

2020

Prevention of Sex Trafficking and Perspectives From Parents in Ogwa Community Edo State Nigeria

Nkechi Iwuoha
Walden University

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.waldenu.edu/dissertations>



Part of the [Public Policy Commons](#), and the [Quantitative, Qualitative, Comparative, and Historical Methodologies Commons](#)

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies Collection at ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Walden Dissertations and Doctoral Studies by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact ScholarWorks@waldenu.edu.

Walden University

College of Social and Behavioral Sciences

This is to certify that the doctoral dissertation by

Nkechi Lilian Iwuoha

has been found to be complete and satisfactory in all respects,
and that any and all revisions required by
the review committee have been made.

Review Committee

Dr. Morris Bidjerano, Committee Chairperson,
Criminal Justice Faculty

Dr. Anne Hacker, Committee Member,
Criminal Justice Faculty

Dr. Daniel Jones, University Reviewer,
Criminal Justice Faculty

Chief Academic Officer and Provost
Sue Subocz, Ph.D.

Walden University
2020

Abstract

Prevention of Sex Trafficking and Perspectives From Parents in Ogwa Community Edo

State Nigeria

by

Nkechi Lilian Iwuoha

BSc, Calumet College of St Joseph, Whiting, 2014

MEd, University of Manchester England, 1991

Advanced Diploma, University of Manchester England, 1990

Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Criminal Justice

Walden University

August 2020

Abstract

There is a high rate of trafficked girls and women from the Ogwa community in Edo state, Nigeria. The Edo government has developed a top-down centralized approach to the prevention of sex trafficking that has proved largely ineffective. The wholistic involvement of people in the decision-making regarding the strategies to prevent sex trafficking can directly create an impact through policy formulation and implementation. However, few studies have addressed the perspective of parents of vulnerable youth to positively impact the policy outcome on sex trafficking. Hence, the goal of this qualitative narrative inquiry study was to explore the perceptions of parents on existing sex trafficking prevention policies in view of influencing policy outcome. The theoretical framework used for this study was Jones and McBeth's narrative policy analysis framework. Data were collected through face-to-face semistructured interviews with 12 parents of young girls and women, aged 13 to 21. The data were coded inductively and subjected to Braun and Clarke's thematic analysis method. Some themes that emerged from the data included lack of awareness education, community/government dialogue, intersectoral collaboration, and infrastructural development. The findings were interpreted in terms of a participatory policy analysis approach. By giving voice to parents, policymakers are better able to understand the need for citizen participation as a tool for community engagement in ending poverty, which is at the root of sex trafficking. Any intervention that addresses poverty can have a positive implication for social change for the Ogwa community, especially for young girls and women from low income families.

Prevention Sex Trafficking and Perspectives From Parents in Ogwa Community Edo

State Nigeria

by

Nkechi Lilian Iwuoha

BSc, Calumet College of St Joseph, Whiting, 2014

MEd, University of Manchester England, 1991

Advanced Diploma, University of Manchester England, 1990

Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Criminal Justice

Walden University

August 2020

Dedication

I would like to dedicate this work to my father, late Ferdinand Onwusoukwu Iwuoha, who stood for justice despite the cost. I also dedicate this work to all victims of sex trafficking, the individuals who have lost their lives trying to rescue the victims, and parents of victims, especially from the Ogwa community, who have endured the ravages of sex trafficking.

Acknowledgments

I thank God for making it possible for me to complete this dissertation.

I would like to express my deepest appreciation to my dissertation committee, chairperson Dr. Morris Bidjerano, my committee member Dr. Anne Hacker and Dr. Dan Jones URR member.

I also wish to thank Dayna Herrington, the Walden Writing Center Dissertation Editors, and the Center for Research Quality for their patient guidance through this process.

Finally, I thank my mother Mrs. Catherine Iwuoha for singing encouraging songs over the phone to cheer me on. I appreciate you all my siblings Dee Uzoma, Maureen and Dorathy. I thank my nieces, nephews and great nieces and nephews for phones calls to encourage me. A special gratitude to Dr. Mrs. Eucharia Ike my eldest sister for encouraging me to begin a Doctoral study. And Rev. Fr. Charles Chukwudi Onyenemerem for his support. I also thank the members of my religious family, the American Province of the Poor Handmaids of Jesus Christ Nuns, for providing me with a peaceful atmosphere and financial assistance to complete this study.

Table of Contents

List of Tables	vi
List of Figures	vii
Chapter 1: Introduction to the Study.....	1
Introduction.....	1
Background of the Problem	3
Problem Statement	9
Purpose of the Study	12
Research Question	12
Theoretical Framework.....	13
Narrative Policy Framework (NPF).....	13
Nature of Study.....	14
Definition of Terms.....	15
Assumptions, Limitations, Scope, and Delimitations.....	18
Assumptions.....	18
Scope and Delimitations	21
Limitations	23
Significance of the Study	24
Summary.....	26
Chapter 2: Literature Review	28
Introduction.....	28
Literature Search Strategy.....	31

Theoretical Foundation	33
Narrative Policy Framework (NPF).....	33
Literature Review Related to Key Variables and/or Concepts	37
Sex Trafficking	37
Existing Studies by Researchers on Sex Trafficking.....	42
Statistics on Sex Trafficking.....	45
Policies and Initiatives to Prevent Sex Trafficking in Nigeria	50
Policy Implementation Process in Nigeria.....	56
Edo State Policies on Sex Trafficking	58
Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition), Enforcement, and Administration	
Act, 2015 (Act No. 4 of 2015)	62
Profile of Victims, Traffickers, and Buyers of Sex	69
Victims.....	69
Traffickers.....	72
Buyers of Sex (Clients).....	76
Services Needed for the Rehabilitation of Victims.....	78
The Influence of Media in the Prevention of Sex Trafficking.....	79
Stakeholder Participation in Policy Analysis and Development	80
Summary.....	83
Chapter 3: Research Method.....	85
Introduction.....	85
Research Design and Rationale	86

Qualitative Research	87
Narrative Inquiry Research Tradition	88
Role of the Researcher	90
Methodology	92
Participant Selection Logic	92
Instrumentation	96
Procedures for Recruitment, Participation, and Data Collection	97
IRB Approval	102
Data Analysis Plan	102
Issues of Trustworthiness	108
Credibility	108
Transferability	111
Dependability	112
Confirmability	113
Ethical Procedures/Considerations	114
Summary	116
Chapter 4: Results	117
Introduction	117
Research Question	118
Setting	118
Demographics	118
Data Collection	119

Data Analysis	122
Evidence of Trustworthiness.....	124
Credibility	124
Transferability.....	126
Dependability	127
Confirmability.....	128
Results.....	129
Theme 1: Community Participation.....	132
Theme 2. Awareness Education.....	133
Theme 3: Infrastructural Development.....	136
Theme 4 Intersectoral Collaboration	137
Theme 5: Environmental and Family Support.....	138
Theme 6: Legislation on Education	139
Theme 7: Trafficker Arrest, Punishment and Rehabilitation.....	141
Discrepant Case	142
Summary	143
Chapter 5: Discussion, Conclusions, and Recommendations.....	145
Introduction.....	145
Interpretation of the Findings.....	147
Limitations of the Study.....	156
Recommendations.....	158
Implications.....	160

Conclusion	162
References.....	165
Appendix A: Face-to-Face Interview Protocol.....	202
Appendix B: Journal Notes.....	204
Appendix C: List of Figures Showing Visual Data	206
Appendix D: Edo State Trafficking in Persons Prohibition Law 2018	208

List of Tables

Table 1. Stages of Thematic Analysis.....	104
Table 2. Complete Coding Example.....	105
Table 3. Groups and Emergent Themes.....	106
Table 4. Preliminary Coding Framework	107
Table 5. Frequency Table	123
Table 6. Data Triangulation	125
Table 7. Data Coding and Analysis Framework.....	131

List of Figures

Figure 1. Trafficking trail from Nigeria to Europe.....	38
Figure 2. Camouflage effect in Prostitution.....	40
Figure 3. Pie chart indicating profits made from Sex Trafficking.....	65
Figure B1. One of the Boats used by the traffickers docked by the sea	206
Figure B2. The spot where 200 drowned trafficked Nigerians were pulled out.....	207

Chapter 1: Introduction to the Study

Introduction

Sex trafficking has been at the core of criminal misconduct and international criminal law since the controversial early 18th Century antislavery movement. Nonetheless, sex trafficking has remained globally ubiquitous. The rate of occurrence despite the empirical evidence continues to be elusive due to its clandestine nature (Worden, 2018). As a global organized criminal practice, there has been difficulty in collecting cross-border data, which hampers any progress in combatting the problem.

The results of the Global Slavery 2016 Index survey, with over 42 million respondents across 25 countries, estimated that predominantly 48.5 million people are used as sex slaves (Walk Free Foundation, 2016). The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC, 2016) disclosed that approximately 54% of those globally identified as held against their will for sexual exploitation are trafficked survivors.

The profits from sex trafficking continue to outweigh the costs of involvement by traffickers, generating income for criminals engaged at different levels of trade, from recruitment to transportation. The International Labor Organization (ILO) estimated profits made in exchanging women as a commodity to be repeatedly consumed at approximately \$99 billion (Worden, 2018). Because of the endemic nature of this crime, efforts are being made by governments globally to stop its further spread.

The Nigerian government has been proactive in responding to the problem of sex trafficking. The government has made some strides to eradicate sex trafficking, but some states remain at higher risk. For instance, for over a decade, sex trafficking in rural

communities of Edo State Nigeria (including Ogwa) has continued to increase annually (Domingues da Silva, 2017; UNHCR, 2017). Since 2009, the government of Edo has implemented various preventive and rehabilitation programs.

However, the office of the National Agency for the Prohibition of Trafficking in Person (MAPTIP) had stated that none of these strategies have stopped the growing problem of sex trafficking of mainly women and girls from rural Edo, Nigeria (NAPTIP, 2015; Shelley, 2016). It is important to note that many young trafficked women for sexual exploitation are from Edo, and it has not been easy to stop the trend in trafficking.

The reason for the lack of success in finding a lasting solution to the problem is partly due to the top-down approach of addressing this phenomenon (Claridge, 2004). The top-down model for combatting sex trafficking involves centralized decision-making and the implementation of policies and programs for the community without consultation with the beneficiaries (Osezua, 2016). It was also evident that researchers have not conducted a study on community involvement as crucial stakeholders of influence in contributing to effective preventive policies to address sex trafficking.

Hence, the purpose of this study was to unravel parents' perspectives as they analyzed existing government preventive policies and programs designed to combat sex trafficking in the Ogwa community. In this way, policymakers may gain insight into ways to formulate effective community-based programs that target the prevention of sex trafficking.

In Chapter one I present the background of the problem of sex trafficking and why parents' input in prevention policy on sex trafficking is needed. The chapter includes

a definition of the problem, purpose, significance for this study, and its social change implications. I outline the research question. I also explore the assumptions, scope, delimitations, and limitations of this study. In this section, the narrative policy theoretical framework, was used as the foundation for this research. This chapter also includes a critical contextual essential definition in the study.

Background of the Problem

Sex trafficking continues to pose a global problem, hence the need for an ongoing debate on the deprivation of victims' human rights. New research data by International Organization for Migration (IOM) revealed that there are approximately 45.8 million people held as slaves worldwide (IOM, 2017). Out of this number of victims, 14% come from Africa, 1% from the Arab States, 5% from the Americas, and 13% from Europe/Central Asia (ILO, 2017).

Researchers have estimated that four million people face forced sex exploitation (Liana, 2017). In 2016, data revealed by the United Nations General Assembly showed that close to 40 million people taken against their will to different locations faced sexual exploitation (United Nations, 2016). The International Labor Organization (ILO, 2017) published a similar story confirming that in 2016, approximately 152 million children ages 5 to 17 were taken into forced labor. Of all these figures, ILO researchers showed new estimates which indicated that women and girls were the most affected, accounting for almost 29 million or 71% of the overall total.

The number of Nigerian victims of sex trafficking has continued to increase, ranking among the highest of any other nation and next to the trafficking of Eastern

European women (Baarda, 2016). The IOM estimated that in 2016, trafficked Nigerian women accounted for approximately 80% of the 11,009 Nigerian women registered at the landing port in Sicily, Italy and that they would go on to live a life of forced prostitution in Italy and other parts of Europe.

The IOM figure doubled from that of 2015 when 5,600 registered as women sex slaves. In 2016 the number of victims represented an almost eightfold increase from 2014, when 1,454 registered Nigerian women landed at the port (IOM, 2017). Out of 180,000 migrants arriving in Italy by the sea in 2016, 37,500 were Nigerian women and children (Ezeh, 2017; Kelly, 2017).

My trip to Lampedusa in the region of Sicily, Italy, to see the landing port referred to by researchers gave an insight into previous research on the sex trafficking of Nigerian women. It also provided me with a better understanding of the port of disembarkation of some victims that would have gone from Ogwa to Italy.

The United Nations (UN, 2017) reported that the sexual exploitation of girls is increasingly on the rise in Nigeria. This trade-in of humans often involves minors who have already experienced trauma on their journey to Europe. NAPTIP affirmed the UN's statement by pointing out that the human trafficking industry in Nigeria involves in the trafficking of young women and girls for sexual exploitation.

Ezeh, (2017) described how traffickers have a structured criminal gang at different locations that act as intermediaries. These different organized groups constitute the agents, recruiters, transporters of the victims. Some of them take care of the victims kept in deplorable conditions. The agents may be strangers or relatives of victims who do

not consider themselves as traffickers. Some of them do not know the intricacies involved in convincing their victim to embark on the journey (Abiodun, George, Amadi, Oladipo, & Iluno, 2017). The agents collaborate with transporters, receivers, pimps, and brothel-keepers (Ezeh, 2017; UNESCO, 2006).

In 2003, the Nigerian government created the NAPTIP Act No. 24 of 2003. NAPTIP is a bill sponsored at the National Assembly by the Women Trafficking and Child Labor Eradication Foundation (WOTCLEF). WOTCLEF is a not-for-profit organization. Because of new crime patterns of trafficking in persons and the need to further strengthen the institutional framework in 2015, it prompted the repeal of the Act. Thus, the Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition), Enforcement and Administration Act, 2015 was enacted. The Act criminalizes and prosecutes traffickers. The agency staff apprehends, investigates, and prosecutes offenders.

The government organized various training for staff and law enforcement agents across the nation on the identification of the Act of trafficking (Government of Nigeria, 2015). The agency also adopted intervention strategies needed when they come across any incident of trafficking. The victims are given different assistance from the various departments set up by the federal agency designated to help protect their rights and secure their freedom and future (Government of Nigeria, 2015). Besides enacting laws, the government made efforts to enforce policies to address the problem, including putting in place some preventive strategies (Edo State Government, 2019). The enactment of the NAPTIP/Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition), Enforcement and Administration Act assisted in the fight against trafficking for sexual exploitation in Nigeria (Ezeh, 2017).

Researchers have reported that in Edo State, acts of trafficking take place while children engage their services as domestic helpers, street beggars, and at quarrying gravel sites (Pathfinders Justice Initiative, 2018). The venues such as these make it easy for traffickers to get access to their victims, thus contributing to the high rate of trafficking activity. Governor Obaseki initiated the services for victims of trafficking located at the capital city Benin (Government of Edo State, 2018). Due to the strategic position of Benin as the capital city, perpetrators were apprehended and prosecuted.

However, sex trafficking goes on unabated in the rural areas, including Ogwa. In the 1980s, most of the victims came from Edo and Delta States (Eze, 2017). However, with pressure from government antitrafficking campaigns, traffickers have restructured by moving away from urban centers to rural areas of the country. There are reported cases of recruitment from the other southern states of Nigeria, such as Imo, Enugu, Lagos, Ogun, Anambra, and Akwa-Ibom (ILO, 2017). Young recruited women and girls come from villages such as the Ogwa community in Edo State. The traffickers use different methods which include abduction, coercion, and pressure to recruit their victims (Abiodun et al., 2017). They also pressure family members who convince the parents that taking their children would help ease their burden (Iyanda & Nwogwugwu, 2016).

In 2003, the commissioner of police in Ogun State, Nigeria, ordered surveillance at the borders, which led to the arrest of nineteen women and ten men on their way to Italy through a border country called Benin-Republic (Daga, 2005). Other preferred routes are Guinea, Sahara Desert, and North African countries (Kelly, 2017). The traffickers have agents who transport their victims from one country to the other, forming

sophisticated criminal ring between Nigeria, the Middle East, and Europe (Government of Nigeria, 2015).

In 2000, NAPTIP reported that Nigeria and Italy signed a bilateral agreement to rescue victims from Italy in a way that respects their rights and dignity. The victims are returned to Lagos, Nigeria, where they stay at the shelter established by the Nigerian government. However, these unequipped shelters cannot handle cases of sex trafficked victims. Because of the stigma and rejection experienced by these women, coupled with inadequate social, emotional, psychological care, the women tend to leave these shelters (Domoney, Howard, Abas, Broadbent, & Oram, 2015).

Therefore, it is evident that the risk factors for mental disorder among female trafficked survivors are due to lower levels of social support. Researchers have indicated that depression and posttraumatic disorder is a result of ongoing social stressors, which can exacerbate and perpetuate symptoms (Domoney et al., 2015). The experience of trauma distorts a person's memory and may affect the individual's ability to recall times, details, or the sequence of events.

In another study, researchers disclosed that depression, posttraumatic stress disorder, and anxiety are some of the mental health issues associated with victims of human trafficking (Abas, Ostrovshi, Prince, Trigub, & Oram, 2013). Gerassi (2017) concurred that sex trafficking could lead to devastating mental and health problems. The consequences of a mental breakdown may result in substance abuse, trauma, and depression, and other sexually transmitted diseases.

The existing social services for victims are located in Benin, the capital of Edo State. One of the best facilities was established in Benin for victims by the Catholic Religious Women Association in collaboration with the Catholic Bishops of Nigeria. The association is known as the Committee for the Support of the Dignity of Women (COSUDOW). It was established in 1999 to provide shelter and rehabilitative services to sex trafficked victims.

COSUDOW offers services such as the provision of vocational training, skills acquisition, and payment of educational expenses for those of school age. They conduct awareness education for families and youths on the dangers of sex trafficking (Ezeh, 2017). The caregivers for sex trafficked victims with trauma and mental illness often disclose their need for not only social support but financial need (Domoney et al., 2015). They also express the need of victims for psychological support through counseling because they face stigma and shame from their communities (Department of Public Safety Canada, 2013). However, these services are nonexistent in the rural areas to enable deported victims to integrate into their environment.

The government of Edo State passed a bill in 2018, which replaced the existing enacted bill of 2000 (Criminal Code [Amendment] Law, 2000 [Section 223A]). This bill criminalized trafficking of citizens for any form of exploitation (Pathfinders Justice Initiative, 2018). The law was enforced with impunity and imposed harsh punishment for perpetrators. Some of the harsher punishments include the prescription of a minimum penalty of five years imprisonment and a fine of 1 million Naira (the equivalent of \$10,000) for sex and labor trafficking offenses. The minimum sentence in the case of

trafficking of a child is seven years in prison. Although the punishment is not as stringent as expected, the new law is a step further in the right direction for Edo State. If the government combines the code with effective advocacy and political will, it should help to stem the scourge of human trafficking for sexual exploitation.

The first conviction secured by NAPTIP in 2004 was from Edo State, bringing the estimated traffickers to 47 percent of convicted traffickers, all of whom are of Edo State origin (Government of Edo State 2018). The state government planned to rehabilitate victims through the provision of education. As stated by the governor of Edo State, most of the deported migrants and trafficked persons are of low academic levels. The governor insisted that equipping the victims with better education and skills would enhance their orientations and lifestyle (Government of Edo State 2018).

However, the central government primarily drives all the strategic plans but lacks effective implementation and a participatory approach in finding a solution to the problem. This study, therefore, addressed the gap in research by exploring an understanding of the perspective of parents on existing policies on sex trafficking in Ogwa. In this way, parents' input may assist in formulating effective strategies for the prevention of sex trafficking in the Ogwa community.

Problem Statement

Sex trafficking is a form of slavery and a human rights issue that transcends national boundaries and has become a critical problem for the global community (Domingues da Silva, 2017; Elechi & Ngwe, 2012; Ross-Sheriff, 2015). The leaders around the world have made efforts to combat sex trafficking, but not enough to contain

the problem. The ILO has estimated that four million people are held globally in forced sexual exploitation (Polaris, 2018). Some efforts to stop further victimization of women through sexual slavery include antitrafficking campaigns to educate the population on the dangers of the trade. Other measures to halt sex trafficking include the implementation of programs such as setting up of task force to police, arresting perpetrators, and rescuing victims.

Nigeria has been a leader in Africa in addressing the problem of sex trafficking with the creation of the NAPTIP of 2003 (Osezua, 2016). This Act was amended in 2004 to allow not-for-profit organizations and volunteers to receive remuneration for reporting cases of sex trafficking to enable them to effectively do the work (Abiodun, George, Amadi, Oladipo, & Iluno, 2017).

However, sex trafficking remains a problem in mainly rural areas where people are less educated, more impoverished, and lack essential facilities. In these rural parts of the country, which are more accessible through border states, traffickers take advantage of the loopholes. The Ogwa community in Edo State is a rural village, with little or no infrastructure and has a high prevalence of reported sex trafficking cases. Both government and nongovernment organizations have contributed in setting up educational campaigns and the Youth Employment Scheme. The goal of this organization is to engage especially young women so that they can be discouraged from being coerced into the sex trade.

Despite the various interventions and government legislation, the phenomenon of sex trafficking still poses a challenge and persists in Ogwa and surrounding communities

in Edo State (Abiodun et al., 2017). Of the many programs initiated by the government of Edo State, none has sought to understand the prevention of sex trafficking from the community's viewpoint.

The review of available literature on existing programs embarked by the government disclosed no information regarding the contribution of the rural population. There is a lack of collaboration with especially parents as influential actors in developing valuable strategies to combat the scourge of sex trafficking in the Ogwa community. Asha, Belete, and Moyo (2016) described the need for inclusiveness in major critical issues facing communities. They emphasized the partnership between government, not-for-profit, and local community members as a relevant tool to encourage community participation (Asha, Belete, Moyo, 2016). The researchers asserted the need for community involvement in the design, delivery of services, and community development (Asha, Belete, & Moyo, 2016). Tsiga, Hofisi, and Mago (2016) concurred by stating that for government and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) to attain sustainable development, it is imperative to employ effective participatory methodologies. These methodologies can provide knowledge to community members and empower them to take the responsibility to engage in the planning and implementation of activities for the development of their communities.

Community involvement is, therefore, critical to sustainable development. Community participation has proven to be beneficial because it instills creative ways in typically excluded people from local planning and design processes on issues affecting

them and, in this way, generating possible suggestions and solutions that may reduce poverty (Amy, 2017; Mak, Cheung, & Hui, 2017).

Therefore, the goal of this research was to understand the perception of parents on existing policies on the prevention of sex trafficking in Ogwa community and how their input as influential actors in the community can impact policy outcomes.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to understand the perceptions of parents on sex trafficking policies and their observations of existing programs in the Ogwa community, Edo-State, Nigeria. Currently, Edo State policies and programs geared towards combating sex trafficking are top-down (centralized) in approach. There has been limited or no research conducted to explore how parents' perspectives impact policy outcomes on the prevention of sex trafficking.

Because of the identified gap in the literature, I adopted a qualitative narrative research method in this study. The intent of this study was to develop an understanding of parents' opinions on existing policies on sex trafficking, hence I used individual semistructured interviews, observations, and field notes. I also enabled participants to explore policy implementation and their observations of the reality of program implementation in the rural Ogwa community.

Research Question

The overarching research question that guided this study was: How do parents of girls and women (aged 13-21) experience the threat (and the reality) of sex trafficking in Ogwa?

In order to answer this question, I explored two of the following subquestions:

What do parents of girls and women in the (aged 13-21) think of the implementation of existing laws and policies against sex trafficking in Ogwa?

How can the parents' stories affect a positive social change on sex trafficking in Ogwa?

Theoretical Framework

Narrative policy framework (NPF) is for researchers to highlight the need for stakeholder participation in policymaking process. The synopsis of this theory is discussed in this section and is further explained in detail in Chapter 2.

Narrative Policy Framework (NPF)

The theoretical base for this study was Jones and McBeth's (2010) narrative policy framework. Macbeth, Jones, and Shanahan, (2014) stated that NPF addressed narrative as the key mechanism in the policy process, given that humans, by their nature, are storytellers. Jones and McBeth's theory have been extensively used in the policy narrative process to influence the framing of policy problems and shape policy beliefs. The basis for NPF's approach is on the premise that if stories are essential, they must play a vital role in groups. Moreover, it can create collective action to engage these groups in policy processes, outcomes, implementation, and design of public policy (Borland, McDonald, O'Leary, & Stockwell, 2017; Gray & Jones, 2016). In this way, it can become a useful lens through which to explore parents' narrative and to help answer the research question.

Hence, I applied Jones and McBeth's (2010) theory to offer guidance on ways to facilitate the understanding of parents' experiential accounts. There was an expectation that parents' story would differ from the main policy narrative on the prevention of sex trafficking developed by the central government. Because the story of the parents differs, their insights help to illuminate the value and meaning of the existing policy. The knowledge acquired from the participants indicated the required action for improvement that may have the potential to prevent future program failures (Abma, 1999).

Nature of Study

A qualitative methodology was used to elicit in-depth and rich information for this study. I studied the perspective of parents on the reality of government application of existing policies that target the prevention of sex trafficking in Ogwa. Qualitative research encourages respondents within their setting to generate new theories and ideas that can assist in redesigning programs. Hence, it is believed that qualitative research used in this study may provide information for the formulation and implementation of community-centered policy on the prevention of sex trafficking (Konneh, 2017).

The qualitative narrative inquiry research design was used in this study because it was useful in the understanding of the subjective experience and daily life encounters of participants. I was able to explore, analyze, and interpret the constructs and meaning that human beings attach to their experiences. Interviews and observations revealed those meanings as the participants saw them (Patton, 2015). In this way, I was able to connect with the people in their environment as I sought to gain insight and put in context

participants' verbal and nonverbal means of communicating the information (Creswell, 2016).

In this study, I adopted a face-to-face semistructured interview with one of the principal actors: The parents who were indirectly affected by the problem of sex trafficking. The information provided the tool needed to ascertain the practical experience of those who are indirectly impacted by the phenomenon of sex trafficking. The perception and feelings of the participants about policies on sex trafficking were explored, including effective best policy practices that they could recommend for the alleviation of the problem.

I also used manual coding of the data collected from the participants. The analyzed data emerged into themes and categories, which were examined and interpreted using NVivo 11 software to obtain a detailed perspective on the same data set (Saldana, 2016).

Definition of Terms

Agent: A person who does business for another person by acting on behalf of him/her. The agent may indulge in the transfer of trafficked individuals or obtain secret information about a person, another country, or a government (Merriam Dictionary, 2014).

Coercion: Coercion refers to the act of persuading or convincing someone to do something using force or other unethical means (Polaris, 2018).

Community participation: Community participation in the context of development is the recognition of community skills. It entails the involvement of people by

government/NGO in the solution of the problem that threatens community's well-being, dignity, and integrity (Arnstein, 1969; Claridge, 2004; Day, 1997; Hatley, 2013).

Community participation as NGOs have been an approach advocating for local people (beneficiaries) to be among other stakeholders in decision-making when designing development strategies (Tsigas, Hofisi, & Mago, 2016).

Clients: These are predominantly men ages 18 to 85 who purchase sex with money from either minors or adults (Bach & Litam, 2017).

Exploitation: An individual who unjustly benefits from another person's labor. It includes at a minimum the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude, or the removal of organs for sale (UNODC, 2019).

Human trafficking: A form of modern-day slavery in which traffickers take victims without consent through the use of force, fraud, or coercion to control victims (Polaris, 2018). Article 3, paragraph (a) of the United Nations Protocol to prevent, suppress, and punish trafficking in persons defines trafficking in persons as the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation (United Nations on Drug and Crime, 2018).

Madams: A term used to describe former trafficked sex workers who have moved on and created their establishments that recruit and employ other women (Arjan, Meshkovska, Siegel, & Stutterheim, 2015).

Nongovernment organization (NGO): Nongovernmental organizations are commonly referred to as NGOs in Nigeria. In the US they are called not-for-profit organizations. They are sometimes international organizations independent of government control. In the U.S. context, designated NGOs are 501(C) organizations that operate within the mandate of the U.S. internal revenue code. This status provides exemption of the organization from the payment of federal, state or local taxes (Portney & Cuttler, 2010).

Organized crime: Considered to be a systematized method of engaging in various crimes by a group of people who have a common goal and ideology. (United Nations on Drug and Crime, 2018).

Pimp: One who controls the sex slaves by taking some of their earnings while soliciting clients for them (Williamson & Cluse-Tolar, 2002).

Sex trafficking: This is a particularly degrading form of human trafficking, defined generally as recruiting, enticing, harboring, and transporting of victim. The victims are obtained either as an adult or a juvenile.

1. An adult is trafficked for commercial sex by force, fraud or coercion.
2. A juvenile for commercial sex, regardless of the means. (Moossy, 2009).

Sexual trafficking goes on in a wide variety of venues within the sex industry, including residential brothels, escort services, fake massage businesses, strip clubs, and street prostitution (Polaris, 2018).

Stakeholder: All of the people who have something to lose or gain by the actions and activities of an organization or group (Preskill & Jones, 2009)

Trafficker: The exploiters of human trafficking include a wide range of criminals and criminal enterprises that organize, implement, and profit from trafficking human beings. Traffickers often rely on enablers to conduct their business: Individuals and entities both legal and illegal that provide goods and services to exploiters. They make human trafficking possible and profitable (Human Rights First, 2017).

Assumptions, Limitations, Scope, and Delimitations

Assumptions

Assumptions are crucial to help set the stage for research and have the potential to guide the research process. I assumed that that the participants responded truthfully to my research question as recommended by (Simon, 2011). These assumptions cannot be proven and are beyond my control (Simon & Goes, 2013). Therefore, there are several assumptions of this study. A general assumption to make regarding sex trafficking is that despite considerable efforts to combat the problem, the magnitude of the problem is on the rise (Efrat, 2016; Orme & Ross-Sheriff, 2015).

Sex trafficking is a clandestine transnational trade and trying to achieve accurate data proves an elusive venture. Researchers' estimates put the total profit made by international traffickers at \$9 billion, and this is one of the fastest-growing international crimes (United Nations, 2018).

The priests of the African traditional religion (ATR) play a significant role in the Nigerian context as independent enforcers of the contract between the victim and the trafficker. The ATR is an ancient belief system in ancestral spirits as mediators to the Supreme God who can bring justice and fairness to individuals who are in dispute with one another over any form of contract. The traffickers have capitalized on the ancestral belief spirit to settle disputes and punish individuals for not going by the terms of the agreement to exploit the trafficked. The traffickers and the ATR priests use coercive mechanisms to manipulate and instill fear in victims of impending punishment by the ancestors if they reveal the identity of their trafficker or fail to repay loan (Baarda, 2016).

An assumption that recent reports pointed out is that the majority of antisex trafficking interventions focus mainly on criminalization policies that track the traffickers or purchasers of sex services (Orme & Ross-Sheriff, 2015). According to the research produced within the framework of United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNICRI) pilot project, young women and minors from surrounding communities in Edo State of Nigeria, such as Ogwa, constitute the majority of trafficked persons for sexual exploitation (Domingues da Silva, 2017; Ezeh, 2017; ILO, 2017).

Some of the root causes of the problem, as identified in the report of the World Health Organization (WHO) of 2017, such as gender discrimination, violence against

women, and subjugation of women, have unfortunately persisted (WHO, 2017).

Aibangbe (2015) asserted that girl-child trafficking continues to be a hindrance to girl-child educational advancement. Both federal and state governments have formulated various programs to address the phenomenon of sex trafficking. But the intervention has remained a top-down, centralized approach (Domingues da Silva, 2017). There is an assumption that convicted perpetrators are few due to fear and a lack of victim cooperation to identify their traffickers. The fear of traffickers persists because traffickers threaten victims' family members in their home countries.

