factors: credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability. Only through the development of sound research design could scholars accept its trustworthiness or methodological rigor (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). For qualitative research inquiry, Lincoln & Guba (1985) proposed a set of strategies to ensure the inquiry's trustworthiness.

Credibility

Knowing that my data and interpretation had to be credible, I used proven and effective qualitative research tools such as triangulation. Various methods and sources to investigate data or a phenomenon are required until finding uniformity in participants' responses. Triangulation increased the study's credibility by using multiple data collection sources, which included documentation and interviews from prospective Latino community leaders. During the face-to-face interviews, monitoring a participant's body language was another appropriate technique to achieve triangulation. Practicing proper data collection through a review of updated material on Illinois state's demographics helped me understand the breadth and the depth of the disproportion in

bureaucratic representation. After ensuring that my transcripts contained the correct data gathered from participants to produce the proper codes for analysis, my findings reached the point of saturation, where there was no new data revealed during the collection process.

Transferability

To ensure the validity of a study, it must be transferable to other similar studies. More precisely, it is the degree to which the methods used in research and its findings can be generalized to other studies. Transferability refers to one study's methods replicated in another study (Guba & Lincoln, as cited in Patton, 2002). According to Amankwaa (2016), the researcher must have used single words and detailed descriptions of the study's setting, the environment, and the participants' attitudes. Transferability in qualitative research is akin to quantitative research's external validity (Thomas & Magilvy, 2011). Lincoln & Guba (1985) defined research transferability as "how one determines the extent to which the findings of a particular inquiry have applicability in other contexts or with other subjects/participants" (p. 290).

Dependability

In qualitative research, dependability is equivalent to quantitative studies (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, as cited in Golshani, 2003). Except, dependability did not use statistics to prove reliability; instead, it used audit trails to ensure consistency in a study's method and process (Hoepf, 1997, as cited in Golshani, 2003). The audit trail required thorough record-keeping of the study's implementation process by the researcher (Rudestam &

Newton, 2007). It involved collecting data under different environments and using diverse approaches (Maxwell, 2013).

Confirmability

Confirmability involves the extent to which the findings reflect participants' responses, as opposed to the scholar's biases, aims, or concerns. To achieve confirmability, it is essential to observe the study from an outsider's perspective. Intra and intercoder reliability is the process of randomly testing the coding of data to establish the reliability of the results (Peter & Lauf, 2002). Reflexivity in qualitative research requires the researcher be aware of how preconceived notions affect the research. Correspondingly, all personal feelings, thoughts, biases, and prior knowledge after each interview are noted, further following the research's direction instead of leading its direction by requesting the participants' clarification regarding their definitions and metaphors. Subsequently, I conducted reflective research to increase the research's trustworthiness and enhance my data's credibility. Lincoln & Guba (1985) suggested three approaches to establish qualitative research confirmability: audit, reflexivity, and triangulation.

Ethical Procedures

According to Yin (2014), avoiding bias is part of a broader set of values falling under the rubric of research ethics. A scholar must have strived for their work's highest ethical standards, including responsibility to scholarship, avoiding plagiarism, and falsifying information. They must have maintained honesty and accepted responsibility for their work. Maintaining professional competence is vital; it includes updating related

research, ensuring accuracy, striving for credibility, understanding, disclosing the methodological qualifiers, and limitations to their work. Above all, it is essential to adhere to IRB's rules at every stage of the study. My participants received information regarding confidentiality and their rights. According to O'Sullivan et al. (2008), the practitioner must have informed the participant that the study was voluntary and that they were free to terminate their participation at any time. Protecting study participants' confidentiality requires that data collection remain in "trust and a duty of care" (Irwin & Winterturn, 2012, p. 293).

As a result of my previous job in the government of Illinois, I knew a few interviewees. However, I was vigilant to avoid misleading them into believing I shared their views. All data gathered during this study is inside a locked drawer in my desk at home, where it will remain for five years, after which they will be shredded.

Summary

Chapter 1 introduced the problems in Illinois state's government regarding the lack of integration of Hispanics into its bureaucracy, as well as describing the background, problem statement, purpose of the study, research questions, theoretical foundation, conceptual framework, nature of the study, definitions, assumptions, scope and delimitations, limitations, and significance. Chapter 2 included literature search strategies and a comprehensive literature review of representative bureaucracy. Chapter 3 addressed the research design and rationale, the role of the researcher, the methodology, instrumentation, data analysis plan, issues of trustworthiness, and ethical procedures. I explained how the underrepresentation of Latinos in government hindered their ability to

contribute effectively to social change in terms of employment, policy decisions, allocations of resources, and delivery of services to their demographic group. Chapter 4 includes an analysis of my data collection as well as coding processes and themes.

Chapter 4: Research Method

The purpose of this qualitative case study was to explore Hispanic community leaders' perceptions of barriers to and facilitators of Hispanics obtaining employment with the State of Illinois, as seen through the lens of the polarities of democracy. Participants in my study were asked for their perceptions of the barriers to and the facilitators of Latinos getting hired by the state government of Illinois.

Setting

All participants selected their offices or homes for interviews. There were no personal or organizational conditions that may have influenced the study's results.

Demographics

The study included eight Hispanic participants, each of whom had a minimum of 10 years of experience working with Latino communities. The selected five women and three men each led a Hispanic organization in the state.

Data Collection

Due to Walden's temporary restrictions on conducting interviews in person during the COVID-19 virus pandemic and federal government restrictions on travel, all interviews took place via video conference on Zoom. My eight research questions questions were semi-structured and open-ended. My sources included official and unofficial documents along with formal and informal interviews and discussions. Yin (2014) said documents were important to "corroborate and argument evidence from other sources" (p. 107). And Patton (2001) asserted that a single method would never adequately explain a phenomenon. Using multiple ways facilitated more in-depth

understanding, allowing the researcher to reach triangulation through various methods or data sources to develop a comprehensive understanding of the phenomena (Patton (2001).

My data collection included themes that emerged from raw data collection. I also gathered significant documentation consistent with my findings. For example, a 2020 yearly report from the Illinois Civil Service Commission stated, "A long-standing significant issue in merit systems is the determination of those positions which should be subject to appointment and dismissal at the discretion of the administration" (p. 9). This statement in the personnel code allowed candidates for exempt positions, such as those for legislative and judicial branches, directors and assistant directors, and for board members and commissions to be appointed without input from human resources.

