

2020

Strategies Human Resource Managers Use to Reduce Employee Turnover

Fatema Turkistani
Walden University

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.waldenu.edu/dissertations>



Part of the [Business Commons](#)

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies Collection at ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact ScholarWorks@waldenu.edu.

Walden University

College of Management and Technology

This is to certify that the doctoral study by

Fatema Turkistani

has been found to be complete and satisfactory in all respects,
and that any and all revisions required by
the review committee have been made.

Review Committee

Dr. Kathleen Andrews, Committee Chairperson, Doctor of Business Administration Faculty

Dr. Christopher Beehner, Committee Member, Doctor of Business Administration Faculty

Dr. Gregory Uche, University Reviewer, Doctor of Business Administration Faculty

Chief Academic Officer and Provost
Sue Subocz, Ph.D.

Walden University
2020

Abstract

Strategies Human Resource Managers Use to Reduce Employee Turnover

by

Fatema Turkistani

Ph. D., MCPHS University, 2016

MS, MCPHS University, 2014

Pharm D, King Abdulaziz University, 2010

Doctoral Study Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Business Administration

Walden University

June 2020

Abstract

One of the highest costs of employee turnover in the United States is in the pharmaceutical industry, where employee turnover is on the rise and affects profitability. Pharmaceutical leaders and resource managers are concerned with employee turnover because the estimated costs of employee turnover range between 70% and 300% of an employee's annual salary. Using Bass's transformational leadership theory as the conceptual framework, the purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to explore strategies human resource managers in the pharmaceutical industry use to reduce employee turnover. Data were collected from a review of company documents and face-to-face semistructured interviews with 5 human resources managers of different pharmaceutical companies in the Northeast United States. Thematic analysis following Yin's 5 step approach was performed for data analysis using data compilation, data disassembly, data reassembly, data interpretation, and conclusion. Three primary themes emerged: hiring and retention strategy, pay and benefits strategy, and career growth strategy. It is recommended managers offer incentive and benefits programs and expand training programs. The implications for positive social change include the potential to reduce employee turnover, which may lead to increased stability for families of employees, new employment opportunities, and the promotion of prosperity for the community.

Strategies Human Resource Managers Use to Reduce Employee Turnover

by

Fatema Turkistani

Ph. D., MCPHS University, 2016

MS, MCPHS University, 2014

Pharm D, King Abdulaziz University, 2010

Doctoral Study Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Business Administration

Walden University

June 2020

Dedication

I dedicate my study to my husband, who inspired me to move forward in my doctoral journey. Your encouragement and support help me to change my worldview. I also dedicated my study to my son. Your smile and laugh give me the happiness that encourages me not to give up and increase my passion for achieving my goals.

Acknowledgments

A profound acknowledgment goes out to my committee chair, Dr. Kate Andrews. Thank you so much for the continuous support you provided. I appreciate your time, effort, comments, and feedback that help me reach this point. I also would like to acknowledge Dr. Christopher Beehner (the secondary committee member) and Dr. Gregory Uche (university research reviewer) for their valuable comments, feedback, and suggestions.

Table of Contents

List of Tables	iv
Section 1: Foundation of the Study.....	1
Background of the Problem.....	1
Problem Statement	2
Purpose Statement.....	2
Nature of the Study	2
Research Question.....	4
Interview Questions.....	4
Conceptual Framework	4
Operational Definitions.....	5
Assumptions, Limitations, and Delimitations.....	6
Assumptions	6
Limitations.....	6
Delimitations	7
Significance of the Study	7
Contribution to Business Practice.....	8
Implications for Social Change	8
A Review of the Professional and Academic Literature.....	8
Organization of the Review.....	9
Strategy for Searching the Literature.....	9
Transformational Leadership Theory	10
The Concept of Employee Turnover	21

Employee Retention	24
Theoretical Perspectives on Employee Turnover: Employee’s Perspective	28
The Reasons for Employee Departure.....	29
Conclusion of the Literature Review.....	45
Transition	46
Section 2: The Project.....	49
Purpose Statement.....	49
Role of the Researcher	49
Participants	53
Research Method.....	55
Research Design.....	57
Population and Sampling	60
Ethical Research.....	65
Data Collection Instruments.....	68
Data Collection Technique.....	72
Data Organization Technique.....	76
Data Analysis	78
Reliability and Validity.....	85
Reliability	86
Validity	87
Transition and Summary.....	93
Section 3: Application to Professional Practice and Implications for Change.....	94
Introduction.....	94

Presentation of the Findings.....	94
Theme 1: Hiring and Retention Strategy.....	96
Theme 2: Pay and Benefit Strategy.....	107
Theme 3: Career Growth Strategy.....	118
Applications to Professional Practice.....	127
Implications for Social Change.....	129
Recommendations for Action.....	130
Recommendations for Further Research.....	131
Reflections.....	132
Conclusion.....	133
References.....	134
Appendix A: Interview Protocol.....	168
Appendix B: Interview Questions.....	170

List of Tables

Table 1. Strategies Adopted for Reducing Employee Turnover.....	96
Table 2. Subthemes in Hiring Strategy.....	97
Table 3. Employee Turnover Rates by Pharmaceutical Companies.....	106
Table 4. Subthemes of Pay and Benefit Strategy.....	108
Table 5. Subthemes in Career Growth Strategy.....	121

Section 1: Foundation of the Study

Employee turnover is continually increasing in the United States (Bureau of Labor Statistics [BLS], 2017). According to Shahin (2017), employee turnover in the pharmaceutical industry is causing significant concern among business owners. Shahin indicated that there are other industries with high employee turnover levels, but the costs associated with employee turnover are higher in the pharmaceutical industry than in other sectors. Al Mamun and Hasan (2017) explained that employee turnover negatively affects business performance and profitability due to loss of productivity. In this study, I explored employee turnover in the pharmaceutical industry to identify strategies that human resource (HR) managers could use to reduce employee turnover.

Background of the Problem

Employee turnover costs approximately 2.5 times the costs associated with retaining an employee (Sinha & Shukla, 2013). Huang et al. (2016) estimated the costs of employee turnover to range between 70% and 300% of an employee's annual salary. There are different reasons why employees in the pharmaceutical industry may be motivated to leave their jobs.

Some of the most pervasive reasons for employee turnover include rapid career advancement, numerous employment opportunities, and downsizing (Hejase, El Dirani, Hamdar, & Hazimeh, 2016; Naseer, ul Haq, & Farooq, 2018). Many researchers demonstrated that there is a positive relationship between motivation and job satisfaction (Alam, 2015; Mathieu, Fabi, Lacoursière, & Raymond, 2016). More importantly, there is evidence that there is a negative relationship between employee motivation and employee turnover intention (Gupta, Bhattacharya, Sheorey, & Coelho, 2018). Hooi and Leong

(2015) mentioned that job satisfaction leads to low employee turnover level. Therefore, decreasing employee turnover level leads to increased business performance (Al Mamun & Hasan, 2017). That is why HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry should develop strategies to reduce employee turnover.

Problem Statement

Employee turnover continues to increase and affect business profitability (BLS, 2017). During the period from September 2016 to September 2017, the total number of employee turnovers increased from 4.9 million to 5.2 million (BLS, 2017). The general business problem is that high employee turnover negatively affects the profitability of companies in the pharmaceutical industry. The specific business problem is that some HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry lack strategies to reduce employee turnover.

Purpose Statement

The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to explore strategies that HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry used to reduce employee turnover. The targeted population consisted of the HR managers of the four pharmaceutical companies in the Northeast, United States. The implications for positive social change include the potential to develop strategies to reduce employee turnover, which in turn may lead to more stability for families of employees, new employment opportunities, and promotion of prosperity for the community.

Nature of the Study

According to Yin (2018), there are three types of research methods: qualitative, quantitative, and mixed research methods. Researchers use qualitative methodologies to explore different perspectives and derive themes from the responses of the interviewees

(Yin, 2018). Qualitative research was the most appropriate research method for my study because I explored different perspectives and derive themes from the responses of the interviewees. According to Magruk (2015), researchers use the quantitative research method to test theories and hypotheses and generalize the study results. A quantitative research method was not appropriate for my study because I was not testing theories and hypotheses and intending to generalize the study results. Mixed methods require using both qualitative and quantitative methods (Archibald, 2016; Syed & Nelson, 2015). Therefore, the mixed methods were not appropriate for my study because I was using only the qualitative research method and not the quantitative method.

There are four primary research designs for qualitative research: case study, phenomenological, narrative, and ethnographical (Yin, 2018). Researchers use a case study design to investigate a phenomenon in depth and describes the event in rich text (Yin, 2018). For my study, the case study design was the most appropriate design because I wanted to investigate an event in-depth and provide a rich text description. A phenomenological study design is used to focus on human lived experiences (Letourneau, 2015). The phenomenological study design was inappropriate for my study because I was not focusing on the human experience. According to Shapiro (2016), a narrative study design is used derive a shared narrative context from the collected life stories of participants. The narrative study design was not a suitable study design for my study because I did not collect the life stories of participants. Researchers use an ethnographical design to engage participants in research and study their shared beliefs, behaviors, and experiences over an extended time (Baskerville & Myers, 2015). Therefore, the

ethnographical design was inappropriate for my study because I did not collect data about shared beliefs and behaviors over an extended period.

Research Question

What strategies do HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry use to reduce employee turnover?

Interview Questions

1. What strategies have you used to reduce employee turnover?
2. How do you measure the success of strategies for reducing employee turnover?
3. What are the major obstacles you faced in implementing strategies to reduce employee turnover?
4. How did you overcome these major obstacles to implementing strategies to reduce employee turnover?
5. What additional information would you like to provide about strategies to reduce employee turnover?

Conceptual Framework

For the conceptual framework of this study, I used the transformational leadership theory. In 1978, Burns (1978) developed the transformational leadership theory and focused on the premise of leaders to inspire their followers to change and work toward common goals. Based on Burns's work, in 1985, Bass (1985) identified four key tenets of the transformational leadership theory: (a) inspirational motivation, (b) intellectual stimulation, (c) idealized influence, and (d) individualized consideration.

Researchers use transformational leadership theory to explore how leaders may inspire their followers (Brewer et al., 2016; Phaneuf, Boudrias, Rousseau, & Brunelle,

2016). Transformational leaders inspire their followers to change expectations, perceptions, and motivations for work toward common goals (Jyoti & Dev, 2015; Mathew & Gupta, 2015). Leaders may use the transformational leadership theory tenets to implement positive change in an organization (Herman, Huang, & Lam, 2013; Waldman, Carter, & Hom, 2012). Using transformational leadership theory is critical in reducing employee turnover (Herman et al., 2013; Waldman et al., 2012). I used the transformational leadership theory as a lens for exploring the strategies HR managers used to reduce employee turnover.

Operational Definitions

The following key terms were used throughout this study:

Charismatic leadership: Charismatic leadership refers to empowering style in which leaders focus on the followers and their respective goals and aspirations (Cole, Bruch, & Shamir, 2009).

Epoché: Epoché refers to a temporary prevention of coming to sensible conclusions (Van Manen, 2017). Researchers have relied on the phenomenon of epoché-reduction to reduce bias during their investigations (Van Manen, 2017).

Employee retention: Employee retention is the act of keeping employees with an organization for a more extended period (Rose & Raja, 2016).

Employee turnover: Employee turnover is the act of employees to permanently resign from an organization either on a voluntary or involuntary basis (Puspita & Susanty, 2017).

Job satisfaction: Job satisfaction is a positive feeling about the job due to its characteristics (Schaumberg & Flynn, 2017).

Organizational culture: Organizational culture is the shared values and beliefs within any given organization that informs patterns of employees' behavior (Ellinas, Allan, & Johansson, 2017; Serpa, 2016).

Assumptions, Limitations, and Delimitations

Assumptions

Leedy and Ormrod (2015) defined assumptions as imagined situations that appear realistic. According to Marshall and Rossman (2016), researchers use assumptions to support such statements because there is a lack of empirical evidence. I assumed that employee turnover was a critical issue for HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry. I also assumed that the participants in my study (HR managers) provided an in-depth context and were honest and truthful in their responses to the interview questions. Finally, I assumed that a qualitative multiple case study was the most appropriate research design for this study because the investigation of the event was in-depth and should had a rich text description.

Limitations

Limitations are potential weaknesses of the study (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). According to Helmich, Boerebach, Arah, and Lingard (2015), study limitations are sources of uncertainty in research. Therefore, researchers do not always claim the generalizability of their study results (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). One of this study's limitations was the lack of generalizability of the findings. The findings may not reflect the views of all HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry. The findings depend on the data obtained from a limited number of HR managers of only four pharmaceutical companies in the Northeast United States. Another study limitation was the limited

transferability of the findings to other settings because the focus was only on HR managers. A further limitation was that I depended on the accuracy of the responses to my questions during the interview with participants who had implemented successful strategies to reduce employee turnover in the pharmaceutical industry.

Delimitations

Delimitations refer to the scope of the study (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). According to Knafl, Leeman, Havill, Crandell, and Sandelowski (2015), delimitations are the boundaries of the research. The geographical location was a delimitation of my study because the focus was only on the Northeast of the United States, and the participants were only from this geographical area. Another delimitation was using a purposeful sampling method because I identified HR managers (who implemented successful strategies to reduce employee turnover) to provide accurate responses to the interview questions. An additional delimitation was focusing the scope of this study on exploring strategies that HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry used to reduce employee turnover; therefore, not addressing other issues such as business sustainability and profitability that might affect pharmaceutical industry leaders.

Significance of the Study

High employee turnover is a challenge for managers in the industry (Wang, X., Wang, Xu, & Ji, 2014). Employee turnover is critical to business practice because it affects the business profitability (Al Mamun & Hasan, 2017). In this section, I will discuss the potential contributions to business practice and the implications for positive social change.

Contribution to Business Practice

According to Al Mamun and Hasan (2017), high employee turnover affects business profitability. HR managers may use the results of this study to develop effective strategies to reduce employee turnover, which in turn may lead to improving organizational profitability. Managers who reduce employee turnover improve sustainable organizational development and knowledge retention (Alsharbri, Khalfan, & Maqsood, 2016; Rohde, Shaw, Butryn, & Stice, 2015).

Implications for Social Change

The results of the study could be beneficial to employees and the communities they serve. According to Steiner and Atterton (2014), successful businesses have implications for positive social change. Gittings and Schmutte (2015) stated that a decrease in employee turnover may result in minimum wage increase. Reducing employee turnover may improve the financial stability for families of employees, promote prosperity for the community, and strengthen the economy. A business can be a force for a positive social change through supporting non-profit organizations, and donations to programs that bring benefits to the communities that employees serve.

A Review of the Professional and Academic Literature

Employee turnover is one of the most persistent problems that face organizations (Alkahtani, 2015; Mitrovska & Eftimov, 2016). Employee turnover continues to increase and affect business profitability (BLS, 2017). During the period from September 2016 to September 2017, the total number of employee turnovers increased from 4.9 million to 5.2 million (BLS, 2017). The general understanding of employee turnover is that it is the rate to which employees leave an organization (Zhang, 2016). From a broader

perspective, Kazi and Zedah (2011) described employee turnover as the change of employees among organizations, careers, and professions on the broader labor market. According to Shamsuzzoha and Shumon (2010), employee turnovers are costly. Mitrovska and Eftimov (2016) found that in small companies employing at most five senior employees, the turnover costs were \$13,500 for every employee who left. For the companies that have more than five senior employees, the average cost when an employee left was \$20,000 (Mitrovska & Eftimov, 2016).

Organization of the Review

In this review of the literature, I begin with the conceptual framework of my study: transformational leadership theory, developed by Burns (1978), which I used to explore strategies that HR managers use to reduce employee turnover. I will then review other supporting and contrasting theories (such as charismatic leadership theory and transactional leadership) to better explain the aspects that may affect employee turnover. Then, I will explain the concept of employee turnover and discussed the employee's theoretical perspectives on turnover. After that, I will focus on the primary key issues that HR managers are often expected to address as strategies for reducing employee turnover (e.g., organizational culture and employee turnover, aligning recruitment and selection to organizational culture, and employee expectations and motivation).

Strategy for Searching the Literature

I searched the BLS website mentioned that employee turnover in the US continues to increase. I used the transformational leadership theory as a lens and conceptual framework for my study. The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to explore strategies that some HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry used to

reduce employee turnover. My objective was to provide a critical analysis and literature synthesis on employee turnover in the pharmaceutical industry using various sources (i.e., peer-reviewed journals, reports, and seminal scholarly books). Most of the references are current within the past 5 years (87%) and from peer-reviewed sources (89%). I used Google Scholar search engine and many electronic databases available through Walden University Library. These databases included ABI/INFORM Collection, Academic Search Complete, Business Source Complete, Dissertations & Theses @ Walden University, EBSCO ebooks, Expanded Academic ASAP, Google Books, Open Library, ProQuest Central, ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, SAGE Journals, SAGE Research Methods Online, and Walden Library Books. My search keywords included: *employee turnover, employee satisfaction, employee motivation, business profitability and employee turnover, factors affecting employee turnover, human resource and employee turnover, transformational leadership theory, human resource management, and organizational culture.*

Transformational Leadership Theory

Increased competition and market volatility have now made organizational change a necessity rather than a choice. Leaders who transform continuously by responding proactively to the changing business environment are better at enhancing organizational competitiveness and profitability than those who take reactive measures (Berendt, Christofi, Kasibhatla, Malindretos, & Maruffi, 2012). Nonetheless, change does not occur in a vacuum; effective leaders oversee the process to make change happen. Leaders play an instrumental role in ensuring that their respective organizations achieve strategic goals and objectives. Many researchers have focused on the concept of

leadership. Cavazotte, Moreno, and Hickmann (2012) focused on the critical role of leadership and the traits and characteristics of the effective leader. Cavazotte et al. (2012) argued that the unique traits and characteristics of leaders have a profound influence on the overall performance of the organization. Although leaders have different traits and attributes, the transformational leadership style is ubiquitous in the academic discourses.

Effective leaders play a critical role in helping organizations to navigate the forces of change successfully. Teece, Peteraf, and Leih (2016) indicated that rapid technological, political, and economical changes had forced modern organizations to thrive in an environment characterized by unpredictability and uncertainty. Therefore, organizations must continuously adapt to changing circumstances. According to Teece et al. (2016), effective leaders become a necessity because they guide organizations through the hardest situations. A significant challenge for organizations is moving beyond incremental modification of strategic plans to transforming the entire practices or processes to sustain their success or survive in the competitive environment (Berendt et al., 2012). Jiang, Zhao, and Ni (2017) identified organizational culture as an aspect of the organization that must be revamped to affect the necessary changes. Empirical discussions have shifted focus to understanding the best leadership philosophy that managers can adapt to change organizations successfully. These discourses have influenced the growing interest in transformational leadership.

Burns proposed the transformational leadership theory in 1978, which changed the conceptualization of leadership significantly (Burns, 1978). Many theories of leadership have traditionally focused on two elements of leadership. The first concept is the goal of attaining and sustaining the position or status of a leader (Grant, 2012).

Specifically, the traditional understanding of leadership is that leaders aim to gain power and use it to influence their followers (Grant, 2012). The second element is the mechanisms of attaining and maintaining the status of a leader (Grant, 2012). As such, it was right for leaders to use force as a means of asserting dominion or authority, as in the case of the traditional autocratic leadership or contemporary transactional leadership (Grant, 2012). Conversely, Burns (1978) questioned the tendency of emphasizing the qualities of leaders while paying less attention to the people that leader led. Burns focused on values and motivations to assess leaders' approach to power. Burns's definition of leadership then sets leaders apart from those whose main preoccupation is gaining and sustaining power.

Burns (1978) developed the transformational leadership theory and introduced a new paradigm of leadership characterized interaction between leaders and followers. Burns defined leadership as the process whereby leaders induce their followers "to act for certain goals that represent the values and motivations (the wants and needs, the aspirations and expectations) of both leaders and followers" (p. 19). Burns contended that transformational leadership occurs when the interaction between leaders and their followers allow the elevation of both to higher levels of morality and motivation. Transcending is an underlying concept of the transformational leadership that describes transcending as a type of leadership that elevates and engages followers (Burns, 1978). According to Burns, followers develop "new cadres of leaders" (p. 20) as they become more active. Burns believed that transformational leaders focus on motivating others and satisfying new motives. Drawing parallels with transactional leadership help to

understand the constructs of transformational leadership. The distinction between the two is crucial because it emphasizes the focus of transformational leadership on followers.

The distinction between transactional and transformational leadership was one of the issues included in the transformational leadership theory. Burns (1978) described transactional leadership as the process of where leaders engage in simple exchanges with their followers. According to Burns, the aim of leader engagement with followers is to influencing performance that will support the achievement of organizational goals. In contrast, transformational leaders foster interactions with their followers based on shared beliefs, values, and goals (Burns, 1978). Such interactions encourage performance that then supports the attainment of predetermined organizational goals (Burns, 1978). Burns described the relationship between leaders and their followers as being mutually beneficial and elevating. Most importantly, Burns posited that the organization of relationships in transformational leadership centers around the common purpose of both leaders and followers in ways that motivate, transform, and improve the ethical aspirations and actions of followers. Burns cited the example of Mahatma Gandhi to illustrate how transformational leaders move their followers to higher levels than they had aspired to reach before the leader induced motivation.

The abstract nature of the transformational leadership theory has attracted continued interest for more than a decade since its inception in 1978 (Grant, 2012). Many authors have extended and expanded transformational leadership based on Burns's (1978) initial propositions (Bass, 1985; Grant, 2012). Bass has been one of the most prolific researchers that have explored multiple dimensions of transformational leadership (Grant, 2012). Notably, Bass (1985) operationalized Burns's earlier paradigm of transformational

leadership and offered rich insights about leadership behavior. Bass proposed the transformational theory and contended that the performance of followers depends on how leaders meet a set of reordered needs. Bass introduced four key constructs of transformational leadership theory to describe how leaders meet the goal. The four principle elements that underpin transformational leadership, according to Bass, include intellectual stimulation, individual consideration, inspirational motivation, and idealized influence. The first two constructs describe the behavior of the transformational leader in the form of actions (Bass, 1985). The latter two entail the behavior of the transformational leader based on their inherent or intrinsic characteristics (Bass, 1985).

First, intellectual stimulation emphasizes issues of creativity and autonomy (Bass, 1985). According to Bass (1985), intellectual stimulation is about raising the level of awareness among followers concerning the significance of specific organizational outcomes and how to achieve them. Grant (2012) singled out vision communication as one of the critical tasks of transformational leaders. The greatest challenge for the transformational leaders is inspiring their followers to share in the inherent values and meanings of the vision (Grant, 2012). Chai, Hwang, and Joo (2017) argued that transformational leaders must induce or motivate their followers to transcend self-interests and instead prioritize the organization, team, or larger entity. Bass asserted that the outcome of this process occurs when followers reorder their portfolio on wants and needs. On the other hand, intellectual simulation is successful when there is congruence between the extrinsic needs of the organization and the intrinsic values or needs of the followers (Raja, Bouckennooghe, Syed, & Naseer, 2018). Therefore, intellectual simulation becomes successful when leaders involve their followers in the decision-

making process, as well as stimulating their efforts to become more innovative and creative (Raja et al., 2018).

Second, individual consideration is a leadership behavior that entails stimulating extra performance among followers (Simola, Barling, & Turner, 2012). As discussed earlier, intellectual stimulation is about communicating the vision and then helping followers to reorder their needs so that they can focus more on achieving the vision (Grant, 2012). Individual consideration moves further by building the confidence of followers concerning their ability to perform tasks that will support the achievement of the goals of the vision (Simola et al., 2012). The transformational leader also demonstrates to the followers how enhanced performance will allow to accomplish the reordered needs and wants (Simola et al., 2012). The construct of individualized consideration exemplifies the focus of transformational leadership on the followers instead of leaders (Simola et al., 2012). Organizations do not have homogenous groups of employees, considering that each employee has unique needs, desires, expectations (Simola et al., 2012). For example, change and excitement motivate some employees, while money is the only motivation for others. As such, transformational leaders use individualized consideration to recognize and respond to the unique needs of each follower (Jiang et al., 2017). Responding to these needs give leaders a chance to motivate their followers toward the achievement of the organizational goals.

Third, inspirational motivation involves the ability of leaders to inspire confidence among their followers, as well as creating a sense of purpose (Simola et al., 2012). The process of transformational leadership usually begins with the development of a vision, as explained in the previous discussions. Then, leaders communicate the vision

and expectations of their followers. After that, leaders inspire their followers to work toward the achievement of the predetermined strategic goals (Simola et al., 2012). According to Simola et al. (2012), transformational leaders need to have superb communication skills to inspire followers. Leaders should consider effective communication as an instrumental role that helps to convey information with power, precision, and a sense of authority (Sookaneknun & Ussahawanitchakit, 2012). Poor communication between leaders and their followers plays a more significant role in the failure of many change programs (Han, Seo, Yoon, S. W., & Yoon, 2016). Thus, communication is the cornerstone of inspirational motivation. Leaders cannot motivate their followers to achieve organizational goals unless they communicate the vision explicitly and effectively (Han et al., 2016).

Fourth, an idealized influence involves describing transformational leaders as charismatic and role models. Bass (1985) described the transformational effect that leaders have on their followers, which then influences the attitudes and feelings of followers toward their leaders. For example, Sookaneknun and Ussahawanitchakit (2012) found that followers usually have admiration, trust, respect, and loyalty toward their charismatic leaders. According to Zhang, Li, Ullrich, and van Dick (2015), such feelings motivate or encourage followers to achieve more than they had initially expected to carry out. However, Bass asserted, “charisma is a necessary ingredient of transformational leadership, but by itself, it is not sufficient to account for the transformational process” (p. 31). Transformational leaders motivate their followers by identifying with them, as well as evoking in strong emotions (Bass, 1985). Additionally, they can also achieve this goal by acting as mentors, coaches, or teachers, which induces profound transformation

of followers at the interpersonal level (Han et al., 2016). The construct of idealized influence brings to the forefront of the role that personal traits and attributes play in differentiating transformational leadership from transactional leadership.

Transformational leaders use their charisma to support and guide their followers to look before their self-interests and instead work toward reaching higher goals (Lee, 2014). The charismatic nature of transformational leaders brings to the forefront of the value-based approach that creates emotional bonds between leaders and their followers (Lee, 2014). Mutual respect, trust, commitment to the leader, and admiration underpin the charismatic relationship or interaction between transformational leaders and followers (Yukl, 2012). Cole et al. (2009) defined charismatic leadership as an empowering style in which leaders focus on the followers and their respective goals and aspirations. Thus, charismatic leadership is a critical construct of transformational leadership because it enhances the social dimension of the leadership process.

House (1977) proposed the theory of charismatic leadership and indicated that the charismatic nature of transformational leadership could provide insight based on the theory of charismatic leadership. The underlying premise of this theory is the effect of the leader's personal influence, attraction, and inspiration on the follower. House emphasized the interaction between leaders and their followers. According to House, the beliefs and personality of charismatic leaders attract their followers. Comparatively, House described the role of leaders in arousing their followers by communicating an appealing vision (based on both the transformational leadership theory and the theory of charismatic leadership). Many researchers underscored the need for leaders to have specific behaviors and traits that leaders to influence their followers toward the achievement of

organizational goals (Cavazotte et al., 2012). Traits include the need for self-confidence, power, and strong convictions. On the other hand, leadership behaviors include an articulation of the vision, confidence, impression management, and communication of high expectation (Cavazotte et al., 2012).

Similar to Burns (1978), Bass (1985) differentiated between transformation and transactional leadership. Bass explored the antithesis of transformational leadership by comparing it to transactional leadership. Bass explained two models and distinguished transformational and transactional leaders: management by exception and contingent reinforcement. First, management by exception implies that transaction leaders only respond to issues related to unsatisfactory performance (Bass, 1985). Consequently, the leader ignores any positive attributes and instead focuses more on disruptive or negative attributes that affect performance (Bass, 1985). Second, management by contingent reinforcement occurs when the leader and followers reach a consensus on actions that should be rewarded and punished (Bass, 1985). Bass' transformation leadership is similar to the transactional model. However, the two models differ at the point when the leader identifies the needs and performance of the followers. At this step, the leader transcends from a simple to a complex exchange process of reordering the needs of the followers. The type and scope of exchange between the leader and the follower determine whether the leadership is transactional or transformational (Bass, 1985).