However, my philosophical assumption is underpinned in my belief that the public and people with authority need to treat the poor and vulnerable members of society with respect and dignity. Because of this understanding, anyone who embarks on a qualitative study needs to collaborate with participants. In addition, the researcher ought to respect the rights of individuals to express their opinion on the issue investigated. In the context of this research, I involved and respected people's opinions through encouraging participants (parents) to reflect on what they know about sexual exploitation. In this way, the parents may provide insight on how to contribute to effective policies that can help solve the problem of human trafficking at the grassroots level. This understanding is at the heart of my world view.

Hence, the recognition of the participants (parents) and the researcher as an instrument in the research process is the epistemological and ontological assumption of this study. Therefore, together, both can find ways to know and confirm what they know about sex trafficking as they explore the reality of this situation. Burkholder, Cox, and

Crawford (2016) emphasized the importance of examining a research topic with facts, observation, understanding the context, and documenting the experiences of participants, which is verifiable (Crawford, 2016).

For the purpose of a verifiable experience, constructivist approach was used appropriate for this research. The constructivist philosophical paradigm as an approach asserts that individuals and community can construct their understanding and knowledge of the world. People do this by experiencing things and take some time to reflect on those experiences. The basis of a constructivist analogy is the understanding that individuals form much of what they know through experiential learning (Haydon, Browne, & VanderRiet, 2017). I learned more on the epic method of epistemology in gathering qualitative data that helped me to design research methods. This learning assisted me in answering the research question to elicit the best result of ways to tackle the problem of sex trafficking in the Ogwa community.

Hence, I decided to use narrative inquiry methodology. By using this methodology, the parents told their stories in a way that helped me to understand their experience of sex trafficking and existing policies designed to tackle the phenomenon.

Scope and Delimitations

Scope in qualitative research defines the extent of the study. Delimitations refer to what the researcher has control of, and this can be determined by how boundaries are set. The study could be limited to the investigation of specific geographical location, gender, age, population, and the size of study sample (Bloomberg & Volpe, 2012). The scope of the study describes what issue will be analyzed and establishes the parameters to be used

(Creswell, 2013; Simon & Goes, 2013). The problem needs to fit specific parameters. To meet the criteria for scope and parameters, this research was conducted on the Ogwa community. For this reason, the interviewees were indigenes of this community. I delimited this study to the investigation of the perspective of parents on existing policies/programs and their reflection on effective preventive policy strategies for sex trafficking in the Ogwa community. I decided not to interview victims due to their already traumatized state and to avoid pressuring them into retelling their story. Reliving their experience through an interview process may bring up possibly healed traumatic experiences.

Although this was a narrative-based study, I focused on the story of parents' experiences as they related to the existing programs and what contribution they can make to effect positive social change. A qualitative research design often uses a small sample size (Creswell, 2013). Hence, with a sample size of 12 parent households, I was able to obtain varied perspectives from the participants on the phenomenon of sex trafficking, which enabled me to collect enough data to reveal crucial research outcomes to answer the research question.

The insights from the study may help further research, and the outcome can be used to address other forms of trafficking. The study outcome could also potentially be applied to other states in Nigeria that are committed to creating an effective and sustainable preventive approach to sex trafficking, thus addressing the socioeconomic problems at the root of demand and supply of girl-children for sexual exploitation in other nations.

Limitations

A limitation is referred to as those circumstances that the researcher cannot control (Brutus, Aguinis, & Wassmer, 2013). Hence, the limitations I foresaw in this study were that parents may be hindered from being open about the research process because of the traumatizing nature of the problem as it may affect their relatives. Another limitation that I encountered was the nature of the parents' occupation. Because most of them were subsistence farmers who had little or no time to engage in the interview process, the time that I intended to conduct the interview interfered with parents farming schedule.

One of the potential strategies that I used to address this limitation was to hold a face-to-face meeting with participants in the evening hours of the day, when they had come back from their farms. This approach helped me to obtain more participants who explored the issue in detail. The timing was appropriate because farmers were back from their farms in the evenings and rested to engage in the interview process. In this way, there was a visual interaction with them that provided me with the opportunity to stop any embarrassing or upsetting question on observation. I did not have control over how participants chose to respond to the interview questions. Respondents wanted to answer the question based on what they thought I would like to hear. However, an emphasis on being honest with their answers helped them to remain open.

The methodological weakness that I encountered was the validity threat that arose in narrative inquiry research. This was because the participants' stories left out or obscured aspects of the meaning of experiences that they were telling about their

experience (Mitchel & Egudo, 2003) of the government's preventive intervention of sex trafficking. However, readers should be able to follow the presented evidence and arguments enough to make their own judgment as to the relative validity of the claim. To eliminate this challenge, I spent time to establish rapport with participants and assured them of the confidentiality of their information.

To eliminate my bias over participants' responses to the posed question, I read and reviewed the interview notes with objectivity, which enabled me to understand and represent their experience of the phenomenon as it affected the community, with no preconceived notion from my bias. Another way that I addressed my personal bias was to prepare the interview and follow-up questions from an objective stance.

A conscious decision made to address bias was to be respectful in my tone of voice in communicating with participants. The respectful stance was necessary as a demonstration of an open-minded attitude to learn and to document participants' words. This also encouraged parents to uncover their life experiences and opinions and helped to provide a more balanced and credible qualitative narrative inquiry into parents' perspective on ways to prevent sex trafficking in the Ogwa community.

In Chapter three, I explain in detail how I controlled my biases. A researcher's ability to be transparent in reflecting on their biases is an essential tool that can help in understanding the interview process and impact on study validity.

Significance of the Study

The current strategies to combat sex trafficking that were initiated by key government officials responsible for decision making came about as a result of an

understanding of the scourge of sex trafficking and the need to address the problem. Some of these policies and programs include setting up an antitrafficking campaign to educate people and the deployment of law enforcement officers to apprehend traffickers and rescue their victims.

However, the intervention policies to address the phenomenon in the Ogwa community had been a centralized approach that did not harness the expertise of the local people (Chirenje, Giliba, & Musamba, 2012). Researching on this study, therefore, may help to raise awareness among government agencies regarding the effectiveness of existing sex trafficking policies. It may provide an insight to policymakers on what is lacking, critique existing systems, and assess the need for community-based program implementation on solving the problem of sex trafficking in the Ogwa community.

The implication for social change includes the community's motivation to use their voice to challenge local authority. The study outcome may provide useful knowledge to the government, not-for-profit agencies, law enforcement, and policymakers on the formulation of a more effective collaborative approach to sex trafficking prevention policies. It may also build on the body of knowledge on literature to explore community participation in the eradication of not only sexual exploitation as one form of human trafficking but also all other forms of trafficking used by globally organized criminals to exploit their victims. This study may motivate researchers to further explore the concept of community participation as an essential component in the investigation of trafficking.

Because communities have useful locally organized structures with centuries of history of addressing their problems (Kamruzzaman, 2013) governments can tap into their expertise to gain more sustainable insight into combating this global phenomenon.

Summary

In this Chapter, I presented sex trafficking as a global phenomenon that affects many and is increasing with no sign of abating. The demand and supply chain persist because sex trafficking is a high profit with low-risk trade. Hence, billions of people are apprehended annually. There have been efforts at the national and international level to combat the problem, but it is difficult to control it due to its private and organized nature. The Edo State government has made various attempts to address the issue, but their intervention had been mostly a centralized (top-down) approach in Ogwa. The Ogwa community is an easy target for traffickers because it is easily accessible through the Atlantic Ocean.

The theoretical framework incorporating NPF was used to offer insight into the need for parents' participation in telling their story about the existing approach to policy and program intervention on sex trafficking. I concluded this chapter with a discussion on research study relevance and why parents' involvement is crucial in achieving effective policy implementation goals and ultimately maximizing positive social change in the Ogwa community.

In Chapter two, I discuss the literature regarding collaborative government approach with the community in the fight against sex trafficking. I explain the dynamics that provide effective ways to partner with the parents in addressing the phenomenon.

This chapter addresses the gap in the literature on the topic of exploring parents' perspective as valuable stakeholders. I describe how parents can be engaged in policy analysis and development. In this way, some insight could be gained into ways that policies and procedures can contribute to sustainable prevention strategies to address sex trafficking.

Chapter 2: Literature Review

Introduction

There has been extensive research and analysis on sex trafficking and the exploitation of victims that remains an epidemic despite being the subject of international criminal law since the early 20th Century (Konneh, 2017; Worden, 2018). Studies disclosed that sex trafficking is the second largest illegal industry in the world, with an estimated earning of 32 billion dollars (Polaris, 2014; Sukach, Castaneda, & Pickens, 2018). Hence, it has proven a challenge to the global community due to globalization and the hidden nature of this trade. Sex trafficking affects persons of all races, ethnicities, genders, ages, educational levels, and geographic locations. The victims can be forced, kidnapped, coerced, or drugged to remain in the trafficker's custody as a sex slave (Ezeh, 2017).

Both Nigerian and international researchers have published various reports on sex trafficking not only as a global challenge (United Nations, 2018), but also how it has continued to ravage especially the most hard-hit rural communities of Edo State, Nigeria, including the Ogwa community (Ezeh, 2017; United Nations, 2018). In 2017, the drowning of 200 trafficked Nigerian women and girl-children whose bodies were washed off the coast of Lampedusa in the region of Sicily, Italy made a global headline (Kelly, 2017). I had the opportunity to travel to the island of Lampedusa to see the location where these trafficked victims were pulled out from the sea.

The review of the literature disclosed that researchers had likened all forms of human trafficking, including sexual exploitation of a predominantly vulnerable

population, to the Trans-Atlantic slave trade of the early 1800s (Domingues da Silva, 2017). Domingues da Silva (2017) described how the slave traders bought the slaves and took them across the Atlantic Ocean to the new world. Researchers stated that in the contemporary time, in the early 20th Century, the trade progressed to the use of especially females for sexual exploitation (Abiodun et al., 2017).

Since the adoption of the Palermo UN Protocol against Trafficking in Persons, a supplement of the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime has been ratified by approximately 147 countries (United Nations, 2002,). The United Nations researchers have embarked on a global extensive study on ensuring that states implement the "3P" (Prosecute, Protect, and Prevent) paradigm enshrined in the instrument (United Nations, 2017).

However, there has been little or no research on the participation of the community in seeking a sustainable approach to the prevention and elimination of human trafficking for sexual exploitation. The reason for the need to conduct this study on community involvement to address this phenomenon was because the young trafficked girls and women used for commercial sex exploitation and their traffickers are from various communities (Barnert et al., 2017) where they are part of the cultural structure of the people. In the Nigerian context, for instance, young women are forced to loan repayment by binding them psychologically to African religious rituals, which has been used negatively to instill fear in victims (Baarda, 2016). Some of the traffickers from the same community as their victim exhibit behaviors such as control and make promises that

seem too good to be true (Ikeora, 2016). They force victims to engage in illegal acts to achieve their aim (Shared Hope International, 2017).

Therefore, one of the things the victims and perpetrators of trafficking sometimes have in common is their membership to the same communities across the globe. Based on the common factor of community affiliation, therefore, there is a connection between the laws enacted by the government to address policies on preventing sex trafficking and public interest/cooperation in the implementation of programs that will impact their lives. As Mapuva (2015) stated, community participation entails providing opportunities to individuals and the community to become actively engaged from the decision-making process to public organization for action to address their problems.

Over the years, governments and organizations have made concerted efforts to combat the issue of trafficking for sexual exploitation. They have strategized on various ways to address the problem so that vulnerable people can live with dignity and have their rights respected. They have done this by addressing some social issues that are predisposing factors to trafficking.

The efforts of governments and NGOs include developing the meaning of sex trafficking so that laws can be enacted to provide deterrent punishments that match the severity of the committed crime (United Nations on Drug and Crime, 2018).

For instance, the Nigerian government repealed the Trafficking in Persons (TIP) Prohibition, law enforcement, and Administration Act of 2013, amended the TIP (Prohibition) Law Enforcement and Administration Act of 2005, and later enacted a new

law: the TIP Act of 2015. These are significant legislative interventions to address the phenomenon of human trafficking for sexual exploitation (UNHCR, 2018).

Although the Nigerian government has made a significant effort to eradicate sex trafficking, the intervention has remained a centralized approach (Shelley, 2016). The program planning, implementation and evaluation of projects on sex prevention of trafficking have lacked community involvement. Hence, the purpose of this chapter is to review literature that explicitly focuses on the community as important players in effective policy development. This is because they are an important voice in the government policy decision-making process and in the implementation of strategies that target the prevention of sex trafficking in Ogwa.

Because I used a qualitative narrative method design, the NPF was the appropriate theory relevant to contribute to the discussion on collaboration between the community and government social agency. The theory highlights the dynamics such as the importance of story-telling that was crucial to this study.

The discussion in Chapter two begins with the presentation of the literature search strategy databases, search engines used to explore this topic, and the key search terms. I then shift the discussion to focus on the theoretical foundation for this research study, namely: NPF and further suggests strategies that can lead to the annihilation of sex trafficking.

Literature Search Strategy

The databases used to research information on sex trafficking include Academic Search, Complete, Sage Premiere, Google scholar, Criminal Justice Database,

MEDLINE, PubMed, ProQuest Central, Public Policy and Administration database, and EBSCOhost. Additional searches were used to conduct studies on Nigerian government documents on sex trafficking. Some useful information could be located using already identified journal articles. The key search terms used were *sex trafficking, community participation, stakeholder policy process, child trafficking, sex slavery, trafficking in persons, human exploitation, human trafficking, modern day slavery, women trafficking, and forced labor.*

Other used key terms included *statistics on sex trafficking, mental health of trafficked victims, social services, Nigerian policy on sex trafficking, narrative policy framework, and participatory policy analysis.* The data search limiters employed strictly searched peer-reviewed journals and scholarly journal published within 5 years of the publication of this study. Hence, I sought materials and articles published from the year 2016 through 2019, except for seminal works. My overall broad range search strategy yielded relevant articles that were used to develop an evidence-based literature review, which shaped this study.

The literature review in this section is organized as follows: the discussion on the NPF, which was the theoretical foundation of the study; and two subsections of sex trafficking, definition of sex trafficking/studies conducted on sex trafficking by researchers and current statistics on sex trafficking. I present Nigerian policy implementation in the following subsections: policies and efforts to eradicate sex trafficking in Nigeria, Edo State's policy on sex trafficking, and the Trafficking in Persons Law Enforcement and Administration Act of 2015. I explain the nature of sex

trafficking and highlight the profile of victims, traffickers, and clients, media influence on sex trafficking, services needed for victims of sex trafficking to live a quality life, and the need for stakeholder participation in policy process.

Theoretical Foundation

The theoretical framework for this research study relied on the NPF. This theory provided perspective on how parents' stories and analysis of existing policies and procedures on the prevention of sex trafficking can impact policy reform. There is a detailed description of NPF to make the connection with the topic of the research study.

Narrative Policy Framework (NPF)

Jones and McBeth (2010) developed the NPF as a critical component in the policy process. This framework encompassed the idea of policy narrative to enable the participation of those affected by policy to tell the story of their experience. The people affected by a problem tell their story within the context of government policy, and they get an opportunity to think beyond the conventional way of policymaking and to shape the nature of government centralized policy narrative (Jones & McBeth, 2010). Jones and McBeth argued that policy narratives influence politics. The researchers reiterated that NPF has a significant impact on policy debate and development of policy, having recognized that other people besides policymakers play a role in shaping policies (Jones & McBeth, 2010).

The assumption of proponents of the policy narrative is that NPF is appropriate and is based on the concept that policy narrative is central to policy process, operates at various levels of analysis, and is generated by different political actors, and that through

these levels of policy storytellers, beliefs are formulated and transformed into policies and programs (Jones & McBeth, 2010). Some examples abound on the use of NPF to clarify procedures.

Borland et al. (2017) used NPF in exploring the claims about vapor devices (e-cigarette regulation) that have been taken up in the state arena. As at the time of this research, no study had been conducted to examine what the accepted claims are about vapor devices in the legislative process. Understanding these claims revealed the government definition of the policy problem of vapor devices legislation. The researchers posed the following questions in their study: What claims about vapor devices have been put forward in the documents recommending or justifying vapor device regulation? How have these claims potentially influenced the outcome in legislation? (Borland et al., 2017). This study affirms the use of NPF in helping to engage groups in policy process as this study involved participants in exploring policies on sex trafficking to impact policy outcome.

There was also an application of qualitative narrative policy framework in the examination of the policy narratives of US campaign finance regulatory reform of the Public Policy and Administration. The researchers affirmed that narrative policy framework is at the hub of a successful creation of groups which can become active actors in policy process of designing and implementation of public policy (Gray & Jones, 2016). In adopting the theory of NPF, the authors identified that the purpose of policy narratives is persuasion (Weible & Schlager, 2014) to influence the framing of a policy problem and shape policy beliefs (Pierce, Smith-Walter, & Peterson, 2014).

Other researchers found that the importance and application of narrative in public policy abound in various academic disciplines. Marketing researchers showed that narrative advertising techniques are more persuasive than other methods such as price point advertising (Mattila, 2000). An example of this form of persuasive style of advertising is explained by (Mattila, 2000). Furthermore, findings in communication and psychology disclosed that the more a person becomes immersed in a story, the more persuasive and compelling the story. Findings in political science also posit that individuals use narrative structures to cognitively organize new information (Schreiner, Appel, Isberner, & Richter, 2018).

The issue of sex trafficking has gained publicity over many decades through media publicity such as national films and crime watch television shows. In addition, the importance attributed to this clandestine organized trade that generates billions of dollars annually has led people to develop an interest in gaining knowledge about the crime of exploitative sex crime (Polaris, 2014). Because sex trafficking is a challenge to the Nigerian legislators, they created a narrative around this problem through the implementation of existing policies and procedures of Trafficking in Persons Act of 2015 adopted by both the Federal and state governments in Nigeria (UNHCR, 2018).

As the Nigerian government recognized that there is a need to address the phenomenon of sex trafficking, thus there is a need for continual political will to explore the narrative of the beneficiaries of the programs that target the prevention of sex trafficking. Thus, the purpose of narrative policy framework in this study was to develop a policy process through the narrative of influential actors: The parents. Previously, Edo

State had no plans or policies in place to address the prevention of sex trafficking until in recent times when the problem escalated with the killing and maiming of their citizens on transit routes through Libya to Italy. The government of Edo State had set up a center called "Idia Renaissance Center." The purpose of the center is to build local capacity and the empowerment of youths' socio-economic status with the needed tools to take control of their future. Hence the Edo State government committed themselves to the federal laws on sex trafficking (Government of Edo State, 2019).

Although the Edo state government have zealously implemented their policies and programs to end sex trafficking, the benefits and intervention strategy models have not trickled down to Ogwa, community. The social services that were created to cater for victims are carried out without the consultation of the local beneficiaries. The narrative policy framework was applied to this study to highlight the need to expedite the policymaking process that will have the ability to harness the knowledge of beneficiaries. In this way, people had the opportunity to tell their story at it relates to policies which may translate into policy reform. Hence, the centralized policy adopted by the state government to address the prevention sex of sex trafficking therefore, formed the basis for exploring of parents' story regarding the impact of these programs on Ogwa community.

McComas and Shanahan (1999) argued that researchers can help to identify the power of narratives in shaping beliefs and actions. Other studies also emphasized the need for a community-based action on program implementation process by using a

narrative theoretical approach, which is beneficial for more useful analysis (George & Selimos, 2018; Varghese, 2017).

Therefore, to further explore information to ascertain why the services are not effective in changing behavior towards sex trafficking in Ogwa community, the relationship between NPF and the proposed research question for this study was essential to re-evaluate existing policies to address future intervention strategies. Thus, an in-depth discussion on some related concepts is useful for better understanding of the phenomenon of sex trafficking.

Literature Review Related to Key Variables and/or Concepts

Sex Trafficking

Sex trafficking constitutes one of the many aspects of human trafficking. Human trafficking for sexual exploitation has existed for centuries through various forms of human trafficking which is considered modern slavery (Abiodun et al., 2017). The trafficked victims experience is paralleled to the Trans-Atlantic slavery of the 1600s and movement of Africans to the so-called new world (Ekong, 2016). There are other identified forms of practiced sexual slavery with the white slave trade of females who worked at the English factory. Presently, millions of children, young women and girls are kidnapped by force or coerced into sexual slavery (Osezua, 2016). An example is the trafficking of Nigerian women and children who are taken across borders to other nations. On investigation, police discovered that the traffickers take their victims through border states and countries (see Figure 1). It shows the trafficking route from Benin city,

capital of Edo State where most of the victims referred to in this study began their journey.



Figure 1. Trafficking trail from Nigeria to Europe. Adapted from “The sex trafficking trail from Nigeria to Europe,” By A. Damon, B. Swails, B. Laine, 2018. Copyright 2018 by International Organization for Migration.

The researchers have debated what constitutes sex trafficking because of the understanding of prostitution as an occupation chosen by some women. The Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2013 defines sex trafficking as the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, obtaining, or soliciting of a person (United States Department of State, 2018). The induced person for a commercial sex act is either forced, tricked, coerced to perform sexual act without attaining the age of 18 (United States Department of State, 2018). The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) has a similar

definition of sex trafficking and further reported that in 2010 commercial sex services in Europe provided by women are exclusively consumed by men (United States Department of State, 2018). UNODC also revealed that approximately 1 million women in Europe are abducted and harbored by their traffickers for sexual exploitation, thus, indicating a total of 140,000 victims annually (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2004).

The rationale for UNODC defining the concept of sex trafficking and the stages of movement of victims is to enable the legislative from member nations to formulate their definition. Also, to contextualize their experience of sex trafficking given the myth that prostitutes choose to be engaged in the sex trade and thus not victimized (Niemi & Aaltonen, 2017). The figure on the page highlights the camouflage in the sex trade which counteracts what critics may refer to as voluntary prostitution.



*Figure 2. Camouflage effect in prostitution. Adapted from “Tackling Trafficking by Targeting Sex Buyers: Can it Work?” By J. Niemi; J. Aaltonen, 2017, *Violence Against Women* 23, 1228-1248. doi:10.1177/1077801216657896 Copyright 2016 by SAGE Publications*

Therefore, prostitution has exploitative forms that calls for urgency in prevention and protection of victims, and the reform of the law to address the myth. The UNODC outline of the elements of human trafficking applies to different forms of exploitation including sexual exploitation. The features include acts which involve the process of victim transportation; the means is the way victims are either forced or coerced, and the purpose entails the reason why traffickers take their victims (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2014).

The United Nations plays a leading role in ensuring the eradication of sex trafficking by organizing member nations to sign to a treaty to strategize and prioritize prevention, protection, and prosecution of perpetrators (United Nations on Drug and Crime, 2018). The UN also encourages nation legislators to enact laws, collaborate among each other through resources provision to member nations (United Nations on Drug and Crime, 2018). At the 1995 Beijing Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, there was an emphasis on the need to strengthen the implementation of relevant human rights instruments to eliminate and combat all forms of trafficking (United Nations, 2002).

Some of the recommended tools include international cooperation and organizing of stakeholders to address all forms of trafficking for sexual exploitation, pornography, prostitution, and sex tourism. Also, to provide legal and social services to the victims which includes provision for international cooperation to prosecute and punish those responsible for the systematic exploitation of women and children (United Nations, 2017). Based on the Beijing recommendations, there is an awakening of global consciousness to address the phenomenon of sex trafficking through collaborative efforts. Collaboration is the key that provided support advancement of the "3P". Collaborations at their best should support the advancement of the "3P" paradigm of prevention, protection, and prosecution that was established by the Palermo Protocol and later reinforced in the legislation of member countries (United Nations, 2000). Also, the Trafficking of Victims Protection Act subsequently added "Partnership" as a core concept to the 3 Ps, highlighting the importance of this global framework to address trafficking.

The most recent figures of modern slavery identify that during 2016, 40.3 million people were victims of modern slavery (International Labor Organization, 2017). Of these number, 24.9 million people were forced by traffickers into labor such as construction, agriculture, factories and sexual slavery which is of interest to this study (Human Rights First, 2017). Gender differences in modern slavery are also apparent in that it is more prevalent among women and girls, accounting for 71% or 28.7 million victims (Human Rights First, 2017). However, when it comes to forced labor in the commercial sex industry women and girls equate to 99% of victims, and of this 21% are children (Human Rights First, 2017).

Due to the clandestine nature of sex trafficking, it is difficult to obtain accurate data on the issue due to unreported and underreported cases. ILO reckon that sex trafficking is the second most profitable criminal industry after drug trafficking (International Labor Organization, 2017). ILO estimates \$150 billion earned by traffickers in 2014 alone (International Labor Organization, 2017). This account indicates the alarming increase in the exploitation of victims and the trauma faced they experience in the hands of their traffickers. Further research gives an insight into the problem of sex trafficking.

Existing Studies by Researchers on Sex Trafficking

Sex trafficking (ST) is a contemporary form of slavery that has been in existence for decades. Over 166 countries have adopted various ST legislation (Orme & Ross-Sheriff, 2015). Despite all efforts to eradicate the problem, it continues to increase with mainly male traffickers taking advantage of a vulnerable young female. Because of the

prevalence of this problem, several studies have been conducted to understand traffickers' motivation, the reason for the spread, the health implications of victims and how to protect them. The trafficked girls and women constitute 98% of those for sexual exploitation (Kelly, 2017). Health and safety standards in exploitative settings are generally deficient, and there has been a link to the degree of experienced violence with adverse physical, psychological, and socio-emotional development (Oludele, 2018).

The application of cross-sectional study design by an investigator that utilized interviews and questionnaire admitted that although very little information exists regarding the victims' mental and medical health needs; there are fundamental conditions which are involved in nature that is plaguing victims (Kelly, 2017).

From the literature, I identified common and prevalent mental and medical issues associated with the victim of sex trafficking as well as the complexity of the problem (Goździak & Bump, 2008).

Zimmerman, Hossain, and Watts (2008), in a conducted qualitative study disclosed that approximately 70% of the trafficked victims interviewed for an investigation had over ten concurrent psychological problems. The health and safety of victims remain a challenge for social service providers and advocacy groups because not only that they lack the skills to deal with the situation, but are underfunded (Davy, 2015). Additionally, the lack of accurate data on the number of people victimized further complicates the effort of social service organizations that support victims' rehabilitation and reintegration process (Davy, 2015). Due to the fear of high rate of sexually

transmitted diseases, there is high demand for children virgins by traffickers (Deb, Mukherjee, & Mathews, 2011).

In the case of Nigeria, researchers have reported that majority of young trafficked women and girls who travel to Europe for sexual exploitation are predominately women from Edo, Delta and Ibo tribe (all from Southern Nigeria) (Ezeh, 2017). Although there was no conclusive research on why the victims come from these significant tribes, (Chukwuezi, 2001) reckoned that the Ibos are resourceful and have a history of migration in search of better livelihood. A possible reason attributed to the predominance of Edo and Delta States victims of sex trafficking is poverty. But studies have shown that these states are not the most unfortunate part of the country.

To address the problem of sex trafficking, it is evident from various studies that the National Agency for the Prohibition of Trafficking in Persons (NAPTIP, 2003) has made multiple attempts to launch an educational campaign in different villages throughout the country. The educational programs have been carried out through the use of posters, radio and television adverts, jingles as well as workshops and seminars. The agency's legal and prosecution unit has established an investigation task force that comprised of personnel from the Nigerian Police Force, the Nigeria Immigration Service, National Intelligence Agency and the judiciary.

The perception from literature and politics regarding the proceeds of sex slavery is that it is a profitable business for pimps and other criminal networks. They explicitly restated the claim that trafficking in persons is the third highest profitable business after drug and weapon (United Nations, 2016). The ethnographic fieldwork study conducted

by Nigerian researchers on Nigerian sex trafficked victims in Benin city, Edo State, in 2011 and 2012 established links between the four migration economies of felicitation, remittance, deportation, and rescue (Plambech, 2017). The investigators suggested that there is a need to explore the multifaceted aspect of this problem and make necessary connections that will help to further comprehend the complexity of the phenomenon of sex trafficking (Plambech, 2017).

The gap in research identified throughout the mentioned studies correlates with my intention for this study. My research explored ways to prevent sex trafficking in Ogwa community by understanding the perspective and narrative of parents regarding existing policies and procedures. There was a lack of community involvement in addressing the best practices for combatting sex trafficking and hence no process to measure the effectiveness of existing policies and procedures targeting the phenomenon. Therefore, Edo State government needed to have a mechanism for evaluating progress to formulate community-based strategies to tackle the problem. My research question was therefore crucial for Edo government to recognize the challenges they are faced with, so that they can find ways to overcome those obstacles and invest their efforts productively by adopting a community-based collaborative style to finding ways to prevent sex trafficking in Ogwa.

Statistics on Sex Trafficking

Researchers have extensively explored organized crime of sex trafficking, but the effort to establish accurate statistics on the phenomenon has eluded researchers due to the hidden nature of the problem. Because the traffickers have sophisticated ways of opening

and closing trafficking rings, it makes it difficult to detect most cases (Polaris, 2018). Feminist theorist Jill Dozema (2010) emphasized that sex trafficking is a contested issue which is difficult to quantify. She mentioned a report by the International Organization for Migration (2015) which disclosed confusion in the use of the language of sex trafficking with smuggling or illegal migration. When these two problems (unlawful immigration and migrant prostitutes) are confused, Dozema opined that the issue will create lack of understanding by police and Department of Justice. With this confusion, researchers can lose the figures generated from sex trafficking in some nations who have no trafficking laws (International Organization for Migration, 2015).

Anderson and O'Connell (2002) highlighted the content of the report on international trafficking by the Global Alliance Against Trafficking in Women (GAATW). They stated that data collected by GAATW tend to refer to migrants and domestic sex workers and no information on cases of trafficking (Anderson and O'Connell, 2002). The IOM gave an insight into global reality of trafficking by gender in Africa by disclosing that females are predominantly trafficked for all forms of exploitation. The research found that 71% of victims of modern slavery are women, forced into labor 59%, forced sexual exploitation 99%, and forced marriage 84% (IOM, 2017).

The researchers who compiled the Index showed that modern-day slavery is most prevalent in Africa with 9.24 million slaves and an average vulnerability score of 62/100 (Pathfinders Justice Initiative, 2018). This disclosure highlights the difficulties faced by especially female population who had to endure both economic and cultural burden. And

the policies outlined to address the problem is not an appropriate intervention that harnesses community expertise. Hence, I focused my study approach on the narrative of parents on the prevention of sex trafficking in Ogwa, Edo state, Nigeria. The goal of the study was to understand their analysis of the policies and procedures on the phenomenon, and to explore how the study outcome can shed some light on the scale of the problem of sex trafficking in Ogwa community.

Since the change in governance in Nigeria in 2016, and with the inauguration of President Buhari, there has been no significant documentation of any decrease in the scourge of trafficking in young women and girls for sexual exploitation (United States Department of Justice, 2016). According to the currently released Global Slavery Index (2018), Nigeria ranked 32/167 of the countries with the highest number of slaves at 1,386,000 (NAPTIP, 2018). The National Agency for the Prohibition of Trafficking in Persons reported that the average age of trafficked Nigerian child ranked a Tier 2 Watchlist country on the U.S. State Department's Trafficking in Persons Report (UNHCR, 2018). The government further contended that 75% of victims trafficked within Nigeria are taken across state line, while 23% are trafficked victims within the country (UNHCR, 2018). Only 2% of Nigerian trafficked children crossed the country borders (NAPTIP, 2015).

Sex trafficking is the third most common crime in Nigeria after drug trafficking and economic fraud (UNESCO, 1999). The general factors that increase vulnerability to trafficking in Nigeria include extreme poverty, corruption, internal conflict, terrorism, climate change, migration and western consumerism. Despite NAPTIP annual report on

international trafficking of victims, the total number of Nigerians taking across the Atlantic is mostly unknown. United Nations stated that there is an undisputed fact that the total number of human trafficking victims outside of Nigeria is mostly unknown. Due to Nigeria's population, she is routinely listed by the United Nations with the most significant number of victims trafficked particularly to Europe. In 2017, identified trafficked victims from Nigeria travel to more than 40 countries (United Nations, 2017). The current trend in illegal migration which includes trafficking in persons for sexual exploitation recorded by the former Nigerian Permanent Representative to the United Nations contended that in 2017 alone, approximately 602,000 Nigerians attempted to leave for Europe through the Sahara Desert (United Nations, 2017). Out of this number of people, it is reported that 27,000 of these migrants died enroute (Pathfinders Justice Initiative, 2020). The estimates from various studies placed the total number of Nigerians that arrived in Europe in 2016 at approximately 40,000 and about 18,000 in 2017 (United Nations, 2017).