Data Analysis

The coding process involves two steps: manual coding and computer-assisted coding. Coding data twice allows for prolonged immersion which leads to saturation. First, I transcribed interview data from recorded interviews. Once I had read the transcripts multiple times, analyzed my notes from participant observations, and collected insights from data, I began manual coding to identify initial codes from data. To refine the codes, I uploaded transcripts to Delve, a system for computer-assisted coding. I reviewed transcripts and highlighted 24 clusters of data for content analysis:

Administration not following law; Affirmative Action in agencies neglect Latino numbers; Hispanic Plan disregarded; agencies lack outreach strategy; agencies must create, recruit, and provide educational events; no Latinos at DHS; Latino applicants struggle to navigate state job site; state test is challenge for ESL; community lacks trust

in state; Democrats have higher comfort level with Blacks; Latinos need higher positions; political hierarchy lacks respect for Latino political power; state's faulty hiring practices; state overlooks gap in Latino representation; Latinos get hired for field positions, not in administration; Latinos should partake in hiring panels; the state hires Latinos only for bilingual positions; only one Latino director in all agencies; outreach to Latino high school graduates urgent; the candidate pool must be saturated with Latinos; there is no recognition for Latinos' work; bilingual skills undervalued; and Latinos need higher positions.

Next, I assigned hierarchical importance to the codes based on their frequency. While further identifying and unifying codes, I also cross-checked against other data sources such as public information and official state publications related to Latino public policy proposals and statistics regarding state employment. I then combined and listed 12 new categories that arose from the previous codes: legislators disregard for laws; state's negative attitude toward Latinos; state's lack of awareness of Latino needs; state lacks infrastructure to hire Latinos; Spanish speakers taken for granted; lack of appreciation toward Latinos; difficulty applying for state positions; lack of employment for Latinos in managing roles; lack of state outreach strategies; systemic and institutional racism; injustice in representation; and discrimination. Finally, I began the sequential process of cross-checking categories to record frequency and patterns of four emerging themes: Inequity, the absence of inclusion, bias, and the absence of outreach strategies.

Evidence of Trustworthiness

Ensuring trustworthiness was a significant consideration during this study because, as the researcher, it was my responsibility to show readers that they could trust the results. Guba (1981) proposed four criteria to ensure trustworthiness intrinsically for qualitative research: credibility, dependability, transferability, and confirmability.

Credibility

Triangulation involves various methods and sources to investigate data. It increased my study's credibility through multiple data collection sources, including the interviews from Latino community leaders. During our face-to-face interactions, monitoring participants' body language was another appropriate technique to achieve triangulation. My data collection increased in accuracy after I reviewed up to date Illinois state demographics to increase my understanding of the lack of representation of Hispanics in the state government. After acquiring enough information for data to reemerge and for my findings to reach the point of saturation, triangulation of the data produced accurate and reliable results, while providing breath, complexity, richness, and depth (Creswell, 2013)

Transferability

Transferability refers to the applicability of findings in other contexts (Creswell, 2013). The transferability of data and results are assured by obtaining rich, thick descriptions from participants. I encouraged interviewees to expand on their observations and recommendations as Latino community leaders. To ensure the validity of a study, it must be transferable to similar research to the degree that the methods that lead to the

findings can be generalized to other studies (Amankwaa, 2016; Maxwell, 2013; Miles et al., 2014; Shenton, 2004). Practitioners can then assess the study's transferability and compare methodologies.

Dependability

A scholar must provide thick, responsive, thoughtful, and detailed descriptions of the research, as well as the time and context so that another researcher can easily judge if their study could have similar context. Achieving an in-depth description by defining the phenomenon under study in detail permits conclusions to be transferred to other situations, settings, people, and times (Amankwaa, 2016). For me, dependability meant an obligation to thoroughly review all documents, videos, and audio numerous times to examine for accuracy and consistency.

Confirmability

Confirmability regards the extent to which the findings reflect the participants' responses instead of the scholar's biases, aims, or concerns (Amankwaa, 2016). To achieve confirmability, observing the study from an outsider's perspective is necessary (Patton, 2002). Because I alone conducted every aspect of the research, my judgment was essential in establishing reliability by observing the procedures outlined in this chapter.

Results

The following tables reflect the percentage of Latino employees in various agencies. Table 1 shows Illinois state employees by race. Table 2 shows Illinois population by race. Table 3 shows the largest state agencies with percentages of Latino employees. The largest agency, Human Services, employs

12,583 employees, of which 10% are Hispanic. Table 4 shows the exempt positions in 2019 that were available for the administration to hire at its discretion. In 2020, 66 of these positions remained vacant.

Table 1

2019 Illinois State Employees by Race

White alone

Table 2

Illinois Population by Race

White alone

Table 4

Total number of exempt agency positions

Abe Lincoln Presidential Library	*10*

The following section includes the presentation of results generated from the thematic analysis of the data. Results for the research questions are organized according to the frequency of themes. Excerpts from the interviews are provided to exemplify each of the four themes that emerged from the data as factors affecting the hiring of Hispanics in the state government of Illinois. They are inequity, absence of inclusion, absence of outreach strategy, and bias.

Inequity was the most frequent theme participants discussed. They all shared a perception that there was an unequal number of Latinos in state government. To them, the unfair representation was a glaring example of the government's long history of ignoring Latino leaders' objections to their unfair share of representation. Data provided evidence that Hispanics were 17% of the population in the state but had 6% of state jobs. I have provided excerpts of their quotes as examples.

Participant 1

It's wrong if you don't have a clear recognition that you have a long way to go to achieve equality.

Participant 2

Governor Pritzker is the first governor in many years to have hired several Latinos for his administration. And whereas I think that's a significant step forward, it hardly makes a dent in the 6% of Hispanic employees. Hopefully, the Governor hasn't only hired them to appease the community and will give them the power to make changes to improve Latino hiring. Honestly, the state has made a poor effort to include Latinos in any of its agencies.

Participant 3

They're not saying, here is a list of stakeholders that's going to partner with us in Illinois that will help us ensure a more robust pipeline of Latino applicants for all these positions, because we're so far behind. And we need your help to catch up. That's never happened. I've never gotten a phone call to say we need to do this.

Participant 4

They'll hire us for frontline staff, but we're still not in play when it comes to administrators, managers, or directors. If you have a big agency like DHS, who runs it right now is Asian, and she has no Latinos, at all, in her cabinet, except for rehabilitation. It's hard to have black and brown on the same playing field, in any way equal. It's clear the governor's comfort level is with blacks, with enough consideration for brown.

Participant 5

We have a lot of people within government that never got the chance to move up because no one in the management looked like us, so they didn't care about moving us up. They're not working with us.

Participant 6

Historically, the representation of Latinos has been extremely poor at all levels. When you calculate our numbers, we should have at least seven positions

that are at the top. We don't have that at the top. There's only one Latino administrator in all agencies combined.