Eberly, Bluhm, Guarana, Avolio, and Hannah (2017) acknowledged the relationship between leaders and their followers as the defining principle of transformational leadership. The behavior and traits that leaders espouse are useful in enhancing the value of the interactions (Cavazotte et al., 2012). Therefore, personality

traits have emerged in the literature review as critical aspects to consider when differentiating transformational and transactional leadership styles. Cavazotte et al. (2012) defined leaders by both their leadership styles and personality types. Therefore, the personality types of leaders influence how they interact with their followers (Cavazotte et al., 2012). For instance, the personality traits of leaders play an instrumental role in influencing leadership styles, particularly transformational and transactional leadership (Cavazotte et al., 2012). The focus on the personality traits of leaders is crucial because both transformational and transactional leadership have a profound effect on the performance of teams and that of the organization in general (Cavazotte et al., 2012). For example, extroverted leaders are more charismatic and engaging compared to their introverted counterparts (Cavazotte et al., 2012). However, the multiplicity and overlap between different personality types makes it difficult to make conclusive inferences (Cavazotte et al., 2012).

Due to the diversity of leadership styles and personality types, many researchers developed different frameworks and models of leadership (Cekmecelioglu, Ilhan, & Günsel, 2017; Zhang et al., 2015). Leaders are not homogeneous, but each of them espouses a unique style of leadership based on their personality types (Zhang et al., 2015). Some leaders have a single leadership style, while others can combine two or more styles of leadership (Zhang et al., 2015). For example, a leader can adopt the transformational style of leadership when overseeing a change initiative while espousing the transactional style to ensure that followers are committed to the rules and regulations of the organization (Zhang et al., 2015). Cekmecelioglu et al. (2017) found that both transformational and transactional leadership focus on achieving organizational goals.

The primary objective of every leader is to work through and with people to ensure that the organization implements strategic plans successfully, which is a prerequisite of performance, competitiveness, and profitability (Cekmecelioglu et al., 2017). Conversely, the greatest challenge facing leaders, regardless of their leadership style, is aligning the needs and goals of followers to the shared mission of the organization (Lee, 2014). The complexity of this task has increased interest in transformational leadership, considering its role in enhancing the relationship or interaction between leaders and followers (Lee, 2014).

Transformational leadership is a people-oriented approach that shifts attention from the leader or process to the people responsible directly for the achievement of organizational goals (Yukl, 2012). According to Yukl (2012), transformational leaders motivate their followers to transcend their self-interests to achieve common objectives. Thus, the transformation leader encourages followers to focus on collective action by stirring their passions and emotions (Yukl, 2012).

Transformational leadership cannot be conceptualized instead of organizational culture, considering the bidirectional relationship between the two concepts. First, the culture of an organization has a profound effect on the type of leadership style (Cekmecelioglu et al., 2017). For example, transactional leadership is pervasive in organizations with the autocratic culture. The leader at an autocratic organizational culture emphasizes a commitment to rules and standard procedures. Second, the type of leadership determines the culture of an organization (Cekmecelioglu et al., 2017). For example, transformational leadership creates a culture of teamwork and continuous adaptation to change. Leaders in the latter organization are alert to changes, and they

mobilize, motivate, and support their followers to embrace change (Cekmecelioglu et al., 2017). Overall, the culture of an organization is a product of the many interactions between leaders and followers, as well as the interpersonal relationship between followers (Cekmecelioglu et al., 2017). The role of the leader is to protect and preserve interactions or relationships that foster a productive and supportive organizational culture (Cekmecelioglu et al., 2017). According to Cole et al. (2009), transformational leaders protect organizational values and norms by fostering a positive organizational culture.

The Concept of Employee Turnover

The ever-changing business environment has made it necessary for organizations to seek concrete sources of sustainable competitive advantage in order to remain at the top. Human resources have emerged as one of the key sources of this competitive advantage given their ability to dictate the operations of organizations. Human resources have become central to organizational processes, especially in a world that has increasingly shifted toward knowledge-based economy.

Today, the most important asset that an organization can possess is a well-trained and experienced workforce. Given the importance of an experienced workforce, the ideal situation would be where the best talent stays with the organization, rendering sustainable productive services to and for the organization until retirement. However, the intense competition for human resources has made it difficult to achieve this goal because both businesses and employees are always looking for opportunities to recruit a better workforce or get better employment terms. This has propelled the challenge of employee turnover into the limelight as organizations are always actively looking for measures to address the challenge.

There is an ample body of literature related to definition and characteristics of employee turnover. The consensus is that turnover is the rate to which employees leave an organization (Zhang, 2016). From a broader perspective, Kazi and Zedah (2011) described employee turnover as the change of employees among organizations, careers, and professions in the wider labor market. Mathematically, employee turnover rate is the proportion (percentage) of the number of employees who leave an organization and are replaced over the total number of employees at the same organization within a given period (usually annually).

Puspita and Susanty (2017) defined employee turnover as the act of employees to permanently resign from an organization either on a voluntary or involuntary basis. There are many more definitions that have been proposed but this is the basic premise (Mitrovska & Eftimov, 2016). The definition of employee turnover in this study: the frequency at which an organization loses its employees and has to replace them, which implies the frequency of new recruitment and selection activities within the organization over a given period. It is important to understand that not all incidents of employee leaving are a problematic loss to an organization. There are many circumstances that lead to employee departure and, therefore, replacement. However, the focus on this study is on the kind of departure that come as a loss to an organization.

Rajan (2013) described the various categories of employee turnover. Functional turnover refers to the departure of a poorly performing employee while dysfunctional turnover refers to the departure of an excellently performing employee. In voluntary and involuntary turnover, the former is where an employee leaves by own choice and the latter is where an organization terminates an employee despite their unwillingness to

leave (Moon, 2017; Rajan, 2013). Unskilled turnover refers to the departure of employees holding untrained, uneducated, and unskilled positions while skilled turnover is the departure of those employees who hold positions requiring high educational qualifications and, therefore, competencies and skills. Avoidable turnover refers to employee departure to avoid circumstances while unavoidable turnover refers to the turnovers due to unavoidable circumstances. Finally, internal and external turnover has to do with whether the employee leaves their position to take another position within the same organization (internal turnover) or in another organization (external turnover; Rajan, 2013). These different types of turnover have an impact on the wellbeing of an organization. It is important to understand the distinction between these turnovers.

Shamsuzzoha and Shumon (2010) noted that employee turnovers are costly, both financially and/ non-financially. Mitrovska and Eftimov (2016) calculated the cost of employee turnover using a web calculator. They found that in small companies employing at most five senior employees, turnover costs ranged between 10,000 and 15,000 Euros, which means an average of 12,500 Euros for every employee who left. For the companies that have more than five senior employees, the average cost when an employee left was 18,500 Euros. These costs include separation costs and paperwork, recruitment and selection costs, training and development costs, and costs resulting from reduced productivity resulting from (among others) the decreased efficiency of colleagues when a team member leaves (Friar & Mulyani, 2018; Mitrovska & Eftimov, 2016). One can reasonably assume that the costs have significantly increased today. The extent of such costs, however, varies depending on the nature of the turnover.

According to Rajan (2013), unskilled turnovers, despite being high, are less costly as they do not directly, if at all, affect the organization's competitive advantage, and filling those positions is not extensive or costly. In contrast, skilled turnovers (even the departure of one senior employee) can have a big impact on the organization. Skilled employees are directly involved in building organizational competitive advantage and if these skilled employees leave, filling their positions involves comprehensive recruitment and selection processes that are costly.

In any case, employee turnover is one of the most persistent problems that organizations face today (Alkahtani, 2015; Mitrovska & Eftimov, 2016). Indeed, organizations face a difficulty not only attracting the best talents and skills, but also difficulty in retaining them (Mngomezuhu, Challenor, Munapo, Mashau, & Chikandiwa, 2015). The statisticians of the Bureau of Labor Statistics showed that the average stay of employees in organizations is about 23-24 months (Izzack, 2010). This poses a significant threat to an organization's growth and productivity (Mitrovska & Eftimov, 2016; Saher, Khan, Shahzad, & Qadri, 2015; Wynen, Van Dooren, Mattijs, & Deschamps, 2019). Rajan (2017) observed that employee turnover impacts on the performance and effectiveness of organizations as well. This makes it important to examine some of the potential ways that managers can utilize to reduce employee turnover.

Employee Retention

Kumar and Gadkar (2016) provided an ideal explanation of employee retention, "creating a big picture of organization as a great place to work and facilitating opportunities for total learning, growth and wholesome development of people in the

organization, in its strive toward excellence and value creation through human capital.”

Nasir and Mahmood (2016) found a strong connection between aspects such as employee retention, job satisfaction, and perceptions that develop amongst employees about organizational support. At the same time, organizational commitment is a major intervening factor in the pharmaceutical industry. Nasir and Mahmood revealed that there is a strong link amongst the mentioned variables (employee retention and job satisfaction), and that organizational commitment invariably results in higher levels of retentions and job satisfaction. It thus becomes apparent that satisfied employees are loyal to the organization and are less prone to switch jobs (Nasir & Mahmood, 2016). Such findings are clear indicators that managers at pharmaceutical organizations must work in the context of the mentioned variables so that they achieve higher levels of employee retention. Complying with these measures helps in achieving organizational goals of preventing employee attritions; leads to higher levels of employee dedication and commitment; and facilitates workers in formulating their career plans (Nasir & Mahmood, 2016). In fact, all aspects having a bearing on employee retention in pharmaceutical companies are interrelated (Kumar & Mathimaran, 2017).

Attempts toward employee retention work best when framing the strategies and focusing in keeping with the needs of employees (Imam, Ali, & Soo, 2018). Likewise, comprehensive strategies of employee retention rely on determining the areas focus in respect of the manner to assess results. Hejase et al. (2016) explained that the most effective retention strategies relate to rewarding employees; and creating more valuable jobs through training programs and better career growth options. The ideal approach is to create an optimum mix of the two approaches. However, several factors need to be

considered while framing an efficient employee retention strategy. Hejase et al. further noted that a manager's capabilities of hiring and retaining employees also depend on factors such as compensation and benefits, succession management and diversity (Hejase et al., 2016). It is better to focus on dealing with the factors that directly impact work-life balance, working environment, and career-growth opportunities. In addition, retaining the employee through positive leadership, better compensation, removing work-life conflicts, and creating a healthy working atmosphere (Hejase et al., 2016).

According to Nasir and Mahmood (2016), the most effective means to retain employees is to recognize their needs at the workplace and make concerted efforts in meeting such needs. In similar vein, Kumar and Mathimaran (2017) asserted that effective employee retention strategies associated with fostering "an environment that encourages current employees to remain employed by having policies and practices in place that address their diverse needs" (p.17). However, Hofmann and Stokburger-Sauer (2017) made a more valid assertion in stating that employee commitment serves as a strong connect amongst the organization and its employees and reduces the chances of turnover. This is because committed employees have a strong sense of attachment with the organization (Hofmann & Stokburger-Sauer, 2017). Such attitudes invariably lead to lesser levels of staff turnover and higher levels of productivity. However, employees in the pharmaceutical industry tend to switch jobs because of better opportunities of career advancement, recession, and structural changes (Olubiyi, Smiley, Luckel, & Melaragno, 2019). It is critical to mention that high levels of employee turnover results in operational disturbances (Olubiyi et al., 2019).

The managers at pharmaceutical industry need employees that are technical experts and have the skills to deal with multifaceted situations (Al Mamun & Hasan, 2017). Nevertheless, the number of people with these abilities and qualifications is inadequate, which is why most hiring managers at pharmaceutical companies have to struggle and engage in a strong competition for talent (Jindal, Shaikh, & Shashank, 2017). In addition, the crucial nature of such jobs and the scarce availability of required people indicates that vacancies often need to be left open for prolonged time periods (Jindal et al., 2017). Consequently, companies must bear the loss of revenues and extra costs resulting from the vacant positions. For this reason, holding on to talented employees is a crucial need of the managers at pharmaceutical companies (Jindal et al., 2017). In keeping with such circumstances, HR managers in pharmaceutical companies must frame appropriate retention strategies (Dwesini, 2019). One way to do that is by identifying the needs of employees and then designing appropriate retention strategies (Singh, 2019).

Hejase et al (2016) highlighted six core areas on which HR managers at the organization should emphasize in order to achieve better employee retention. These areas include human resources, cultural and generational diversity, culture and values, career growth, workplace design, and new-employee onboarding. Nevertheless, the effectiveness, survival and competency of organizational strategies in this regard depend a great deal on the organization's HR department, which plays a crucial role in employee retention. It is critical to note that the link between job performance and retention of employees varies considerably amongst companies because of differences in organizational culture and values (Kodikal & Rahiman 2016). In fact, organizational

culture is more powerful than the combined impact of the labor market and the demographic characteristics of new employees (Kodikal & Rahiman 2016).

Theoretical Perspectives on Employee Turnover: Employee's Perspective

The primary question that researchers have is why employees may choose to leave (voluntary turnover). The basic assumption is that it has to do with how employees perceive the workplace and the organization. In this regard, there are several theoretical approaches to understand this problem, particularly in relation to employee motivation, job satisfaction, and commitment to the organization.

The first perspective to explain the phenomenon (employee turnover), is the equity theory. Adams (1963) developed this theory and focused on how employees perceive their treatment by their managers compared to how managers treat others. According to Adams, an employee is motivated by what they consider fair in comparison to other employees. In other words, an employee's motivation, attitude, and behavior are influenced by their perception of fairness or unfairness at the workplace (Al-Madi, Assal, Shrafat, & Zeglat, 2017; Wang, 2016). The employees' perception of their relationship between work and compensation is critical (Buttner & Lowe, 2017). Employees like to be compensated fairly in relation to what others receive (Buttner & Lowe, 2017).

The second perspective is the expectancy theory. Victor H. Vroom (1964) developed the expectancy theory and focused on why different employees choose different behavioral options. Azaliwa and Casmir (2016) mentioned that the premise that different employees have different expectations, and each will be motivated by how they perceive the likelihood of attaining those expectations. De Simone (2016) further suggested that work motivation rests on perceived relationship between performance and

outcomes, and that employees will modify their behaviors depending on their calculation of anticipated outcomes.

The last theory, to explain employee turnover, is the Herzberg two-factor (motivator-hygiene) theory (Herzberg, 1968). Frederick Herzberg (1968) developed this theory and addressed the relationship between two factors among employees, motivation and satisfaction (Herzberg, 1968). Herzberg distinguished between various factors including factors believed to boost employee job satisfaction as well as factors that cause employee dissatisfaction (Drago, 2015). Herzberg classified these factors into two; hygiene and motivator factors (Drago, 2015). Hygiene factors are the work environment factors that business manager needs to address to avoid unpleasant workplace experiences among the employees. These factors include compensation, quality of interpersonal relationship, job security, and control among others (Drago, 2015). In contrast, motivator factors are those that improve employees' individual or personal growth and, in turn, job satisfaction. The relationship between these factors is not linear, meaning that the factors that boost job satisfaction do not necessarily negate those that lead to employee dissatisfaction. An organization must, therefore, address these two factors in order to minimize employee turnover.

The Reasons for Employee Departure

The policy makers, in most countries, highly regulate the pharmaceutical industry (Ding, 2018). Many employees considered the working environment in the pharmaceutical industry as complex and demanding (Latten et al., 2018). In addition, there is a constant increase in the competition which led to stagnation in wages and incentives (Khalid & Nawab, 2018). Even though the industry does not have high

attrition rate, most employees specialized in their respective fields. Consequently, if any employees leave, the managers, at that organization, suffers a setback in the organizational productivity (Vatankhah et al., 2017). Given the rigid timelines and strict regulation in the pharmaceuticals industry, resignation by a research specialist leads to interruption in product development (Ding, 2018). In addition, the HR managers gets deprived of the much-needed talent (Roy & Devi, 2016). Moreover, a leaving specialist often takes away much of the customer relationships. Such circumstances render the organization highly susceptible to pressures that have the potential of reducing its comparative advantage (Hejase, Dirani, Hamdar, & Hazimeh, 2016). For these reasons, it is very important to determine the causes regarding why employees in the pharmaceutical industry seek other job openings, and to find concrete ways of reducing employee turnover.

There are many published empirical studies in which authors sought to understand the reasons for employee departure and have accordingly arrived at different conclusions (Ehsan, 2018; Erthal & Marques, 2018; Iqbal, Guohao, & Akhtar, 2017; Jani & Saiyed, 2017; Kadir & Amalia, 2017; Kwakye, 2018; Li, 2015; Pang & Lu, 2018; Subekti & Setyadi, 2016). I found many studies in which authors mentioned that employees quit their job mainly due to lack of motivation and job satisfaction (Drago, 2015; Ehsan, 2018; Jani & Saiyed, 2017; Kadir & Amalia, 2017; Li, 2015; Qi & Wang, 2016; Subekti & Setyadi, 2016). More specifically, these problems arise from, among others, the lack of training and development, feeling less appreciated, lack of career development, and the nature of the work environment. These are the key issues that HR managers are often expected to address as strategies for reducing employee turnover.

Organizational culture and employee turnover. Before discussing the specific elements of HR management, it is important to begin by understanding how managers, in the broader organizational culture, influence decisions on these elements. Looking at most of the literature on employee turnover, it becomes clear that organizational culture is one of the critical factors that is largely ignored. In most studies, authors merely mentioned organizational culture in passing like an add-on topic, and yet it remains a central factor in what organizations' HR managers will do in relation to the specific elements that influence employee retention and, ultimately, employee turnover (Iqbal, Guohao, & Akhtar, 2017; Kwakye, 2018).

The concept of organizational culture, as used in organizational behavior literature is the shared values and beliefs within any given organization that informs patterns of employees' behavior (Ellinas et al., 2017; Serpa, 2016). Organizational culture is the drive for the efforts as well as contributions of the members of an organization that provides a holistic understanding of not just what the organization needs to achieve, but also how it is to achieve it, as well as the interrelationship between goals, and how each employee contributes toward the attainment of those goals (Ellinas et al., 2017; Odor, 2018; Serpa, 2016). According to Erthal and Marques (2018), national culture, among other factors, can influence organizational culture.

Culture is a collective process of the human mind that distinguishes the members of one human group from another. Organizational culture involves keeping employees in line by acclimatizing them toward the objectives of the organization. Ultimately, organizational culture has a significant impact on the organization at large. Ellinas et al. (2017) and Odor (2018) highlighted the relationship between organizational culture and

excellent (or poor) performance of the said organization through its programs for the development and retention of HR. Organizational culture, therefore, is the overall position of the organization, which encompasses natural settings, climate, rite and rituals, and the programs of within the organization. This often impacts on the management of performance, training, and development of employees, as well as the recruitment and selection, among others.

Organizational culture varies from one organization to another. This is in relation to relative ordering of values and beliefs, and assumptions. According to Harrison and Bazy (2017), this becomes evident in the way that managers at an organization give priority to any given aspects of HR management. For example, while some managers place emphasis on recruitment and selection, others will place a bigger importance on employee training and development programs, while others will lay more emphasis on the administration of compensation and performance management. Further still, other managers place premium on their employees' career development, pay-for-performance, and goal setting, with the ultimate objective of maximizing the performance of employees and customer service (Batcha, Jan, Subramani, & Julie, 2017; Harrison & Bazy, 2017; Meng et al., 2016; Özçelik, Aybas, & Uyargil, 2016). These priorities help create an organizational culture of high performance. Moreover, some HR managers take more seriously the wellbeing of their employees, which is often reflected in investment in free medical care, good cafeterias, employees' personal trainers, and subsidizing daycare for their employees' children (Jebaseelan & Samuel, 2017).

Aligning recruitment and selection to organizational culture. Researchers published many studies on how to prevent or reduce employee turnover and they focus on

the post-recruitment stage (Jani & Saiyed, 2017; Li, 2015). The assumption that strategies either are or are not reducing employee turnover can only be done once one is an employee of a firm. Li (2015), for instance, observed that many organizations approach recruitment merely as a regular process of official duties, without considering the value of organizational culture. However, the overall goal of recruitment and selection is to obtain quality of employees who will help to advance the organizational strategic goals in beneficial ways, and organizational culture is an important part of this. In this regard, organizational culture is an important part of the recruitment and selection because those employees are more likely to be happy and less likely to leave (Jani & Saiyed, 2017; Li, 2015).

The role of organizational culture in the process of recruitment and selection stems from the concept of motivational fit. There are generally two ways in which motivational fit presents itself: job fit (talent, skills, and competencies) and organizational fit (candidates/employees expectations and the extent to which they perceive the organization as advancing those expectations; Ardic, Uslu, Oymak, Ozsoy, E., & Ozsoy, 2016). Organizational fit encompasses various organizational attributes central to the congruence between individual and organizational values. Therefore, HR managers focus on organizational fit that relates to drive and willingness of an individual employee to commit to and fit in with the organization (Ardic et al., 2016). Many HR managers at organizations fail to consider motivational fit of candidates, particularly organizational fit.

Human resource managers should provide information at every stage of the recruitment and selection process as part of the organizational culture. Walters (2015)

captured the influence of organizational culture on recruitment and selection. The organizational culture is the base for attracting the best talents. It is the key to “building a reputation for having a positive workplace culture” (Walters, 2015, p.6). The HR managers give a chance for candidates to sample the organizational culture during the recruitment process so that they can decide whether the culture fits with their desire. For example, HR managers can give candidates the opportunity to meet the company's employees during the (long) recruitment process so that they can gain valuable insight into work environment and processes. Another important aspect of the organizational culture, during recruitment and selection process, is the need to communicate the right message to the candidates. This includes addressing most explicitly the values and culture of the organization and what it entails in actual work processes. This communication of organizational values, beliefs, and practices should continue throughout the onboarding process. Moreover, organizational culture should include information related to the interviewing process.

Walters (2015) stated that building a reputation for having an encouraging organizational culture is likely to attract employees. Therefore, it is critical during the interview processes to ensure that managers can identify whether a candidate will be a good cultural fit within the institution (Walters, 2015). The managers should beyond just the strategies for identifying the required technical competencies of candidates, and instead, undertake a thorough process of determining the ability of the candidate to fit with the organizational culture. The process involves understanding what, to a candidate, is the best workplace environment (controlled or free), preferences for autonomous decision-making, approach to learning and innovation, attitudes toward a diverse

workforce in the workplace (in terms of gender, race and ethnicity, age, among others), and career goals and plans. It is critical to create a good balance between employees' expectations and organizational plans by allowing candidates to sample that culture beforehand. All these are important aspects of recruitment and selection processes that HR managers could set along with the organizational culture.

Walters (2015) stated that many managers at organizations often fail to incorporate measures of the organizational culture. However, he noted that there have been many efforts to inform better culture-based recruitment and selection processes (Walters, 2015). There are recommendations for integrating culture fit into recruitment and selection processes (Walters, 2015). These recommendations include the need to adequately train managers on, among others, various interview strategies (such as behavioral interviewing), concepts of motivation fit, and interpretation of recruitment data; how to use behavioral-based questions to assess candidate's ability as well as competencies that align core organizational values; the use of Realistic Job Previews; and the utilization of motivational fit tool to analyze job and organizational traits, the use of motivational questionnaires, and comparison of organizational and candidate profiles to determine suitability (Jani & Saiyed, 2017; Li, 2015).

Employee expectations and motivation. One of the biggest challenges that managers face is how to effectively motivate the workforce. Employee motivation is central to overall effectiveness of an organization. In this regard, applied psychology is critical in the workplace, whereby organizational behavior (an aspect of culture) is a key to motivating the workforce (Kadir & Amalia, 2017; Pang & Lu, 2018; Subekti & Setyadi, 2016). Toward this end, employees expect to be compensated and given career

development opportunities on the basis of their performance and merit (Ehsan, 2018).

The relevant issues here, therefore, include employee appraisal and performance management; compensation; career development; and employee involvement.

Compensation and appraisal. Compensation as an aspect of HR management has to do with the planning, organizing, and control of direct and indirect payments given to employees due to the work that they do. Many researchers have indicated that compensation (and reward) administration focuses on organizational culture and as such, encompasses the system of pay based on fundamental and interrelated policy factors (Ehsan, 2018; Subekti & Setyadi, 2016). Consequently, each company implements a compensation system that is unique to them by placing varying levels of emphasis on the policy elements mentioned above.

Ehsan (2018) mentioned that for compensation to be effective, there has to be a structure for appraisal and performance management, which is the systematic evaluation of the performance of an employee, as well as their potential for development. According to Wang (2016), compensation administration manager pays close attention to internal equity and consistency (as informed by organizational culture). More specifically, internal equity and consistency concerns, among others, rationalization of pay within any one organization by analyzing, describing, and evaluating organizational structure and job structure. Compensation and reward involve the comparison of job titles, analysis of skill and competency levels in relation to the culture of work, and finally remuneration to determine how each employee contributes to the achievement of organizational goals and objectives through their work (Wang, 2016). This encompasses employees' expectation of fairness.

For compensation to be effective, there must be a structure for appraisal and performance management, which is the systematic evaluation of the performance of an employee, as well as their potential for development (Ehsan, 2018). According to Wang (2016), HR managers should help to set the organizational culture and help the compensation managers to pay close attention to internal equity and consistency. Employees at organizations have concerns related to internal equity and consistency (Buttner & Lowe, 2017). Therefore, compensation managers should describe the rationalization of the compensation packages within the organization by (a) explaining the compensation market analysis (e.g., comparing the compensation at the organization with that at other organizations), and (b) evaluating the organizational structure and job description (Buttner & Lowe, 2017). Compensation and reward involve the comparison of job titles, analysis of skills and competencies levels in relation to the culture of work, and finally remuneration to determine how each employee contributes to the achievement of organizational goals and objectives through their work.

Human resource and compensation managers should analyze compensation packages based on relevant organizational policies and strategies so they can set appropriate pay types and levels, as well as benefits among other forms of compensation (Ehsan, 2018). This entails measuring job values, designing and maintaining pay structure, paying for performance, competence and skill, and providing employee benefit (Ehsan, 2018). The argument is that HR managers has a motivational effect on employees through compensation, especially where there is a structure where employees receive compensation that is reciprocal to their effort or performance (Ehsan, 2018; Kadir & Amalia, 2017; Subekti & Setyadi, 2016). Therefore, it is generally agreed that managers

who will develop a compensation system should take into account the internal consistency when determining rates of pay for their employees, both those who hold the same positions and those who hold different positions, and all in accordance with prevailing organizational culture (that is, organizational values and beliefs). The extent to which the manager at an organization shows how he values certain employees and the nature of their work and level of their productivity reflects an organization's corporate culture (Erthal & Marques, 2018).

Generally, several factors influence a company's structure and level of payments to employees. Buttner and Lowe (2017) indicated that the social customs and economic forces (e.g., governmentally mandated minimum wage as a result of employee demands) are factors that had influence on corporate pay structures. Ehsan (2018) highlighted job requirements factors (in terms of skills, knowledge and experience) that HR managers should consider while setting the payment structure. Other factors are employee acceptance, employee knowledge and skills, and company factors. Employee acceptance refers to the influence of employee expectation regarding their compensation. The employee who has knowledge can influence the earnings of his/her colleagues. Employees can either quit or file a lawsuit when they consider their compensation unfair. Employees with knowledge and skills influence their bargaining power (i.e., the extent to which the organization would like to retain them). For example, an employee who can perform at different levels of the organization will often have a better bargaining power (assuming he or she knew how to utilize that power). Finally, company factors include the existence of a pay structure as well as supporting elements, such as technology. Organizational culture is one of the company factors. It also includes the organization's

perception of pay, such as whether employees understand the payment as a tool for motivation and commitment to the organization (Ehsan, 2018; Kadir & Amalia, 2017; Subekti & Setyadi, 2016). All these are important aspects of the compensation system.

Kadir and Amalia (2017) pointed out that even as managers at organizations seek to use compensation systems to attract and retain the best talent, the managers must also pay attention to the importance of balancing the need to keep operational costs low. This should be in line with the corporate cultures of many organizations, often exhibiting the culture of cost minimization (Kadir & Amalia, 2017). So, the managers at an organization's pay rate is comparable with those of their competitors (Kadir & Amalia, 2017). Therefore, according to Batcha et al. (2017), to achieve external competitiveness in relation to wage levels (that is, find a balance between too much and too little), the managers must have a system for comparing wage levels with industry standards. And ultimately it involves the examination of the company's resources and goals, as well as corporate culture to determine their own working wage levels.

Batcha et al. (2017) argued that managers have a vital degree of control over-compensation and, by extension, over performance. In such a corporate culture that management establishes good pay for employees and at the same time has a culture that ensures rewards and bonuses for employees, there is incentive for employees to not only commit to the organization, but also go the extra mile (Al-Madi et al., 2017). Therefore, employees use common sense to know what to do when faced with situations that are not exactly within their job description, rather than refusing to do the task as none of their business (Al-Madi et al., 2017). As a result, this indicates that an employee feels a sense

of ownership and belonging, so the employee does the best that is possible to help achieve organizational goals (Farroqui & Nagendra, 2016).