Although there is no accurate count of Nigerians who were trafficked or sought to migrate voluntarily, however, Nigerians accounted for about 21% of the 181,000 population that took the risking boat journey across the Mediterranean to travel to Italy (Ezeh, 2017). In 2017, the Nigerian Immigration Service reported that no fewer than 10,000 Nigerian women and girls perish crossing both the Sahara Desert and the Mediterranean Sea (Kazeem, 2018). In 2017, 36,512 stranded Nigerians in Niger and Libya claimed that they were either trafficked or are illegal migrants (IOM, 2017). The overwhelming majority of these trafficked victims and illegal migrants who make the

treacherous journey come from Edo State (including Ogwa) and the Delta States to Kano, and then taken through the Sahara Desert to Libya (Kelly, 2017)

The IOM found that out of the number of trafficked victims from Nigeria which increased from 1,454 in 2014 to 11,009 in 2016; 80% of the coerced young women who arrived in Italy from Nigeria will likely go into prostitution as sex trafficked victims (Ezeh, 2017). According to the Italian Immigration Authority, there are approximately between 10,000 to 30,000 Nigerian women and girls who are held as sex slaves and work on the streets of Italy (Pathfinders Justice Initiative, 2018).

There are numerous reports regarding the number of trafficked victims from Nigeria and around the globe. The traffickers lure vulnerable population that is predominantly rural. They are unaware of the existence of the crime and taken under deceitful circumstances (Bello, 2018). However, these facts are precisely the number of identified victims. Most of the victims are either dead or not recognized because there are no witnesses to testify to their fate. The inaccuracy in data continues to cloud the efforts of researchers in documenting an exact number of victims, because traffickers are intelligent at what they do: Closing a trafficking network and starting another one once discovered. Due to inaccuracy in data on victims, it becomes difficult to develop methods of victim recovery services (Bello, 2018).

Other factors that accounted to lack of accuracy in victims count are also lack of collaboration with community members to help determine who left from the community, how and through what route. Thus, there was a little amount of literature that exists regarding retrieving information on sex trafficking from especially rural dwellers from

Ogwa community. Hence, a background discussion on the process of implementing policy is essential to explain the lack of information from the rural communities.

Policies and Initiatives to Prevent Sex Trafficking in Nigeria

Since the 1990s the Federal Republic of Nigeria has made efforts to address the issue of sex trafficking (Ezeh, 2017). In 2003, Nigeria became the first nation in Africa to pass legislation against trafficking in persons for sexual exploitation. In the late 2000s, the government intensified commitment and took various remarkable initiatives to combat human trafficking for sexual exploitation (the predominant form of trafficking in Nigeria). The nation has invested a lot of resources in the area of research and collaboration with other countries to obliterate the scourge of trade in humans (Bello, 2018; Ezeh, 2017). The term human trafficking was not known to the people until the late 1990s when the United Nations pronounced the definition contained in article 3 of the Trafficking in Persons Protocol which is meant to provide consistency and consensus around the world on the phenomenon of trafficking in persons (UNHCR, 2018). The United Nations Trafficking in Persons Protocol Article 5 requires the criminalization of trafficking in domestic legislation which is the conduct set out in article 3 (United Nations Office on Drug and Crime, 2018). This Article, therefore, gave Nigeria the impetus to engage in the subject of trafficking by enacting the "3Ps" into law.

The menace of trafficking and its concomitant negative image on the country prompted President Olusegun Obasanjo administration at the time to adopt a three-prong presidential measures to tackle the horrendous trade:

- National Agency for the Prohibition of Trafficking in Persons (NAPTIP) and other Related Matters.
- The federal paramilitary agencies that formed the joint action on trafficking are the Nigeria Immigration Service, (NIS); the Nigeria Police (NPF) and the Nigerian Customs Service (NCS).
- The third prong was at the level of government parastatals like the National Emergency Management Agency (NEMA), whose primary assignments were only indirectly related to human trafficking (Lipede, 2007).

For this study, I concentrated on the activities of NAPTIP as a policy used by the Nigerian government to tackle sex trafficking. To expand the systems set up for the prevention of sex trafficking based on the first prong, the agency responsible for trafficked citizens recommended a bill to the National Assembly with the intent of outlawing sex trafficking of young Nigerian women. The bill was passed into law in 2003 establishing the National Agency for the Prohibition of Trafficking in Persons, (NAPTIP) which formally criminalized human trafficking for sexual exploitation (UNHCR, 2018). NAPTIP refers to a task force with the responsibility to enforce anti-trafficking legislation and coordinate rehabilitation of trafficked persons. The Act was then amended in 2005 to increase penalties for trafficking offenders (NAPTIP, 2015). In 2015, the Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition), Enforcement and Administration Act was passed, introducing further penalties for offenders and criminalizing the employment of children under 12 in domestic labor (NAPTIP, 2015). The focus of NAPTIP's mission statement is

on the prevention of all forms of human trafficking, including sexual slavery with the collaboration of Nigeria's crime prevention and law enforcement resources (NAPTIP, 2015). The amended Trafficking in Persons Act of 2003 provides punishment ranging from 10 years in prison to life sentence for traffickers and their middlemen and women who are caught recruiting or transporting of persons within and across international borders (NAPTIP, 2015).

The agency initiated various awareness programs at local and state levels through enlightenment campaigns, original posters, enlightenment campaigns, seminars and workshop, as well as radio and television jingles. NAPTIP established an investigative task force through its legal and prosecution unit. The investigation team includes the Nigerian Police Force, the Nigeria Immigration Service, National Intelligence Agency and the judiciary. The task force has a total staff strength of 69, including 40 new members of staff (NAPTIP, 2003). All of them have gone through induction courses, 10 of them at the Police Detective School in Enugu (Department of Justice, 2018). The training of different cadres of law enforcement means that NAPTIP continued to provide the needed tools to arrest, prosecute and punish criminals according to the dictates of the rule of law.

NAPTIP investigative unit developed a collaborative style of addressing the issue of sex trafficking with other agencies. According to Lipede (2007) NAPTIP was able to prosecute and convict one trafficker named Sarah Okoma. She was apprehended in Benin, Edo state and was convicted. In 2004, out of 41 cases reported to NAPTIP, 27 have been investigated based on the facts of the circumstances and the criminals were

arraigned at different state courts in Auchi, Benin, Uromi, Kano, Ilaro and Ibadan (Lipede, 2007). In 2005, there were six newly reported cases to the NAPTIP (Lipede, 2007).

In addition to rescuing and protecting victims, NAPTIP has apprehended African traditional priests who not only place a psychological burden of fear on victims but also makes finding the traffickers difficult. The agency raided the shrines of priests in Edo state; they arrested several priests, confiscated their charms and seized other items including some victims' photographs. Through the information they got from the priests, NAPTIP collaborated with other security agencies to successfully intercept teams of traffickers and their victims traveling within Nigeria and across the Sahara Desert (Department of Justice, 2018).

Babandede (2004) posited that although NAPTIP do not provide microcredit for victims, but they collaborate with other federal government agencies such as the National Directorate of Employment (NDE) and the National Program for the Eradication of Poverty (NAPEP) with the mission of poverty alleviation to provide rehabilitated victims with skills in entrepreneurship. NAPTIP rehabilitation unit also partners with anti-human trafficking units of the Immigration Service as well as local and international NGOs to rehabilitate and reintegrate victims of sex trafficking. The success story of NAPTIP of collaborative rehabilitation programs is evident with the International Organization for Migration, (IOM) and ALNIMA (an NGO). The both worked together in the rehabilitation of 18 deported victims and the reuniting of 14 with their various families (Akor, 2011).

NAPTIP has been proactive in cooperation and collaboration with other countries both within the Sub-Saharan African region and other parts of the world. In 2004, the agency was working with these nations because they are either a source, transit or destination countries (NAPTIP, 2017). The agency wrote a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with England, Northern Ireland, Italy, Kingdoms of Saudi Arabia, Spain, the Netherlands on cooperation with intelligence sharing and prosecution (Olateru-Olagbegi & Ikpeme, 2002).

An example of effective collaboration between Nigeria and Spain is the submission of the names of traffickers with their addresses to Interpol for investigation (Olateru-Olagbegi & Ikpeme, 2002). These countries have collaborated to ensure the legal prosecution of cases such as the Attorney General of the Federation v. Hussain Ibrahim and Anor as well as Attorney General v. Sarah Okoye. These prosecuted cases took place at the Kano Judicial Division and the other in the Edo Judicial Division respectively (Ndifon, Apori, & Ndifon, 2012). Both instances involved male and female international sex traffickers who operated from other European nations, bringing the total number of convictions in 2012 to 25 (UNHCR, 2018).

Due to some of these success stories, the countries also cooperated in the provision of anti-trafficking training for law enforcement, various government sectors and agencies (Ndofin et al., 2012). Nigeria doubled its effort to increase anti-trafficking law enforcement numbers and conviction of 25 traffickers 25 (UNHCR, 2018). The government provided anti-trafficking training to officials of various government ministries and agencies.

The government continues to make efforts to address the problem. In 2017, a new director general of NAPTIP was appointed to lead government efforts to combat trafficking. She reorganized the agency and set up an inter-ministerial committee on trafficking. This committee meets several times annually to help develop policies on trafficking including the first draft of a Protocol for Identification, Safe Return, and Rehabilitation of Trafficked Persons (Government of Nigeria, 2015). NAPTIP continues drafting a 2018-2023 revised national action plan which was approved by the inter-ministerial committee (UNHCR, 2018). The awareness campaign was intensified in churches, transit center, schools and media outreach were expanded through the use of radio and television to educate the people on the identification of potential traffickers and dangers of allowing their children and family members to travel for non-existent lucrative jobs abroad. Due to alleged reports that service providers, government employees, and security agents are sexually exploiting Internally Displaced People (IDPs), NAPTIP launched an investigation.

Because of this investigation, two sex traffickers were arrested (UNHCR, 2018). NAPTIP and other international organizations conducted screening and sensitization campaigns in IDP camps in Maiduguri (home of the terrorist group, Boko Haram) and other surrounding state-managed campsites. Other activities on campaigning involved sites where persons displaced by flooding and inter-tribal conflict resides (UNHCR, 2018). The government increased its outreach to traditional community leaders in a bid to reach the traditional religious leaders to address the activities of the ATR priests in using an oath to coerce victims. Given the efforts of NAPTIP, there was increased funding and

passage of another bill: Trafficking in Persons Law Enforcement and Administration Act of 2015 which was enacted to continue the campaign to combat sex trafficking (NAPTIP, 2015).

Although Nigeria has made some strides in combating sex trafficking, however, slow judicial processes and insufficient funding to cover NAPTIP's broad intervention have hindered Nigeria's anti-trafficking agencies' ability to implement legislation, and rates of arrest and prosecution of traffickers (Mahmoud & Dumoulin, 2017).

Though the law enforcement agents had been making concerted efforts, much ground still needs to be covered in the war against sex trafficking, because for every trafficker that is apprehended, several hundred may be utilizing some of the many illegal routes across the country's borders (Ndifon et al., 2012). The efficiency of traffickers' organizational structure makes the war against trafficking a very difficult challenge to address.

Policy Implementation Process in Nigeria

There were no significant policy shifts following the years after independence between 1960 to 1963 (Nuamah, 2015). In the critical areas of the economy, government policies obtained in pre-colonial times showed little signs of deviation. A problem warrants the intervention of the government to bring about a resolution. To solve the problem, they have to articulate clear and concise goals and objective, develop alternative plans, and evaluate the impact of decisions on the public since there is a requirement to respect individual needs and rights in policy implementation (Gauchat, 2012). A formulation of plan, implementation and application of enacted laws would have to be

approved by the three arms of government: Executive, legislative and judiciary (Nuamah, 2015). Researchers on public trust concurred with the idea that in a policy development process, there can be friction between government officials and the citizens (Beierle & Cayford, 2002). This conflict exists because of the difficulty in getting two parties to agree on all levels of the decision-making process based on personal interest and the expected outcomes.

In Nigeria, policy issues referred to the legislature by the executive go through a series of legislative processes of First, Second, and Third readings. After this process, it is then referred to designated committees for consideration; internally, or externally by a public hearing. After the completion of deliberation, a bill goes to the President for approval and then it becomes law when signed. A policy in the Nigerian context is codified legislation for a predictable more permanent guidance of the public in areas covered by that law (Constitution of Nigeria, Art. 6.9). In 1978, President Obasanjo stated that the fate of millions of Nigeria population is dependent on the type of constitution and policy formulated to address peoples' need. He further posited that policy's ultimate and utilitarian goodness depends on the will, disposition and vision of its operators. Whether it is a vehicle of justice, fairness and progress or an instrument of oppression and tyranny depend on the cooperation, understanding, and behavior of the leaders (Alafuro & Wilson, 2018).

Although the government developed some new policies targeting sex trafficking, it became difficult to apply a participatory approach to an effective intervention to

support victims of sex trafficking and ensure the enforcement of more stringent deterrent punishment for traffickers.

Edo State Policies on Sex Trafficking

Edo State adopted federal government's guidelines on prosecution and sentencing of criminals who are found guilty of human trafficking for sexual exploitation. In 2000, the then Governor Adams Oshiomhole of Edo state introduced a bill to address the movement of women and girls from the state (Government of Edo State, 2018). The penalties proposed in the bill appear to mirror those outlined in Nigeria's current federal anti-trafficking law (Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition) Enforcement and Administrative Act of 2015). This Act prescribed a minimum penalty of five (5) years imprisonment and fine of One million Naira for sex and labor trafficking offenses (minimum sentence in the case of a child increases to seven years). Advocacy groups and human rights activists decried the penalty as not being stringent enough to address such gross criminality.

The governor continued to call on European governments to help in the fight against sex trafficking by identifying the sponsors abroad and ensure that they are prosecuted (Egbebullem, 2009). The state Attorney General/Commissioner for Justice and Chairperson of the Edo State Taskforce on Sex Trafficking (TST), Yinka Omorogbe, outlined plans of the government to work on strengthening sentencing law to ensure that traffickers and those who aid trafficking for sexual exploitation of Edo women have no option of fine (Vanguard, 2017). The government set up the "Edo State Task Force" on

sex trafficking with other international agencies such as the European Union on deportation, apprehension, and prosecution of perpetrators.

The past government did not address the promised stringent legislative action against sex trafficking until governor Obaseki took office in 2017. In 2018, Godwin Obaseki along with legislators, law enforcement, and advocates, worked together to pass a bill that would make human trafficking for sexual exploitation a crime in Edo state. This recently formulated law repealed and replaced the existing enacted legislation; (Criminal Code Amendment) Law, 2000 (Section 223A) (Government of Edo State, 2018). The new bill provided the law enforcement with authority to investigate cases of trafficking, enforce more stringent punishment on offenders, and prepare rehabilitation follow-up for victims (Government of Edo State, 2018). Human rights organizations in the state acknowledged that the bill was essential as a step to address the threat to public safety and rights of the people especially women of Edo state. On May 23, 2018, a House Bill, Edo State Trafficking in Persons Prohibition Act was signed into law by Governor Obaseki (Government of Edo State, 2018).

This Act was passed due to the effort by the human rights coalition who insisted that more needs to be done to deter criminals from taking advantage of vulnerable young women in the state. Advocacy groups knew that there is a need to bring this crime to an end, find effective ways to provide services to victims and support them in their transition to normal life. After years of petition, and peaceful protests, Edo State became one of the 23 of the country's 36 states including the Federal Capital Territory that enacted a law against sex trafficking (Vanguard, 2017). According to the Nigerian government rating

on States' antitrafficking intervention; presently Edo State is known in the country as the most committed to combatting human trafficking (sex slavery) due to the improvements they have recorded in the fight against sex trafficking. Unlike past practices, instead of stigmatizing victims, the state holds those who buy sex domestically, former victims who become part of the criminal network and traffickers accountable (Government of Edo State, 2018).

The consistent engagement by Edo State government and NAPTIP officials encouraged the Oba of Benin (traditional ruler in Benin City) to issue what he referred to as a “curse” on sex traffickers in 2018. The Oba revoked all juju spells administered by priests to bind victims to their traffickers (United States Department, 2018). His gesture is believed to be the reason in the increase of victim identification and willingness to participate in trials against their traffickers. (United States Department of State, 2018).

It is evident that the psychological impact of belief in ancestral spirits that were invoked at the sealing of contract between the pimp and the victim was impeding therapeutic efforts of service providers (Daphne, 2018). The belief in ancestral spirits has roots in African traditional Religion (ATR) which recognizes the existence of the Supreme God and reverence of ancestors who act as intermediaries to the Supreme God in the event of any dispute including contractual agreement. ATR priests capitalized on this belief by victims that the gods will punish them if they breach the contract with their trafficker.

However, a newly promulgated law provides an effective comprehensive legal and institutional framework to address the fake priests for the prohibition, prevention,

detection, prosecution and punishment of offenders in Edo State (Pathfinders Justice Initiative, 2018). The provisions outlined in the law provided the state police the opportunity to address the role of the Oba of Benin (traditional ruler), and the commitment of Edo State in helping to reverse that psychological curse placed on victims by ATR priests. In 2018, the Oba of Benin made a pronouncement prohibiting ATR priests in partaking in the heinous crime of sex trafficking. This pronouncement has helped to curb the activities of fake ATR priests.

The current Governor of Edo State Obaseki and his assistant announced at a press conference of a concluded plan to officially reinforce the Edo State Taskforce Against Human Trafficking, which became functional in the State in August 2018 (Government of Edo State, 2018). This group assisted with investigative intelligence needed to combat human trafficking for sex and develop collaborative tools with the Ministry of Women and Social development (Ezeh, 2017). Steps are currently being taken in the new political dispensation to improve existing strategies and policies to eradicate sex trafficking. The creation of various Police zonal units in the state provided a more thorough investigation of activities in especially the city of Benin.

The decentralized units have made it easy for the apprehension of traffickers and helped in obtaining more reliable data on the number of people trafficked. At an event to mark 2018 United Nations Day Against Trafficking in Persons in Benin City, Edo State, the Benin Zonal Commander of the agency urged all stakeholders to collaborate with Edo State to curb the menace of trafficking for sex. Nduka (the head of the department) stated that with the joint collaboration between the State Police Department and the Edo State

Command of the National Drug Law Enforcement Agency (NDLEA) over 500 victims of sexual trafficking have been intercepted and brought back to the state, 103 persons involved in trafficking of humans and drug have been arrested and arraigned in court (NAPTIP, 2015). If compared to 2009 when only seven arrests were made (UNHCR, 2017), it is evident that more is being done to address this problem, and service providers testify to the decrease in the number of cases.

Although the government has made some efforts, more remains to be done by the State. For instance, the government is yet to pass a draft of the bill that aims at restricting the capacity of judges to offer the option of fines instead of prison time during sentencing. The Nigerian Police Force (NPF), and other relevant stakeholders have also continued to experience difficulty in identifying trafficked victims (Bello, 2018; United States Department of State, 2017). The media reported the disappointment of the public over the new bill which they thought would be stronger. Activists hope that the law places the protection of survivors at the helm since survivors are instrumental in ensuring successful prosecutions and in aiding targeted prevention efforts in the state (Pathfinders Justice Initiative, 2018). In this way the government can address the urgent need of the victims.

**Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition), Enforcement, and Administration Act, 2015
(Act No. 4 of 2015)**

Trafficking in Persons (Prohibition) Enforcement and Administration Act (TIPEA) was introduced in 2015 to repeal TIPEA Act of 2003 and provide means to address the issue of sex trafficking in Nigeria (NAPTIP, 2015). On March 2015,

President Goodluck Jonathan signed the reauthorization of TIPEA which reauthorized a vital tool in the anti-trafficking efforts (Federal Republic of Nigeria Official Gazette, 2015). This bill allows NAPTIP to perform the following tasks:

- Provide effective and comprehensive legal and institutionalized framework for prevention, detection, prosecution, and punishment of traffickers and criminals who committed a similar offense.
- Protect and rehabilitate victims of sex trafficking
- Promote and facilitate national and international co-operation to eradicate sex trafficking from the supply and demand chain (Federal Republic of Nigeria Official Gazette, 2015).

Since the new President, Mohammed Buhari took over the office in 2016, he continues the campaign against what is considered modern slavery in the form of transporting females as sex slaves. With President's collaboration with the Spanish government and Europol, 89 traffickers were arrested in Spain which brought about the break-up of one of the most notorious trafficking rings in Europe (Piranty, 2018).

The creation of the United Nations Global Initiative by UNODC to fight all forms of trafficking including sex trafficking is an essential platform for leaders of all nations to work together and collectively explore ways to address the phenomenon (Nguyen, 2010). This platform facilitates global partnerships necessary for UN's member states to make a connection and share resources to solve the problem. The created forum focused on the intent of the UN to combat all forms trafficking including sexual exploitation. The UN realized that only one country could not solve the scale of the spread of sex trafficking

and instead needs collaboration and cooperation of all nations (United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking Hub, 2017). And the Nigerian government including Edo state have been working with the United nations mandate of collaboration among nations which has helped to decrease the movement of youths by traffickers.

Sex trafficking is one of the forms of the crime of human trafficking. It ranks second to drug trafficking as one of the largest illegal for-profit industries in the global economy (Yea, 2010). Sex trafficking operates in the market economy as a profit-making business with three related elements (Yea, 2010):

- Means (recruitment)
- Mode (movement of people)
- Purpose (sexual exploitation for profit) (Yea, 2010).

The International Labor Organization estimated that sex trafficking in the private sector could exceed \$150 billion per annum (ILO, 2015). The exact global and local cost of trafficking for sexual exploitation are difficult to establish because some of the proceeds are used to fuel illicit drug trafficking (ILO, 2017). UN researchers estimated that sex trafficking is the fastest growing aspect of organized crime (United Nations, 2002). In some cases, as can be seen in figure 3, the high profit is in the 99 per centile (United Nations, 2002). Since sexual trafficking is a high reward with low risk, the profitable nature of the business indicated in figure 3 shows that the trade will keep attracting new criminals who will engage in a specialized area of the complex process of recruitment, transportation, and pimping of women (Hodge & Lietz, 2007; Monzini,

2004). The figure below shows profits made from human trafficking with special reference to sexual exploitation.



Figure 3. Profit made from Sexual Exploitation. Adapted from “The Profits made from Human Trafficking.” By Gopal, 2018, Copyright SAFECHR 2018. All Rights Reserved.

Getu conceded that sex trafficking provides traffickers with the opportunity to make billions of dollars because of the secrecy and low-risk nature of the organized trade in humans by taking advantage of the demand for people and the endless supply chain (Abiodun, et al., 2017). Getu further asserted that some predisposing factors for sex trafficking are poverty and lack of awareness. However, with slightly varying perspectives, Kleemans (2011), Kleemans & Smit, (2014) all argued that there should be no assumption that poverty alone is the main reason behind the existence of this crime. But instead, several other factors may be responsible for the exploitation of people such as environmental degradation, war and conflict, oppression, and economic violence (Konneh, 2017). The rise in sex trafficking can also be attributed to globalization, free

markets which allows clients in the receiving countries of Europe and the United States of America to make demands thus increasing the supply of vulnerable victims. Other predisposing factors are household mental illness, abuse, emotional, physical neglect, household violence, parental separation or divorce, household member incarceration, sexual abuse, and emotional abuse.

Those who are engaged in the purchase of sex acts would take advantage of people in any of these categories of vulnerability. Most of the sex buyers demand sex when they are out of their city on business trip, in this way hotels get involved in meeting their needs. A Norwegian study found that 80% of men purchased sex when they are abroad (Sarkisian, 2015). Norway showed success in outlawing the buying of sex rather than selling sex (Sarkisian, 2015). On the other hand, Germany added to the problem by legalizing prostitution (Oludele, 2018). Hence the crime of trafficking in humans for sexual exploitation creates a niche market and as Hughes rightly put it, it becomes monopolistic, allowing traffickers to determine price and profits (Hughes, 2004). This situation presents limited barriers for traffickers wanting to get into the crime or out of the offense (Wheaton, Schauer, & Galli, 2010).

The demand for prostitutes at Super Bowl games in the United States fueled human trafficking for sexual exploitation due to the lucrative opportunity to make a profit for traffickers (Konneh, 2017). The examined historical antecedent of human trafficking for sexual exploitation in Nigeria by scholars and researchers who linked the phenomenon of sex trafficking to the Federal Structural Adjustment Program (SAP). SAP is a prognosis that was conditioned by the World Bank (WB) and International Monetary

Fund (IMF) for debt-ridden countries of Africa to bring economic restoration (Abiodun et al., 2017). SAP is a policy adopted by the federal government of Nigeria that demanded cutbacks in so many social areas that can benefit the citizens such as education, employment, food, agriculture and cuts in other sectors (Adepoju, 2000; Attoh, 2009)

Other inexhaustible factors necessitating sex trafficking which however are not specific to Nigeria are lack of opportunity, inequality, illiteracy, ignorance, greed, gender-induced cultural bias, persistent unemployment, poverty (a principal driving force), and large family size (Adepoju, 2000). Other contributing issues such as high demand for cheap labor; desire for youth emancipation; inadequate political commitment; porous borders, lack of strong political will; access to education, sex-selective migration policies, disruption of supportive system, traditional community attitude, manipulation of religious rituals, children orphaned by AIDS, and other forms of human deprivation (Aghatise, 2002; Adepoju, 2005, Attoh, 2009; Eghafona, 2009; UNESCO, 2006).

The two kinds of trafficking that Nigeria is notoriously known for are internal, and external trafficking. Internal trafficking is associated with domestic servitude and street begging, while external trafficking comprises of sex trafficking and domestic labor. It is imperative to note the dynamics of the trade in humans vary from one zone to another. For instance, Edo and Delta states are known for sex trafficking which accounts for 95% of reported cases from Nigeria (Iyanda & Nwogwugwu, 2016). Lagos and Ogun states are known for child labor and domestic servitude, while traffickers from Benue and Sokoto states deal in children as street beggars and domestic laborers (Adepoju, 2005; Iyanda & Nwogwugwu, 2016).

The use of African traditional religion (ATR) rituals by priests distinguishes the Nigerian modus operandi from other human trafficking streams. ATR is a form of ancestral worship in Nigeria that has existed for centuries alongside Christian and Islamic belief. ATR in the context of the crime of sex trafficking in Nigeria refers to a variation on ancient West African religious traditions in which a priest connected to a traditional shrine has the power to manipulate outcomes in people's lives (Van Dijk, 2001). For example, traffickers operating within East European rings monitors their victims. "Loverboys" bring women to Western Europe and exploit them under the threat of violence in the event of defiance (Kleemans & Smit, 2014, p. 6).

In contrast, Nigerian traffickers' network can exercise remote control. The recruited women are made to go through elaborate ATR rituals in Nigeria by traffickers and agents to enforce a contract. This ritual psychologically binds victims on loan repayment. The terror-inducing rituals lead to a situation in which the women out of fear for their lives will not run away when traveling on their own. The women cooperate in the rituals voluntarily, albeit under misleading promises. They may not be aware of the loan amount and the exploitative circumstances in which they will have to work in Europe (Baarda, 2016; Kleemans, 2011; Van Dijk, 2001). The Edo state government and the Nigerian law enforcement not only arrested tipped trafficker but worked with the Oba of Benin (King) who supposedly has authority over all ATR priests operating in Edo state to abolish this fetish practice.

In 2016, the government explored the trafficking network of the most dangerous terrorist organization in Nigeria (UNHCR, 2018). The government detained those

considered to be Boko Haram (Islamic terrorists) combatants and at least 78 child trafficked victims aged 13-17-years-old were rescued (U.S. Department of State, 2018). Some of the arrested traffickers claimed that they went explicitly to remote areas to recruit women and girl-children (Baarda, 2016). Although law enforcement and NAPTIP are proactive in targeting sex trafficking, these services are centralized and are not available in mainly rural areas such as Ogwa.

Profile of Victims, Traffickers, and Buyers of Sex

Victims

The socio-economically marginalized population has been susceptible to sex trafficking. Poverty is one of the root causes of families and young women and girls becoming prey to traffickers (Adepelumi, 2015). When considering risk factors for sexual trafficking, research indicated that poverty, lack of economic and educational opportunities, and individual's gender play essential role in contributing to an individual's vulnerability to human trafficking (Efrat, 2016; Schauer & Wheaton, 2006; Zimmerman et al., 2011). The examination of an individual's socio-economic status is through h/her level of education, income, occupation and the lack of stable economic opportunities can constitute vulnerability factors to exploitation (Bales, 2005)

As has been suggested, the lack of access to or opportunities for employment and education lead to poverty and the search for better possibilities elsewhere. Individuals feeling disenfranchised may feel they have no choice but to place themselves in vulnerable positions to satisfy their economic need. Moreover, victimized persons having witnessed community, interpersonal or political violence early in life may either accept

this violence or attempt to escape from it. The story I heard of Sarah 29 is a typical scenario of a young woman faced by poverty had to leave her community. Sarah was deceived. A woman came to their village and said she could make a lot of money in Europe. She was very young and did not have anything. She wanted to help her family to pay for her schooling. She would have preferred to stay in Nigeria, but there was nothing for her to do.

She stated that she had nobody to fight for her, so she had to fight for herself. Desperate and without the right support, she was an obvious target for human traffickers. With more than 40 million estimated victims of modern slavery around the world, there are many more like Sarah, hidden from view (Cumming, 2017). The circle of poverty among families provides traffickers with the ability to become creative in forging fraudulent contracts with families guaranteeing positive support that will not be met (UNHCR, 2018; Polaris, 2018). This situation of helplessness and ignorance of families especially in rural areas permits traffickers to engage in the crime causing parents to lose everything, including their loved ones.

Bales (2005) suggested three key factors that foster sexual forms of trafficking in the modern world: Disparity in economic status, leading victims to seek better opportunities; political unrest and instability leading to the displacement of people, and socio-cultural practices of the country. One of the beliefs is that children are incapable of transmitting HIV/AIDS and that females are less valuable than males. Polaris (2014) supported Bales assertion. They outlined three major vulnerability factors to sex trafficking: Poverty, personal characteristics (e.g., lack of education, being female, and

youth) and isolation (e.g., geographically, linguistically, culturally, and legally) (Polaris, 2014).

Traffickers gain access to their victims through coercion, kidnapping or force. Some vulnerable youths who move away from the villages either to beg on the streets or in search of jobs in the cities become susceptible to trafficking (Logan, Walker, & Hunt, 2009). These children believe that life on the streets and doing menial jobs is better than the impoverished situation that they find themselves in the villages. Oludele (2018) stressed that victims are promised a better life and more significant opportunity in the receiving nation in Europe or America, and sometimes they voluntarily accept the offer by their trafficker. At the host nation, dispossessed victims who no longer have their passports are locked up by their madam or male pimp and forced into a different reality from what they initially endorsed before leaving their countries (Ezeh, 2017; Kelly, 2017).

The life of slavery begins with having to pay the debt they fraudulently incurred at the signing of the fake contract. Confirming how traffickers recruit their victims a report from University of North London disclosed that the trafficker approaches the victims with a promise of job in another country (United Nations, 2016). The woman lacking a better option at home agrees to migrate overseas where she is locked up by her employer in a strange environment.

To keep their victims enslaved and in physical bondage, the traffickers brainwash the victims, put daily surveillance over them while keeping them isolated by using people who have been previously victimized (Worden, 2018). The victims are threatened with

the murder of family members if they attempt to escape. In some cases, victims cannot leave their captor due to the language barrier, and fear of deportation. This situation makes it difficult for law enforcement to get any information from victims (United Nations on Drug and Crime, 2018).

Traffickers

Traffickers exploit sex trafficked victims. They include a wide range of criminals and criminal enterprises that organize, implement, and profit from trafficking human beings. They could be accomplished blue-collar workers to relatives of victims. Traffickers often rely on enablers including corrupt government officials to conduct their business. These could be both legal and illegal individuals and entities who can provide goods and services to exploiters, which make human trafficking for sex possible and profitable (Logan et al., 2009).