Participant 7

There’re not enough state employees to fill the bilingual positions needed. A few years back the unemployment office was filled with droves of Latinos because of the recession.

Participant 8

We need a Latino heading Affirmative Action positions to hire more Latinos, the highest minority group in the state, yet African Americans have tripled their state government presence. That is great for their community, but it still leaves us behind.

Absence of inclusion was the second most discussed theme. It was described as a sense of being excluded from participating in government policy changes, particularly regarding their suggestions on practical solutions to increase employment for Latinos.

Participant 1

We've asked them to have Latinos on the hiring panel in each agency. We've got a Hispanic Plan that is not enforced in any state agency, in any nature. They don't understand the importance of hiring people with bilingual skills or making websites accessible to English learners. They don't understand the importance of hiring people with bilingual skills or making websites accessible to English

learners. The inclusion of Latinos is way far away from what we want and expect to see.

Participant 2

I think the politics involved to fill senior positions have to do with politics and not necessarily fair for minorities or Latinos. It's a struggle to get people to represent our community for general consul positions or chief of staff who report to the director, or a public information officer to communicate with Spanish language media to develop programs to educate high school students on state government.

Participant 3

The job applicant pool for the State should be saturated with Latinos to increase their chances of getting hired. There are community organizations that have never been contacted by the State to coordinate any programs or objectives. Honestly, the state has made a poor effort to include Latinos in any of its agencies. Latinos lose the opportunity to gain significant positions that could lead to an increased Latino voice, one that influences programs such as grants, public services, and hiring.

Participant 4

Having Latinos on the inside means more people can offer resources and advice. The political hierarchy doesn't have much respect for the level of power that our community represents.

Participant 5

No agency is following the Hispanic Plan. It's a law, but you know, nobody's, nobody's watching. Latino employment is not important to them. They have not instructed their people at the top to start looking and start changing this mentality of Latino numbers and why we need to get them up. They're cherry-picking who they want. People always say you guys are always asking for everything. Well, guess what? It's because you ignore us!

Participant 6

When you calculate our numbers, we should have at least seven positions that are at the top. We don't have that at the top. There's only one Latino administrator in all agencies combined.

Participant 7

And there's a lot of Latinos from within government that have been in government that never got a chance to move up. They didn't care about moving us up. Most exempt positions (meaning excluded from the mandatory hiring rules) hold some authority over policy and implementation. The number of Latinos in these positions continues to be underrepresented, which often means

there is less of a Latino voice during implementation program designs. Most exempt positions (meaning excluded from the mandatory hiring rules) hold some authority over policy and implementation.

Participant 8

If you have a Latino in an exempt position, it will increase Latino hiring and increase bilingual staffing because, at the top, they can push for these openings to be filled by Latinos. Examples of exempt positions are chief of staff, general counsel, assistant deputies, and other high-ranking authorities. There are many positions that haven't been filled.

Absence of Outreach was the third theme. It included the dissatisfaction that all participants shared regarding the state not doing enough to reach out to the community and recruit.

Participant 1

The state doesn't have a strategy for reaching out to community leaders.

Participant 2

You have to go out and recruit them (Latinos). They are not going to come to the state unless we invite them to learn about the system. Right now, they would need someone to mentor them or guide them on the application process.

Participant 3

There's not a lot of consistency. There isn't an overarching strategy. They need to organize job fairs in different communities. Latinos have a problem with

education, so they should also consider a way of improving their education so that more of them could graduate from high school and college. There are community organizations that have never been contacted by the state to coordinate any programs or objectives.

Participant 5

Why aren't you recruiting or having a training program on how to apply for a state job and get it? We have two state colleges, universities that are HSI, Hispanic Serving Institutes, 50 percent plus. What is the State doing right now at Northeastern and at UIC? What are they doing about recruiting? Are they doing enough?

Participant 6

The State doesn't have a strategy of reaching out to community leaders.

Bias was the fourth theme which all participants addressed, even if they did not employ the word itself. They portrayed bias as a deliberate way to exclude them when jobs are available and instead hiring other groups who are perceived as being more favorable, competent or suitable for positions.

Participant 1

Without a voice, it's always going to be a challenge for Latinos. I think that historically it has been a problem in the State of Illinois. They don't understand the importance of hiring people with bilingual skills or making websites

accessible to English learners, so I think that's been a challenge. The one thing the state does allow is the established bilingual positions. This is probably one reason half of Latinos working for the State got in, because they posted it under a bilingual position.

Participant 2

I think the politics involved to fill senior positions have to do with politics and not necessarily fair for minorities or Latinos. You know this whole process of where you find a job; not everybody wakes up and realizes that you got to go to the right website when you want a position with the State. Or don't know how to navigate it. I think the challenge for most people is how to navigate the application process, to begin with, and that's going to be always a challenge, especially with bilingual applicants.

Participant 3

They need to facilitate the process for bilingual applicants. Latinos lose the opportunity to gain significant positions that could lead to an increased Latino voice, one that influences programs such as grants, public services, and hiring.

Participant 4

It's often problematic for leaders to fully celebrate two racial and ethnic minorities at the same time. And we're struggling with that today.

Participant 5

Latino employment is not important to them. They have not instructed their people at the top to start looking and start changing this mentality of Latino numbers and why we need to get them up. I understand that you're looking for the person most qualified, but we have them they're there. They're not following Affirmative Action. There is no doubt that the system is racist. If a government has a recognition gap and doesn't see it, then they're never going to fix it. Historically, their representation of Latinos has been extremely poor at all levels.

Participant 6

People love saying that there is no systemic or institutionalized racism. They don't know what it’s like to live with bias and discrimination because of your skin color.

Participant 7

Maybe it's true that the government takes better care of them because they vote, and we don't. Most exempt positions (meaning excluded from the mandatory hiring rules) hold some authority over policy and implementation. The number of Latinos in these positions continues to be underrepresented, which often means there is less of a Latino voice during implementation of program designs.

Table 5

Frequency of themes addressed per participant

Themes

Chapter 5:

Chapter 1 introduced the problems in Illinois state's government regarding the lack of integration of Hispanics into its bureaucracy, as well as describing the background, problem statement, purpose of the study, research questions and theoretical foundation, conceptual framework, nature of the study, definitions, assumptions, scope and delimitations, limitations, and significance. Chapter 2 included literature search strategies and a comprehensive literature review of representative bureaucracy. Chapter 3 covered the research design and rationale, the role of the researcher, the methodology, instrumentation, data analysis plan, issues of trustworthiness, and ethical procedures. Chapter 4 included an analysis of my data collection, coding processes, themes, and interviews.