Career planning and employee participation. Career planning related to employees' aspirations regarding their career growth and development. Career planning involves providing opportunities for internal mobility as part of internal succession plan and a program that entails a comprehensive approach to professional development, all this as a part of organizational values on employee career growth and development (Anthony & Weide, 2015; Brent & Perez, 2015; Caleb, 2015; Camacho, 2015). Many managers at organizations do not have the approach for helping employees discuss their career aspirations and the potential to achieve those aspirations within their organizations. The same is true of these organizations, where employees are completely unaware of any career paths in their organizations. However, it is important to understand that employees have an important role to play in their career planning, but only with the help of organizational values that can help to enhance what Piotrowski (2015) calls "self-directed employee career development" (p.41). As evident in this description, the main element is whether an employee has a voice through participation and involvement, and organizational culture is critical in this regard.

Employee participation. Employee involvement is the participation and empowerment of employees to be involved in decision-making processes, where the manager involves the employees' input toward the achievement of both organizational and employee goals and objectives (Irawanto, 2015; Qi & Wang, 2016). Employee involvement is the process of allowing the employees to participate in decision-making as well as problem-solving and are given more autonomy at the workplace. Employee

involvement is often geared toward motivating them to be more committed and productive as a result of higher job satisfaction (Qi & Wang, 2016). The idea stems from the understanding that employee empowerment requires a certain degree of forfeiting a command-control system as well as a mechanistic structure. In this regard, managers do not control the employees and instead, act as facilitators.

I searched the literature for employee participation within the context of organizational culture. According to Brenyah and Obuobisa-Darko (2017), organizational culture design influences the perceptions of employees regarding their involvement and relationship at the workplace. Toward this end, employee involvement is high in organizations with strong cultures, which are characterized by employee performance and cognition enriched by ethics. Researchers have generally shown that creating supporting environments for the employee, which involved allowing them to work flexibly, can empower them by creating confidence in the workplace (Brenyah & Obuobisa-Darko, 2017; Jiony, Harvey, Gom, & Ruth, 2015).

According to Irawanto (2015) and Janićijević (2013), organizational structure is a tangible manifestation of organizational culture. Organizational culture is a determinant for employee involvement in key decision-making processes (Irawanto, 2015; Janićijević, 2013). Irawanto and Janićijević also highlighted many mitigating factors regarding the relationship between organizational culture and organizational structure.

Janićijević (2013) highlighted the mutual impact of organizational culture and structure in the process of organizational change. Janićijević argued that organizational culture and organizational structure both had impact on the behaviors of employees. Organizational culture refers to intangible/invisible system of assumptions, values and

beliefs, and norms that influence employee's perceptions of the workplace and their roles (Janićijević, 2013). Organizational structure refers to a rational and stable pattern of actions and interactions that organizations undertake for the purpose of achieving organizational goals (Janićijević, 2013). Particularly, organizational structure manifests in the emphasis on the differentiation of power (Janićijević, 2013). Therefore, the emphasis placed on positions of various employees within the organization, what influences how they interact and how they communicate. Ultimately, organizational structure relates to how employees perform their tasks toward achieving organizational goals and objectives (Irawanto, 2015; Janićijević, 2013). According to Janićijević, organizational culture influences the design and implementation of organizational structure.

Structure being more pervasive (meaning more enforced), it could also be that organizational structure determines organizational culture (Irawanto, 2015). For example, Irawanto (2015) observed that even as some organizations have made strides to create a participatory culture where employees can gain full involvement in decision making processes, this culture slowly dies as structure is increasingly built. Managers significantly influence employees (through organizational structure) (Irawanto, 2015; Janićijević, 2013). The influence of managers includes the extent to which employees enjoy freedom and autonomy in the course of their work, and even whether they participate in key decision-making processes (whether managers empower employees to provide input for key organizational decisions) (Irawanto, 2015; Janićijević, 2013).

Employee freedom and autonomy relates to the specific model of organizational structure that exists in the organization (Irawanto, 2015; Janićijević, 2013). There are

many models of organizational structure, with various impacts on operations and relationships within the workplace. However, the two main models of organizational structure are vertical and horizontal structures.

Vertical organizational structures are highly hierarchical. This means that there is emphasis on ranks as well as power and authority. Vertical organizational structures affect how lower-rank employees interact with high-rank employees. The lower-rank employees are ever conscious of the higher-ranking employees' power and authority, and this conscious awareness stands in the way of true interaction (Irawanto, 2015; Janićijević, 2013). Indeed, this structure is rigid, with a strict line of communication (Irawanto, 2015; Janićijević, 2013). One must report to someone in the next high position, and this continues until the information reaches the right person. Therefore, employee involvement is low in the vertical organizational structure (Irawanto, 2015; Janićijević, 2013). Horizontal organizational structures are more flexible enabling a more same-level interaction of employees regardless of rank. Any employee can communicate directly with others no matter their rank (Irawanto, 2015; Janićijević, 2013). Therefore, there is a better basis for employee involvement (Irawanto, 2015; Janićijević, 2013).

Managers can change employee involvement regardless of organizational structure. Irawanto (2015) found that most of organizations that have a vertical/hierarchical structure have made strides to establish participatory cultures. However, organizational structure does not significantly influence the extent to which employees enjoy autonomy and flexibility and, by extension, the extent to which they feel empowered. Irawanto observed that even as organizations attempt to create a participatory culture, these cultures slowly die as structure increasingly takes center-

stage. In other words, as Janićijević (2013) pointed out, it is paramount that organizational culture and structure are consistent.

Training and development. Many researchers focus on lack of training and development, in their studies, as one of the reasons for employee decisions to quit (Asfaw, Argaw, & Bayissa, 2015; Hazra, Ghosh, Sengupta, 2017; Kristin, Sheryl, & Robin, 2018). Training and development is a HR management function that involves organizational activities aimed at improving the competence and performance of employees (Kristin et al., 2018). In a study on the impact of training and development on employees, Hazra et al. (2017) argued that training and development becomes a way for the organization to arm employees with the skills, information, and technology required to for high services standards.

Training and development improve employees' effectiveness and performance (Asfaw et al., 2015). Training and development of employees also has an important motivational impact on employees as it cultivates and supports the desire among them to progress (Asfaw et al., 2015; Hazra et al., 2017). It shows employees, through true investment and by example, the value that the organization places in their learning and development, providing opportunities for career mobility within the organization. In this regard, training and development programs are key to team building as they have positive impact on job satisfaction and organizational commitment, thereby playing a mediating role on employees' intention to quit (Mansoor, Shah, Rehman, & Tayyaba, 2015). Lack of training and development implies a lack of commitment to employees by the organization and, as such, a leading cause of lack of morale among the employees. Moreover, training and development also provides a platform for employee orientation

and socialization on organizational culture (Heather & Kissack, 2010). Investment in training and development demonstrates commitment to employee retention by arming them with cutting edge knowledge and practices.

Most often, managers implement training and development of employees to enhance employees' knowledge, skills, abilities and competencies (Hazra et al., 2017). Hazra et al. (2017) showed that HR managers provided training programs that help in influencing and improving the soft and hard skills of employees. Moreover, Hazra et al. showed that team building was among the most important training and development activities that had a positive impact on job satisfaction and organizational commitment.

Asfaw et al. (2015) argued that managers can understand the case of organizational culture and employee training and development from the impact of organizational culture on employee commitment. Organizational cultures have an impact on the extent to which employees perceive the environment around them, and in turn their commitment to the organization. Particularly, organizational culture manifests in how the management communicate with the junior staff, and how the latter ultimately develop trust for the management and organization (Anthony & Weide, 2015). Employee training and development seem to provide a way to affect the two (organizational culture and organizational structure).

Conclusion of the Literature Review

The purpose of this literature review was to conduct a comprehensive literature review about transformational leadership theory based on insights by both Burns (1978) and Bass (1985). The leadership is about interactions and transactions between leaders and their followers. Such relationships emerge explicitly in the transformational style of

leadership. Both Burns (1978) and Bass (1985) acknowledged the critical role that transformational leaders play in motivating and influencing the actions of their followers. The achievement of this goal is essential for the leaders to allow their followers to transcend personal needs and instead focus more on how to attain organizational goals. The goal of any organization is to ensure that all employees are working toward the achievement of a common vision (Bass, 1985; Burns, 1978). Therefore, this review of the literature has shown that transformational leaders are instrumental in transforming organizations because they create and communicate the vision of an organization in a way that motivates followers to support its achievement. As such, an in-depth understanding of how transformational leadership affects organizational processes and people is valuable knowledge for leaders.

The business environment has evolved rapidly in the last few decades as managers continually seek to gain a competitive advantage for the firms and outdo their competitors. One of the key fronts that have emerged is the management of HR. Human resource managers have realized the critical role that their employees play in achieving their organizational goals. Toward this end, they are always looking for new ways of ensuring that they retain their best talents. I highlighted some of the key strategies that organizations are using to minimize labor turnover in a bid to gain a long term and reliable competitive advantage of a highly trained workforce.

Transition

Section 1 of this qualitative multiple case study contains a brief and concise overview of the background of the problem (employee turnover) followed by details related to the problem statement (to explain the scope of the problem), and purpose

statement (to describe the intent of the research). There is a discussion of the nature of this study (research method and design). After that, I presented the research question (that aligned with the specific business problem and purpose statement) and interview questions (that aligned with the research question). For the conceptual framework of this study, the transformational leadership theory serves as a lens to explore strategies that HR managers use to reduce employee turnover. Then, there are operational definitions and assumptions, limitations, and delimitations of the study. After that, there is the significance of the research description that includes contributions to business practice and the implications for social change.

A review of the professional and academic literature includes topics related to the conceptual framework of my study (transformational leadership theory), supporting and contrasting theories (such as charismatic leadership theory and transactional leadership), the concept of employee turnover, and the employee's theoretical perspectives on turnover. After that, I focused on the primary key issues that HR managers are often expected to address as strategies for reducing employee turnover (i.e., organizational culture and employee turnover, aligning recruitment and selection to organizational culture, and employee expectations and motivation).

Section 2 contains a description of the researcher role in the data collection process and identifying qualified participants. Section 2 also contains justifications for the selected research method and design and the sampling method. After that, I discussed the ethical research standards and ensuring the protection of the study participants. Section 2 also includes an explanation of data collection instruments, data collection technique, data organization techniques, data analysis, reliability, and validity.

In Section 3, I explained the findings and a detailed discussion on the applicability of the findings concerning the professional business practice. After that, I discussed the implications for social change. Section 3 includes recommendations for action, recommendations for further research related to improving business practice, a reflection on my experience within the Doctor of Business Administration (DBA) doctoral study process, and conclusion.

Section 2: The Project

In this section I will describe the role of the researcher in the data collection process and the relationship I have with the topic, participants, and research area. Section 2 includes discussion related to the protection of the privacy and confidentiality of the data collected. I will describe the eligibility criteria for selecting study participants and discussed strategies for gaining access to participants and establishing a working relationship with them. I will also give the justifications for the selected research method and design and the sampling method. Finally, I will discuss the ethical research standards and ensuring the protection of the study participants.

Purpose Statement

The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to explore strategies that HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry used to reduce employee turnover. The targeted population consisted of the HR managers of the four pharmaceutical companies in the Northeast United States. The implications for positive social change include the potential to develop strategies to reduce employee turnover, which in turn may lead to more stability for families of employees, new employment opportunities, and promotion of prosperity for the community.

Role of the Researcher

When researchers conduct interviews for their qualitative studies, they pay attention to the respondent through active listening (Smith & Sparkes, 2017). Researchers use strategies such as probing and paraphrasing, which enable them to connect with participants (Smith & Sparkes, 2017). Using this approach, researchers create a more comprehensive discussion on the subject matter (Smith & Sparkes, 2017). In my role as

the principal researcher, I collected relevant data (using open-ended questions) and reviewed some of the companies' various documents that participants provided to me. I forged interpersonal relations with the multiple participants of an ongoing study and using non-verbal cues was critical due to several reasons. First, I used interpersonal relationships to establish trusting and empathic relations with the respondents. Second, I used interpersonal relationships to help in the overall protection of the participant's privacy and confidentiality. This attribute was particularly important when participants want to disclose critical information. Finally, interpersonal relationships also prevent the occurrence of psychological harm to both the researcher and the participants (Slade & Sergeant, 2019).

I abided by the rules and procedures in *The Belmont Report* of 1979 (Belmont Report, 1979). For example, providing an informed consent form to the participants and maintaining their privacy and confidentiality throughout my study. In studies that involve human participants, researchers are ethically and legally bound to respect the participants' right of informed consent (Dankar, F. K., Gergely, & Dankar, 2019). It is one of the main principles in *The Belmont Report*, *The Nuremberg Code*, and *The Declaration of Helsinki* (Constantin, 2018; Dankar et al., 2019).

There were several measures to safeguard the identity and privacy of the participants. For example, linking the name of every participant with a code number, using this code number (instead of using the name of the participant), and keeping the sheet linking the name of the participants and the code numbers in a locked filing cabinet in my home office. I was the only one who had access to this cabinet. Furthermore, I used

a password for my laptop, so no one except me could have access to the data on my laptop.

The sampling method for this study was a purposeful sampling of the participants. Researchers use purposeful sampling to leverage limited resources and select cases that have rich information (Duan, Bhaumik, Palinkas, & Hoagwood, 2015). It is necessary to protect the participants in from both mental and physical forms of harm. All participants received equal treatment. I ensured to identify only individuals who did not have any personal ties of interaction with me before this investigation. However, I had prior experience in the geographical location of these individuals and the pharmaceutical industry but not with the participants.

During the 5 years I worked in the pharmaceutical industry, I witnessed a significantly high number of employees leave their jobs. However, I used several approaches during this study to ensure that my personal views did not influence the results of this study. Researchers have relied on the phenomenon of epoché-reduction to reduce bias during their investigations (Van Manen, 2017). Phillips (2016) asserted that a researcher could alleviate the effects of bias by using disciplined subjectivity. Therefore, the researcher needs to understand that bias and ethnocentricity are pre-conceived notions (Phillips, 2016). I needed to recognize my own biases and acknowledge that the participants might have views and opinions that might oppose my stance on the subject matter. I did not draw any conclusions about participants' culture based on my cultural traditions and values.

Clancy and Vince (2019) showed that human emotions and opposing opinions of both the participants and the researcher have the potential to undermine the quality of

research. Despite this, researchers cannot truly eliminate these factors because of the critical role they play (Clancy & Vince, 2019). Emotions and opposing opinions can be parts of the multifaceted nature of research findings (Clancy & Vince, 2019). Most notably, researchers can acknowledge these elements and provide additional insight into the study (Clancy & Vince, 2019). Therefore, I was open to research findings that either supported or competed against my perspective on the subject under study.

Researchers use interview procedures to gather the overall perspectives of the participants (Taylor, Fornusek, Ruys, Bijak, & Bauman, 2017). Researchers conduct interviews through a series of questions and seek to not only create a clear path for the interviews but also encourage the interviewees to provide more information on an issue that may not be covered in the questions (Taylor et al., 2017). Researchers demonstrate increased support for triangulation because they consider it useful (Turner, Cardinal, & Burton, 2017). Researchers use triangulation and implement multiple data collection approaches to promote a more comprehensive understanding of the subject under investigation (Khaldi, 2017; Shoaib & Mujtaba, 2016).

Relying on an interview protocol was necessary to maintain uniformity during the preparation, interview, and post-interview stages (see Appendix A). Castillo-Montoya (2016) developed an interview procedure that consists of four stages that researchers can use to improve their interview processes. In the first stage, the researcher ensures that the interview questions reflect the idea presented in the research question. In the second stage, the researcher creates a conversation depending on inquiries related to the topic of the study. In the third stage, the interviewer collects relevant feedback regarding the protocol. In the final stage, the interviewer conducts a pilot of the interview protocol. I

used the first three stages to make sure that my interview protocol met the requirements of Walden University's Institutional Review Board (IRB) and the doctoral study guidelines at Walden University.

Participants

Having sufficient research participants is critical because the qualitative researcher needs adequate information to be able to study the phenomenon in-depth and provide a rich context (Saunders & Townsend, 2016). The eligibility criterium for individuals who participate in my study was that they hold an HR manager's position within the pharmaceutical industry. Martínez-Mesa, González-Chica, Duquia, Bonamigo, and Bastos (2016) indicated several factors that determine the overall number of participants in the research. These factors include the intent behind the study, what the researcher wants to explore, what is at stake, what data is beneficial, and whether this information is credible (Martínez-Mesa et al., 2016).

The participants in my study were HR managers who have successfully implemented strategies to reduce employee turnover in their various organizations located in the Northeast area of the United States. According to Maramwidze-Merrison (2016), for a qualitative study to be successful, the qualitative researcher should conduct interviews with experienced representatives of an organization who can provide relevant and appropriate answers to the interview questions. Additionally, researchers can gain more insight regarding identifying appropriate participants and whom to include in the study through strategies like reviewing business directories, organizational databases, and business listings (Maramwidze-Merrison, 2016). Maramwidze-Merrison indicated two forms for gaining access to participants: primary and secondary access. The primary

access is the process that occurs when the researcher is trying to have permission from the managers at an organization to conduct research. The secondary access is the process when the researcher is building the relationship with people at an organization to gain access to related information or other people at the same organization (Maramwidze-Merrison, 2016).

During the initial stages of my study, identifying potential participants was through LinkedIn, which contains various businesses and professionals. Additionally, I reached out to the HR managers (from different pharmaceutical firms). I used the email addresses obtained from them or LinkedIn for the initial contact with them as potential participants. In the email, there was an explanation of the purpose of the study, interview process, and interview questions. The email contained a question to ask for voluntary participation in this study. If potential participants agreed to participate in the study, they received the informed consent form by email.

I arranged an introductory telephone call to have a conversation with the potential participants after they expressed their desire to participate through email. During this initial phone call, I explained the interview process and answered their questions related to the interview. During the conversations, I determined if the potential participants were a good fit for this study. The potential participants received more information regarding the proposed research. This information made it possible to seek out informed consent from them before proceeding to the next phase of the study (i.e., the interview).

Goodman-Delahunty and Howes (2016) showed that initial consultations should be used to prompt an individual's participation. After the potential participants agreed to be in the study, I had a scheduled face-to-face interview with the participants. During the period

between the introductory call and the scheduled interview, I provided any additional requested details regarding their roles in the study.

Research Method

The purpose of this qualitative study was to explore strategies that HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry used to reduce employee turnover. There are three primary research methodologies: qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods (Almalki, 2016; Yin, 2018). When researchers use the qualitative research method, they place more emphasis on observing and interpreting the data they collect from the individuals who participate in the study (Park & Park, 2016). The objective of qualitative researchers is to promote deep understanding while analyzing and interpreting the participants' evocative answers to the interview questions and explaining the similarities and differences between the participants' perspective (Park & Park, 2016). Qualitative researchers strive to identify any theoretical findings and make discoveries to respond to their research questions, all in the ordinary setting of the participants (Park & Park, 2016). According to Murshed and Zhang (2016), qualitative researchers want to develop an in-depth understanding of the phenomenon within a setting. Researchers use a qualitative research method to conduct a wide-ranging and comprehensive analysis (Yardley, 2017). Most importantly, qualitative researchers display significantly high levels of commitment and precision by providing an in-depth description of the phenomenon of interest (Yardley, 2017). Therefore, qualitative research was the most appropriate research method for my study because I wanted to explore different perspectives conducted thorough an exploration of different perspectives, develop more understanding into a business problem, and derive themes from the responses of the interviewees.

In quantitative studies, researchers utilize arithmetic, and experimental and statistical analysis to provide an account of the different ways in which variables interact with each other (Khaldi, 2017). In this manner, quantitative researchers display a preference for the acquisition of theoretical forms of knowledge rather than the understanding from personal experiences (Murshed & Zhang, 2016). Quantitative researchers conduct an exhaustive analysis of the basic facts and use this to explain people's behavior (Murshed & Zhang, 2016). Researchers who use quantitative analyses do not include human interactions, daily lived experiences, and individual accounts of these experiences (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). Despite this, the researchers must ascertain that the data they collect display a significant amount of frequencies, occurrences, and similarities. According to McLeod (2017), the sample size of quantitative studies must be extremely large for the researchers to find similarities and patterns. In quantitative research, when the sample size is too small, the researchers may generate unreliable and invalid findings due to the limited amount of data. Park and Park (2016) explained that quantitative research relies on the careful collection of different quantitative variables of human behavior. Quantitative researchers study the associations between these quantitative variables to find statistical relations (Park & Park, 2016; Yin, 2018). A quantitative research method was not appropriate for my study because I did not study the interaction between variables.

According to Yin (2018), mixed methods researchers combine both qualitative and quantitative research methods. According to Mabila (2017), there are six main characteristics of mixed methods research. First, mixed methodology includes both types of data (quantitative and qualitative). Second, using mixed methodology carries the need

for analyzing quantitative and qualitative data. Third, the mixed methods approach has an exhaustive procedure for both qualitative and quantitative data. Fourth, researchers integrate both data sets. Fifth, researchers consider equal or unequal emphasis on each type of data (quantitative or qualitative). Finally, the overall model depends on a rigorous and valid school of thought. When researchers use a combination of different research methods (i.e., mixed), they can generate a significantly high level of understanding due to triangulation (Khaldi, 2017; Turner et al., 2017). Triangulation is an approach in which the researcher uses several methods to identify and accumulate meaningful information that is aligned with the questions that are guiding the research (Turner et al., 2017). One form of triangulation includes the combination of field studies with the laboratory experiment, a clear indication of multiple methods (Turner et al., 2017). The mixed methods approach was not appropriate for my study because I used only the qualitative research method and not the quantitative method.

Research Design

For a qualitative study, there are four primary designs: case study, phenomenology, ethnography, and narrative inquiry. According to Yin (2018), researchers use case study as a research design to generate a report on individuals and events. The case study is an experiential-based method of investigation in which qualitative researchers attempt to explore a subject matter while it is in its original context (Runfola, Perna, Baraldi, & Gregori, 2017). Under this approach, there are no distinct differences between the phenomena and its context (Runfola et al., 2017). Furthermore, the researcher relies on numerous sources of information and attempts to generate an exhaustive understanding of a social phenomenon, such as individual and

group behavior and the practice of management (Runfola et al., 2017; Yin, 2018).

Therefore, qualitative researchers use case study design to develop a more comprehensive understanding of elements and events while they are in their original context.

Considering this, the case study design was the most appropriate design for my study because I wanted to investigate an event (employee turnover) in-depth and provide a rich text description.

According to Letourneau (2015) and Nazir (2016), using a phenomenological study design allows the researcher to focus on human lived experiences. Therefore, by using a phenomenological research design, qualitative researchers attempt to generate a comprehensive portrayal of a phenomenon based on the study participants' live experiences (Daher, Olivares, Carré, Jaramillo, & Tomicic, 2017). The phenomenological study design was inappropriate for my study because I was not focusing on the human experience of HR managers participating in this study.

Another research design is ethnography. Anthropologists initially developed an ethnographic research design for investigating other people's way of life or culture (Ferraro & Andreatta, 2017). Ethnography helps to generate more insight and information on how people from different cultures lead their lives. The qualitative researcher uses ethnography to place more emphasis on engaging in observation of other people's culture (Yin, 2018). The passive events, objects, and individuals are a more reliable way through which researchers can attain an accurate representation of the world (Yin, 2018). The ethnographical design was inappropriate for my study because I did not collect data about shared beliefs and behaviors over an extended period, and I was not focusing my research on ethnic groups and cultures.

Qualitative researchers use narrative research design to understand the development, current operation, and future endurance of individuals based on their personal stories (Hamilton, Discua Cruz, & Jack, 2017). The researcher can determine the multifaceted processes that contribute to the creation, organization, and administration of such an individual from the personal story (Hamilton et al., 2017). Researchers who employ narrative research design use reciprocal forms of reflection as well as co-construction to understand the subject under evaluation (Hamilton et al., 2017). According to Brown (2017), narrative researchers rely on conversations and their interpretation of the participants' stories. According to Hickson (2016), qualitative researchers should focus more on the narratives told by the participants. Researchers focus on the narratives to gain more insight into the context, constructs, and additional features of the narrative (Hickson, 2016). The narrative design's success depends wholly on the researcher's ability to employ a reflexive approach (Hickson, 2016). It is worth noting that all this is impossible to achieve in the absence of the researcher's and participant's ability to engage in the process of reflection (Hickson, 2016). According to Shapiro (2016), researchers use a narrative study design to have a shared narrative context derived from the collected life stories of participants. The narrative study design was not a suitable study design for my study because I did not obtain the life stories of participants.

A researcher's inability to attain a high level of saturation in the data collected could undermine the quality of a study because it negatively affects the validity of the data and associated findings (Saunders et al., 2018). Semistructured interviews, particularly those that rely on open-ended questions, are better placed to achieve

saturation criterion (Nascimento et al., 2018). When there is enough information for other researchers to reproduce a study, it means that the initial researcher has attained desirable and appropriate data saturation levels (Saunders et al., 2018). The researchers reach a data saturation level when they cannot obtain new information and additional coding is no longer feasible (Nascimento et al., 2018). Saturation is only attainable when researchers conduct a comprehensive analysis (Nascimento et al., 2018). Analysts are prone to encounter difficulties in placing data into categories and generating new concepts if enough data (i.e., saturation level) are absent (Nascimento et al., 2018).

Researchers can attain saturation through interviews (Weller et al., 2018). There is a clear and direct link between triangulation and data saturation due to triangulation's capacity to generate multiple forms of data, which in turn strengthen the overall study's accuracy, validity, and reliability (Varpio, Ajjawi, Monrouxe, O'Brien, & Rees, 2017). The researchers use triangulation, so they can merge information they retrieve from different sources as a means of promoting coherence and consistency in research (Yin, 2018). Member checking is considered a critical tool in research and the interviewers use member checking to return analyzed versions of the data to the participant for confirmation of accuracy (Thomas, 2017). In my study, I conducted in-depth interviews and continued interviewing more participants until identifying a repetition of themes from the collected data. The implementation of data triangulation and member checking were critical to ensure reaching data saturation.

Population and Sampling

The need to identify cases that have adequate information while using minimal resources is what drives purposeful sampling (Valerio et al., 2016). Purposeful sampling

is a method that researchers often use to identify individuals who are prone to feeling the effects of the issue under investigation (Valerio et al., 2016). Researchers use purposeful sampling to maintain a more thorough approach to study, through focusing on variables and characteristics that make an essential contribution to the study (Valerio et al., 2016). The researcher can implement purposeful sampling through several steps (Ames, Glenton, & Lewin, 2019). To begin with, the researcher identifies the study population through inclusion and exclusion criteria. Additionally, the researcher chooses a sample size that is both appropriate and useful for the study. The researcher also needs to develop a sampling strategy that enable the identification of participants that the researcher includes in the research. Finally, the researcher creates the sample by conducting recruitments that target the identified population. A researcher who wants to determine the extent to which individuals differ in their ability to adapt to various conditions can employ purposeful sampling (Ames et al., 2019). In studies with a large amount of data, purposeful sampling is used to narrow down the criteria for inclusion (Ames et al., 2019). I used a purposeful sampling method to select HR managers who participated in my study.

Another important sampling method that researchers use to identify participants is convenience sampling. It is a non-random and nonprobability selection of the participants. Using convenience sampling, researchers select predetermined criteria and include any members of the population that meet these criteria (Etikan, Abubakar, Sunus, & Alkassim, 2016). These criteria can consist of factors, such as easy accessibility, proximity to an area (e.g., geographical location), availability at a specific time, and the desire to participate in the study (Etikan et al., 2016). While this sampling method was

indeed convenient, I did not use convenience sampling because using this sampling method lead to that not all qualified individuals in my target population have equal chances of participating in my study. Snowballing is a sampling approach that researchers use to identify participants based on information from other respondents (Kirchherr & Charles, 2018). There was no snowball sampling in this study because the focus was on seeking participants who met specific eligibility criteria.

Robinson (2014) mentioned that he conducted research with a sample of five HR managers who could answer the interview questions. I followed Robinson's example and used purposeful sampling to identify five HR managers who can provide detailed answers in order to answer the research question. Then, the HR managers may provide HR current records related to employee turnover and compare it to employee turnover previous records. Using this comparison was useful to determine whether the strategies that HR managers have used have been active in reducing their organizations' turnover. Researchers need to ensure that they maintain transferability when they are identifying their study sample (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). Essentially, their results ought to be highly credible, reliable, and easy to use when the need to replicate them arises (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). Using a purposeful sampling was the most appropriate sampling method for my study because HR managers are knowledgeable enough to provide reliable answers and, therefore, they were the best individuals to provide me with information related to strategies they used to reduce employee turnover.