According to the Organization for the Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE), trafficking can best be thought of as a process rather than a single offense. It is a process involving different stages or nodes through which victims pass and involving different persons at each step of the process.

In 2002, the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights described traffickers as those who transfer and maintain trafficked persons in an exploitative and deplorable situation. They profit directly and indirectly from the gains of trafficking, its component acts and related offenses (United Nations Commission on Human Rights, 2002). The different actions in the chain of recruitment are performed by both single individuals such as boyfriends, family members and by multiple people depending on

whether the trafficker is a solo operator or part of a more complex criminal organization. The steps involve recruitment/abduction, transfer/transportation to exploitation location and exploitation (Human Rights First, 2014). For instance, 80% of recruited young women from Eastern Europe knew their recruiters. Majority of recruiters are boyfriends, fiancée, or husbands (Ezeh, 2017).

The traffickers in the Nigerian context can also be relatives and madams known to a friend of the family of the victim. For instance, a couple in Texas (initiated by the woman of the household) lured a widowed mother of six children from Nigeria to work in their home. The woman is supposedly a relative that they wanted to help. As she arrived the U.S, the family took away her travel documents. They restricted her movement and she was held as domestic servitude for eight years (Human Rights First, 2014). The victim was subjected to work for approximately 16 hours for seven days in a week (Human Rights First, 2014). A study conducted by (United Nations, 2014) showed that there are different groups of trafficked /migrant women selling sex in Denmark. Some women come from Thailand and Eastern Europe. However, most of them are different groups of trafficked women selling sex in Denmark. Many of the women came from Thailand or Eastern Europe but the majority of the women are from Nigeria.

The survey disclosed that some Nigerian women finance their hazardous journey to Europe by taking a loan from people living in Europe or Nigeria who promised them that they would earn enough for loan repayment (Kelly, 2017). Ezeh (2017) confirmed that traffickers use other recruitment tactics such as abduction or purchase of the women from family members.

An investigation of trafficking in Finland involving predominantly trafficked women from former Soviet Union countries disclosed that female traffickers are included in the recruitment of other women, organizing daily tasks and teaching newly recruited victims (Kangaspunta, 2015). Women who are in debt bondage are advised to hire other women to help them offset their repayment. Another research on trafficking network in Italy in the late 1990s revealed that recruiters who are female use to perform visible acts such as recruitment, the collection of money from clients, and control of victims (Kangaspunta, 2015).

The common element in the experience of these exploited women is poverty and desire to improve their financial status not only for themselves but for their extended family members (Kara, 2017). According to some victims, when they can pay their debt or escape from their trafficker, they can gain financial freedom and independence that they did not have in their home countries (Abiodun et al., 2017). With this mindset, they are unable to comprehend the concept of coercion by traffickers. This ambiguity in understanding coercion persists because the pressure is a complicated construct to measure and thus better understood as an element of interpersonal social power (Preble, 2016).

It is imperative to mention that due to the distorted understanding of prostitution, many traffickers are not given the deserved punishment. The law in most countries narrowed child sex trafficking to cases where the victim who is under the control of a trafficker needs to create a threshold legal requirement that s/he prove that h/she was controlled by the third party (Jovanovski & Tyler, 2018). This legal requirement puts the

burden of proof on the minor (Jovanovski & Tyler, 2018; Raino, 2017). Therefore, it is no surprise to see that there are fewer prosecuted traffickers. It is reported that abuse of victims of sex trade in the criminal justice system is horrendous. From October 1, 2006–June 30, 2013, while 379 investigations were conducted, prosecution were 73 and total number of convictions is 34 (Kvale, 2007).

This situation requires that people become aware of the menace of sex trafficking and the need for increased research, commitment to social justice, bolstered education at all levels, and influenced national and international legislations that target prevention, protection of victims and prosecution of buyers.

In the U.S. federal laws on sex trafficking are now being used through undercover sting operations through the Internet to arrest and prosecute buyers who attempt to engage in commercial sex with minors (Bach & Litam, 2017). Some of the examples of nations stepping up laws is exemplified by the European legal instruments on human trafficking that encourage states to tackle the demand for services of trafficked persons. The European Union is doing this by criminalizing the use of services of trafficked victims. In Finland, buying sex from a trafficked person is a criminal offense (Scherrer & Werner, 2016). The Council of Europe outlined their recommendations on trafficking in the Convention on Action Against Trafficking in Human Beings (Scherrer & Werner, 2016) which has 46 ratifications, and in the European Union Parliament and Council Directive 2011/36/EU on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims (hereafter Trafficking Directive) (Bach & Litam, 2017).

Buyers of Sex (Clients)

There is limited research on the number of male clients who purchase sex. They have remained mainly anonymous, faceless and nameless. The focus of research has been primarily on women and how their role in perpetuating the sale of sex is responsible for the demand. The few available studies indicate that the percentage of men who purchase sex acts varies from countries and cultures.

Study summary findings disclosed that in Europe, the rate of men who buy sex acts varies: In Great Britain, 7%, Spain, 39%, Finland, 13%; Norway, 11%; Sweden, 13%; Netherlands, 14%; Switzerland, 19%; Russia, 10% (Hughes, 2004). In Asia, there is a report of 37% of Japanese men, and Thailand 73% (Hughes, 2004). A recent pilot study interviewed men, some of whom had experience with purchasing sex acts, in Denmark, Thailand, India, and Italy. They found the significant cross-national differences about the extent and nature of social acceptance for men to buy sex (Scherrer & Werner, 2016). For example, Danish men said they never experienced social pressure to purchase sex and disagreed with the idea that hiring a woman for sex was a mark of manhood or masculinity (Hughes, 2004).

In contrast, the Thai men said that purchasing sex acts was a normal masculine behavior (Hughes, 2004). Buyers of sex are predominantly male (aged 18 to 84). Sex purchasers engage in this act from age 21; they purchase sex both from indoor and outdoor locations (Partners Against Child Trafficking, 2017).

While purchasers of sex can be tourists, some are married or have partners but go out on occasion to perform sex acts. The reasons people give for purchasing sex range

from the convenience, male bonding experience, the thrill and power, and going to obtain sex acts not provided by their spouses or partners. Some common elements bind men who purchase sex. Studies revealed that men who are likely to buy sex, watch pornography on a regular basis, and share the belief that prostitution is voluntarily chosen by these women to make a living (Partners Against Child Trafficking, 2017).

Nations have made efforts to stop male clients who seek the trafficked women for sex. Social shaming is a deterrent measure used by some countries to discourage people who purchase sex. For instance, Sarasota took advantage of new Florida law that raised the penalty for buying sex from \$500.00 to \$5,500.00. The Sgt. Rob Armstrong said that the increase in the cost of the sentence raised the number of buyers of sex that face trial (Sells, 2017). Craig Schaeffer, the chief assistant state attorney in Sarasota, Manatee and DeSoto counties of the State of Florida, stated that any man caught soliciting sex was arrested, and they are mandated to attend a "John School." John School is a one-day class which focus on educating purchasers of sex on the consequences of such behavior such as contracting sexually transmitted diseases (Sells, 2017).

It is imperative to conduct further research on men who buy sex to explore their importance in helping to stop not only the chain of demand and supply but also how some of them can become an asset in the rescue mission of trafficked women. For instance, the story of Ejiro is a good example of where her client participated in her rescue. Ejiro, a 21-year-old Nigerian woman who lives in Monale near Turin was rescued by her Italian client and was helped to find a shelter. She was forced by her madam to work as a

prostitute, and she refused; she narrated her story to her client who helped her to escape (Government of Nigeria, 2015).

On the other hand, researchers suggested that some men are deterred from purchasing sex acts. For example, studies showed that fewer men in the United States obtain sex acts with less frequency than in other countries (Scherrer, & Werner, 2016). Can this be attributed to the criminalization of soliciting sex acts? Hence, the need to explore the role of law in setting the need for social norms (Hughes, 2004).

Services Needed for the Rehabilitation of Victims

The trade in humans for sexual exploitation continues to globally ravage the lives of especially the poor and uneducated rural dwellers. The victims and survivors lack the tools to address the emotional and physical consequences that impact their lives. Many of these victims require services to heal the trauma associated with the phenomenon (Hooper, 2017). The need for specialized therapy is greater for especially trafficked victims who cross their country borders as sex slaves where they know no one and no place other than their exploiter.

Nigerian women and girls who travel to nations such as Italy, Netherlands, and Spain; may feel alone due to the language barrier. On arrival to host countries, the victims become diverse when they meet others in camps set up by the host nation. For instance, in Italy I was told by a service provider that victims are placed in camps (rescue shelters). Obviously in this situation, the victims require case management, transportation, and medical assistance which is provided in Italian. Because the victims speak other languages other than their host country's language, they sometimes can feel

isolated (Polaris, 2016). Sex trafficking poses devastating consequences on the lives of victims. Hence, if victims receive inadequate medical, emotional and psychological care, it may slow down their recovery process (Polaris, 2016).

Therefore, different types of health and psychological services are needed to give victims a second chance at living healthy lives. The victims require services such as housing, food, and shelter when they return to their various communities. Some other long-term needed services include case management, medical, and educational services. Other skills such as vocational education, addressing the issue of gender and cultural socialization, poverty alleviation programs, and other employment services are needed (Crawford, 2017) to aid them in their path to recovery. And the various means of communication is needed to educate the public on the plight of victims.

The Influence of Media in the Prevention of Sex Trafficking

The influence of media on combatting the phenomenon of sex trafficking cannot be overemphasized especially in rural areas. Thus, the Nigerian government needs to expedite its efforts on the prevention of sex trafficking by raising awareness through the television, radio and other traditional forms of communication (Musaroà & Parmiggiani, 2017; Samyn, 2018). The government engaged the participation of local task force and other non-governmental agencies, school institutions, businesses in the past in addressing the issue of terrorist insurgency (Adepelumi, 2015). In the same way, there is need for government to explore modern and traditional medium of information dissemination and other public educational enlightenment that targets rural areas.

Some NGOs have made efforts to provide services to victims and communities. Since 1999, the Major Religious Women Superiors of Nigeria continued its efforts in combatting sex trafficking which led to the establishment of the Committee for the Support of the Dignity of Women (COSUDOW) (Ezeh, 2017). The groups expanded campaign through the use of local media led to the establishment of activities of the committee focused on sensitization of young rural and urban community dwellers on the dangers of human trafficking for sexual exploitation (Ezeh, 2017). Through this enlightenment campaigns, coalitions were established with other organizations including Women Trafficking and Child Labor Eradication Foundation (WOTCLEF) to encourage victims to come forward not only to receive services but also to speak about their ordeal in the hands of their captors (Ebegbulem, 2017). If the government and service provider continue to see the need for public enlightenment, therefore they need to realize the importance of collaboration with the people to achieve an effective and long-term preventive campaign.

Stakeholder Participation in Policy Analysis and Development

Peoples' participation in policy analysis refers to the involvement of citizens, civil society organizations (CSO), and other interested stakeholders in influencing policies and laws which affect their lives. Countries and national governments increasingly recognize the importance of asking for peoples' opinion in policy development within the global community. The European Union emphasized the crucial need for engagement of civil society in policy debates and dialogue; stating that public participation increases collaboration, ownership, and responsibility in implementation (Association of

Accredited Public Policy Advocates to the European Union, 2016). The Union outlined some essential principles that government and non-government-organization (NGO) need to accomplish the goal and values of the principle of public participation as follows:

- Commitment
- Recognition of rights and responsibilities
- Access and clarity of information
- Continuity (ongoing)
- Proper structure (coordination)
- Publicity
- Transparency
- Openness and consideration
- Objectivity and equal treatment
- Resources
- Sufficient time
- Accountability for the process and result
- Acknowledgment and feedback
- Evaluation. (Association of Accredited Public Policy Advocates to the European Union, 2016)

Kamruzzaman (2013) examined the contribution of NGOs in the process of public participation in program design. Kamruzzaman noted that NGOs elicit information, collate public opinion, evaluate their situation, take their views and concerns into consideration in the design of policy. This partnership that is encouraged by NGOs

advanced the idea of the bottom-up policy development approaches suggested in the works of Mehrizi and Ghasemzadeh (2009).

There are some examples of the encouragement of stakeholders to be engaged in policy development processes. In the Italian context, it is observed that the government involved the people at various levels of participation in the goal of the formulation of employment policies (Aurich-Beerheide et al., 2015). In Germany, there have been studies linking public engagement and policy integration, which has generated high integration influenced by the national framework for long-term unemployed policy development (Aurich-Beerheide et al., 2015). In Africa's community-based natural resource management (CBNRM), a scheme has emerged to give community participation value. Some African governments has expanded the concept of a community-participatory approach in the management of natural resources (Chirenje, Giliba, & Musamba, 2012).

Under a detailed implementation plan developed by governments, all concerned stakeholders participate in the scheme. The government agencies take decision-making to the local community from the formulation stages up to the implementation; in contrast to the traditional method of involving the communities in the implementation of programs. This level of participation has had significant benefits for the poor and deprived communities (Chirenje, Giliba, & Musamba, 2012).

This same model can be applied to the prevention of all forms of trafficking including sex trafficking through community involvement. The rationale in advocating for community participation in addressing sex trafficking is that the criminals

(traffickers) and their victims are from communities where there are existing structures that the government can utilize to partner with the people on ways to deal with traffickers and improve services and programs provided to victims to prevent the problem.

Although, Edo state government has various laudable policies and procedures on the prevention of sex trafficking, none of these programs is based on community-initiative. Hence, my goal for this research study is to explore perceived opinion of parents on existing services and plans regarding the prevention of sex trafficking, and how their narrative on realistic experience can impact policy change and thus bring about social change in Ogwa community.

Summary

There are major themes that came up from the literature search. Some of these highlights included the economics of demand and supply for sex trafficking, victimization of those from the margins of society especially the rural uneducated poor. This chapter explored the political process of policy formulation and implementation. The economic concept of deprivation seemingly is the force that drives human trafficking for sexual exploitation due to poverty and lack of financial stability for prostitutes and victims.

Additionally, traffickers have gained monetarily because of the hidden nature of the business. There is an unsearchable need by buyers of sex for victims of all races, gender, and economic status who are either kidnapped, coerced, or forced into sexual slavery. However, sex trafficked victims bear greater suffering especially women and

girls from an impoverished environment; rural and without education to resist the need to leave their homeland to seek for better life especially in European nations.

The narrative policy framework provided the basis to give voice to parents to be involved in the discussion on existing policies and programs. Based on their realistic narrative and participation, there could be an achievement of a positive policy change. As antecedent to conducting this research, the methodology and procedures used in this study formed the basis of discussion in chapter three.

Chapter 3: Research Method

Introduction

The trafficking of humans as sex slaves is a global phenomenon and shows no signs of abating as the demand for victims continues to be on the rise. The victims are trafficked both domestically and internationally, enabling an endless supply by traffickers (Kleemans, 2011; Wheaton et al., 2010). The ability of the international community to obtain accurate data on the number of victims has proven difficult given the number of unreported and underreported cases (Cavagnaro, 2017).

The purpose of this qualitative narrative research study, therefore, was to explore the perception of parents on existing sex trafficking prevention policies and their observation of the reality in the Ogwa community, Edo-State, Nigeria. In using the NPF developed by Jones and McBeth (2010), I aimed to disclose valuable information that may assist Edo State policy makers with the tools and knowledge needed to address the needs of victims of sex trafficking. In this way, they can seek greater collaboration with influential community stakeholders in the designing and implementation of preventive programs to combat sex trafficking. The outcome of this study may also give insight to detailed ways to embark on community development that targets the socioeconomic status of especially youths through education. In this way, it may potentially lead to positive social change.

In this chapter, I commence with the restatement of the research question that guided this research and the phenomenon of sex trafficking. I explain my role as the researcher in this study, the rationale of the research design selected for this study, and

methodology for the study. I discuss the population sampled for the study, the reason for the study instrumentation, study procedures, recruitment process, participation, and data collection procedures. I outline of the process of data analysis, including the coding framework, and explain the issues of trustworthiness with a description of ethical procedures. I then conclude the chapter with a summary of the ideas presented and transition to Chapter 4. Because of the involvement of the people in the analysis of process, Participatory Policy Analysis (PPA) was an appropriate type of analysis that I used to analyze the data in Chapters 4 and 5.

Research Design and Rationale

This study addressed the following research question:

How do parents of girls and women (aged 13-21) experience the threat (and the reality) of sex trafficking in Ogwa?

Sex trafficking is a heinous crime perpetrated by both males and females from different parts of the world who violently abuse their victims. These victims are from communities where there are existing structures that the government can use as a platform to partner with communities on ways to improve services and programs provided to prevent the problem of sex trafficking. However, the Edo State government has various laudable policies and procedures on the prevention of the phenomenon of sex trafficking that are not community-based.

Hence, my goal for this research study was to explore the perceived opinion of parents on existing policies regarding the prevention of sex trafficking and how the narrative of their experience of reality can impact policy and, thus, bring about social

change in the Ogwa community. This process takes decision-making to the local community from the program formulation stages to the implementation stage in contrast to the traditional method of involving the communities only at the implementation step of the programs. This level of participation has benefits for poor people and poor communities (Chirenje et al., 2012). Because of the emphasis on exploring the opinion of parents as influential members of the community, I used a qualitative research tradition.

Qualitative Research

The reason for the choice of this research methodology was due to its ability to disclose and synthesize the meaning individuals attach to their experience of a phenomenon through data collection methods of interviews and observation (Creswell, 2016; Ravitch & Carl, 2016).

Other researchers believe that qualitative research relies on verbal and nonverbal expression and an in-depth interpretation of reality by participants, thereby expounding what the researcher seeks to analyze. Some of these researchers include Maxwell (2013), and Ryan, Coughlan, and Cronin (2009). Patton (2002) in his research provided an understanding that conducting qualitative research helps the researcher to engage his or her subjects to learn from them and to understand their viewpoints based on their lived experiences of what is familiar to them. Qualitative research explores, analyzes, and interprets the constructs and meaning that human beings attach to those experiences. Interviews and observations reveal those meanings as the participants see them (Patton, 2015).

An essential element of the qualitative study is that the researcher remains engaged in the process and is actively part of the generated data. A qualitative study demands that participants be treated as experts of their own experience in their settings and are the valuable resource for the phenomenon under study. Within the qualitative methodology, I chose a qualitative narrative inquiry research study as the most appropriate approach for this investigation to enable parents to express their perception of governmental existing policies on the prevention of sex trafficking.

Narrative Inquiry Research Tradition

The use of this method of inquiry was an appropriate research tradition that allowed me to explore the story of parents and highlight its potential for influencing policy change. I did not interview victims because they are vulnerable population and it was not be necessary to make them relive their past trauma.

Narrative inquiry research methodology asserts that understanding participants' lived experiences through listening to, asking for, gathering, and analyzing stories explores new impetus to research (Sylvester, 2018). Researchers have found that narrative frameworks and the narrative environment that make up institutional storytelling could exert an impact on the power of peoples' stories (O'Toole, 2018; Sylvester, 2018). The narrative inquiry approach provides valuable avenues to situate community-based action research in the multileveled context of research production and elicit the multilayered elements of meaning-making that are often overly simplified, particularly in positivist approaches (Selimos & Glynis, 2018). An individual or phenomenon can not only be understood on their own but can be based on a specific

personal and social context (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). Hence, it is imperative to note that there would be no knowledge of individuals without examining their story and the impact the story had on them.

The basis for narrative inquiry for this study was based on the epistemological assumption that human beings make sense of random experiences through story structure. Researchers' introduction to the narrative inquiry approach disclosed that its origin is from the field of literary criticism (Bell & Duff, 2002). Bell and Duff (2002) posited that historians have the opinion that narrative has an internal thread in helping in the understanding of current events, which stems from past happenings and ultimately pointing to the future outcome. Some data collection methods can be used in narrative research, as the researcher and the research participants work together in this collaborative dialogic relationship (Yin, 2009). Hence narrative inquiry research is appropriate in helping parents in the context of this study to generate a more in-depth understanding of the reality of their experience of the existing preventive policy on sex trafficking in Ogwa community. Data obtained through this inquiry can be in the form of field notes, journal records, interview transcripts, observations, and storytelling (Moen, 2006). However, the narrative research design I used was in the form of interviews, observation, and field notes that provided information that helped to make connections with the lives of real people (parents) who have indirectly encountered sex trafficking.

Another reason for choosing a narrative inquiry was because it provided a tool to test and apply my selected theory of NPF to the phenomenon of sex trafficking. Although the case study design can be used to explore complex issues (Creswell, 2013; Yin, 2013),

it could not be applied to this study because it was not appropriate in the testing of my selected theories.

Ethnography was not appropriate for this study because the research did not involve the observation of a cultural phenomenon and ways that people live in their environment (Watras, 2010). Moustakas (1994) posited that phenomenological research should focus on the wholeness of experience and a search for the essence of experiences. I did not use a phenomenological method because the problem of sex trafficking and the lived experiences of participants were not under study. Instead, I focused on the perceived implementation of public policy and social service programs that targeted the issue. I did not employ grounded theory in this study because grounded theory refers to a set of systematic inductive methods for conducting qualitative research aimed toward theory development (Birks & Mills, 2011; Charmaz, 2009).

Role of the Researcher

My role as a researcher was to act as a primary instrument for data collection (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005). In qualitative studies, the researcher is responsible for designing the instrument, identification, recruitment of participants, and conducting interviews to generate data from participants (Tracy, 2013). The researcher also is charged with the task of data analysis (Tracy, 2013), which I did.

I had no relationship with any of the participants who were involved in the study. Hence, any conflict of interest and power differential was eliminated. I posed questions guided by the interview protocols and asked for clarification as needed. Participants were selected to fit into the stated criteria for this study. The participants were selected to

provide the needed and valuable data that were required to answer the research question for this critical topic. As a researcher, it was imperative to eliminate my bias, assumptions, expectations, prejudice, and preconceived ideas and concentrate on the opinion of the participants (Zaharia, 2008). Self-reflection and self-critique are crucial not only to help researchers avoid bias but also not to engage in shallow research. Hence, the researcher needs to not project his or her values and be open to a subjective experience that will transform the researcher's values (Jared, 2018).

Another step I used to avoid bias was to keep my emotions in check and to apply my intellectual honesty. Intellectual honesty tends to prevent beliefs that interfere with the assessment of the truth and provide an atmosphere where presented facts are without bias. To avoid this bias, I sent my research question ahead of time to allow participants to think through it and decide on ways to respond to me.

The selection of participants was purposeful because no victim of trafficking was invited to be part of the study. The eligible participants are those indirectly affected: Parents who have children within a vulnerable age and who have not been victims of trafficking themselves. For this reason, my selection criteria for participants was not based on my desire to achieve my research goals (Yin, 2009), and not designed to influence the answers of the participants.

My background as a social worker and paralegal was helpful for me to remain objective throughout the interview process and to focus on the facts that emanated from the response to the research question. It is crucial to realize that building relationship with participants is vital to elicit in-depth information that will give depth to the research

(Ravitch & Carl, 2016). So, I established rapport with the sample population. This type of friendly disposition made parents of young women aged 13 to 21 to feel comfortable and able to trust me to share.

I was able to reach this goal of trust during the preliminary study introduction through shared traditional social networks (Rubin & Rubin, 2012). The interview questions were submitted to the participants with explanations a week ahead to give the parents an opportunity to reflect on the issue. I had an added advantage to achieve this because the religious Nuns that helped me to reach Ogwa community had been living and working with them for close to a decade. The Nuns helped me with making the initial contact with the traditional ruler for permission to conduct the study. They also accompanied me to my familiarization visit with the community. Through the assistance of the Nuns, I worked continually to maintain that ease and comfort through respect of each participant and facilitated a feeling of not being exploited (Maxwell, 2013). This process of community engagement in a respectful manner provided the needed atmosphere for data collection, ability to code the information, look for themes/patterns and present a valid research finding.

Methodology

Participant Selection Logic

The target population for this study were parents of young girls and women aged 13 to 21. The topic of this research study elicited data that would provide an understanding of the phenomenon of sex trafficking and explore ways to effectively prevent the problem through developing effective policies. I took into cognizance the

research question and the target population for data collection in the decision of my research process. Also, equally important, was the viewpoint of the participants that was needed to gather the information necessary to respond to the research question with integrity and needed perspectives (Creswell, 2007, Ravitch & Carl, 2016).

Hence, a purposeful sampling method was found appropriate for this study, to provide rich and in-depth account of a specific population and location. The primary purposeful sampling approach enabled me to deliberately select the individuals and research setting that was required to answer the research question (Coyne, 1997; Patton, 2015). In choosing participants to respond to the research question, it was appropriate to identify a diverse population by age, role, gender, status, and knowledge of the research topic. A thorough consideration of these issues in participant selection helped to provide credible respondents for the interview (Turner, 2010).

Using inclusion and exclusion criteria principles (Ravitch & Carl, 2016) helped me as the researcher in obtaining reliable results. Since this study sought to understand community perspective on the prevention of sex trafficking, the criteria for inclusion was 15 parent-household of young girls and women aged 13 to 21 that have not been trafficked. They made up the eligibility of selection of the target population. It was an intentional choice not to select parents of former trafficked victims or those who were once victims themselves. In this way, they were not directly emotionally attached to the problem and are open to objectively address the questions.

The selection of a small group of participants was to enable me to build a better relationship with them. In this way, I could collect more in-depth information during and

after the interviews if need be (Crouch & McKenzie, 2006). Patton (2015), suggested that having a small sample of 12 to 15 people is crucial in ensuring that qualitative sample size meets the determined time allotted, resources available, and study objectives (Patton, 2015).

Hence, my decision in selecting 15 parent-households of young girls and women aged 13-21 who reside in Ogwa community. It was appropriate for me to make this selection because in qualitative research, the researcher is the primary instrument, bringing his or her perspective to the choice and meaning of data (Marshall, 1996).

The parents were purposefully sampled for this study because these participants have needed attributes that are of interest. They were also important to the research question which helped in the explanation of the phenomenon of sex trafficking by using a face-to-face semistructured interview tool of data collection.

Sex trafficking is a complex organized crime and thus require an information-rich-case method that can generate much learning about the importance and the purpose of the inquiry. Studying information-rich cases provides insight and in-depth understanding rather than empirical generalizations (Laureate Education (Producer). (2014-a). Ravitch and Carl (2016) concurred by emphasizing the importance of having clear, reasoned and explicated rational for why a specific population or individuals are selected to become part of a study. The respondents were selected prior to the start of the interview.

To identify these parents, I worked with the Committee for the support of the dignity of women (COSUDOW). COSUDOW is a non-governmental organization that

work with communities in Edo-State, including Ogwa. They collaborate with government agencies in working to reintegrate and rehabilitate sexually exploited young women who have voluntarily or involuntarily returned from Europe. COSUDOW also run shelters for deported women in Benin city which is the capital of Edo State. The executive director and her assistant took me to the local leaders in Ogwa to make preliminary arrangements and connections. These Catholic Nuns have partnered with these rural local leaders in the area of an awareness campaign on all forms of human trafficking including sex trafficking which is the predominant form of exploitation that Edo girls and women face. I had audience with local leaders because they are the traditional and primary contact for the community. I sent preliminary letters to those of them who can read and write and then had a meeting with all the traditional leaders to explain what the study entailed.

The reason for the study on parents was explained to the traditional rulers since talking directly to parents had not been the norm in previous research that had been conducted addressing trafficking in Ogwa. Another reason why it was essential to ensure that the local leaders understand the concept of this study was to get the permission and support needed to reach the parents who are the unexplored local experts in the field of finding a solution to the crime of sex trafficking.

I targeted this number of parent households to attain saturation that will justify the standpoint of parents from various backgrounds. The choice of 15 participants may achieve saturation requirement as they narrate their realistic experience on implemented policies on the prevention of sex trafficking in Ogwa.

Saturation occurs when adding more participants to the sample size do not guarantee any new information emanating from the interview (Saumure & Given, 2008). The attainment of saturation allows for a diversity of opinions that do not rely heavily upon one section of the community.

Instrumentation

I adapted a semistructured face-to-face interview from another research institution and utilized it for data collection for this study as noted by (Stuckey, 2013). I adapted this form of data collection because interviews are recommended within the qualitative paradigm as the primary tool of data collection (Rubin & Rubin, 2012). Researchers suggested that face-to-face interview enable investigators to collect in-depth information about the phenomenon of sex trafficking from the perception of the participants (Ravitch & Carl, 2016). Although a face-to-face interview may create some discomfort among participants, however, it is an effective tool to guide the formulation of specific questions. It also helps to deviate from the questions if there is an important comment that require further exploration and needs clarification. The interview protocol can be located on (Appendix A). It was used to make sure that there was uniformity of data collected and facilitation of a focused discussion (Turner, 2010).

The interview protocol developed was based on the research question guiding this study, the review of literature and a questionnaire developed by Safe Coalition for human rights (Gopal, 2017) on human trafficking for sexual exploitation. This survey has been used globally as an anonymous questionnaire to obtain human trafficking data for

program implementation. The interview question consists of 14 questions and prompts that explored participants' stories and experiences.

All face-to-face interview was conducted by me. Tape recorder served to record the response from parents, and I transcribed the interviews for textual analysis. As (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015) suggested, there was need to use the audio tape to record all conversations for accuracy in data collection. During the interviews, some open-ended questions were incorporated in the interview guide to focus the discussion and to avoid leading the participants to a specified answer (Chenail, 2011). The use of probing and clarifying follow-up questions encouraged participants and helped them to elaborate their responses and clarify their thoughts.

At the completion of the data collection, I analyzed the transcribed data through the use of the thematic analysis developed by Braun and Clarke's (2006). In this way, the valid emergent themes helped to answer the research question and gave a detailed insight into the phenomenon under study.

Procedures for Recruitment, Participation, and Data Collection

The recruitment process commenced with the identification of 15 parent-household of young girls and women aged 13-21 in Ogwa community. The criteria for selection of parents was based on those whose children have never been trafficked. The objective was to identify 10-15 parent-households and contact them to ascertain their interest to be interviewed. Also, it was verified that they have not directly experienced the trafficking of their children. Before I started the interview, I explained the informed consent answered questions pertinent to the study and got consent to record the interview.

I held separate meetings with the Catholic Nuns and the traditional rulers to explain the research to be conducted and why. This discussion with this group of people was to obtain the necessary permission and support that I needed before engaging parents from Ogwa community. As soon as I received approval from the traditional leaders, I sent the consent letters to parents. I ensured that there is a consent by the parents before the interview which assured them of the voluntary nature of their participation and the confidentiality of the shared information during the interview.

Informed consent is a crucial process that involves conversation (Walden University, Center for Research Quality (2010). I read and explained the consent forms to the parents and asked them to verbalize the statement “I consent” which was recorded. I gave each participant a copy of the form and started the interview. In this way, the participants knew what to expect and I took note of my expectations.

I reiterated each participant’s free will to participate in the study, and an instruction to stop me if at any point he or she no longer wants to participate in the study. The interview lasted for 60 minutes. The location for the interview was at the community center. The location selection was to give them the privacy they needed and to make them feel comfortable and safe.

The primary research study relied on a face-to-face interview of data collection. This data collection technique focused on in-depth information was recorded. This included the use of digital recorder, and observation. Creswell (2013), and Patton (2002) encouraged the use of audio recorders that can clearly project the voice of both the interviewer and the interviewee.

Hence, for my study I used a quality recording device to record the parents so that I can capture all they had to say. The parents live in rural areas, and a telephone interview as a back-up was not feasible due to cost and logistics. To facilitate the gathering of useful, precise and detailed data, I took time to thoroughly prepare myself before the interview including organizing the device needed for recording the conversation.

The need for organization is a crucial component in research to put both investigator and interviewee at ease to obtain an in-depth study (Rubin & Rubin, 2012). An example of organizing the day included test playing all devices to ensure the quality of sound. As soon as I received my Walden Institutional Review Board (IRB) approval, I began the recruitment of participants as noted at the instrumentation stage. I explained to the participants what was hoped to be achieved and reminded them that their participation was voluntary. There was reiteration that there was no monetary or in-kind remuneration for their participation and that the document will be destroyed after 5 years of research completion.

Privacy is respect for persons, which means that only volunteers can be studied and not a collection of data through a prohibited form of coercion. Coercion is an inappropriate dynamic in research because it goes against the ethical value of respect for persons (Walden University, Center for Research Quality, 2010). I made sure that the participants knew about their protected identity.