Interpretation of the Findings

Interpretation of the Literature on Representative Bureaucracy

Bureaucratic power is one of the principles and continuing conflicts within the study of public administration. Public administrators play a critical role in representing their communities and acting on their behalf, particularly for those who have historically been marginalized and underserved. Without government employees who represent minority and underserved groups, segments of the population may be excluded from government programs and services that could benefit their community members by providing them with opportunities for a better life. Latino leaders are justified to claim they have rights to fair and equal representation and particularly as administrators with influence on policy decisions.

It is necessary to recruit more underrepresented and historically disadvantaged members of society into the public workforce. This affords them a level of control over the implementation of organizational policies, and goals. When bureaucrats reflect the views of those with similar demographic backgrounds, there is a higher possibility for civil servants to take an interest in actively representing their groups. Seldon (2015) said that when members of diverse groups convert to public officials, they become actors in the political process with the ability to shape public policy.

Interpretation of the Polarities of Democracy

Both representative bureaucracy and the polarities of democracy share the same ideals for democracy. This study explored the effects of polarities of democracy as a consequent motivator of representative decision-making by bureaucrats to the extent that their values and interests are of consequence to the Latino community. Democracy was measured by the degree of engagement with the polarities.

Participation and Representation

Benet (2006) said that representation at a societal level demonstrates a form of legitimization where citizens find a means to provide political and ideological input. Community members' participation and representation as bureaucrats increases confidence in the system of representation, access to government bureaus, and democracy. Based on the results of my research, Illinois failed to afford participation and representation to Latinos and ignored their requests to participate and represent their communities.

Human Rights and Communal Obligations

The human rights and communal obligations polarity pair addresses the human rights of marginalized communities who are hindered from participation in a democratic system, thereby exemplifying the absence of representative bureaucracy. Government organizations must avoid violating human rights. Communities have obligations to protect their members' human rights. When ignored, this can be detrimental to a community. In this study, Latino leaders confirmed their perceptions of being marginalized as a community and excluded from participation. Therefore, excluding Latinos in a democratic system would be considered an assault on their political rights which represents an assault on human rights.

Diversity and Equality

This polarity is an essential element to achieve a diverse but equal workforce in the state. According to the study's participants, without diverse employees who are treated equally, the government cannot represent the state's underserved communities. Lack of diversity is a factor which can lead to barriers in terms of language and culture, particularly for Spanish language speakers. As a result, because Illinois has not addressed its lack of diversity, its inefficiency has led to unequal representation of Latinos.

Freedom and Authority

While freedom should be a condition for democracy, authority creates stability and order in society. Authority is necessary for governments to dissuade citizens from violations. But authority should not hinder citizens' rights to freedom. Illinois appears to hinder Latinos' freedom to work for its government.

Justice and Due Process

Justice affords support to individuals who need legal protection. Due process protects citizens from unfair practices. Participants in this research said the government of Illinois unjustly ignores Latinos' who want to partake in its workforce and ignores its legal obligation to provide them due process. My participants were unaware of an efficient method to validate their complaints and obtain justice for their cause. The Hispanic Employment Plan had legislative approval but was largely ignored by legislators and the administration viewed it as inconsequential.

Limitations of the Study

Because my study included only Illinois Hispanic community leaders, I cannot make inferences regarding the perceptions of Latino community leaders elsewhere. It is always unclear if the interpretation of one group reflects the behavior of a similar group with different demographics. However, this study's outcomes may suggest the potential for similar findings in other governments, but additional research is needed. Other state governments may be perceived differently by their Latino community leaders with whom they have a collaborative relationship.

Recommendations

My research contributed to understanding racial equity in public administrations and explored the relationship between bureaucratic representation and democratic values. Many questions remain as to why such a disparity has existed in Illinois despite Hispanic community leaders voicing their concerns for decades. I offer six suggestions worth future studies:

Examining how representatives from the Federal Affirmative Action program in each state agency collaborate with Latino community leaders may lead to effective hiring measures. I would also recommend future studies identifying Latino representation's equity in other state governments, providing additional research with variables.

Moreover, my study examined the perceptions of Hispanic leaders regarding the extent to which Illinois' hiring practices conformed to the polarities of democracy theory. Future research could examine to what degree, and in what ways, the polarities of democracy theory addresses any conflicting concepts arising from the American founding documents (the Declaration of Independence and the Constitution) and the Federalist and Anti-Federalist papers that set forward a set of values, processes, and attitudes (e.g., the rule of law, checks, and balances, fair elections) that are required for a representative democracy.

Future research could determine how the polarities of democracy theory provides a framework to ensure that our public education system better prepares all students for governmental employment.

Having explored the perceptions of Hispanic leaders regarding the degree to which Illinois' hiring practices conformed to the polarities of democracy theory, further research could analyze the extent and ways, that the polarities of democracy theory provides a useful framework for successfully advancing the United Nations Sustainability Development Goals in Employment.

Implications

Recruitment, Hiring, and Advancing

The state should increase current employment efforts by asking management in all agencies to recruit from all sources for vacancies, including for deputy directors or other administration positions.

Agencies should work with Latino associations at universities, other Hispanic Serving Institutions, and organizations to establish student and entry-level internship programs.

Management should use hiring specialists (outstanding scholars and bilingual/bicultural program; worker-trainee; and paid student internships) to prepare individuals for the state's competitive examination and to recruit Latinos and other qualified candidates for entry and mid-level positions.

Targeted Recruitment and Funding

The state should monitor recruitment program activities and funding to ensure that resources available will allow participation in Hispanic organizations' recruitment events and promote employment opportunities by Spanish-speaking media.

Selection, review, and interview panels must satisfy diversity objectives and ensure the applicant pool for these positions includes Hispanics and other qualified candidates.

Illinois should increase efforts and encourage management officials to establish developmental training programs leading to mission-related or specialized occupations

and ensure Hispanic representation in such programs with other candidates. Latinos should be aware of and encouraged to participate in all formal career development.

Latino employees should partake as mentors and role models to inspire and motivate other Latino employees to pursue education and training opportunities.

The state should encourage Hispanics' retention by offering career progression and performance recognition options, such as special pay allowances, quality increases, performance, and incentive awards, when appropriate and consistent with current regulations and policies.

Mentoring/Internships

As the significant literature from Chapter 2 confirmed, mentoring was extremely helpful for inexperienced potential employees who did not have the traditional qualifications or knowledge required for a successful job application. Several internship and mentoring programs could open doors to ethnic minorities or the underserved.