My target population for this study was HR managers who work in the pharmaceutical industry located in the Northeast area of the United States. Furthermore, these HR managers have experience implementing successful strategies to reduce

employee turnover. I identified five HR managers (of four pharmaceutical companies) who met the eligibility criteria (i.e., working in the pharmaceutical industry and being an HR manager). Other researchers have relied on a similar number of participants. For example, Shaheen (2016) studied employee retention using a case study research design and included five participants. Additionally, Miller (2017) also adopted a similar approach with five participants to study employee turnover. Similarly, Combs (2017) studied employee turnover and employed multiple case research designs, but only relied on data collected from two individuals. It is worth noting that all the researchers mentioned above were investigating the event of employee turnover using a sample size of five participants or a lower number of participants. Due to the similarity of my study to the three studies mentioned earlier, the minimal number of five participants were adequate and appropriate for my study. My research was a qualitative multiple case study to explore strategies that HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry used to reduce employee turnover.

According to Constantinou, Georgiou, and Perdikogianni (2017), qualitative researchers reach data saturation when they cannot identify a new theme from the collected data. Britton, Pieterse, and Lawrence (2017) recommended the use of triangulation of data, field notes that are reflective in nature, exhaustive interviews, member checking and extended interaction with the participants to ensure data saturation. According to Britton et al. (2017) and Yin (2018), researchers seek member checking to generate data that is consistent with the participant's opinions by allowing them to confirm that the results are accurate. I followed Britton et al. recommendations to ensure data saturation. After transforming interview recordings into written data, the next step

was making sure to include all the information covered during the interview. Then, creating a brief statement of the interviews and highlighting the main themes that emerged. After the final analysis of the data, each participant received an email that contains the summary of the participant's response. The participant can verify the information to ensure an accurate reflection of the answers generated from the participant's experience and perspective. Interpretation of the data was in a manner that reflective of the participants' responses. The participants had the opportunity to add additional suggestions and corrections if needed. Researchers achieve data saturation level when they have enough information to replicate the study (i.e., no possibility to add more information). Hence further coding is not feasible (Nascimento et al., 2018; Saunders et al., 2018). Triangulation is a procedure that lets the researcher combine data collected through multiple tools and from different sources to maintain congruency (Yin, 2018).

Interviewers may have concerns related to safety issues (Ecker, 2017). Some of the approaches that interviewers can use is promoting the safety of interviewers while data collection procedures include having many interviewers at a private interview site and providing them with adequate training (Ecker, 2017). Additionally, the interviewers need to ensure that they always keep their cellphones on them during the interview for their safety (Ecker, 2017). Interviews conducted within private residences present numerous challenges, which are absent in those that researchers carried out in public places (Ecker, 2017). Researchers showed that various factors of the environment could affect the participants' desire to reveal confidential information (Dawson, Hartwig, Brimbal, & Denisenkov, 2017). These factors include the size and the general setting of a

room (Dawson et al., 2017). For example, some people might feel comfortable in a specific environment, while others may feel like they are under a lot of pressure. To ensure that the participants were comfortable and that there was no distractions during the interview, I made sure to choose an impartial location for the interview sessions (e.g., public library). The site was also secure enough to protect all individuals involved from harm. The interview protocol (see Appendix A) for this research contains additional details regarding the entire process.

Ethical Research

According to Baker et al. (2016), researchers should follow their institutional procedures of ethics and demonstrate adherence to these ethical standards. Researchers must present their informed consent form to the ethical committee (e.g., IRB) and have approval before conducting the research (Baker et al., 2016). Walden University's IRB determines a researcher's compliance with the basic ethical principles that a researcher must follow when conducting a study that involves human participants.

The informed consent form is a document that contains all detailed information about the study (Dankar et al., 2019). This information includes the goals of the research, the role the researcher expects the participant to play throughout the study, and the potential harms and costs these individuals may incur by choosing to become a part of the study. Researchers use informed consent forms to help the prospective participants to take an informed decision regarding participation in the research and protect them from any harm (Dankar et al., 2019; Yin, 2018). The researchers must provide a consent document to gain people's consent to become a part of the investigation before the start of the study, so the participants have a full understanding of the research (Yin, 2018). I

used the informed consent form in the early stages of research, particularly before I begin to collect data.

The IRB at Walden University received an email that contains my informed consent form and my interview protocol (see Appendix A). After having the approval from the board, I included Walden University IRB approval number in my final doctoral study and on the informed consent form. The next step was to start contacting the potential participants. The participants in this current study were HR managers working in the pharmaceutical industry in the Northeast area of the United States. Each potential participant received an email one week in advance (before the proposed date of the actual interview), and the email contained the informed consent form document. Each potential participant had the time to review the information in the informed consent form and decided regarding the willingness to take part in this research. The HR managers provided their informed consents through signing the consent forms in person on the day of the interview, before the beginning of the interview process. I also signed the forms and date them appropriately before the interviews begin.

Participation in this study was voluntary. The potential participants had the freedom to accept or decline the invitation to enroll in my research. Furthermore, the participants could pull out of the research at any time during the study (i.e., withdraw from the study before or after the interview without having to provide any explanations for their decision to withdraw). To withdraw their consent, these participants could reach out to me either through e-mail or phone (the process was provided in the informed consent form). The decision to withdraw consent was not associated with reprimanding

or any other types of repercussions. For any individual who decided to withdraw from my study, I deleted all his or her information and did not include it in the analysis.

Potential participants did not receive any incentives or rewards to encourage their participation in my study. According to Hidi (2016), rewards include items, situation, and activities to motivate people to engage in a particular action. Hidi indicated that rewards could change behavior to have such an object. Individuals assume that their engagement in activities with rewards will result in more rewards (Hidi, 2016). Additionally, offering rewards can also influence people's decision-making (Hidi, 2016). All participants in my study received a thank-you card and an e-mail expressing gratitude for their participation. Furthermore, I emailed them a copy of the published version of the findings.

The Nuremberg Code, Belmont Report, and the Declaration of Helsinki emphasized the informed consent process (Constantin, 2018; Dankar et al., 2019). I uphold the basic tenets of the Belmont research convention. For examples, keeping the participants safe from harm, safeguard the information they revealed, protect the privacy of the participants, and confidentiality of the data. Lindlof and Tylor (2019) indicated that the researcher is responsible for managing data, maintaining the privacy of participants, and the confidentiality of the data. Linking the name participants with code numbers and using these numbers instead of using the names of the participants was the method to maintain the privacy of participants and the confidentiality of the data in this study. Then, it was necessary to keep the sheet (that linked the name of the participants and the code numbers) in a locked filing cabinet in my home office. I was the only one who has access to this cabinet. Using a password for my laptop was critical, so only I can have access to the data on my laptop. Then, the next step was to keep this information for 5 years, and

after that, destroying the soft and hard copies of the data. Deleting the soft-copy versions includes deleting the interviewees' information, informed consents, audio recordings, and the interview transcript. Destroying the hard copy includes destroying the sheet that contained the links between the participants and their code numbers, informed consents, and the interview transcript.

Data Collection Instruments

I was the primary data collection instrument in this study. I collected and analyzed data from the HR managers, through a semistructured interview and a thorough review of pertinent documents. These documents include HR documentation of employee turnover (e.g., annual and semi-annual reports). In qualitative studies, researchers employ methods, such as interviews with organizational leaders and direct reports to collect relevant information (Yin, 2018). It is crucial for the qualitative researchers to have data so they can attain a comprehensive understanding of the organization's policies and strategies as well as the outcomes and impact those policies and strategies have on the firm (Yin, 2018).

For qualitative interviewers to effectively collect data, the interviewers need to employ several strategies. To begin with, interviewers need to implement active listening. This approach requires the researcher to use both verbal and non-verbal cues to indicate that he or she is listening to and understanding what the interviewee is saying (Yin, 2018). Additionally, active listening also requires researchers to establish a relationship with the interviewees so that they can disclose more information in an unrestricted manner (Yin, 2018). Most importantly, researchers create rapport with the participants to promote an in-depth discussion of the subject matter (Maramwidze-Merrison, 2016).

Probing is one of the ways interviewers can forge strong ties with their interviewees (Smith & Sparkes, 2017). Furthermore, interviewers should also engage in paraphrasing, which indicates that they are paying attention to the interviewees' opinions (Smith & Sparkes, 2017). Researchers use paraphrasing to cross-check the facts and confirm that the interpretations reflect the interviewees' sentiments (Yin, 2018). While face-to-face interviews are a practical approach, some researchers rely on online tools, such as Skype, to interview participants who are unable to meet them for an in-person conversation due to time and geographical limitations.

Interviews are the standard method used to collect oral forms of information when conducting a qualitative study (Wright, Wahoush, Ballantyne, Gabel, & Jack, 2016). There are numerous forms of consultations and dialogue that researchers can use to collect and evaluate information from participants. To begin with, Yin (2018) indicated that the structured interview relies on a standardized script. The purpose of using a structured interview is to maintain consistency across all interviews by following a list of specific questions (Yin, 2018). Conversely, a semistructured interview enables the researcher to pose questions based on the information he or she wants to discover (Yin, 2018). Therefore, the researcher can make alterations, during the interview, to the questions that the researcher prepared before the study began. Finally, the unstructured interview is one in which there is no guiding set of questions. Instead, the researcher can ask general questions regarding the topic he or she wants to explore (Smith & Sparkes, 2017). In my study, I used semistructured interviews to create questions that reflected the study's aims, goals, and purpose. A comprehensive list of the questions is available (see Appendix B). In addition to the original questions, there were also be follow-up questions

that were on a probing nature. Using this strategy facilitates clarifying specific responses and ensure that my interpretation and general understanding reflected the participants' opinions.

Researchers can triangulate their research findings through a review of the documents and other information they have collected (Yin, 2018). Furthermore, this procedure also provides context to the overall study. In research, the researchers rely on numerous data collection tools, including observation, document reviews, and interviews (Johnson et al. 2017). I employed a similar approach to my study. The data collection tools, in this study, include annual and semi-annual reports (related to employee turnover) and other relevant documents that participants provided (e.g., reports on the cost of training new employees and overall labor costs). During the interviews, the data collection for this study was according to my interview protocol (Appendix A). My reliance on an interview convention was particularly beneficial because there was a structure for both during and after the interview process. Furthermore, the interview protocol was a guide. It has information on obtaining participant's consent, strategies for opening and closing the interview session, recording notes (as the interview was ongoing), and coding the information that I did collect.

Researchers should take all the steps necessary to guarantee a high level of reliability and validity in their data (Yin, 2018). There are many strategies that enhance the reliability and validity of the data collection process, including triangulation, reflexive writing, member checking, and debriefing the peers (Yin, 2018). When a researcher involves the participants in the process of confirming data, through member checking, he or she can minimize researcher bias (Birt, Scott, Cavers, Campbell, & Walter, 2016).

While the researchers interpret the collected data, they must ensure they do not undermine the interviewees' opinions and point of view regarding the subject matter (Birt et al., 2016). According to Moon, Brewer, Januchowski-Hartley, Adams, and Blackman (2016), the reliability of the data collection depends on the extent to which the researchers amassed data during the investigation. Study reliability reflects the ability of third parties (e.g., researchers) to follow the various procedures undertaken to either duplicate the research or provide a critique (Yin, 2018). Conversely, validity refers to the degree to which a researcher reflects the actual opinions expressed by the participants (Yin, 2018). Valid research does not contain biased interpretations and personal views of researchers (Moon et al., 2016). Researchers can maintain credibility in their study by demonstrating a consistent link between data collected and the conclusions (Yin, 2018). Valid research is not only confirmable but also easy to understand by the target audience.

Transferability is a term used to indicate the external validity of a study (Moon et al., 2016). When research makes a significant contribution to theoretical knowledge, people can apply the findings in a real-world setting. Therefore, scholars consider the study to be valid and hence, transferable. The readers, as well as future researchers, will rely on the transferability of research to either reproduce the study or implement its findings in various settings (Moon et al., 2016). I reviewed the companies' documentation, observed the participants, and interviewed participants using open-ended questions as a means of collecting valuable information regarding the participants. Qualitative researchers tend to employ a myriad of methods to amass information, ranging from observation interviews and digital diaries, to case studies and focus groups (Johnson et al., 2017). Attaining conformability in this research was by providing a clear

description of how deriving the conclusions and interpretations from the information (gained through using dialogue and conversations, data reviews, and observation processes). Furthermore, it was critical to not including my personal opinions in my study, which in turn demonstrated avoiding bias in this study. The study consisted of explanations of concepts and adequate elucidation of the outcomes. Depending mainly on the interview protocol (see Appendix A) helped to improve the overall accuracy of the transcripts. Furthermore, by using member checking, there was an opportunity to align the interpretations of the data with the participants' perceptions.

Data Collection Technique

The researcher conducting a qualitative study aimed to interpret the participants' expression based on of the participants' views regarding a subject (Yin, 2018).

Qualitative researchers strive to implement strategies and models that can provide an adequate representation of the participants' opinions and provide satisfactory answers to basic questions, such as why and how (Alderfer & Sood, 2016). Qualitative researchers have many ways to collect data. Eyisi (2016) indicated some of the methods in collecting data, for qualitative studies, include field notes, in-depth interviews, and open-ended questions. All these methods or approaches have one thing in common: studying the phenomenon without removing the individuals participating in the study from their daily activities and environment (Eyisi, 2016).

Many qualitative researchers use a semistructured interview to conduct a thorough discussion with the interviewees (Castillo-Montoya, 2016). They pose probing questions to acquire more information regarding the participants' experiences and views about the subject matter (Goodman-Delahunty & Howes, 2016). Unlike using structured interviews

that rely on a standardized script and a list of specific questions, interviewers use the semistructured interview to gather more in-depth information from the participants regarding various concepts and factors related to the topic under investigation (Yin, 2018). The participant can develop a more productive relationship with the interviewer when the interviewer expresses thoughts without restrictions (Yin, 2018). I made sure that I maintained the same semistructured approach when interacting with all five HR managers and collected information from the employee turnover reports that HR managers provided.

I conducted the interviews in a secluded area that was part of a local library. There were three reasons for conducting my interviews at the local library. First, there were private rooms in the public library, and this help in protecting the participants' privacy, and no one know that I met the participants because of the interview. Second, since the interview was in the library, distractions was significantly minimal. Third, meeting at a public place was guarantee security for both the participants and me. Before beginning the interview, it was critical to inform the participants that I was recording our interaction using a recorder and my phone (for back up). If my recorder failed to record, no need to stop the interview. Instead, my phone was there for the same function (i.e., recording). The recording of the interview also used as a reference for the transcription, coding, and analysis of the responses.

I implemented a semistructured interview that depends on using open-ended questions (see Appendix B). After asking a question, the participants had adequate time to answer my interview questions exhaustively. Depending on their initial response to each question, there were follow-up questions that served the goal of seeking the

participant's clarification on a specific matter. In addition to recording the whole process, I also had reflexive notes on my notepad throughout the interviews. Whenever noticing points needed to focus on during the interview, writing these points in the notepad was necessary to ask follow-up questions, and seeking additional details and explanations. When the interviews end, the next step was to offer gratitude to the participants for the information they provided. In addition, I told the participants how much I appreciate their decision to take time to speak with me.

According to Yin (2018), triangulation occurs when a researcher merges data collected from varying sources, as a means of achieving uniformity. As part of my triangulation methodology, I retrieved data from different sources besides the HR managers. For example, significant reliance could be on the company's documents that the HR managers supplied. These documents included annual and semi-annual employee turnover reports, orientation, and training records as well as publications that outline the organization's yearly labor costs. When reviewing these publications, recording relevant information was critical to check the reduction in employee turnover levels after participants (HR managers) implemented their strategies. The use of documents in research enables the researcher to identify pertinent data that offers additional support to other data sources (Britton et al., 2017; Yin, 2018).

Qualitative researchers use interviews that are not excessively structured (e.g., semistructured interview) so they can engage in active and supportive listening to the participants (Yin, 2018). This strategy emphasizes building a trusting relationship with the interviewee and implementing paraphrasing and probing techniques (Smith & Sparkes, 2017). These tools urge the participants to engage in an in-depth dialogue

regarding the subject under investigation (Smith & Sparkes, 2017). I conducted my research using semistructured interviews to collect pertinent information from HR managers who successfully implemented strategies to reduce employee turnover in the pharmaceutical industry.

Semistructured interviews present a myriad of disadvantages. A semistructured interview method tends to be very time-consuming (Yin, 2018). Because seeking to promote an in-depth discussion of the topic, offering the participants ample time is necessary to provide adequate and exhaustive responses to the interview questions. Additionally, there is a high level of commitment when using semistructured interviews because the interviewer and the interviewee need to arrange the time and attend according to the prepared schedule (Yin, 2018). The participants in this study proposed their time availability to arrange and schedule the interview enough time, so the interviewee can check their schedule and confirm. Then, the potential interviewee received an email one day before the interview to remind them of the date and time so they could attend. Finally, interviews are only as good as the interviewer. Therefore, a researcher lacking proper interviewing skills and an understanding of appropriate strategies and tools are often incapable of performing an effective interview (Smith & Sparkes, 2017). Therefore, I made sure to conduct adequate research regarding the skills and tools required to improve the outcomes of my interview.

Triangulation method was critical in this study to improve the data saturation level in the research. As mentioned earlier, triangulation involves using several sources, to provide a more collective interpretation of information collected for research purposes. In this study, there was a combination of document reviews, observation, reflective notes,

and interview data to achieve triangulation. Despite the proven benefits of triangulation, Glasper and Rees (2016) showed that using multiple methods in research can complicate the research process. Triangulation may prevent researchers from remaining true to a single method of collecting data (Glasper & Rees, 2016). Furthermore, there are concerns related to the researcher's reliance on multiple sources (Glasper & Rees, 2016). Owing to these issues, researchers take precautions to ensure that they do not undermine the reliability of the data they collected (Glasper & Rees, 2016). They should analyze the data separately, before synthesizing it so that they can identify the similarities and differences in data (Glasper & Rees, 2016). To avoid this problem, I conducted a systematic review of the field notes, documents, and interviews separately. Eventually, identifying similar themes that made a valuable contribution to my study.

The member checking procedure involves the researcher taking the summary of results to the participants so they can confirm its accuracy and provide additional details (Thomas, 2017). The interviewees use this information to provide confirmation and additional details that the researcher may leave out during the initial interview. According to Birt et al. (2016), allowing participants to provide their feedback to the summary of results improves the overall accuracy of the study. Using member checking process, each participant received a summary of the participant's contributions results. Then, the participant reviewed that summary, and I used any changes to augment my results to increase validity.

Data Organization Technique

Researchers conducting a qualitative study rely on data management software to organize various items, including field notes and interview transcripts. Data management

software also contains transcribing features, which are beneficial for qualitative researchers. According to Yin (2018), more and more researchers are separating databases from case study analyses, which are now thought to be distinct. Researchers should compile the information and arrange it in an orderly manner. It is also crucial for researchers to separate the unmodified dataset from their interpretations of this information (Yin, 2018). By using this distinction, readers and other researchers can view the data that contributed to the general findings and conclusions of the research (Yin, 2018).

According to Appelbaum et al. (2018), the researchers should continue keeping the databases and records of research for at least 5 years. The researcher should store the data in a readable format. The researchers should store the data in a form in which other participating researchers can access it so they can confirm the original researcher's conclusions. Most importantly, other participating researchers should not have access to the informed consents and list linking participants to codes because the primary researcher should protect the privacy of the of the participants and maintain the data confidentiality. The researchers should protect the data from corruption and loss throughout this period of 5 years.

NVivo® 12 is a computer program used to help in conducting qualitative data analyses by organizing the data and tracking the information analyzed. Unlike software used to conduct statistical analyses, NVivo® 12's primary role is to aid the researcher's analysis process. Qualitative researchers use NVivo® 12 because they can display various processes and outcomes while analyzing their data (Houghton et al., 2016).

There is no known software that researchers can use to automatically analyze qualitative forms of data.

NVivo® 12 is beneficial due to several reasons. To begin with, the qualitative researcher can use the software to help in analyzing the data accurately and transparently. Additionally, multiple users can use NVivo® 12, so they can work on the same set of data at the same time (Robins & Eisen, 2017). Researchers who have a high level of understanding regarding the inner workings of multiple user coding are more likely to successfully generate quality qualitative analyses (Houghton et al., 2016). Furthermore, researchers can use NVivo® 12 to strengthen their research findings by creating a convention so they can guide the data synthesis (Houghton et al., 2016). I used the NVivo® 12 program to organize the data from multiple sources (e.g., interviews and document reviews) and to track my analyzed information. The next step was storing the data that pertains to the study, such as my reflection notes, transcripts of the interviews, and other relevant notes, in a flash drive protected with a password. After that, the step of retaining the raw data on a similar storage device and place it in a fire-proof cabinet located in my home office. Retaining this information was be for 5 years and then I destroyed the data.

Data Analysis

The process of analyzing data begins when researchers compile relevant data collected from their various sources (Yin, 2018). Once this process is complete, researchers proceed to disassemble the data and place it into distinct categories. The researchers then place the data into code and identify clusters. In the following stage, the

researcher endeavors to interpret the data and group its various components into different and identifiable themes.

The researcher may employ triangulation and collect data from different sources (Khaldi, 2017). According to Shoaib and Mujtaba (2016), studies are more likely to have accurate and more convincing findings and conclusions when they depend on data retrieved from multiple sources. Varpio et al. (2017) demonstrated that researchers use triangulation to present an exhaustive analysis of the subject matter compared to studies with a single researcher and data collection method and analysis. In my research, I collected data from different sources: document reviews, face-to-face interviews, audio recordings, and field notes. Facilitating the triangulation of data was by collecting the data from the sources I mentioned. Then, the implementation of a five-step approach that Yin (2018) used to perform data analysis. The first step was compiling the data from different sources into a single database. After that, disassembling the data, before eventually re-assembling it into distinctive categories and themes based on their similarities and differences. The fourth step was interpreting the information. The final step was writing the conclusion.

NVivo® is a computer software program that researchers commonly use in qualitative studies to help organize and code data, which includes both images and texts. Researchers use NVivo® to harmonize data they collected so they can identify commonalities (Oliveira, Bitencourt, Zanardo dos Santos, & Teixeira, 2016). NVivo® has numerous tools, which researchers can use throughout the different stages of research.

In my study, I chose to use NVivo® 12, and I installed the program on my laptop that has a Windows operating system. By using NVivo®, there was an opportunity to code and conduct additional evaluations on the collected data for this research. At the same time, I used NVivo® for data management because I was able to place all the necessary information and materials collected throughout the study in the same place.

The case study database contains information that is distinctly different from the information collected from the field (Bengtsson, 2016). The database is more likely to include various forms of data, including numbers and other documents (Yin, 2018). When compiling data, there was creation of several categories for the data. These categories included employee satisfaction, employee retention, employee motivation, and engagement with the job. Additional categories included managerial training and HR management. Besides these six categories, other sets of data continued to emerge under different and additional categories that added when analyzing the information in this study.

According to Johnson and Rasulova (2017), researchers should treat their case studies as a means through which they can contribute to basic principles and theories. During the first stage of data analysis, researchers begin by transcribing and organizing information that they retrieve using interviews. One of the ways of data disassembly is through data reduction. Qualitative researchers use data reduction to break up a large amount of information into small and manageable sizes (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). The goal of data reduction is increasing the ability to interpret and understand the sets of data.

The data collected during the research should reflect the study's purpose that the researcher established at the beginning of an investigation (Yin, 2018). Information should contribute toward the researcher's enlightenment and increased knowledge of the topic under review. Essentially, the researcher needs to remember the research question and use it as a guide through the various stages of the study. For example, the development of themes, a process conducted in the later stages of research largely depends on this question. For the researchers to familiarize themselves more with the information collected through interviews, they can go through the final transcripts. Qualitative researchers check the interviews final transcripts to identify familiar storylines and varying perspectives (Castleberry & Nolen, 2018). During the disassembling stage, there was disassembling of the collected information into different sections, such as document reviews, annual reports, and interviews. I identified emergent trends and themes during this process to label and explain different perspectives. For example, I recognized some of the factors that determine the overall rate of employee turnover during the disassembling phase.

In the stage of data reassembly, the researcher needs to emphasize identifying patterns and other commonalities and discrepancies in the data (Yin, 2018). However, researchers need to take extra precautions to ensure that they do not introduce numeric values into the information under assessment during this stage (Yin, 2018). This mistake is not uncommon for researchers that rely on software to code and analyze research information. Instead, they should strive to identify patterns and use them to code, categorize, and interpret the data. Using these activities, researchers can shed more light on phenomena they observed and focus on in the study (Ramani & Mann, 2016).

When reassembling data, researchers identify some of the significant and minor themes present in their data (Ramani & Mann, 2016). The researchers re-arrange the large amount of data into small components, which are not only easy to analyze but also easy to understand (Yin, 2018). At this stage, the researchers rely on their analytical skills to place various sets of data into clusters and dividing these groups further into smaller sub-clusters (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). I performed all these activities using the software program, NVivo®. Then, the next step was identifying common themes, clusters, and repetitions to code and divide the data into small manageable groups.

When providing a report on qualitative data, researchers create a summary of their data using theme-based grouping (Yin, 2018). The researchers calculate the frequency of individual factors, concepts, and terms to interpret the data (Yin, 2018). The researchers can identify repetitiveness and redundancies in their data by analyzing and comparing the various themes that they identified during the investigation. During this phase, researchers can also identify the need for collecting additional evidence by determining whether the sources of information provide contradicting accounts of the subject matter (Yin, 2018). Furthermore, the researcher also revisits the data multiple times so that he can develop an in-depth understanding of the information (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). Depending on the personal narratives of the participants helped to identify convergence in data. As a result, I identified evidence that participants provided adequate answers to my research question, allowing me to attain the overall goal for the study. Furthermore, I used my findings to make general conclusions, identify implications, and provide my target audience with recommendations for future research.

NVivo® is a computer software program that qualitative researchers commonly use to conduct electronic data coding. Qualitative researchers rely on NVivo® so they can synchronize data to make it understandable (Oliveira et al., 2016). Researchers use NVivo® to effectively identifying themes and efficiently coding the data in qualitative studies (Oliveira et al., 2016). Qualitative researches also use MAXQDA®, which is also a software that enables researchers to conduct digital analyses of their data. Much like NVivo®, MAXQDA® contains coding and categorization abilities which are beneficial to the content analysis of research data (Oliveira et al., 2016).

Researchers also use Atlasti software program to analyze data collected in qualitative studies. For example, Paulus and Lester (2016) used this software in their data analysis stage due to two main reasons. First, the researchers had a significantly large amount of data. Second, there were two researchers, and they needed to collaborate working on their data. Paulus and Lester indicated that Atlasti contained merging tools, which was ideal for their type of qualitative study. Unlike these researchers, I used NVivo® 12 to manage and review data from different sources under a single system. Additionally, NVivo® software contains transcribing features to upload audio files directly into the software.

It is crucial for researchers to identify both the name and version of programs used to analyze data (Paulus, Woods, Atkins, & Macklin, 2017). These requirements stem from the rapid changes and development of software (Paulus et al., 2017). With each new version, the tools, features, and general capabilities are significantly enhanced (Paulus et al., 2017). Therefore, an older version of the same program might generate different results if another researcher attempted to reproduce the research findings from a

previous study. When these details are missing from a publication, the target audience develops misconstrued notions toward this software because they may assume that the software is static, when the reality is the opposite (i.e., the software is evolving). NVivo® 12 has unique features, such as its ability to codify different types of data, including audio and images because it retains copies of material that the researcher has already codified. Since NVivo® 12 saves and duplicates codifications, the eventual result is strong and the analyses are reliable (Oliveira et al., 2016).

Qualitative researchers use NVivo® or Atlasti to visualize the relationship between different data codes. However, researchers use NVivo® to demonstrate the distribution of the codes across two different case studies. Therefore, researchers can conduct comparisons in a faster and more efficient manner. As a result, the NVivo® software program is appropriate for studies that employ data and method triangulation. Due to the benefits of NVivo® mentioned above, I used NVivo® to codify my data and identified common themes that presented while analyzing my data.

When researchers fail to develop their themes adequately, they may generate unsubstantiated findings, which in turn have little to no impact on business practice and research (Connelly & Peltzer, 2016). Furthermore, such a study will be rejected for publication because the researcher fails to contribute to the existing knowledge with no impact on business practice (Connelly & Peltzer, 2016). There are three main reasons why researchers experience the problem of inadequate themes. First, the researchers do not acquire in-depth insight into the topic under investigation, and their interviewing technique could be the reason. Second, the analysis of all information is usually weak and

insufficient. Third, the researchers fail to identify and develop the relationship between discovered themes and their method of research (Connelly & Peltzer, 2016).