The goal of qualitative interviews is to elicit the participant's perceptions and views on a given topic (Patton, 2002; Patton, 2015). Hence it was imperative to ensure that I presented the subject with clarity during the interview process (Patton, 2002). I

began the interview with a semistructured questions to encourage discussion and further exploration of the topic.

The literature I presented in Chapter 2 of this proposal provided the background to the formulation of the research questions posed to participants (see Appendix A). The research question was used to collect information from parents regarding their perception of existing policies and procedures targeting the prevention of sex trafficking. I adapted the questions to the specific need of my study to align with the proposed theory in my theoretical framework as illustrated in the literature review. Hence, the questions incorporated the views of Jones and McBeth's narrative policy framework.

I listened for threads in the conversations and mirrored to the interviewee what I heard instead of making my own interpretation. Rubin and Rubin agree that responsive interviewing means that researchers play an active role, encourage conversation, react to what interviewees said and ask detailed questions to follow up on initial answers (Rubin & Rubin, 2012). It is possible to follow the creative input by the respondent even if it means deviating from the original plan regarding the questions (DiCicco-Bloom & Crabtree, 2006).

It is also vital that the researcher keep his or her ego in check, listen to stories from the perspective of the participant and to realize that the world do not revolve around the researcher (Seidman, 2012). Therefore, in my study, it was critical to recognize that questions can stir up unpleasant memories of how participants may have experienced the trauma of knowing some trafficked young girls and women (O'Sullivan, 2016). Also,

equally important, is that I was attentive to when follow-up questions can be asked to better understand the thoughts and opinions of the participants.

Since the participants are rural subsistence farmers, necessary contact and arrangement were made to ensure that the interview was conducted during the dry season (December to March) when they do not have to go to the farm. Because most parents do not have phones, some are not able to read and write, I stayed in the village for approximately seven days in case any of them have questions or need further clarification or explanation.

Because there are many tribal languages in this community, the study was conducted in the local language developed from English language by market women called pidgin English. Since I know how to speak pidgin English, I did not need a translator. Development of rapport was vital in building the needed relationship of trust. Anton (2014) advised on the need to establish relationship between participants and researchers which might compromise the voluntary nature of participants' responses. Therefore, to make the most of the interview, it is advisable to create a relaxed and dialogical style of interviewing and to conduct it in an environment where both the interviewee and interviewer are comfortable (Anton, 2014). These skills are essential to ensure the quality of data from the participants (Patton, 2015).

To verify the authenticity of the obtained data received through face-to-face interviews, I utilized the process of member checking. There are various types of member checking, but since most of the participants can neither read nor write, I utilized a form of member checking that occurs during the interview process (Marshall, 1996). I restated

and summarized the information that I got from each parent at the interview process and question the participant whether I stated correctly what he or she said to ensure accuracy. In this way, the participants either agreed or disagreed that the summary did not reflect their feelings, opinion, emotions and experiences. In the event that a participant gave a positive response, the accuracy and completeness are affirmed, the study was referred to as credible (Creswell 2007; Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Member checking provides accuracy and thorough representation of participants' response. It is also critical to the validation of a study to increase transferability, validity, and credibility (Bryman, 2004).

I thanked the participant after the interview and asked if they had any further questions. And if not, I asked them questions to corroborate the transcript with what they said to ensure accuracy since most of them cannot read. For those who can read and write, I sent them copies of the transcript to ensure accuracy. As soon as I verified the accuracy and validity of the transcript, the data analysis began.

IRB Approval

Before data collection began, an approval of the research by the Walden Institutional Review Board (IRB) was sought. The Walden IRB approval number for this study is 11-19-19-0650537 and expires on November 18, 2020.

Data Analysis Plan

I used Braun and Clarke's (2006) thematic analysis method for the analysis of the data that I collected. Thematic analysis is a methodology for data analysis developed in the 1970's by Gerald Holton but was not adopted as an effective method of data analysis until 2006 (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Braun and Clarke (2006) provided the thematic

analysis as a method for identifying, analyzing, and reporting patterns/themes within data. It helps to organize and provide a detailed description of the data set. Rubin and Rubin (1995) reckon that this method of analysis is exciting because the researcher can discover themes and concepts that is embedded in the course of the interviews.

Braun and Clarke (2006) pointed out that the advantage of thematic analysis is that it is not tied to a specific theoretical perspective. Thematic analysis allows the researcher to search for patterns, repeated words, opinions, ideas, concepts and phrases in a data to construct themes which can inform the research question and become the guide for the research study (Jones & McBeth, 2010).

Thematic analysis as described by (Braun & Clarke, 2006) consists of 6 distinct steps (See Table 1). It is crucial to note that this analysis is an iterative process with one step leading to another. Hence, I as the researcher altered the analysis as reflected by the data and as ideas emerged (Braun & Clarke, 2006)

Table 1

Stages of Thematic Analysis

Steps	Description
Step 1-Transcription of verbal data/familiarization with the transcript	The transcript was read repeatedly before coding to understand all aspects of the data identified and noted emerging patterns. Commonly used words, phrases and ideas are identified. Transcript are checked against original audio recording to ensure accuracy.
Step 2- Generate initial codes	Initial coding of the data with what was interesting, potential themes/patterns. I coded data that communicated tension and inconsistencies within and across the data item to retain accounts that departs from the dominant story in the analysis.
Step 3- Initial search for themes	Codes are scrutinized for common elements. Like codes are grouped until no further code was possible. Codes that do not fit into the main themes were tracked. Emerging themes were analyzed for connections and examination of completion.
Step 4- Reviewing/re-examining themes	I created thematic map to reflect themes and relationships. Potential new themes are identified and coded. Themes are compared to transcript, codes and groups to ensure accuracy in the representation of participants' opinion and experiences.
Step 5- Defining and naming themes	Identification of the importance of each theme, and what part of the data are captured. Themes are assigned a descriptive name indicating what they are.
Step 6- Writing the report	Analysis is completed, and results written in narrative form to convince the reader of the merit and validity of the analysis.

Note. Adapted from “Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology,” by V. Braun and V.

Clarke, 2006, *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), p. 77-101

I began to read over the collected data to better gain insight and appreciation of the general content of the transcripts. I began coding the data by noting significant words, phrases and ideas embedded in the interview responses, and allocating brief descriptive labels to the fragments of the text. Data Fragment was able to receive more than one code (See Table 2 for example). This created flexibility which provided depth of analysis.

Table 2 contains an example of the information from the following complete collected data:

I have a different take on the existing policy of the government regarding sex trafficking. There are different programs that addresses sex trafficking in Ogwa, but none has explored the knowledge of the community regarding the root causes of the problem. There are no jobs in Ogwa. Many youths migrated to the extent that it is difficult to find people to do the chores that young people can do in the town.

Table 2

Complete Coding Example

Code Assigned	Data Fragment Used
Existing policy not helpful Lack participatory approach	Community are not approached to give their opinion on what to do.
Unemployment Root cause not explored	Many youths have left Ogwa town in search of jobs. They have no one to turn to. Sex trafficking policy do not address the root cause of the problem
Need for education awareness	I felt that education is key. Address shame

I continued through the rest of the collected data as I cross-compared emergent codes between interviews. When all data were coded, all similar codes were grouped to construct emergent themes (see table 3 for an example)

Table 3

Groups and Emergent Themes Example

Groups	Emergent themes
I feel sad for victims feel shame, stigmatized People are not educated	Emotional response to the plight of victims Awareness education
Community are not consulted on government programs	Community dialogue with government on government programs

These themes formed the categories to which different data subsets of code were related. The themes were constructed according to their relevance to the research question, and how they were able to briefly capture the recurring observation within the dataset. I later compared the themes that I identified to one another and to the data in general to ascertain the thematic framework of the analysis. The themes were finalized, the definition; documented and the results of the study reported in narrative form.

Braun and Clarke (2014) suggested the possibility of creating a coding framework with preselected codes. Therefore, in order to make sure that all aspects of the data are explored, I used a set of preliminary codes (see Table 4) to provide evidence of the alignment between data, theory, assumption and research questions.

Table 4

Preliminary Coding Framework

Primary Code	Secondary/ Child code	Data Collection Protocol
Government (Institutions)	Actors, self-interest	6, 10, 12, 14
Perspective/Perception	decision-making	1-14
Constraints/Challenges (delivery of services)	Global and local view, media (TV, Radio), family circle behavior	8, 4, 11
Narrative/Experience	actors, voice, stories	4, 7

Data triangulation was utilized during the coding of the data and analysis (Hanson et al., 2011). The emergent themes from one respondent to the dataset in general were compared by me, to ensure saturation and research findings validity. The Discrepant cases that were contrary to the emergent themes were searched and noted (Petty et al., 2012). I presented these discrepancies and examined them. I then presented them together with the other themes to ensure critical comparison of these findings. I listened to the respondents during the interview recording and took note regarding potential codes that could be referred to by the participants. I transcribed the interview and presented the preliminary codes. I utilized NVivo software 11 for data management. I transcribed the initial interview and coded it, followed by interview 2 which was transcribed and coded. I then recorded them to seek for any emerging or new codes. I proceeded to do the interview 3, transcribed and coded it, and then recorded interview 2 for emerging and new codes. This process was used till saturation was reached.

Issues of Trustworthiness

The quality and dependability of a qualitative researcher is evaluated based on h/her trustworthiness. Hence, Lincoln and Guba (1984) developed four criteria to ascertain the trustworthiness of a qualitative research. These include the following:

- Credibility,
- Transferability,
- Dependability, and
- Confirmability.

The methods by which this study met these criteria are discussed in this section.

Credibility

One of the limitations of qualitative research lies in the fact that its findings cannot be generalized to a larger population with the same level of confidence as you would with a quantitative study (Atieno, 2009). Hence, the need for the researcher to engage in a methodological and comprehensive data collection that can respond to the research topic. Researchers' bias poses a significant threat to the validity and credibility of the research outcome (Maxwell, 2013; Patton, 2015). Credibility is one of the crucial elements to ensure trustworthiness. The purpose of the research is to provide findings that meet the requirement of trustworthiness; this means the study outcome reported is not subject to doubt.

Therefore, the researcher would need to approach the study with a disposition that strives to keep his or her bias in check. Patton (2002), advised that one of the ways to address this bias would be for research to explore data that enhances results that counter

what the researcher sets out to seek. Creswell (2013) supported the claim by stating that the researcher needs to acknowledge his or her bias at the onset to enable the reader to understand the perception and analysis by the researcher. Another way to address the issue of credibility is to have the researcher's peer review the data collected by the researcher (Shenton, 2004).

In my research study, it was vital for me to note some of the elements that define credibility such as peer briefing, prolonged engagement, member check, referential adequacy and persistent observations (Drost, 2011). The predominantly used are triangulation and member checks. Triangulation is the use of the same research question on a different respondent, a collection of data from varied sources and application of different methods to respond to the same issues (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005). My study employed an interview as a data collection method. Hence, I took extensive field notes and engaged in careful observation to record those non-verbal cues Creswell (2013) that provided additional perspective from the participant. The non-verbal response gave a thorough and revealing coding process that ensured useful interpretation and the outcome of research (Creswell, 2016).

Member checking was vital for my study through the involvement of the participants in the data review to ensure the accuracy of interpretation. In this way, my research study guaranteed credibility which makes the qualitative study believable, as validity was to quantitative study method (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Member checking was a credible system of ensuring validity. Hence, I requested to check with the parents

on what they thought of the findings and conclusion of the study to confirm accuracy in the representation of their perspective.

Marshall argued in favor of the usefulness of requesting that participants review the information that they provided to verify that the data accurately reflected their response during the interview process (Marshall, 1996). This process of member checking will give them the chance to correct errors of fact or errors of interpretation (Simon, 2011). In this way, the process aligned with triangulation of data, since the documents provided a useful tool to validate participants' sentiments, thus, reinforcing internal validity.

Saturation was important to improve credibility of a (Merriam & Tisdell, 2013). At some point in the data collection process, adding more participants becomes irrelevant if no new information is generated (Saldana, 2016). The 12 parent-households in my study kept repeating the same issues about policies on sex trafficking, I had to acknowledge that the study has attained saturation. I used the coding and saturation matrix to enable me track saturation and identify other ways that can be necessary to ask some questions.

Credibility can also be achieved through reflexivity (Petty, Thomson, & Stew, 2012). Reflexivity entails the researcher's need for consistency in awareness of his or her biases and a conscious effort to mitigate how these biases can impact the data generated from the research. To address the issue of bias and commit to reducing its effect on the study, I employed what (Tufford & Newman, 2012) referred to as reflexive Bracketing.

Reflexive bracketing is an iterative method used in qualitative research to reduce the potentiality of preconceptions that may taint the research process. This helped me to approach the data with objectivity, since I began this study with the belief that there was lack of effective strategies to prevent sex trafficking due to government inability to collaborate with the community in the formulation of preventive policies and procedures targeting sex trafficking in Ogwa community.

Transferability

Another issue for consideration in ensuring trustworthiness is transferability of the conclusions from the qualitative data collected. Transferability refers to the probability of generalization of the research finding to other situations (Konneh, 2017). For instance, the reader of this document may establish the need for replication of an improvement in the development of effective policies and procedures that harnesses community participation in addressing prevention of sex trafficking to similar such participatory strategies regarding the creativity and dynamics that contributed to the effectiveness of the program in Ogwa community. Thus, determining broader applicability than the population under the study (Tracy, 2010).

To establish transferability, a thick description was used to provide richly detailed information (Petty et al., 2012) highlighting the situational context for the reader. In this way, helping the reader to connect to the document to be able to comprehend the intent of the participants' opinion.

Hence, the selection of 12 parent-households of potentially vulnerable victims of sex trafficking under this study provided the needed information to demonstrate the

uniqueness of the dynamics that will be involved in the development of a community-based preventive policy to address sex trafficking. Thus, a detailed account of my findings may be used by others who wish to apply the same procedures to another situation thereby achieving the same results.

Dependability

This is the measurement of how stable the study can remain overtime (Morrow, 2005). I was aware of some limitations that could accrue from the interview; where distorted data could be from interviewees' response due to their own bias, sensitivities, and experiences. The participants may react in negative ways to the interviewer, depending on the tone of voice, demeanor, and ability to put the interviewer at ease in the process of the interview (Patton, 2002). It was essential that I as the researcher recognized this potential problem and developed plans to address this issue during the meeting if need be.

Todres, (2003) clearly pointed out that as long as there are no errors in the study conceptualization, and there is consistency in data collection gathering, interpretation of study findings, transparent reporting of result and instructions are specific and detailed, this would prove dependability in the data collected (Todres, 2003). Because of this advice, I developed a dependable study that identified reliable patterns prompting other researchers to replicate the study.

Triangulation can contribute to dependability, if the findings of the study can establish enough support from a wide range of participants. (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). If many of the participants concurs with the themes that emerged from the data, then the

study result can be accurate and is likely to remain stable over a period of time. I used triangulation to further ensure dependability of the study.

Also, an audit trail was used which provided a measure to ensure study dependability if the researcher documents detailed methodological steps used in the study (Petty et al., 2012) Through following the methodological steps I used in carrying out this study, another researcher will be able to replicate this study, and evaluate the procedures and sensibility in the methodological decisions that I followed in conducting this study.

Confirmability

Confirmability means that the study findings accurately represents the participants' opinion on the phenomenon under study and not that of the researcher (Patton, 2002).

Confirmability is enhanced through reflexivity. As Patton (2002) posited, confirmability is the degree to which a study outcome can be varied from or corroborated by peers or others who reviewed the study. This is thus, a form of member checking to endorse confirmability in research which provided objectivity of the study.

The objectivity of this study required an oversight which was needed to confirm that the data collected, and its findings are participants' ideas and experiences and not my preferences and summations. Lincoln and Guber (1985) further suggested four requirements for valid data interpretation: Neutrality, consistency, truth-value, and applicability. Neutrality was the position I took to make sure that I as the investigator had no bias and thus this confirmed study confirmability.

Ethical Procedures/Considerations

Before data collection, I received permission for conducting the study. The Walden IRB approval number for this study is 11-19-19-0650537 and it expires on November 18, 2020.

To ensure ethical principles in this study, I obtained an informed consent from the participants to meet the federal requirement for protection of research participants. Patton (2015) emphasized the need to obtain informed consent and confidentiality before the research. Informed consent reiterated that the participants involvement was strictly voluntary, participants' expectation, and an explanation that the respondent would have any monetary remuneration. Also, it was explained to the participants my intention to audio record the interview and confirmation of the participants' right to confidentiality as advised by (Patton, 2015)

All participants involved in the study were assigned numbers and were reminded of their right to withdraw from the interview process if they wished.

In our discussion, I stated respectfully the need not to feel threatened by me, and anonymous retention of their names (Rubin & Rubin, 2012). I rescheduled appointment at a convenient time and place, in the event that there was any parent-household who missed their interview appointment.

The respondents were treated with respect and approached in a way that respected their dignity. I let them know that the collected data from the respondents will be stored safely in the computer which can only be accessed by me with a password. This information storage system eliminated issues of privacy, fears and ensured participants'

confidentiality of identity and shared information (Laureate Education (Producer). (2014- a). The participants were told that all back up data with written notes and observations will be stored in my personal computer. They were also informed of the destruction of all collected information after five years and all information on paper shredded.

Other ethical issues involved the choice of respondents who are familiar with the construct under measurement (Bhattacharjee, 2012). As mentioned earlier, I used people (such as parents) who are conversant with the subject matter as advised by (Taylor et al., 2013). One of the strengths of content validation was the intuitive and straightforward nature of its basic idea. Content validation holds that what a test seeks to measure constitutes a content domain, and the items on the test should sample from that domain in a way that makes the test items representative of the entire field (Keith & Kellie, 2012). Content validation methods seek to assess this quality of the items on a test (Keith & Kellie, 2012 para 2).

Validity requires the verification of results utilization since validity is used to rule out any threats to measurements and designs (Konneh, 2017). Hence, my commitment to ensure the validity of this research was by adhering to the established procedures. One of the ways that I developed efficacy was to coopt appropriate participants for the study (Shenton, 2004). To ensure content validity, therefore, I made sure that the interview questions measure the constructs under the study. I paid attention to ensure that the responses received represent the actual opinions of participants and not influenced by external factors (Bhattacharjee, 2012).

Also, I have no relationship with the participants of this study and as such there was no conflict of interest or power differential associated with this study. I did not indulge in unethical inducement in the participation of this study, since I did not use coercion in my recruitment process.

Summary

The sole method of data collection utilized face-to-face semistructured interviews with 12 selected parent-households of young girls and women in Ogwa community. A thematic data analysis was applied which aimed at understanding the perspective of parents on the threats and reality of existing policy used to address the phenomenon of sex trafficking in their community of Ogwa. The chapter discussed the issues of trustworthiness to address the ethical requirements of the study. The next chapter presents the study result and interpretation of the research findings. Chapter 5 includes the discussion on the results of this study.

Chapter 4: Results

Introduction

The purpose of this study was to explore the impact of the perspectives of parents of girls and women (aged 13-21) on existing government policies and procedures for the prevention of sex trafficking in the Ogwa community. The research question guiding this study was as follows: How do parents of girls and women (aged 13-21) experience the threat (and the reality) of sex trafficking in Ogwa?

The findings from this study may give policymakers insight into the benefits of community participation in long-term interventions to prevent sex trafficking. The findings may also (a) help policymakers develop community-based approaches to eradicating sex trafficking and (b) challenge leaders in government, as well as the community, to consider the ways in which they can address the root causes of sex trafficking. This community participatory strategy in finding a solution to sex trafficking may improve the socioeconomic status of the Ogwa people and beyond, leading to reduction in poverty rates and thereby promoting positive social change.

For this study, I gathered data through face-to-face semistructured interviews with 12 participants. The goal was to understand their perspectives on the impact of existing policies and procedures on preventing sex trafficking, which had been developed in their community. I used NVivo 11 to assist with data analysis, management, and organization.

This chapter covers the interview setting, the demography of the participants, details on the data collection method, and the processes used for organizing and coding data. I describe the themes that emerged from the data analysis and discrepant cases. I

also explore the steps that I used to provide evidence of trustworthiness and present details on the study results.

Research Question

The research question for this study was as follows: How do parents of girls and women (aged 13-21) experience the threat (and the reality) of sex trafficking in Ogwa?

Setting

All participants selected the location for their interview. I encouraged them to select a location that would permit them the serenity and quiet they needed to concentrate on answering questions, away from their children and neighbors. The chosen locations were relaxed and comfortable spaces in which respondents could actively participate. Of the 12 participants, 10 completed interviews at a community center; two participants were interviewed at their offices.

Each participant gave consent to be interviewed following my explanation of the study and the content of the consent form. I made a recording of the participant saying “I consent” before each interview began. The participants spoke freely, without fear or pressure. Each interview ended when the participant had no new information to share with me.

Demographics

The participants were seven women and five men from separate households in Ogwa. Among the female participants, four were traders, two were full-time housewives, and one was a teacher. Four of the five male participants were farmers; one held public office.

One of the participants told me that there are few men present for the interviews because most of the male-headed households were either dead or had left for the city in search of work. This information was relevant to the study because it confirmed the belief about the vulnerability of the children who grow up in female-headed households as being the ones mostly trafficked.

I identified participants as eligible for this research based on their role as parents of vulnerable girls and women. Participant selection was not based on age, economic status, or tribal affiliation as this type of demographic information was irrelevant to this study. I questioned all participants to ensure that they were neither trafficking victims themselves nor parents of such victims. Participants were recruited from an area 10 miles in diameter surrounding Ogwa, with the exception of two participants who lived in the nearest village neighboring the Ogwa market.

There were three participants who made connections and analysis linking trafficking and poverty. They also addressed how those in government needed to collaborate with the community of Ogwa before making policy decisions on how to combat sex trafficking. The analysis offered by these participants was based on their understanding that they were directly affected by the problem.

Data Collection

The data were collected from 12 participants. Each interview lasted 45 to 60 minutes. I recruited participants by posting flyers in churches and at marketplaces. Participants were recruited from two villages approximately 6 miles from each other. I

used a semistructured, face-to-face interview protocol (Appendix A) to help the participants focus on the issue of interest.

During the interviews, greetings and introductions were exchanged. I built rapport by using light conversation to make the participants comfortable. The initial conversation began with a detailed explanation of the purpose of the study and the contents of the consent form. I took time to respond to participants' questions, including questions that were not related to the study. Additionally, I addressed privacy issues with the participants and encouraged them to speak freely. Each participant agreed to take part in the study by saying "I consent," which I recorded. I then asked for permission to audio-record the interview. During the interviews, I asked all participants similar questions. I posed follow-up questions for clarification, as well as to get more information on unrelated but relevant issues that participants pointed out (Creswell, 2013; Patton, 2015).

Because the participants comprised of fathers and mothers, their input was essential in providing different perspectives. I documented field notes and other relevant ideas for use at the analysis stage if needed. I wrote notes using personal journals (see Appendix B). I used journaling to record my thoughts, insights, and experiences, as well as issues that might be relevant for detailed analysis (Mero-Jaffe, 2011). Because journaling is a form of triangulation, it allowed me to bracket my biases.

I used a built-in member checking process by reviewing participants' responses after each interview. Built-in member checking was done by reading to each participant his or her response to my questions to ensure that I accurately documented what he or she said. The purpose of this type of member checking was to verify that the information that

participants gave me corresponded to what I understood and had put in writing to ensure accuracy of the interview process (Marshall, 1996).

All interviews were recorded. I used two tape recorders as a precaution in case of malfunction. Within 24 hours of each interview, I had copied the recording to my laptop under a confidential password. In this way, I complied with the provisions for the safe storage of collected data specified in my approved IRB application. Each interview was transcribed verbatim within 48 hours of data collection.

There were some variations from the data-collection process stated in Chapter 3. I originally planned to interview 15 participants but was able to stop data collection after conducting interviews with 12 participants having achieved saturation (Rubin & Rubin, 2016). Saturation helped to establish credibility of the study (Merriam & Tisdell, 2013). Saturation is the point at which the addition of more participants can no longer generate new information and do not explain further the collected information in any significant way (Stuckey, 2013). All 12 participants kept repeating what was said by the others by emphasizing that the existing government policies on preventing sex trafficking are not effective and do not involve local community. Thus, I saw no need to conduct any more interviews. The attainment of saturation depicted that sufficient evidence of support had been found for each theme, thus enhancing research findings' legitimacy.

No unusual circumstances were encountered during the data collection process. All participants were interested in the topic and were happy to share their insights into the phenomenon of sex trafficking that had ravaged their community.

Data Analysis

As mentioned in Chapter three, I used Braun and Clarke's (2006) thematic data analysis approach. It helped me to identify patterns, opinions, concepts, phrases, and ideas that could support a detailed summary of the collected data.

The recorded data were transcribed verbatim within 48 hours and were stored in a secure personal computer. After a week, I went back to the community to let them know the content of the transcription and to find out if there were any comments on the transcription or if there were any discrepancies in it. There were no concerns. I precoded the data, which enabled me to find the parameters that helped me to ascertain the amount and quality of data that I had collected for coding, thus laying emphasis on the specific data that responded to my research question.

The collected data were uploaded into the NVivo 11 software and were coded based on each question of the interview protocol in a way that the question number organized the responses to each question. I used the software to organize and store the data for reexamination of themes, coding, analysis, interpretation, and representation.

I also hand-coded the data to help me understand and organize the vital themes. Data were initially collected and coded based on 14 questions. Six or more similar answers to a question were grouped to form codes. Each significant thought was separated into coded units, and a node was given based on the frequency of occurrence of each participant's idea or opinion.

Table 5

Frequency Table

Codes	Frequency
Awareness education	f = 56
Community dialogue with government (emergent theme)	f = 20
Environment and family support	f = 40
Effective intersectoral collaboration	f = 30
Lack of infrastructure (roads	f = 45
Enforcement of educational legislation	f = 50
Lack of political commitment to punish traffickers	f = 30

As I began making connections and formulating new codes such as stigma, shame, and lack of political will to involve people, to mention but a few, several similar themes emerged (awareness education, community/government dialogue, environment and family support). The plan for coding was determined from NPF theory with reference to the research question.

Because of the role of the parents in exploring this study, it became imperative to use PPA (Laird, 1993) as a lens for this data analysis. I applied PPA because it contributes to integrating the mental models of differing actors' approaches to address my research question. The term *mental model* in a policy network refers to a conceptual model that each actor has in his or her mind to explain the way policy operates. PPA has been used extensively in the analysis of development interventions and programs targeted at community members in order to influence policy, thus revealing its importance in

stakeholder policy analysis (Durning, 1990; deLeon, 1999; Robb, 2002). PPA helped me explain the reason for the involvement of parents in policy analysis in this study. It offered direction on ways in which the analysis of the policies and procedures could influence the implementation of an innovative plan.

PPA recognizes the participation of stakeholders in the interpretation of difficulties by using the political lens. It has encouraged the beneficiaries of government programs to determine what regulations, legislation, and subsidies are needed to accomplish the goals of government (Hult, 2015). Hence, PPA can empower stakeholders such as Ogwa community to become contributors to active policy development, which improves the legitimacy and implementation of policy.

Evidence of Trustworthiness

One challenge of a researcher is to establish trustworthiness. Hence the need to explore the four criteria established by Lincoln and Guba (1984) to ensure trustworthiness in a qualitative study: credibility, transferability, dependability and confirmability.

Credibility

Credibility refers to the extent which the study outcome accurately explained the phenomenon of the study (Leech & Onwuegbuzie, 2011). I contributed to credibility of the study by use of data triangulation (Hanson et al., 2011). Triangulation is comparing data from various sources to create a credible and substantiated finding and reveal discrepancies to the prevailing theme (Thomas & Magilvy, 2011). Data triangulation was used to make comparison across participants' interview (See Table 6). This comparison

revealed that each possessed unique perception regarding their experiences with the phenomenon under study. In this way, I ensured that the themes that emerged were endorsed by most of the respondents across the dataset.

Table 6

Data Triangulation

Profile	Part 1	Part 2	Part 3	Part 4	Part 5	Part 6
Economic status	Poor	Poor	Middle class	Middle class	Poor	Middle class
Educational background	High sch	Elementary	Associate degree	High school	Never went to school	Never went to school
Perception	No government/community collaboration	None	None	None	None	None

Data triangulation from all 12 participants from various economic and educational background, points out the same conclusion that government did not collaborate with the community to address the preventive intervention on sex trafficking. While it is true that government has implemented different programs in Ogwa, none has created a sustainable impact because government has not giving voice to the project beneficiaries. Hence data triangulation provides data validation and research by cross verification of the same information. This type of data triangulation contributes to strengthening of the research because the data increases validity and credibility (Creswell, 1994).

Bracketing was recommended to ensure the reduction of researcher bias (Tufford & Newman, 2012). I made sure that I used this tool to limit my personal bias throughout the data collection process.

It helped me to approach the collection of information with objectivity. My belief, prior to conducting the interviews, was that there was no community engagement in policy analysis on existing preventive programs on sex trafficking. Hence, it was imperative to ensure that the interview and follow-up questions did not change the course of the interview process in such a way that participants could not tell their story from their own perspectives. The interview and follow up questions also helped the participants to share their experience on how the lack of community involvement has negatively impacted effective programs to eradicate sex trafficking from Ogwa community.

Transferability

Transferability refers to the degree to which the results of qualitative research can be generalized or transferred to other contexts or settings. The reader has the task of deciding on whether a study finding can be replicated or is applicable to situations other than the study location or population (Tracy, 2013). He or she may be able to adopt themes and categories generated from the participants as basis to serve as a reference for other researchers seeking to expand the idea of participation in policy process in combatting sex trafficking (Hacker, 2018).

The reader can also see the variation in the people who participated in the study such as, women, men, poor, and from varied socio-economic background and

experiences as a potential factor for transferability of this study. The study outcome may be used in other rural settings in studies related to the perspective of parents on existing policies and their observations and reality on the prevention of sex trafficking (Rafferty, 2013). This detailed information provides the reader with a situational context for generating insights based on the study findings that can help to determine the applicability beyond the study participants, thus ensuring transferability.

In this study, I did not seek to generalize data; hence my findings can only be applied to a small population of people in the surrounding villages of Ogwa. However, due to the differences in the experiences of respondents, socio-economic background, gender, and ethnicity, it could be possible to transfer these finding in other studies that are related to the perception of community on the eradication of sex trafficking. It can also be used in other states or community environment (Rafferty, 2013).

To ensure applicability, a quantitative instrument can utilize participants' responses from this study and distribute them in a survey form to more educated participants of a larger sample in different parts of Nigeria. Also, mixed-methods study could combine the outcome of this research to come up with a more comprehensive approach which could further authenticate this study.

Dependability

Dependability asks: How can the study be measured for stability over time and over conditions (Morrow, 2005)? As mentioned in Chapter three, I used an audit trail, an in-depth approach to show that the study findings are based on the participants' narrative. This involved description on how the data was collected and analyzed in a transparent

manner. In this way, another researcher can follow the process utilized in this study and able to replicate not only the study but also able to evaluate the precautions adopted by the researcher in her methodological decisions in conducting this study (Petty et al., 2012).

Hence, I explored similar approach to my study and chose to consistently code and record the collected data to establish reliability. In recoding the data, I paid attention and double checked my journal and field notes to make sure that all participants' responses are recorded and documented prior to theme coding. And any emerging theme that was repeated by several participants was an evidence of accuracy and depicts that the study will be stable overtime. The data collected were examined severally to identify any theme that deviates from the main topic of the study. The purpose of recoding of themes was to clarify to the readers the purpose of the coding and to show that my analysis followed a logical path that was dependent on participants' narrative.

Confirmability

Confirmability means that the study data and interpretations reflect accurately the response and opinions of the participants and not that of the researcher (Thomas & Magilvy, 2011).

As I noted in Chapter three, I employed the attitude of reflexivity as depicted in data collection and analysis. I used the process of epoch to block my bias by using a journal to track my bias and experience of my relationship with participants, as well as assumptions made before, during and at the end of the data collection process. I noted in my personal notes; themes that were emerging or repetitive opinions. See Appendix B for

an example of the journal notes written during the interview. The notes were helpful at the stages of data interpretation and writing of study findings.