Latino Employment Program

The Central Management System (CMS) should develop a Latino Employment Program (LEP) to structure resources and commitment in recruitment, hiring, and advancement, training, career development, and education, retention, rotation, and recognition, community outreach, partnerships, and coalitions.

Program Managers

CMS should have a full-time LEP director and full-time or part-time LEP managers at the largest state agencies: Employment Security, Human Services, Children and Family Services, Healthcare and Family Services, Corrections, Transportation,

Revenue, Natural Resources, Innovation, Technology, and Veteran's Affairs to provide the necessary leadership, assistance, and function as integral members of the management team. Also, ensure LEP managers have the visibility and support needed to perform their responsibilities, so that Latinos are aware of employment opportunities at the agencies at all levels of the administration.

Latino Employment Program Structure

The state should ensure the LEP initiatives at the agency level interface with CMS and field activities' regular operation and structure to effectively implement the program and monitor program objectives.

Ensure LEP managers have an opportunity to attend training courses to elevate their skills to practice program requirements, develop leadership and negotiation skills, and establish productive community relations to raise Hispanics' profile in the agencies.

The state should establish a Latino Employment Advisory Committee comprised of five to 10 representatives from the Latino community to follow the plan's implementation and progress. The committee could also recommend to management proposed approaches to increase Latinos' representation in employment and career development, education programs, retention, recognition, etc.

The administration should focus on recruitment, hiring, and advancing. And it should restructure vacant positions below the standard performance level to establish entry-level opportunities, facilitate recruitment, provide professional and administrative candidates from a larger pool of applicants, and ensure that Latinos and other candidates are considered prospects.

The administration should increase current recruitment efforts by asking management to recruit from all sources for all position vacancies, including deputy directors or other administration positions. Agencies should work with the Latino associations at universities, other Hispanic Serving Institutions, and organizations to establish student and entry-level internship programs.

Targeted Recruitment and Funding

Agencies should monitor recruitment program activities and funding to ensure that resources available will allow participation in Hispanic organizations' recruitment events and promote employment opportunities by Spanish speaking media.

Selection, review, and interview panels must satisfy diversity objectives and ensure the applicant pool for these positions includes Hispanics and other qualified candidates.

The administration should increase efforts and encourage management officials to establish developmental training programs leading to mission-related or specialized occupations and ensure Hispanic representation in such programs with other candidates.

Hispanics should be aware of and encouraged to participate in all formal career development.

Latino employees should partake as mentors and role models to inspire and motivate less experienced employees to pursue education and training opportunities.

Management should encourage the retention of Hispanics by offering career progression and performance recognition options, such as special pay allowances, quality

increases, performance, and incentive awards, when appropriate and consistent with current regulations and policies.

Directors should identify and address systemic barriers reported by departing Hispanic employees by employing exit surveys, interviews, or other data collection to ensure that management officials know of general obstacles requiring corrective action.

Community Outreach, Partnership, and Coalitions

Agencies should practice sharing of information regarding employment and advancement opportunities by including Hispanic media to conduct targeted recruitment and community outreach.

Agencies should create a website to provide specific information on employment and career opportunities, annual training conferences, mentoring opportunities, post hyperlinks to the websites of Hispanic professional organizations, and other related groups.

LEP managers should have established productive relationships with local high schools and higher education institutions with a high representation of Hispanic student enrollment. They should also encourage managers and supervisors to participate in community outreach activities, partnerships, and coalitions with Hispanic associations, professional organizations, disabled veterans, and other important groups.

Conclusion

In 2020, one of the most pervasive issues in American society was the importance of inclusion and diversity. My research demonstrated that Latinos' equity had not reached

the goals of representative bureaucracy and the ideals of democracy that called for fair treatment and equal opportunity for all, regardless of race or social status. Parity for Hispanics in the government workforce of Illinois would strengthen their representation and allow them to partake in services, programs, and policies that could increase their quality of life and the lives of Latinos in underserved communities. Finally, the dissertation presented and responded to questions absent from the existing literature on Latino underrepresentation in Illinois state government by examining Hispanics' persistent inequity in state civil service.

The current study proposed a case study research design focused on qualitative interview techniques that required consideration of differences in the perception of barriers to and facilitators of employment for Latinos in Illinois' state government. Participants paralleled on the central issues and cited unfair and discriminatory practices in the state's hiring process. The study's results confirmed that Hispanic community leaders in Illinois have consistently demanded a fair opportunity for state jobs to reflect their population percentage, without success. There was evidence of opportunities for improvement, such as better outreach to communities, developing a sizeable quantity of internships, mentoring programs, and developing targeted hiring programs.

My findings suggest that Illinois' policymakers should take this study into account by acknowledging the urgency of this problem and using this data to develop programs that assist, encourage, and recruit Latino candidates. In a democracy, equality and justice are fundamental human rights. Closing the gap of this disparaging inequality is long overdue. Increasing the opportunity for Latinos to represent their community in state

government is one step closer to ending the forces of institutional bias, discrimination, and racism. Only a strong will can confront racism head-on to achieve racial and ethnic equality. In the words of Bell (1992), we cannot assume that only the dominant culture's decisive component perpetuates a racist ideology. We fool ourselves when we argue that Whites do not know what racial subordination does to its victims. Indeed, it is difficult to believe that no one outside of the Hispanic community had noticed the sizable divide, stark inequality, and injustice.

References

Amankwaa, L. (2016). Creating protocols for trustworthiness in qualitative research. *Journal of Cultural Diversity*. Fall 23(3): 121-127.

Andrews R., Ashworth, R., & Meir, J. (2014). Representative bureaucracy and fire service performance. *International Public Management Journal.* 17(1): 1-24. DOI: 10.1080/10967494.2014.874253

Benavides, A., D. & Hernandez, J. C. T. (2007). Serving diverse communities-cultural competency. *Public Management, Vol. July 2007.* https://icma.org/documents/serving-diverse-communities-cultural-competency

Benet, W. J. (2006). *The polarity management model of workplace democracy* (Order No. NR15724) [Doctoral dissertation, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto, Canada]. Available from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global; ProQuest One Academic. (304928339). https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/polarity-management-model-workplace-democracy/docview/304928339

Benet, W. J. (2012). *The polarities of democracy: A theoretical framework for building a healthy, sustainable, and just world.* Unpublished Manuscript. Social Economy Centre, Adult Education and Community Development Program of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the University of Toronto, Canada.

Benet, W. J. (2012a, June). Managing the polarities of democracy: A social economy framework for healthy, sustainable, and just communities. Paper presented at the

Association for Social Economics' 14th World Congress of Social Economics, Glasgow, Scotland.