The researchers need to develop a clear and comprehensive understanding of qualitative research to fully develop appropriate and effective themes (Yin, 2018). They need to remain knowledgeable about research elements, such as effective interviewing strategies, clear-cut methodologies, and analyses that provide an adequate evaluation of information (Connelly & Peltzer, 2016). Researchers reach data saturation when they identify a repetition of themes from the collected data (Constantinou, Georgiou, & Perdikogianni, 2017). The researcher can determine the limits of his research questions and topic through theme saturation (Yin, 2018).

When researchers are developing the themes of their study, they need to ensure that they avoid adopting a limited focus and scope (Yin, 2018). Instead, they should strive to treat similarities in the participants' choice of words as an underlying theme. Furthermore, they should be open to identifying sub-themes where they are appropriate and relevant. Additionally, qualitative researchers can hierarchically organize their categories, to demonstrate their level of importance to the study (Castleberry & Nolen, 2018). Most importantly, there is a clear need to link the similarities and groups identified to the research questions and conceptual frameworks used to guide research processes (Castleberry & Nolen, 2018). I relied on the strategies mentioned above to identify themes that frequently occur in my data set.

Reliability and Validity

Qualitative researchers should strive to guarantee to target audience high levels of credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability in their studies (Mohajan,

2017). Qualitative researchers should reduce the bias in their interpretations of research data (Mohajan, 2017). A researcher has a high likelihood of increasing validity and reliability of the study when he uses numerous types of data collection tools to collect the data related to the topic of interest (Mohajan, 2017).

Reliability

Dependability is a term used to refer to the extent to which data remains stable, despite changes in time and environmental conditions (Yin, 2018). In the following section, the focus is on dependability. In addition, I discussed using member checking of data interpretation and transcript review to address dependability.

Dependability. A researcher can improve the dependability of his research by engaging in practices, such as debriefs, member checking, and prolonged observation and interaction with the participants (Connelly, 2016). When providing a report of the qualitative studies, researchers should demonstrate the extent to which they engaged in these practices (Connelly, 2016). For example, a part of the final publication should illustrate the amount of time the lead interviewer spent forging ties and interviewing individuals. Member checking is a widespread practice applied in qualitative research. When participants' views fail to align to findings of the research, the researchers consider the study to be not trustworthy (Thomas, 2017). Researchers need to consider the type of interview and questions used during data collection. Qualitative researchers who use structured interviews do not get more details as researchers who use semistructured interview, in fact semistructured interviews help to have more information from participants due to the opportunity to ask probing questions (Yin, 2018). I ensured dependability in this study by providing the interviewees with a transcribed summary of

my interaction with them. I also invited them to identify errors, discrepancies, and add more information.

Validity

In this section, I discussed credibility, transferability, confirmability, and data saturation. For a study to be considered credible, the researcher needs to conduct enough debriefings and member checking (Connelly, 2016). Additionally, prolonged observation sessions, coupled with an active engagement with participants, can also generate similar results (Connelly, 2016). Confirmability refers to the consistency and reproducibility of the study findings (Connelly, 2016). Transferability is used to determine whether the researcher can apply the findings into practice in a different setting (Yin, 2018).

Credibility. A credible study tends to represent a version of events and interpretations that are reflective of the true nature of things. Thomas (2017) indicated that researchers use member checking to seek out participant's permission to quote them in the study. Furthermore, the researchers consider the research is highly credible when the researcher who conducts the study illustrates how he or she gathered and reviewed information used in the investigation process (Yin, 2018). Furthermore, the participants who participate in the study should demonstrate a clear understanding of the human experience.

According to Young (2016), there is a clear need to abandon complicated descriptions of a phenomenon. Instead, the researcher should put into practice different procedures, practices, and methods to improve the credibility of his findings. To ensure the credibility of my study, there was a merge of information from the annual reports of different pharmaceutical companies, personal notes, and interviews (i.e., triangulation). I

made sure that my personal bias was not affect my analysis by generating data convergence based on information retrieved from these different sources.

Transferability. Transferability is a term used to determine whether results derived from an investigation are applicable in other settings and contexts (Korstjens & Moser, 2018). When the target audience and other researchers find meaning in a study, then they consider the findings are transferable. Connelly (2016) identified some of the ways through which the researchers can promote the credibility and transferability of their studies. For example, they can engage with the respondents over a long period (Connelly, 2016). On the same note, they should also observe the participants in a consistent manner and over a prolonged time. Other approaches include member checking, peer-to-peer discussions, and reflective notes (Connelly, 2016). The researcher's adequate explanation of these processes also improves the transferability feature of research (Korstjens & Moser, 2018). As aforementioned, a study is transferable when other people can find meaning and reproduce it in a different context (Korstjens & Moser, 2018). It is the researcher's sole responsibility to ensure that his findings and conclusions are applicable in subsequent studies (Marshall & Rossman, 2016).

The readers and other researchers engage in the process of transferability when they either implement or reproduce the credible information found within a study (Bengtsson, 2016). These individuals identify specific features of the research and then match them to real-life situations and events. If they discover similarities, the results of their research generate similar findings as well. When reporting my findings, I included detailed explanations of all the results and identified some of the limitations encountered me while conducting my research. Additionally, there was a list of suggestions for future

researchers who are interested in investigating the subject of employee turnover. In section 3 of my dissertation, there was some arguments and demonstration of the study's relevance to both businesses practice and positive social change. All these activities help in facilitating both the readers and researchers' ability to determine the transferability of my research findings.

Confirmability. A study's confirmability implies that its findings are reflective of the participants' opinions and responses received during the interview and not the views and biases of the researcher (Yin, 2018). A researcher can demonstrate the confirmability of the study when he or she illustrates the manner of deriving the findings from the data collected. For example, researchers can quote the participants directly, a clear demonstration that they are basing their arguments and conclusions from participants' views (Johnson & Rasulova, 2017).

The qualitative researchers can use several methods to achieve high levels of confirmability in their studies (Yin, 2018). For example, they should continually audit their research and create an illustration of the same procedure in the final publication. Additionally, they can use methodological memos to provide a detailed account of the various ways in which they concluded from data (Yin, 2018). These notes can also provide additional details on how they made their decisions and how they conducted their analysis. Colleagues and peer reviewers can rely on these notes to determine the quality of the research. Researchers can also engage their peers in relevant discussions regarding the study. Through these deliberations, they can identify their biases and endeavor to separate them from research.

The researchers can show significant high levels of confirmability if they provide an exemplification of how they derive their interpretations and eventual findings from the data they collected. However, the separation of individual notions from the study can be a significant challenge to inexperienced researchers. Therefore, researchers can use bracketing to alleviate these challenges (Bengtsson, 2016). Implementation of the bracketing approach in this research facilitated identifying my personal views on the subject matter. Most importantly, I separated my opinion during the data analysis to avoid introducing personal bias to my study, and to generate confirmable results.

The researchers use confirmability to ascertain that the research process and its associated outcomes are not affected by their personal bias. Confirmability is not limited to the findings generated in a study but also extends to the researchers as well (Johnson & Rasulova, 2017). Bias in research is related to how a researcher's view can influence the research during various processes, data gathering, and review (Yin, 2018). The researcher remains in direct contact with the people participating in the study, the data, and the subject matter. Johnson and Rasulova (2017) indicated that the researcher's direct interaction with the various components of a study plays a critical role in qualitative studies. Due to this, these types of investigations are prone to high levels of bias, and the researchers involved need to take the steps necessary to avoid exerting their influence on interpretations and outcomes (Johnson & Rasulova, 2017). The researchers need to remain conscious of their behavior, prejudices, and opinions and how these concepts can play a determining role in the research findings (Johnson & Rasulova, 2017; Yin, 2018). I made sure that I was aware of my opinions on employee turnover when I collected,

analyzed, and interpreted the data. As a result, my preconceived notions was not influencing my overall interpretation of the research findings.

The researchers can determine confirmability by demonstrating a clear link between the findings and the participants' responses and explaining how they were able to use the information received from the interviewees to arrive at their conclusions (Yin, 2018). One of the ways the researchers exhibit confirmability is using respondent's quotes in the published version of the research (Bengtsson, 2016; Yin, 2018). And the researchers should not place these quotes randomly. Instead, they ought to offer support to themes and arguments made by the researcher (Yin, 2018). The researcher has higher chances of understanding the participants' realities when it becomes fully immersed in the individual's various experiences, which are a crucial feature of his or her reality (Bengtsson, 2016). I used epoché to reduce bias and increase the confirmability of my study. Van Manen (2017) defined epoché as a temporary prevention of coming to sensible conclusions (i.e., suspend judgement non-evident matters to have freedom from worry and anxiety. It means neither deny nor affirm until coming to sensible conclusions). Researchers have relied on the phenomenon of epoché-reduction to reduce bias during their investigations (Van Manen, 2017). Other researchers used epoché in the past to overcome researcher forms of biases (Bengtsson, 2016; Van Manen, 2017).

Data saturation. Data saturation is vital for all studies, particularly when the researcher wants to review the sample sizes to use in qualitative research. A researcher attained data saturation when he or she cannot retrieve additional information by conducting more data collection (Boddy, 2016). This concept is one of the identifying features of the quality and validity of the study. Reaching data saturation means there is

no new themes arising from data analysis (Marshall & Rossman, 2016). Until data saturation, I continued with re-interviewing the participants to gain more in-depth data than I have collected. Data saturation is related to conducting an exhaustive and in-depth investigation of the subject matter (Yin, 2018). Furthermore, it also calls for the application of multiple data collection methods (i.e., triangulation). A researcher who uses a single tool for data collection cannot collect enough data. Instead, a researcher should strive to practice data triangulation as a means of achieving saturation (Yin, 2018). According to Boddy (2016), the researcher's desire to achieve high levels of data saturation tends to influence his decision regarding the sample size. It is not likely that a researcher uses a single case study to achieve data saturation (Boddy, 2016). Therefore, the researcher needs to include more participants to have enough information to reach data saturation level (Boddy, 2016).

In the absence of data saturation, researchers may generate studies with significantly low quality (Yin, 2018). Furthermore, it also undermines the overall validity and reliability of research. The researchers reach data saturation to make sure they collected relevant data that make a significant contribution to theoretical knowledge (Yin, 2018). Furthermore, the researchers should use data saturation to influence research outcomes because data saturation is related to significant contributions to processes, such as data collection and analysis (Nascimento et al., 2018).

Data saturation enables other researchers to use the information provided in a study to replicate its findings. Essentially, future researchers will no longer need to collect and code the data and identify thematic relations. Open-ended questions are the most effective interview strategy, so the interviewers use pen-ended questions to allow

participants to provide an in-depth outlook on the subject matter (Nascimento et al., 2018). Additionally, data triangulation also generates similar results, so the researchers use it to merge information collected from a myriad of sources (Marshall & Rossman, 2016; Yin, 2018). In my study, I relied on exhaustive semistructured interviews, and data triangulation, which consisted of information from reports, interviews, member checking, and personal notes to ensure data saturation.

Transition and Summary

In Section 2, I presented the purpose statement, and the focus was on the responsibilities of the researcher. In addition, I identified the strategies that I used to identify the participants. Then, there were justifications for my selection of research methods and design. After that, there was a description of the population, sampling method, and applying ethical research standards in this study (e.g., protecting the privacy of participants involved in this research, maintaining the data confidentiality, and providing informed consent forms). Section 2 also includes data collection instruments and technique, data organization techniques, data analysis, and reliability and validity.

In Section 3, I will provide an illustration of my findings and their application to professional practice and implications for social change. After that, I will provide my recommendations for further research. Section 3 also will contain a reflection on my experience within the DBA doctoral study process and closes with the conclusion.

Section 3: Application to Professional Practice and Implications for Change

Introduction

The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to explore the strategies HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry use to reduce employee turnover. I obtained data from HR manager interviews and pharmaceutical company documentations at four pharmaceutical companies in the Northeast United States. I studied employee turnover through the lens of Burns's (1978) transformational leadership theory. I selected this theory because of the theory's four key constructs (inspirational motivation, intellectual stimulation, idealized influence, and individualized consideration) affect employee turnover. Findings were consistent with transformational leadership theory. According to Herman et al. (2013) and Waldman et al. (2012), using transformational leadership theory is critical in reducing employee turnover. There are many strategies that the HR manager participants used to reduce employee turnover. These strategies included: selecting the employees who fit into the company's culture, competitive compensation and benefits, appreciation of employees, and career growth and development.

Presentation of the Findings

My research question was the following: What strategies do HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry use to reduce employee turnover? I collected data from five HR managers who participated in my recorded semistructured interviews. These HR managers came from four pharmaceutical companies in the Northeast, United States. The HR manager participants responded to all my questions (five interview questions and many different probing questions for each participant) regarding strategies they used to reduce employee turnover. I transcribed the recordings and analyzed the data and then

sent a summary of the analyzed data to the participants for member checking. The participants validated my interview interpretation. I was able to have additional information from participants through member checking that I incorporated into my final results.

I used the triangulation method. I collected and combined the data from many sources including interviews, annual and semi-annual employee turnover reports, orientation, and training records, as well as publications that outline the organization's yearly labor costs. After completing the interview with the fifth participant, I realized that I had reached data saturation as there was no new information and no new themes emerging. For qualitative data analyses, I used NVivo 12 computer software program. I conducted a thematic analysis and followed Yin (2018) five steps for data analysis (data compilation, data disassembly, data reassembly, data interpretation, and conclusion). I followed thematic analysis to derive the themes. According to Yin, qualitative researchers should group various data components into different and identifiable broad themes. There were three broad themes that emerged from the collected data (see Table 1). In addition, while analyzing the data, I found some subthemes and I discussed these subthemes in the findings of the corresponding theme.

Table 1

Strategies Adopted for Reducing Employee Turnover

Strategy	Percentage of use by participants
Hiring and retention strategy	100%
Pay and benefits strategy	100%
Career growth strategy	100%

Theme 1: Hiring and Retention Strategy

Managers at organizations need to create a working environment in which there are minimal incentives for employees to switch jobs and the way to do this is through efficient hiring practices (Khalid & Nawab, 2018). P3 stated, "Although efficient hiring practices is challenging, eventually results in positive outcomes in terms of employee retention." P3 further mentioned that the main objective of employee retention practices and strategies should be to significantly lessen the costs associated with recruitment, training and new-employee orientation. This is important because "staff turnover threatens organizational performance and profitability as it is related to loss of human resources" (Dwesini, 2019, p.4). When employees switch jobs, the internal stakeholders at organization invariably suffers on account of reduction in consumer loyalty; higher organizational costs in terms of recruitment, administration and training expenses; loss of proficiency and know-how; and disruption in the daily workflows (Dwesini, 2019).

P1 stated, "Such circumstances clearly appear that HR managers at organizations must focus on better recruitment practices through which it introduces an efficient and robust onboarding process." Efforts toward reducing employee turnover must commence

with introducing a recruitment approach through which managers call candidates with matching qualifications, skills and experience for interviews. The HR managers should finalize selection of candidates by doing away with subjective practices so that selection depends on objectivity in keeping with best practices (Chen, Chuang, & Chen, 2017).

In effect, the overall recruitment process has an important bearing in lessening employee turnover (Salehudin, & Satrya, 2018). P1 and P4 mentioned that managers can make considerable difference by restructuring and rationalizing the recruitment process so that managers tapped better talent. The HR managers should finalize selection of candidates by doing away with subjective practices so that selection depends on objectivity in keeping with best practices (Chen, Chuang, & Chen, 2017). P5 mentioned that HR manager should supplement the recruitment process with new-employee orientation, which creates lesser inclinations for new employees to think of changing their jobs. P5 also mentioned that an excellent new-employee onboarding process help to create a positive image for the company as well as increase the employee retention. In Table 2, I displayed the three main subthemes that emerged from the hiring and retention strategy.

Table 2

Subthemes in Hiring Strategy

Subthemes in hiring strategy	Percentage of use by the company
Interview process	100%
Hiring process	100%
New-employee onboarding	100%

Interview process. Many participants mentioned that their interviews with candidates are based on some important features, such as the expectation of candidates, practices of employee orientation, capabilities of managers, and personality fit of candidates. P1 stated that interviewer skills were very important, and he supported his contention by highlighting the need for the interviewer to be well-trained. He explained this enables the interviewer to grasp pertinent information about the candidate, which in turn facilitates in hiring the most capable candidates.

All five participants were unanimous in stating that conducting multiple interviews with a given candidate was quite common. For example, P1 conducts three interviews, while P3 conducts two interviews with each candidate. P1 stated, "Conducting three interviews is critical and each interview has different purpose and setting." P1 mentioned that the first interview is by phone to conduct screening to make sure that the candidate has the minimum skills to do the job. The second interview also by phone, but to dive deep into discussing the candidate experience. And the third interview is on-site where P1 can see the candidate reflections while answering the questions. P3 mentioned, "Two interviews are enough, one by phone for screening, and the second is on-site to select the perfect fit." In the context of multiple interviews, all HR managers stated that managers from various departments (e.g., market access, health economics, and the marketing) interview candidates. When a hiring manager needs to conduct multiple interviews for a candidate, the interviewing managers exchanged their notes and observations about the candidate and then conveyed their final opinion to the hiring manager.

In keeping with the interview guidelines issued by the HR Department managers, the recommendations of the interviewing managers included varied aspects such as reasoning in respect to declined candidates: reasonably good with some shortcomings; advanced level with higher competency; and highly competent (recommended). One participant (P3) stated that it is crucial to ensure a cordial atmosphere in the entire recruitment process. P3 observed that it is very important to give indication to candidates about the areas in which they need to research and the extent of accuracy they should achieve in delivering marketing messages for different medicines. From another perspective, P4 insisted, "Asking leading questions to candidates so that they themselves came up with solutions to dilemmas such as what they would do if a research initiative to innovate a given drug failed despite hectic efforts of over 6 months." P4 believed that posing such questions to candidates would allow the selection committee to determine the capability of candidates in finding viable solutions to tricky situations in their working environment. In addition, asking some questions to candidates allow the committee to select the candidate who is the perfect fit for the position.

Khalid and Nawab (2018) indicated that employee behavior and attitude are important considerations while hiring employees. This allows them to make their own decisions on the job, instead of just complying with the employer's instructions. Consequently, P2 mentioned, "Behavioral interviews are very effective in knowing the reasoning and decision-making abilities of candidates." From this perspective, the findings of this study are in keeping with the research conclusions arrived at by Khalid and Nawab. In fact, focusing on behavioral strategies that seek to determine candidates' reasoning abilities allows the managers to hire candidates that will remain with the

company for long time. Devotta et al. (2016) asserted that encouraging interviewers to involve in qualitative inquiry proves to be fruitful and helps in getting candidates that meet the specific needs of the organization. This process may entail greater investments in terms of money and time for training and supporting such interviewers, but the result is beneficial for the organization. Devotta et al. (2016) also demonstrated through their research that with adequate and appropriate resources by way of financial investments and time, such interview strategies result in positive outcomes for participants as well as interviewers.

Hiring process. It became apparent when discussing the hiring process that all participants were using background and reference checks for validating the declarations that candidates made. P2 stated, "Adopting the use of a predictive index for ascertaining the personality traits and values of candidates." P2 mentioned that attitude of the candidate is very important. In addition, he also sought to ascertain if such characteristics were in keeping with the requirements for the given job. According to Fisher and Wilmoth (2018), business leaders must make use of predictive personality tests to know of candidates' cultural fit in respect of the given position in the organization. In this context, P4 indicated, "Organizational fit refers to the vibrant approach through which culture, environment, and leadership style and abilities aligned with the strategies and mission of the organization." Fisher and Wilmoth highlighted that leaders are morally bound to abstain from bringing any harm to the stakeholders at organization. P4 mentioned that there is no doubt that examining and interviewing candidates for responsible positions is quite a taxing exercise. The researchers contended that there is an association between finding the right candidate with the same complexity as finding a

specific needle in a pack of needles (Fisher & Wilmoth, 2018). Engagement of interviewers with such exhaustive assessment relative to fit serves very well in achieving the organization's hiring goals.

The participants (HR managers) in this study made use of predictive methods for evaluating the patience, extraversion, dominance and formality levels of candidates. The objective was to ascertain if they were good fits for the given positions. As Fisher and Wilmoth (2018) explained,

There are many ways of becoming entrenched within an organization and thus defining what is legitimized and acceptable. It is critical for the leader to assess if the candidate fits the culture of the organization. And this assessment should be before, during, and after the interview. (p. 82)

Fisher and Wilmoth further noted that, associating the strengths and capabilities of the candidate with the organization's culture and mission is an effective means to develop a fruitful partnership. In this regard, P2 explained, "Once they finalize on hiring a particular candidate, the associates at the HR department maintain regular contact with employees on monthly basis in order to observe their assimilation patterns and to guide them on different aspects when required." It thus emerged that the initial levels of adjustments of the new employee have a major bearing on employee retention. P4 mentioned that this is imperative in the context of new employees because their progress has to be observed in different management training programs. This practice is in keeping with the conclusions drawn by Jones and Bozer (2018) regarding coaching being instrumental in fostering personal growth of employees through opportunities, skills, and tools that employees needed for developing themselves and becoming more competent.

Jones and Bozer (2018) found that mentoring and coaching employees creates positive impact in terms of lessening employee turnover. P3 stated that his executive manager in the HR department conducted interview exercises with the objective of hiring the best candidates with maximum potential. Thereafter, the executive HR manager trained such employees to enable them to have a satisfying employment experience and to have their best contribution to the organization. P5 provided me information about the immense significance his internal stakeholders at the company attached in establishing strong expectations amongst candidates during the interview process itself. He mentioned that it is very important to inform candidates during the interview about the daily expectations from them. He gave the example of outlining expectations from employees during the interview itself, so that new employees become totally prepared for their responsibilities.

The knowledge economy of today is reliant on the values espoused by the HR department of any organization (Khalid & Nawab, 2018). In the ongoing competitive atmosphere, more and more organizations have begun to focus on their respective selection and hiring processes (Chen et al., 2017). However, a crucial aspect associated with the employee hiring process has not yet been exhaustively researched. Previous researchers did not focus on studying patterns of employee performance and the factors that attract people with the required talent and the factors that lead to employee retention (Rozario, Venkatraman, & Abbas, 2019). In this context, Rozario et al. (2019) studied the prevailing selection and hiring practices in order to determine the main factors relative to employee recruitment that have a strong bearing on decision-making in regard to diverse parameters of candidates. They found that it is necessary to develop more

commitment amongst interviewers toward the employee hiring process (Rozario et al., 2019).

New-employee onboarding. All the participants agreed that organizing an exhaustive candidate selection process was amongst the most effective strategies for reducing employee turnover. P5 stated, "Interns that had undergone internship training in different organizations in the pharmaceutical industry tended to be more aware about the positions for which they applied." He noted that if applicants were apprised in advance in respect of the position applied for by them, they tended to make better decisions about the given position. From another perspective, P4 stated, "It is very important to conduct the employee orientation in the right spirit; otherwise it may create negative consequences for employees while working in the pharmaceutical organization." He stated that new-employee onboarding programs, which are for a few days' duration, do prove to be a major constraint on the smooth functioning of the organization for some time.

The participants agreed that employees who stayed on for about two years tended to be less prone to switch jobs. In the context of these observations, the participants acknowledged the immense significance of assimilating employees within the organization's culture at the earliest. P2 emphasized the necessity of providing new employees with positive experiences during the hiring process. He held that employees tend to judge the organization on the basis of the efficacy of its hiring and onboarding programs. In fact, onboarding and assimilation programs are conducted in order to assist new employees in adjusting with the new working environment. Appropriate onboarding helps employees in getting over with the initial anxiety associated with the unknown and

with the new behaviors they encounter. Effective onboarding and assimilation programs help new employees in making the best of the tools that they required for success.

Benavides and Keyes (2016) asserted that the immense significance of some basic aspects of orientation and onboarding has been highlighted in the literature and has been helping new recruits in attaining social integration within the organization. However, the same has not been effectively applied in the organizational environment. They suggest that managers at organizations must be supportive of mentoring and socialization amongst new employees and should provide them with opportunities of socializing across the entire organization (Raj & Brindha, 2017). In fact, the researchers held in this regard that a major cost factor resulting from employee turnover was loss of human capital (Salehudin & Satrya, 2018). From this perspective, the participants mentioned that employee turnover imposed major challenges for the management team and the departmental heads in pharmaceutical companies. For this reason, the participants again emphasized the imperative need to lessen turnover. Needless to add, this becomes a major objective for the HR heads and managers.

According to Hejase et al (2016), the pharmaceutical industry is the main force behind medical and scientific progress in view of the consistent improvements in science and technology. Hejase et al. explained by saying that

Research in the pharmaceutical sector is consistently becoming progressive, and researchers involved the research methods in providing options for better medicines and the gainful use of big data. It is because of such developments in the pharmaceutical sector that 62% of the executives in the industry have altered their respective organizations' approaches toward decision making. (p. 59)

Hejase et al. further noted that, managers at organizations use new and better datasets to train their employees about the gains from analytical procedures.

As reported by the participants, the overall turnover rate of employees in the pharmaceutical industry is quite high. The participants were categorical in stating that the employee turnover rates in their respective companies were considerably lower than the national average. In Table 3, I displayed the employee turnover rate in the four companies represented by each of the participants. The participants stated that the turnover rate was a good means to determine the extent to which employees in their respective companies were satisfied with their jobs and were not very keen to switch to other companies. Nevertheless, the turnover rate is a good indicator of the pharmaceutical company's operational efficiency in terms of employee satisfaction. The participants also mentioned that the HR executives in their respective companies rely on this data in order to know of the extent to which their retention and onboarding strategies are successful. Upon analyzing the data of employee turnover in Table 3, it becomes apparent that all HR managers, from the four companies, are taking appropriate measures in ensuring that their new employees are cared for and remain contented, instead of thinking of switching to other pharmaceutical companies.

Table 3

Employee Turnover Rates by Pharmaceutical Companies

Participants	Rate of employee Turnover (%)
Pharmaceutical company 1	12
Pharmaceutical company 2	10
Pharmaceutical company 3	5
Pharmaceutical company 4	13

It is apparent from Table 3 that P3 (from Pharmaceutical Company 3) has a much lower employee turnover rate in comparison with other companies. The participants think this is because of the different employee retention policies and onboarding programs that the company organizes in recognizing the massive significance to retain employees. From the data in respect of turnover patterns obtained during the research, it became apparent that almost every HR department manager in the companies reported low turnover figures. Undoubtedly, such information proves to be crucial for the HR managers because it is reflective of a positive working environment. It was surprising to note that department managers in Pharmaceutical Company 3 reported almost no turnover, while others reported rates of 1-4% on a monthly basis. Such detailed bifurcation of turnover is indicative of departments that had lower turnover on a consistent basis. Managers in the HR department can use such data to ascertain the departments in which managers and supervisors who do not have the appropriate abilities to check prevailing patterns of employee turnover.

One of the participants (P4), whose company was having a turnover rate of 13% explained that a low turnover or attrition rate did not necessarily prove to be helpful in all situations. He argued, "A low rate of turnover may indicate that employees are not having high competency levels, which is why they are unable to avail of better employment opportunities in other pharmaceutical companies." However, this was a personal view of the participant, and is not supported with the empirical evidence that is available in the literature. According to Sun and Wang (2017), transformational leadership plays a major role in substantiating on the ways in which leaders influence their followers in demonstrating the desirable behaviors and attaining the required performance levels. The old leadership concept that focused on employee compliance, motivating followers to complete tasks; and the official relationship that must exist amongst followers and leaders, is not applicable in the current business environment (Sun & Wang, 2017). The researchers hold that a change in standards must be made in order to comprehend the ways in which followers are motivated by leaders in terms of increasing their grasp of organizational goals, and uplifting their moral values. In addition, researchers assert that this is the ideal example of transformational leadership.

Theme 2: Pay and Benefit Strategy

According to Siddiqui (2018), the managers at organizations recognized compensation as an extremely important tool because of its role in being a financial inducement that results in employee retention. In addition, according to Siddiqui (2018), it is a very useful means to reward employees behaving in the desired ways. Roy and Devi (2016) attempted to establish a link between compensation and managerial support in pharmaceutical companies. The researchers found there was a direct relationship

between employee satisfaction, retention, compensation and managerial support (Roy & Devi, 2016). In addition, they concluded that the main reason for high rate of turnover in pharmaceutical companies was deficiency in competitive rewards and compensation (Roy & Devi, 2016). The compensation system design has to be framed in keeping with the organizational strategy (Hong, 2017). In fact, it is very important for managers at pharmaceutical companies to understand the ways in which they can compensate employees in better ways in order to reduce turnover. The participants highlighted the immense significance of making use of a just compensation policy from the perspective of lessening employee turnover. As per responses of the participants, and as depicted in Table 4, the main elements of the compensation strategy are (a) salary and wages, (b) bonuses and incentives, (c) competitive packages, and (d) retirement plans.