Member checking after the interview process was another technique that helped in ensuring study confirmability. In this way making sure that participants' voices were documented as expressed by them (Mero-Jaffe, 2011). Also, the use of audit trail added to the confirmability of the study because it allows the readers to follow the decisions made at the methodological and analytic stages to evaluate the level of objectivity of my actions (Thomas & Magilvy, 2011).

Results

The research study sought to answer the question: How do parents of girls and women (aged 13-21) experience the threat (and the reality) of sex trafficking in Ogwa?

The findings depicted the themes in tabular form according to frequency of occurrence. The themes were derived from the coded responses based on the core research question and the study theoretical framework. The collected data from the respondents corresponds with some of the codes such as constraints/challenges, and government institution that were previously outlined in the preliminary codebook. Additional codes emerged, such as government accountability, lack of infrastructure and community/government collaboration. Most of the codes that emerged from the responses of the participants are related to the theoretical framework, research question, and interview questions.

In coding the data for the second round, many codes were merged to create new codes, while some were eliminated because they occurred infrequently in the coding.

Themes were formed from the coded data, developing a relationship with the research question and the theoretical framework. The review of the study result was conducted based on the research question, frequency (recurring) of the topic, emerging themes, and non-conforming data which supported with direct quotation from the participants.

The themes listed in Table 7 emerged from codes derived from the responses of parents who participated in the study regardless of their educational background, occupation, rural or semi-rural dwelling, age or gender. I combine the themes and explain the theme under the subsections research question that are related to them. I present the results in the data coding and analysis framework shown in Table 7. I discussed theme and the data presented from the perspective of the participants.

Table 7

Data Coding and Analysis Framework

Theme	Category	Code	Code frequency (f)
Community participation	Community/government dialogue	Unemployment	10
		Poverty	8
		Church involvement	10
		Ineffective program	15
Awareness education	Environment/family support	Victim's low self-image	9
		Exploitation by ATR priests	13
		Shame, Stigma	10
Infrastructural development	Enforcement of legislation	Road construction	9
		Renovation of schools	10
		Free education	8
	Government accountability	Rehabilitation of victims	10
		Arrest and punishment of traffickers	8
		Rehabilitation of traffickers	7
Intersectoral collaboration	Political commitment	Involve health professionals	15
		Collaborate in policymaking	9
		Border control	7

In this table I presented the list of codes and frequencies in the dataset. It also shows the five categories and four themes. The table also provided an overview of connections with codes, categories and themes.

The codes and themes emerged from the participants' perception and experience of the threat (and the reality) of sex trafficking in Ogwa community, points to these themes as the most vital governmental disparities in policy implementation. Each of these themes are discussed in detail, taking into cognizance the research question and theoretical framework.

Theme 1: Community Participation

The lack of community/government dialogue is one of the reasons for the participants to opt for community participation. The following codes were generated as aspects that require dialogue with the community: Unemployment ($f = 10$), poverty ($f = 8$), church involvement ($f = 10$) and ineffective programs ($f = 15$). This dominated the discussion among the 12 participants. Some of them saw it as a crucial topic in the conversation on effective policies and procedures targeting the prevention of sex trafficking. They reckon that no meaningful prevention can occur without the collaboration between government and community in agreeing on methods of action to combat trafficking for sexual exploitation.

When asked what challenges that community has faced in dealing with victims who returned? Participant six expressed frustration at government programs which do not explore the issues of shame and stigma attached to trafficking and how the victims are not integrated into the community. She said that the victims lack sense of belonging. The

victims have the notion that people believe that they are infected with HIV/AIDS and would not want to have anything to do with them.

Participant two decried the need for dialogue with the community in all program implementation. In this way, the government can receive useful in-depth information on what is happening in the community and how best to design the planned actions to eradicate sex trafficking.

One discrepant case involved two participants had a deferring view when they commented that some community members have nothing to contribute in a dialogue with the government. They said that this is because these individuals raise lazy children, encourage and pay money to would be traffickers to take their children to Europe. By doing so, they believe that they can make more money to help them escape poverty.

Theme 2. Awareness Education

Awareness education was the most mentioned theme among all the 12 participants in reference to Interview Questions 2, 4, 5, 6, 9 and 14. The questions the answered are related to their perception and factors fueling sex trafficking in their community. The questions were as follows:

2. What do you know about the sex trafficking that exists in Ogwa community?
4. In your opinion what are the factors driving sex trafficking in Ogwa?
5. What is your understanding of the population that are more at risk of being targeted for sex trafficking in Ogwa?
6. What policies has Edo State developed to prevent sex trafficking in persons?
9. What challenges or barriers affect service delivery for victims?

14. In what way do you see the government's collaboration with the community in addressing the prevention of sex trafficking?

In general, most of the participants believe that awareness education as a policy was one of the crucial factors at the root of sex trafficking. Some of the factors that prompted the conversation on the need for awareness education is the need for environmental and family support. The participants believed that victims' low self-esteem ($f = 9$), exploitation by African Traditional Priests ($f = 8$), shame and stigma ($f = 10$) are issues that can be addressed through education of the community. Participant 1 affirmed the need for government to engage the community in an educational awareness that creatively involves the community since their present approach is not effective. She stated,

Government should provide agents who should educate everybody and advise them on ways to avoid being trafficked and the effects of sex trafficking. The use of media television, radios and local town criers were given as some examples of tools that can be used to educate the community.

Participant 2 echoed the same need for government to educate people. This participant believes that many of the young girls and women are deceived into believing that there are jobs for them in especially Italy. And on getting there, they are turned into sex slaves.

Five of the participants were of the opinion that some of the traditional myths of the African Traditional Religious priests needed to be addressed in the awareness education program. They emphasized the need to help the community to understand the

emptiness of the priest's incantation and prophecies. In educating the people, they will come to realize the danger of believing the traditional priests who has taking advantage of the poverty of his or her client as a ground to distort African Traditional Religion (ATR) for their own benefit.

The participants stated,

The community should be warned to beware of ATR priests who parade the village as healers and advocates for justice. There are some of them who feed on the poor and engage in financial exploitation with traffickers because of people's lack of education.

Participant 12 shared how through education, she understood that going to Italy is a higher risk than staying at home to learn a skill which she said has helped her to raise her children. She talked about her desire to provide her children with not just education on how not to engage in frivolous lifestyle but to give them a better quality of life through higher learning in the university. She further told a story of a single mother who despite her environmental upbringing and socio-economic standard raised her four children to be become responsible citizens. All her children are working and earning income which has raised their economic status. Some of her children are mentors in the community. Hence, she emphasized the need for government to involve them in formulating programs, so that the community can generate ideas that can help develop effective preventive strategies to address sex trafficking.

Theme 3: Infrastructural Development

Lack of enabling Infrastructure was an important theme that was echoed by the 12 participants. They lamented on the lack of amenities such as clean water supply, electricity and most of all good roads to transport their produce. Interview question 11, 12, and 13 were directly posed to the participants. The questions are as follows:

11. What challenges or barriers affect service delivery for victims?

12. How do you feel government officials with whom your community interact with, understand the nature of sex trafficking?

Please provide examples of agreement, misconceptions or misunderstandings related to trafficking in persons, particularly those that might affect effectiveness at detecting and combating sex trafficking?

13. How can parental perspective inform future policy outcome?

Some participant made a strong connection between lack of good roads, and trafficking, stating that farmers sometimes get good harvest but cannot transport their produce to the cities where they can sell their produce for a higher price. Some traders that brave the bad roads to come into their village, will give them little for their hard work since they prey on their inability to find transportation for themselves to go to the cities.

Participant 10 narrated the experience of a young farmer who made efforts to farm the land after returning from Italy. The young man tried to make a living through farming, since their land is fertile. But he faced the challenge of where to sell his produce due to bad roads. After working for four years on the land and could not see any change in his quality of life, he left to rejoin the traffickers.

Based on experience, this participant made an insightful point, because I did not make connections between bad roads and trafficking. And it is evident in the generated codes where need for road construction occurred nine times ($f = 9$). The issue pointed out by this participant highlighted the need for dialogue between the government and community as key to finding sustainable prevention strategies to address the problem of sex trafficking.

Theme 4 Intersectoral Collaboration

Effective intersectoral collaboration was a theme expressed by 10 out of 12 participants especially as it pertained to the question: Who can you contact for preventive measures and victim assistance?

The participants were aware of the policy on addressing the problem of victims, but they expressed their discontent on the silo approach to government policy. Ten participants commented on the issue of multisectoral collaboration as holistic approach to address the prevention of sex trafficking in Ogwa. The assumption was that without a policy of intersectoral intervention, the effort to prevent sex trafficking will be a myth. There is clear evidence that life is interconnected, and one aspect affects the other. Therefore, in dealing with either prevention or rehabilitation, different sectors and service providers have a role in addressing the problem from their various perspectives.

Participant two emphasized the need to work with health professionals to assess the health status of returned victims. And to provide them adequate treatment to check infectious diseases and at the same time working with Employment/skill development to assist them to be gainfully employed.

Participant five reiterated the need for involving all government and non-governmental agencies in the process of finding solution to the problem of sex trafficking. In his words,

The government comes here and start programs that the community and the youths do not need. If they had discussed with us, we would let them know that provision of tailoring materials/equipment and ownership of plots of land for farming could help bring some interested youths out of poverty. If youths are engaged, they will not be looking for other ways to make money through evil means. Therefore, government has to work with different agencies.

Theme 5: Environmental and Family Support

Environmental and family support was another theme that emerged among 10 participants. This topic they said is important because of the influence it has had on determining childhood development and growth. They emphasized that this issue is one of the many factors at the root of the prevalent sex trafficking taking place in the community. They felt that although the government understands this link as part of their policy, but they have to work with the community to help them make an informed connection on the issue based on practical examples in Ogwa community.

Participants pointed out compelling issues that some children grew up in families whose fathers are in Europe as traffickers and not at home to raise especially their male children. The absence of the father they stated can be a driving factor for the young boy to grow up to engage in trafficking. Ten Participant expressed their dismay at the difficulties faced by children who are raised by single women. The children in the family

have no role model to encourage them and teach them the value of education and good morals.

Participant eight opined that due to family upbringing and lack of discipline in some homes, some parents lack the moral stance to help their children to understand the danger of crossing the Atlantic Ocean into Italy. And some of them get stuck in Libya where they can either lose their lives or taken into slavery. Libya is one of the trafficking routes where victims are kept while awaiting passage into Lampedusa, Italy. These victims can contract any disease and die an untimely death said Participant 4.

Theme 6: Legislation on Education

A theme that was one of the most mentioned was the need for government to enforce educational legislation in all communities. Although there was policy on education, the participants stated that there is no department to enforce the law and subsequently provide the educational materials vital for effective learning. All the 12 participants were passionate about the deploring nature of the public schools in their community. When asked: What services does Edo State government provide to the community and their feelings regarding government's understanding of the nature of sex trafficking.

All participants especially eight participants decried the deplorable state of schools established to educate for their children. They believe that there is no proper structure to keep children interested in school and discourage them from leaving Ogwa. Participant four expressed dismay at the lack of desk, tables benches and proper blackboards in the classroom. The children have no zeal to stay in class.

The participants challenged the government commitment to education to check sex trafficking. They emphasized the need to not only build schools, but it is imperative to provide basic classroom furniture to aid learning, and provision of trained teachers.

Participant 10 disagreed with government posting of teachers. He stated that the government do not post good teachers who want to commit themselves to the education of rural children. The teachers posted to them seem disgruntled, unhappy and this he said affects learning and encourage dropout rate.

Participant 12 exclaimed the lack of consistency on the part of the government to follow up on adequate education and enforcement of the law on mandatory education passed by the Federal government. Children are seen hawking on the markets and on streets during school hours. Some parents claim that they do not have any other person to help them feed the children.

He further stated the need for free education which will be a way for parents to send their children to school without making an excuse with lack of finance. Most families who would want their children to go to school may not have the money especially if their parents are subsistence farmers. This policy if implemented he said will encourage children from especially low-income families to attend school.

The discussion and experience of these participants showed that they are critically analyzing government policy on education. They saw the gaps and how it can be filled to address the loss of children through trafficking.

While the patterns showed that respondents overall were discontent about government policies designed to address sex trafficking, the majority acknowledged that

while it is good to have schools to educate the children, the enforcement of the legislation on education is important to help prevent young girls and women from being taken as sex slaves. The results revealed that majority of participants believed that policies and procedures targeting the prevention of sex trafficking, need to be more community-centered in helping government in the planning of programs that are appropriate based on their input.

Theme 7: Trafficker Arrest, Punishment and Rehabilitation

Arrest, punishment and rehabilitation of traffickers are themes mostly pointed out by 9 out of the 12 participants. They believe that corruption contributed to the slow pace in addressing this policy and thereby eradicating sex trafficking in the community. They nine participants attributed this problem to lack of political commitment on the part of government to make a change.

On responding to the question what policies Edo State has developed to prevent sex trafficking in persons, Participant 8 clearly stated that the lack of commitment among government officials makes it impossible for them to address rehabilitative measures for ex-offenders. Arrest and punishment are sometimes not enforced especially when the government official is related to the trafficker, are involved in the gang that transports young girls and women out of the community, or sponsors of the traffickers. She also eludes to the fact that there is mismanagement of the skill development center set up to rehabilitate offenders. She said,

When the youth graduate, they do not receive adequate financial assistance to support their business. They leave Oigwa when they are faced with this situation.

Therefore overall, participants' responses points to the difficulties associated with lack of commitment on the part of government to follow up on issues that address the root causes of sex trafficking. Hence, there will be no meaningful and effective policy to achieve success in arrest, punishment and rehabilitation of traffickers if some officials are involved in the organized crime of sex trafficking.

Discrepant Case

The discrepant case encountered during the interview was from Participant nine who had a differing view. She stated,

Some of the women are lazy to farm the land. I believe that it is their choice to put themselves in the position to be trafficked. They look for young men with flashy cars, money and sophisticated homes. The parents want them to go for this kind of men for marriage without asking for their source of income. In the process of befriending these men, they are trafficked, and the parents will later find out that no marriage took place.

This difference in perspective in this participant depicts the cultural socialization that pervade in the society that girls and women who are trafficked made the choice. But the unexplored narrative is that poverty and unstable family upbringing are some of the driving force that make the victims to engage in activities that undermine their quality of life. This experience to lay blame on the woman shaped the belief of this participant that all girls and women have equal opportunity to work hard but some chose not to. This participant did not see poverty and unstable family upbringing of the victim as a factor that contributed to her being trafficked.

Summary

In this chapter I presented the result of the research study. The interview protocol was designed to align with the theory of Narrative Policy Framework and related to the research question. The interviews disclosed that the perception of parents and their experience of the threat (and the reality) of sex trafficking in Ogwa impacted the community in a multifaceted way. A factor that was particularly stressed was the participants' experience and observation of the policy on awareness education and how it has impacted the community especially people from low-income socio-economic and educational background. Although perceptions are limited to the groups' and individual's viewpoint, the findings clearly highlight the vital role of government's collaboration with the community in the search for solution regarding sex trafficking.

Hence, the following identified themes based on participants response of awareness education, community-government dialogue, environment and family support, intersectoral collaboration, Infrastructural development, enforcement of legislation on education, and trafficker Arrest, punishment and rehabilitation policies can be effective in addressing sex trafficking. If these themes are addressed collectively, it will improve the quality of life of the community, and thus create a long-term solution to the phenomenon of sex trafficking that will benefit both the community and victims.

Hence, the participants believe that policy reform which can effectively address the prevention of sex trafficking is possible, if the government can tap the knowledge of the community in improving existing policies. With the participation of the community in

exploring other intricacies involved in a given policy, they may provide policy makers with useful insight into what was not initially addressed in a policy.

Although the findings involved only 12 participants from the Ogwa community, this study may pave a way for future investigation that may be replicated in other communities in Esan local government area and other states beyond Edo state. In Chapter 5, the findings will be presented with reference to the theoretical framework, its potential implication for social change and recommendations for future research.

Chapter 5: Discussion, Conclusions, and Recommendations

Introduction

The purpose of this qualitative study was to explore the perspective of parents of girls and women (aged 13-21) and how they experience the threat (and the reality) of sex trafficking in Ogwa. Participants scrutinized the impact of the government's existing policies and procedures to prevent sex trafficking.

I collected the data for this study from 12 participants who had girls and women (aged 13-21) and had not been a victim of trafficking. The findings from the data collected from the participants included the combination of themes, which were the four themes and five categories that I indicated in Table 7. The themes and categories formed the perspective of parents on their threats and (reality) of existing policy on the prevention of sex trafficking as generated from the interview data.

The first theme was the importance of community participation. The participants emphasized the need for community/government dialogue in addressing the underlying issues of the root of sex trafficking, such as poverty and unemployment. They believed that a participatory approach to decision making will enhance effectiveness in existing programs targeting sex trafficking.

Another essential theme mentioned by participants was efficiency and development of awareness education for the community. Awareness education can provide greater understanding on the part of the community on the guilt, shame, and stigma that victims of trafficking deal with on daily basis. Also, through education, the

issues of victims' low self-image emanating from stigma, environmental influence, and greed can be explored to encourage families and community to support victims.

A tool that the participants emphasized is collaboration of all sectors in the fight against sex trafficking. Some participants outlined that health workers, immigration officers manning borders, and policymakers can play a vital role in helping to eradicate sex trafficking.

Participants suggested the need for infrastructural development in addressing a holistic approach to combatting sex trafficking in the Ogwa community. They believed that there is lack of political commitment to addressing the issues of addressing road construction and dilapidated school buildings to provide adequate opportunities for young people to stay in the community. Participants also believed that the enforcement of legislation on education is key to ensuring that bills are passed on providing education to the poor. They also recommended that the senate exercise their role of oversight and ensure accountability on the part of government to apprehend traffickers and to provide rehabilitation for victims of sex trafficking in Ogwa.

In the first part of this chapter, I explain the interpretation of the findings and present the limitations as they relate to the trustworthiness of the study identified earlier in the data collection and analysis stage. I provide recommendations for future research, including the implications of the study. In conclusion, I enumerate the link between this study and its potential impact on positive social change.

Interpretation of the Findings

The outcome of the data from the interview were consistent with the reviewed literature presented in Chapter two of this dissertation. The findings that emerged supports the perception of parents, which also in alignment with the literature review. However, it is imperative to point out that there are some inconsistencies that require further study. I recommend these studies in the later part of this chapter.

All 12 interviewees expressed dialogue between government and the community as a difficult challenge to overcome. For successful program implementation of programs targeting sex trafficking, the participants stated how this is a vital element to open discussion with the community on the planning of what and how. They emphasized that it is not enough to start a program but to ask the opinion of the community on how it will be effectively used by the people to achieve the desired result.

Hence, the need for community participation as mentioned by all participants cannot be overstated. The reasons emanated from the subtheme of effective community/government dialogue in the policy process, which resulted in the theme community participation. The theory of stakeholder participation grew out of the importance of the recognition of the poor as the crucial contributors to decision making in development strategies, implementation, and benefits (Hounmenou, 2018). Hence, a top-down approach becomes a way of perpetuating poverty, lack of employment, poor education, environmental degradation, and persistent negative cultural socialization (Claridge, 2004).

Community participation emphasizes the need for problem-solving activities that mobilize the information and resources of the right set of community actors who can influence other members of the community to effect a positive change in a given developmental activity. In both public and private organizations, participation becomes a tool for the democratization of society. After the mid-1970s, participation as a means for democratic decisions lost its popularity (Geurts & Joldersma, 2001). It is also therefore consistent with the role of community in this study in exploring the issue of sex trafficking and sets the backdrop for the appropriateness of PPA as a useful tool to explain the importance of community engagement in policy analysis.

Several participants referred to a study conducted in an Edo state rural community by several researchers, which disclosed that the reason for the forced migration was due to the high unemployment rate (Aibangbe, 2015). Therefore, community participation can provide the platform for the government and community dialogue on how to address unemployment, thus helping to end poverty, which is at the root of sex trafficking in Ogwa.

Awareness education was another mentioned theme in the study. The participants stressed that it was an important policy to address the issue of sex trafficking. They emphasized this point, especially as it related to traditional priests who take advantage of the vulnerable youth. The traffickers use the African traditional religious practices to exploit the young women who enter into a contractual agreement before the priests, promising to repay their traffickers who loaned them money for the journey.

The participants expressed dismay over the issue of exploitation by the traditional priests because people see the priests as mediators with their ancestors. The participants repeatedly referred to the need for awareness education theme over and over. In this way, they met the saturation requirement, providing trustworthiness to this research study. This theme is crucial in addressing the problem of sex trafficking if the government can use the expertise of the community members.

The theme of awareness education indicates that the community believes that it is not a one-time annual event presently conducted by the government but should be a continual strategy. For instance, Participant 10 suggested the use of media elements such as television, radio, and traditional means of communication, including social media, which are widely used by young people, to enhance a better understanding of the problem. Environment and family support were mentioned by the respondents as a crucial issue that demands further education of the community members.

The participants believed that a lack of a conducive environment and family support deter the development of a child into adulthood. They felt that the government needs to invest in developing skills that can keep parents engaged with their young children. A participant decried the situation of an absent father. He said that possibly the father might have left the village either as a trafficker or as a middleman. In some cases, the father may choose to engage in criminal activity to be able to provide for his family needs. The young children from this type of family may grow up to become criminals.

Infrastructural development was one of the frequently mentioned themes that occurred in the study. The participants made the connections between the trafficking of

girls for sexual exploitation and dilapidated structures such as health and educational centers, water supply, and roads. However, the participants made the most links with especially bad roads and low incomes from agricultural produce.

The 12 participants felt that there was no emphasis on road construction as one of the policies that can monitor the trafficking of young girls and women from the Ogwa community. They believed that if the government does not repair the roads and keep them maintained, farmers cannot transport their produce and subsequently are unable to earn more for their harvest. The trickle-down effect is that young male farmers will continue to abandon the land to become traffickers and middlemen who coerce the young girls and women into sexual exploitation.

I was surprised at the connection of road construction to the problem of sex trafficking. This link was insightful because it is not one of those factors that readily come to mind as a potential cause of the problem of sex trafficking. The insight into the lack of maintained roads that came up from the community is crucial in the conversation regarding the prevention of sex trafficking. For this reason, it is essential to include the community who are most affected in the deliberation on the intricacies involved in addressing the issue of sex trafficking.

Intersectoral collaboration, as stated by the participants, is an essential method of action that needs to be fostered by the government (Brown & Ashman, 1996). The people believed that they had seen many parallel, compartmentalized, and competitive programs in their community targeting the prevention of sex trafficking. They observed that none of these sectors work together, although their goal is the eradication of sex trafficking and

the well-being of the community. Two participants believed that different areas of service need to work on the phenomenon of sex trafficking because the cause and effect are multifaceted.

Other factors they stated as being at the root of the problem of trafficking were the high cost of living, lack of agricultural subsidy which has led to low productivity, lack of higher education and a condition of neglect; with a low teacher-pupil ratio in high schools (Aibangbe, 2015; Ekong, 2016). Hence, four participants emphasized the need for multisectoral intervention regarding the root cause of the problem of trafficking and how best to design effective programs that target the problem.

The category on enforcement of legislation on education was a subtheme echoed by 12 participants to emphasize implementation of education policy. In my opinion, this policy can be strengthened under the commitment to intersectoral collaboration to help address the root of cause of sex trafficking. The participants experienced that schools are available, but either poorly equipped or badly managed. Therefore, the government need to commit themselves to the enforcement of the enacted Edo State bill on education. This bill mandates parents to send their children to school. The respondents also believed that it is essential to assist parents who do not see the benefit of education by educating them on the need for training since their parents did not teach them. The participants suggested that the enforcement of the bill on mandatory education need to have both affordability and free education as crucial components to encouraging especially low-income students to attend school.

The issues identified by the participants cannot be implemented with an oversight. Hence the participants rightly stated the need to establish checks and balances to hold government accountable regarding trafficker arrest, punishment, and rehabilitation. The participants pointed out the ineffectiveness of the policy on arrest, punishment, and rehabilitation of offenders. This means that, in reality, the people experienced a lot of challenges with this policy and therefore it does not portray it as an effective and transparent process.

The results of this study reveal that perceptions about the existing method of action targeting the prevention of sex trafficking are not sufficient because of the multifaceted nature of the problem. And therefore, requires the involvement of the community in policy analysis to achieve a sustainable solution to the phenomenon of sex trafficking. The participants' observation of reality therefore revealed the need for a detailed evaluation of existing program implementation targeting sex trafficking.

This study findings confirmed my choice of a narrative policy framework, which encompasses the idea that people affected by a problem should be allowed to tell their story. In this case, using this framework to assist them in telling their story as they perceive it in the context of existing government policy on sex trafficking. In this way, they are encouraged to critically analyze issues beyond the conventional method of policymaking and become part of shaping a centralized narrative on policymaking (Jones & McBeth, 2010).

The readers can apply the process used in this study to community organizations, and political arenas where people come together to form business relationships and hold

similar values and beliefs. It is important to note that because the experience impacted not only the perception of participants on the lack of progress in the eradication of sex trafficking, it may also inform their choice of a political candidate to lead their constituency. The process may also strengthen established community groups, especially on social media, and engage people in critical thinking to effect radical change.

The participants' responses also disclosed that their perception of the reality and threats of sex trafficking in their community of Ogwa largely depended on their lived experience on how the method of actions implemented by the government impacted them. Although personal opinion and interests may have played a role in their perception, the participants' experience through the use of the programs, and their impact on their socio-economic status formed their opinion.

There could be a variety of other factors that informed participants' perception, whether it is through friends, relatives, neighbors, or employment in the case of a teacher among them. But it is imperative to point out that it was these experiences that formed the inconsistencies observed on existing policies and procedures used to address sex trafficking in Ogwa community. These different avenues of shaping participants' perceptions further reinforce the narrative policy framework that encourages individuals to tell their stories as an effective strategy for community engagement.

Although the results of this research are limited to a small group of participants within Ogwa community, the findings may have other implications. For instance, 12 participants expressed the need for infrastructure development (roads) as a contributory

factor to sex trafficking. Because of this insight on the issue of bad roads, the government may address road construction as an urgent policy on sex trafficking.

Also, the interaction that participants had with other members of the community to help inform and enrich their discussion and perception regarding trafficking is valuable in furthering the narrative policy framework. The participants' interaction with other people and sharing of knowledge, is a clear indication that they are sharing their stories of sex trafficking and how it has impacted their lives.

In the political arena, this study can assist policymakers in engaging in the planning and formulation of a future intervention targeting sex trafficking. This strategy also takes into cognizance the opinion of the community in effective program implementation. The conversation will implicitly inform and influence voters' decisions regarding the election of people into public offices. Because of the community understanding of the victim's socio-economic and structural barriers, the electorate opinion will be critical to the improvement of policy and creation of social change.

In the literature review, I discussed the utilization of the narrative policy framework as a useful tool to address policy problems in both scientific, social, and financial regulatory legislation. This tool has focused on how groups who are affected by a problem can become active actors in designing and implementation of public policy. There was evidence where this policy process has led to legislative reform (Borland et al., 2017).

As rightly noted by Jones and McBeth (2010), narrative policy analysis theory enables the respondents to provide an in-depth explanation of the connection of one

variable to the other. In the case of this study, participants highlighted the need for analysis of the educational program provided by the government. They stated that although the government responds to the lack of educating young girls and women, it fails to address the community's need for free education so that children from low-income families who are most impacted can afford the service.

I was intrigued by what Participant 12 had to say regarding what drives youths into sex trafficking. This participant stated,

Although I am raising my children in poverty, I believe that it is laziness on the part of some female victims of sex trafficking. My circumstances influenced me positively and are a motivating factor to raise my children to become focused and responsible children regardless of my low-income status.

Listening to the voices of parents opened up the need to use a participatory policy analysis (PPA) for my data interpretation. This tool is essential because it entails the involvement of actors who affect or are affected by a decision in the policy-making process such as Ogwa community.

PPA aligns to the study research question on how the perception of parents regarding the implementation of current policies meets reality. The rationale for the use of PPA for interpretation of data highlights the need for the voice of parents in addressing the phenomenon of sex trafficking. As Dunn (1994) rightly stated, it is imperative to recognize whose voice is essential to contribute to sustainable development, which addresses the underlying factors with influential community players.

Therefore, if this is the contribution of PPA to the conversation on public policy, then participants of this study have some benefits because sex trafficking indicates a grave policy issue that requires discussion by all stakeholders on the underlying problem of poverty and crime.

It is vital to note that although in Ogwa, there has been a proliferation of various programs on the eradication of human trafficking for sexual exploitation, little or none has involved the skills of stakeholders as experts in influencing policy decisions on the issue that affects their life (Ezeh, 2017). A visual data (Appendix C) that I collected provides a pictorial insight into the reality of Nigerian women victims of sex trafficking and what conditions they faced on their voyage into Italy. And this visual data that I collected during my trip to Lampedusa in the region of Sicily, Italy to see the landing port referred to by researchers contributes to the knowledge that could invite community engagement in the discussion on the prevention of sex trafficking.

Hence, the government has the responsibility to involve the community in finding a sustainable solution to their problem. And the application of participatory policy analysis to the problem of sex trafficking in Ogwa could be useful in addressing the need of the vulnerable population.

Limitations of the Study

Barriers to trustworthiness that arose from this research were my tribal identity. I noted in Chapter One that the preconceived belief of all Nigerians is that Edo State is the predominant area to find trafficked girls and women. Because of this assumption therefore, the state resent the label put on them by people who belong to other tribes. I

took note of my opinion regarding my perception coming from the Igbo tribe, and I made sure that I wrote these issues of bias in my journal before I commenced data collection.

To ensure that I do not let this bias play out during my questioning, the community partners walked me around the town prior to the study. Because they live and work in Ogwa, they earned trust which was extended to me and giving me validity as a credible researcher.

I made a note of these issues of bias in my qualitative journal before collecting data to prevent my bias from reflecting on my questioning and sampling. To improve the quality of my research, I made the necessary corrections to the interview questions. To clarify my interview questions, I chose to conduct a practice interview. During coding for patterns, categories, and themes, I was aware of biases throughout the study to ensure that reporting the themes that emerged were identified from the responses from the participants.

The other limitation I noted in Chapter one was the actual interview with participants who may have had trafficked relatives or friends, thus feel trauma that the conversation would have invoked in them. Although I made efforts to eliminate those who directly experience trafficking from the study, it was not possible to altogether avoid the pain of remembering relatives who may have been victims. But I addressed this situation by asking them to contact their local Pastor if they need help talking through how the experience of remembering a trafficked loved one affects them.

Recommendations

This qualitative narrative study design explored the opinions and perspectives of parents regarding their observation of reality and the threat of sex trafficking. And also, how their experience of existing policies and procedures targeting sex trafficking can impact policy outcomes. The outcome of this study suggested that similar research may yield the same result in other neighboring communities with the same size and population of Ogwa community.

Recommendations for future research may include a more focused phenomenological study approach in a selected low-income slum in the city or middle-class communities in Edo State. This study can explore the story of victims' experience of sex trafficking. This can be done in collaboration with some schools of counselling and psychology. The reason being that in the process of the study, they can help to mitigate the victims' trauma and stress through counseling intervention. Also, they can help them to narrate how environment, personal experiences, observation, and family upbringing can influence the perception of the phenomenon of sex trafficking and preventive intervention developed by the government.

Because of the power of story and narrative the data generated from this study was subjected to thematic analysis. But the policy analysis of this study was more on the micro level unit of analysis which explored how individuals, participants and beneficiaries were impacted. Therefore, there is need to link a future study to the policy analysis framework. A potential study can be extended to include middle or major level of the policy narrative units of analysis. This type of study can include any policy actors

such as organizations, and coalitions within the policy subsystems and again in a more qualitative way to depict a different level of analysis.

There is a need to conduct future studies focusing on existing educational systems and its effectiveness in meeting the needs of the community and the affordability of the program. Many victims of sex trafficking suffer various mental, social, and psychological challenges coupled with shame, and stigma, which hinders their social functioning. And this situation may make them feel unaccepted in the educational system. Hence, a need for government-community dialogue on best practices on the provision of education, infrastructural development, and resources needed to address the problem in a more sustainable approach.