Benet, W. J. (2012b). Managing the polarities of democracy: A theoretical framework for building a healthy, sustainable, and just world. Manuscript in preparation. Social Economy Centre, University of Toronto, Ontario, Canada. Benet, 2013.

Benet, W. J. (2013). Managing the polarities of democracy: A theoretical framework for positive social change. Journal of Social Change 5(1), 26-39. doi:10.5590/JOSC.2013.05.1.03.

Bodkin, C. P. (2016). Public sector mentoring: An analysis of mentor-protégé relationships and their effects on outcomes. https://repository.lib.ncsu.edu/bitstream/handle/1840.16/11216/etd.pdf?sequence=2

Bradbury, M., & Kellough, J.E. (2008). Representative bureaucracy: Exploring the potential for active representation in local government. Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory 18(4): 697-14. DOI: 10.1093/jopart/mum033

Bradbury, M., & Kellough, J.E. (2010). Representative bureaucracy: assessing the evidence on active representation. The American Review of Public Administration, vol. 41, 2: pp. 157-167. http://journals.sagepub.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/action/doSearch?field1=Title&text1=%22Representative%20bureaucracy:%20assessing%20the%20evidence%

20on%20active%20representation%22&field2=AllField&text2=&Ppub=&Ppub=&AfterYear=2011&BeforeYear=2011&access=.

Capers, J. K. (2017). The Effect of the external environment on bureaucratic representation: Assessing the passive to active representation link. The American Review of Public Administration Vol.48, Issue 4, pages 301-317. https://doi-org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.1177/0275074016686715.

Creswell, J. W. (2003). Research design qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approach. Sage Publications. https://us.sagepub.com/en-us/nam/research-design/book255675

Crowe, M., Inder, M., & Porter, R. (2015). Conducting qualitative research in mental Health: Thematic and content analyses. Australian & New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry, 49, 616-623. doi:10.1177/0004867415582053.

Cuellar, A., Jr., & Vega, A. (2007). Hispanic Association of Colleges and Universities National Internship Program: A Means toward Achieving a Representative Bureaucracy. Journal of Hispanic Higher Education, 6(1), 89–100. https://journals-sagepub-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/doi/10.1177/1538192706295376

Donner, G., & Wheeler, M. (2007). Mentoring as a leadership development strategy. Canadian Nurse, 103(2), 24-25. https://eds-b-ebscohostcom.proxy1.ncu.edu/eds/pdfviewer .

Fazio, R. H., & Olson, M. A. (2003). Implicit measures in social cognition research: Their meaning and use. Annual Review of Psychology, 54, 297–327. doi: 10.1146/annurev.psych.54.101601.145225.

Fiske, S. T., & Taylor, S. E. (1991). Social cognition (2nd ed.). McGraw-Hill.

Geelan, D.R. (2004). Weaving narrative nets to capture classrooms: Multimethod qualitative approaches for research in education. Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Glick, Dunod P. (1991). Trait-based and sex-based discrimination in occupational prestige, occupational salary, and hiring. Sex Roles, 25(5/6), 351–378. doi:10.1007/BF00289761.

Greenwald, A. G., McGhee, D. E., & Schwartz, J. L. (1998). Measuring individual differences in implicit cognition: The implicit association test. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 74(6), 1464–1480. doi:10.1037/0022-3514.74.6.1464.

Haegele, J. A., & Hodge, S. R. (2015). Quantitative methodology: A guide for emerging Physical education and adapted physical education researchers. Physical Educator, 72, 59-75. doi:10.18666/TPE-2015-V72-I5-6133 Hadwiger, 1973.

Harrison, H., Birks, M., Franklin, R., & Mills, J. (2017). Case study research: Foundations and methodological orientations. Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung / Forum: Qualitative Social Research, 18(1). doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.17169/fqs-18.1.2655.

Hays-Thomas, R. (2016). Managing workplace diversity and inclusion: A psychological perspective. https://books.google.com.

Heckman, J. (1998). Detecting discrimination. The Journal of Economic Perspectives, 12, 101–116. doi:10.1257/ jep.12.2.101.

Hongseok, L. (2019). Does increasing racial minority representation contribute to overall organizational performance? The role of organizational mission and diversity climate. The American Review of Public Administration, 49(4), 454–468. http://dx.doi.org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.1177/0275074019831101

Hudson, K. (2007). The new labor market segmentation: Labor market dualism in the new economy. Social Science Research, 36(1), 286–312. doi: 10.1016/j.ssresearch.2005.11.005.

Huffman, M. L., & Cohen, P. N. (2004). Racial wage inequality: Job segregation and devaluation across U.S. labor markets. American Journal of Sociology, 109(4), 902–936. doi:10.1086/378928.

Illinois Department of Central Management Services (2019). Hispanic Employment Plan. https://www2.illinois.gov/cms/personnel/DEP/Pages/HEP.aspx#:~:text=The%20State%20Hispanic%20Employment%20Plan,diversity%20of%20our%20great%20state.

2020 Illinois Civil Service Commission. Personnel Rules: State Illinois. https://www2.illinois.gov/sites/icsc/Documents/2020%20Annual%20Report.pdf

Irwin, S., & Winterton, M. (2012). Qualitative Secondary Analysis and Social Explanation. Sociological Research Online, 17(2), 1–12. https://scholar.google.com/scholar?q=Irwin,+S.,+%26+Winterton,+M.+(2012).+

Qualitative+Secondary+Analysis+and+Social+Explanation.&hl=en&as_sdt=0&as_vis=1&oi=scholart.

Jingrui Ju, Luning Liu, & Yuqiang, Feng (2019). Public and private value in citizen participation in E-governance: Evidence from a government-sponsored green commuting platform. Government Information Quarterly. El Sevier doi.org/10.1016/j.giq.2019.101400.

Johnson, B. (1996). Polarity management. HRD Press.

Kanter, R. M. (1977). Some effects of proportions on group life: Skewed sex ratios and responses to token women. American Journal of Sociology, 82, 965–990. doi:10.1086/226425.

Kaufman, R. L. (2002). Assessing alternative perspectives on race and sex employment segregation. American Sociological Review, 67(4), 547–572. doi:10.2307/3088945.

Kay, A. C., Czapliński, S., & Jost, J. T. (2009). Left–right ideological differences in system justification following exposure to complementary versus non complementary stereotype exemplars. European Journal of Social Psychology, 39(2), 290–298. doi:10.1002/ejsp.500.