Table 4

Subthemes of Pay and Benefit Strategy

Subthemes of pay and benefits strategy	Use by pharmaceutical companies (%)
Salary and wages	100%
Bonuses and incentives	100%
Competitive benefits packages	100%
Retirement plans	100%

Salary and wages. In conducting his research on the impacts of salary and compensations on employee performance, Calvin (2017) considered employee performance as the dependent variable and remuneration comprising of salary, bonus, and incentives as the independent variable. Calvin found a strong and positive link

amongst employee performance and remuneration, and concluded that salary, bonus, and incentives served as a major form of motivation for employees. Calvin also found that judicious use of compensation strategies serves very well in reducing employee turnover.

P2 narrated, "Fixing salaries based on prevailing industry levels was not considered to be appropriate by our company". P2 gave an illustrative example of how his high level management team at the company evaluate each employee from the perspective of his/her experience, demonstrated the capabilities and future potential, and then fixes the salary of the employee, which is subject to further appraisal every 6 months. In addition, P3 mentioned that he gave weightage to the cost of living index in the place of posting of the employee. For example, in a city like New York, he added additional weightage of 12% in comparison to an employee posted in a smaller place such as Baltimore. Other elements of an employee's salary are more related to the candidate's caliber, qualifications, experience and performance during the previous assessment period. Phungsoonthorn and Charoensukmongkol (2018) explained,

Workers who perceived their superiors as transformational leaders did not have much intentions of switching to other jobs. This relationship was primarily an outcome of the trust that employees had in the leader. In addition, the transformational leader commanded trust amongst the employees and because of this trait, the employees were less inclined to switch to other jobs. (p.66)

Phungsoonthorn and Charoensukmongkol further contended that, a major consideration for such attitudes was the moderation that occurred on account of salary levels and the number of years the employee served on the job. Phungsoonthorn and

Charoensukmongkol also demonstrated that transformational leadership was a major factor contributing to the reduced risk of employee attrition.

All the participants were of the view that employee turnover is much less if salaries are kept a little higher than the prevailing levels in the pharmaceutical industry. It was for this reason that the participants held that it is important for pharmaceutical companies to constantly monitor the salaries offered by their competitors. P1 and P5 indicated that employee turnover was a critical component of the organizational cost related with the organization's wage bill. P3 mentioned that it is very important to provide competitive salaries to employees, along with competitive benefits and good healthcare plans. He argued, "Such strategies go a long way in making employees feel that are being valued by the organization." Such sentiments are in keeping with the outcomes that spontaneously occur when employees are under the guidance of transformational leaders, who respect personal needs of employees and create the urge in them to make changes by way of improving their working styles.

As highlighted by Alzoraiki (2017), adopting transformational leadership helps in making long-term efforts toward imparting knowledge in coherent and systematic ways. P5 also made similar observations in asserting that employees perceive greater value when they have offer that include retirement plans. This goes a long way in increasing employee trust, as they start believing that the organizational actually cares for them. P3 also contended that salary is a crucial factor in motivating employees to consider that they are an integral part of the organization. Holston-Okae and Mushi (2018) asserted that employee satisfaction occurs when employees are "participating in job-related decisions, receiving work-related information, forming close friendships with others at

work, earning reasonable and fair compensation, and enjoying opportunities for promotion” (p.222). The employees of organizations that adopt policies of fair compensation are inherently more satisfied than people working in other organizations (Calvin, 2017).

One of the participants (P3) illustrated a novel approach toward affecting salary increase. He cited the example of a new practice that executives initiated in his organization in respect of salary fixation for the position of Research Assistant. Conventionally, the practice was to fix a new employee’s salary in keeping with the prevailing norms for new entrants. However, this was preventing recruitment of exceptionally capable researchers who get offers with higher salaries in other companies based on their excellent credentials. The managers at the company deviated from its established practice and instead offered these high caliber candidates to ask for their own salaries. According to P3, the managers at organization willingly complied, albeit with a condition that managers would review employee performance after a 6-month period, to which the employees readily agreed. P3 shared that this set the pace for recruitment of exceptional talent in the company’s research department. In effect, this example ideally demonstrates the results that emerge when transformational leaders take on the responsibility to introduce revolutionary changes that set the trend for better employee performance and better organizational outcomes.

P5 mentioned, "Employee satisfaction resulting from receiving well-deserved salary packages goes a long way in reducing employee turnover in the organization." P5 further noted that this creates a favorable psychological impact and serves as a basis for the managers at HR department to analyze the salary levels and determine if they are in

keeping with the actual caliber of employees. P1 indicated, "Evaluation standards must be established in ascertaining the potential of different employees so that they get their well-deserved benefits". Only then managers at firms can extract maximum productivity from their employees. From this perspective, P3 asserted that if he did not pursue with his management to introduce the new system, the managers at his organization would never have benefited from the unique opportunity through which they were able to recruit the best talents in the pharmaceutical industry.

Bonuses and incentives. Upon asking the participants about the extent to which their management team at their organization focused on bonuses and incentives in order to reduce employee turnover, P3 mentioned that the executive manager at his organization believes that it is crucial to have employees that are motivated as well as productive. Upon being asked how he motivates employees, P3 stated that he relies to a great extent on incentives that are performance based. In addition, he gives bonuses to employees that perform well. P3 indicated that he gives bonuses in the form of organizational incentives such as shares, and profit-associated pay. Ogbonnaya, Daniels, and Nielsen (2017) researched the association amongst contingent pay benefits, employee share ownership, profit-associated pay, performance-associated pay, and positive employee feelings in relation to trust in management, employee commitment and job satisfaction. Ogbonnaya et al. (2017) found that performance-associated created a direct and positive connection with all the three aspects of employee feelings mentioned above. In keeping with these findings, P3 said that in providing performance related incentives to employees, they invariably develop greater trust in the organization, and hence do not think of switching jobs.

In discussing about the pattern of employee turnover in his organization, P5 narrated that his organization has a turnover of only 5%, which is much lower than the other pharmaceutical companies represented by other participants in this research study. P5 also attributed the lower employee turnover to the positive working environment that he had been creating over the years by large number of long-serving employees, many having been with the organization for over 10 years. P5 believes that these employees are instrumental in motivating new employees by narrating their own positive experiences by way of incentives and regular pay raises. This encourages new employees to continue working in the hope that they too will benefit in the same ways. Sethunga and Perera (2018) found that with reduction in non-monetary rewards, employee turnover tends to increase. The researchers concluded that continuing with practices of giving non-monetary rewards tends to be successful in retaining employees.

The participants stated that the very nature of the pharmaceutical industry is strongly embedded in the field of research, and they hired most of the new employees in keeping with their involvement and achievement of positive outcomes in the area of research and development (R&D). Such employees are very young and are fresh after completing their doctorate or post graduate qualifications in science and technology. P2 observed that some young employees continued to have loan liabilities on account of loans taken to complete their education. He added that he has created a major initiative for the last 3 years in helping such employees to repay their loans. He said that such measures have had a positive impact on new employees and enhanced the urge in them to make a career in the company. Such strategies are novel and contribute in a large way to reduce employee turnover.

However, a major condition of the repayment policy in P2's organization was that if such employees left the organization within 3 years of joining, they had to repay the entire amount. P4 contributed about another novel strategy that he used in retaining new employees. This was the reimbursement of education fees paid by employees in respect of the programs they already enrolled in. Other than providing such employees the leverage to leave office an hour early to attend their classes, P3 mentioned that he reimbursed the fees employees paid for such courses. This was obviously done in the belief that attaining higher educational qualifications, particularly in R&D activities, would be beneficial for the organization in the long-term. It is important to note that such practices were discussed by the participants that the strategies are in keeping with existing research about employee turnover. Messersmith, Patel, and Crawford (2018) pointed out that employee benefits have important as well as differential impacts on the point of views of employees and their dedication toward the organization. Such strategies may add to costs, but they act as a strong stimulus in the development of human capital.

Competitive benefits packages. HR managers who provide competitive benefit packages to their employees create a kind of executive membership through which employees get further motivated in continuing with their jobs. Al Mamun and Hasan (2017) explained,

Scheduling such benefits is a crucial function of the HR department. Providing such benefits is crucial in attracting, motivating, and retaining employees that aspire to work toward achieving organizational goals. The best way of promoting and motivating employees would be a combination of pay, promotion, bonus, and other kinds of rewards to achieve organizational performance. (p.68)

Al Mamun & Hasan further mentioned that, proactive managers used the extra benefits other than salary and fixed monthly allowances as a means of motivating employees and facilitating them in enjoying their work.

PI indicated that such employees perceive a strong sense of job satisfactions and do not become inclined to think of other employment options. In getting benefits such as vacation allowance, life insurance, health insurance, scholarships, discounts on merchandize, and share-buying options, employees become less inclined to change their jobs (Al Mamun & Hasan, 2017). In this regard, P2 provided the information that fringe benefits play an important role in determining employee tenures in his organization. He stated that the overall benefits package provided by executive HR manager at his organization is highly competitive in the pharmaceutical industry, with very few companies offering similar packages.

It became apparent that all the participants evaluated turnover patterns for each department on a monthly basis. HR managers use the information obtained from employees during exit interviews in ascertaining the causes for employee turnover. In addition, the HR managers use this information in making the working environment better. P4 made an interesting point in stating that he adopts a system through which HR associates can contact former employees by email. HR managers can extract valuable information from former employees in regard to the areas in which HR managers can make improvements. Many HR managers in pharmaceutical companies regularly analyze the benefits packages of competing firms in the industry in order to remain competitive, particularly by offering better packages to their employees. P1 stated, “We maintain a cordial relationship with people with similar designations in other pharmaceutical

companies, and keep in touch to get information about new developments.” P1 explained that HR managers get additional information about the benefits packages offered by other HR managers at different organizations by discussing such matters with candidates who were previously employed at other pharmaceutical companies.

However, sometimes such information may not be authentic. This became apparent when a candidate being interviewed exaggerated the salary and benefits, he received with his previous employer. Doubting such information, the HR manager contacted his counterpart in the other pharmaceutical company and got general information (i.e., estimated range of salary and benefits) from him. P1 mentioned that in such cases, he outright rejected candidates as they cannot be relied upon, particularly regarding having aspirations of switching jobs quickly.

P5 believes that employees negatively viewed inappropriate benefits packages as major reasons for them to think of joining companies that provide better benefits other than salary. In this context, P4 was quick to react in saying that it was precisely for these reasons that he has always believed in providing better benefits packages than most other companies in the pharmaceutical industry. He asserted that this allows them to remain ahead in the competition and to attract and retain the best talent. P3 stated that his company has always focused on providing good personal benefits such as healthcare and insurance plans that are far more comprehensive than the benefits provided by other companies. P1 mentioned that he attaches immense significance in providing benefits other than salary to employees. He rewarded employees for outstanding performance with extra vacation days. This serves as a major motivator in encouraging staff to remain focused on achieving better outcomes for the organization.

Disclosures made by different participants that benefits packages work wonders in creating a working environment that is conducive to creating a positive spirit amongst employees to perform their best in achieving outstanding results. This in turn benefits the organization in terms of better productivity and attainment of comparative advantage. The benefits for internal stakeholders at pharmaceutical organizations in terms of lesser turnover patterns are clearly apparent, which is why they readily adopt practices of offering varied kinds of benefits to their employees.

Retirement plans. The participants agreed that in order to remain competitive in attracting and retaining the best talent, HR managers at pharmaceutical companies need to take well-reasoned decisions in regard to employee benefit decisions. Thinking from the perspective of the overall compensation package, indirect benefits such as retirement plans play a major role in dissuading employees from switching to other companies. P1 indicated that good retirement benefits by way of pension plans and other retirement facilities create a sense of security amongst employees in allowing them to work dedicatedly, without having any apprehensions about their old age. P4 mentioned that he makes specific and dedicated financial allocation to meet the needs of maintaining a good retirement benefits plan for all employees. In the last 10 years, many states in the United States have introduced legislation in requiring firms to give preference to introducing retirement benefits in comparison to other benefits (Gorina & Hoang, 2019). In effect, by tightening norms for retirement benefits, the government has created an environment in which firms have started making provisions for pension plans for employees that have served for a particular number of years (Gorina & Hoang, 2019). P3 mentioned that this often proves to be a deterrent for employees in his organization in the context of

switching jobs, because many amongst them tend to stay on in order to benefit from the retirement benefits that accrue after some years of service. P2 stated, "Pension was a motivating factor that helped in retaining talented employees." He was categorical in stating that many employees in his organization consider pension to be as significant as salary.

Omilani and Akintolu (2017) analyzed the efficacy of motivational strategies on employee retention. They found that by using financial strategies such as providing for pension fund schemes, HR managers at organizations succeed in creating an environment in which employees become more productive (Omilani & Akintolu, 2017). Such situations result mostly in higher levels of employee retention. Kuranchie-Mensah and Amponsah-Tawiah (2016) shared the same outcomes and found that even though young employees are eager to first strengthen their financial position, and to subsequently think of other things, eventually give preference to having a secure future. HR managers best met this need by providing adequate retirement benefits so that employees can prepare in advance for their retirement. Such benefits have a strong impact in dissuading employees from leaving their jobs, even if there are offers of higher salary. In this regard, Goldhaber, Grout, and Holden (2016) found that contrary to traditional belief, introduction of pension plans led to lesser employee turnover.

Theme 3: Career Growth Strategy

Individuals widely believed that working in a pharmaceutical company involves functions such as R&D, production, and marketing of healthcare drugs. Nevertheless, pharmaceutical companies are mostly involved in research activities. They offer massive opportunities for career growth in terms of being involved in science and technology;

providing a working environment with outstanding local and global personnel; and providing reasonably good salaries and job security. However, pharmaceutical companies are generally viewed as being traditional in terms of work and working environment (Alzoraiki, 2017). The pace of work in the industry is slower in comparison to many other industries, and research associates are often put to massive pressure despite work not moving at a fast pace (Ding, 2018). Individuals developed their skills in the industry only in specific areas because of the need to focus on the same specialist capabilities (Raj & Brindha, 2017). However, most pharmaceutical companies are massive in size, and thus internal stakeholders offer excellent career growth opportunities for people that effectively assimilate in the organizational environment (Ding, 2018).

It became apparent from the participants' interactions that they considered pharmaceutical companies to be conservative in their functioning. However, the participants provided an appropriate reasoning in explaining why such perceptions exist. The very nature of their activities is to be highly cautious in producing the right drugs with the right composition and results, failing which the product gets rejected. Working in such an environment may create apprehensions initially, but once an individual integrates into the environment, he or she can make an excellent career, without thinking of switching jobs.

According to Latten et al. (2018), relationships amongst professionals in pharmaceutical companies and healthcare organizations are the most crucial factor in determining the success of a pharmaceutical company. Consequently, the working environment in pharmaceutical companies mostly rests on the maintenance of such relationships. However, negative perceptions about working environments in the

pharmaceutical industry may be created in view of the traditional nature of the industry' functioning (Imam et al., 2018). Consequently, managers at pharmaceutical companies may face greater challenges in attracting and retaining talented employees.

The biggest opportunity for aspirants desiring to make a career in the pharmaceutical industry lies in terms of the massive potential in management functions relative to creating sustainable pharmaceutical supply chains. Equipped with learning on new technologies, innovations, and scientific developments, new entrants can make an excellent career in the industry (Ding, 2018). There is massive potential because of the evolving nature of the industry by way of creation of facilities leading to sustainable value creation and development of a smarter and more personalized and agile sector (Ding, 2018).

The participants indicated that career growth opportunities in the pharmaceutical sector are primarily impacted by factors that are accounted for by transformational leadership theory. Transformational leaders enhance the innovative work behaviors of their followers, primarily through work engagement, empowerment, and developing trust in the organization (Li et al, 2019). The prevalence of such circumstances empowers employees in becoming more productive. They perceive higher levels of job satisfaction and develop aspirations of making a good career in the organization. Four subthemes emerged from the career growth strategy, and these are depicted in Table 5.

Table 5

Subthemes in Career Growth Strategy

Subthemes in career growth strategy	Use by pharmaceutical companies (%)
Training of employees	100%
Employee development	100%
Leadership development	100%
Engagement of employees	100%

Training of employees. Even though managers at pharmaceutical companies employ competent and experienced people, HR managers in the sector are constantly involved in creating programs through which employees get training in order to have better skills, competencies, and knowledge in relation to their work portfolios. Halawi and Haydar (2018) contended that managers at companies do so in view of their belief that employees are their biggest resource. Singh (2019) held a similar view. Singh contends that even though human resources are the most productive and valuable assets for organizations, retaining them proves to be a major challenge. In this context, P3 mentioned that he faces some challenges in the implementation of training programs for new employees. This was because of perceptions held by some members of the management team that they require spending more, and that the ongoing expenses in this regard were not providing the required outcomes. Nevertheless, P2 and P4 did not agree with P3 and asserted that training programs were a sure means to improve the capabilities of new employees, particularly in facilitating them to integrate effectively and to

understand the working of the organization, while having new techniques and knowledge in their area of working.

In general, the participants were of the view that training was instrumental in reducing employee turnover. All the participants purported that the significance of training strategies and practices of their respective organizations are effective in helping employee development. In fact, such strategies enhanced employee confidence and trust in the organization, which in turn reduced their inclination to switch to other companies. Phungsoonthorn and Charoensukmongkol (2018) indicated that the predominant strategy for reducing employee turnover was to first provide for competitive salary and benefits packages and to then focus on developing employees in terms of their skills and capabilities so that they have better career growth opportunities.

The HR managers indicated that information obtained in respect of trainings attended by all employees show that training is imperative for employees as well as managers. The participants agreed that managers also need training in order to have the skills required for leading and guiding their subordinates. Vatankhah et al. (2017) indicated in this regard that there was an increase in leaders in the healthcare sector adopting transformational leadership styles. This has been leading to positive outcomes in respect to enhanced productivity (Vatankhah et al., 2017). With enhanced productivity employees will be rewarded suitably, which is why they will not think of leaving such lucrative jobs. Chen et al (2017) observed that new employees exposed to professional training developed abilities of contributing in much better ways to the organization.

Employee development. Participants highlighted their roles in the pharmaceutical industry in creating programs leading to employee development. The

main focus of such programs is on training on varied aspects of personality development and acquirement of knowledge that is related to performing the given organizational functions. P4 mentioned that training has the maximum impact on new employees in terms of personal development and acquiring capabilities to perform organizational functions better. For this reason, he asserted that the organization must focus on framing competitive training programs for new employees. In supporting his contention, P4 said, “My company considers employee development as a major need that is met mainly through training programs.” In similar perspective, P3 reported that he believes in creating a culture of employee development through training programs and exposure to practical situations through which employees gain knowledge as well as experience.

Saravo, Netze, and Kiesewetter (2017) highlighted the need for research analysts in pharmaceutical companies to come up with concrete outcomes from their R&D activities. In doing so, they need to have strong clinical leadership abilities. The researchers held that this is best accomplished by introducing training programs leading to personal development and adoption of transformational leadership styles (Saravo, Netze, & Kiesewetter, 2017). Transformational leaders create a protective effect on followers and a positive impact on teamwork (Saravo et al., 2017). The researchers recommend that managers at firms must include transformational leadership training in their employee development programs by building on the target behaviors related with transformational leadership abilities (Saravo et al., 2017). From this perspective, HR managers can also look into the welfare of their employees (Arnold, 2017).

Leadership development. Transformational leaders are known to reduce employee turnover through their initiatives in enhancing innovative behaviors amongst

employees (Li et al., 2019). It is through such activities that transformational leaders are able to increase their followers' creativity and innovative behaviors (Li et al., 2019). This invariably facilitates new employees to effectively integrate in the organizational environment, and to become active in the production processes (Li et al., 2019). All participants mentioned that they gaining their employees' trust by encouraging their employees and guiding them in performing their work more effectively, particularly by making work more interesting and creative.

Transformational leadership is amongst the most crucial in impacting employee creativity and the ability of employees to come up with new ideas (Chen, Ning, Yang, Feng, & Yang, 2018). Transformational leadership results in positive impacts on the outcomes of employees in the organizational environment (Chen et al., 2018). Even though negative and positive impacts of transformational leadership can occur at the same time, such situations create grounds for rationality in terms of checking performance levels of employees (Chen et al., 2018).

It becomes possible to ascertain the extent to which transformational leadership has been successful (Chen et al., 2018). Even if there is an inverse relationship between employee performance and transformational leadership, positive results occur because the inverse outcomes are moderated by the newly proactive personalities of employees (Chen et al., 2018). In effect, transformational leadership proves to be crucial in enhancing employees' creativity, and their ability to come up with new ideas. Cekmecelioglu and Ozbag (2016) concluded that understanding the link between creativity and transformational leadership allows leaders to develop employees' potential for creativity. Cekmecelioglu and Ozbag revealed there was a direct connection between individual

creativity and intellectual stimulation. It emerged that transformational leadership plays an important role by involving in inspirational motivation and creating high levels of idealized impact on employees' creativity (Cekmecelioglu & Ozbag, 2016). The participants in this study provided material on training programs conducted at their respective companies and the participants revealed that considerable focus was placed on training managers in conducting interviews with better outcomes. All participants indicated that providing training on leadership development is very beneficial for the overall development of employees and for the organization.

Engagement of employees. Jindal et al. (2017) attempted to determine the main factors that impact employee engagement. The researchers concluded from their research that managers at organizations having employees with higher levels of engagement experience, lesser levels of employee turnover, and higher levels of customer satisfaction and productivity. Therefore, high employee engagement directly contributes to enhanced profits for the organization (Jindal et al., 2017).

One of the pharmaceutical industry characteristics is the crucial need to have highly talented employees. P1 highlighted the responsibility of HR managers to ensure that employees remain well-engaged by providing employees with opportunities of sharing feedback with their supervisors and acknowledging workers' contribution on a regular basis. Al-Omar et al. (2019) revealed that the perceptions of researchers working in pharmaceutical companies in respect of "organizational support are related to their engagement in the workplace, demonstrating a significant relationship between perceived organizational support and employee engagement" (p.1044). P2 indicated that managers at pharmaceutical companies must encourage their employees to demonstrate

empowering leadership behaviors through transformational leadership styles that leads to psychological empowerment, which in turn enhances employee engagement. P5 gave an example of a situation in his organization whereby the executive leadership team decided to fire a manager because his department constantly characterized with high rate of employee turnover. The high attrition rate was consistently occurring because the manager did not value employees and was using obsolete management practices in dealing with them. P5 made it a point to replace that manager with another who was a transformational leader and had excellent people management skills. This measure helped in reducing employee turnover in the department.

Alignment of the Findings with the Transformational Leadership Theory

Many believe that some level of employee turnover does result in enhanced creativity (Sun & Wang, 2017). However, there is strong evidence to suggest that higher rate of turnover harms organizational performance, because it disturbs delivery of service and increases costs for the company in respect of conducting recruitment exercises (Salehudin & Satrya, 2018). In pharmaceutical companies, such costs are high in view of the difficulties in finding qualified research personnel (Salehudin & Satrya, 2018). In view of such circumstances, it is imperative for managers at pharmaceutical companies to improve their recruitment systems in acquiring a sustainable workforce that contributes massively in increasing productivity and meeting organizational goals (Rozario et al., 2019).

Most theories of leadership focus on the significance of employees' personal traits and on motivating them to perform better. However, researchers on the topic clearly indicated that transformational leadership is instrumental in preventing employees from

developing the inclination to leave (Vatankhah et al., 2017). In addition, transformational leaders create a positive and collaborative working environment that employees get adapted with; after which they do not think of leaving (Sun & Wang, 2017). Based on the findings of this study, all participants recognized the significance of transformational leadership theory in attaining better outcomes in their respective organizations, relative to reducing employee turnover. The participants also indicated that employee motivation increased with enhanced focus on transformational leadership. The participants also mentioned that during their initial period in the organization, employees perceived better opportunities of growth and development. HR managers in this study added that increase in workplace motivation is a direct outcome of new employees exposed to transformational leadership.

Applications to Professional Practice

HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry can make use of the findings of this research in developing appropriate strategies in order to reduce employee turnover and provide better returns to stakeholders. One of the pharmaceutical industry characteristics is the rapid pace of innovations and changes that are taking place in respect of product offerings because of technological advancements (Schuhmacher, Gassmann, & Hinder, 2016). Consequently, it is not surprising that employee turnover in the industry is quite high. In addition, according to Sun and Wang (2017), technological advancements entail more opportunities for existing employees to change jobs in order to get better salary and incentives. Schuhmacher et al. (2016) asserted that “new drugs serving unmet medical needs are one of the key value drivers of research-based pharmaceutical companies”

(p.1). HR managers may effectively reduce high employee turnover in pharmaceutical companies by applying some strategies mentioned in this study.

From this research finding, HR managers at pharmaceutical industry may get the clear message that they must adopt better recruitment and retention strategies. Bai and Bhutto (2016) opined that “effectiveness of human resources practices in dealing with employee retention can be enhanced by improving the compatibility between employee and organizational values” (p.677). Linking the employee compatibility with organizational values should become a top goal for the management team of these pharmaceutical companies. In addition, HR managers can use the findings of this study in framing effective compensation strategies and benefits packages in order to attract better talents. Having experienced talented employees will certainly help in meeting the constantly increasing competition in the pharmaceutical sector, and in reducing turnover (Jindal et al., 2017). The researchers stated that organizational leaders must recognize employee needs in order to prevent them from switching jobs (Al Mamun & Hasan, 2017). The pay structure in pharmaceutical companies should be indicative of organizational values that directly appeal to employees in influencing them to make a career in the organization (Al Mamun & Hasan, 2017).

The HR managers at pharmaceutical companies can use the research findings to establish a development strategy for employees in order to initiate programs on employee engagement and employee development. In introducing these measures, HR managers at organizations will be able to become more assertive with their employees in terms of challenging them and motivating them to perform better. Most of the time, if managers are transformational leaders who led employees, these managers will achieve such

desired outcomes (Vatankhah et al., 2017). The researchers had categorically stated that employee turnover in the pharmaceutical companies can be overcome only by adopting a retention strategy through which leaders create better incentives for existing employees (Hejase et al., 2016). In addition, employee engagement by way of appreciating employees' work help in making employees to develop greater trust in the organization. Based on the study's findings, there is a need for the management team in pharmaceutical companies to practice transformational leadership through which adopting appreciative styles in dealing with and motivating employees to perform their best are initiated.

Implications for Social Change

From this study, individuals may recognize the fact that long-serving employees in pharmaceutical companies can benefit in getting a consistent flow of income. This in turn allows employees to improve their work-life balance, particularly because they can devote more time to family and community. Bufquin, DiePietro, Orłowski, and Partlow (2017) explained that the organizational leaders must be more involved in demonstrating greater warmth toward employees from diverse socioeconomic backgrounds. Certain groups of employees are in need of greater professional and social support from the management team at the company. In reducing employee turnover, HR managers at pharmaceutical companies keep employees actively engaged and thus fulfill their social responsibilities. According to Kunze and Suppa (2018), unemployment causes considerable financial hardships to people and also deprives them of psychological, social, and non-pecuniary advantages associated with employment. As highlighted by Kunze and Suppa, the unemployed are unable to participate in a number of social

activities like attending concerts and cultural events and engaging with neighbors and friends.

HR managers in pharmaceutical companies that hire people from adjacent societies play an important role in reducing unemployment that results in enhanced social activities, higher levels of income, and higher standards of living in such societies. One of the participants (P2) highlighted the benefits of such practices. For example, his company is involved in making specialized drugs for terminally ill patients and began providing free genetic testing for terminally ill patients in surrounding communities. This activity to serve the community greatly enhanced the image of the company and it received a lot of positive comments in the media for doing so. Managers at pharmaceutical companies also involve in other social activities to improve the economic wellbeing of people in poor communities. P1 indicated that the executive leadership team at his company encourages their employees to recommend adoption of communities for which it assumes responsibility to take care of its medicine requirements.

Recommendations for Action

HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry will find this study very useful in developing action plans for reducing employee turnover. It is recommended that pharmaceutical companies adopt sound practices relative to selection of talented employees who are characterized with outgoing personalities and leadership qualities. It is very important for these companies to be actively involved in maintaining rapport with employees; and to expand on the training programs offered by them. In effect, employee turnover can be reduced only if companies consistently implement management policies and procedures focused on keeping employees positively engaged.