There could be case studies conducted on beneficiaries on existing methods of action on the prevention of sex trafficking. This study may provide a platform to explore further through story telling how these policies and procedures impact the people who use the services. And subsequently share results with the community stakeholders, community members, potential victims, policymakers, and not-for-profit organizations.

On an extensive scale, to replicate the study, a quantitative study methodology can be used to focus on a random sampling of participants in a given city. The research could utilize questionnaires, emails, surveys through a telephone call to gather information on peoples' perceptions of the existing policies targeted towards the prevention of sex trafficking. This quantitative instrument can use variations that include age, tribe, socio-economic, and professional status. This investigation may provide an in-depth insight into whether these variations can reveal more information about the varied

population selection. A more generalized population can use this study because it has a broader sample size. Also, it may generate more accurate information due to anonymity.

Implications

The result of this investigation may provide significant knowledge and understanding of the effects of community-based policy analysis on human trafficking for sexual exploitation. The community may collectively come to realize the extent of abuse and devastation of generations and engage in actions that may transform the trend. As rightly pointed out, the outrage seems particularly likely to productively shape group processes and social change outcomes (Thomas, McGarty, & Mavor 2009). Hence, the method used in this study may trickle down to the need for policymakers to extend the scope of utilizing community input to address the problem.

The results of this study will add to the body of knowledge that can provide scholars with a narrative policy framework as a useful theory to formulate tools for further research regarding the perception of the community on the issues of sex trafficking. In the examination of this subject, researchers may gain more insight and understanding of how individuals' family environment can shape their perceptions and preferences. And as regards institutions and community contexts, investigators may further realize the knowledge of opinions and preferences which go into processes in which policy choices are made.

According to Ravensbergen and VanderPlaat (2010), because individuals are experts in the issues that concern them, they have information that is pertinent to their development and targeted action that can yield significant results. In this way, the

findings of this study will provide the government with the tool they need to mobilize necessary resources and relationships within the community to facilitate inclusive policy design by bearing in mind the public as a priority (Fiorino, 1990).

This research study may also provide a basis for replication by utilizing a qualitative, quantitative, or mixed methods methodology in other surrounding areas of Ogwa community, Edo state, or in Nigeria. The use of multiple research methods provides diverse perspectives in the understanding of why parents perceive the plan of action formulated to address sex trafficking in the way they do. The different techniques will also provide a tool to quantify the impact of education, for instance, on the number of children that attended school when education intervention improved and how it impacted the quality of their life, thus preventing sex trafficking.

Barriers to trustworthiness that arose from this research were my tribal identity. I noted in Chapter One that the preconceived belief of all Nigerians is that Edo State is the predominant area to find trafficked girls and women. Because of this assumption therefore, the state resent the label put on them by people who belong to other tribes. I took note of my opinion regarding my perception coming from the Igbo tribe, and I made sure that I wrote these issues of bias in my journal before I commenced data collection.

To ensure that I do not let this bias play out during my questioning, I asked some colleagues from Walden and colleagues that I met at a human trafficking conference in Chicago to go through my interview protocol, and they provided feedback for modifications.

I made a note of these issues of bias in my qualitative journal before collecting data to prevent my bias from reflecting on my questioning and sampling. To improve the quality of my research, I made the necessary corrections to the interview questions. To clarify my interview questions, I chose to conduct a practice interview. During coding for patterns, categories, and themes, I was aware of biases throughout the study to ensure that reporting the themes that emerged were identified from the responses from the participants.

The other limitation I noted in Chapter one was the actual interview with participants who may have had trafficked relatives or friends, thus feel trauma that the conversation would have invoked in them. Although I made efforts to eliminate those who directly experience trafficking from the study, it was not possible to altogether avoid the pain of remembering relatives who may have been victims. But I addressed this situation by asking them to contact their local Pastor if they need help talking through how the experience of remembering a trafficked loved one affects them.

Conclusion

Policies that provide a bottom-up approach for individuals and community to share their observation of reality and threats on issues such as sex trafficking ravaging their community may not guaranteed to prevent young girls and women from being trafficked. But it is key to the component of fostering sustainable social change. The data collected in this study illustrated the numerous challenges and obstacles to the prevention of sex trafficking.

One of them being the centralized policy design and implementation of preventive strategies on sex trafficking that do not involve the community in the policy process. This lack of collaboration and top-down approach (centralized) is not peculiar to Ogwa community, but also within other towns, villages, and states in Nigeria.

Although there are policies such as education, skills development, and health systems that were adopted by the government to eradicate the problem, this study highlighted participants' opinions and observations, which revealed discontent on the quality of the actions formulated by the government to address sex trafficking. It is evident then government's policies did not effectively tackle the problem of sex trafficking.

The lack of trust in government policy reveals the inadequacy in services provided to victims of sex trafficking victims who were returned or deported from foreign nations. It is, therefore, imperative to ensure that the community members are involved in deliberating on appropriate support programs that broadly address the study result. Some of them, as mentioned, are awareness education, community-government dialogue, environment, and family support. Others are intersectoral collaboration, infrastructure development, arrest, punishment, and rehabilitation and legislation on education for the effective reintegration of victims.

The findings confirm other studies that found out that personal experiences play a significant role in the process of decision-making that impacts both individuals and communities. However, it is imperative, therefore, to note that every decision is a product of a story, and hence the need to allow people to tell their stories both in community and

political arena to create more sustainable and effective services for those affected by the problem.

The participants of this study want policymakers to understand that any policy geared towards the prevention of sex trafficking needs to engage a participatory policy analysis process to enhance a more effective strategy to combat the phenomenon of sex trafficking. Hence, government needs to know that although policies and bills (Appendix D) passed to address the upsurge of sex trafficking are essential, but equally important is a community-based participatory approach for a sustainable intervention to the prevention of human trafficking for sexual exploitation in Ogwa.

References

- Abas, M., Ostrovschi, N.V., Prince, M.V.I., Trigub, C., & Oram, S. (2013). Risk factors for mental disorders in women survivors of human trafficking: a historical cohort study. *BMC Psychiatry*, 13, 204. doi:10.1186/1471-244X-13-204
- Anton, N. I. (2014). An overview of qualitative research methodology for public health researchers. *International Journal of Medicine & Public Health*, 4(4), 318-323. doi:10.4103/2230-8598.144055
- Adepelumi, B. (2015). *The root causes of human trafficking in Nigeria*. Retrieved from https://www.unodc.org/documents/congress/workshops/workshop2/Presentation_P_Adepelumi_African_Center_.Pdf
- Adepoju A. (2000). Issues and recent trends in international migration in Sub-Saharan Africa. *International Social Science Journal* 3(165), 385-394. doi:10.1111/1468-2451.00267
Retrieved from <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/1468-2451.00267>
- Aibangbe, M. O. (2015). Child-trafficking: A hindrance to girl-child education. *Journal of Planning and Changing; Normal*, 46 (3-4) 311-323. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1145452>
- Akor, L. (2011). Trafficking of women in Nigeria: Causes, consequences and the way forward Corvinus. *Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 2(2), 89-110. Retrieved from <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/129679454.pdf>
- Abiodun, A. K., George, A, Amadi, C. C., Oladipo, G. & Iluno, L. U. (2017). Human trafficking: A global challenge reflection on the challenges in Nigeria. *Law*,

Policy and Globalization, 61, 192. Retrieved from

[http://heinonline.org/HOL/Page?handle=hein.journals/jawpglob61&id=193&div=
&collection=](http://heinonline.org/HOL/Page?handle=hein.journals/jawpglob61&id=193&div=&collection=)

Arnstein, S. R. (1969). A Ladder of Citizen Participation. *Journal of the American Institute of Planning*, 35(4), 216-224. doi:10.1080/01944366908977225

Asha, A. A., Belete, A., & Moyo, T. (2016). Challenges facing decentralization and community participation in local development in Capricorn District Municipality, South Africa. *Journal of Human Ecology*, 54(2), 131-137.

doi:10.1080/09709274.2016.11906995

Anderson, B., & O'Connell J.D. (2002). Trafficking – A demand led problem? A multi-country pilot study. Retrieved from

<https://gaatw.org/publications/The%20Demand%20Side%20part1.pdf>

Attoh, F. (2009). Trafficking in women in Nigeria: Poverty of values or inequality?

Journal of Social Science, 19(3), 169-171. doi:10.1080/09718923.2009.11892705

Aurich-Beerheide, Catalano, S. L., Graziano, P. R., & Zimmermann, K. (2015).

Stakeholder participation and policy integration in local social and employment policies: Germany and Italy compared. *Journal of European Social Policy*, 25(4), 379 –392. doi:10.1177/0958928715594543

Amy, S. K. (2017). The art of participation: The case of creative communities in

Indonesia. *Community Development Journal*, 52(1), 171-185.

doi:10.1093/cdj/bsw042

Adepoju, A. (2005). Review of research and Data on Human Trafficking in Sub-Sahara

African. *International Migration*, 43(1-2), 75-98. doi:10.1111/j.0020-7985.2005.00313.x

Aghatise, E. (2002). Trafficking for Prostitution in Italy: concept paper. Presented at expert group meeting on “Trafficking in Women and girl” 18-22 November 2002, New York, Glen Cove, USA. Retrieved from www.un.org/..EP-Aghatise.PDF

Arjan, Meshkovska, Siegel, & Stutterheim, (2015). Female Sex Trafficking: Conceptual Issues, Current Debates, and Future Directions. *Journal of Sex Research*, 52(4):380-395 doi:10.1080/00224499.2014.1002126

Abma, T. (1999), Telling Tales: On evaluation and narrative. *Advances in Program Evaluation*. ERIC (6). Retrieved from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED439150>

Alafuro, E., & Wilson, G. (2018). Public policy formulation and implementation in contemporary Nigeria. *Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, 8(6), 177-178. doi:10.13140/RG.2.2.13256.21763

Retrieved from https://www.ijmra.us/project%20doc/2018/IJRSS_JUNE2018/IJMRA-13870.pdf

Association of Accredited Public Policy Advocates to the European Union, (2016). LobbyFacts.eu. Retrieved from <https://lobbyfacts.eu/representative/4e724a65725f4876a64efa21a31a86bc/association-of-accredited-public-policy-advocates-to-the-european-union>

Barnert, E., Iqbal, Z., Bruce, J., Anoshiravani, A., Kolhatkar, G., Greenbaum, J. (2017). Commercial sexual exploitation and sex trafficking of children and adolescents: A narrative review. *Academic Pediatrics Association*, 825 (17), 8. Retrieved from

<https://web-a-ebSCOhost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=4&sid=3410df3d-2996-4637-b378-e88891a8dfda%40sessionmgr4007>

- Bach, J. E., Litam, S. D. A. (2017). "Kind regard": An examination of one buyer's attempt to purchase a trafficked child for sex. *Journal of Sexual Aggression*, 23 (2), 222-233. doi:10.1080/13552600.2017.1323124
- Birks, M. & Mills, J. (2011). *Grounded theory: A practical guide*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage publications.
- Burkholder, G. J., Cox, K. A., & Crawford, L. M. (2016). *The scholar-practitioner's guide to research design*. Baltimore, MD: Laureate Publishing.
- Badejo, F. A., (2016). Understanding human trafficking as a social issue in Nigeria: A multi-stream formative social marketing approach. (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from https://www120.secure.griffith.edu.au/rch/file/977413d3-040d-4c0a-a6aa-3b8e2e3599a2/1/Badejo_2016_01Thesis.pdf
- Bello, P.O. (2018). Criminal justice response to human trafficking in Nigeria and South Africa: Suggestions for better performance. *Contemporary Justice Review*, 21(2), 140-158. doi:10.1080/2F10282580.2018.1455507
- Baarda, C.S. (2016). Human trafficking for sexual exploitation from Nigeria into Western Europe: The role of voodoo rituals in the functioning of a criminal network. *European Journal of Criminology*, 13 (2), 257-273. doi:10.1177/1477370815617188
- Beierle, T. C. & Cayford, J. (2002). *Democracy in practice: Public participation in*

environmental decisions. Washington, DC: Resources for the Future

Bell, J.S., & Duff, P. A. (2012). Narrative inquiry: More than just telling stories

TESOL Quarterly 36 (2), 207-213. doi.org/10.2307/3588331

Retrieved from

https://www.jstor.org/stable/3588331?seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents

Bhattacharjee, A. (2012). Social science research: Principles, methods, and practices

(2nd ed.). USF Tampa Bay Open Access Textbooks Collection. Book 3. pp. 1-

142. Retrieved from http://scholarcommons.usf.edu/oa_textbooks/3

Borland, McDonald, O'Leary, & Stockwell, (2017). Claims in vapor device (e-cigarette)

regulation: A narrative policy. Retrieved from <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov>

doi:10.1016/j.drugpo.2017.03.004

Brutus, S., Aguinis, H., & Wassmer, U. (2013). Self-reported limitations and future

directions in scholarly reports analysis and recommendations. *Journal of*

Management, 39(1), 48-75. doi:10.1177/0149206312455245

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative*

Research in Psychology, 3(2), 77-101. doi:10.1191/1478088706qp063oa

Brown, D. L., & Ashman, D. (1996). Participation, social capital, and intersectoral

problem solving: African and Asian cases. *World Development* 24, (9), 1467-

1479. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0305-750X\(96\)00053-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/0305-750X(96)00053-8)

Bryman, A. (2004). Member Validation and Check. In Michael S. Lewis-Beck, Alan

Bryman & Tim Futing Liao (Eds.), *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Social Science*

Research Methods. doi <http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781412950589>

- Bales, K. (2005). *Understanding global slavery*. Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press
- Bloomberg, L. D. & Volpe, M. (2012). *Completing your qualitative dissertation: A road map from beginning to end*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Clandinin, D. J., & Connelly, F. M. (2000). *Narrative inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research*. San Francisco, CA: John Wiley & Sons.
- Cumming, E. (2017, September 29). Slaves on our streets: Tracking the route of human trafficking from Nigeria to Europe and back again. *Independent Newspaper*. Retrieved from <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/crime/modern-day-slavery-nigeria-uk-human-trafficking-europe-investigation-lagos-slaves-on-our-streets-a7973366.html>
- Crouch, M. & McKenzie, H. (2006). The logic of small samples in interview-based qualitative research. *Social Science Information*, 45(4), 483-499. doi: 10.1177/0539018406069584
- Crawford, M. (2016). International sex trafficking. *Women & Therapy*, 40(1-2)101-22, <https://doi.org/10.1080/02703149.2016.1206784>.
- Chirenje, L.I., Giliba, R.A., & Musamba, E.B. (2012). Local communities' participation in decision-making processes through planning and budgeting in African countries. doi:10.1080/10042857.2013.777198
- Charmaz, K. (2009). *Grounded theory*. The Sage Encyclopedia for Social Science Research Methods.2003. SAGE Publications.
- Claridge, T., (2004). *Designing social capital sensitive participation methodologies*.

Report, Social Capital Research, Brisbane, Australia.

Creswell, J. W. (2016). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among the five approaches* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE

Creswell, J. W., Hanson, W. E., Clark Plano, V. L., & Morales, A. (2007). Qualitative Research Designs: Selection and Implementation. *The Counseling Psychologists*, 35(2), 236-264. doi:10.1177/0011000006287390

Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Cavagnaro, G. L.C. (2017). Sex trafficking: The hospitality Industry's role and responsibility. Retrieved from <https://scholarship.sha.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?referer=&httpsredir=1&article=1000&context=honorstheses>

Creswell, J. W. (1994). *Research Design: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*.

Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications Culbertson, J.A. (1981). Three Epistemologies and the Study of Educational Administration.

University of California Educational Administration Review, 22, (1), 6.

Coyne, I. T. (1997). Sampling in qualitative research. Purposeful and theoretical sampling; merging or clear boundaries? *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 26, 623-630. doi:10.1046/j.1365-2648.1997.t01-25-00999.x

Chukwuezi, B. (2001). Through Thick and Thin: Igbo Rural-Urban Circularity, Identity and Investment. *Journal of Contemporary African Studies*. 19(1):55–66 [[Google Scholar](#)]

- Chenail, R. (2011). Interviewing the investigator: Strategies for addressing instrumentation and researcher bias concerns in qualitative research. *The Qualitative Report*, 16(1), 255-262. Retrieved from <http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR>
- Daphne, C. S. (2018). The application of ethical principles in treating Juju believing Nigerian sex trade survivors. *The Journal of Pan African Studies*, 12, (5), 218-231. Retrieved from <https://eds-b-ebshost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=1&sid=0ec8909a-4db6-4da4-9d07-e862bf625c09%40pdc-v-sessmgr05>
- Davy, D. (2015). Understanding the support needs of human-trafficking victims: A review of three human-trafficking program evaluations. *Journal of Human Trafficking*, 1:318–337, 2015
doi:10.1080/23322705.2015.1090865
- Day, D. (1997). Citizen Participation in the Planning Process: An essentially contested concept? *Journal of Planning Literature*, 11, (3), 421-434.
doi:10.1177/088541229701100309
- Denzin, N.K., & Lincoln, S. (2005). *The Sage handbook of qualitative research*. Sage Publications, Inc. Thousand Oaks, California.
- Domingues da Silva, D. B. (2017). The Atlantic Slave Trade from West Central Africa, 1780–1867. Retrieved from https://scholar.google.com/scholar?hl=en&as_sdt=0%2C15&q=Domingues+da+Silva%2C+D.+B.+%282017%29.+The+Atlantic+Slave+Trade+from+West+Central+Africa%2C+1780%E2%80%931867.+Retrieved+from+https%3A%2F%2Fboo

ks.google&btnG

- Drost, E. A. (2011). Validity and reliability in social science research. *Education, Research and Perspectives*, 38(1), 105. Retrieved from <https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Validity-and-reliability-in-social-science-research-Drost/081534bfe6cf8dd0da1f40704098366f368da3e8>
- Durning, D. (1993). Participatory policy analysis in a social service agency: A case study. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, 12(2), 297-322.
doi:10.2307/3325237
- Retrieved from <https://eds-a-ebshost.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=6&sid=e41e32b2-5e11-4471-aa8d-c065fa5c9653%40sessionmgr4008>
- Dunn, W.D. (1994). *Public policy analysis: An introduction*. Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, NJ.
- Daga, S. (2005). *Bring back the lost daughters: A fight against trafficking of Nigerian women and girls for the international sex market*. Fab Educational Books, Jos, Nigeria.
- Denzin, N.K., & Lincoln, S. (2005). *The Sage handbook of qualitative research*. Sage Publications, Inc. Thousand Oaks, California
- Department of Public Safety Canada, (2013). Human trafficking stakeholder consultation-National summary report. Retrieved from <https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrscs/pblctns/2013-hmn-trffckng-stkhldr/index-en.aspx#a06>

- Domoney, J., Howard, L.M., Abas, M., Broadbent, M., & Oram, S. (2015). Mental Health Service Responses to Human Trafficking. *BMC Psychiatry* Retrieved from <http://ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=psyh&AN=2015-52870-001&site=ehost-live&scope=site>
- deLeon, P. (1990). "Participatory policy analysis: Prescriptions and precautions". *Asian Journal of Public Administration*, 12(1), 29-54.
doi:10.1080/02598272.1990.10800227
- Deb, S., Mukherjee, A., & Mathews, B. (2011). Aggression in sexually abused trafficked girls and efficacy of intervention. *Journal of Interpers Violence*, 26(4):745-68.
doi: 10.1177/0886260510365875.
- DiCicco-Bloom, B. & Crabtree, B. F. (2006). The qualitative research interview. *Medical Education*, 40, 314-321. doi:10.1111/j.1365- 2929.2006.02418.x
- Department of Justice, (2018). Nigeria: Traffiking. Retrieved from <https://www.justice.gov/eoir/file/887031/download>
- Ebegbulem, S. (2009, September 27). Oshiomhole tasks European on human trafficking. *The Vanguard*, Retrieved from <https://www.vanguardngr.com/2009/09/oshiomhole-tasks-european-govts-on-human-trafficking/>
- Ezeh, M. D. (2017). Human Trafficking and Prostitution Among Women and Girls of Edo State, Nigeria: Possibility of Rehabilitation Through Education and Prevention. Xlibris Publishing Corporation, UK
- Elechi, O.O., & Ngwe, J.E. (2012). Human trafficking: The modern-day slavery of the

21st Century. *African Journal of Criminology and Justice Studies: AJCJS*, 6

(1&2),103-119. Retrieved from

https://www.umes.edu/uploadedFiles/_WEBSITES/AJCJS/Content/6%201%202%20ngwe%20and%20elechi%20proof.pdf

Eghafona, K.A. (2009). *The bane of female trafficking in Nigeria: An examination of the role of family in Benin and society*” in Alfred Awaritefe, *Towards a Sane Society*, Benin City: Roman Publisher Press.

Ekong, S. (2016). Nigerian policy on child labor: An evaluation of the education sector preparedness for effective policy implementation. (Doctoral Dissertation).

Retrieved from

<http://search.proquest.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/pqdtlocal1005747/docview/1758252321/abstract/98BC2B3E83D4DCEPQ/8>

Ebegbulem, P. (2017). The fight to end human trafficking: Nigerian women religious’ perspective. Retrieved from

<https://blogsfcg.gov.uk/sallyaxworthy/2017/12/06/the-fight-to-end-human-trafficking-nigerian-women-religious-perspective/>

Edo State Government, (2019). We are intensifying advocacy to curb human trafficking- Edo Government. Retrieved from <http://www.edostate.gov.ng/we-are-intensifying-advocacy-to-curb-illegal-migration-human-trafficking-edo-govt/>

Efrat, A. (2016). Global efforts against human trafficking: The misguided conflation of sex, labor, and organ Trafficking. *International Studies Perspectives*, 17 (1), 34-54. doi:10.1111/insp.12097 Retrieved from

<https://ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login?url=https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=tsh&AN=114637376&site=eds-live&scope=site>

Farmer, J., Taylor, J., Stewart, E., & Kenny, A. (2017). Citizen participation in health services co-production: A roadmap for navigating participation types and outcomes. *Australian Journal of Primary Health* 23(6) 509-515

doi:10.1071/PY16133

Fiorino, D. J. (1990). Citizen participation and environmental risk: A survey of institutional mechanisms. *Science, Technology & Human Values*,15(2), 226–243.

doi:101177/016224399001500204

Gerassi, L. (2017). How do I fit: Understanding barriers and facilitators to social services among women involved in commercial sexual exploitation through identities, traumas, and substance use. Retrieved from

<http://search.proquest.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/docview/1885037775/abstract/5C062ED53AD9465BPQ/1>

Gauchat, G. (2012). Politicization of science in the public sphere a study of public trust in the United States, 1974 to 2010. *American Sociological Review*,77(2), 167-187.

doi: 10.1177/0003122412438225

Gopal, K. (2017). SafeChr. Retrieved from <https://www.linkedin.com/in/dr-kalyani-gopal-664a9716>

Government of Nigeria (2015). Trafficking in Persons Law Enforcement and Administration Act, (2015) Retrieved from

<https://nass.gov.ng/document/download/7857>

- Government of Edo State, (2018). Government of Edo State, (2018). Government of Edo State in Nigeria partners with Bridge to improve public schools
<https://www.bridgeinternationalacademies.com/government-of-edo-state-in-nigeria-partners-with-bridge-to-improve-public-schools/>
- Goździak, E. M. & Bump, M. N. (2008). Data and research on human trafficking: Bibliography of research-based literature. *Institute for the Study of International Migration*. pp. 4 – 47. Retrieved from
<https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/224392.pdf>
- Gray, G., & Jones, M.D. (2016). A qualitative narrative policy framework? Examining the policy narratives of US campaign finance regulatory reform. *Journal of Public Policy and Administration*, 31 (3), 193-220, 28. doi:10.1177/0952076715623356
- Geurts, J. L.A., & Joldersma, C. (2001). Methodology for participatory policy analysis. *European Journal of Operational Research*, 128, Retrieved from
http://www.ced.cl/ced/wp-content/uploads/2012/02/geurts-joldersma_2001.pdf
- George G., & Selimos, E.G. (2018). Using narrative Research to explore the welcoming of newcomer immigrants. *Qualitative Social Research*, 19 (2), 118-138.
 doi:10.1711/fqs-19.2.2907
 Retrieved from
<https://ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login?url=https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=sih&AN=129148362&site=eds-live&scope=site>
- Heller, L.R., Lawson, R.A., Murphy, R.H., William, C.R. (2018). Is human trafficking the dark side of economic freedom? *Journal of Defense and Peace*, 29 (4), 355-

382. doi:10.1080/10242694.2016.1160604

Hacker, A. J. (2018). Preliminary data analysis and coding worksheet. Retrieved from

<http://academicguides.waldenu.edu/researchcenter/orec/application>

Hooper, E. K. (2017). Trauma-informed psychological assessment of human trafficking survivors. *Journal of Women and Therapy*, 40 (1-2),12-30.

doi:0.1080/02703149.2016.1205905

Haydon, G., Browne, G., VanderRiet, P. (2017). Narrative inquiry as a research methodology exploring person-centered care in nursing.

[dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.colegn.2017.03.001](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.colegn.2017.03.001)

Hodge, D.R & Lietz, C.A., (2007). The international sexual trafficking of women and children. *Affilia: Journal of Women and Social Work*, 2 (22) 163-174. Retrieved

from doi:10.1177/0886109907299055

Hult, F.M. (2015). *Making policy connections across scales using nexus analysis*. In F.M.

Hult & D.C Johnson (Eds.), *Research methods in language policy and planning:*

A practical guide (pp. 217-231). doi:10.1002/9781118340349.ch19

Hatley, P. J. (2013). Preserving place: A grounded theory of citizen participation in community-based planning. Scholar Commons. (Doctoral Dissertation) Retrieved

from <https://scholarcommons.usf.edu/etd/4503/>

Hughes, M. D. (2004). *Best practices to address the demand side of sex trafficking*.

Rhode Island: University of Rhode Island.

Human Rights First, (2017). Who are human traffickers? Retrieved from

<https://www.humanrightsfirst.org/resource/who-are-human-traffickers>

Human Rights First (2017) Fact Sheet Human Trafficking by the Numbers; Retrieved from <https://www.humanrightsfirst.org/resource/human-trafficking-numbers>

International Labor Organization, (2017). 40 million in modern slavery and 152 million in child labor around the world. Retrieved from http://www.ilo.org/global/about-the-ilo/newsroom/news/WCMS_574717/lang--en/index.htm

International Labor Organization, (2015). Elimination of forced labor; Elimination of child labor, protection of children and young persons. Retrieved from http://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/natlex4.detail?p_lang=en&p_isn=101267&p_country=NGA&p_classification=04

International Organization for Migration, (2017). UN migration agency issues report on arrivals of sexually exploited migrants, chiefly from Nigeria. Retrieved from <http://www.iom.int/news/un-migration-agency-issues-report-arrivals-sexually-exploited-migrants-chiefly-nigeria>

International Labor Office (2017). Global estimates of modern slavery: Forced labor and forced marriage. Geneva: International Labor Office

Iyanda, R. O., & Nwogwugwu, N. (2016). Globalization and rising human trafficking in Nigeria. *Kuwait Chapter of Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review*, 5(6), Retrieved from https://www.arabianjbmr.com/pdfs/KD_VOL_5_6/2.pdf

Ikeora M, (2016). The Role of African Traditional Religion and ‘Juju’ in Human Trafficking: Implications for Anti-Trafficking.” *Journal of International Women’s Studies; Bridgewater*, 17(1), 1–18. <http://vc.bridgew.edu/jiws/vol17/iss1/1>

- Jones, M.D., & McBeth, M.K., (2010). A Narrative Policy Framework: Clear enough to be wrong? Retrieved from <https://liberalarts.oregonstate.edu/sites/liberalarts.oregonstate.edu/files/economics/jones31oct2013a.pdf>
- Jared S. (2018). On militancy, self-reflection, and the role of the researcher, politikon. *South African Journal of Political Studies*, 45(3), 438-455.
doi:10.1080/02589346.2018.1523349
- Jovanovski, N., & Tyler M. (2018). “Bitch you got what you deserved!”: Violation and violence in sex buyers Reviews of legal brothels. *Violence Against Women*, 24(16), 1887-1908. doi:10.1177/1077801218757375?
- Kleemans, E. R. (2011). Expanding the domain of human trafficking research: Introduction to the special issue on human trafficking. *Trends in Organized Crime*, 14(2), 95-99. doi:10.1007/s12117-011-9139-8
- Kazeem, Y. (2018). The harrowing, step-by-step story of a migrant’s journey to Europe <https://qz.com/africa/1341221/the-harrowing-step-by-step-story-of-a-migrants-journey-to-europe/>
- Kamruzzaman, P. (2013). Civil Society or ‘Comprador Class’, Participation or Parroting? *Progress in Development Studies*, 13(1), 31-49. doi
10.1177/146499341201300103
- Kvale, S. (2007). *Doing interviews*. Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Keith A. M., & Kellie M. S. (2012). *Encyclopedia of research design*.
Retrieved from

<http://methods.sagepub.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/base/download/ReferenceEntry/encyc-of-research-design/n74.xml>

- Kelly, A. (2017, January 12). Number of Nigerian women trafficked to Italy for sex almost doubled in 2016. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2017/jan/12/nigerian-women-trafficked-to-italy-for-sex-doubled-2016>
- Konneh, S. (2017). An exploration of efforts to combat trafficking in a small community. (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from <https://search-proquest.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/pqdtglobal/docview/1912729757/fulltextPDF/BE499B3E754845DEPQ/1?accountid=14872>
- Kangaspunta, K. (2015), Was trafficking in persons really criminalized? *Anti - Trafficking Review*, 4, 80-97. Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/criminaljusticeperiodicals/docview/1727831639/abstract/B555E6BE509A469BPQ/8>
- Kleemans E.R (2011) *Human smuggling and human trafficking*. In: Tonry M (ed.) *The Oxford Handbook of Crime and Public Policy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kleemans E.R., & Smit, M. (2014) *Human smuggling, human trafficking, and exploitation in the sex industry*. In: Paoli L (ed.) *The Oxford Handbook of Organized Crime*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 381–40.
- Kara, S. (2017). *Modern slavery: A global perspective*. New York Chichester, West Sussex. Columbia University Press doi:10.7312/kara15846
- Liana, W. R. (2017). Human Trafficking: New global estimates of forced labor and

modern Slavery. CRS Insight. Retrieved from

<http://fas.org/sgp/crs/row/IN/10803.pdf>

Logan, T. K., Walker, R. & Hunt, G. (2009). Understanding human trafficking in the United States. Vol. 10, No. 1. Sage Publications. doi:10.1177/1524838008327262

Laureate Education (Producer). (2010). *Overview of qualitative research methods*.

Baltimore, MD: Author.

Lipede, A. (2007). Women trafficking and insecurity in West Africa: Character, *trend and scale in Nigeria*. in Barkindo, B.M and A. Lipede (ed.) Human Trafficking and Economic Crimes across Nigeria's International Borders, Ibadan: Spectrum Books Limited.

Leech, N. L., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (2011). Beyond constant comparison qualitative data analysis: Using NVivo. *School Psychology Quarterly*, 26(1), 70-84. doi: 10.1037/a002271

Lanier, M. & Henry, S. (2010). *Essential Criminology* (3rded). New York, NY: Westview Publishers.

Lincoln, Y.S. & Guba, E.G. (1985). *Naturalistic Inquiry*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.

Laird, F. N., (1993). Participatory analysis, democracy, and technological decision making.

Science, Technology and Human Values, 18(3), pp. 341–361.

doi:10.1177/016224399301800305

Lutya, T. M., & Lanier, M. (2012). *An integrated theoretical framework to describe*

human trafficking of young women and girls for involuntary prostitution. In

Public Health- Social and Behavioral Health. Retrieved from

<http://cdn.intechopen.com/pdfs/36964/InTech->

[An_integrated_theoretical_framework_to_describe_human_trafficking_of_young_women_and_girls_for_involuntary_prostitution.pdf](http://cdn.intechopen.com/pdfs/36964/InTech-An_integrated_theoretical_framework_to_describe_human_trafficking_of_young_women_and_girls_for_involuntary_prostitution.pdf)

Mattila, A.S. (2000). The Role of Narratives in the Advertising of Experiential Services

[https://journals-sagepub-](https://journals-sagepub-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/doi/abs/10.1177/109467050031003)

[com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/doi/abs/10.1177/109467050031003](https://journals-sagepub-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/doi/abs/10.1177/109467050031003)

Moustakas, C. (1994). *Phenomenological research methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Marshall, M. N. (1996). Sampling for qualitative research. *Family Practice*, 13(6), 522–

525. Used by permission of Oxford University Press via the Copyright Clearance Center

Merriam Dictionary, (2014). Retrieved from www.merriam-webster.com

Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2015). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and*

implementation. John Wiley & Sons.