Kay, A. C., & Jost, J. T. (2003). Complementary justice: Effects of "poor but happy" and "poor but honest" stereotype exemplars on system justification and implicit activation of the justice motive. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 85(5), 823–837. doi:10.1037/0022-3514.85.5.823

Keiser, L. R., Wilkins, V. M., Meier, K. J., Holland, C. A. (2002). Lipstick and logarithms: Gender, institutional context, and representative bureaucracy. *American Political Science Review*, 96, 553-564.

Kingsley, D. J. (1945). Representative bureaucracy: An interpretation of the British Civil Service. *American Sociological Review*, *10*(4), 576-577.

King, E. B., Madera, J. M., Hebl, M. R., Knight, J. L., & Mendoza, S. A. (2006). What's in a name? A multiracial investigation of the role of occupational stereotypes in selection decisions. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 36 (5), 1145–1159. doi:10.1111/j.0021-9029.2006.00035.x.

Kmec, J. A. (2003). Minority job concentration and wages. Social Problems, 50(1), 38–59. doi:10.1525/sp.2003.50.1.38,

Knight, J. L., Hebl, M. R., Foster, J. B., & Mannix, L. M. (2003). Out of role? Out of luck: The influence of race and leadership status on performance appraisals. *Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies*, 9(3), 85–93. doi:10.1177/107179190300900308.

Kohli, J., Gans, J., & Hairston, J. (2011, September 22). A better, more diverse senior executive service in 2050 more representative leadership will improve the effectiveness and efficiency of the 100-federal government. *American Progress.* https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/race/reports/2011/09/22/10251/a-better-more-diverse-senior-executive-service-in-2050/

Krings, F., & Olivarez, J. (2007). At the doorstep to employment: Discrimination against immigrants as a function of applicant ethnicity, job type, and raters' prejudice.

International Journal of Psychology, 42(6), 406–417. doi:10.1080/00207590701251721.

Lee, H. (2019). Does increasing racial minority representation contribute to overall organizational performance? The role of organizational mission and diversity climate. American Review of Public Administration, 49(4), 454–468. https://doi-org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.1177/027507401983110.

Liang, J., Park, S., & Zhao, T. (2020). Representative Bureaucracy, Distributional Equity, and Environmental Justice. Public Administration Review, 3, 402. https://doi-org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.1111/puar.13160.

Linehan, M., & Scullion, H. (n.d). The development of female global managers: the role of mentoring and networking. Journal of Business Ethics, 83(1). https://doiorg.proxy1.ncu.edu/10.1007/s10551-007-9657-0.

Lipton, J. P., O'Connor, M., Terry, C., & Bellamy, E. (1991). Neutral job titles and occupational stereotypes: When legal and psychological realities conflict. Journal of Psychology, 125, 129–151. doi :10.1080/00223980.1991.10543278.

Martins, L. L., Milliken, F. J., Wiesenfeld, B. M., & Saldgado, S. R. (2003). Racioethnic diversity and group members' experiences: the role of the racioethnic diversity of the organizational context. Group & Organization Management, (1), 75. https://search-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login.aspx?direct=true&db=edsgea&AN=edsgcl.100198536&site=eds-live&scope=site.

Maxwell, J. A. (2005). Qualitative research design: An interactive approach (3rd ed.). (Vol.41). Sage Publications.
DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781526421036788354

McLeod, L. P., & Lobel, A, S. (1992). The effects of ethnic diversity on idea generation on small groups. *Academy of Management Best Papers Proceedings.* 1992, pp. 227-231. 5p. DOI: 10.5465/AMBPP.1992.17515639.

Meier, K. J. (1997). Bureaucracy and democracy: the case for more bureaucracy and less democracy. *Public Administration Review*, *57*, 193–199. https://doi-org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.2307/976648.

Meier, K. J., & Bohte, J. (2001). Structure and discretion: missing links in representative bureaucracy. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*,4, 450-470 https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordjournals.jpart.a003511

Merriam, S. (2009). Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation. Revised and expanded from qualitative research and case study applications in education. John Wiley & Sons.

Ndobo, André & Tomaskovic-Devey, D. (1993). The gender and race composition of jobs and the male/female, White/Black pay gaps. Social Forces, 72(1), 45–76. doi:10.2307/2580159.

Ndobo, Andre, Faure, Alice, Boisselier, Jeanne & Giannaki, Stella (2018). The ethno-racial segmentation jobs: The impacts of the occupational stereotypes on hiring decisions, *The Journal of Social Psychology*, 158:6, 663-679 DOI: 10.1080/00224545.2017.1389685.

Nicholson-Crotty, S. & Grissom, A.& Nicholson-Crotty, J. & Redding, C. (2016). *Journal of Public Administration & Administration Theory*. Disentangling the casual mechanism of representative bureaucracy: Evidence from assignment of students to gifted programs. Doi:10.1093/jopart/ muw024

Patton, MQ. (2002). Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods. Sage Publications.

Petersen, L. E., & Dietz, J. (2005). Prejudice and enforcement of workforce homogeneity as explanation for employment discrimination. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 35, 144–159. doi:10.1111/j.1559-1816. 2005.tb02097.x.

Popielarz, P. A., & McPherson, J. M. (1995). On the edge or in between: Niche position, niche overlap, and the duration of voluntary association memberships. *The American Sociological Review*, 101, 698–720. doi:10.1086/ 230757.

Powell, G. N. (1993). Women and men in management. (2nd ed.). Sage.

Powell, G. N., & Butterfield, D. A. (2002). Exploring the influence of decision makers' race and gender on actual promotions to top management. *Personnel Psychology*, 55(2), 397–428. doi:10.1111/j.1744-6570. 2002.tb00115.x.

Prewitt, K. (2010). When social inequality maps to demographic diversity, what then for liberal democracies? *Social Research, 77*(1), 1-20,425. https://ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/docview/872088173?accountid=14872.

Riccucci, M. N., & Van Ryzin, G. G. (2017). Representative bureaucracy: a lever to enhance social equity, coproduction, and democracy. *Public Administration Review*, 77(1), 21-U187. https://eds-a-ebscohost-

com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/detail/detail?vid=4&sid=ebb66aca-ee59-4b12-982e785f022de572%40sessionmgr4009&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWRzLWxpdmUmc2NvcGU9c2l0ZQ%3d%3d#AN=000392519200006&db=edswss.

Reskin, B. F., McBrier, D. B., & Kmec, J. A. (1999). The determinants and consequences of workplace sex and race composition. Annual Review of Sociology, 25, 335–361. doi: 10.1146/annurev.soc.25.1.335.

Rice, J. (2012). Why Make Diversity So Hard to Achieve? Harvard Business Review, 90(6), 40. https://search-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login.aspx?direct=true&db=bth&AN=75369836&site=eds-live&scope=site.