The organization must become more active in introducing measures directed at employee empowerment and involvement, and this should be complemented with participative transformational leadership. By ensuring good and positive alignment with employees, and by establishing positive rapport with them, pharmaceutical companies can effectively reduce employee turnover and attain better retention outcomes. Nevertheless, employee retention can be achieved on a consistent basis only if there is commitment on the part of the leadership and senior management (Kodikal & Rahiman, 2016). In fact, retention in contemporary times is achieved only if the management adapts with the reasonable needs of workers. In addition, HR managers can achieve better organizational outcomes only if they ensure the active involvement of each employee. Moreover, pharmaceutical companies can move a step ahead in employee retention if they make changes in their incentive programs and start offering non-salary benefits such as bonuses, paid holidays, better healthcare and insurance plans, study loan repayments, and tuition reimbursement. I also recommend that HR managers in the pharmaceutical sector should provide for constant training and development of all staff members, including managers and supervisors. This will allow managers to become well-versed with the latest management techniques in respect of professional development, personal development, and engagement of employees.

Recommendations for Further Research

The research was conducted in relying on the data and information provided by five HR managers from four pharmaceutical companies in the Northeast United States. However, because the participants were from a specific region of the United States, the research outcomes may not be reflective of the opinions held by HR managers in all

pharmaceutical companies in the United States. Consequently, future research should focus on considering a much wider respondent base by incorporating the practices of pharmaceutical companies across the entire country. Future research should also focus on key performance indicators in respect of the efficacy of training programs in pharmaceutical companies. This is important because training plays a crucial role in enhancing employee knowledge and confidence in respect of performing tasks in an environment characterized with fast-pace technological advancements. Training equips employees in becoming conversant with the rapid pace of innovations in virtually all fields of activities in which pharmaceutical companies are involved. Moreover, future research should also focus on investigating employee turnover in different cultures in order to know about how culture impacts employee turnover.

Reflections

Even though I found the entire research process quite challenging, I gained major insights from the exercise, particularly in regard to understanding the complexities associated with ensuring employee retention in the pharmaceutical industry. I realize that this research has proven to be an excellent opportunity for me to widen my knowledge base in regard to the factors that are responsible for high employee turnover and the measures that can be taken in retaining employees on a consistent basis. In keeping with the research objectives and timeline, I was able to adapt myself with it and completed it within the given time frame. The research did challenge me in meeting tight deadlines, but I maintained consistency in fulfilling my objective of completing my doctoral degree within the given time. Having studied the employee turnover patterns in pharmaceutical companies, I understand that the industry is highly regulated, which is why jobs have

become more complex and stressful. The pharmaceutical industry has lower turnover in comparison to other industries, but the cost associated with it is very high. It is possible for pharmaceutical companies to achieve better levels of employee retention, but the management in these companies has to provide employees with more incentives and development programs

Conclusion

In keeping with the findings of the research, I conclude that HR managers in the pharmaceutical industry must make use of appropriate retention strategies that focus on improving recruitment procedures; improving compensation strategies; and implementing better employee development strategies. The conceptual framework for this study was transformational leadership theory. The objective of this multiple study was to examine the strategies that HR managers in pharmaceutical companies use in reducing employee turnover. The study led to the conclusion that employee turnover is best dealt with by adopting appropriate strategies of employee retention, recruitment, just compensation and benefits packages, and introduction of proactive training and development programs for employees. The findings of this research have important implications for HR managers and senior management in the pharmaceutical industry. The research highlighted the role of transformational leadership in exerting influence of followers and demonstrating the desirable behaviors that are needed to achieve required performance levels.

References

- Adams, J. S. (1963). Toward an understanding of inequity. *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology, 67*, 422–436. doi:10.1037/h0040968
- Al Mamun, C. A., & Hasan, M. N. (2017). Factors affecting employee turnover and sound retention strategies in business organization: A conceptual view. *Problems and Perspectives in Management, 15*(1), 63–71.
doi:10.21511/ppm.15(1).2017.06
- Alam, S. M. T. (2015). Factors affecting job satisfaction, motivation and turnover rate of medical promotion officer (MPO) in pharmaceutical industry: A study based in Khulna city. *Asian Business Review, 1*, 126–131. Retrieved from <https://jabr.weebly.com>
- Alderfer, M. A., & Sood, E. (2016). Using qualitative research methods to improve clinical care in pediatric psychology. *Clinical Practice in Pediatric Psychology, 4*, 358–361. doi:10.1037/cpp0000164
- Alkahtani, A. H. (2015). Investigating factors that influence employees' turnover intention: A review of existing empirical works. *International Journal of Business and Management, 10*(12), 152–166. doi:10.5539/ijbm.v10n12p152
- Al-Madi, F. N., Assal, H., Shrafat, F., & Zeglat, D. (2017). The impact of employee motivation on organizational commitment. *European Journal of Business Management, 9*(15), 134–145. Retrieved from <http://ejobm.com>
- Almalki, S. (2016). Integrating quantitative and qualitative data in mixed methods research challenges and benefits. *Journal of Education and Learning, 5*, 288–296. doi:10.5539/jel.v5n3p288

- Al-Omar, H. A., Arafah, A. M., Barakat, J. M., Almutairi, R. D., Khurshid, F., & Alsultan, M. S. (2019). The impact of perceived organizational support and resilience on pharmacists' engagement in their stressful and competitive workplaces in Saudi Arabia. *Saudi Pharmaceutical Journal*, *27*, 1044–1052. doi:10.1016/j.jsps.2019.08.007
- Alshabri, N., Khalfan, M., & Maqsood, T. (2016). Retention of knowledge within the private sector organizations in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. *Middle East Journal of Business*, *11*(3), 18–31. doi:10.5742/mejb.2016.92834
- Alzoraiki, M. (2017). A review of transformational leadership and environmental work quality. *International Education and Research Journal*, *3*(7), 26–29. Retrieved from <http://ierj.in>
- Ames, H., Glenton, C., & Lewin, S. (2019). Purposive sampling in a qualitative evidence synthesis: A worked example from a synthesis on parental perceptions of vaccination communication. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, *19*(1), 26–35. doi:10.1186/s12874-019-0665-4
- Anthony, P. J., & Weide, J. (2015). Motivation and career-development training programs: Use of regulatory focus to determine program effectiveness. *Higher Learning Research Communications*, *5*(2), 24–33. doi:10.18870/hlrc.v5i2.214
- Appelbaum, M., Cooper, H., Kline, R. B., Mayo-Wilson, E., Nezu, A. M., & Rao, S. M. (2018). Journal article reporting standards for quantitative research in psychology: The APA Publications and Communications Board task force report. *American Psychologist*, *73*, 3–25. doi:10.1037/amp0000191

- Archibald, M. M. (2016). Investigator triangulation: A collaborative strategy with potential for mixed methods research. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research, 10*, 1–23. doi:10.1177/1558689815570092
- Ardic, K., Uslu, O., Oymak, O., Ozsoy, E., & Ozsoy, T. (2016). Comparing person organization fit and person job fit. *Journal of Economics and Management, 25*(3), 5–13. doi:10.22367/jem.2016.25.01
- Arnold, K. A. (2017). Transformational leadership and employee psychological well-being: A review and directions for future research. *Journal of Occupational Health Psychology, 22*, 381–393. doi:10.1037/ocp0000062
- Asfaw, A. M., Argaw, M. D., & Bayissa, L. (2015). The impact of training and development on employee performance and effectiveness: A case study of District Five Administration Office, Bole Sub-City, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. *Journal of Human Resource and Sustainability Studies, 3*, 188–202. doi:10.4236/jhrss.2015.34025
- Azaliwa, E. A., & Casmir, A. (2016). A comparative study of teachers' motivation on work performance in selected public and private secondary schools in Kilimanjaro region, Tanzania. *International Journal of Education and Research, 4*(6), 583–600. Retrieved from <https://www.ijern.com>
- Bai, S., & Bhutto, M. (2016). HRM practices in improving employee retention in Pakistan, where employee value as a focal point. *Journal of Economics, Business and Management, 4*, 677–683. doi:10.18178/joebm.2016.4.12.472

- Baker, L., Phelan, S., Snelgrove, R., Varpio, L., Maggi, J., & Ng, S. (2016). Recognizing and responding to ethically important moments in qualitative research. *Journal of Graduate Medical Education, 8*, 607–608. doi:10.4300/JGME-D-16-00384.1
- Baskerville, R. L., & Myers, M. D. (2015). Design ethnography in information systems. *Information Systems Journal, 25*, 23–46. doi:10.1111/isj.12055
- Bass, B. M. (1985). *Leadership and performance beyond expectation*. New York, NY: Free Press.
- Batcha, H. M., Jan, N. A., Subramani, A. K., & Julie, R. L. (2017). Exploring the impact of organization culture on employees' work performance using structural equation modeling (SEM) approach. *International Journal of Applied Business and Economics Research, 15*(16), 483–493. Retrieved from <http://serialsjournals.com>
- Belmont Report. (1979). *The Belmont Report: Ethical principles and guidelines for the protection of human subjects of research*. Retrieved from <http://www.hhs.gov/ohrp/humansubjects/guidance/belmont.html>
- Benavides, A. D., & Keyes, L. (2016). New-student orientations: Supporting success and socialization in graduate programs. *Journal of Public Affairs Education, 22*(1), 107–124. doi:10.1080/15236803.2016.12002231
- Bengtsson, M. (2016). How to plan and perform a qualitative study using content analysis. *NursingPlus Open, 2*, 8–14. doi:10.1016/j.npls.2016.01.001
- Berendt, C. J., Christofi, A., Kasibhatla, K. M., Malindretos, J., & Maruffi, B. (2012). Transformational leadership: Lessons in management for today. *International Business Research, 5*(10), 227–232. doi:10.5539/ibr.v5n10p227

- Birt, L. L., Scott, S., Cavers, D., Campbell, C., & Walter, F. (2016). Member checking. *Qualitative Health Research, 26*, 1802–1811. doi:10.1177/1049732316654870
- Boddy, C. R. (2016). Sample size for qualitative research. *Qualitative Market Research: An International Journal, 19*, 426–432. doi:10.1108/QMR-06-2016-0053
- Brent, M., & Perez, A. (2015). Career development at GM: Accelerating careers through core values and conversations. *Career Planning and Adult Development Journal, 31*(3), 9–15. Retrieved from <https://www.careernetwork.org>
- Brenyah, R. S., & Obuobisa-Darko, T. (2017). Organisational culture and employee engagement within the Ghanaian public sector. *Review of Public Administration and Management, 5*(3), 1–7. doi:10.4172/2315-7844.1000233
- Brewer, C. S., Kovner C. T., Djukic M., Fatehi F., Greene W., Chacko T. P., & Yang Y. (2016) Impact of transformational leadership on nurse work outcomes. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 72*, 2879–2893. doi:10.1111/jan.13055
- Britton, S., Pieterse, T., & Lawrence, H. (2017). The lived experiences of radiographers in Gauteng. *South African Radiographer, 55*(1), 28–32. Retrieved from <http://www.sar.org.za>
- Brown, P. (2017). Narrative: An ontology, epistemology and methodology for pro-environmental psychology research. *Energy Research & Social Science, 31*, 215–222. doi:10.1016/j.erss.2017.06.006
- Bufquin, D., DiPietro, R., Orlowski, M., & Partlow, C. (2017). The influence of restaurant co-workers' perceived warmth and competence on employees' turnover intentions: The mediating role of job attitudes. *International Journal of Hospitality Management, 60*, 13–22. doi:10.1016/j.ijhm.2016.09.008

Bureau of Labor Statistics. (2017, November). *Job openings and labor turnover*.

Retrieved from <http://www.bls.gov>

Burns, J. M. (1978). *Leadership*. New York, NY: Harper and Row.

Buttner, E. H., & Lowe, K. B. (2017). The relationship between perceived pay equity, productivity, and organizational commitment for US professionals of color.

Equality, Diversity and Inclusion: An International Journal, 36, 73–89.

doi:10.1108/EDI-02-2016-0016

Caleb, D. (2015). Internal succession planning: The research and practice of growing and developing retail pharmacy talent from inside the corporation. *Career Planning and Adult Development Journal*, 31(4), 46–51. Retrieved from

<https://www.careernetwork.org>

Calvin, O. Y. (2017). The impact of remuneration on employees' performance: A study of Abdul gusau polytechnic, Talata-Mafara and State College of Education Maru,

Zamfara State. *Nigerian Chapter of Arabian Journal of Business and*

Management Review, 4(2), 34–43. doi:10.12816/0037554

Camacho, G. (2015). A skill-gap development model within the healthcare arena: A

comprehensive approach to professional development. *Career Planning and Adult Development Journal*, 31(4), 20–29. Retrieved from

<https://www.careernetwork.org>

Castillo-Montoya, M. (2016). Preparing for interview research: The interview protocol refinement framework. *The Qualitative Report*, 21, 811–830. Retrieved from

<https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr>

- Castleberry, A., & Nolen, A. (2018). Thematic analysis of qualitative research data: Is it as easy as it sounds? *Currents in Pharmacy Teaching and Learning*, *10*, 807–815. doi:10.1016/j.cptl.2018.03.019
- Cavazotte, F., Moreno, V., & Hickmann, M. (2012). Effects of leader intelligence, personality and emotional intelligence on transformational leadership and managerial performance. *The Leadership Quarterly*, *23*, 443–455. doi:10.1016/j.leaqua.2011.10.003
- Çekmecelioglu, H. G., & Özbağ, G. K. (2016). Leadership and creativity: The impact of transformational leadership on individual creativity. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *235*, 243–249. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.11.020
- Cekmecelioglu, H. G., Ilhan, O. O., & Gunsel, A. (2017). Transformational leadership and individual creativity: The mediating role of intrinsic motivation. *Journal of Business, Economics and Finance*, *6*, 224–232. doi:10.17261/Pressacademia.2017.682
- Chai, D. S., Hwang, S. J., & Joo, B. K. (2017). Transformational leadership and organizational commitment in teams: the mediating roles of shared vision and team-goal commitment. *Performance Improvement Quarterly*, *30*, 137–158. doi:10.1002/piq.21244
- Chen, S. Y., Chuang, C. H., & Chen, S. J. (2017). A conceptual review of human resource management research and practice in Taiwan with comparison to select economies in East Asia. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, *35*, 213–239. doi:10.1007/s10490-017-9516-1

- Chen, Y., Ning, R., Yang, T., Feng, S., & Yang, C. (2018). Is transformational leadership always good for employee task performance? Examining curvilinear and moderated relationships. *Frontiers of Business Research in China*, *12*(1), 1–28. doi:10.1186/s11782-018-0044-8
- Clancy, A., & Vince, R. (2019). Theory as fantasy: Emotional dimensions to grounded theory. *British Journal of Management*, *30*, 203–216. doi:10.1111/1467-8551.12304
- Cole, M. S., Bruch, H., & Shamir, B. (2009). Social distance as a moderator of the effects of transformational leadership: Both neutralizer and enhancer. *Human Relations*, *62*, 1697–1733. doi:10.1177/0018726709346377
- Combs, K. M. (2017). *Strategies for retaining employees for call centers* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses database. (UMI No. 1868839781)
- Connelly, L. M. (2016). Understanding research. Trustworthiness in qualitative research. *MEDSURG Nursing*, *25*, 435–436. Retrieved from <http://www.medsurnursing.net>
- Connelly, L. M., & Peltzer, J. N. (2016). Underdeveloped themes in qualitative research: Relationship with interviews and analysis. *Clinical Nurse Specialist CNS*, *30*, 52–57. doi:10.1097/NUR.0000000000000173
- Constantin, A. (2018). Human subject research: International and regional human rights standards. *Health and Human Rights*, *20*(2), 137–148. Retrieved from <https://www.hhrjournal.org>

- Constantinou, C. S., Georgiou, M., & Perdikogianni, M. (2017). A comparative method for themes saturation (CoMeTS) in qualitative interviews. *Qualitative Research, 17*, 571–588. doi:10.1177/1468794116686650
- Daher, M., Olivares, H., Carré, D., Jaramillo, A., & Tomicic, A. (2017). Experience and meaning in qualitative research: A conceptual review and a methodological device proposal. *In Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research, 18*(3), 24–48. doi:10.17169/fqs-18.3.2696
- Dankar, F. K., Gergely, M., & Dankar, S. (2019). Informed consent in biomedical research. *Computational and Structural Biotechnology Journal, 17*, 463–474. doi:10.1016/j.csbj.2019.03.010
- Dawson, E., Hartwig, M., Brimbal, L., & Denisenkov, P. (2017). A room with a view: Setting influences information disclosure in investigative interviews. *Law and Human Behavior, 41*, 333–343. doi:10.1037/lhb0000244
- De Simone, S. (2016). Expectancy value theory: Motivating healthcare workers. *American International Journal of Contemporary Research, 5*(2), 19–23. Retrieved from <http://ajjcrnet.com>
- Devotta, K., Woodhall-Melnik, J., Pedersen, C., Wendaferew, A., Dowbor, T. P., Guilcher, S. J., . . . & Matheson, F. I. (2016). Enriching qualitative research by engaging peer interviewers: A case study. *Qualitative Research, 16*, 661–680. doi:10.1177/1468794115626244
- Ding, B. (2018). Pharma industry 4.0: Literature review and research opportunities in sustainable pharmaceutical supply chains. *Process Safety and Environmental Protection, 119*, 115–130. doi:10.1016/j.psep.2018.06.031

- Drago, P. (2015). The ghost of Herzberg motivational theory: Motivators and demotivators. *Vallis Aurea: International Journal*, *1*, 15–25.
doi:10.2507.IJVA.1.1.2.2
- Duan, N., Bhaumik, D. K., Palinkas, L. A., & Hoagwood, K. (2015). Optimal design and purposeful sampling: Complementary methodologies for implementation research. *Administration and Policy in Mental Health*, *42*, 524–532.
doi:10.1007/s10488-014-0596-
- Dwesini, N. F. (2019). Causes and prevention of high employee turnover within the hospitality industry: A literature review. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, *8*(3), 1–15. Retrieved from <https://www.ajhtl.com/>
- Eberly, M. B., Bluhm, D. J., Guarana, C., Avolio, B. J., & Hannah, S. T. (2017). Staying after the storm: How transformational leadership relates to follower turnover intentions in extreme contexts. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, *102*, 72–85.
doi:10.1016/j.jvb.2017.07.004
- Ehsan, H. (2018). Impact of performance appraisal, work design and compensation on employee performance: A study of telecom sector. *Journal of Global Economics*, *6*(3), 1–9. doi:10.4172/2375-4389.1000301
- Ellinas, C., Allan, N., & Johansson, A. (2017). Dynamics of organizational culture: Individual beliefs vs. social conformity. *Plos One*, *12*(6), 1–20.
doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0180193
- Erthal, A., & Marques, L. (2018). National culture and organizational culture in lean organizations: A systematic review. *Production Planning & Control*, *29*, 668–687. doi:10.1080/09537287.2018.1455233

- Etikan, I., Abubakar, M. S., Sunus, I., & Alkassim, S. (2016). Comparison of convenience sampling and purposive sampling. *American Journal of Theoretical and Applied Statistics*, 5(1), 1–4. doi:10.11648/j.ajtas.20160501.11
- Eyisi, D. (2016). The usefulness of qualitative and quantitative approaches and methods in researching problem-solving ability in science education curriculum. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7, 91–100. Retrieved from <https://www.iiste.org/Journals/index.php/JEP>
- Farroqui, S., & Nagendra, A. (2016). The impact of person organization fit on job satisfaction and performance of the employees. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 11, 122–129. doi:10.1016/S2212-5671(14)00182-8
- Ferraro, G., & Andreatta, S. (2017). *Cultural anthropology: An applied perspective*. Boston, MA: Cengage Learning.
- Fisher, E. M., & Wilmoth, M. C. (2018). Do I take the job? Assessing fit with the organization. *Journal of Professional Nursing*, 34, 82–86. doi:10.1016/j.profnurs.2017.08.003
- Frian, A., & Mulyani, F. (2018). Millennials employee turnover intention in Indonesia. *Innovative Issue and Approaches in Social Sciences*, 11(3), 90–111. doi:10.12959/issn.1855-0541.IIASS-2018-no3-art5
- Gittings, R., & Schmutte, I. (2015). Getting handcuffs on an Octopus: Minimum wages, employment, and turnover. *ILR Review*, 69, 1133–1170. doi:10.1177/0019793915623519
- Glasper, A., & Rees, C. (Eds.). (2016). Triangulation of data. *Nursing and Healthcare Research at a Glance* (pp.70–72). Chichester, West Sussex: John Wiley & Sons.

- Goldhaber, D., Grout, C., & Holden, K. L. (2017). Pension structure and employee turnover: Evidence from a large public pension system. *ILR Review*, *70*, 976–1007. doi:10.1177/0019793916678424
- Goodman-Delahunty, J., & Howes, L. M. (2016). Social persuasion to develop rapport in high stakes interviews: Qualitative analyses of Asian-Pacific practices. *Policing & Society*, *26*, 270–290. doi:10.1080/10439463.2014.942848
- Gorina, E., & Hoang, T. (2020). Pension reforms and public sector turnover. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, *30*, 96–112. doi:10.1093/jopart/muz009
- Grant, A. M. (2012). Leading with meaning: Beneficiary contact, prosocial impact, and the performance effects of transformational leadership. *Academy of Management Journal*, *55*, 458–476. doi:10.5465/amj.2010.0588
- Gupta, P. D., Bhattacharya, S., Sheorey, P., & Coelho, P. (2018). Relationship between onboarding experience and turnover intention: Intervening role of locus of control and self-efficacy. *Industrial and Commercial Training*, *50*, 61–80. doi:10.1108/ICT-03-2017-0023
- Halawi, A., & Haydar, N. (2018). Effects of training on employee performance: A case study of Bonjus and Khatib & Alami Companies. *International Humanities studies*, *5*(2), 22–45. Retrieved from <https://www.ihs-humanities.com/>
- Hamilton, E., Discua Cruz, A., & Jack, S. (2017). Re-framing the status of narrative in family business research: Toward an understanding of families in business. *Journal of Family Business Strategy*, *8*(1), 3–12. doi:10.1016/j.jfbs.2016.11.001

- Han, S. H., Seo, G., Yoon, S. W., & Yoon, D. Y. (2016). Transformational leadership and knowledge sharing: Mediating roles of employee's empowerment, commitment, and citizenship behaviors. *Journal of Workplace Learning, 28*, 130–149.
doi:10.1108/JWL-09-2015-0066
- Harrison, T., & Bazy, D. (2017). Aligning organizational culture and strategic human resource management. *Journal of Management Development, 36*, 1260–1269.
doi:10.1108/JMD-12-2016-0335
- Hazra, K., Ghosh, P., Sengupta, P. P. (2017). Importance of training and development and its impact on employees of hotels in Kolkata, India: An empirical study. *Journal of Tourism and Hospitality Management, 5*(2), 23–33.
doi:10.15640/jthm.v5n2a3
- Hejase, H. J., El Dirani, A., Hamdar, B., & Hazimeh, B. (2016). Employee retention in the pharmaceutical companies: Case of Lebanon. *Journal of Business Management, 18*(4), 58–75. doi:10.9790/487X-1804015875
- Helmich, E., Boerebach, B. M., Arah, O. A., & Lingard, L. (2015). Beyond limitations: Improving how we handle uncertainty in health professions education research. *Medical Teacher, 37*, 1043–1050. doi:10.3109/0142159X.2015.1073239
- Herman, H. M., Huang, X., & Lam, W. (2013). Why does transformational leadership matter for employee turnover? A multi-foci social exchange perspective. *The Leadership Quarterly, 24*, 763–776. doi:10.1016/j.leaqua.2013.07.005
- Herzberg, F. (1968). One more time: How do you motivate employees? *Harvard Business Review, 46*(1), 53–62. Retrieved from <https://hbr.org>

- Hickson, H. (2016). Becoming a critical narrativist: Using critical reflection and narrative inquiry as research methodology. *Qualitative Social Work: Research and Practice, 15*, 380–391. doi:10.1177/1473325015617344
- Hidi, S. (2016). Revisiting the role of rewards in motivation and learning: Implications of neuroscientific research. *Educational Psychology Review, 28*(1), 61–93. doi:10.1007/s10648-015-9307-5
- Hofmann, V., & Stokburger-Sauer, N. E. (2017). The impact of emotional labor on employees' work-life balance perception and commitment: A study in the hospitality industry. *International Journal of Hospitality Management, 65*, 47–58. doi:10.1016/j.ijhm.2017.06.003
- Holston-Okae, B. L., & Mushi, R. J. (2018). Employee turnover in the hospitality industry using Herzberg's two-factor motivation-hygiene theory. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences, 8*(1), 218–248. doi:10.6007/IJARBSS/v8-i1/3778
- Hong, P. (2017). The literature review on compensation system design. *Modern Economy, 8*, 1119–1128. doi:10.4236/me.2017.89077
- Hooi, L. W., & Leong, P. Y. (2015). The impact of employee satisfaction on employee intention to leave: A case study analysis. *Journal for International Business and Entrepreneurship Development, 8*, 281–299. doi:10.1504/JIBED.2015.070805
- Houghton, C., Murphy, K., Casey, D., Meehan, B., Thomas, J., & Brooker, D. (2016). From screening to synthesis: Using NVivo to enhance transparency in qualitative evidence synthesis. *Journal of Clinical Nursing, 26*, 873–881. doi:10.1111/jocn.13443

- House, R. J. (1977). A 1976 theory of charismatic leadership. In J. G. Hunt & L. L. Larson (Eds.), *Leadership: The cutting edge* (pp. 189–2007). Carbondale, IL: Southern Illinois University Press.
- Huang, Y. H., Lee, J., McFadden, A. C., Murphy, L. A., Robertson, M. M., Cheung, J. H., & Zohar, D. (2016). Beyond safety outcomes: An investigation of the impact of safety climate on job satisfaction, employee engagement and turnover using social exchange theory as the theoretical framework. *Applied Ergonomics*, *55*, 248–257. doi:10.1016/j.apergo.2015.10.007
- Imam, T., Ali, H., & Soo, H. S. (2018). Dilemma of employee retention through the lens of organizational politics: A quantitative study on pharmaceutical industry of Pakistan. *International Journal of Academic Research in Accounting, Finance and Management Sciences*, *8*(3), 26–36. doi:10.6007/IJARAFMS/v8-i3/4449
- Iqbal, S. I., Guohao, L., & Akhtar, S. (2017). Effects of job organizational culture, benefits, salary on job satisfaction ultimately affecting employee retention. *Review of Public Administration and Management*, *5*(3), 229–235. doi:10.4172/2315-7844.1000229
- Irawanto, D W. (2015). Employee participation in decision-making: Evidence from a state-owned enterprise in Indonesia. *Management*, *20*(1), 159–172. Retrieved from <https://hrcak.srce.hr/management>
- Izzack, T. (2010). *Staff turnover repercussions* (3rd ed.). London, UK: Palgrave Macmillan.