Musaroà, P., & Parmiggiani, P. (2017). Beyond black and white: The role of media in

portraying and policing migration and asylum in Italy. *International Review of Sociology*, 27 (2), 241-260. doi:10.1080/03906701.2017.1329034

Mak, B.K.L., Cheung, L.T.O., Hui, D.L.H., (2017). Community participation in the

decision-making process for sustainable tourism development in rural areas of

Hong Kong, China. Retrieved from

<https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Community-Participation-in-the->

Decision-Making-for-Mak-

Cheung/bb2bfe7d832326688de635fc0ba02dd3556f32de

doi.org/10.3390/su9101695

Monzini, P. (2004). Trafficking in women and girls and the involvement of organized crime in western and central Europe. *International Review of Victimology*, 11(1), 73–88. doi:10.1177/026975800401100105

Mehrizi, M. H. R., Ghasemzadeh, F., & Molas-Gallart, J. (2009). Stakeholder Mapping as an Assessment Framework for Policy Implementation. *Journal of Evaluation*, 15(4), 427–444. doi:10.1177/1356389009341731

Moen, T. (2006). Reflections on the narrative research approach. *International Journal of Qualitative Methodology*, 5(4), doi:10.1177/160940690600500405

Maxwell, J. A. (2013). *Qualitative research design: An interactive approach* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Marshall, M. N. (1996). Sampling for qualitative research. *Family Practice*, 13(6), 522–525. doi:10.1093/fampra/13.6.522

Mahmoud, A. B., & Dumoulin, A. (2017). Enforcing Nigeria's anti-people trafficking legislation: Challenges toward effective implementation. Retrieved from <https://www.chathamhouse.org/event/enforcing-nigeria-s-anti-people-trafficking-legislation-challenges-toward-effective>

McBeth, M. K., Jones, M. D., and Shanahan, E. A. (2014). The Narrative Policy Framework. Chapter in Paul A. Sabatier and Christopher Weible (eds.), *Theories of the Policy Process* (3rd edition), Boulder: Westview

- Moossy, R. (2009). Sex trafficking: Identifying cases and victim. *National Institute of Justice Journal*, 262. Retrieved from <https://www.nij.gov/journals/262/pages/sex-trafficking.aspx>
- Mitchel, M., & Egudo, M. (2003). A review of Narrative methodology. Retrieved from <https://www.webpages.uidaho.edu/css506/506%20readings/review%20of%20narrative%20methodology%20australian%20gov.pdf>
- Morrow, S. L. (2005). Quality and trustworthiness in qualitative research in counseling psychology. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 52(2), 250–260.
doi:10.1037/0022-0167.52.2.250
- Mero-Jaffe, I. (2011). ‘Is that what I said?’ Interview transcript approval by participant: An aspect of ethics in qualitative research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 10(3), 231-247 doi:10.1177/160940691101000304
Retrieved from <http://ejournals.library.ualberta.ca/index.php/IJQM/>
- Mapuva, J. (2015). Citizen Participation, Mobilization and Contested Participatory Spaces. 3(10), 405-415 doi:10.14662/IJPSD2015.052.
<https://www.academicresearchjournals.org/IJPSD/PDF/2015/October/Mapuva.pdf>
- Nguyen, J. (2010). Three Ps of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act: Unaccompanied undocumented minors and the forgotten P in the William Wilberforce Trafficking Prevention Reauthorization Act. *Washington and Lee Journal of Civil Rights and*
Retrieved from: *Social Justice* 17, 187
<http://scholarlycommons.law.wlu.edu/crsj/vol17/iss1/11/>
- Nuamah, R. (2015). Nigeria’s foreign policy after the Cold War: Domestic, regional and

external influences. Retrieved from

https://www.ipinst.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/06/nigerias_foreign_policy.pdf

National Agency for the Prohibition of Trafficking in Persons, (2015). Functions of

NAPTIP. Retrieved from https://www.naptip.gov.ng/?page_id=112

Niemi, J., & Aaltonen, J. (2017). Tackling trafficking by targeting sex buyers: Can it work? *Violence Against Women*, 23(10), 1228–1248.

doi:10.1177/107780121665789

Ndifon, C. O., Apori, K. A. & Ndifon, R. A. (2012). Human trafficking in Nigeria: A metaphor for human rights, crime and security violations. *American Journal of Social Issues & Humanities*, 2 (3), 84-99. Retrieved from <http://www.ajsih.org>

Orme, J., & Ross-Sheriff, F. (2015). Sex trafficking: Policies, programs, and services.

Retrieved from

<http://ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=110258418&site=ehost-live&scope=site>

O'Toole, J. (2018). Institutional storytelling and personal narratives: Reflecting on the 'value' of narrative inquiry. *Irish Educational Studies*, 37 (2), 175-189, 15.

doi:10.1080/03323315.2018.1465839

Retrieved from [https://eds-b-ebscohost-](https://eds-b-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/detail/detail?vid=3&sid=0a1fc537-0115-4e17-89c1-767b4a242407%40pdc-v-sessmgr01&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWRzLWxpdmUmc2NvcGU9c2l0ZQ%3d%3d#AN=130244929&db=eue)

[com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/detail/detail?vid=3&sid=0a1fc537-0115-4e17-](https://eds-b-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/detail/detail?vid=3&sid=0a1fc537-0115-4e17-89c1-767b4a242407%40pdc-v-sessmgr01&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWRzLWxpdmUmc2NvcGU9c2l0ZQ%3d%3d#AN=130244929&db=eue)

[89c1-767b4a242407%40pdc-v-](https://eds-b-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/detail/detail?vid=3&sid=0a1fc537-0115-4e17-89c1-767b4a242407%40pdc-v-sessmgr01&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWRzLWxpdmUmc2NvcGU9c2l0ZQ%3d%3d#AN=130244929&db=eue)

[sessmgr01&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWRzLWxpdmUmc2NvcGU9c2l0ZQ%3d%3d#A](https://eds-b-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/detail/detail?vid=3&sid=0a1fc537-0115-4e17-89c1-767b4a242407%40pdc-v-sessmgr01&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWRzLWxpdmUmc2NvcGU9c2l0ZQ%3d%3d#AN=130244929&db=eue)

[N=130244929&db=eue](https://eds-b-ebscohost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/detail/detail?vid=3&sid=0a1fc537-0115-4e17-89c1-767b4a242407%40pdc-v-sessmgr01&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWRzLWxpdmUmc2NvcGU9c2l0ZQ%3d%3d#AN=130244929&db=eue)

- Olateru-Olagbegi, B., & Ikpeme, A. (2002). Action programme against trafficking and forced labor in West Africa: Review of legislation and policies in Nigeria on human trafficking and forced labor. Retrieved from https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms_083149.pdf
- Osezua, C.O. (2016). Gender Issues in Human trafficking in Edo State, Nigeria. *African Sociological Review*, 20(1), 36-66. Retrieved from https://www.jstor.org/stable/90001845?seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents
African Sociological Review / Revue Africaine de Sociologie
- O'Sullivan, E. (2016). *Research Methods for Public Administrators, 6th Edition*. Routledge, 20161004. VitalBook file.
- O'Leary, R., Borland, R., Stockwell, T., & MacDonald, M. (2017). Claims in vapor device (e-cigarette) regulation: A narrative policy framework analysis. *International Journal of Drug Policy*, 44 (31), 40.
doi:10.1016/j.drugpo.2017.03.004.
Retrieved from <https://www-sciencedirect-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/science/article/pii/S0955395917300695>
- Oludele, D.C. (2018). Human trafficking in Richmond, Virginia: An exploratory case study. Retrieved from <https://search.proquest.com/docview/2042334117/abstract/EA1AEA4687DA4B34PQ/1>
- Polaris, (2018). Sex trafficking. Retrieved from <https://polarisproject.org/type->

trafficking/sex.trafficking

Polaris. (2014). 2012 State ratings map. Retrieved from

<http://www.polarisproject.org/what-we-do/policy-advocacy/national-policy/state-ratings-on-human-trafficking-laws/2012-state-ratings>

Partners Against Child Trafficking, (2017). Child sex trafficking: Who are the buyers.

Retrieved from <https://pact.city/child-sex-trafficking-buyers/>

Plambech, S. (2017). Sex, Deportation and rescue: Economies of migration among

Nigerian sex workers, *feminist economics*, 23(3), 134-159.

doi:10.1080/13545701.2016.1181272

Petty, N. J., Thomson, O. P., & Stew, G. (2012). Ready for a paradigm shift? Part 2:

Introducing qualitative research methodologies and methods. *Manual Therapy*,

17(5), 378-384. doi:10.1016/j.math.2012.03.004

Pierce, J.J., Smith-Walter, A., & Peterson, H. (2014). Research design and the narrative

policy framework. Retrieved from

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/270648172_Research_Design_and_the_Narrative_Policy_Framework

Piranty, S. (2018, March 3). Spanish police break up Nigerian sex trafficking gang.

British Broadcasting Service. Retrieved from <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-43514125>

Pathfinders Justice Initiative, (2018). Edo state human trafficking bill signed into law by

governor Obaseki. Retrieved from <http://pathfindersji.org/edo-state-passes-new-law-against-human-trafficking/>

- Pathfinders Justice Initiative, (2018). Nigeria: Human trafficking fact sheet. Retrieved from <http://pathfindersji.org/nigeria-human-trafficking-factsheet/>
- Pathfinders Justice Initiative, (2020). Human trafficking. Retrieved from <https://www.africaschildrensfund.org/causes/programs/human-trafficking.php>
- Portney, K., & Cuttler, Z. (2010). The local nonprofit sector and the pursuit of Sustainability in American cities: A preliminary exploration. *Local Environment* 15(4), 323-339. doi:10.1080/13549831003677704
- Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods: Integrating theory and practice* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE
- Pianigiani, G., & Hauser, C. (2017, November 7). 26 young women From Nigeria found dead in Mediterranean Sea. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/11/07/world/europe/italy-migrants-teenagers-dead.html>
- Polaris, (2016). On-ramps, intersections, and exit routes: A roadmap for systems and industries to prevent and disrupt human trafficking. Retrieved from <https://polarisproject.org/a-roadmap-for-systems-and-industries-to-prevent-and-disrupt-human-trafficking>
- Preble, K.M. (2016). Victims' perception of power and identity intersections: A human trafficking experience. Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com/pqdtglobal/docview/1859920924/abstract/B845D25B7>

B224E7DPQ/9

Preskill H, & Jones N (2009). *A Practical guide for engaging stakeholders in developing evaluation questions*. Robert Wood Johnson Foundation Evaluation Series.

Retrieved from

<http://www.rwjf.org/content/dam/farm/toolkits/toolkits/2009/rwjf48595>

Raino, C.M., (2017). Criminalizing buyers under child sex trafficking laws as a critical protection for child victims. *Wake Forest Law Review*, 2, 435. Retrieved from

<https://eds-b-ebshost->

<com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=2&sid=8bfdb992->

<5963-4822-b0ca-5139078ef78c%40pdc-v-sessmgr05>

Ravitch, S. M., & Carl, N. M. (2016). *Qualitative research: Bridging the conceptual, theoretical, and methodological*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publication

Ryan, F., Coughlan, M., & Cronin, P. (2009). Interviewing in qualitative research: The one-to-one interview. *International Journal of Therapy & Rehabilitation*, 16(6), 309-314. doi:10.12968/ijtr.2009.16.6.42433

Ross-Sheriff, F. (2015) Sex trafficking: Policies, programs, and services. *Journal of Social Work*, 60, (4), 287-294. doi:10.1093/sw/swv031

Retrieved from

<http://ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=110258418&site=ehost-live&scope=site>

Rafferty, Y. (2013). Child trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation: A review of promising prevention policies and programs. *Am J. Orthopsychiatry*, 83(4),559-

75. doi:10.1111/ajop.12056.

- RavensBergen, F., & VanderPlaat, M. (2010). Association of Accredited Public Policy Advocates to the European Union, 2016, para 2) Barriers to citizen participation: The missing voices of people living with low income. *Community Development* 44(4), doi:10.1093/cdj/bsp014
- Robb, C.M. (2002). Can the poor influence policy: Participatory poverty assessments in the developing world. *The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank*. Retrieved from <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/367261468285046345/Can-the-poor-influence-policy-participatory-poverty-assessments-in-the-developing-world>
- Rubin, H. J., & Rubin, I. S. (2012). *Qualitative interviewing: The art of hearing data* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications
- Ratislavová, K. & Ratislav, J. (2014). Asynchronous email interview as a qualitative research method in the humanities. *Springer Journal*, 24 (4), 452-460. doi: 10.2478/s13374-014-0240-y.
- Sarkisian, M. (2015). Adopting the code: Human trafficking and the hospitality industry. *Cornell Hospitality Report*, 15(15), 3-10.
Retrieved from https://scholarship.sha.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1222&context=chrs_pubs
- Schreiner, C., Appel, M., Isberner, M., & Richter, T. (2018). Argument strength and the persuasiveness of stories, 55(4), 371-389. doi: 10.1080/0163853X.2016.1257406

<https://www-ncbi-nlm-nih-gov.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/pmc/articles/PMC5954649/>

Storey, D. (1999). Issues of integration, participation and empowerment in rural development: The case of Leader in the Republic of Ireland. *Journal of Rural Studies*, 15, 307-315. doi:10.1016/S0743-0167(98)00073-4

<http://agris.fao.org/agris-search/search.do?recordID=GB1999007977>

Shared Hope International, (2017). Report trafficking. Retrieved from <https://sharedhope.org/join-the-cause/report-trafficking/>

Samyn, S. L. (2018). Indentured sex work migration from Edo State to Europe.

Navigation in violent contexts. Masterproef voorgelegd voor het behalen van de graad Master in de richting Conflict en Development

Academiejaar. Retrieved from

<https://www.prio.org/Publications/Publication/?x=10>

Shenton, A. K. (2004). Strategies for ensuring trustworthiness in qualitative research projects. *Education for Information*, 22 (2), 63-75. doi:10.3233/EFI-2004-22201

Retrieved from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ792970>

Seidman, I. (2012). Interviewing as qualitative researcher: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences (3rd ed.). New York: Teachers College.

Simon, M. K. (2011). Validity and reliability in qualitative studies. *In Dissertation and scholarly research: Recipes for success* (pp. 1–3). Seattle, WA: Dissertation

Success. Retrieved from [http://dissertationrecipes.com/wp-](http://dissertationrecipes.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/04/Validity-and-Reliability-in-a-Qualitative-Study.pdf)

[content/uploads/2011/04/Validity-and-Reliability-in-a-Qualitative-Study.pdf](http://dissertationrecipes.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/04/Validity-and-Reliability-in-a-Qualitative-Study.pdf)

- Selimos, E.D., & Glynis, G. (2018). Using narrative research to explore the welcoming of newcomer immigrants: A methodological reflection on a community-based research project. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 19(2), 9. doi:10.3233/EFI-2004-22201 Retrieved from <https://eds-b-ebshost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/eds/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=5&sid=69e5340e-611f-47fe-a57c-f491721cbd01%40pdc-v-sessmgr05>
- Sylvester, A. (2018). A narrative inquiry: Factors contributing to veterans' successful reintegration into civilian workforce. Dissertation Abstracts International: Section B: *The Sciences and Engineering*, 79(12-B) (E), Retrieved from <https://web-a-ebshost-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/ehost/detail/detail?vid=3&sid=a69a0b95-bfc6-466b-bdab-582dd2ed7b94%40sessionmgr4010&bdata=JnNpdGU9ZWwhvc3QtbGl2ZSZzY29wZT1zaXRl#AN=2018-48576-098&db=psyh>
- Shafritz, J. M., Ott, J. S., & Jang, Y. S. (2016). *Classics of organization theory*. (8th ed). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth, Cengage Learning. ISBN: 978-1-285-87027-4
- Sukach, T., Castaneda, N. G, Pickens, J.C., (2018). Experiences of Female Sex Trafficking Survivors: A Phenomenological Analysis. *The Qualitative Report; Fort Lauderdale*, 23 (6), 1422-1440. Retrieved from <https://search-proquest-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/docview/2062625796?accountid=14872>
- Shelley L. (2016). Human trafficking: A global perspective. Retrieved from

<https://www.cambridge.org/us/academic/subjects/politics-international-relations/international-relations-and-international-organisations/human-trafficking-global-perspective?format=HB&isbn=9780521113816>

Simon & Goes, (2013). Assumptions, limitations, delimitations, and scope of the study.

Retrieved from <http://www.dissertationrecipes.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/04/limitationscopedelimitation1.pdf>

Saldaña, J. (2016). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Stuckey, H. L. (2013). Three types of interviews: Qualitative research methods in social health. *Journal of Social Health and Diabetes*, 1(2), 56. doi: 10.4103/23210656.115294

Sells, H. (2017, July 25). Stopping the sex trade, one buyer at a time. *CBN News*.

Retrieved from <https://www1.cbn.com/cbnnews/us/2017/february/stopping-the-sex-trade-one-buyer-at-a-time>.

Shafritz, J. M., Ott, J. S., & Jang, Y. S. (2016). *Classics of organization theory*. (8th ed). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth, Cengage Learning. ISBN: 978-1-285-87027-4

Schauer, E. J. & Wheaton, E. M. (2006). Sex trafficking into the United States: A literature review. *Criminal Justice Review*, 31(2), 146-169. doi: 10.1177/0734016806290136

Scherrer, A., & Werner, H. (2016). Trafficking in human beings from a gender perspective directive 2011/36/EU. Retrieved from

[https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2016/581412/EPRS_STU\(2016\)5](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2016/581412/EPRS_STU(2016)5)

81412_EN.pdf

- Salah, R. (2001). Child trafficking in West and Central Africa: An overview. Paper presented at the first Pan African Conference on human trafficking organized by Wotclef at the International Conference Centre, Abuja, February 19th – 23rd, 2001, pag.4, Retrieved from <http://www.unicef.org/media/newsnotes/africchildtraffick.pdf>
- Taylor, L. D. (2010). *Consumer demand in the United States: Prices, income, and consumption behavior* (3rd ed.). Springer: New York. doi: 10.1007/978-1-4419-0510-9
- Thomas, E., & Magilvy, J. K. (2011). Qualitative rigor or research validity in qualitative research. *Journal for specialists in pediatric nursing*, 16(2), 151-155. doi:10.1111/j.1744-6155.2011.00283.x
- Terrance, H. (2018). Citizen perceptions of institutional disparities and the reintegration of nonviolent drug related offenders. Ph.D., Walden University. Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com/pqdtlocal1005747/docview/2112408527/abstract/3E6CC9848ED340FDPQ/8>.
- Timmerman, C., Martiniello, M., Rea, A., & Wet, J. (2015). *New dynamics in female migration and integration.*, Taylor & Francis, NY: New York, 10017 Routledge.
- Turner, D, W. (2010). Qualitative interview design: A practical guide for novice investigators. *The Qualitative Report*, 15(3), 754-760. Retrieved from <https://ezp.waldenulibrary.org/login?url=https://search-proquest-com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/docview/578480397?accountid=14872>

- Tsiga, B., Hofisi, C, & Mago, S. (2016). Community participation in NGO “Development Projects” in Zimbabwe: Myth or reality? *Journal of Human Ecology*, 55 (3), 237-248. doi:10.1080/09709274.2016.11907029
- Todres, L. (2003). The status of method: Flexibility, consistency and coherence. *Qualitative Research*, 3(3), 345-357.
doi: 10.1177/1468794103033004
- Thomas, E. F., McGarty, C., & Mavor, K. I. (2009). Transforming “apathy into movement”: The role of prosocial emotions in motivation action for social change. *Personality & Social Psychology Review*, 13(4), 310–333. Retrieved from the Walden Library databases.
- Todres, L. (2003). The status of method: Flexibility, consistency and coherence. *Qualitative Research*, 3(3), 345-357.
doi: 10.1177/1468794103033004
- Tracy, S. J. (2010). Qualitative quality: Eight “big-tent” criteria for excellent Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 16(10), 837-851. doi:10.1177/1077800410383121
- Tufford, L., & Newman, P.A. (2012). Bracketing in Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Social Work*, 11(1),80-96. doi:10.1177/1473325010368316
- Tracy, S. J. (2013). *Qualitative research methods: Collecting evidence, crafting analysis, communicating impact*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell.
- UNHCR (2017), United Nations Refugee Agency Nigerian COI compilation on human trafficking. Retrieved from <https://www.refworld.org/pdfid/5a79c7114.pdf>
- United States Department of State, (2018). Nigeria, Tier 2 Watch list: 2018 Trafficking in

Persons Report. Retrieved from

<https://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/countries/2018/282722.htm>

United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking Hub, (2017). Sex trafficking of minors in America. Retrieved from <http://www.ungift.org/2017/09/17/sex-trafficking-of-minors-in-america>

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, (2004). Questionnaire on implementation of the protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime. Retrieved from https://www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/reviewquestionnaires/2004/TIP_Protocol/1st_Trafficking_Protocol_-_E.pdf

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, (2014). Human trafficking. Retrieved from <http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/what-is-human-trafficking.html>

United Nations, (2017). Treaty collection: Penal matters of the protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons especially women and children, supplementing the United Nations convention against transnational organized crime. Retrieved from https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src¼IND&mtmsg_no¼XVIII-12-a&chapter¼18&clang¼_en

United Nations on Drug and Crime, (2018). Organized crime. Retrieved from <https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/organized-crime/intro.html>

- United Nations Educational scientific and Cultural Organization, (2006). Human trafficking in West Africa (Benin, Togo and Nigeria): Root causes and policy recommendations. *Policy paper poverty series* 14 (2), Retrieved from <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001478/147844e.pdf>
- United Nations, (2002). *The United Nations response to trafficking in women and girls*. Retrieved from www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/egm/trafficking2002/reports/WP-DAW.PDF
- UNODC, (2016). Global Report on Trafficking in Persons. Retrieved from [http://www.unodc.org/documents/ data-and-analysis/glotip/2016_Global_Report_on_Trafficking_in_Persons.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/documents/data-and-analysis/glotip/2016_Global_Report_on_Trafficking_in_Persons.pdf).
- UNODC (2019). The Doha Declaration: Promoting a culture of lawfulness. Retrieved from <https://www.unodc.org/e4j/en/tip-and-som/module-6/key-issues/the-purpose-of-exploitation.html>
- UNHCR, (2018). Trafficking in Persons Report – Nigeria. Retrieved from <https://www.refworld.org/docid/5b3e0ab6a.html>
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, (1999). International Migration and Africa: Trends and Prospects for the 21st Century. United Nation Education Scientific and Cultural Organization. (UNESCO), Retrieved from <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0011/001185/118566eo.pdf>
- Varghese, C. (2017). Current anti-prostitution efforts and potential of strategy to tackle demand for addressing sex trafficking in the Houston Area. Retrieved from <https://search-proquest->

com.ezp.waldenulibrary.org/pqdtglobal/docview/2019615580/abstract/9353CDA
ED1554ADFPQ/13?accountid=14872

Villalobos, J.D. (2012). Agency input as a policy-making tool: Analyzing the influence of agency input on presidential policy success in congress. *Administration and Society*, 45 (7), 837-874. doi:10.1177/0095399712438378

Vanguard, (2017, October 27). Edo plans laws against human trafficking, on sensitization campaign. *The Vanguard*. Retrieved from <https://www.vanguardngr.com/2017/10/edo-plans-laws-human-trafficking-sensitisation-campaign/>

Van-Dijk, R. (2001) Voodoo on the doorstep: Young Nigerian prostitutes and magic policing in the Netherlands. *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute*, 71(4), 558–586. doi:10.3366/afr.2001.71.4.558

Wheaton, E. M., Schauer, E. J., & Galli, T. V. (2010). Economics of human trafficking. *International Migration*, 48(4), 114-141. doi:10.1111/j.1468-2435.2009.00592.x

Worden, D. (2018) Sex trafficking: Towards a human rights paradigm. *The International Journal of Human Rights*, 22 (5), 709-732, doi: 10.1080/13642987.2018.1454906

Walden University, (2010). *Research design: Some thoughts on the research process*. Minneapolis, MN: Walden University

Wandersman, A., Florin, P., Friedmann, R., & Meier, R. (1987). Who participates, who does not, and why: An analysis of voluntary neighborhood organizations in the United States and Israel. *Sociological Forum*, 2(3), 534-555. Retrieved from

https://www.jstor.org/stable/684673?seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents

Weible, C. M., Sabatier, P. A. (2018). *Theories of the policy process* (4th ed.). Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

West, K. (2018). Trafficked women in Denmark falling through the cracks. *Anti-Trafficking Review*, 10, 160–163. doi:10.14197/atr.2012181011

Walden University, (2010). *Research design: Some thoughts on the research process*. Minneapolis, MN: Walden University

Walden University, Center for Research Quality. (n.d.-e). *Institutional Review Board for ethical standards in research*. Retrieved from <http://academicguides.walden.edu/researchcenter/orec>

World Health Organization, (2017). Violence against women. Retrieved from <https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/violence-against-women>

Walden University, Center for Research Quality. (n.d.-d) *Research ethics and compliance: Application and general materials*. Retrieved from <http://academicguides.waldenu.edu/researchcenter/orec/application>

Watras, J. (2010). Ethnography and ethics: A critique of Gregory Bateson (1904-1980). *Journal of Ethnographic and Qualitative Research*, 5(2), 127-137. Retrieved from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ955294>

Walk Free Foundation, (2016). The Global Slavery Index. Retrieved from <http://assets.globallslaveryindex.org/downloads/GSI-2016-Full-Report.pdf>.

Walden University, (2012). ProQuest Dissertations Publishing, 3503105.
Retrieved from

<https://ezp.waldenulibrary.org/pqdtlocal100574/docview/1009056812/DCA8B82C44464B06PQ/3?accountid=14872>

Webler, T., 1999, The craft and theory of public participation: A dialectical process.

Journal of Risk Research, 2(1), pp. 55–71. doi:10.1080/136698799376989

Retrieved from

<https://scholar.google.com/citations?user=D1JjNMcAAAAJ&hl=en>

Williamson, C. & Cluse-Tolar, T. (2002). Pimp-controlled prostitution: Still an integral

part of street life. *Violence Against Women*, 8(9), 1074-1092. doi:

10.1177/107780102401101746

Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research: Design and methods* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks,

CA: Sage Publications

Zimmerman, C, Hossain, M., & Watts, C. (2011). Human trafficking and health: A

conceptual model to inform policy, intervention and research. *Social*

Science/Medicine, 73(2):327-3

doi:10.1016/j.socscimed.2011.05.028

Zaharia, R. M. (2008). Qualitative research methods: A comparison between focus group

and in-depth interview. Retrieved from

[https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Qualitative-Research-Methods-a-](https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Qualitative-Research-Methods-a-Comparison-between-focus-group-and-in-depth-interview)

[Comparison-between-focus-group-and-in-depth-interview.](https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/Qualitative-Research-Methods-a-Comparison-between-focus-group-and-in-depth-interview)

Appendix A: Face-to-Face Interview Protocol

The following questions were adapted from a human trafficking questionnaire developed by Stop Violence Against Women, an advocacy group (www.stopvaw.org, 2009). The questions will be used to collection information from parents of women and girls from the age range of 13 -21 regarding their observation and realities of prevention policies and on sex trafficking in Ogwa community. The interview used a face-to face study. The questions were tailored to cater for a specific research method from the proposed theories that can be located in my literation review section. The questions aligned with the narrative policy analysis and participatory policy analysis.

1. What is your contribution to the community and why?
2. What do you know about the sex trafficking that exists on Ogwa community?
3. What have you seen or heard of regarding sex trafficking as a form of exploitation of young women in your area?
4. In your opinion what are the factors driving sex trafficking on Ogwa?
5. What is your understanding of the populations that are more at risk of being targeted for sex trafficking on Ogwa?
6. What policies has Edo State developed to prevent sex trafficking in persons?
7. What is your experience regarding the implementation of existing Edo State policies and procedures on sex trafficking on Ogwa?
 - Please cite specific examples if pertinent to your answer.
8. What challenges has your community faced in dealing with victims of sex trafficking who return to the village?

9. Who can you contact for victim assistance?
10. What services does Edo State provide victims of sex trafficking (e.g., protection, skill acquisition, deportation, referrals, victim advocates, legal, medical, educational or financial assistance)?
11. What challenges or barriers affect service delivery for victims?
12. How do you feel government officials with whom your community interact with, understand the nature of sex trafficking?
 - Please provide examples of agreement, misconceptions or misunderstandings related to trafficking in persons, particularly those that might affect effectiveness at detecting and combating sex trafficking?
13. How can parental perspective inform future policy outcome?
14. What ways do you see the government's collaboration with the community in addressing the prevention of sex trafficking on Ogwa?

Appendix B: Journal Notes

I will share two examples of personal notes taken at reflection on two interviews:

It was good experience because participants were passionate about the problem of sex trafficking and wants to do something about it. In the course of the interview developed better listening, communication and questioning skills. The questions provoked deep thinking and interest in the topic since it is a problem that they said that the government has not appropriately addressed. The average discussion was about 20 - 25 minutes after the recording has been ended.

I must admit that my prejudgment is that it is all government's fault who fail to provide the basic needs to the community and thus solely to be blamed for trafficking for sexual exploitation. One example is my experience with two parents from a low-income family who believed that some parents who are greedy deserve blame because they prefer that their daughter bring some income to the family rather than going to school.

This experience reminded of my need to be objective and become aware of my assumptions throughout the interview process to hear what the participants had to say. So, I am challenged to listen attentively to the participants to get information that will add depth and value to the study (Iwuoha, 2019, Thursday December 20th, unpublished raw data from personal note)

On this day I saw mainly common themes in the interview with participants with regards to education awareness, environmental factor, infrastructural development and community participation in program design and implementation. At this point I believe I have enough information that I need to begin coding and data analysis. I

will take three more persons for interviews the next day. However, it has been a wonderful experience and I look forward to what I will come up with during the coding (Iwuoha, 2019, Friday December 21th, unpublished raw data from personal note)

Appendix C: List of Figures Showing Visual Data

The picture in Figure B1 shows one of the actual boats that brought the trafficked victims from communities such as Ogwa and Figure B 2 on the next page is the actual spot where 200 Nigerians, including sex trafficked victims, perished in 2016.



Figure B1: Boat that brought trafficked victims/migrants to Lampedusa, Italy.

Source: Photo taken by Nkechi Iwuoha during a visit to the port of Sicily, Italy



Figure B2: The spot where 200 bodies of drowned trafficked Nigerian victims were pulled out of the water at the port of Sicily, Italy.

Source: Photo taken by Nkechi Iwuoha during a visit to the port of Sicily, Italy.

Appendix D: Edo State Trafficking in Persons Prohibition Law 2018

S.1. ENACTMENT: Be it enacted by the Edo State House of Assembly
and by the Authority of the same as follows:

S.2. CITATION: The Law may be cited as the Edo State Trafficking
in Persons Law, 2018.

S.3. COMMENCEMENT: The Law shall come into force on the 1st day Jan 2018

The following bills was passed indicating the articles:

Art: 5.15: Procurement of persons for sexual exploitation.

Art: 5.16: Procurement and Recruitment of Persons under the age of 18

Years for Prostitution or other forms of Sexual Exploitation.

Art 5.17: Procurement/Recruitment of Person for Sexual Pornography

Art 5.18: Foreign Travel which Promotes Prostitution or Sexual Exploitation

Art 5.19: Procurement or Recruitment of Person for use in Armed Conflict

Art 5.20: Procurement or Recruitment of Person for Organ Harvesting

Art: 5.21: Prohibition of Buying or Selling of Human Beings for any purpose

Art: 5.22: Forced Labor

Art 5.23: Employment of Child as Domestic Worker and inflicting

Grievous Harm

Art 5.24: Trafficking in Slaves

Art 5.25: Slave Dealing

Art 5.26: Offences Relating to Fraudulent Entry of persons

Source: Government of Edo State, 2018