Roch, C. H., and D. W. Pitts. (2012). Differing effects of representative bureaucracy in charter schools and traditional public schools. The American Review of Public Administration 42:282-302.

Roman, A. V. (2017). The Determinants of Public Administrators' Participation in Policy Formulation. The American Review of Public Administration, 47(1), 102–129. https://doi.org/10.1177/0275074015577799.

Roscigno, V. J., Williams, L. M., & Byron, R. A. (2012). Workplace racial discrimination and middle-class vulnerability. American Behavioral Scientist, 56(5), 696–710. doi:10.1177/0002764211433805.

Sabharwal, M., Levine H. & D'Agostino, M. (2016). A conceptual content analysis of 75 years of diversity research in public administration. Review of Public Personnel

Administration. http://journals.sagepubom.ezp.waldenu library.org. /doi/10.1177/0734371X16671368.

Schröter, E. (2019). From the Politics of Bureaucracy to the politics of representative bureaucracy. British Journal of Politics & International Relations, 21(3), 494–503. https://doi-org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.1177/1369148119842036.

Shafritz, J., M. & Rosenbloom, D., H. (1984). Essentials of labor relations. Reston Pub Co.

Seldon, S., C. (1998). The Promise of Representative Bureaucracy: Diversity and responsiveness in a government agency. Routledge. doi.org/10.4324/9781315699196.

Semyonov, M., & Herring, C. (2007). Segregated jobs or ethnic niches? The impact of racialized employment on earnings inequality. Research in Social Stratification and Mobility, 25, 245–257. doi: 10.1016/j.rssm.2007.08.006.

Stainback, K., & Irvin, M. (2012). Workplace racial composition, perceived discrimination, and organizational attachment. Social Science Research, 41, 657–670. doi: 10.1016/j.ssresearch.2011.11.016.

Stewart, L., & Perlow, R. (2001). Applicant race, job status, and racial attitude as predictors of employment discrimination. Journal of Business and Psychology, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers. 16(2), 259–274. doi:10.1023/A:1011113301301.

Strouble, B. W., Jr. (2015). Racism vs. social capital: A case study of two majority black communities (Doctoral dissertation, Walden University, School of Public Policy).

Available from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global Full Text database, UMI Publishing. (Order No. 3717562)

Tajfel, H., & Turner, J. C. (1986). The social identity theory of intergroup behavior. In S. Worchel, & W. G. Austin (Eds), Psychology and intergroup relations (pp. 7–24). Nelson-Hall Publishers.

Terpstra, D. E., & Larsen, J. M. (1980). A note on job type and applicant races as determinants of hiring decisions. *Journal of Occupational Psychology*, 53(2), 117–119. doi :10.1111/j.2044-8325. 1980.tb00015.x 678.

Tobor, J. O. (2014). Urhobo culture and the amnesty program in Niger Delta, Nigeria: An ethnographic case study (Doctoral dissertation, Walden University, School of Public Policy). Available from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global Full Text database, UMI Publishing. (Order No. 3645926)

Tomaskovic-Devey, D., & Stainback, K. (2007). Discrimination and desegregation: Equal opportunity progress in U.S. private sector workplaces since the civil rights act. *The Annals of the American Academy*, 609), 49–84. doi:10.1177/ 0002716206294809.

Tomaskovic-Devey, D., Zimmer, C., Stainback, K., Robinson, C., Taylor, T., & McTague, T. (2006). Documenting desegregation: Segregation in American workplaces by race, ethnicity, and sex, 1966-2003. *American Sociological Review*, 71(4), 565–588. doi:10.1177/000312240607100403.

United States Census, 2019. https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/il,US/RHI725217.

U.S. Department of Education. (2018). Status and trends in the education of racial and ethnic groups 2018. https://nces.ed.gov/pubs2019/2019038.pdf.

Van Dijk, T. A. (1992). Discourse and the denial of racism. Discourse and Society, 3(1), 87–118. doi:10.1177/ 0957926592003001005.

Van Riper, P. P. (1969). Bureaucracy, politics, and public policy. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, *14*(3), 494–495. https://doi-org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.2307/2391155.

Verkuyten, M., De Jong, W., & Masson, K. (1994). Racial discourse, attitude, and rhetorical maneuvers race talk in the Netherlands. *Journal of Language and Social Psychology*, 13(3), 278–298. doi:10.1177/0261927X94133003.

Waldinger, R., & Bailey, T. (1994). The new immigrants. In E. Gintzberg (Ed.), Changing U.S. labor market (pp. 194–199). Westview Press.

Warikoo, N. (2017). Our compelling interests: the value of diversity for democracy and prosperous society. *Contemporary Sociology*. Vol 47, Issue 1, pp. 86 – 88. https://doi-org.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/10.1177/0094306117744805z.

Watkins-Hayes, C. (2009). Race-Ing the bootstrap climb: Black and Latino bureaucrats in post-reform welfare offices, *Social Problems*, Vol. 56. https://doi.org/10.1525/sp.2009.56.2.285.

Watson, S., Appiah, O., & Thornton, C. G. (2011). The effect of name on pre-interview impressions and occupational stereotypes: The case of black sales job applicants. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 41(10), 2405–2420. doi:10.1111/j.1559-1816.2011. 00822.x.

Wetherell, M., & Potter, J. (1992). Mapping the language of Racism. Columbia University Press.

Wilkins, V.M., L. R. (2006). Linking passive and active representation by gender: The case of child support agencies. Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory, 16, 87-102.

Wilkins, V. M., Williams, B. N. (2008). Black or blue: Racial profiling and representative bureaucracy. Public Administration Review, 68, 654-664.

Wilson, K. Y. (2010). An analysis of bias in supervisor narrative comments in performance appraisal. Human Relations, 63, 1903–1933. doi:10.1177/0018726710369396.

Wingfield, A. H., & Alston, R. S. (2014). Maintaining hierarchies in predominantly white organizations: A theory of racial tasks. American Behavioral Scientist, 58(2), 274–287. doi:10.1177/0002764213503329.

Yin, R.K. (2013). Case study research: Design and methods (5th ed.). Sage.

Yin, R.K. (2009). Case study research: Design and methods (4th ed.). Sage.

Zick, A., Pettigrew, T. F., & Wagner, U. (2008). Ethnic prejudice and discrimination in Europe. Journal of Social Issues, 64(2), 233–251. doi:10.1111/j.1540-4560.2008.00559.x

Ziegert, J. C., & Hanges, P. J. (2005). Employment discrimination: The role of implicit attitudes, motivation, and a climate for racial bias. Journal of Applied Psychology, 90(3), 553–562. doi:10.1037/0021-9010.90.3.553.