- Jani, M., & Saiyed, R. (2017). Person-organization fit: Gaining competitive advantage through successful talent acquisition. *Journal of Management Sciences and Technology*, 4(2), 53–60. Retrieved from <https://apeejay.edu/aitsm/journal>
- Janićijević, N. (2013). The mutual impact of organizational culture and structure. *Economic Annals*, 58(198), 35–60. Retrieved from <http://www.ekof.bg.ac.rs/publikacije/casopisi/ekonomski-anali/>
- Jebaseelan, J. J., & Samuel, U. (2017). Role of training program in wellbeing of employees: A conceptual study. *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science (IOSR-JHSS)*, 3, 80–84. Retrieved from <http://www.iosrjournals.org/iosr-jhss.html>
- Jiang, W., Zhao, X., & Ni, J. (2017). The impact of transformational leadership on employee sustainable performance: The mediating role of organizational citizenship behavior. *Sustainability*, 9, 1567–1583. doi:10.3390/su9091567
- Jindal, P., Shaikh, M., & Shashank, G. (2017). Employee engagement; Tool of talent retention: Study of a pharmaceutical company. *SDMIMD Journal of Management*, 8(2), 7–16. doi:10.18311/sdmimd/2017/18024
- Jiony, M. M., Harvey, G. T., Gom, D., & Ruth, S. (2015). Understanding the effect of organizational culture and employee engagement on organizational performance using organizational communication as mediator: A conceptual framework. *American Journal of Economics*, 5(2), 128–134. doi:10.5923/c.economics.201501.13

- Johnson, M., O'Hara, R., Hirst, E., Weyman, A., Turner, J., Mason, S., & Siriwardena, A. N. (2017). Multiple triangulation and collaborative research using qualitative methods to explore decision making in pre-hospital emergency care. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, *17*(1), 1–11. doi:10.1186/s12874-017-0290-z
- Johnson, S., & Rasulova, S. (2017). Qualitative research and the evaluation of development impact: Incorporating authenticity into the assessment of rigor. *Journal of Development Effectiveness*, *9*, 263–276. doi:10.1080/19439342.2017.1306577
- Jones, R. J., & Bozer, G. (2018). Advances in the psychology of workplace coaching. *Applied Psychology*, *67*, 768–772. doi:10.1111/apps.12164
- Jyoti, J., & Dev, M. (2015). The impact of transformational leadership on employee creativity: The role of learning orientation. *Journal of Asia Business Studies*, *9*(1), 78–98. doi:10.1108/jabs-03-2014-0022
- Kadir, M. A., & Amalia, L. (2017). The effect of job motivation, compensation, organizational culture toward job satisfaction and employee performance of The Ministry of Man Power. *International Journal of Business and Management Invention*, *6*(5), 73–80. Retrieved from <https://www.ijbmi.org>
- Kazi, G. F., & Zedah, Z. F. (2011). The contribution of individual variables: Job satisfaction and job turnover. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business*, *33*(5), 984–991. Retrieved from <https://ijrb.webs.com>
- Khalidi, K. (2017). Quantitative, qualitative or mixed research: Which research paradigm to use? *Journal of Educational and Social Research*, *7*(2), 15–24. doi:10.5901/jesr.2017.v7n2p15

- Khalid, K., & Nawab, S. (2018). Employee participation and employee retention in view of compensation. *SAGE Open*, 8(4), 1–17. doi:10.1177/2158244018810067
- Kirchherr, J., & Charles, K. (2018). Enhancing the sample diversity of snowball samples: Recommendations from a research project on anti-dam movements in Southeast Asia. *PloS one*, 13(8), e0201710. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0201710
- Knafl, K., Leeman, J., Havill, N., Crandell, J., & Sandelowski, M. (2015). Delimiting family in syntheses of research on chronic childhood conditions and family life. *Family Process*, 54, 173–184. doi:10.1111/famp.12101
- Kodikal, R., & Rahiman, H. U. (2016). Influence of quality of work life on organizational commitment amongst employees in manufacturing sector. *International Journal in Multidisciplinary and Academic Research (SSIJMAR)*, 5(5), 56–69. Retrieved from <http://www.ijeais.org/ijamr/>
- Korstjens, I., & Moser, A. (2018). Series: Practical guidance to qualitative research. Part 4: Trustworthiness and publishing. *European Journal of General Practice*, 24, 120–124. doi:10.1080/13814788.2017.1375092
- Kristin, M., Sheryl, F. K., & Robin, D. (2018). The impact of manager training on employee turnover intentions. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Insights*, 1, 203–219. doi:10.1108/JHTI-02-2018-0010
- Kumar, A. A., & Mathimaran, K. B. (2017). Employee retention strategies – An empirical research. *Global Journal of Management and Business Research*, 17(1), 17–22. Retrieved from <https://journalofbusiness.org/index.php/GJMBR/index>

- Kumar, C. A., & Gadkar, R. D. (2016). A study on employee retention strategies in Indian manufacturing industries. *International Journal of Management Research and Social Science (IJMRSS)*, 3, 80–84. Retrieved from <http://irdp.info/ijmrss>
- Kunze, L., & Suppa, N. (2018). The effect of unemployment on social participation of spouses: Evidence from plant closures in Germany. *Empirical Economics*, 58, 815–833. doi:10.1007/s00181-018-1542-4
- Kuranchie-Mensah, E. B., & Amponsah-Tawiah, K. (2016). Employee motivation and work performance: A comparative study of mining companies in Ghana. *Journal of Industrial Engineering and Management (JIEM)*, 9, 255–309. doi:10.3926/jiem.1530
- Kwakye, E. O. (2018). Organizational culture and employee turnover: Evidence from Ghana. *British Journal of Economics, Management and Trade*, 21(2), 1–11. Retrieved from <http://www.sciencedomain.org/journal/20>
- Latten, T., Westra, D., Angeli, F., Paulus, A., Struss, M., & Ruwaard, D. (2018). Pharmaceutical companies and healthcare providers: Going beyond the gift – An explorative review. *PloS One*, 13(2), 1–15. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0191856
- Lee, M. (2014). Transformational leadership: Is it time for a recall? *International Journal of Management and Applied Research*, 1, 18–29. doi:10.18646/2056.11.14-002
- Leedy, P. D., & Ormrod, J. E. (2015). *Practical research: Planning and design* (9th ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Merrill Prentice-Hall.
- Letourneau, J. L. H. (2015). Infusing qualitative research experiences into core counseling curriculum courses. *International Journal for the Advancement of Counseling*, 37, 375–389. doi:10.1007/s10447-015-9251-6

- Li, H., Sajjad, N., Wang, Q., Muhammad Ali, A., Khaqan, Z., & Amina, S. (2019). Influence of transformational leadership on employees' innovative work behavior in sustainable organizations: Test of mediation and moderation processes. *Sustainability, 11*(6), 1–21. doi:10.3390/su11061594
- Li, T. (2015). Nestle employee recruitment research. *International Journal of Business and Social Science, 6*(4), 97–113. Retrieved from <https://ijbssnet.com>
- Lindlof, T.R., & Tylor, B.C. (2019). Sensemaking I: Analyzing, coding, and managing data. *Qualitative Communication Research Methods* (4th ed., pp.308–39). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Mabila, T. T. (2017). Postgraduate students' understanding of mixed methods research design at the proposal stage. *South African Journal of Higher Education, 31*, 136–153. doi:10.28535/31-5-1498
- Magruk, A. (2015). The process of selection of the main research methods in foresight from different perspectives. *Business, Management & Education / Verslas, Vadyba Ir Studijos, 6*, 234–248. doi:10.3846/bme.2015.281
- Mansoor, H. S., Shah, F. T., Rehman, A., & Tayyaba, A. (2015). Impact of training and development on organization performance with mediating role of intention to quit as human resource quality cost. *European Online Journal of Natural and Social Sciences, 4*, 787–797. Retrieved from <http://european-science.com>
- Maramwidze-Merrison, E. (2016). Innovative methodologies in qualitative research: Social media window for accessing organizational elites for interviews. *Electronic Journal of Business Research Methods, 14*, 157–167. Retrieved from <http://ejbrm.com>

- Marshall, C., & Rossman, G. (2016). *Designing qualitative research* (6th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Martínez-Mesa, J., González-Chica, D. A., Duquia, R. P., Bonamigo, R. R., & Bastos, J. L. (2016). Sampling: How to select participants in my research study? *Anais brasileiros de dermatologia*, *91*, 326–330. doi:10.1590/abd1806-4841.20165254
- Mathew, M., & Gupta, K. S. (2015). Transformational leadership: Emotional intelligence. *SCMS Journal of Indian Management*, *12*(2), 75–89. Retrieved from <https://www.scms.edu.in/journal/>
- Mathieu, C., Fabi, B., Lacoursière, R., & Raymond, L. (2016). The role of supervisory behavior, job satisfaction and organizational commitment on employee turnover. *Journal of Management & Organization*, *22*, 113–129. doi:10.1017/jmo.2015.25
- McLeod, S. (2017). What's the difference between qualitative and quantitative research? [PDF file]. Retrieved from <https://www.simplypsychology.org/qualitative-quantitative.html>
- Meng, F., Wang, X., Chen, H., Zhang, J., Yang, W., Wang, J., & Zheng, Q. (2016). The influence of organizational culture on talent management: A case study of a real estate company. *Journal of Chinese Human Resource Management*, *7*, 129–146. doi:10.1108/JCHRM-07-2016-0010
- Messersmith, J. G., Patel, P. C., & Crawford, C. (2018). Bang for the buck: Understanding employee benefit allocations and new venture survival. *International Small Business Journal*, *36*, 104–125. doi:10.1177/0266242617717595

- Miller, O. P. C. (2017). *Human capital strategies of leaders in the food service industry* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 10603784)
- Mitrovska, S., & Eftimov, L. (2016). Calculating the cost for employee turnover in the IT industry in Macedonia by using web calculator. *Journal of Human Resource Management, 19*(1), 24–33. Retrieved from <https://www.jhrm.eu>
- Mngomezuhu, N., Challenor, M., Munapo, E., Mashau, P., & Chikandiwa, C. T. (2015). The impact of recognition on retention of good talent in the workforce. *Journal of Governance and Regulation, 4*(4), 372–379. doi:10.22495/jgr_v4_i4_c3_p2
- Mohajan, H. K. (2017). Two criteria for good measurements in research: Validity and reliability. *Annals of Spiru Haret University Economic Series, 17*, 59–82. doi:10.26458/1746
- Moon, K. (2017). Voluntary turnover rates and organizational performance in the US federal government: The moderating role of high-commitment human resource practices. *Public Management Review, 19*, 1480–1499. doi:10.1080/14719037.2017.1287940
- Moon, K., Brewer, T. D., Januchowski-Hartley, S. R., Adams, V. M., & Blackman, D. A. (2016). A guideline to improve qualitative social science publishing in ecology and conservation journals. *Ecology & Society, 21*, 133–152. doi:10.5751/ES-08663-210317
- Murshed, F., & Zhang, Y. (2016). Thinking orientation and preference for research methodology. *Journal of Consumer Marketing, 33*, 437–446. doi:10.1108/JCM-2016-1694.

- Nascimento, L. D. C. N., Souza, T. V. D., Oliveira, I. C. D. S., Moraes, J. R. M. M. D., Aguiar, R. C. B. D., & Silva, L. F. D. (2018). Theoretical saturation in qualitative research: An experience report in interview with schoolchildren. *Revista brasileira de enfermagem*, 71, 228–233. doi:10.1590/0034-7167-2016-0616
- Naseer, M., ul Haq, A., & Farooq, M. (2018). Antecedent of employees' career satisfaction: An empirical investigation of pharmaceutical sector of Pakistan. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 8(7), 281–299. doi:10.6007/IJARBSS/v8-i7/4341
- Nasir, S. Z., & Mahmood, N. (2016). Determinants of employee retention: An evidence from Pakistan. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 6(9), 182–194. doi:10.6007/IJARBSS/v6-i9/2304
- Nazir, J. (2016). Using phenomenology to conduct environmental education research: Experience and issues. *The Journal of Environmental Education*, 47, 179–190. doi:10.1080/00958964.2015.1063473
- Odor, H. O. (2018). Organizational culture and dynamics. *International Journal of Scientific Research and Management*, 6, 31–39. doi:10.5465/amr.1993.9402210154
- Ogbonnaya, C., Daniels, K., & Nielsen, K. (2017). Does contingent pay encourage positive employee attitudes and intensify work? *Human Resource Management Journal*, 27, 94–112. doi:10.1111/1748-8583.12130

- Oliveira, M., Bitencourt, C. C., Zanardo dos Santos, A. M., & Teixeira, E. K. (2016). Thematic content analysis: Is there a difference between the support provided by MaxqdaR and NivoR software packages? *Brazilian Journal of Management*, 9(1), 72–82. doi:10.5902/1983465911213
- Olubiye, O., Smiley, G., Luckel, H., & Melaragno, R. (2019). A qualitative case study of employee turnover in retail business. *Heliyon*, 5(6), 1–8. doi:10.1016/j.heliyon.2019.
- Omilani, M., & Akintolu, M. (2017). The effectiveness of motivational strategies on productivity in selected financial institutions in Nigeria. *American Journal of Industrial and Business Management*, 7, 881–892. doi:10.4236/ajibm.2020.102014
- Özçelik, G., Aybas, M., & Uyargil, C. (2016). High performance work systems and organizational values: Resource-based view considerations. *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 235, 332–341. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.11.040
- Pang, K., & Lu, C. (2018). Organizational motivation, employee job satisfaction and organizational performance: An empirical study of container shipping companies in Taiwan. *Maritime Business Review*, 3, 36–52. doi:10.1108/MABR-03-2018-0007
- Park, J., & Park, M. (2016). Qualitative versus quantitative research methods: Discovery or justification? *Journal of Marketing Thought*, 3(1), 1–7. doi:10.15577/jmt.2016.03.01.1

- Paulus, T., & Lester, J. (2016). ATLAS.ti for conversation and discourse analysis. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology, 19*, 405–428.
doi:10.1080/13645579.2015.1021949
- Paulus, T., Woods, M., Atkins, D. P., & Macklin, R. (2017). The discourse of QDAS: Reporting practices of ATLAS.ti and NVivo users with implications for best practices. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology: Theory & Practice, 20*(1), 35–47. doi:10.1080/13645579.2015.1102454
- Phaneuf, J., Boudrias, J., Rousseau, V., & Brunelle, E. (2016). Personality and transformational leadership: The moderating effect of organizational context. *Personality and Individual Differences, 102*, 30–35.
doi:10.1016/j.paid.2016.06.052
- Phillips, D. P. (2016). Interpreting and presenting marginalized voices through intersubjective accounts. *Qualitative Research Journal, 16*, 26–38.
doi:10.1108/QRJ-03-2015-0020
- Phungsoonthorn, T., & Charoensukmongkol, P. (2018). The preventive role of transformational leadership and trust in the leader on employee turnover risk of Myanmar migrant workers in Thailand: The moderating role of salary and job tenure. *The Journal of Risk Management and Insurance, 22*(2), 63–79. Retrieved from <https://www.jrmi.au.edu/index.php/jrmi/index>
- Piotrowski, K. (2015). A “wow!” approach to self-directed employee career development. *Career Planning and Adult Development Journal, 31*(3), 41–44. Retrieved from <https://www.careernetwork.org>

- Puspita, I., & Susanty, A. I. (2017). Career development and work motivation drive employee turnover intension in an IT consulting in Indonesia. *Indian Journal of Scientific Research, 17*, 257–263. Retrieved from <http://www.ijsr.in>
- Qi, F., & Wang, W. (2016). Employee involvement, public service motivation, and perceived organizational performance: Testing a new model. *International Review of Administration Sciences, 84*(4), 746–764. doi:10.1177/0020852316662531
- Raj, S. R., & Brindha, D. G. (2017). A study on employee retention strategies with special reference to Chennai IT industry. *International Journal of Civil Engineering and Technology, 8*(6), 38–44. Retrieved from <https://www.iaeme.com/index.asp>
- Raja, U., Bouckenoghe, D., Syed, F., & Naseer, S. (2018). Interplay between PO fit, transformational leadership and organizational social capital. *Personnel Review, 47*, 913–930. doi:10.1108/PR-07-2016-0161
- Rajan, D. (2013). Impact of nurses' turnover on organization performance. *Afro-Asian Journal of Social Sciences, 4*(4), 1–18. Retrieved from <http://www.onlineresearchjournals.com/aajoss>
- Rajan, D. (2017). Employee turnover and employee performance: A comparative study among nurses. *MOJ Applied Bionics and Biomechanics, 1*, 1–12. doi:10.15406/mojabb.2017.01.00025
- Ramani, S., & Mann, K. (2016). Introducing medical educators to qualitative study design: Twelve tips from inception to completion. *Medical Teacher, 38*, 456–463. doi:10.3109/0142159x.2015.1035244

- Robins, C. S., & Eisen, K. (2017). Strategies for the effective use of NVivo in a largescale study: Qualitative analysis and the repeal of don't ask, don't tell. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *23*, 768–778. doi:10.1177/1077800417731089
- Robinson, O. C. (2014). Sampling in interview-based qualitative research: A theoretical and practical guide. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, *11*(1), 25–41. doi:10.1080/14780887.2013.801543
- Rohde, P., Shaw, H., Butryn, M. L., & Stice, E. (2015). Assessing program sustainability in an eating disorder prevention effectiveness trial delivered by college clinicians. *Behaviour Research and Therapy*, *72*, 1–8. doi:10.1016/j.brat.2015.06.009
- Rose, S., & Raja, K. G. (2016). Role of HR practices, job satisfaction, and organization commitment in employee retention. *CLEAR International Journal of Research in Commerce & Management*, *7*(10), 1–3. Retrieved from <https://ijrcm.org.in>
- Roy, G. S., & Devi, V. R. (2016). Talent management issues of pharmaceutical companies. *SAMVAD: SIBM Pune Research Journal*, *12*, 23–28. Retrieved from <http://www.samvad.sibmpune.edu.in/index.php/samvad/index>
- Rozario, S. D., Venkatraman, S., & Abbas, A. (2019). Challenges in recruitment and selection process: An empirical study. *Challenges*, *10*(2), 1–22. doi:10.3390/challe10020035
- Runfola, A., Perna, A., Baraldi, E., & Gregori, G. L. (2017). The use of qualitative case studies in top business and management journals: A quantitative analysis of recent patterns. *European Management Journal*, *35*, 116–127. doi:10.1016/j.emj.2016.04.001

- Saher, N., Khan, D. M., Shahzad, F., & Qadri, S. (2015). The impact of employees' turnover at the productivity of a software. *International Journal of Nature and Engineering Sciences*, 9(3), 23–27. Retrieved from <http://www.nesciences.com>
- Salehudin, & Satrya, A. (2018, May 31). Turning Over Employee Turnover: A Review on Employee Alumni and Rehiring. doi:10.31235/osf.io/xc3wp
- Saravo, B., Netze, J., & Kiesewetter, J. (2017). The need for strong clinical leaders: Transformational and transactional leadership as a framework for resident leadership training. *PloS One*, 13(2), 1–15. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0183019
- Saunders, B., Sim, J., Kingstone, T., Baker, S., Waterfield, J., Bartlam, B., . . . & Jinks, C. (2018). Saturation in qualitative research: Eploring its conceptualization and operationalization. *Quality & Quantity*, 52, 1893–1907. doi:10.1007/s11135-017-0574-8
- Saunders, M. K., & Townsend, K. (2016). Reporting and justifying the number of interview participants in organization and workplace research. *British Journal of Management*, 27, 836–852. doi:10.1111/1467-8551.12182
- Schaumberg, R. L., & Flynn, F. J. (2017). Clarifying the link between job satisfaction and absenteeism: The role of guilt proneness. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 102, 982–992. doi:10.1037/apl0000208
- Schuhmacher, A., Gassmann, O., & Hinder, M. (2016). Changing R&D models in research-based pharmaceutical companies. *Journal of translational medicine*, 14(1), 1–11. doi:10.1186/s12967-016-0838-4
- Serpa, S. (2016). An overview of the concept of organizational culture. *International Business Management*, 10(1), 51–61. Retrieved from <http://medwelljournals.com>

- Sethunga, S., & Perera, I. (2018). Impact of performance rewards on employee turnover in Sri Lankan IT industry. In *2018 Moratuwa Engineering Research Conference (MERCOn)* (pp. 114–119). IEEE. doi:10.1109/MERCOn.2018.8421961
- Shaheen, A. (2016). *Successful employee retention strategies in childcare centers* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 10241658)
- Shahin, N. (2017). A study of employee retention in the pharmaceuticals sector in Ranchi City. *International Journal of Engineering Technology Science and Research*, 4(9), 292–301. Retrieved from <http://www.ijetsr.com>
- Shamsuzzoha, A. H. M., & Shumon, R. H. (2010). Employee turnover: A study of its causes and effects to different industries in Bangladesh. *Manufacturing Engineering/ Vyrobné Inžinierstvo*, 6(3), 64–68. Retrieved from <https://www.worldcat.org/title/manufacturing-engineering-vyrobné-inžinierstvo>
- Shapiro, B. B. (2016). Using traditional narratives and other narrative devices to enact humanizing business practices. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 139, 1–19. doi:10.1007/s10551-015-2645-x
- Shoaib, S., & Mujtaba, B. G. (2016). Use it or lose it: Prudently using case study as a research and educational strategy. *American Journal of Education and Learning*, 1(2), 83–93. doi:10.20448/804.1.2.83.93
- Siddiqui, F. (2018). Impact of retention strategies on employee turnover: A case in point. *Journal of Resources Development and Management*, 42. 1–10. Retrieved from <https://www.iiste.org/Journals/index.php/JRDM/index>

- Simola, S., Barling, J., & Turner, N. (2012). Transformational leadership and leaders' mode of care reasoning. *Journal of Business Ethics, 108*, 229–237.
doi:10.1007/s10551-011-1080-x
- Singh, D. (2019). A literature review on employee retention with focus on recent trends. *International Journal of Scientific Research in Science and Technology, 6*(1), 425–431. doi:10.32628/IJSRST195463
- Sinha, D., & Shukla, S. K. (2013). A study of employee retention in the pharmaceuticals sector in Dehradun city. *International Journal of Education and Psychological Research, 2*, 30–39. Retrieved from <http://ijepr.org>
- Slade, S., & Sergent, S. R. (2019). *Interview techniques*. Treasure Island, FL: StatPearls Publishing.
- Smith, B., & Sparkes, A. C. (Eds.). (2016). Qualitative interviewing in the sport and exercise sciences. *Routledge handbook of qualitative research in sport and exercise* (pp. 103–123). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Sookaneknun, S., & Ussahawanitchakit, P. (2012). Transformational leadership, organizational innovation capability, and firm performance of cosmetic businesses in Thailand. *Journal of International Business and Economics, 12*(4), 77–91. Retrieved from <http://jibe-journal.org>
- Steiner, A., & Atterton, J. (2014). The contribution of rural businesses to community resilience. *Local Economy, 29*, 228–244. doi:10.1177/0269094214528853

- Subekti, A., & Setyadi, D. (2016). The implication of financial compensation and performance appraisal system to job satisfaction and motivation also employee performance in PT Pupuk Kalimantan Timur Indonesia. *International Journal of Business and Management Invention*, 5(2), 16–27. Retrieved from <https://www.ijbmi.org>
- Sun, R., & Wang, W. (2017). Transformational leadership, employee turnover intention, and actual voluntary turnover in public organizations. *Public Management Review*, 19, 1124–1141. doi:10.1080/14719037.2016.1257063
- Syed, M., & Nelson, S. C. (2015). Guidelines for establishing reliability when coding narrative data. *Emerging Adulthood*, 3, 375–387. doi:10.1177/2167696815587648
- Taylor, M. J., Fornusek, C., Ruys, A. J., Bijak, M., & Bauman, A. E. (2017). The Vienna FES interview protocol: A mixed-methods protocol to elucidate the opinions of various individuals responsible for the provision of FES exercise. *European Journal of Translational Myology*, 27, 160–165. doi:10.4081/ejtm.2017.6604
- Teece, D., Peteraf, M., & Leih, S. (2016). Dynamic capabilities and organizational agility: Risk, uncertainty, and strategy in the innovation economy. *California Management Review*, 58(4), 13–35. doi:10.1525/cm.2016.58.4.13
- Thomas, D. R. (2017). Feedback from research participants: Are member checks useful in qualitative research? *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 14(1), 23–41. doi:10.1080/14780887.2016.1219435
- Turner, S. F., Cardinal, L. B., & Burton, R. M. (2017). Research design for mixed methods. *Organizational Research Methods*, 20, 243–267. doi:10.1177/1094428115610808

- Valerio, M. A., Rodriguez, N., Winkler, P., Lopez, J., Dennison, M., Liang, Y., & Turner, B. J. (2016). Comparing two sampling methods to engage hard-to-reach communities in research priority setting. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, *16*(1), 1–11. doi:10.1186/s12874-016-0242-z
- Van Manen, M. (2017). Phenomenology in its original sense. *Qualitative Health Research*, *27*, 810–825. doi:10.1177/1049732317699381
- Varpio, L., Ajjawi, R., Monrouxe, L. V., O'Brien, B. C., & Rees, C. E. (2017). Shedding the cobra effect: Problematising thematic emergence, triangulation, saturation and member checking. *Medical Education*, *51*, 40–50. doi:10.1111/medu.13124
- Vatankhah, S., Alirezaei, S., Khosravizadeh, O., Mirbahaeddin, S. E., Alikhani, M., & Alipanah, M. (2017). Role of transformational leadership on employee productivity of teaching hospitals: Using structural equation modeling. *Electronic Physician*, *9*, 4978–4984. doi:10.19082/4978
- Vroom, V. H. (1964). *Work and motivation*. New York, NY: John Wiley & Sons.
- Waldman, D. A., Carter, M. Z., & Hom, P. W. (2012). A multilevel investigation of leadership and turnover behavior. *Journal of Management*, *41*, 1724–1744. doi:10.1177/0149206312460679
- Walters, R. (2015). *The role of workplace culture in recruiting top talent*. Robert Walters Whitepaper. Retrieved from <https://www.robertwalters.com>
- Wang, Q. (2016). The choice of salary transparency: Based on the value of equity theory. *Open Journal of Business and Management*, *4*, 494–499. doi:10.4236/ojbm.2016.43052

- Wang, X., Wang, L., Xu, X., & Ji, P. (2014). Identifying employee turnover risks using modified quality function deployment. *Systems Research & Behavioral Science, 31*, 398–404. doi:10.1002/sres.2282
- Weller, S. C., Vickers, B., Bernard, H. R., Blackburn, A. M., Borgatti, S., Gravlee, C. C., & Johnson, J. C. (2018). Open-ended interview questions and saturation. *PloS one, 13*(6), e0198606. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0198606
- Wright, A. L., Wahoush, O., Ballantyne, M., Gabel, C., & Jack, S. M. (2016). Qualitative health research involving indigenous peoples: Culturally appropriate data collection methods. *The Qualitative Report, 21*, 2230–2245. Retrieved from <http://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/>
- Wynen, J., Van Dooren, W., Mattijs, J., & Deschamps, C. (2019). Linking turnover to organizational performance: The role of process conformance. *Public Management Review, 21*, 669–685. doi:10.1080/14719037.2018.1503704
- Yardley, L. (2017). Demonstrating the validity of qualitative research. *The Journal of Positive Psychology, 12*, 295–296. doi:10.1080/17439760.2016.1262624
- Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case study research and applications: Design and methods* (6th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Yukl, G. (2012). Effective leadership behaviors: What we know and what questions need more attention? *The Academy of Management Perspectives, 26*(4), 66–85. doi:10.5465/amp.2012.0088

- Zhang, X. A., Li, N., Ullrich, J., & van Dick, R. (2015). Getting everyone on board: The effect of differentiated transformational leadership by CEOs on top management team effectiveness and leader-rated firm performance. *Journal of Management*, *41*, 1898–1933. doi:10.1177/0149206312471387
- Zhang, Y. (2016). A review of employee turnover influence factor and countermeasure. *Journal of Human Resource and Sustainability Studies*, *4*, 85–91. doi:10.4236/jhrss.2016.42010

Appendix A: Interview Protocol

Interview preparation. After receiving the approval from the IRB at Walden University, I will contact the potential participants through the email; I will send the potential participants my prepared and IRB-approved introduction letter that contains the purpose of my research. After receiving participants' permission for the interview, I will ask them to propose time and location for conducting the interview.

Opening the interview. I will start all interviews by thanking the participants for their times and participation, introducing myself, explaining the purpose of my research, and describing the benefits of conducting my study from business and social perspectives. I will make sure that all participants are comfortable and ready for the interview before I start.

Informed consent. Before I start the interview, I will ask all participants to sign a consent form (IC). I will make sure that participants know about recording the interview for transcription purposes. Before the interview, I will turn on the recording device and my phone to record the information such as the date, time, name of the participant, and numeric code for the analysis.

Conducting the interview. The interview will be a semistructured that will contain many open-ended questions (the complete list of my interview questions is in Appendix B). I will give enough time for the participants to answer each interview question. When necessary, I will repeat participants answer in my way, and I will ask several follow up and probing questions so I can have clarification.

Theme verification. I will ask participants about the major themes discussed during the interview to confirm that I understood the intent of the participant's responses to my questions.

Coding. I will use numerical coding to protect and maintain the privacy of the participants and the confidentiality of the data. For example, I will code the first participant as P1, the second one as P2, and I will use the same strategy for the numerical coding of all other participants. For my records and analysis purposes, I will keep a list that links participants' names with their code numbers in a secure place in a locked filing cabinet at my home office. I will be the only person who has access to this document to ensure protection and maintain the privacy participants and confidentiality of the data.

Recording reflexive notes. While I am doing the interview, I will document any reflexive thoughts, including any follow-up or probing questions that may arise during the interview.

Ending the interview. At the end of the interview, I will thank the participants for their time and participation. I will inform all participants that I will contact them in the future to participate in member checking to obtain more information they might provide. I will make sure that all private information and the contents of the interview remain confidential and secure. I will not include the participant's name or the organization's name when I publish my study.

Appendix B: Interview Questions

1. What strategies have you used to reduce employee turnover?
2. How do you measure the success of strategies for reducing employee turnover?
3. What are the major obstacles you faced in implementing strategies to reduce employee turnover?
4. How did you overcome these major obstacles to implementing strategies to reduce employee turnover?
5. What additional information would you like to provide about strategies to reduce employee turnover?